Why Use Music in English Language Learning? A Survey of the Literature

Dwayne Engh¹

¹ English Teacher, Tudor BEC College London, U.K.

(Received Masters in English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics, King’s College London, 2010)

Correspondence: Dwayne Engh, St. Peter’s Vicarage, 53 Belsize Square, London, U.K. NW3 4HY. E-mail: dwayneengh@shaw.ca

Received: December 9, 2012   Accepted: December 22, 2012   Online Published: January 9, 2013
doi:10.5539/elt.v6n2p113   URL: http://dx.doi.org/10.5539/elt.v6n2p113

Abstract
The use of music and song in the English language-learning classroom is not new. While many teachers intuitively feel that music is beneficial in teaching English language, there is sometimes a lack of the theoretical underpinnings that support such a choice. There are examples in the literature to argue the strong relationship between music and language that are substantiated by research in the fields of cognitive science, anthropology, sociolinguistics, psycholinguistics, First Language Acquisition (FLA) and Second Language Acquisition (SLA).

Keywords: music, song, English language learning

1. Introduction

The use of music and song in the English language-learning classroom is not new. As early as Bartle (1962), Richards (1969) or Jolly (1975), scholars have been arguing for use of music in a language acquisition context for both its linguistic benefits and for the motivational interest it generates in language learners.

There are examples in the literature to argue the strong relationship between music and language that are substantiated by research in the fields of cognitive science, anthropology, sociolinguistics, psycholinguistics, First Language Acquisition (FLA) and Second Language Acquisition (SLA). Music had been used on occasion with the Audiolingual Method in language teaching classrooms to reduce the boredom that could occur from repetitive drills from the 1950s through to the 1970s (Bartle, 1962; Kanel, 2000) and later, the use of classical instrumental music was used with the goal to produce a relaxed state of mind that makes the brain receptive to inputs and activates the subconscious in Suggestopedia methodology (Lozanov, 1978; see also Bancroft, 1978). However, it may not have been until Communicative Language Teaching (CLT) and Task Based Learning (TBL) approaches became more pervasive that there was a sudden demand for pedagogical material for the use of songs in the language-learning classroom (Griffee, 2010).

1.1 Why is it Important?

There were two important outcomes from the author's recent research (2010) into effective use of music in the English language classroom (in press). One suggested that there was strong support for use of music in the language-learning classroom, but that there was actually very little occurring in most classrooms. Connected, but a separate issue, implied that while many teachers intuitively felt music was beneficial in teaching English language, there was also the perception that there was a lack of understanding of the theoretical underpinnings that supported such a choice. Therefore, some educators felt unable to defend the decision to champion use of music in the classroom to administrators, business English students or those in a predominantly exam focused environment.

Salcedo (2010), after a survey of foreign language teaching journals, suggests there are “only a few articles on the subject compared to multitudinous articles on other methodological ideas”. Other scholars have noted this as well: Coe (1972) stated there have been no controlled music use in the language classroom experiments and Griffee (1989), in an editorial introduction discussing why songs and music aren’t used more extensively in the language classroom, suggests there exists a lack of theoretical perspective and empirically based research in the field. I would propose that, while there has been some progress in this subfield, little has changed throughout the past decades.
1.2 Subsections of Literature Review

In this literature review, I will examine academic perspectives from within the field of applied linguistics and will make connections to the field from other disciplines that argue there is a firm empirical, theoretical and pedagogical basis to consider for the use of music as an aid in language acquisition. The examination of the literature will consider the following five categories:

1. Sociological Considerations
2. Cognitive Science
3. First Language Acquisition
4. Second Language Acquisition
5. Practical Pedagogical Resources

2. Sociological Considerations

There are four distinct sections in the exploration of Sociological Considerations that will be discussed. Those include the areas of Anthropological Arguments, Community, Breaking Boundaries and Culture.

2.1 Anthropological Arguments

The connection of song to both the development of human languages and the linguistic development of the individual are anthropologically worth noting (Murphey, 1990). Livingstone (1973), in a contentious article that made extrapolations from physical anthropological research of birdsong and mammal behaviour, hypothesised that humans evolved song before speech. While this can never conclusively be proven (see Count, Hewes, Livingstone & Mourant, 1974 for counter-argument), it raises interesting connections to infant development and first language acquisition research that will be discussed later in this review. From a social anthropological perspective, Merriam (1964) has argued that the survival of literature, epic poetry and ballads in oral traditions must be credited to the use of song. The odes of praise and stories of the tribe were passed on through song so that the texts would not be forgotten before the written word developed. Rubin (1995) suggests this may be because of the multilayered patterns of rhythm, sound, linguistic meaning and emotional content functioning simultaneously. Lastly, drawing on anthropological and ethnomusicological literature, Trehub and Trainor (1998) examine the historical and cultural functions of songs in child care, claiming “the descriptive evidence seems to suggest that the practice of singing to infants and many details of song form and style are rooted in ancient traditions that have survived industrialization and urbanization” (43). It does appear the anthropological development of human languages is, to some extent, connected to music and song.

2.2 Community

In addition to being utilized by caregivers and individual storytellers in oral traditions, singing has also historically evolved as a collective activity. It is communally practiced by people not requiring professional training, with a wide range of experience levels, and in a variety of settings including leisure, religious or educational communities. It is argued that use of song in the language classroom enhances social harmony (Huy Le, 1999), creates a safe space to experience learning collectively and contributes to the building of a community (Lems, 1996; Lake, 2003); all of which are essential factors for effectively attaining teaching and learning goals. Specifically examining trust and cooperation, Anshel and Kipper (1988) suggest that group participation in singing positively influences both trust and cooperation, which are primary contributors to the progression of group cohesion and a sense of community (see McMillan & Chavis, 1986 for further discussion of theories of community). Gao (2008), while discussing use of karaoke and singing contests as evidence of learner collaboration in English Corners in China, approaches the humanistic learning that can occur within this type of community as following traditional Chinese cultural values and Confucian pedagogical traditions (see also Nguyen, Terlouw & Pilot, 2006). The literature appears to suggest that the specific feeling of belonging to a cohesive community, that many teachers explicitly strive to establish for their learners in the classroom, can be promoted by use of music and collective singing.

2.3 Breaking Boundaries

Music consistently surrounds our lives and may potentially assist educators in removing boundaries between the various communities that students belong to (Nagy & Herman, 1987). Extending their work, Medina (1990) suggests it may be beneficial to attempt methods that more closely resemble life outside of the institutional classroom, which is generally filled with music, songs, stories and visual images. Because students learn a great deal of language before school age and outside of the institution once school has begun, it is potentially justifiable to consider non-traditional teaching methods that are less structured and ritualised.
Cheung (2001) prefers the image of music bridging gaps between ‘formal and informal’ learning as opposed to breaking boundaries and Huy Le (1999) extends this bridging of formal and informal learning environments to include the bridging of the gap between teachers and students as well. By breaking down the boundaries or bridging the gaps between stereotypical ‘institutional’ learning and the ‘informal’ learning of our homes, work places and school grounds, we can continue to engage students in natural and authentic language that they will want to practice independently out of class (Jenkins & Dixon, 1983; Harwood, 1998). In a study of young learner’s engagement in music beyond the institutional classroom, Campbell (1998) discusses how the function of music in learner’s lives, the use of music in play and the manner of musical enculturation relate to the place of music in institutional educational settings, suggesting more music should occur in educational institutions – supporting Murphey’s (1992a) argument that the school environment is the only place in society not using music and song to its full potential.

2.4 Culture

Candlin, in the preface as series editor that Songs in Action (Griffee, 1992) was a part of, argues for the importance songs may provide as an historical and social cultural context to the language being acquired. He states:

To be sure, songs have a place in the classroom for helping create that friendly and co-operative atmosphere so important for language learning, but they can offer much more. They offer insights into the culture and especially the stories and myths of different societies, providing a window into the frames of reference and values of the peoples whose language we are learning. (Candlin, 1992: ix)

There are two areas to consider under the heading of culture. First, that Pop Culture is a global phenomenon orientated toward a common youth culture with pop songs as its backbone (Griffee, 1992) and hence is something that is both significant and familiar to the students (Dubin, 1975). Therefore, use of music from Pop Culture allows a window to the target language of ‘their culture’ (Cheung, 2001; Plagwitz, 2006) and not only works to bridge the gap between generations, between pre-defined teacher-student roles and between the stereotypical formal and informal learning environments, but also validates and empowers ‘their music’, ‘their language’ and ‘their culture’ (Hamblin, 1987; Domoney & Harris, 1993).

Secondly, songs are a potentially culturally rich resource for the language classroom (Murphey, 1992b; Ajibade & Ndububa, 2008) that can explicitly be used to teach the cultural norms and ideals of the target language (Gravenall, 1945; Jolly, 1975). Music, while universal, is culturally specific in that the musical content and style mirror a particular culture, acting as a cultural artefact that may both reflect and influence that culture (Griffee, 1992; Failoni, 1993; Mishan, 2005). “The introduction of vocal music as the foundation on which to either build a coordinated language-culture course or, more often, supplement an already established program, can be a powerful tool, especially when the music is a faithful reflection of the culture from which it derives” (Jones, 2008: 10). While a number of academics agree and appear to support the pedagogical use of music to increase cultural competency in the culture of the target language (i.e. Saricoban & Metin, 2000; Orlova, 2003), there are other linguists such as Huy Le (1999) who argues “that music, particularly songs, is an encoding of cultural values and ideology which needs to be viewed critically if foreign music is used in teaching a second language…” The use of music in the classroom raises significant questions concerning how culture, language and identity are related, and therefore demands critical reflective thought, if not a level of caution regarding the potential linguistic and cultural imperialism that could occur (see Pennycook 2003, 2007 for further discussion of transcultural flows and performativity with relationship to culture and identity).

We now move from the discussion of Sociological Considerations into the exploration of the cognitive and neural relationship of language and music.

3. Cognitive Science

Cognitive research investigates the anatomic structure of the brain and its neural functions, suggesting that language and music have important points of convergence and/or overlap. There are multiple recent studies in this field, likely somewhat due to the increase in sophistication of neuroscience technology as well as increased interest from within the field in the neural and functional structure of both language and music domains (for developmental comparison, see McMullen & Saffran, 2004). Additionally, the popularisation of some studies such as the ‘Mozart Effect’ (Rauscher, Shaw & Ky 1993, 1995; Hetland, 2000) by Campbell (1997) has brought increased attention from the general public to the field of cognitive science. The original Rauscher et al. (1993, 1995) study extended the work of French therapist Tomatis (Thompson & Andrews, 2000) and indicated an enhancement of spatial-temporal abilities after listening to music composed by Mozart, an assertion that has been disputed by Chabris (1999), Nantais and Schellenberg (1999), Steele, Bass and Crook (1999) and Steele et
al. (1999).

Cognitive science research agrees that there are important connections between music and language:

*Like language, music is a human universal involving perceptually discrete elements organized into hierarchically structured sequences. Music and language can thus serve as foils for each other in the study of brain mechanisms underlying complex sound processing, and comparative research can provide novel insights into the functional and neural architecture of both domains.* (Patel, 2003: 674)

There is, however, an interesting contradiction noted in the literature debating how that occurs. The evidence from neuropsychology argues that musical and linguistic elements can be dissociated, and therefore may work together as discrete domains. Borchgrevink (1982) postulated that linguistic and musical elements are processed in different hemispheres of the brain and therefore language and music used concurrently provides effective pedagogical methodology to increase learning, while Jackendoff (1991, 2006) describes how music parallels the perception of language and suggests a ‘parallel architecture’ approach. It is argued that language and music collaborate but operate in different domains, so that “from a conceptual standpoint, music and language must be dissociated, or else there would be no possibility for cooperation” (Steinke, Cuddy & Holden, 1997: 316). A specific study of song lyrics and melody processing suggest “that the monitoring of speech and music in songs is performed by independent neural processors” (Peretz, 2002: 174) and a research study of how phonemes and pitch are controlled in different but collaborating areas corroborate those findings that the two aspects of language “are handled separately, yet in harmony by a musical-linguistic collaboration” (Zatorre, Meyer, Gjedde & Evans, 1996: 848).

Yet these conclusions stand in direct contrast to recent neuroimaging data, which indicates a convergence in the processing of the syntactic relations in language and music (Patel, 2003). This suggests that musical structure is processed in language areas of the brain (Patel, Edward, Ratner, Besson & Holcomb, 1998; Koelsch, Gunter & Friederici, 2000; Koelsch et al., 2002), specifically “localized in Broca’s area and its right-hemisphere homologue, in areas involved in syntactic analysis during auditory language comprehension… indicating that these regions process syntactic information that is less language-specific than previously believed” (Maess, Koelsch, Gunter & Friederici, 2001: 540; also see Levitin & Menon, 2003). Hence, because they are processed in the same region, our brains may recognize aspects of linguistic and musical sequences in a similar manner.

Patel (2003) and Slevc, Rosenberg and Patel (2008) suggest a possible resolution to this contradiction in the literature with the use of linguistic and musical syntactic processing cognitive theories, postulating “a specific point of convergence between these theories leads to the hypothesis that syntax in language and music share a common set of processes (instantiated in front brain areas) that operate on different structural representations (in posterior brain areas)” (Patel, 2003: 674).

As we move from the area of Cognitive Science to that of First Language Acquisition, Gomez and Gerken (2000) act as a transition in their literature review of cognitive research discussing the possible contributions and correlations of the language acquisition device (LAD) and associative learning functions through the methodology of testing artificial language learning and language acquisition in infants. The studies reviewed raise significant questions with respect to whether such neural functions are general or specific to language. “The fine-grained characterizations of infant learning mechanisms that this approach permits should result in a better understanding of the relative contributions of, and the dynamic between, innate and learned factors in language acquisition” (ibid: 178).

### 4. First Language Acquisition

The FLA field offers a number of insights that corroborate the arguments of Cognitive Neuroscience for the innate connection of language and music in human beings. Loewy (1995) postulates that music acts as the prelinguistic carrier for communicative intent, essentially that a foundation for peer social interaction is built through the infant's preverbal communication of crying. Other scholars, such as Chen-Hafteck (1997), suggest that the prelinguistic phase discussed in FLA literature is similar to the premusical phase discussed by musicologists, which echoes arguments that song-like vocalisation will commonly precede language in regular ontogenetic development (Murphey, 1989).

*Music and language are the two ways that humans communicate and express themselves through sound. Since birth, babies start to listen and produce sound without distinguishing between music and language, singing and speech.* (Chen-Hafteck, 1997: 85)

The intentional experimentation with linguistic production occurs through prosodic elements of speech and the vocal contour, including manipulating tone, timbre, stress and rhythm in the infant’s ‘indistinct babbling’
vocalisation that precedes specific linguistic and musical production. "This music of speech is the earliest dimension of language that is used and understood by children" (Loewy, 1995: 61). Papousek and Papousek (1981, 1991) support Loewy’s proposition and argue there is very little difference between spoken intonational contour and sung melodic contour before the first lexical items are acquired by infants, which is corroborated by empirical research (Trehub, Trainor & Unyk, 1993) that tracked language development in infants by analysing pitch contours in linguistic and musical material.

It is argued the input infants receive in affective ‘baby-talk’ or infant-directed speech prosody (Trainor, Austin & Desjardins, 2000), as well as the songs mothers and other caregivers sing (Bergeson & Trehub, 2002), has an impact of linguistic and musical development. Nursery rhymes and lullabies are some of the first language input that occurs with enough repetition to encourage memorization and therefore acquisition (Howle, 1989). Murphey and Alber (1985) note that as children grow up, they receive less and less of the affective musical ‘motherese’ language that caregivers use with infants and postulate it is replaced by pop music as the ‘motherese of adolescents’, as well as suggest connections between the motherese of adolescents and the benefits of ‘affective foreigner talk’ (see also Murphey, 1992a). This affective foreigner talk is observed in language teachers as a simplified code of comprehensible input at the appropriate language level in the language-learning classroom, noting that the use of modified intonation is often instinctive from both language teachers and caregivers, who are often unaware that they are ‘singing’ with an exaggerated pronunciation and hyperbolic melodic contour at that moment (Fontes, 2000). It appears that melodic musicality of speech is not only significant to FLA, but to the entire language acquisition process and connections can be drawn between first language and second language acquisition literature as we move into the next section.

5. Second Language Acquisition

For the purposes of this literature review, the extensive field of SLA research as it applies to use of music in language-learning will be discussed under the headings: Affective Filters, Motivation, Learning Strategies and Empirical SLA Studies.

5.1 Affective Filters

The ‘affective filter hypothesis’ (Krashen, 1982) argues that the most favourable learning occurs in a setting of low anxiety, self-confidence and high motivation. Built on SLA research, the hypothesis states “acquirers with a low affective filter seek and receive more input, interact with confidence, and are more receptive to the input they receive” (Richards & Rodgers, 2008: 183). An exploration of the literature regarding how affective filters may relate to the use of music and song in the language classroom (Merriam, 1964; Coe, 1972; Claerr & Gargan, 1984; Wilcox, 1995) suggests that music lowers affective barriers and assists in making students more relaxed, thereby more receptive to language learning. Based on corpus analysis, pop songs are conversation-like, repetitive and occur at roughly half the speed of spoken discourse (Murphey, 1992b), therefore also lowering affective barriers. “This simplicity, their highly affective and dialogic features, and their vague references (ghost discourse), allow listeners to use them in personally associative ways” (Murphey, 1992b: 771). Connecting this argument to earlier ‘motherese of adolescents’ discussions, it is postulated pop songs create a low affective filter and Murphey characterises them as a ‘teddy-bear-in-the-ear’ because of their riskless nature. Additional research examining differences in affective filter, stress levels and language acquisition (Ganschow et al, 1994) implies the anomic language-learners feel, which may include a sense of homelessness, social uncertainty and dissatisfaction, can be addressed by use of music in the classroom (Schoepp, 2001; Lake, 2003).

5.2 Motivation

Motivation is multifaceted and concerns both the affective states and attitudes that impact the amount of effort a learner expends to acquire a new language. The degrees of the various types of instrumental, integrative, resultative and intrinsic motivation (Ellis, 1997) differ with the individual student and the literature supports the use of song and linguistic play in the language classroom (Cook, 1997) to increase individual language-learner motivation (see also Ndububa & Ajibade, 2006; King, 2010).

The validity of using authentic and natural language input “including real-world/target tasks, pedagogical tasks and enabling skills” (Nunan, 2004: 19) so that “there is some sort of relationship to comparable real-world activities” (Skehan, 1998: 95) has been noted as a motivating factor in the language classroom (see also Nunan, 1989; Bell & Gower, 1998; McGrath, 2002). Mishan (2005) contends that because music is an authentic activity that occurs among first language users both in terms of discussion of popular music as well as in the group singing that occurs at many public events ranging from karaoke to football, it also proves motivating to use for language-learners in a classroom setting (see also Cook, 1997). The arguments that the rhythmic patterns of ‘Jazz Chant’ are fragments of authentic language use (Graham, 1992); that popular rock music provides meaningful
authentic activity with frequent integrated exposure (Domoney & Harris, 1993); that rock songs are short, accessible authentic texts rich in content that work as a catalyst to engage with and build meaning from (Pope, 1995); that the poetry of rock music provides a valid authentic text (Abrate, 1983; Griffee, 1992); and that this 'rock poetry' may be considered an example of inclusive literature (Ferradas Moi, 1994, 2003), all provide further support to the motivating factor of music in the language classroom.

5.3 Learning Strategies

It has been suggested that motivation may have connections to other individual learner differences in second language acquisition such as learner strategies, learner autonomy and preferred learning styles (Sinclair, 1996; Cohen, 1998; Benson, 2006). Separating potential interconnectivity of the variables between motivations, individual learning preferences due to multiple intelligences and learner strategies (Carrell, Pharis & Liberto, 1989; Brown, 2007) therefore becomes an issue. There is also a strong possibility that the influence of learning environments, which may include family, educational and cultural background factors might have an effect on the learner (Locastro, 1994; Harley, 2000). Gardner (1999) acknowledges Locastro’s point when considering the impact of personal decisions in the expression of multiple intelligences (Chen & Gardner, 2005) and defines intelligence as “a biopsychological potential to process information that can be activated in a cultural setting to solve problems or create products that are of value in a culture” (Gardner, 1999: 33). Fonseca Mora (2000) applies Gardner’s multiple intelligences hypothesis specifically to language teaching (see also Berman, 1998) and asserts “one of the main implications for teaching of this theory was that students should not only be taught to increase their verbal, spatial, and numerical intelligences, but also to nurture their musical, bodily-kinaesthetic, interpersonal, and intrapersonal intelligences” (146).

Although there are, admittedly, some challenges with the learner strategy literature in general, there are a number of researchers who remain enthusiastic about the value of language learner strategies (Oxford, 1990; Naiman, Frohlich, Stern & Todesco, 1996; Chamot, 2005), suggesting that a more genuine interaction occurs (Lam & Wong, 2000). When music is situated as an aid to learning strategies in the language classroom, both cognitive and metacognitive strategies are enhanced (Jones, 2008), affective exploration is increased (Cullen, 1998) and the student is more receptive to language inputs (Bancroft, 1978; Lozanov, 1978; Magahay-Johnson, 1984).

This leads us now to specific empirical research regarding the use of music and its effect on second language acquisition.

5.4 Empirical SLA Studies

There is ample empirical evidence to suggest that use of music and song enhances students’ success in second language acquisition, which will be discussed in three sections: Recall and Memory, The Din/Involuntary Mental Rehearsal and Language Specific Skills. Medina claims “the conclusions for the use of music in the second language classroom are clear. Since music can be as viable a vehicle for second language acquisition as stories, then songs should not be treated as extra-curricular entities” (1990: 18).

5.4.1 Recall and Memory

Empirical research comparing conventional pedagogical methods with those that use music and song has produced positive results in the area of vocabulary recall. For example, studies with primary students by Medina (1990) investigated effectiveness of vocabulary acquisition with the use of music and story illustrations, and a study by Schunk (1999) examined the effect of signing when coupled with singing on receptive vocabulary skills.

Based on research using background music to aid verbal phrase recall, Fonseca Mora (2000) asserts that songs have a positive outcome on the students’ language acquisition and that lexical patterns stored in long-term musical memory can be retrieved with ease at a later date for mental rehearsal, memoservation or during oral interaction. Wilcox (1995) studied the pronunciation of target vocabulary in adult learners through use of music cues to aid prosodic memory, which is confirmed by research into vocabulary recall attached to visual or auditory cues (Brown & Perry, 1991), and research into music-dependent memory using background musical cues with specific target vocabulary (Balch, Bowman & Mohler, 1992). Brutten, Angelis and Perkins (1985) explored this research further by testing oral proficiency using musical ability and memory in English language learners and suggested that innate musical abilities and verbal memory may have accounted for score variances.

Pop songs are useful for not only discrete lexical vocabulary item recall, but also for longer utterances and formulaic phrases. For example, Wray and Perkins (2000) have suggested that most speech is the repetition and variation of memorized formulas, and that these formulaic lexical phrases are flexible and therefore allow for many repetitions. Distinctive intonation, rhythmic and stress patterns can accompany each formulaic unit when
incorporating the multiple formulaic lexical phrases found in songs, making it easier for the learner to remember and apply.

The use of rhythm and rhyme to assist auditory recall has also been studied, and the multimodal combination of rhythm, melody and rhyme along with linguistic prosody appears to lead to greater retention (Graham, 1992; Palmer & Kelly, 1992). This has been applied to language learning in a study of rhyming ability of preschool children as a phonological skill (Bryant, MacLean, Bradley & Crossland, 1990) and applied to English verse (Kelly & Rubin, 1988), where connections are suggested between children’s verse and acquisition of prosodic rules (see also Krumhansl, 2000 for further psycholinguistic research in this area).

5.4.2 The Din / Involuntary Mental Rehearsal

Murphey (1989) provides potential evidence regarding why music effectively assists in lexical and phrasal recall in noting the resemblance of songs to conversational discourse and suggests they are linguistically processed in a similar manner. “Thus, song may be called pseudo-dialogal or a form of Piaget’s (1923) egocentric language, a form of egocentric language that at first may be pronounced for us but is soon appropriated by us, psychologically and subvocally if not actually sung aloud” (Murphey, 1989: 168). He subsequently goes on to hypothesize a relationship between Piaget’s (1923) egocentric speech, Krashen’s (1983) involuntary verbal rehearsal, Vygotsky’s (1934) inner speech and postulates the ‘song-stuck-in-my-head’ (SSIMH) phenomena. “The similarity of the Din to the SSIMH phenomenon is suggested… It is hypothesized that song may act as a LAD activator, or be a strategy of the LAD in the ontogenetic development of language” (Murphey, 1990: 53). The argument for subvocal involuntary mental rehearsal is corroborated as potential evidence why songs in the language classroom have such a positive effect on delayed vocabulary, formulaic lexical phrases and extended text recall (Fonseca Mora, 2000; Salcedo, 2010).

5.4.3 Language Specific Skills

SLA research has also examined specific language skills that can be effectively developed with the use of music and song, such as explicit development of listening discrimination and comprehension. This has been examined for improving aural comprehension and spelling through use of modified cloze procedure (Froehlich, 1985; in a comparative study of conventional listening exercises and pop song gap-fill exercises (Kanel, 1997); through the use of music with passage correction tests (Odlin, 1986); and as practice for extracting meaning from noise with the ‘mondegreens’ found in pop music (Smith, 2003). Music in the language classroom may also be utilized with an explicit vocabulary and grammar focus (Richards, 1969; Saricoban & Metin, 2000) and used to reinforce either grammar or pronunciation points (Allen & Vallette, 1977). Pronunciation and phonology are a natural use of songs in the aid of second language acquisition (Schön et al, 2008), and Leith (1979) states:

…there is probably not a better nor quicker way to teach phonetics than with songs. Phonetics instruction is one good use to which songs can be put even in beginning classes (540).

The repetitive nature of songs makes them effective use for pronunciation drills (Bartle, 1962; Techmeier, 1969; Shaw, 1970) and firstly, it is argued that songs contextually introduce supra-segmental features (Lems, 2001; Wong and Perrachione, 2006), which aids in the learning of patterns for word identification.

6. Practical Pedagogical Resources

In the examination of the academic literature, we have seen a strong empirical and theoretical basis for the potential music has as an aid to language acquisition. However, there appears to be a dearth of current literature that discusses the extent to which teachers are using music and the manner in which it is being used in a practical context. Of the little research exploring teacher attitudes and practice that does exist, it seems to focus on primary school age children and rarely discusses the use of music and song with teen or adult learners. In the last category of the literature review, a brief survey, which does not claim to be exhaustive, of recent textbook publications and website journal articles may give some indication as to how music is being applied and what principles are being recommended in this representative sample.

There are a number of web resources for use of music in the language classroom, including examples of practical lesson discussions with theoretical support in online journals such as the Internet TESL Journal or Humanising Language Teaching Magazine. Examples include the use of music while writing to develop critical thinking (Aloha, 2005); use of music in language play (Cakir, 1999; Saricoban & Metin, 2000); use of music in conversation classes (Orlova, 2003); and use of song lyric ‘word clouds’ as corpora for the language classroom (Kryszewska, 2010). There are also! quite a few examples of downloadable lessons and worksheets from various websites, the majority of which focus on grammatical or vocabulary activities, but few, if any, include any rationale or theoretical basis for decisions made in the development of the materials.
Of the teacher resource books published since 2000, there is a focus on young learners, such as the Paterson and Willis (2008) ‘English Through Music’ from the Oxford basics for children series, which includes 36 varied practical activities with a theoretical discussion of rationale for music use, what opportunities there are for language learning and improving the musical quality of classroom singing. There are also approaches that replace the original words of familiar folk, pop or children’s song melodies in order to learn phonics and grammatical concepts. For example, the melody of Frère Jacques is used with different words so that it becomes Talking and Walking, with a focus on the spelling rules of long vowels and silent vowels in the ‘Sing Your Way Through the Phonics’ program (Gifford, 2000); Rock Talk (Redding, 2006) explores basic grammar and phonics through rock melodies; and, in an effort to learn phonics and grammatical rules, the ‘Learning English Through Songs’ and ‘Phonics the Fun Way’ programs (Gabriel, 2007, 2010) use familiar children’s songs such as Twinkle, Twinkle Little Star and replaces the words to become the Grammar Rules’ Song or a song to learn Prepositions with Rhyming Words using structure ‘There are...’. There are also products that specialise in writing songs explicitly for the language learning market such as the Tutortunes ‘grammatically focused pop’ Top-40-style song, Next to Me (Lock, 2009), which includes 54 different prepositions, or the Days of the Week (Mol, 2008) from Supasongs, presumably both modelled to some degree on earlier language and music resources such as the grammar-orientated Hard to Learn that English as a Second Language Blues (Wellman & Byrd, 1975).

There were a number of resource books about music use in the language classroom published in 1992 or immediately after, including Graham (1992), who created the concept of ‘Jazz Chants’, the rhythmic unison speaking of chants and poetry in the language classroom. Cranmer and Laroy (1992), Griffee (1992) and Murphey (1992) were also all published in the same year as part of different publisher’s established resource book series. Central to the Cranmer and Laroy (1992) text, which focuses on the use of Western orchestral music, is the technique of inner eye visualization, of the “ability to form images in the mind in response to a musical stimulus” (ibid: 2). The Griffee (1992) text also explores the affective response to music in a variety of approaches from dictations to listening exercises to music surveys and a number of extension activities along with firm theoretical underpinning to the choices made, noting that “songs create their own world of feeling and emotion, and as we participate in the song, we participate in the world it creates” (ibid: 4). Lastly, Murphey’s (1992) text explores music and video, learner autonomy and a variety of authentic language activities that occur in first language discourse. Although first published in 1976, Grenough (1994) later republished and includes sheet music, lyrics, worksheet questions and visuals with additional information. If continuously published and therefore current in its song choices, it could prove to be a valuable resource, but by naming and working with specific pop songs, the text has a dated feel that the Griffee and Murphey texts do not. Unfortunately, out of all the texts mentioned in the last paragraph, Music and Song (Murphey, 1992) is the only one still in print at this time, which clearly limits the options for language teachers wanting to use music in the classroom.

7. Conclusion

One is left with a number of questions based on the literature review of theoretical, empirical and practical classroom resources just completed. If connections between music and language are as strong as the literature reviewed above suggests, why is there such disparity between theoretical support and practical application in the classroom? Why, outside of a few young learner texts, has there been such a gap in teacher pedagogical resource books supporting the use of music in language learning since the early 1990s? Why are the needs of adult and teen learners not reflected in the current web or print pedagogical resources?

7.1 Further Research

Given the limitations of the author’s original study, there appears to be a need for additional research of a similar nature examining teacher attitudes and practices with a larger sample size in order to increase statistical significance. Furthermore, several interesting questions arising from the study point to a need for further research. There is a need for an in-depth study with a class of teen and adult learners to measure effects of a music intensive teaching methodology versus conventional methodologies. There is also a need to establish, by conducting research on subjects of various age levels, whether the influence of music is greater at any one particular developmental period. Additionally, further exploration of teacher attitudes and prejudices pertaining to Hip-Hop and rap, making connections to World Englishes and identity, is in order. Lastly, little has been done in the subvocal involuntary mental rehearsal of the Song-Stuck-In-My-Head-Phenomenon (Murphey, 1990) and the motherese of adolescence (Murphey & Alber, 1985; Murphey, 1992a) since first published, although “both are still viable concepts and researchable” (Murphey, 2010).

7.2 Pedagogical Implications

A number of practical suggestions made by respondents during the course of the author’s study point to ways
that a possible disconnect between teacher theoretical support and classroom use can be bridged. Numerous respondents requested materials development as a resource for use of music by language teachers. Of the many useful music books aimed at English language teachers of adult and teen students published in the 1990s, only the Murphey (1992) is still available. Therefore, the suggestion from many respondents to publish new materials may be valid. Potential suggestions include (1) a journal aimed specifically at uses of music in language teaching, with opportunity for feedback and conferences (2); a practical resource book with ready-made photocopiable lesson plans and worksheets (3); and lastly, an edited collection of music in language-learning journal articles so that teachers and future researchers can easily access the growing body of published research in this subfield. This literature review is an attempt to address the last point.

7.3 Closing

Overall, the results are clear in suggesting use of music and song in the language-learning classroom is both supported theoretically by practicing teachers and grounded in the empirical literature as a benefit to increase linguistic, sociocultural and communicative competencies. From an educational standpoint, music and language not only can, but should be studied together.

References


Murphey, T. (2010). Personal communication with the author.


Steele, K., Bella, S., Peretz, I., Dunlop, T., Dawe, L., Humphrey, G., Shannon, R., Kirby, J., Jr., & Olmstead, C.


