

The Effect of Gender on Organizational Commitment of Teachers: A Meta Analytic Analysis

Ayhan AYDIN

Eskişehir Osmangazi University

Yılmaz SARIER^a

Eskişehir Osmangazi University

Şengül UYSAL

Eskişehir Osmangazi University

Abstract

The purpose of this study is to determine the effect of gender on the organizational commitment of teachers. In this respect, the levels of organizational commitment were also investigated with organizational commitment. Fifteen master and doctorate theses done between 2005-2009 were analyzed using meta analysis. At the end of the research study, the mean effect size was calculated as $-0,07$. It means that the effect of gender on the organizational commitment is on the favor of males. Particularly, it was found that the effect of gender is in the favor of males at the levels of identification and internalization. Male teachers can adopt the norms and values of the organization easier than females. On the other hand, female teachers have a tendency of organizational commitment so as to carry on their acquisition.

Key Words

Organizational Commitment, Meta Analysis, Educational Administration.

A human being who is a social creature spends his most of lifetime in organizations. An organization emerges in need of cooperation. People need cooperation in order to fulfill their purposes. While an organization is a tool to accomplish one's purpose, an individual can be thought as a tool to succeed in organizational purposes.

Organizational commitment is the promise and pledge of any responsibility in the future (Zangaro, 2001, p. 14). Organizational commitment is a responsibility felt by an employee in order to identify with the norms and purposes of the organization (Buchanan, 1974, p. 533). Organizational commitment can't be thought as a simple loyalty. Organizational commitment has been defined as involving an employee's loyalty to the organization, willingness to exert effort on behalf of the organization, degree of goal and value congruency with the organization, and desire to maintain membership (Cohen, 2007, p. 336).

In the light of all these definitions, organizational commitment is a definite desire to maintain organizational membership, identification with the purposes, successes of organization, the loyalty of an employee, and a willingness to exert considerable effort on the behalf of the organization.

There are various classification for organizational commitment. In Turkey, the classification performed by O'Reilly and Chatman (1986, p. 492) with Allen and Meyer (1990, p. 2-5) was mostly used. O'Reilly and Chatman (1986, p. 492) implies three levels for organizational commitment:

The Level of Accordance

The level of accordance defines a shallow organizational loyalty (Balay, 2000, p. 68). The employees feel the necessity of accordance in order to record gains. Accordance is the first step of commitment. It is possible to say that an individual feels the necessity of accordance because of an award or a penalty. An individual tries to accord with the others for pay rise or promotion (Bursalıoğlu, 2005, p. 143).

a *Correspondence:* Yılmaz SARIER, Eskişehir Osmangazi University, Faculty of Education, 26480 Eskişehir / Turkey. E-mail: yilmazsariyer@yahoo.com. Phone: +90 222 339 3750.

The Level of Identification

It is the second level of commitment. Identification defines the influence between the individual and the group. An individual feels himself as a part of the group when he gets the opportunity to express himself freely. When a person identifies with the organization, his job satisfaction gets higher while his tolerance with the ambiguity is low. If his level of identification is high, he accepts the success of the organization as his own (Başaran, 2000, p. 33).

The Level of Internalization

This is the last level of commitment. It defines the accordance between the organizational and personal norms. An employee makes the organizational norms and values willingly not by forcing (Bursalıoğlu, 2005, p. 144).

Allen and Meyer (1990) identify three types of commitment; affective commitment, continuance commitment and normative commitment.

Affective Commitment

Affective commitment is defined as the emotional attachment, identification and involvement that an employee has with organization and goals (Wiener, 1982, p. 427). Affective commitment of an employee is the identification of an employee with a particular organization (Chen & Francesco, 2003, p. 501). It is a belief that acceptance of the organization's goals and values, a willingness to focus effort on helping organization achieve its goals and a desire to maintain organizational membership.

Continuance Commitment

Continuance commitment is the willingness to remain in an organization because of the investment that an employee has with 'nontransferable' investments like rank, retirement money (Obeng & Ugboro, 2003, p. 87). The main factor that influences this kind of commitment is the maintenance in the organization (Yalçın & İplik, 2005, p. 395). Continuance commitment means that disadvantages are when an employee will face when he leaves the organization.

Normative Commitment

Normative commitment is the commitment that a person believes that they have to the organization or their feeling of obligation to their workplace

(Wasti, 2002, p. 536). It is a 'generalized value of loyalty and duty.' It is a moral obligation to the organization (Gül, 2003, p. 45).

Schools are the fundamental organizations of educational systems. Schools fulfill the organizational, educational, and administrative purposes. Teachers and administrators perform their tasks using their own skills information and behaviors. In order to accomplish all these implied duties we need highly motivated and identified employees (Balay, 2000, p. 3).

For Web, Metha and Jordan (1992, p. 538) the results of research studies show that effective schools and their characteristics are closely related to organizational commitment. They added that the schools with teachers having high organizational commitment are effective schools.

It is obvious that we need effective practices to support the motivation and performances of teachers, so organizational commitment and the factors affecting commitment should be analyzed. However, it is stated that job satisfaction of teachers depends on not only good physical and economic factors but also psychological satisfaction by teaching (Celep, 2000, p. 146).

Particularly, the relationship between organizational commitment and gender has become the subject of several research studies (Balay, 2000; Karrasch, 2003; Şimşek, 2002). The researchers who studied on the stated subject had different results (Arbak & Kesken, 2005; Aven, Parker, & McEnyoy, 1993; Şimşek, 2002). According to some, men have stronger and constant feeling of organizational commitment than women because of higher salaries and better occupational positions (Arbak & Kesken, 2005, p. 82). According to others, females have higher organizational commitment (Kamer, 2001; Dixon, Turner, Cunningham, Sagas, & Kent, 2005). For another group, gender doesn't affect the organizational commitment (Balay, 2000, p. 165).

There are various factors that affect organizational commitment. Academicians and researchers put these factors into different categories. Charles Schwenk stated that these factors were previous experiences, demographic features, organizational-functional factors, and situational factors (Balay, 2000, p. 51).

The purpose of this study is to analyze the effect of gender on the organizational commitment of teachers. In accordance with this aim, the classification of organizational commitment was also investigated.

The fifteen theses between 2005-2009 were preferred. The research problem in this study is that whether teachers' gender affects the organizational commitment of teachers, if there is, how great the effect size is.

Method

Within the parallelism to the aim of the research, meta-analysis was used as the research method that combined the research findings of the master and doctoral thesis produced in Turkey. In this section, the procedures that were carried out for data collection, coding of the studies in terms of the principles determined, the definition of independent and dependent variables and calculation of effect sizes were explained.

The purpose of this research study is to analyze the effect of gender on the organizational commitment of teachers. The theses done between 2005-2009 were preferred. Firstly, fifteen theses including necessary information for meta analysis were obtained and coded. While coding, the author, date, name of the research study and its type and the sample with the place it was performed were included. These were shown in appendix 1.

Standardized effect size was preferred because of the varieties in sample sizes and scales. While interpreting the size effects, the classifications developed by Cohen and Thalheimer and Cook were used.

The criteria a research study must have are stated as being consistent with limitations and including the necessary statistical data. The criteria set for the study are as follow:

1. The theses of MD or PhD between 2005-2009
2. The data about organizational commitment
3. The teachers' opinions
4. The values of arithmetic mean and standard deviation

The effect size is one of the most important units used in meta-analysis. The effect size is said to be the fundamental of meta-analysis and it was developed by Cohen (1988, p. 40). It was defined as the frequency of factual occurrence in society. There are two models used in meta analysis; fixed effects model and random effects model (DeCoster, 2004; Shelby & Vaske, 2008).

Group effect meta analysis was used in the analysis of the data. With the formula of $d = (\bar{X}_c - \bar{X}_k) / SD$ Cohen's d was calculated. \bar{X}_c and \bar{X}_k express experi-

mental and control groups successively while SD tells the standard deviation (Şahin, 2005). In this research study experimental group was females whereas the control group is males. When effect size value is positive, it is in favor of females and when negative, it is in favor of males. MS Office Excel software was used to write formulas. The doctorate theses entitled 'The effect of the gender of education administrators and of education administrators who participated in the service training to their tasks: a meta-analysis' which was written by Özcan (2008) was partly used.

Results

In this part, the meta-analytic findings of research studies about the effect of gender on the job satisfaction of teachers are stated. Firstly, the frequency and percentage of each research study is calculated, and then effect size values are calculated.

Fifteen research studies are included in this study. As shown in Table 1, most of the research studies (41%) were carried out in 2009. 60% of the studies are done in İstanbul. 88% of the theses are at master's degree. 10 of the research studies were carried out by using the opinions of primary school teachers while 8 of them were done by using the opinions of secondary school teachers.

6 of the research studies are on the topic of organizational commitment. Similarly, 6 research studies are related to the different level of organizational commitment.

Using the fixed effect size model, the mean effect size was calculated as -0,07 between the lower limit of 0,36 and the upper limit of 0,44 with 95% confidence interval. It means that the effect of gender on the job satisfaction is in the favor of males. According to Cohen, Welkowitz and Ewen (2000) it can be interpreted as low effect. For the classification of Thalheimer and Cook, (2002) it is possible to say that it has negligible effect. According to the classification by Allen and Meyer (1990), the mean effect size for effective commitment was low, it was calculated as negligible for continuance and normative commitment. For females, the mean effect size for continuance and normative commitment increased. For the classification of O'Reilly and Chatman (1986) the mean effect sizes were different. For the level of accordance, it was calculated as 0,004 that was interpreted as negligible according to the classification of Thalheimer and Cook (2002). For the level of identification and internalization, it was found out low according to the classification of

Thalheimer and Cook (2002). For all these studies mentioned above, according to Cohen et al. (2000) the mean effect size was calculated as low and in favor of males.

For the fixed effects model, the effect size in population is assumed to be the same for all studies included in a meta-analysis. Therefore, the test of homogeneity (Q) was used. For all levels of organizational commitment, except accordance and continuance levels, the Q value was calculated greater than chi square value of 11, 07. It means that the calculations done by the fixed effects model is heterogeneous, so the random effects model was used. The calculation done by the random effects model shows that the Q value is not greater than the chi square value. It means that this study is homogeneous.

Discussion

In this research study, fifteen theses which include the necessary data according to coding principles were chosen. Most of the research studies were carried out in 2007 and following years (93%).

According to the fixed effects model, the mean effect size was calculated as -0, 07. It means that the effect of gender on the job satisfaction is in the favor of males. According to Cohen et al. (2000) it can be interpreted as low effect. For the classification of Thalheimer and Cook (2002), it is possible to say that it has negligible effect. It can be interpreted that male employees show slightly greater organizational commitment than females. For Allen and Meyer (1990), the mean effect size for affective commitment was low, and it was calculated as negligible for continuance and normative commitment. For females, the mean effect size for continuance and normative commitment increased. For the classification of O'Reilly and Chatman (1986) the mean effect sizes were different. For the level of accordance, it was calculated as 0.004 which was interpreted as negligible according to the classification of Thalheimer and Cook (2002). For the level of identification and internalization, it was found out low according to the classification of Thalheimer and Cook (2002). It is possible to say that female teachers have the organizational commitment in order to maintain and save their gains with the feeling of the necessity. Hrebiniak and Alutto (1972) stated that females leave their organizations less than males.

This result implies that males have stronger organizational commitment than females. This situation is interpreted as (Aven et al. 1993; Eren, 2004): Females think that the source of their commit-

ment and identity is their family roles. In other words, being a mother is more important than work. However, for males work is the first choice. In addition, females quit an employment or stay away from office more often. Similarly, some research studies asserted that females have low level of commitment too (Arbak & Kesken, 2005; Dixon et al., 2005; Yağın & İplik, 2005). Alvi and Ahmed (1987) stated that females have higher level of commitment than males. Mowday, Steers and Porter (1979) found that there was a coherent relationship between organizational commitment and gender. They added that females have higher level of commitment than males, because they tried to do a lot for their job status.

For the levels identification and internalization it was calculated in the favor of males. It means that males make the values and norms of organization as their own. In this research study, it was found out that there were differences between males and females in terms of organizational commitment and its levels. For the levels of accordance and continuance were found in favor of females while for the levels of identification and internalization it was on the favor of males. In addition, according to the fixed effects model it is generally heterogeneous while for the random effects model, it is homogeneous.

Suggestions for the researchers and practitioners;

1. Educational administrators could help individuals in organizations to improve their commitment by taking into consideration the request, need, and expectation of different genders.
2. In this research study, it has been found that the effect of gender is in favor of males. In other words females have lower level of commitment than males. We need more research studies to analyze the reasons. In this context, educational policymakers could evolve policies related to organizational commitment of teachers.
3. In the light of the study results, female teachers have commitment to maintain their advantages they gained. Some required policies could be made to increase the levels of identification and internalization.
4. In this research study the effect of gender on organizational commitment was analyzed. Researchers could investigate the effects of other independent variables on organizational commitment.

References/Kaynakça

- Allen, N. J., & Meyer, J.P. (1990). The measurement and antecedents of affective, continuance and normative commitment to the organization. *Journal of Occupational Psychology*, 63 (1), 1-18.
- Alvi, S., & Ahmed, S. W. (1987). Assessing organizational commitment in a developing country: Pakistan, a case study. *Human Relation*, 40 (5), 267-280.
- Arbak, Y. ve Kesken, J. (2005). *Örgütsel bağlılık, sağlık hizmetlerinde sürekli gelişim için davranışsal bir yaklaşım*. İzmir: Dokuz Eylül Üniversitesi Yayınları.
- Aven, F. F., Parker, B., & McEnvoy, G. M. (1993). Gender and attitudinal commitment to organizations: A meta analysis. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 72, 642-648.
- Balay, R. (2000). *Özel ve resmi liselerde yönetici ve öğretmenlerin örgütsel bağlılığı*. Yayınlanmamış doktora tezi, Ankara Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Ankara.
- Başaran, İ. E. (2000). *Örgütsel davranış insanın üretin gücü*. Ankara: Bilim kitap kurtasiye.
- Buchanan, B. (1974). Building organizational commitment: the socialization of managers in work organizations. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 19, 533-538
- Bursalhoğlu, Z. (2005). *Okul yönetiminde yeni yapı ve davranış*. Ankara: Pegem A Yayınları.
- Celep, C. (2000). *Eğitimde örgütsel adanma ve öğretmenler*. Ankara: Anı Yayıncılık,
- Chen, Z. X., & Francesco, A. M. (2003). The relationship between the three components of commitment and employee performance in China. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 62 (3), 490-516.
- Cohen, J. (1988). *Statistical power analysis for the behavioral sciences*. New York: Academic Pres.
- Cohen, J., Welkowitz, J., & Ewen R. B. (2000). *Introductory statistics for the behavioral sciences*. Orlando: Harcourt Brace College Publishers.
- Cohen, A. (2007). Commitment before and after: an evaluation and reconceptualization of organizational commitment. *Human Resource Management Review*, 17, 336-354.
- DeCoster, J. (2004). *Meta-analysis notes*. Retrieved 15 February 2011 from <http://www.stat-help.com/notes.html>.
- Dixon, M. A., Turner, B. A., Cunningham, G. B., Sagas, M., & Kent, A. (2005). Challenge is key: An investigation of affective organizational commitment in undergraduate interns. *Journal of Education for Business*, 80, 172-180.
- Eren, E. (2004). *Örgütsel davranış ve yönetim psikolojisi*. İstanbul: Beta Basım Yayım Dağıtım.
- Gül, H. (2003). *Karizmatik liderlik ve örgütsel bağlılık ilişkisi üzerine bir araştırma*. Yayınlanmamış doktora tezi, Gebze İleri Teknoloji Enstitüsü, Gebze.
- Hrebiniak, L. G., & Alutto, J. A. (1972). Personnel and role-related factors in the development of organizational commitment. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 17 (4), 555-573.
- Kamer, M. (2001). *Örgütsel güvenin örgütsel bağlılık ve örgütsel vatandaşlık davranışlarına etkileri*. Yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, İstanbul Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, İstanbul.
- Karrasch, A. I. (2003). Antecedents and consequences of organizational commitment. *Military Psychology*, 15 (3), 225-236.
- Mowday, R. T., Steers, R. M., & Porter, L. M. (1979). The measurement of organizational commitment. *Journal Of Vocational Behavior*, 14 (2), 224-247.
- Obeng, K., & Ugboro, I. (2003). Organizational commitment among public transit employees: An assessment study. *Journal of The Transportation Research Forum*, 57 (2), 83-98.
- O'Reilly, C., & Chatman, J. (1986). Organizational commitment and psychological attachment: The effect of compliance, identification and internalization on prosocial behavior. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 71 (3), 492-499.
- Özcan, Ş. (2008). *Eğitim yöneticisinin cinsiyet ve hizmetçi eğitim durumunun göreve etkisi: Bir meta analitik etki analizi*. Yayınlanmamış doktora tezi, Marmara Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü, İstanbul.
- Shelby, L. B., & Vaske, J. J. (2008). Understanding meta-analysis: A review of the methodological literature. *Leisure Sciences: An Interdisciplinary Journal*, 30 (2), 96-110.
- Şahin, M. C. (2005). *İnternet tabanlı uzaktan eğitimin etkililiği: Bir meta analiz çalışması*. Yayınlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, Çukurova Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Adana.
- Şimşek, M. (2002). *İnsan faktörü*. İstanbul: BabiAli Kültür Yayıncılık.
- Thalheimer, W., & Cook, S. (2002). *How to calculate effect size from published research: a simplified spreadsheet*. Retrieved 10 May, 2010 from http://www.work-learning.com/white_papers/effect_sizes/Effect_Sizes_Spreadsheet.xls.
- Wasti, S. A. (2002). Affective and continuance commitment to the organization: Test of an integrated model in the Turkish context. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations*, 26, 525-550.
- Web, L. D., Metha, A., & Jordan, K. F. (1992). *Foundation of american education*. New York: Macmillan Publishing Company.
- Wiener, Y. (1982). Commitment in organizations: A normative view. *Academy of Management Review*, 7 (3), 418-428.
- Yalçın, A. ve İplik, F. N. (2005). Beş yıldızlı otellerde çalışanların demografik özellikleri ile örgütsel bağlılıkları arasındaki ilişkiyi belirlemeye yönelik bir araştırma: Adana ili örneği. *Çukurova Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 14 (1), 395-412.
- Zangaro, G. A. (2001). Organizational commitment: A concept analysis. *Nursing Forum*, 36 (2), 14-23.