

Result-Oriented Management: the Experience of Kazakhstani Universities

Samal Askarkyzy^a, Adlet Toibayev^b, Nursulu Algozhaeva^a, Zelvys Rimantas^c, Guldariya Iskakova^d and Aigul Arynova^e

^aAl-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty, REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN; ^bKazakh State Women's Pedagogical University, Almaty, REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN; ^cVilnius University, Vilnius, LITHUANIA; ^dI. Zhanusugurov Zhetysu State University, Taldykorgan, REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN; ^eSarkand Liberal Arts College, Sarkand, REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN

ABSTRACT

The present article outlines the main principles and peculiarities of the result-oriented university management on the basis of the Development strategy of the Kazakh State Women's Pedagogical University for 2013-2020. The relevance of the investigated issue is conditioned by the fact that in the context of a highly competitive market of research and educational services, universities search for new management instruments that help to achieve a competitive strategic management of the modern university. The research is carried out on the basis of records of the structural departments of the university in the relevant areas and objectives set out in the strategy. The main method of the study is the method of a comparative analysis and synthesis. Drawing upon the results received, a SWOT analysis of the financial and economic sustainability of the university is presented. It is proved that the realization of the task to improve the quality level of educational services will increase the competitiveness of the university in the domestic and international markets of research and educational services. This requires the implementation of result-oriented education - the development of a system of professional competence with regard to the labor market requirements, views of students, graduates, teachers and researchers. For this, it is assumed that there will be a full transition to a modular principle of constructing the structure of educational programs, which will enhance the mobility and variability of educational programs. The results and recommendations can be applied in the educational, scientific and economic system development strategies of Kazakhstan and are of significant interest to Kazakh scientific and educational thought.

KEYWORDS

Educational management, development strategy, human resources, strategic planning

ARTICLE HISTORY

Received October 15, 2016
Revised November 25, 2016
Accepted November 27, 2016

Introduction

Education is recognized as one of the most important priorities of the long-term strategy "Kazakhstan-2050". The overall goal of educational reforms in Kazakhstan is to adapt the system of education to the new socio-economic

CORRESPONDENCE Samal Askarkyzy ✉ samal050191@mail.ru

© 2016 Askarkyzy et al. Open Access terms of the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>) apply. The license permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, on the condition that users give exact credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons license, and indicate if they made any changes.

environment. The President of the Republic of Kazakhstan has also set a task for the country to join the 30 most competitive countries of the world. The improvement of the system of education plays an important role in achieving this goal (Online media, 2016).

One of the universities of Kazakhstan, which is being developed after the strategy “Kazakhstan – 2050”, is the Kazakh State Women's Pedagogical University. The Kazakh State Women's Pedagogical University was opened as an institute by the Resolution of the Council of People's Commissars of the Kazakh SSR No.457 dated August 15, 1944 “On the preparation of the qualified teaching staff from among Kazakh women's youth”. History of the discovery of this institute, the purpose of which was to attract girls from remote areas for receiving a higher education and upbringing through the training of spiritual and moral qualified staff.

Robin Kramar (2014) in his article on strategic human resources management notes that a man in a society needs to have an experience and education, which give the professional development, in order to be competitive. While agreeing with the author of this article, we note that the Kazakh State Women's Pedagogical University trains the staff, which is competitive in today's society. This is confirmed by the following fact: on the basis of the order No.802 dated April 23, 2008, the Control Committee in the field of Science and Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan granted a permission to defend dissertation works at the D 14.61.09 dissertation council, created at the Kazakh State Women's Pedagogical Institute, in the following specialties: “13.00.01 - General Pedagogy, Pedagogy and History of Education, Ethno-pedagogy”, “13.00.02 - Theory and Methods of Training and Education”. Dissertation works covered different fields of science.

In 2010, at the university dissertation council, 16 candidate and 3 doctoral dissertations were defended. Nataliya Lukyanova, Yuriy Daneykin and Natalia Daneikina (2015) in their article about the communicative competence of management argue that lifelong education gives a person stability in the environment as an educated person. The authors consider that higher education for the individual has a communicative nature. For this, higher education institutions give an opportunity to get some knowledge.

To date, there are several approaches to the formation of a university management system. S. D. Reznik and V. M. Filippov (2010) consider the system of university management as a socio-economic system, which reflects the “relationship between the elements of the environment that affect the system of university management, and the final results of the activity of this system, which can be achieved through an effective use of the principles and mechanisms for implementing the system of linkages and relationships between the object and the subject of management of this system”.

Y.S. Vasiliev, V.V. Glukhov and M.P. Fedorov (2001) determine four management levels: conceptual solutions, strategic management tasks, tactical management tasks and operational management, which belongs to the temporary group of tasks. These levels are intersected by the functional areas of management.

O. G. Ilyina (1997) considers the organizational structure of university management from the point of view of strategic management and includes 11 control subsystems in its structure, which are based on the challenges they face.

These subsystems cover education planning, marketing, financing of the university activity, learning organization, research work, advanced training and retraining, teachers' labor organization, staff involvement, staff development, remuneration, maintenance.

The above-mentioned definitions and systems of university management are complementary, but they do not provide an innovative component as one of the elements, which, in our opinion, should be allocated to one of management subsystems.

The Development Strategy and Mission of the University

When providing services, the university has its own particular mission. The mission of the Kazakh State Women's Pedagogical University is as follows: the development of knowledge (science) and the provision of teacher education for girls; the training of specialists with an active citizenship; the creation of favorable conditions for the integration of education, science and innovation with regard to the preservation of national traditions and customs of the Kazakh people. The goal and objectives of the university strategy are given in Table 1.

Table 1. Development strategy of the Kazakh State Women's Pedagogical University for 2013-2020

Name	The Development Strategy of the Republican state enterprise on the basis of the right of economic management "Kazakh State Women's Pedagogical University" of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2013-2020
Development foundation	Strategy "Kazakhstan - 2050: new political course of the established state"; State Program for Development of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan for 2011 - 2020; Legal acts on education, science, public property, industrial-innovative development, civil and labor law
Developer	The Republican state enterprise on the basis of the right of economic management "Kazakh State Women's Pedagogical University" of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan
Goals and objectives	Improvement of the status and competitiveness of the university; Formation of the structure of the teaching staff, researchers and employees of the administrative and managerial staff with a high level of qualification; Introduction of modern forms of corporate management of the university; Creation of a favorable infrastructure for receiving a high-quality, accessible education; Introduction and implementation of the research projects aimed at the industrial and innovative development of the country; Formation of patriotism bases, active citizenship, social and moral responsibility and leadership in the youth; Creation of conditions for the commercialization of the results of scientific, methodical and educational activities; Introduction of new financing mechanisms of the university activity; Formation of a public-private partnership system through the introduction of welfare institutions, employers' council with modern content and composition; Entry into the world educational space for the development of various forms of cooperation in the field of training of competitive specialists of higher and postgraduate education;



	Creation of the environment for the integration of scientific and educational activities.
Main principles	<p>Scientific rigor and focus on innovation: constant pursuance of the use of the latest scientific achievements in the organization and planning of educational activities, willingness to apply new technologies, scientific knowledge and information in the university activity;</p> <p>Consistency and integrity: provision of a dynamic and integrated system of implementing mandatory, recommendatory and facultative parameters, tools and mechanisms to improve the educational process;</p> <p>Continuity: provision of lifelong education, based on the advanced educational and innovative teaching technologies;</p> <p>Diversification: expansion in the number of specialties and development of new types of educational services designed to improve the quality and growth of the competitiveness of graduates;</p> <p>Transparency: provision of the availability of information resources and the transparency of the educational process;</p> <p>Autonomy and academic freedom: self-sufficiency and collegiality in management and decision-making in various areas of the university activity, based on democratic principles and the personal responsibility of each participant of the educational process, the achievement of academic freedom in conjunction with the qualitative regulation of the educational process and the organization of work;</p> <p>Internationalization of higher education: an important part of the educational policy, characterized by the accessibility, universalization and innovativeness of the educational process through the enhancement of international cooperation and academic mobility;</p> <p>Legitimacy: strict observance of all legal norms in educational, scientific, industrial, economic and other activities of the university</p>
Terms of realization (stages)	<p>The Development Strategy is implemented in two stages:</p> <p>First stage: 2013-2016;</p> <p>Second stage: 2017-2020.</p>
Target indicators	Target, qualitative and quantitative parameters - figures given in the tables
Sources and volumes of financing	Budgetary, extra-budgetary and other means by which the goals and objectives set forth in the Development Strategy will be implemented

The Development Strategy of the university is the main document, which will be the basis for taking appropriate decisions and internal regulations aimed at the development of the university. The adoption of the Strategy is conditioned by the world modern trends taking place in the sphere of education and science, the labor market changing conditions and, in particular, the socio-economic situation of the country. The implementation of the Strategy will provide an adequate response of the university to external and internal requests and the establishment of the university as a leading world-class higher education institution. The realization of the Strategy is planned in two phases. At the level of the first stage, in the period from 2013 to 2016, through the completion of structural changes, the university will focus on the implementation of preparatory measures aimed at the transition to autonomy, the improvement of the quality of educational services and learning technology. At this stage, by improving the material and technical base, the necessary conditions should be created for entering into the world educational space.

Management of Higher Education Institutions

As it is known from the management theory, the need for management arises where activities are performed by two persons or more. Since the university manages over thousands of people, it should be noted that the learning process and the achievement of any goal is impossible without the organizational management. Thus, the university must have a certain structure that makes it possible to manage in an appropriate manner. We would like to give an example based on the experience of the Kazakh State Women's Pedagogical University.

The structure of the university consists of six faculties: Physics and Mathematics; Social Science and Humanities; Pedagogy and Psychology; Natural Sciences; Kazakh philology and World Languages; Arts and Culture.

The university provides training for the teaching staff in 43 (forty-three) specialties of the professional training program of higher education (bachelor's degree course), 22 (twenty-two) specialties of post-graduate education (master's degree course) and 4 (four) specialties of doctoral studies – PhD. At the date of approval of the present Strategy, the university had 7,646 students taking courses in 6 (six) faculties, including intramural – 4,880, extramural – 2,766, master's degree students – 434 and doctoral students - 9.

At the same time, management is the process regulating the achievement of the objectives of the educational policy of the state and society as a whole by the authorized state and non-state bodies, organizations and officials (Higgins, 1983). This process includes the analysis and evaluation of the current practice in the field of education, the identification of goals and tasks of educational management, the planning of activities on the implementation of the assigned tasks and the organization of coordinated activities between all the elements of the education system and others. In this sense, the management of the education system is the system management, and the education system itself is nothing else than a management system. University as part of the education system performs the assigned tasks at the state level. Thus, according to the order No.554 of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated December 30, 2011, at the premises of the university, the preparatory department has been operating since 2012. The university has the Research and Development Institute for Social and Gender Studies, Center for Professional Advancement, Centre for Multilingual Education, Center for Information and Communication Technologies, Center for Basic Research and the Laboratory of the Development Problems of Kazakh schools. The activity of these structures is determined by the legal acts of the university, the work plans and decisions of the Academic Council. The proportion of intramural students, trained in the state language, is 88.1%, extramural - 63.82%, based on the state educational grant - 32.87%. The master's degree course includes 434 people, of whom 97% - based on the state order.

Management of higher education institutions is an important structural element of the system of lifelong education. Legal, economic and social bases of the organization and activity of higher education institutions are defined in the law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Higher Education". Continuous educational and professional programs, which are different in nature and scope, content and duration of training, the development of which is certified by the documents on the relevant level of higher education, can be implemented in higher education institutions. The multilevel structure of higher education is



aimed at expanding the opportunities of higher school to meet the diverse cultural and educational needs of the individual, and enhancing the professional, scientific and cultural training of professionals with regard to the changing needs of the economy and the labor market.

Currently, the education system of the university is based on the credit technology of education, implemented on the basis of the Rules of organizing the academic process according to the credit technology of education, approved by Order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 20, 2011 No.152. Training is conducted in the state, Russian and English languages. The percentage composition of the teaching staff is as follows: in the state language - 89.6%, in Russian - 16.9%, in English - 11.7%. The employment of graduates in the field is carried out by the state order, at the request of employers - consumers, by agreements and independently. Security share for the bachelor's degree course is 86%, master's degree course - 92%, PhD - 100%. M.K. Sadykova (2012) in her scientific paper on employment issues shows and evaluates the employment of graduates of this university. According to the figures presented, it can be seen that all the graduating specialists in teacher education have been employed.

Human Resources in the Structure of University Management

Human resources also play an important role in management. Human resource management is a set of abilities and opportunities of the administrative staff to ensure the effective functioning of the management system. Upon reaching the optimal level of human resource development, the size and structure of the staff meet the needs of the rationally organized management structure and complexity of the tasks; the level of qualification helps to provide a high quality of the decisions made and their early implementation; physical data and individual psychological characteristics of the staff correspond to the specifics of management activity in market conditions.

The total number of the teaching staff at the university at the date of approval of this strategy is 644 people. Among them: regular workers - 86.9% (560 people), with academic degrees - 42.8%, with academic degrees including academic titles - 46.3%. Of these, full-time workers - 69.7% (449 employees), half-time - 22.5% (145 employees), those who work on a 0.75 basis - 4% (26 employees), on a 0.25 basis - 3.3% (21 employees). The number of teaching employees with academic degrees and titles is 298, which amounts to 46.2% of the total number of teachers at the university. Among them, 9.9% is taken by doctors of science and professors, and 36.3% - by candidates of science and associate professors. The average age of teaching employees with academic degrees and titles is 53 years, the proportion of teaching employees who speak 3 (three) languages - 26.1%. The university staff is formed by the following occupational groups: teaching and research staff; administrative and management staff (AMS); educational support staff (ESS) and service staff (SS). It should also be noted that it is the human resources that carry out the assigned objectives and tasks and make it possible to manage the process.

At the university level, in the period from 2011 to 2014, there were accepted more than 300 (three hundred) legal acts in various areas of the university activity including:

- a) staff management;

- b) admission (enrollment) of students;
- c) academic policy;
- d) socio-economic problems, including remuneration questions;
- e) pursuance of scientific researches;
- f) management and use of state property;
- g) realization of the internal control;
- h) provision of the safety of students and employees;
- i) information security;
- j) consideration of the references of private persons and legal entities and other activities.

N.V. Shumakova (2013) in her article on innovative technologies in the system of vocational training notes about preparing students for scientific research work with the use of innovative technologies. The author believes that each prospective educational institution should use innovative technologies in education and science. We can note that within its walls the Kazakh State Women's Pedagogical University applies innovative technologies, which is proved by the data below. Research studies are the most important resource and tool for the formation of teachers' competencies and skills of the retrieval, analysis, development and updating of the information, ensuring the success of professional work. The research activity of both the university and the teaching staff is an important strategic direction. The research activity also involves students in accordance with the educational programs. In 2013, the university implemented 6 research projects, the total funding of which is 32 million tenge. The sources of funding are the budgetary means allocated by the relevant budget programs, approved by the Committee of Science of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Foundation of the First President of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the university funds raised by the types of services provided. These research projects were attended by 42 teachers and research workers, which is 6% of the total number of the teaching staff, and the participation share of students, masters and PhD candidates was 10%.

From 2008 to 2013, 54 articles were published by the teaching staff of the university in scientific journals of the former Soviet Union and other foreign countries, including 23 articles for 2012. In 2012, 438 employees of the university attended international symposia and conferences, the proportion of their participation in foreign conferences was 7%.

In the furtherance of the implementation of creative and scientific potential of young people, the Small Academy of Sciences has been opened at the university. The structure of the Small Academy of Sciences consists of the representatives of the student community of six faculties. At the university level, the program "Projects Start-up" was elaborated, 15 projects were developed in 2013, and at the expense of extra-budgetary funds, the decision on funding was made for 4 (four) projects planned to be implemented since January 2014. The university students take an active part in the republican subject competitions and scientific conferences. Thus, in the 2012-2013 academic year, 80 university students were the winners of various scientific competitions. For the organization and participation of students in the most important



competitions and contests, more than 9 million tenge was allocated in 2012. In the 2012-2013 academic year, for the organization and holding of 14 conferences held at the university and faculty level, more than 10 million tenge was allocated (Development Strategy, 2013).

With regard to the above-mentioned data, a SWOT analysis of the financial and economic sustainability of the university is presented in Table 2.

Table 2. SWOT analysis of the financial and economic sustainability of the university

S - strengths (potentially positive internal factors)	W - weaknesses (potentially negative internal factors)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Availability of the required educational and methodological base, a supportive social infrastructure of the university; - Availability of strong scientific schools; - A permanent system of the internal control over the quality of teaching and administrative management; - A high level of international cooperation of the university with various scientific schools, foreign universities and scientists; - A high level of informatization of the academic process; - Introduction of the trajectory of learning in the English language; - Availability of the required material and technical base of the university; - Wide geography of international cooperation; - An increase in academic mobility of the teaching staff and students; - Sufficient supply of the highly qualified staff; - An increase in the number of teachers who speak foreign languages; - Sufficient supply of the highly qualified managers; - Compliance of the university management system with the principles of corporate management; - Availability of the policy attracting young specialists-managers possessing management skills to the university management. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Lack of the close connection between the research work and the service staff within the framework of research projects; - Aging of human resource capacity in a number of scientific directions; - Lack of the executive discipline of employees; - Insufficient academic degree holders rate of human resources in certain specialties; - Insufficient level of the diversification of financial flows; - A low cost of training; - Insufficient logistical support to the educational process; - Lack of knowledge of the English language of the academic staff and students. - Depreciation of equipment; - Lack of commercialization and implementation of research results; - Insufficiently developed relations with business structures; - Poor state of the material and technical base; - Lack of effective mechanisms to combat plagiarism. - An insufficient number of textbooks in the Kazakh and Russian languages; - Availability of international treaties unrealizable in practice; - Inertia of faculties and departments in the development of international cooperation; - A large percentage of extramural students; - Shortage of qualified medium-level managers; - A high degree of bureaucracy and complexity of certain procedures; - Insufficient autonomy of structural divisions.
O - opportunities (potentially positive external factors)	T - threats (potentially negative external factors)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Financial support from the public authorities; - Regular funding for the advanced training of teaching employees; - Opportunity for the introduction of various 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Change of the university's top management which in the long term will have a negative impact on the degree of continuity in the development of the university policy; - Financial inability of the contingent of

-
- | | |
|---|---|
| <ul style="list-style-type: none">technical means of corporate management;- Opportunity to attract foreign specialists to the university's top management.- Opportunity to allocate funds for the advanced training of the academic staff in foreign centers;- Opportunity to obtain financial autonomy;- An increase in the development of international scientific and educational mobility of the academic staff;- Opportunity to improve the quality of research and development with access to the international level results;- Support from the public authorities.- An increase in the level of protection of intellectual and industrial property objects;- Obtainment of grants of international organizations and funds for research activities;- Availability of public financial support for academic mobility of master's degree students;- International accreditation of educational programs;- An increase in scholarships for pedagogical specialties. | <ul style="list-style-type: none">students;- Poor funding of the material base of the academic process;- Competition on the part of other universities in the country;- Insufficient training of high school graduates (particularly, in the field of English learning);- Student enrollment in the university on the "leftover" principle;- A high cost of equipment.- Insufficient funding for research activities of the academic staff;- A low level of wages;- Competition on the part of national universities on the selection of human resources;- Turnover of the highly qualified staff;- Lack of interest on the part of foreign colleagues in the cooperation in scientific work on pedagogical sciences;- Unrecognized nature of the university in foreign countries. |
|---|---|
-

Conclusion

A source of education of the Kazakh girls, an educational institution, which turned into an intellectual contemporary school and underwent a number of changes over the 70-year history of its existence, now has become the university of humanity and creativity, which boldly steps into the world educational space. Positive traditions of the university formed over the years, qualified specialists and productive work of the known scientists currently reflect a solid foundation of today's success of the creative and intellectual potential of the Kazakh State Women's Pedagogical University. The academic staff and management of the university believe that the history of the hearth of education, which began back in the harsh 40th years of the last century, is not only the vivid traces of the past but also a solid foundation for building a strong, spiritual, modern, creative and intellectual center of education with great research and creative potential. It is proceeding to the future, educating the highly qualified staff and preparing hard-working young people of great erudition.

The future of the country, as known, is the youth. The same thought is given in the paper written by E. B. Moje (2002), who says that the youth is the value of the society, and the promotion of young people shows the country's future. We fully agree with this author.

Disclosure statement

No potential conflict of interest was reported by the authors.

Notes on contributors

Samal Askarkyzy is a PhD student at Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan

Adlet Toibayev is Cand.Sci. (Pedagogy) and Vice President for Academic Affairs at Kazakh State Women's Pedagogical University, Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan

Nursulu Algozhaeva is Cand.Sci. (Pedagogy) and Deputy Dean for Academic Affairs at Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty, Republic of Kazakhstan

Zelvys Rimantas is Dr.Sci. (Pedagogy) and Professor at Vilnius University, Vilnius, Lithuania

Guldariya Iskakova holds a Master's degree in History and now is Senior Lecturer at I. Zhansugurov Zhetysu State University, Taldykorgan, Republic of Kazakhstan

Aigul Arynova is Senior Lecturer in Sarkand Liberal Arts College, Sarkand, Republic of Kazakhstan

References

- Development Strategy (2013). Development Strategy of the Kazakh State Women's Pedagogical University for 2013-2020. Almaty: Kazakh State Women's Pedagogical University.
- Higgins, J.M. (1983). *Organizational policy and strategic management: text and cases*. 2nd ed. Chicago: The Dryden Press.
- Ilyina, O.G. (1997). *Methodology of the statistical research of university management*. PhD thesis. Moscow: Moscow State University of Economics, Statistics, and Informatics.
- Kramar, R. (2014). Beyond strategic human resource management: Is sustainable human resource management the next approach? *International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 25(8), 1069-1089.
- Lukyanova, N., Daneykin, Y. & Daneikina, N. (2015). Communicative competence management approaches in higher education. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 214, 5 December, 565-570.
- Moje, E. B. (2002). Re-framing adolescent literacy research for new times: Studying youth as a resource. *Reading Research and Instruction*, 41(3), 211-228.
- Online media "Zakon.kz" (2016). Retrieved from: <http://www.zakon.kz/>
- Reznik, S.D. & Filippov, V.M. (2010). *University management* [Textbook]. 2nd ed. Moscow: INFRA-M.
- Sadykova, M.K. (2012). Employment issues: plans and expectations of pedagogical university students (based on materials of the Kazakh State Women's Pedagogical University). Paper presented at the *International Scientific Conference on Teaching Skills* (pp. 294-297). Moscow: Buki-Vedi.
- Shumakova, N.V. (2013). Innovative technologies in the system of vocational training of students. *Young Scientist*, 5, 787-789.
- Vasiliev, Y.S., Glukhov, V.V. & Fedorov, M.P. (2001). *Economy and organization of university management* [Textbook]. 2nd ed. St. Petersburg: Lan'.