

Full Length Research Paper

An educational experience in the Conservatory of Bologna: The Italian students' views on contemporary Turkish polyphonic choral music

Köksal Apaydınlı

Faculty of Music and Performing Arts, Department of Music, Ordu University, Ordu, Turkey.

Received 28 November, 2015; Accepted 14 April, 2016

It is known that many choirs in European countries perform different styles of traditional songs in different languages in their repertoire. However, Turkish contemporary polyphonic choral works which have specific harmony and timbres effected by *makam* may not be known as the others. In this context, the main aim of this study is to introduce these specific harmonies and timbres to the foreigners and to learn their opinions about Turkish polyphonic choral music. In this study, Italian students were preferred as foreigners because it is thought that Italian sounds clear and sonorant and its intonation is similar to Turkish. The study group consisted of nine volunteer participants from a chamber choir whom the researcher gave chorus courses at the Conservatory of Giovan Battista Martini in Bologna in Italy, which had a bilateral agreement with the University of Ordu under Erasmus Academic Staff Teaching Mobility Programme. The Turkish choral work, called "Suda Balık Oynuyor", was taught, and a semi-structured interview form was conducted. The results indicated that although the students had difficulties regarding Turkish pronunciation because of them singing a Turkish choral song for the first time, and they also had problems in performing the *makam* scales in Turkish music, they performed the song correctly. They were interested in the choral work they studied, and emphasized that it had characteristic features, especially the timbres, according to the songs in their own repertoire. According to the results, suggestions were improved. The Turkish choral works can be translated into their languages, besides the original Turkish language, and can be published. In this way, they can understand the meanings of the lyrics easily. Moreover, foreign choir conductors can learn and have knowledge about the pronunciations, articulations, and themes of Turkish choral works with the help of the Turkish students studying in their universities. Thus, Turkish polyphonic choral music containing the specific traditional timbres can be known and performed by foreign choirs.

Keywords: choir, singing, conservatory, contemporary choral song, Turkish pronunciation.

INTRODUCTION

Music and language are the basic elements interacting with people. No matter which nation one belongs to, the

E-mail: koksalapaydinli@gmail.com.

Authors agree that this article remain permanently open access under the terms of the [Creative Commons Attribution License 4.0 International License](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)

usage of language with music affects the people and their emotions. Thus, the works performed by the human voice are the easiest and the most effective way to reach the audience. Choral music is the finest example which makes intercultural communication possible because choral music is a socio-cultural fact. Singing in a choir socializes people by bringing them together for the same goal and increases their cultural relationships and interactions with each other (Durrant, 2003). The choral works belonging to the different cultures make a significant contribution to the chorists for their musical culture. Thus, the groups who perform choral music recognize the societies having different religions, languages, and cultures, which add a universal dimension to the music.

Traditional and contemporary Turkish music

Traditional Turkish Music, which is classified under two major headings, as Turkish Folk Music and Classical Turkish Music, has modal and monodical features. According to Karaosmanoğlu (2012), it is a genre drawing roots from a thousand year old tradition, featuring distinct melodic patterns called *makam* and rich rhythmic structures called *usul*. Yekta (1924) defines *makam* as a specific form of a musical scale that characterizes itself by an organization of intervals and various constitutive relations (as cited in Bozkurt et al., 2014). Also, according to Yahya (2009, 53), "*Makam* is the structure of the scales which consists of a specific pitch and intervals within a special melodic progression". On the other hand, the rhythmic counterpart to the melodic concept of the *makam* is *usul*, which is a rhythmic pattern of a certain length that contains a sequence of strokes with varying accents (Marcus, 2001). The arrangement of the strong and weak strokes and accents represent the differences between the kinds of *usul* (Özkan 2010: 606). With the richness of *makam* and the diversity of *usul*, the musical structures of traditional Turkish music are different from western classical music; including the polyphonic harmony (Feridunoğlu, 2004: 215).

Every country creates its own culture and contributes to the world with it. The development level of countries that have shown the cultural background regarding science, technology and art coming from the past, is called modernity (Küçüköncü, 2004).

Turkey is a modern country with different cultural features based on two sources: First, because of being an inheritor of the Ottoman Empire, Turkey has secular customs and traditions in its texture, and carries the cultural features of the Islamic World. Second, due to the cultural modernization by Atatürk's reforms, the Turkish nation became a modern society (Kongar, 2001). After the proclamation of the Republic in 1923, the musical reforms made by Atatürk built the basis for contemporary polyphonic Turkish music. Some of these reforms were: the opening of *Musiki Muallim Mektebi* (Music Teacher

Training School) in 1924 for training music teachers; a number of talented young people were sent to various cities in Europe by the Turkish government to study western classical music to be a performer and music teacher; and conservatories and departments of music were established in collaboration with European composers, Paul Hindemith and Eduard Zuckmayer.

Briefly, contemporary Turkish music was developed into two main parts; as traditional monodic and modern polyphonic (Uçan, 2005). In this context, masterpieces were composed for choir and orchestra, and these works made our music universal.

The general properties and similarities of Turkish and Italian languages

According to Taşer (2004), the general properties of Turkish can be listed as:

1. It is a spoken as written and written as spoken language
2. It has rich, soft, coloured and melodic phonetical features
3. It sounds clear and sonorant instead of glottal voice
4. Vowels and consonants are suitable for articulation

Findings reached in Moğulbay (2010)'s research about Italian language are given as follows:

The letters in Italian are generally spoken as written. With a few exceptions, pronunciation of the consonants as 'b, d, f, l, m, n, p, r, t, v' inside the sentences are the same as Turkish. However, some consonants are pronounced differently such as; the letter 'g' is pronounced as "c" if it is written before 'e' and 'i'; on the other hand the same letter is pronounced as 'g' if it is written before 'o' and 'a' or any consonant after it. Moreover, the letter 'z' is pronounced as "ts" or "ds". Because of Turkish consonants 'ç, k, ş, y' do not exist in Italian, these letters are pronounced by the different combination of consonants, for instance, pronouncing 'ch' as "k". Turkish vowels 'ı, j, ö, ü' are not used in Italian. Words usually end with a vowel in Italian. Thus, it sounds clear and sonorant.

Turkish and Italian are similar in terms of intonation. As identified by Egüz (1991: 54), the intonation is a melodic line, a wave of sound in pronunciation of a sentence. According to Canepari (1986), Italian has three essential tunes: a falling tune expressing completeness, a rising tune, used for questions, and a suspensive tune, used to express non-completeness, (as cited in D'Imperio 2002). Turkish also has the same kinds of intonations.

Purpose of the study

It is known that many choirs in European countries

Table 1. Demographic features of the study group.

No	Voice Group				Grade			Field of Study
	S	A	T	B	1	2	3 Graduated	
1	x				x			Choir Conducting
2	x					x		Singing
3	x					x		Singing
4	x						x	Choir Conducting
5		x			x			Singing
6		x					x	Singing
7		x					x	Choir Conducting
8			x					x Singing
9				x				x Singing

perform different styles of traditional songs in different languages in their repertoire. However, Turkish contemporary polyphonic choral works which have specific harmony and timbres effected by *makam* may not be known as the others. In this context, the main purpose of this study is to introduce these specific harmonies and timbres to the foreigners and to learn their opinions about Turkish polyphonic choral music. Accordingly, the problem sentence was constituted as “what are the opinions of Italian students regarding Turkish contemporary polyphonic choral music?” and the sub problems are as follows:

- (1) What is the level of awareness of Italian students about the contemporary Turkish polyphonic choral music?
- (2) What kind of difficulties do Italian students have when they perform Turkish choral work?
- (3) What are the differences between the Turkish choral work they study and the works in their own repertoire?

METHOD

Qualitative research methods were used in this descriptive survey model research.

Study group

The study group were determined according to typical case sampling, which is one of the purposive sampling methods used in qualitative research. Typical case sampling is the determination of the most typical cases in which the application is done or the innovation is presented by the researchers aiming to introduce a new application or an innovation. The goal is to get an idea about a specific field or to inform the persons who do not have enough information about the subject, application, or innovation (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2003: 71-72; Patton, 1987).

Accordingly, the study group consisted of nine volunteer participants from a chamber choir whom the researcher gave chorus courses at the Conservatory of Giovan Battista Martini in Bologna in Italy, which had a bilateral agreement with the University of Ordu under Erasmus Academic Staff Teaching Mobility Programme. Among these participants, seven of them were

females, and two of them were males. Four of the female students were Soprano (S) and three of them were Alto (A), while one male was Tenor (T) and the other was Bass (B). Two of the students of this study group were first-grade, two of them were second-grade, three of them were third-grade, and the other two had graduate degree. Four students were being trained in singing and three in choir conducting, while two participants were professional singers who had graduated from the Conservatory of Giovan Battista Martini. The demographic features of the study group are given in Table 1.

The features of the chosen work

As the time period for the researcher was limited, some criteria were considered for the chosen work. These can be listed as follows: because the researcher taught the choral work to the Italian students in Turkish, it should contain as few sentences as possible composed of easy-to-pronounce words; it should be written in simple metres as the time signature of 2/4 or 4/4 instead of odd metres as 5/8, 7/8 or 9/8; and it should not be long so that it is possible to learn it in a short time and in an easy manner. Accordingly, an anonymous folk song from Kırşehir, which is a small town in the middle of Turkey, named “*Suda Balık Oynuyor* (Fish is Wriggling in the Water)” arranged for the chorus by Erdal Tuğcular (Çevik, 2000: 193-196) was chosen for the study group to learn.

The chosen work has the following features:

The time signature of the four-page folk song is 4/4, and it consists of *Hicaz Makam* scales. In Turkish music, *makam* scales are formed of perfect fourth and perfect fifth intervals by ordering in different types with each other. The connection note of these intervals is named *güçlü*, and it affects the type and effect of *makam* according to the arrangement of the tetrachord and the pentachord in the scale. *Makams*, which have these kinds of properties, are known as “*Basic Makams*” and one of them is *Hicaz Makam* (Özkan, 2010:116).

Normally in Turkish makam music, the *Hicaz makam* scale is built on the note A (La) by arranging in an order of tetrachord and pentachord; however, in the folk song called “*Suda Balık Oynuyor*”, the scale begins with D (Re) arranging in an order of pentachord and tetrachord, which is the feature of *Uzzal*. (a different kind of *Hicaz Makam*). According to the scale features of this folk song; *Karar*, the resolution note is Re and *güçlü*, the connection note of pentachord and tetrachord, is La. On the other hand, in traditional Turkish music *seyir*, the melodic progression-categorized in three as ascending, ascending-descending, and descending- is important

Figure 1. The first two bars of the song called *Suda Balık Oynuyor*

for the impact of the makam effect. Thus, the folk song used in this research has the ascending-descending *seyir* feature. Moreover, according to the feature of the *hicaz makam* scale in this song, the interval between the second and the third degree (Mib-Fa#) is augmented second, which is the same as the harmonic minor scales used in western classical harmony between the sixth and the seventh degrees. Because the accidentals (flat and sharp) are used together in Turkish music, the flat is written before the sharp in the key signature (Feridunoğlu 2004: 218). For this reason, as seen in Figure 1, E flat is written before F sharp in the key signature because of the properties of the *hicaz makam* scale.

The folk song is arranged for the chorus according to the quadruple harmony system which is used in Turkish Music. According to Tutu and Tutu (2012), when analysed the development process of polyphonic Turkish music, Kemal İlerici-the Turkish composer and musicologist-expressed for the first time that the modal (*makamsal*) music needed to have a distinctive art of harmony (as cited in: Yalçın, 2012: 220). It is known that the 1st, 3rd, 5th and 8th degrees in a scale are called stable tones in classical harmony, and the basic chords are formed by these triads. However, the stable tones of the makam scales are the 1st, 4th, 5th and 8th degrees while the unstable tones are 2nd, 3rd, 6th and 7th degrees (İlerici, 1970: 25-26; Bozkurt, 1990: 74-76). Thus, the chords overlapped by the fourths are considered as the quadruple harmony system in Turkish music (it can be seen in the first chord in Figure 1).

At the beginning of the song, while the main melody is on soprano with the syllable "lal", the other parties accompany the soprano with the same syllable. In the whole work, the transition of the parties between soprano-alto and tenor-bass are seen frequently, and while the two parties usually perform the melody in lyrics, the other two parties accompany them with the syllables "lal" and "oy". Moreover, there is a small tenor solo within the song, and the other parties accompany the tenor with the same syllables. The work is composed of two stanzas and it is concerned with the emotions of a young man who cannot receive sympathy and attraction from the girl that he loves.

Data collection tools

A literature review was carried out in order to establish the theoretical framework of the study, and relevant to this issue, dissertations, articles, proceedings, and sources on the linguistic features of Italian were investigated. In accordance with the researcher's preparations in Turkey, detailed information about the chosen choral work was taken from a specialist in the field of Turkish Folk Music. In addition, a semi-structured interview form

was prepared with six questions in order to find out the Italian students' views about the work. The prepared form was sent to experts to examine its content and availability, and due to the experts' view one question should be removed from the form because of it serving the same purpose addressed by another question in it. Accordingly, the finalized semi-structured interview form, which was analysed for its content validity, consisted of five questions as two open-ended, two closed-ended, and one grading type. Besides, some personal questions about the grade levels and voice groups were included in the form so as to determine the features of the students.

The researcher visited the Conservatory of Bologna in Italy under the Erasmus Academic Staff Teaching Mobility between 12th and 16th May, 2014, and taught the chosen choral work to the study group. When the researcher was in Turkey, the scores were delivered to the students by e-mail before the song was taught. The theme of the work, the meanings of its phrases and polyphonic structure were explained by the researcher during the course. As the chosen work contained the *Hicaz makam* scale, the concept and the properties of the scale (*accidentals*, *karar*, *güçlü* and *seyir*) were told briefly. Each voice group was conducted with the sight-singing of the song individually, and the researcher put excessive emphasis on the notes that created the effect of the *Hicaz Makam*. Afterwards, the solfège of the choral song was done together, and the students were made to perform it a few times for the timbres so as to be well-understood. The Turkish words in the song were pronounced very slowly by the researcher, and the students were made to repeat the words one by one with true articulation. Then they were allowed to take notes about the Turkish syllables they heard according to the pronunciation of Italian language. The words were repeated in the speaking tone according to the rhythmic patterns, and then each group were made to perform these words with the support of the piano as musical phrases. Finally, the lyrics of the work were translated into English and the whole song was sung and interpreted with the nuances as a capella, and the performance of the choir was recorded.

After the song was taught and rehearsed, the researcher explained the aim of his study and got permission for the interview from the participants. By the way, the interview form was applied to the participants as a group in order to learn their views about the work. During the interview, the researcher took notes about the answers of the students as data. The participants were coded according to their voice groups as; S1, S2, S3 and S4 for Sopranos, A1, A2 and A3 for Altos, T1 for Tenor and B1 for Bass.

Analysis of the data

The data obtained by using the semi-structured interview technique

Table 2. The cases in which the study group listened to and performed Turkish choral works.

Options	Listening to Turkish choral song	Performing Turkish choral song
Yes	1	-
No	8	9
TOTAL	9	9

Table 3. The cases in which difficulties were experienced in the work.

Study group	Views (From the difficult to the easy)
S1	Pronunciation, Scales, Rhythm, Musicality
S2	Pronunciation, Rhythm, Scales, Musicality
S3	Pronunciation, Rhythm, Scales, Musicality
S4	Pronunciation, Scales, Rhythm, Musicality
A1	Pronunciation, Scales, Rhythm, Musicality
A2	Scales, Pronunciation, Rhythm, Musicality
A3	Scales, Pronunciation, Rhythm, Musicality
T1	Pronunciation, Scales, Rhythm, Musicality
B1	Pronunciation, Scales, Rhythm, Musicality

was analysed with the content analysis method. The basic aim in the content analysis is to reach the concepts and relations that could express the collected data. The basic procedure is to bring the similar data together around certain concepts and themes, and to arrange them in an understandable manner (Yıldırım and Şimşek, 2003:162). Büyüköztürk et al. (2008: 253) indicate that the procedures to be used in the content analysis vary according to the purpose of the analysis to be done, and the type of the material to be analysed. The researcher may determine the themes before starting the analysis. In this context, the data obtained from the interview forms were classified by the researcher according to the predetermined themes. These constituted of the “awareness of contemporary polyphonic Turkish choral music” and the “views of the contemporary polyphonic Turkish choral works learned” related to the research questions. The codes determined around these themes were classified as “experience”, “difficulty”, “timbre effect”, and “comparison” and the data was analysed according to this classification.

FINDINGS

Findings related to the theme of the “awareness of contemporary polyphonic Turkish choral music”

The study groups were asked the following questions under the code “experience”: “Have you ever listened to a Turkish choral song before? If so, where did you listen to it?” and “Have you ever performed a Turkish choral song before? If so, please give the name(s) of the song(s).” The replies are shown in Table 2.

The data in Table 2 show that eight students in the study group had not listened to polyphonic Turkish choral works before. A student (bass) reported that he had listened to it on radio. In addition, it is understood that none of the Italian students had performed Turkish choral

works before. Thus, they did not have any experience regarding Turkish music.

Findings related to the theme of “views of contemporary polyphonic Turkish choral works learned”

Findings related to the difficulties in the choral work studied

A grading question, “Please prioritise the difficulties in the song when you are performing”, was asked of the study group. The answers to the question are shown in Table 3. When Table 3 is examined, the most difficult points while performing the work in each voice group appeared to be generally the same. Accordingly, all the sopranos had the utmost difficulty in pronunciation. S1 and S4 reported that they had problems in the scales of the work in the 2nd rank, and in the rhythms in the 3rd rank. On the other hand, S2 and S3 reported that they had problems in the rhythms in the 2nd rank and in the scales in the 3rd. Because the soprano parts in the scores divided into two as soprano 1st and soprano 2nd in the choral song, the rank differences could be the reason for this. In the Alto group, A1 stated that she had problems in the pronunciation of the 1st rank and in scales in the 2nd, while A2 and A3 had problems in scales in the 1st rank and in pronunciation in the 2nd. The reason for this result can be explained as the alto’s melody involves more difficult intervals according to the soprano. Besides this, the problem in the 3rd rank for the alto is the rhythms. Tenor (T1) and bass (B1) groups had the utmost difficulty

in pronunciation like the soprano and beside this; they had problems in scales in the 2nd rank, and in rhythms in the 3rd. None of the students in the study group experienced a problem in musicality.

Some vowels and consonants in Turkish can be difficult to pronounce for foreigners. Difficulties varying according to the nations can be seen while performing some letters as “ğ, ş, ç, ı, ü” (Er et al. 2012: 63). Therefore, it is normal that Italian students can have problems pronouncing the sounds in a language that they do not know at all. As the video camera record during the performance was examined, the students appeared to have trouble in pronouncing the Turkish vocals “ı, ö, ü”. However, when the students studied repeatedly and elaborately by the researcher, they began to pronounce the words better and almost accurately.

The songs performed in Europe generally have a tonal structure. Normally, the e-flat and f-sharp interval is a minor 3rd in terms of hearing, but theoretically it is augmented 2nd according to the classical harmony. Except for the usage of harmonic minor scales, this case is not always observed in tonal scores but frequently used in Turkish music. As a result, it is clearly seen that the Italian students accustomed to tonal effect had difficulties in makam scales.

A song that consisted of odd time signature such as 5/8, 7/8 or 9/8 was not chosen purposely because it could require a long process to teach these rhythm patterns (2+3, 2+2+3 or 2+2+2+3 etc.) to the foreign students. As the researcher stayed in Italy for a limited period of time, he preferred to allow the students to study a song consisting of 4/4 time signature so that he could get a result in a short time. Considering the data, the students in the study group prioritized the rhythm difficulties in the 3rd rank. It could be said that the students did not have problems regarding rhythm. Only two sopranos reported that they had problems regarding the rhythms, and they showed it in the 2nd rank. According to this result, some reasons concerning the rhythm problems in the soprano group could be thought as: there were syncopes in the general structure of the work, the sixteenth notes used with quarter rests were repeated most, and these notes were performed quickly with the syllable “lal”.

As the respiration marks and musical phrases were explained at the beginning of the study, the students had no problems with the musicality. They practiced the nuances and musical phrases accurately in the sight-singing step.

Findings related to the timbre effect of the work studied

The study groups were asked the question: “What kind of feeling did you have when you heard the harmony of the

song that you have just learnt?” The answers given by the students are listed as follows:

S1: I found it interesting and enjoyable. The melody was different.

S2: When I heard the harmony, I found myself in Turkey for a while. I like it.

S3: The voices were so intensive, and I like this harmony

S4: I felt the Turkish atmosphere; very beautiful and different.

A1: It was so exotic and different. It sounded nice.

A2: It was unusual and I like it. The timbres were interesting.

A3: I like the harmony, it was cheerful

T1: I found it fascinating and different

B1: It was really beautiful. I felt myself travelling to Turkey.

Parallel to the answers given above, it seems that Italian students liked the harmonic structure of the Turkish choral work they performed. According to the tonal structure they were accustomed to and which existed in their own cultures, a different harmony caused the study group to have different feelings. When the answers were analysed, all the students mentioned the unusual aspect of the timbres they heard. They reported the song sounded interesting, the melody was different, and they liked it a lot. Some of them indicated that they felt the Turkish atmosphere. Briefly, it can be said that the participants were affected by the traditional timbres of the Turkish music.

Findings related to the comparison between the Turkish work studied and the works in their own repertoire

The study groups were asked the following question: “What is your opinion regarding the differences between the songs in your repertoire and this Turkish song?” The answers are listed as follows:

S1: This song is very interesting. The scales and the character are very different. Flat and sharp are used together at the beginning of the song. So, it is neither major, nor minor.

S2: The Turkish song has got different and beautiful harmonies.

S3: Different scales and harmonies. Beautiful, but I couldn't understand the tonality.

S4: The differences for us are the harmonies, but it was nice.

A1: The scales are different; an interesting experience. I got surprised when I saw both e-flat and f-sharp together at the beginning of the song.

A2: I like the exotic character of the scale.

A3: It has very different and beautiful harmonic scales.

T1: Different scales. It would be a good idea for the repertoire of a choir.

B1: Scales and the harmony are very different and interesting. But now I know a new music that I have never tried to study before. It was enjoyable.

With the reference to the answers were given, the Italian students found the general structure of the Turkish song different from the works in their own repertoire. The reason for this is explained as; tonal structure and the scales of their songs are different from the *makam* features of the Turkish music. The usage of flat and sharp together in the key signature of the work attracted a great deal of students' attention. Moreover, all the students indicated that they liked the timbres and peculiar characteristic of the work. One of them suggested adding the song to the repertoire.

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTIONS

According to the findings, the eight participants in the study group had not listened to a polyphonic Turkish choral song before, except one, who had listened to it on the radio. Besides this, none of the participants had performed Turkish choral work before, and it was clearly seen that they had no idea about this kind of choral music. In this context, the choral festivals organized in different countries could be introduced in Turkey, and the Turkish Government could support the Turkish chorists in order to participate in these festivals to introduce polyphonic Turkish choral works which have different timbres, rhythms and harmonies.

The study group indicated that they had some difficulties in pronunciation and the scales during the course. It is normal for foreigners to have difficulties in the lyrics of a Turkish song and its scales. Nevertheless, due to the fact that the letters in Italian are generally spoken as written like in Turkish, and nearly all the Italian words end with vocals, the students pronounced the Turkish words correctly. The special Turkish vocals 'ı, ö, ü' were difficult to articulate for participants, but they pronounced these vocals easily at the end of the study with the help of the researcher. In this case, according to the performance of the nine participants in the study group, it can be said that they were successful in Turkish pronunciation, and it is thought they can perform different Turkish polyphonic choral works also.

The usage of flat and sharp together in the key signature of the work attracted a great deal of students' attention. They indicated that they could not understand the tonality. According to them the choral work was neither major nor minor. This is a specific feature of Turkish music based on *makam*. Because Europeans are

used to performing the tonal scales, the study group had problems in performing the *makam* scales in Turkish music. However, after the researcher made the students practiced the specific intervals in *Hicaz Makam* scale, they sang the song correctly.

The study group thought the Turkish choral song that they had learnt had characteristic features, especially the timbres, according to the songs in their own repertoire. They emphasized that they liked the scales and the harmonies. It can be thought that more Turkish choral works can be introduced to them.

Worldwide known distinguished works belonging to various countries are studied by choral conductors in Turkey, and they are generally performed in their own language. However, some of them are performed by translating them into Turkish. The same way can be thought for foreigners regarding Turkish choral works which have artistic and universal features. They can be translated into the other languages, besides the original Turkish language, and can be published. In this way, they can understand the meanings of the lyrics easily. Thus, Turkish polyphonic choral music containing the specific traditional timbres can be known and performed by foreign choirs.

It is known that many Turk students have studied in various schools in Italy, the researcher met some of them in the Conservatory of Bologna. With the help of these students, foreign choir conductors in these conservatories can learn and have knowledge about the pronunciations, articulations, and themes of Turkish choral works. Thus, they can interpret the songs in light of this information. Beside this, the pronunciation and the articulation of these choral works can be performed correctly by listening to the best records on social network sites such as YouTube, etc. As a result, taking the students' answers, it is thought that foreigners can be interested in contemporary Turkish choral works.

This study was carried on Italian students only. The same folk song could be practiced by undergraduate students from another country, and their views could be compared to the case involving the singing of contemporary Turkish polyphonic choir works.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Special thanks to Associate Professor Gian Paolo LUPPI and Angela BALBONI, the Erasmus Coordinators of Conservatory of Giovan Battista Martini in Bologna; and also special thanks to choir conductor Professor Pierpaolo SCATTOLIN and his students.

Conflict of Interests

The author has not declared any conflicts of interest.

REFERENCES

- Bozkurt B, Ayangil R, Holzapfel A (2014). Computational analysis of Turkish makam music: Review of state-of-the-art and challenges. *J. New Music Res.* 43(1):3-23. doi: 10.1080/09298215.2013.865760.
- Bozkurt H (1990). Harmony in Turkish Music. Doctoral Thesis. Selçuk University Institute of Science, Konya.
- Büyükoztürk Ş, Çakmak EK, Akgün OE, Karadeniz S, Demirel F (2008). Scientific research methods. Ankara: PEGEM Publications
- Canepari L (1986). Standard and regional Italian pronunciations. Padova:CLEUP.
- Çevik S (2000). Choir album: The fish is wriggling in the water. Arranged by Erdal Tuğçular. Ankara: Yurtrenkleri Press.
- D'Imperio M (2002). Italian Intonation: An Overview and some Questions. *Probus*, 14(1):37-69.
- Durrant C (2003). Choral conducting philosophy and practice. New York: Routledge.
- Egüz S (1991). Collective voice training. Ankara: Ayyıldız Press.
- Er O, Biçer N, Bozkırlı KC (2012). Evaluation of problems encountered in Turkish teaching for foreigners in terms of related literature. *Int. J. Turkish Literature Culture Educ.* 1(2):51-69.
- Feridunoğlu L (2004). The way to the music. (2nd ed). İstanbul: İnkilap Press.
- İlerici K (1970). Turkish music and harmony in terms of composition. İstanbul: Ministry of National Education Press.
- Karaosmanoğlu MK (2012). A Turkish makam music symbolic database for music information retrieval: SymbrTr. Proceedings of the 13th International Society for Music Information Retrieval Conference, Porto, Portugal, October 8-12, pp. 223-228. http://ismir2012.ismir.net/event/papers/223_ISMİR_2012.pdf.
- Kongar E (2001). The cultural self-perception of Turkey: A richness for EU. Symposium on Turkey and Poland on their way towards the EU – Two candidate countries in the process of transition, University of METU, Ankara, http://www.kongar.org/makaleler/Turkiye_nin_Kulturule_OzAnlayisi.php. Date accessed: August 28, 2014.
- Küçüköncü Y (2004). Music Teachers and Music Education during the Republic Period in Turkey Regarding their Influence on the General Musical Culture. Symposium on Training Music Teachers from Music Teacher Schools to Present. University of Suleyman Demirel, Isparta, April 7-8. <http://www.muzikegitimcileri.net>. Date accessed: August 26, 2014.
- Marcus S (2001). Rhythmic modes in Middle-Eastern music. *Garland Encyclopedia of World Music, Volume 6: Middle East (V. Danielson & S. Marcus Ed.)*. London: Routledge pp. 89-92.
- Mısırlı E (2008). Italian grammar. Ankara: Gökçe Bookstore.
- Moğulbay D (2010). The Turkish translations and pronunciations of the examples selected from compositions of the polyphonic chorus which are performed in Italian and phonetic characteristics of Italian language. Master Thesis. Cumhuriyet University Institute of Social Sciences, Sivas.
- Özkan İH (2010). Theory and usuls of Turkish Music. (8th ed.) İstanbul: Ötüken Press.
- Patton MQ (1987). How to use qualitative methods in evaluation. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications.
- Taşer S (2004). Elocution with samples. İstanbul: Papyrus Press.
- Tutu M, Tutu S (1999). Quadruple harmony and application to Turkish music. İzmir: Ege University Press.
- Uçan A (2005). Culture of Turkish music. (2nd ed.) Ankara: Evrensel Müzikevi Publications.
- Yahya KG (2009). Guidebook of Turkish Music. Ankara: Maya Academy Press.
- Yalçın G (2012). Comparative analysis of the harmony books containing the applications of quadruple harmony system. *İnönü University J. Art and Design* 2(5):219-234.
- Yalçın G, Kutluk Ö (2012). Harmonic analysis of the piano pieces in Muammer Sun's country colours album No. 1. *J. Acad. Soc. Sci. Stud.* 5(7):769-788.
- Yekta R (1924). Music Theory. (Reprint in 1997). Musikisinas, Spring 1, İstanbul.
- Yıldırım A, Şimşek H (2003). Qualitative research methods in Social Sciences. (3rded.) Ankara: Seçkin Publications.