African-American Male Honor Students’ Views of Teaching as a Career Choice

By Vernon G. Smith, Faite R-P. Mack, & Stacey Gray Akyea

Statement of the Problem

Why are the brightest of the young, African-American male high school graduates not seeking a career in teaching? It is widely recognized that there are pedagogical and societal benefits to having more African-American male role models for both African-Americans and other ethnic and racial groups. This investigation was based on the premise that awareness of issues restricting African-American male participation could significantly contribute to larger effort to create a culturally informed and culturally diverse teaching population.

The study was designed to answer the questions: Is there a pool of qualified, interested male African-American high school students available to be recruited into teacher education programs? If so, what are the barriers that restrict them from pursuing a
teaching career? To seek answers to this question, this investigation surveyed the attitudes of African-American male honor graduates with regard to teaching as a career choice.

The Issue of Recruiting Minority Teachers

School districts and teacher educators have continued to express their concern about the critical under representation of minority groups in the profession of teaching (Banks, 1991, 1994; Case, Shive, Ingebretson, & Spiege, 1988; Golinick & Chinn, 1986; Gordon, 1993; Greer & Husk, 1989; Holmes, 1986; Smith 1988, Spelman, 1988, Mack & Jackson, 1998). In 1993 minority students comprised 30% of the student population (Hodgkinson, 1993). That figure is now approximately 38%, and six states (California, Hawaii, Louisiana, Mississippi, New Mexico, and Texas) and the District of Columbia have majority minority populations (National Center for Education Statistics, 2002). In Great City School Districts, minority students comprise 69% of the student body, English language learners account for 21%, and 72.5% of the Great City School Districts cite an immediate need for minority teachers (Recruiting New Teachers, 2003). Yet, only 12% of teachers in the United States are members of minority groups (Duarte, 2000).

Without sufficient exposure to minority teachers throughout their education, both minority and majority students tend to characterize the teaching profession, and the academic enterprise in general, as better suited for white Americans (Mack and Jackson, 1995). As the proportion of white American teachers grows, role modeling that might encourage minority students to pursue careers in education decreases, possibly further decreasing the already inadequate ratio of minority teachers to minority pupils in the schools. While the United States' population is growing in its racial/ethnic, cultural, and linguistic diversity, the teaching force is not.

The racial mismatch between students and teachers is quite striking. African Americans represent about 17 percent of students in public schools, but constitute only about eight percent of the teaching staff. Hispanics/Latinos are among 14 percent of public school students, but only about four percent of the teaching force. About five percent of public school students are Asian/Pacific Islanders, while less than one percent of public school teachers are categorized as such. American Indian and Alaska Natives comprise one percent of the student body and less than one percent of the teaching force (AACTE, 1999).

The downturn in minority educators has been so dramatic that some authors have referred to minority teachers and administrators as an “endangered species” (Cole, 1986; Irvine, 1988; Michigan Education Association, 1992; Tewel & Trubowitz, 1987). The implications are that most teachers teaching today’s children are white, and tomorrow’s teaching force will be even more so. The racial mismatch between students and teachers has reached the point that many students of color can go through 13 years of public education (K-12) without meeting a single teacher from their same
Vernon G. Smith

racial group. In school districts in which minority students out number white students, two-thirds (66 percent) of the teachers are white. Of these districts, African-American teachers still make up only 21 percent of the teaching force; Hispanic teachers 10 percent; and Asian/Pacific Islander teachers, three percent. Even in the high minority populated central cities of the United States, minority teachers still account for only 27 percent of the teaching force (Recruiting New Teachers, 2000).

Most white students in the United States complete their K-12 education without ever having a teacher of color. In school districts in which 90 percent or more of the students are white, the faculty is almost exclusively (99 percent) white. Even in districts with ten to less than 50 percent minority enrollment, 91 percent of the teachers are white (Alliance for Equity in Higher Education, 2000; Recruiting New Teachers, 2000).

In 1950 nearly half of the African-American professionals in the United States were teachers (Foster, 1989). However, with the increase in the number of African-American college graduates in a variety of fields, teaching is no longer perceived as a way out of the lower class. As a result, both teachers and parents may be discouraging talented African-American high school students from identifying teaching as a career option.

Even as potential role models, minority teachers may not be encouraging students to become teachers. In a 1988 survey of American teachers (Harris & Associates, 1988), African-American and Hispanic teachers were reported to be much more likely, than white teachers, to see themselves as leaving the teaching force. Of 300 teachers surveyed, 41% said they would likely leave teaching within five years as opposed to 25% of the white teachers. Although African-American teachers generally reported positive views of the factors associated with their teaching careers, they were not very likely to encourage their own children to enter the profession (Page, 1991; Mack & Jackson, 1996). Sullivan and Dziuban (1987) discovered that teachers frequently discouraged academically talented students from considering a career in teaching. Because of the frustrations associated with their own employment and status, they were accomplishing this so effectively that virtually none of their students, interviewed in the study, seriously considered public education as a career choice.

Page and Page (1984) reported that negative school environments discouraged high school seniors from considering teaching as a career option. The major finding of their study was that the variable which best determines if students will consider teaching is simply whether or not other individuals have discussed the career choice with them. The majority of students had never had anyone talk to them about selecting the teaching profession as their occupational choice.

A closer review of the teaching force in the United States reveals that the median age of the nation’s teachers is over 40, and that minority teachers with full-time teaching experience are concentrated in the upper age bracket. Among minority teachers, nearly half (46.3%) have ten-to-twenty years of experience,
African-American Male Honor Students’ Views of Teaching

while almost a third (28%) have taught for more than twenty years. Thus, a
significant number of minority teachers are anticipated to retire by the year 2005
(AACTE, 1999).

Within the context of these enrollment figures is the ever-growing disparity
between the diversity of the student body and the teaching force. Current population
estimates project that “minority” students will become the majority in United States
classrooms by 2050. The proportion of the United States minority school-aged
population (ages 5-to-17) is expected to increase to 44 percent by 2020 and to 54
percent by 2050 (U.S. Census Bureau, 2002).

The Issue of Recruiting African-American Males

Why are African-American males desirable as teachers in our schools both at
the elementary and secondary levels? Social scientists have long pointed out that
men and women are socialized early to learn appropriate gender roles (Weitzman,
1975; Chodorow, 1978; Thorne, 1993). Schools, as well as parents and peers,
courage and reinforce sex-appropriate, as well as society-appropriate, behaviors.
Once at school educators are asked to confront difficult societal problems that
manifest in the school and called for the presence of both genders. It is felt that men
are needed as teachers in our schools both at the elementary and secondary levels,
influencing the gender constructions of students. Unfortunately, teaching, espe-
cially in the elementary grades, has long been defined as women’s work with
minimal representation of males (Acker, 1996; Allen, 1993; Apple, 1994).

Jackson and Salisbury (1996) noted that children, especially boys, need
exposure to alternative ways of being male, a range of masculinities. Griffin-Howie
(200, February) in his article, “Is there really a ‘need’ for African-American
teachers in our nation’s public schools?,” argued that African-American children
need male teachers as well as teachers from diverse backgrounds. He questioned
whether African-American children would ever know, at an early age, that they
have the same experiences and opportunities available to them unless they have this
contact. He noted that he never realized that he had never seen an African-American
teacher until his senior year in high school.

Among the key issues that stand out as affecting African-American male
identity is ethnic distinctiveness and role model identification. A reason commonly
mentioned for the alienation and poor academic performance of some African-
American males is that they perceive most educational experiences as irrelevant to
their masculine identity and development. Furthermore, it is argued that schools and
teachers impose a “feminine” culture on males that inadvertently induces opposi-
tional behavior (Bernard, havingh, Nezsek & Pro-Bayard, 1996; Polite & Davis,

Given the alienating school contexts and consequences, particularly those
focusing on gender expectations, many African-American males become both
Vernon G. Smith

victims and participants in their own education marginalization (Polite & Davis, 1999). Moeller (1994) in the article, “Teaching Manhood in the Urban Jungle”, noted that some children have never had the opportunity to observe an adult black male who is successful in a career.

Research by Thornton (1999) provided issues central to male teacher training at the primary level: (a) access to male role models and peers, especially for those male students with problems; (b) not being made to stand out; and (c) the issue of physical contact with young children. Of the three issues, the participants cited physical contact with children as an important issue that needed to be addressed. Should they cuddle a distressed child? Should they escort children to the toilets or change wet pants? Should they ever be alone with children? Some respondents expressed concern that they might be seen perverts, or potential child abusers for wanting to work with children. These fears, combined with the fear of being considered homosexual seemed to be factors in deterring some men from work with young children (Burn, 1998; Penn & McQuail, 1997). However, participants claimed primary teaching to be worthwhile, socially valuable, rewarding, and interesting. Some mature males gave additional reasons for opting for primary teaching, for example, a career change and/or the correction of an earlier career mistake. Redundancy, unemployment, and job insecurity also led to career changes for older participants.

Tillman (1992) recommends that every public school system should provide concentrated opportunities and constructive purposes for young African-American male students to spend quality amounts of time with suitable adult African-American male teachers. If urban schools are to be successful with African-American male students, these schools must have the presence of both genders.

Survey Group and Survey Instrument

The survey group included 38 African-American male honor students from five high schools in the Gary (Indiana) School District. They were asked to complete a survey instrument regarding their interest in teaching as a career choice. Nine of the questions elicited a “yes” or “no” response and two of the questions asked for additional information from the respondents. From the sample, twenty-four surveys were returned with a return rate of 62%.

Of these two questions asking for additional information, the first asked the respondent to explain their answers using 100-200 words; the other asked the respondent to list (incentives that would lead him to pursue a career in teaching). Students were instructed to carefully read each item and to mark their response and/or write in the space provided. They were informed that the survey was not a test, and the only “right” answer was the one that was a true reflection of their opinion.

Each transcript was carefully read, with close attention given to those themes that consistently emanated from the data and provided insight into the students’
African-American Male Honor Students' Views of Teaching

schooling experiences. Similar themes were combined together. Pertinent quotes supporting a theme were identified and presented.

**Findings**

While 50% of those surveyed indicated that they would consider a career in teaching, not one identified teaching as their primary career choice. Instead, those careers chosen by the students are listed in Table 1 and included computer related fields, engineering, business, medical/health, and other areas.

**Table 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Field</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Computer related</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>37.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>25.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medical/Health</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16.67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8.33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The reasons noted for not considering a career in teaching were varied, however the responses centered around disciplinary problems in school, low salaries, job satisfaction and negative personal experiences with schooling. Following are typical, but particularly telling comments made:

- I’m going into a career that would be lucrative and everybody knows teachers are underpaid and overworked.
- With all the stupid things kids are doing in school and to the school I would be a fool to be a teacher. Kids are bringing guns into schools and shooting the school up. Why would I subject myself to that?
- Teaching is not stimulating for me. I would like to enjoy my career, and teaching would not make me happy.
- I would not consider teaching as a profession because that is not where my interest lies. Educating children is a tough profession because you have so many variables involved. Also, the monetary compensation for the difficult task of teaching is not worth the headache.
- I would not consider a career in teaching because of the disciplinary problems. Generally, parents are not as supportive of teachers as they once were.
- They don’t pay teachers enough for what they all have to endure. I don’t have time for bad kids and low pay.
- I probably couldn’t stand teaching bad kids. I would probably lose my temper at one of them and end up hurting them.
◆ I would not consider a career in teaching because a career has to be something that you love. It [teaching] might be boring.

◆ I don’t like repeating myself over and over again. In teaching you are faced with that situation repeatedly.

◆ I don’t think I have the desire to teach. If I were a teacher, my philosophy would be the class is a team and students don’t have the basics to understand that.

---

**Value of Teachers**

The respondents clearly were aware that there are problems in schools, yet they noted how needed and valuable teachers are. One graduate who expressed a desire to become a lawyer stated:

I would like to consider a career in teaching because of the students. I believe if you train, educate, and have patience with kids, there can be a bright future for them. A teacher can make a child’s future bright or dark. I would love to be a teacher, to be there for any student in my class that has a problem. If you show them [students] that they are somebody, their future can be as bright as the North Star. I am a good example of a problem student and a teacher made a difference in me.

Another student responded just as impressively about the teaching profession and noted:

I would pursue a career in teaching because I know the value of giving back. Being a teacher lets you know that you are making a difference in the lives of young people. Teaching is one of the few professions that you are actually able to see your effect on life. I know some teachers in my life that have really made me appreciate the job that they do. If you really think about it, teachers are the backbone of a community. Teachers are the people that start children at a young [age] making them believe that they are capable of doing something with their lives.

A third young man responded:

I would like to be a teacher because it is a job where you can use your knowledge to help someone who is trying to get where you are. I like working with kids. I’d also like the challenge of trying to teach kids who seem to be having learning disorders. Also, as a teacher I would have the opportunity to learn something new each day just as my students are learning something new.

Following is a sample of other comments:

◆ I would consider teaching due to the fact of the shortage in the area. The teaching field needs more males as teachers, especially of the African-American race. I feel I would be able to reach out and touch the students who are coming up in this century.

◆ The joy of seeing a child learn is worth a lot in a person’s life.

◆ I would consider a career in teaching because I like to see students do well.
African-American Male Honor Students' Views of Teaching

◆ If I cause only one student to be successful, I would consider it a great accomplishment.

Incentives

Of the students (50%) indicated they would consider a career in teaching, the most frequent incentive indicated was more money. Other incentives offered by these students included guaranteed safety in the classroom, working with students who attend school wanting to learn, strong community involvement, being able to select the school work site better benefits, more opportunity for promotions, better facilities, adequate instructional materials, availability of instructional technology in schools, extended vacation time, and college tuition reimbursement.

It is worth noting that those students (50%) who stated they would not consider a career in teaching were consistent by not listing incentives. However, when asked the question, “Would you choose a career in teaching if the pay was better?” one-third of those students replied “yes.” One student listed a huge salary of $65,000-to-$95,000 and a half-day schedule. Of the total survey group, 67% responded, “yes” to the above question.

Responding to the question, “Did you know there is a shortage and need for African-American males in the teaching field? 79% indicated “yes.” A follow-up question was then asked, “Knowing that there is a shortage of and need for African-American males in the teaching field, would this cause you to consider a teaching career?” only 29% said “yes.”

Participants were asked, “Would you choose a career in teaching for job security?” The response was 29% “yes” and 71% “no.” Focusing on the issue of discipline, 59% indicated they would consider teaching if the disciplinary problems in schools could be better controlled.

Directing the role of parents in their career choice, 16% noted that at least one of their parents was a teacher. While only 29% noted that their parent(s) influenced their career choice. This response supports the findings of Mack and Jackson (1996, 1998) that one of the strongest influences against selecting a career in teaching was emanating from teachers and school counselors.

Summary and Conclusions

Are we correct in believing that African-American male students are not interested in teaching as a career? The findings in this study, although limited, have suggested that some qualified African-American male students are interested in teaching a career and are available to be recruited into teacher education programs. Our results suggest that lack of career awareness, lack of positive information regarding the profession, and lack of encouragement are obstacles to students pursuing that interest. Somehow these intervening variables have become effective gatekeepers in restricting African-American male student enrollments in schools of
education. The findings of this study are consistent with a number of previous studies that have addressed the factors influencing choice of teaching as a career (Evans, 1993; Jackson & Salisbury, 1996; Mack & Jackson, 1998.)

For many African-American students, making money and gaining occupational stability are important factors in career selection (Wilder, 1999), but more often than not, a career decision is likely to involve interplay between intrinsic and extrinsic considerations (Johnston, McKeown, & McEwen, 1999). While individual interests and aptitudes undoubtedly play an important role, the perceived attractiveness of the work of teaching is also influential. Unfortunately, males, especially African-American males, have negative perceptions of teaching as a career. These perceptions, however, can be positively influenced.

Smith (1997) documents the strong positive correlation between caring teachers and mentors and academic achievement on the part of students. Students in this study cited the constructive associations they had with teachers and the difference it made in their lives. Maybe we have overlooked the value of caring mentors, at the pre-collegiate level, in the recruitment of underrepresented populations into the field of teaching.

The views of these African-American students about classroom and school experiences are important for us to consider. An emotionally nurturing and safe climate is one of the correlates of effective schooling. The experiences of these students clearly tell that the climate is not good in our schools. Perceived negative experiences of classroom teachers and disruptive classrooms turn off students, especially high ability students.

The findings of this study have implications for teacher recruitment campaigns that have often focused attention on those who have already decided to consider a career in teaching or who have embarked on a teacher-training course. In contrast, we suggest that efforts need to focus more attention on those factors that the “undecided” view as important in influencing their choice of a career by in teaching. If African-American males are to be recruited into teaching, efforts should be designed that address concerns identified in this study.

Perhaps the most valuable tool of any recruitment plan might be the benefits that are available for a potential participant. It is no different in the profession of teaching. To attract bright, energetic candidates, incentives must be considered, especially in the realistic world in which highly qualified African-American males can literally choose among a variety of career opportunities. The most frequent response from these students was salary. Other items of importance included safe school environments, students wanting to learn, community involvement, quality facilities and resources, career advancement opportunities, and assistance with the cost of their college education.

It is significant to note that 50 % of the subjects in the present study indicated that they would consider a career in teaching. The efforts of schools of education and all concerned about the “endangered” status of African-American male and other
African-American Male Honor Students’ Views of Teaching

minority teachers must not only be focused on the collegiate level). This study suggests that innovative programs should be developed and instituted at the pre-collegiate level, especially for males, who may have an interest in teaching as a career choice. Concerted efforts must be made to influence their decision-making, and to present the positive opportunities available in a teaching career. Mentors must be assigned to these potential candidates to provide positive models of individuals who are attracted by a desire to work with children and to perform a service to society.

While the professional literature is full of tangible quantitative data about the imbalance in numbers of African-American males compared to other gender and racial groups, few studies have addressed the issue of African-American males in teaching, especially those who have not considered a career in teaching. This study sought to extend what is currently known about the factors influencing African-American males’ choice of teaching as a career. From the data, we offer the following strategies for increasing male, African-American enrollment in pre-service teacher education programs:

1. Establish Future Teacher Associations at middle and high school levels.
2. Establish scholarship programs that offer work-study and summer employment opportunities in high schools.
3. Encourage successful African-American male educators to visit every school for the purpose of proselytizing the virtues of being a teacher.
4. Encourage successful African-American male teachers and administrators to serve as mentors for high school and college students interested in a teaching career.
5. Organize publicity activities that communicate the employment rewards offered by teaching.
6. Establish “magnet” middle-and-high schools that have a teaching career as a theme. Grow your own!

If our nation’s schools are to reflect the model of a “just society”, minorities, especially African-American males, will have to be empowered with an equitable representation of teachers and school administrators, and a guarantee that teacher education is inclusive rather than exclusive. As stated by E.L. Boyer (1990), we must recognize that inequality is rooted in the society at large, and it falls on higher education to have an unequivocal commitment to social justice.

Teacher education schools and departments must greatly expand their efforts to increase significantly the number and proportion of minority graduates (Mack &
Vernon G. Smith

Smith, 1996). Since a majority of African-American students are attending predominantly white institutions, it becomes even more critical for those institutions to adopt policies that are innovative in recruiting, supporting, and graduating a greater number of minorities. Changing demographics suggest that the nation can ill afford to waste valuable resources by ignoring minority students; and the nation’s future will depend on minority students’ success, thus influencing the social, economic, and political stature of the United States (Midgette & Stephens, 1990).

The goal of attracting talented African-American candidates to enter teaching is highly supported. The barrage of state teacher competency testing indicates that there is a concern for having highly qualified persons in our nation’s classrooms. Both concern for quality and a need for quantity have presented a problem in the educational arena. In seeking the best qualified candidates, we have we have not given attention to what motivates people to teach nor addressed the factors that discourage people from desiring to teach (professional environment and extrinsic rewards). If we aspire to attract qualified African-American males, we must respond to what they view as being important for a life span of work. While African-American males in this study indicated the presence of intrinsic values of teaching, extrinsic values for the most part are unsatisfying for the overwhelming majority.

As with qualitative research, this study presents findings that can be expressed and described verbally. Characteristically, qualitative studies attempt to describe events or discern patterns of behavior exhibited by an individual or group. Qualitative studies focus on the particular documents or persons under investigation; it is not the researchers’ intent to generalize the findings to some larger group (Frankel & Wallen, 2002). Instead these findings raise interesting issues many of which parallel and support the findings of other investigators focusing on this topic. Accordingly, the findings from this study warrant further research and policy makers wishing to increase the number of African-American male teachers should consider the conclusions. It has no consequence if we don’t use the findings and the similar finding in other studies to change the negative school experiences of our youth, to actively work to attract at an early age our best and brightest, and to guide the most capable into pursuing a career in teaching.

References:

Alliance for Equity in Higher Education. (2,000). Educating the emerging majority: The role of
African-American Male Honor Students’ Views of Teaching

of minority-serving colleges & universities in confronting America’s teacher crisis.

Washington, DC: The Institute for Higher Education Policy.
American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education. (1999). Teacher education
pipeline IV: Schools colleges and departments education enrollments by race and

Apple, M.W. (1994). Is change always good for teachers? Gender, class and teaching in history,
in K. Borman & N. Greenman (Eds.) Changing American Education: Recapturing the

15). New York: ERIC.


teachers: Conversations with high school sophomores. Research Triangle Park, NC:
Southeastern Educational Improvement Laboratory.

improving the recruitment of male early childhood education professionals: The female
viewpoint. Masters Project, Grand Valley State University.

Boyer, J. (1990, January). In search of community. Speech presented at American Council
on Education Annual Convention, Washington, DC.

Burn, E. (1998, September). We must erase the “pervert” stigma. TES, 18, 16.

Case, C.W., Shive, R.J., Ingebretson, K., & Spiege, V.M. (1988). Minority teacher education:

Chodorow, N. (1978). The reproduction of mothering: Psychoanalysis and the sociology of

Department of Education National Center for Educational Statistics.

55, 326-334.


Foster, M. (1989, November). Recruiting teachers of color: Problems, programs and possibili-
ties. Paper presented at the Fall Conference of the Far West Holmes Group, Reno, NV.

Frankel, J. R. & Wallen, N. E. (2002). How to design and evaluate research in Education


bus: Charles Merrill.

Gordon, J.A. (1993). Why students of color are not entering teaching: Reflections from

68(8), 598-605.

Phi Delta Kappa Foundation.


Holmes, B.J. (1986). Do not buy the conventional wisdom: Minority teachers can pass the tests. Journal of Negro Education, 55, 335-346.


Howson, J. (1998, November). Where have all the young men gone? How data, TES, 6, 22.


87
African-American Male Honor Students' Views of Teaching


