Best Practices in the Transition to Work Services for Students with Intellectual Disability: Perspectives by Gender from Saudi Arabia

Ghaleb Alnahdi, PhD
Assistant professor, Special Education Department
College of Education
Prince Sattam bin Abdulaziz University
Best Practices in the Transition to Work Services for Students with Intellectual Disability: Perspectives by Gender from Saudi Arabia

Transition to work services are a complex process and can cover an enormous range of practices. This paper examines the literature on best practices in transition to work services and considers teachers' perspectives regarding these practices. Teachers working with students with intellectual disabilities participated in this study (369). The three practices rated highest by teachers were exposing students to work experiences, maximizing opportunities to participate in activities with typically developing peers, and family participation in the development of a transition plan. Perspectives by gender are discussed.

**Keywords:** Best Practices, Transition to Work, Intellectual Disability, Saudi Arabia
The transition from childhood to adulthood, with all of its included aspects, is one of the most critical points in a person’s life (Alnahdi, 2013; Gillan & Coghlan, 2010; Knott & Asselin, 1999). Transition in general is defined by Oswald (2010) as any change in a person’s life and can be narrowed down to a specific period, such as the transition from high school to the adult world. The school to work transition for individuals with disabilities is defined by the U.S. Office of Special Education and Rehabilitation Services (OSERS) as “an outcome-oriented process encompassing a broad array of services and experiences that lead to employment” (Will, 1984, p. 1). In Saudi Arabia, chapter 1 of the Regulations of Special Education Institutes and Programs (RSEIP) defines transition services as “a consistent set of activities designed to prepare student with special needs to move from a stage or from an environment to another, and from school’s life to the public life’s activities to be able to rely on himself after God Almighty” (p.3).

Transition services, especially transition to work services, which are the focus of this study, are an important aspect of special education that needs to be studied in depth so that educators can determine best practices to providing transition to work services for students with mild intellectual disabilities. Transition to work services in Saudi Arabia are still in the early stages despite the presence of regulations such as an article in The Regulations of Special Education Institutes and Programs (RSEIP, 2001), which emphasizes the necessity of providing transition services whenever they are needed (Alnahdi, 2014). This is true despite efforts such as The Ministry of Social Affairs (MSA) programs, which are described as "specializing in the rehabilitation of people with mental or physical disabilities by training them in any suitable occupation and helping them to become more productive individuals who are able to interact with the rest of their community members" (MSA, 2011, para. 4).

The significance of the roles teachers play in providing and supporting transition to work services cannot be overstated. For this reason, teachers are the focus of this study. This study
reviews research conducted in the United States and other countries that focuses on providing transition to work services to individuals with mild disabilities. This examination will provide a background for the current investigation of the perceptions of education professionals in Saudi Arabia regarding best practices.

The Rationale behind the Independent Variable

In this study, gender served as an independent variable because there are separate schools for boys and girls in Saudi Arabia, and preparation programs for female special education teachers are separate from male teachers' preparation programs. Almuqael (2008) found significant differences in perceptions regarding transition services between male and female participants, which is consistent with Althabet’s (2002) results of significant differences in perceptions of the effectiveness of special education teacher preparation programs between male and female teachers who graduated from preparation programs in King Saud University in Saudi Arabia. Al-Wabli (1982) also found that female teachers rated the teaching skills and student teaching they experienced in their preparation programs less positively than did male teachers.

Additionally, Alghazo and Gaad (2004) found that female teachers held more positive attitudes toward the inclusion of students with disabilities than did male teachers. Conversely, Elhoweris and Alsheikh (2006) found no difference in teachers’ perspectives based on gender. Thus, the majority of these studies showed a difference between male and female teachers’ perceptions of new services, such as inclusion for students with disabilities in regular schools and their preparation programs. Therefore, it seemed reasonable to examine whether the different schools and preparation programs that male and female teachers were exposed to influenced their perceptions regarding best practices in transition to work services.
This study is mainly guided by the following research questions:

1: What are teachers’ perceptions regarding the best practices for transition services for youth with intellectual disabilities?

2: Are there any differences in teachers’ perceptions due to gender?

**Best Practices in Transition Services**

Transition services are a complex process (Bell, 2011; King, Baldwin, Currie, & Evans, 2005; Winn & Hay, 2009) and can cover an enormous range of practices. Determining best practices has been the focus of many studies in the field of special education. In this section, we review studies regarding best practices within three categories. First, studies have examined best practices that relate directly to transition to work services. Second, studies have examined best practices in transition services in general. Third, studies have examined best practices transition services to adulthood that do not exclusively focus on work. Although the majority of studies on the transition from school to work for students with disabilities were conducted in the US (Beamish et al., 2012; Xu, 2015), some studies have been conducted in other countries. This distribution is reflected in this study’s literature review.

**Best practices in transition to work services.**

Kohler (1993) found that the following are the most important practices cited in the literature that should be considered to facilitate the transition from school to work: "vocational training, parent involvement, interagency collaboration and service delivery, social skills training, paid work experience, and individual transition planning" (p. 107). However, Black and Langone (1997) emphasized social skills as the most important aspect in preparing youth with intellectual disabilities for work.
Landmark, Ju, and Zhang (2010) reviewed 29 documents, articles, and books that were chosen because they support at least one of the eight best practices outlined by Kohler (1993) to be best practices in transition services. By sorting the eight practices depending on the frequency of their appearance in the 29 documents, they found that the most important practice was work experience, followed by "employment preparation, family involvement, general education inclusion, social skills training, daily living skills training, and self-determination skills training" (p. 165). The least emphasized practice was community or agency collaboration.

Wehmeyer and Palmer (2000) concluded that school-to-work transitions should include teaching decision-making, independent performance, self-evaluation, and adjustment skills that students need to develop to improve their adjustment after leaving school. King, Baldwin, Currie, and Evans (2005) highlighted four approaches that have been shown to enhance the transition to work services: skills training, prevocational/vocational guidance, a client-centered approach, and an ecological/experiential approach.

In Canada, a report by the Canadian Centre on Disability Studies (2004) identified seven factors as contributing to successful employment for students with disabilities: 1) having a post-secondary education; 2) personal qualities such as self-determination, perseverance and motivation; 3) flexibility in the workplace; 4) previous experience; 5) experience in living independently; 6) strong social skills; and 7) support from family and disability organizations.

**Best practices in transition services in general.** A study of 104 teachers in Australia by Beamish et al. (2012) that focused on transitions for youth with intellectual disabilities and autism reported that “family-school relationship, student development, and student focused planning” (p.227) are the most endorsed practices. In the United States, Bell (2011) surveyed practitioners, administrators, teachers, transition specialists, and other staff regarding transition practices in Midwestern public school districts. The results indicated that assessment practices
were a possible reason for unsuccessful transition programs. The participants emphasized four things that were necessary to improve transition programs: (a) student-centered planning, (b) interagency collaboration, (c) family involvement, and (d) program structuring. This study recommended additional training for teachers and administrators to improve the effectiveness of transition programs.

Beresford (2004) emphasized key points for providing transition services: 1) transition services are a way of supporting students movement toward a new life stage, not a way of moving them from one service to another; 2) an agency alone cannot achieve success in transition services; 3) a plan for transition should consider long-term goals and should be flexible; and finally 4) services, facilities, and opportunities should be available whenever students need them. Lubbers, Repetto, and McGorray (2008) found that participants (2,000 middle and high school teachers in Florida) believed the most effective practices in the transition process were (a) stakeholder involvement, (b) systems and policy, and (c) communication and collaboration. In addition, the results indicated areas that needed improvement, including systems and policy, information and training, and teachers and district transition. The National Secondary Transition Technical Assistance Center (NSTTAC) listed a number of evidenced-based practices, including “Student-Focused Planning (involvement in IEP process), Student Development (skill assessment and instruction), Interagency Collaboration, Family Involvement, and Program Structures (policies, philosophies, resources)” (para,1).

**Best practices in transition services to adulthood.** Heal, Gonzalez, Rusch, Copher, and DeStefano (1990) concluded that family involvement in transition services is one of the most significant elements in predicting success in the transition from school to adulthood. They found that adults with intellectual disabilities who remained employed for at least six months shared a high level of family involvement during their transition from high school to adulthood. They also
emphasized the importance of life skills training for students with disabilities along with the promotion of social skills. Bauer (2003) argued for the comprehensiveness of transition planning, which helps in building some relevant aspects of students’ personalities, such as confidence, independence, and self-direction. He also linked success in employment and life after high school to the student, parents, and professional personnel working together to design and implement effective transition plans. Overall, he concluded that for many students with disabilities, it is possible to experience success after leaving high school, whether in higher education or as an employee. Soomyung and Namhee (2004) sought to examine whether Korean high school education prepared students with the competencies necessary for a college education or work by surveying 227 high school graduates. They highlighted the importance of "communication skills, cooperative attitudes, computer skills, maintaining friendships, adaptability, self-directed learning, and problem solving skills for students’ future lives" (p. 691). The results showed that students believe a high school education does not prepare them with the necessary skills, and they report the need for "more extracurricular activities, laboratory classes, practical training, career guidance, and diverse pedagogies" (p. 692) than what they were given.

Sample & Instrument

Before conducting this study, approval was secured from the Ministry of Education in Saudi Arabia to collect data from special education programs for both male and female programs. Participation in this study was voluntary, and participants had the right not to complete the survey. The sample for this study was teachers in programs for students with mild intellectual disabilities in the city of Riyadh, the capital of Saudi Arabia. Riyadh was chosen for three reasons. First, approximately 23% of the country’s population lives there (Central Department of Statistics and Information of Saudi Arabia, 2004). Second, the researcher assumed that Saudi
teachers in others regions and cities would not be different from teachers in Riyadh in the factors this study examined because until 2002 there was only one university-based program that prepared special education teachers to work with students with disabilities in the entire country; in other words, most Saudi teachers working in special education programs throughout the entire country graduated from the same program. Third, there was a time factor; given the time constraints of this study, focusing on teachers in Riyadh expedited data collection. The participants were from 15 programs for male students with intellectual disability (12 elementary schools and three middle and high school) and 15 programs for female students with intellectual disability (12 elementary schools and three middle and high school). In all schools, mediators distributed the surveys, and all teachers in special education programs were asked to voluntarily participate. Surveys were sent to schools via five mediators (special education teachers) who distributed and collected them within a week. A total of 369 surveys were completed for a response rate of 62%. Schools were selected according to their location near the mediators to facilitate the distribution of the survey, which was collected after one week. The selection of mediators was based on the diversity of their schools’ locations to cover the basic areas in Riyadh.

The survey was developed in English for this study and consisted of 5 subscales and 39 items. One subscale is the focus of this article (7 items for best practices). The subscale asked the participants to rate best practices; the questions were drawn from a comprehensive literature review. The items were coded as follows: strongly agree = 5; agree = 4; neutral = 3; disagree = 2; strongly disagree = 1. Cronbach's alpha coefficient was utilized to determine item consistency across the two subscales. The Cronbach's alpha reliabilities for the subscale of best practices subscale was .780.
**Participants' Demographic Information**

The participants in this study were 369 teachers who worked in special education programs for students with mild intellectual disabilities in Riyadh. The following demographic information for the participants is provided in the next section: (1) gender, (2) educational background, (3) school level, (4) level of education, and (5) years of teaching experience.

As indicated in Table 1, teachers with special education degrees constituted 86% (319) of the participants, whereas 11% of the teachers (40) had degrees in other areas. Male teachers constituted 60% (223) of the participants, and female teachers constituted 40% (146) of the participants in this study. Seventy-eight percent (289) of the participants were elementary school teachers, whereas 18% of the teachers (67) taught in middle and high schools. Ninety percent (334) of the participating teachers held bachelor’s degrees, and approximately 7% (25) of the participants held master’s degrees.

The researcher chose to group the participants into four groups based on their years of teaching experience. This grouping procedure made the findings easier to report in this section and facilitated the comparison of these groups in the analysis. As noted in Table 1, 49 of the participants (13.3%) had less than five years of teaching experience; 104 (28.2%) had between five and ten years of teaching experience; and 105 (28.5%) had between 10 and 15 years of teaching experience. Finally, thirty-six teachers (8.6%) had more than 15 years of teaching experience. Thus, the majority of the teachers (n = 209 or 56.7%) had 5 to 15 years of teaching experience. As shown in Table 1, the majority of the teachers (n = 200 or 54.2%) did not have a relative or close friend with a disability, whereas 160 (43.4%) participants had a relative or close friend with a disability. Nine participants failed to respond to the question.
Table 1
Participants' Demographic Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>60.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>146</td>
<td>39.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>369</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational background</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special education</td>
<td>319</td>
<td>86.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other majors</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>10.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>359</td>
<td>97.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School level</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary school</td>
<td>289</td>
<td>78.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle and high school</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>18.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>356</td>
<td>96.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level of education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor’s degree</td>
<td>334</td>
<td>90.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master’s degree</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>6.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>364</td>
<td>98.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relative or someone close with a disability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>43.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>54.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years of experience</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less than 5 years</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>13.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 to 10</td>
<td>104</td>
<td>28.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 to 15</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>28.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 15</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>297</td>
<td>80.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missing</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>19.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The data from the survey were analyzed using the statistical software SPSS 17. Two methods were used to analyze the data. First, descriptive statistics were used to analyze the demographic data and ranking practices. Second, a multivariate analysis of variance (MANOVA) was used to examine differences by gender and school level on all items. In addition, Cronbach’s alpha was computed for reliability.
Results

Best Practices for Transition to Work Services

Exposing students to some work experiences, vocational training or both during high school received the highest mean rating (4.39) and was ranked as the most important transition to work services practice among all options included in the survey.

The second most important practice as determined by the mean score was giving students with mild disabilities opportunities to participate in activities with their typically developing peers, which had a mean of 4.37. The third most important practice based on the mean score was family participation in the development of a transition plan, with a mean of 4.33. The fourth and fifth most important practices, with the same mean of 4.27, were improving decision-making skills in students with mild disabilities and assigning life skills goals to students in middle and high schools. The sixth most important practice based on the mean score was giving students opportunities to be independent in school, with a mean of 4.08. The least important practice based on the mean score was improving students' social skills, with a mean of 3.96 (see Table 2).

For all items, the MANOVA results showed that there were no significant differences between elementary and middle/high school teachers’ perceptions (see Appendix 1). Therefore, these groups’ responses were combined.

Table 2
Means of Teachers’ Responses Regarding Transition Service Practices by gender (Ordered from the Highest to the Lowest Mean)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item number</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Overall M</th>
<th>Male M</th>
<th>Female M</th>
<th>MANOVA F-value</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Expose students to some work experiences, vocational training or both during high school.</td>
<td>366</td>
<td>4.39</td>
<td>4.30</td>
<td>4.53</td>
<td>10.19</td>
<td>.002*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Participate in activities with their typically developing peers</td>
<td>367</td>
<td>4.37</td>
<td>4.32</td>
<td>4.43</td>
<td>2.10</td>
<td>.148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Family participating in making a transition plan.</td>
<td>369</td>
<td>4.33</td>
<td>4.27</td>
<td>4.43</td>
<td>5.041</td>
<td>.025*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. Improve decision-making skills for students with mild disabilities.  
5. Assigning life skills goals for students in middle and high schools.  
6. Give students opportunities to be independent in school.  
7. Improving students' social skills.

Gender Differences. In general, all items were perceived more highly by female teachers than by male teachers. There was agreement that exposing students to some work experiences was the most important practice, and there was agreement on the improvement of students' social skills as the least important practice. We conducted a MANOVA with these items to examine the significance of the mean differences. The results showed that all mean differences were statistically significant with the exception of two items (2,7) (see Table 2). One item focused on the importance of integrating students with disabilities and their typically developing peers in activities, and the other item focused on the importance of improving students' social skills.

Discussion

This section discusses best practices as perceived by teachers. Differences in some items by gender were expected due to different work environments for male and female teachers in Saudi Arabia. Male and female teachers work in completely separate schools. This issue might have an influence on how teachers perceive a practice in comparison.

Participants in this study agreed on the importance of certain practices that enhance the planning and implementation of transition to work services. These practices include work experience, inclusion in the general education setting, family involvement, decision making, independent performance, social skills and extra-curricular activities. These practices are identified in the literature and supported by this study’s findings as the key elements in
successful transition services following best practices as perceived by the participants regardless of gender.

**Transition to Work Services Practices**

This study found that exposing students to some work experiences, vocational training or both during high school was the transition-related activity that teachers rated most important based on the mean scores. This finding is strongly supported in the literature as a critical practice in providing successful transition services (Benz, Lindstrom, & Yovanoff, 2000; Blackorby, & Wagner, 1996; Fabian, 2007; Harvey, 2002; Izzo, Cartledge, Miller, Growick, & Rutkowski, 2000; Karpinski, Neubert, & Graham, 1992; Kohlar, 1993; Kohler & Rusch, 1994; Landmark et al., 2010; Rabren, Dunn, & Chambers, 2002; Shandra & Hogan, 2008). Therefore, it is critical that transition to work services in special education programs in middle and high schools make this practice a priority and expose students to different work experiences as much as possible. Students with more work experiences have greater chances of finding a job after they leave school than do those who have less work experience prior to graduation.

Nevertheless, this practice will initially be challenging due to the lack of prepared teachers with experience to help plan and train students in work skills. Another challenge that should be considered is that not all schools are suited to provide students with work experience because some schools are not prepared to serve students with disabilities (Al-Mousa, 2010).

This study also found that giving students with mild disabilities opportunities to participate in activities with their typically developing peers was the second most important practice agreed upon by teachers. This finding is consistent with Al-hoshan’s (2009) study, which found that inclusive schools were a significant predictor of success in postsecondary education, interaction, and participation in group activities and employment.
Despite the significant development that has occurred in the last decade through the opening of special education programs for students with disabilities in public schools (Alnahdi, 2014), it is still unreasonable that students with disabilities spend their school day in full isolation from their peers with the exception of one or two break times that do not exceed a total of 35 minutes in most schools. Educators in Saudi Arabia must rectify this situation through the provision of extracurricular programs that will create opportunities for students with disabilities to participate in activities with their typically developing peers in support of their important role in the success of transition services (Soomyung & Namhee, 2004). Officials in Saudi Arabia also need to proceed with integration programs in an attempt to increase opportunities for students with disabilities to meet with their typically developing peers through various activities.

Work experience. As supported by the findings in this study, exposing students with disabilities to work experience prior to graduation from high school (or, if there is no opportunity for the student to continue to high school, in middle school) is one of the most critical practices in providing successful transition services. This finding is supported by many studies (Benz et al., 2000; Blackorby, & Wagner, 1996; Fabian, 2007; Harvey, 2002; Izzo et al., 2000; Karpinski et al., 1992; Kohlar, 1993; Kohler & Rusch, 1994; Landmark et al., 2010; Rabren et al., 2002; Shandra & Hogan, 2008). Thus, it is critical that transition services in special education programs in Saudi Arabian middle and high schools make this practice a priority and expose students to different work experiences as much as possible. Students with more work experience have greater chances of finding a job after they leave school than do those who have less work experience prior to graduation (Benz et al., 2000).

General education inclusion. The integration of students with disabilities with their typically developing peers is an important aspect in preparing students for future social interactions with members of their community. Separating students with disabilities from their
typically developing peers diminishes their chances of success in the workplace (Kohlar, 1993; Landmark et al., 2010). Therefore, officials in Saudi Arabia need to proceed with integration programs in an attempt to increase opportunities for students with disabilities to engage with their typically developing peers through various activities and settings.

**Social skills.** As indicated in this study’s findings, improving students' social skills is one of the most important practices in transition services. This finding is supported by other studies (Kohlar, 1993; Landmark et al., 2010). Without these skills, students are unable to become successful as independent people in life after school, whether at work or elsewhere. A large number of studies have reported that social skills are one of the key elements students need to have a successful transition from school life to adulthood (Blanchett, 2001; Canadian Centre on Disability Studies, 2004; Heal et al., 1990; Kohler, 1993; LaCava, 2005; Webb, Patterson, Syverud, & Seabrooks-Blackmore, 2008; Wolfe et al., 1998). Black and Langone (1997) believe that social skills are not only important, but they are also the most significant predictors in the success of transition services. In short, students with limited social skills have limited work options; even if they find a job, it is likely they will not maintain it for long. In conclusion, the development of social skills in students should be a focus of special education programs in Saudi Arabia, particularly in middle and high schools.

**Decision-making.** As emphasized in the findings of this study, transition services should include teaching decision-making skills to students because training them in these skills will help them develop new skills to improve their adjustment after leaving school (Wehmeyer & Palmer, 2000). Without these skills, students will be less independent in the workplace, which in turn will affect their performance at work and in life in general. Special education programs in Saudi Arabia should place students in different circumstances that require them to make decisions and encourage them to be more independent in making these decisions.
References


