Promoting the Inclusion of Tenure Earning Black Women in Academe: Lessons for Leaders in Education

Dannielle Joy Davis  
*Alabama State University*
Rema Reynolds  
*Asuza Pacific University*
Tamara Bertrand Jones  
*Florida State University*

*Florida Journal of Educational Administration & Policy*
Fall 2011  
Volume 5, Issue 1

This narrative work highlights one Black female faculty participant’s experience of the Sisters of the Academy (SOTA) Research Boot Camp. She shares the benefits of the initiative, as well as how the program influenced her research and writing productivity as a faculty member. SOTA leadership supports Black female tenure-track and tenured faculty via offering strategies for academic productivity and expanding professional networks. The article illustrates the role Sisters of the Academy’s Research Boot Camp has upon ameliorating challenges faced by Black women throughout the tenure and promotion processes.

*Keywords:* Black women, academe, tenure-track, faculty development
The recruitment, hiring, and subsequent success of faculty from underrepresented groups, such as African Americans and Hispanics is a significant issue in higher education. Researchers have long identified the factors that contribute to academic and professional success in the academy (e.g., dissertation completion; clear, consistent performance criteria; successful tenure and promotion) and have examined these factors in many institutional and gendered contexts (Johnsrud & DesJarlais, 1994; Phelps, 1995; Ponjuan, Martin Conley, & Trower, 2011; Villalpando & Delgado Bernal, 2002). Consistent evidence has shown that faculty of color have different experiences in comparison to their White counterparts (Johnson-Bailey & Cervero, 2004; Johnsrud & DesJarlais, 1994; Ponjuan, Martin Conley, & Trower, 2011; Stanley, 2006, 2007; Thompson & Dey, 1998; Tillman, 2001). For Black female faculty the intersectionality of race coupled with gender issues creates an even more challenging experience (Gregory, 2001; Griffin & Reddick, 2011; Johnson-Bailey & Cervero, 2008; Tillman, 2011). Tillman (2001) identified three primary factors that present roadblocks for Black females’ successful promotion and tenure: (a) lack of socialization to faculty life, (b) lack of meaningful mentoring, and (c) inability to articulate a viable and sustainable research agenda. These hindrances serve as a framework to view the existing literature related to the challenges Black female faculty face.

Socialization is an important factor in the professional success of early career faculty (Clark & Corcoran, 1986; Johnson, 2002; Lucas & Murry, 2002). Clark and Corcoran (1986) defined socialization as “a mechanism through which new members learn the values, norms, knowledge, beliefs, and the interpersonal and other skills that facilitate role performance and further group goals” (p. 22). Early career faculty often have not received the proper prior training to become productive faculty members (LaRocco & Bruns, 2006; Ortlieb, Biddix, & Doepker, 2010; Reynolds, 1992). Socialization activities for new faculty focus on the discipline-based knowledge and common skills required for academic and professional success. These areas, while important, fail to address many of the unwritten or unstated rules of academic culture that govern the academy (Johnson, 2001; LaRocco & Bruns, 2006; Reynolds, 1992). Successful socialization depends on many factors and often occurs prior to the first academic appointment. Previous exposure to academic culture in graduate school prepares faculty for assessing and evaluating their current (and future) departmental culture.

Understanding the written and unwritten rules of academic life broadly, and departmental politics specifically, can help or hinder early career faculty during the tenure and promotion process. Building upon the already challenging transition from student to professor, Black faculty often also experience isolation and alienation in departments (Johnsrud & DesJarlais, 1994; Phelps, 1995). Unfortunately, females are less likely than males to experience appreciation and support from colleagues (Bronstein & Farnsworth, 1998); while faculty of color receive less social support than White colleagues (Ponjuan, Martin Conley, & Trower, 2011). The lack of support is sometimes a result of conflicting values that govern individual faculty members and the academy at large (Stanley, 2007).

In addition, developing and articulating a viable and sustainable research agenda is an important component of the designation as a scholar and is important to the tenure and promotion process (Boyer, 1990; Tillman, 2001). Clear and consistent criteria guiding the tenure and promotion process ensures that the process remains as “objective” as possible. Despite objectivity those involved in the review often subjectively place value on their colleagues’ research. Many Black women faculty inform their research through their teaching and service (Gregory, 2001).
Many would applaud this connection and efficiency of work, but unfortunately, faculty of color face challenges receiving validation from peers if they conduct gender or race-related research (Ponjuan, Martin Conley, & Trower, 2011; Stanley, 2007).

Patricia Hill Collins’ work (1986) provides a relevant lens from which to view the experiences of Black female faculty. Collins asserts that Black women possess a unique perspective of their experiences and that there are commonalities shared by Black women as a group. While there are shared understandings, a diversity of life experiences also exists, impacting how each woman has interpreted and experienced those common themes. The act of sharing one’s story and drawing a connection to other Black women who have similar experiences is powerful and can aid the understanding of the challenges Black women face in academia.

For the purposes of this work, mentoring refers to the broader relationships developed between early career and senior faculty. Among the many benefits, mentoring can help alleviate feelings of isolation and alienation early career faculty experience (Zellers, Howard, & Barcic, 2008), be utilized as a tool to socialize new faculty (Davis, 2008), positively contribute to the recruitment and retention of faculty of color (Johnson-Bailey & Cervero, 2004; Stanley, 2006), and facilitate engagement in scholarly activities (i.e., submission of publications, research and funding opportunities) (Gregory, 2001). The lack of a critical mass of senior Black faculty (men and women) in departments and institutions limits the opportunities for same-race or same-gender mentoring for early career faculty. Limited access to the formal and informal networks that exist in many professions and disciplines often causes Blacks to miss out on opportunities to participate in research and other professional activities, ultimately compromising their professional success (Frierson, 1990; Patitu & Hinton, 2003; Turner & Thompson, 1993).

Conversely, while opportunities for Black female faculty to be mentored are limited (Thomas & Hollenshead, 2001), they are more likely to serve as mentors in comparison to their other faculty colleagues (Griffin & Reddick, 2011). When mentoring does occur for Black female faculty, it is more often a peer approach (Myers, 2002; Thomas & Hollenshead, 2001) and takes place outside of the department or institution (Stanley, 2006; Tillman, 2011). These realities point to the importance of cross-race mentoring and the positive impact culturally responsive White mentors can have on the promotion and tenure process (Johnson-Bailey & Cervero, 2004; Patitu & Hinton, 2003; Stanley & Lincoln, 2005). Evidence suggests that pre-tenure faculty report more collegial relationships with peer and senior faculty who have clarity about their role and expectations for tenure and promotion (Ponjuan, Martin Conley, & Trower, 2011).

The intent of this article centers upon exploring the influence of the SOTA Boot Camp upon the experience of a tenure-track African American woman. Doing so may offer administrators insight into strategies for retaining and promoting this important segment of the academic community.

**Theoretical Framework**

The Theory of Professional Interaction serves as the theoretical framework for this piece. The work from which it emerged was centered within the context of faculty mentor and protégée relationships within a mentoring program context. Elements of this model may inform understanding of how Sisters of the Academy influenced the tenure-track experience of the featured scholar (See Figure 1.).
The theory suggests that the professional interaction (PI) of mentors and junior faculty yield differing outcomes depending upon the frequency and type of professional interaction experienced (ex. email versus face-to-face meetings). The degree and frequency of professional interaction is influenced by workload or availability to meet, as well as whether the workplace is perceived as fostering integration or isolation. The type of professional interaction one engages in reflects whether or not one has mentors or allies and resulting collegial relationships. These in turn influence protégées’ overall experiences. Key experiences noted by participants of the original study included the degree of collegiality of mentors and co-workers, the quality and quantity of career enhancing information, the degree of satisfaction, and their perceptions of campus climate. The concept of professional interaction, coupled with the tenets of degree, frequency, and interaction will serve as the lens for this article.

Methods

Despite contributions to the professoriate for over a century, Black women today face challenges in the professoriate due to their race and gender identities. Some have sought out SOTA to ameliorate their academic journeys. The purpose of this narrative work centers upon understanding how SOTA as a professional development organization influences the tenure-track experiences of Black academic women via examining one individual’s story related to the organization’s Research Boot Camp.

The featured woman is African American and is an American citizen. In terms of age, her age ranges between 30 to 40 years old. An Assistant Professor from a predominantly White institution, she holds a tenure-track position. A pseudonym is used to protect the individual’s identity.

Data Collection and Analysis

This article features the experience of a participant from the Sisters of the Academy (SOTA) Research Boot Camp. Journaling, participant observation, reflection, and content analysis contributed to the autobiographical account of the participant. The employment of narrative inquiry allows for the ability to capture the experiences (Creswell, 2007) of the participant in terms of the featured program. The narrative works to give voice to this woman from a traditionally marginalized group. Coding entailed examining her story, noting emerging themes to unveil meaning from it, and illustrating how the themes presented were related. Analysis centered upon autobiographical description of the story and themes emerging from it (Huber & Whelan, 1999). This autobiographical focus renders the work a type of first order narrative where the participant shares her own story and experiences (Elliot, 2005).

Description of the Featured Program: The Sisters of the Academy Research Boot Camp

The Sisters of the Academy (SOTA) Research Boot Camp employs a mentoring model where participant pair with both a senior and junior faculty member to coach them towards predetermined goals through a week’s duration. Approximately four protégées per senior-junior faculty team comprises a mentoring group. In addition to direct feedback from mentors, participants take part in group mentoring where they learn from questions and challenges of the mentors’ other protégées. Time for personal writing and mentoring sessions with assigned senior scholars are complemented by workshops on qualitative and quantitative methodology, the
research process, and publishing strategies. Participants also present their research, once at the Boot Camp’s commencement where they briefly share their goals for the week, and again at the end of the Camp summarizing progress and manuscripts completed. A panel of senior scholars critique each project and suggest directions for future work during the final presentation. The mentoring model of SOTA’s Camp benefits faculty participants of the program in their roles as junior scholars in terms of strengthening their skills in advising students during the dissertation process (Davis & Sutherland, 2008).

The Participant’s Perspective

Women sometimes occupy a tenuous position within the academy due to pervasive male privilege and the marginalizing dynamics of hegemonic patriarchy. Women’s continual quest to be regarded as serious scholars who make important contributions to the field, to attain parity with their male colleagues, can prove more arduous for Black women whose professional and personal lives are mitigated by the intersectionality of race and sex¹ as well as the navigational implications that derive from conflated racism and sexism.²

Academe can be a daunting and intimidating space with few policies and practices in place to address the diverse needs of faculty. Untraditional faculty such as Black women may need to seek professional support from sources outside their institutions of higher education in an effort to attain and activate social capital necessary for success as an academic. The capital used by Black women in the Academy is frequently positioned as congruous with values and norms of their White counterparts (Few, 2007; Giddings, 1984; hooks, 1981; 1984). Academicians employing forms of capital differing from those of the dominant culture are often viewed through a deficit lens and in need of transformation or acculturation (hooks, 1989; Martin, 1993). Black women can be viewed through this deficit lens and positioned as inferior in scholarship, teaching, and service—all necessary for promotion and tenure. A safe haven, a space for Black women faculty to convene as a collective and to provide diverse forms of support, is vital for retention and advancement.

Sisters of the Academy (SOTA), an organization intentional in its aim to create an educational network of Black women in higher education, has served as an invaluable personal and professional support to me as I journeyed with SOTA from my dissertation proposal into promotion as a faculty member. This article highlights my journey. Grounding my account within Black feminism (Collins, 1989; Few, 2003; 2007) serves to give voice to Black women in the academy and amplify their experiences with greater accuracy. A necessary “transformation of silence into language and action” (Lorde, 1984, p. 40) is possible when research is grounded with this theoretical base. Counterstorytelling is a methodological tool that uses oral interpretation to convey narratives that are often not validated by the dominant culture. Critical Race Theory insists on recognition of the experiential knowledge of minoritized³ people and their communities

¹ See Reynolds, 2010.
² Though not detailed in this paper, gender can also prove problematic in professional relationships as participants reported that homophobia and heterosexual norms also serve to marginalize Black lesbians in institutions of higher learning.
³ Minoritized, unlike minority, emphasizes the process of minoritizing and insists that the relative prestige of cultures are constituted in social relations of power and agency (Mukherjee, et. al., 2006). Minoritized, unlike minority, emphasizes the process of minoritizing and insists that the relative prestige of cultures are constituted in social relations of power and agency (Mukherjee, et. al., 2006). Those who are minoritized are subordinated in power relations by those belonging to the dominant culture (Tettey & Puplampu, 2006).
(Matsuda et al., 1993; Dixson & Rousseau, 2005) and allows for the incorporation of counterstorytelling (Solorzano, 1998). The tool draws explicitly on experiential knowledge so that my voice as a Black women scholar can be a focus in this article.

I pursued my doctorate from a world-renown research institution were I was often met with the familiar opposition that comes with assumptions that deem Black people’s culture, values, and norms oppositional to the culture, values, and norms of schooling in the United States (Ladson-Billings, 1994; Delpit, 1995; Edwards et al., 1999; Yan, 2000; Noguera, 2001). I quickly realized that I was one of a very small number of Black doctoral students, and one of two Black women within my program. Implications of racism and sexism within classrooms, among my peers, colleagues, and interactions with faculty were immediately evident. Already possessing a Master’s degree and over a decade of experience in the field, I found that attainment of elevated class status through education did not exempt me from the stereotyping and differentiated treatment Black people of all classes experience. Racism and sexism served to minimize her class status and became more pronounced as I traversed through my program.

“Double consciousness” was characterized by W.E.B. DuBois (1969) as "this sense of always looking at one's self through the eyes of others, of measuring one's soul by the tape of a world that looks on in amused contempt and pity" (p. 45). When I encountered this concept in a class dedicated to DuBois, I was able to name what I had been feeling and explicitly acknowledge and articulate a double consciousness, an acute awareness of perceptions I believed my peers, who were members of the dominant culture, espoused in relation to the fact that I was a Black woman. Negotiating professional relationships within the academy can have deleterious effects on both the professional and personal lives of Black women academicians.

I brought this fatigue, this stress, this frustration with me when I arrived at SOTA’s Research Boot Camp, a one-week intensive meant to help doctoral students develop sound research agendas. Seasoned Black women scholars, statisticians, and theorists help doctoral students conceptualize and design components of their dissertations. I signed up for the assistance with writing my proposal but gained so much more during that week.

The week was structured to provide writing support for participants. Women came from all across the country at different stages of completion on projects and with diverse needs in order to meet their individual goals. I’m always a bit guarded when entering new spaces with unfamiliar people and processes and was interested, after the first day of project presentations given by each participant, to see how the women in charge were going to meet the vast needs of such an eclectic group of fledgling scholars. I wondered, from a bit of a cautionary distance, how I would get my needs met, and if these women, both the participants and the organizers, suffered from the same stress I did and if they would, like many I had encountered before, first internalize that stress and then transfer their pain to one another. I engaged the space carefully the first two days.

The second day of the Boot Camp was all business. After giving my presentation the previous day, I was matched with a mentor and given an assignment. The homework that involved work on the “Methods” section of my dissertation proposal was due and was to be discussed in a one-on-one meeting with my mentor. I was a good student who worked well with deadlines and I found the individual attention and personal accountability necessary. I immediately knew that the Boot Camp would be a productive space for me. And it was. I finished a draft of my entire proposal within that week under the guidance of my assigned mentor. What I did not predict was the richness of the relationships I would foster that week.

Boot Camp participants have time each night to fellowship after a taxing day of writing, workshops, and physical exercise. I found like-minded women with similar challenges and
triumphs through SOTA: Women like myself who had experienced great success in life and had come to academe only to question their own merit. I formed a bond with these women. The bond extended beyond academics though I continues to publish with these professionals today, to a genuine friendship…a group of comrades helping one another through life’s ups and downs, and supporting one another with advice, resources, and compassion when acts of discrimination surface within the academy for any among them. This relationship was organically created within this Boot Camp experience and can be intentionally replicated within other spaces as it has proved to be a veritable lifesaver for me as I have gone from student to faculty.

I attended SOTA’s Boot Camp as a participant in 2007. After successfully defending my dissertation proposal, I returned to SOTA’s writing retreat in 2008 again seeking assistance with writing, but also expecting to connect with sisters in the same professional struggle. I received both. At that time, 2008, I decided to assume a more integral role in providing SOTA’s services to Black women in academia. Black folks in the professorate and in many other fields often feel compelled to reach as they climb, to develop others like themselves and provide mentorship and guidance to ensure the personal success of the individual as well as the collective. I want to do that work through SOTA as I see the need for safe spaces for Black women to engage in scholarship and relationships unfettered by racism and sexism.

Coming full circle four years later, I participated in SOTA’s Boot Camp as a member of the leadership team. It has remained a priority for me to assist in the cultivation of assured, confident Black women scholars. I found that with the support of networks like the one SOTA provides, Black women within the academy can do their work cocooned in the respect, consideration, and support of women who look like them, have shared experiences, and pressures, and often similar research agendas. I am intent on providing that service for fellow Black women colleagues that the academy has not embraced.

**Findings**

The Influence of Professional Interaction (P.I.) on Faculty Experiences was used as the theoretical framework for the analyses of the featured participant’s experiences. In terms of working within an integrative versus an isolating work environment, Rachel spoke of double consciousness when referring to the awareness of self in relation to an awareness of how she and her work were perceived or regarded within the academy. When detailing her experiences, Rachel expressed fatigue and stress. She pragmatically spoke about struggles with companionship, pressure to perform better and produce more than her colleagues often associated with stereotype threat, and the stress involved with balancing work and home responsibilities. While these themes may be common to scholars collectively, Rachel perceived her experiences to be exacerbated by racist and sexist microaggressions (Sue & Sue, 2007) in the workplace. This climate prompted her interest in Sisters of the Academy.

In terms of types of Professional Interaction, Rachel expressed that her “struggles with companionship” at her home institution was countered by the SOTA experience, where she “found like-minded women with similar challenges and triumphs.” These like-minded women served as both mentors and allies. Collegiality emerged as Rachel noted how she and her SOTA peers moved “beyond academics to genuine friendship.” This collegiality was substantial as it was “unfettered by racism and sexism.”

---

4 See Steele, 2003
Opportunities and information flowed as Rachel experienced “advice, resources, and compassion when acts of discrimination surfaced within the academy.” Rachel described the program climate of SOTA as being “cocooned in the respect, consideration, and support of women who look like (her, with) shared experiences…pressures…and often similar research agendas.” This description contrasts with that of her home institution as a climate tainted by “racist and sexist microaggressions.”

Conclusion

The featured narrative reveals the importance of validation and mentoring that the SOTA Boot Camp provided to the participant as a double minority. The intersectionality of race and gender played a role in her occupational experiences and rendered SOTA a key component in ameliorating her worklife. The validation and mentorship resulting from the SOTA program contributed to the participants’ engagement with not only Boot Camp participants, but the profession at large. In essence, it provided her the opportunity to create her own professional world. Such environments might be replicated at individual institutions through formal mentoring programs or college and university writing retreats. Educational leaders interested in retaining Black female faculty have supported SOTA’s Research Boot Camp through sponsoring participants and hosting the Research Boot Camp on their campuses.

In addition to external initiatives such as SOTA’s, formal mentoring programs supported by institutions rather than individual departments, promise to address the isolation experienced by some minority scholars (Davis & Sutherland, 2008). Writing retreats, whether sponsored by a university or a non-profit organization, offer Black women struggling with heavy service loads space to write and complete projects. The implementation of such faculty development initiatives yields benefits to both universities and academics in the field via greater intellectual productivity for all members of the professoriate and an expansion of knowledge from oft silenced voices. Employing faculty development initiatives promises to positively shift academic culture from rigid, isolating spaces to inclusive, interdisciplinary, and nurturing intellectual environments. See Table 1.

Recommendations

When developing faculty mentoring programs, leaders with an interest in retaining Black female faculty should consider the often differentiated, heavy service loads for Black female faculty and work to ameliorate them (Davis et al, 2011). Also, share faculty development efforts, whether they be mentoring programs or writing retreats, with faculty candidates during the interview and hiring processes. This suggests the institution’s genuine interest in the success of all faculty members, including Black women. In addition to university programs, offer professional development funding. This provides an opportunity for Black female faculty to participate in organizations geared towards their development and success. For instance, in an effort to supports its Black female faculty, the University of Texas at Arlington’s Provost Office provided full funding for two Black female faculty to attend the Sisters of the Academy Research Boot Camp and Writing Retreat for four consecutive years through the UTA Sisters of the Academy Award. Recipients of this award were competitively selected. The availability of this institutional award demonstrates the university’s commitment to Black female faculty’s success and inclusion in academe.
References


Davis, D. J., Provost, K., & Major, A. (2011). Writing groups for work-life balance: Faculty writing group leaders share their stories. To Improve the Academy, 30, 31-42. DOI: 978-1-1180-1131-7.


552-588.
Figure 1

The Theory of Professional Interaction: *The Influence of Professional Interaction (P.I.) on Faculty Experiences*

Table 1

Shifting of Organizational Cultures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>From…</th>
<th>To</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Individualistic, publish or perish mentality</td>
<td>Fostering a nurturing community of scholarship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Countering organizational toxicity and the “culture of arrogance” in</td>
<td>Less toxicity and personal stress due to improved campus and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>academe (Thompson &amp; Louque 2005)</td>
<td>departmental climates</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rigid perspectives on field and discipline</td>
<td>Interdisciplinary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Good ole’ boy” or “us” versus “them” mentality</td>
<td>Inclusive, welcoming</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>