FEATURE

STANDING BY THEIR PRINCIPLES

Two Librarians Who Faced Challenges

Introduction by Helen Adams
What do school librarians fear most? Hands down, their biggest fear is a formal challenge to a resource in the school library. There are no accurate statistics about the number of challenges to school library resources. The staff of ALA’s Office for Intellectual Freedom estimates that only about 20 percent are reported to ALA annually. For the year 2014 the number of challenges reported was 311 (ALA 2015).

In the article that follows, two courageous school librarians tell the stories of their challenges and what they learned. Both were recognized with national awards for their stands against censorship. Dee Ann Venuto received the American Association of School Librarians Intellectual Freedom Award in 2011, and in 2013 DaNae Leu was awarded the Robert B. Downs Intellectual Freedom Award from the faculty of the Graduate School of Library and Information Science at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign.

**Work Cited:**
I feel strongly that all children deserve to see their lives, their experiences, and their families reflected back in the books they read.
laundry; others called it a heroic stance for intellectual freedom.

Once the article broke, groups from all over the country also began turning their attention toward our situation. The Intellectual Freedom Committee of the Utah Library Association offered assistance, as did the National Coalition Against Censorship. The Utah chapter of the ACLU let its concerns be known, along with many LGBT groups across the state.

The district continued to stand by the decision to remove *In Our Mothers’ House* from the shelves but quickly extinguished the plan to remove any other books. In the fall of 2012 the ACLU brought a lawsuit on behalf of a parent, charging that her children’s First Amendment rights had been violated by limiting access to the book. Before the suit could go to court, Davis School District conceded that library books were not curricular resources, eliminating the rationale for removing the book from open circulation (ACLU 2013). The books were immediately returned to the shelves. As a result of this ordeal, our district took a hard look at policies and created strong guidelines to assist librarians when faced with future challenges.

I feel strongly that all children deserve to see their lives, their experiences, and their families reflected back in the books they read. They should also be lucky enough to see other lives, other experiences, and other families. That is the promise of the First Amendment, and I am proud to uphold it.

**DaNae Leu** is the school librarian at Snow Horse Elementary School in the Davis School District in Kaysville, Utah. She is a member of AASL. She is a board member of the Utah Educational Library Media Association and is School Library Section Chair for the Utah Library Association. She was awarded the Robert B. Downs Intellectual Freedom Award and Jeanne Layton Intellectual Freedom Award.

---

**Works Cited:**


The challenge at my school, Rancocas Valley Regional High, began when almost twenty community members attended a board meeting, accompanied by a county newspaper editorialist, asking for the removal of three library books. The group provided information about what they claimed to be President Obama’s “homosexual agenda,” which included appointing Kevin Jennings, former president of the Gay, Lesbian, and Straight Education Network (GLSEN), to the U.S. Department of Education as assistant deputy secretary in the Office of Safe and Drug-Free Schools. Members of the group had searched our high school library’s online catalog for book titles recommended by GLSEN and requested their removal. The books in question all deal with the topic of sexuality and individuals who identify as LGBT: Revolutionary Voices, The Full Spectrum, and Love and Sex.

Who Were the Challengers?
Based on previous complaints, our superintendent believed the group at the board meeting was affiliated with Glenn Beck’s 9/12 Project. Searching the Internet, we discovered this to be true. Surprisingly, their online communications were not private, and hundreds of posts regarding plans and ideology were revealed. These made it clear that 9/12-ers did not value the tolerance education taught in public schools and were planning a “blitz of local school boards” to inform them of the “homosexual liberal takeover... and request removal of materials” (Blitz 2010). Their decision to go public and bring in the press made it easier for us to be transparent and public in our response.

Our Response
With the aid of the superintendent, national organizations, and members of the review committee, a host of information resources, including policies, articles, and letters, were assembled regarding the challenge. The committee members read these sources and the books in question, voting to keep two titles on the shelves and remove Revolutionary Voices.

POST CHALLENGE I BECAME A BETTER TEACHER, MORE ADEPT AT COMMUNICATING THE PURPOSE OF LIBRARIES IN A DEMOCRATIC SOCIETY.
Meanwhile, 9/12 members enacted their plans, presenting information to area high schools where formal complaints were never submitted. The American Library Association, American Civil Liberties Union, National Coalition Against Censorship, and state organizations issued statements of support, and a group of local actors took readings from Revolutionary Voices on the road as a peaceful protest. Later we learned through Open Public Records Act requests that the local public library had removed all copies of Revolutionary Voices from its branches without due process.

The Personal Side of a Challenge

As a librarian, the concept of defending intellectual freedom seems logical in theory. However, in practice, the process can become difficult, making professionalism paramount. While following policy and procedure to review the books, I became a target as well, referred to as sexualizing and indoctrinating children. One cannot deny the emotional toll a challenge can take. Never did I expect to be portrayed as someone who did not protect and care for young adults. Conversely, never did I expect the level of support I received from the dedicated individuals in ALA’s Office for Intellectual Freedom and the National Coalition Against Censorship. Fortunately, because I quickly saw the political, social, and possibly national connections of this organized challenge, I reached out to these professionals who provided me with emotional support, talking points, and options. In some ways they were therapy for the stress. I would not have handled interactions with stakeholders or the media as well without these great people.

Results of the Challenge

This challenge allowed me the opportunity to write, lecture, and collaborate with other librarians on the front lines of advocating for the principles libraries uphold. Post challenge I became a better teacher, more adept at communicating the purpose of libraries in a democratic society. Through our curriculum, students receive bibliographic/research instruction each year of high school. They are made aware of the librarians’ Code of Ethics and are educated about the process of removal and selection of materials in collections. We speak of privacy, labeling, voluntary censorship, data mining, filters, civic participation, and access rights. Our students are better educated on the purpose of libraries and the services they provide. Students are empowered to choose the best resources for themselves.

As a result of the challenge, I’ve increased justifications for acquisitions, particularly in urban literature, music, and graphic novels. These justifications include purchasing books from suggested bibliographies and, as support, relying on documents such as ALA’s Library Bill of Rights, Intellectual Freedom Manual, and the Freedom to Read statement. In regard to providing access to information, I am compelled to serve students’ needs, advocate for their First Amendment rights, and meet their requests. For certain, decisions about providing materials, particularly materials rated “R” or CDs with sexually explicit language, pose difficult questions for librarians. However, I am proud to say that among our 500 plus seniors, 75 percent report the library “most definitely” impacted the value of their education, and 63 percent will use libraries in the future. Important tenets of librarianship are closely linked to the Constitution and the Bill of Rights; it is our duty to uphold these and educate our students about them.

Dee Ann Venuto is the school librarian for Rancocas Valley Regional High School in Mt. Holly, New Jersey. She is a member of AASL and chair of the New Jersey Association of School Librarians Intellectual Freedom Committee. She received the AASL Intellectual Freedom Award in 2011 and the New Jersey Library Association Intellectual Freedom Award in 2011, and in 2010 she was honored by the National Coalition Against Censorship as a defender of free speech. She wrote the article "Managing Challenges to Library Resources," which was published in the December 2014/January 2015 issue of School Library Monthly.

Work Cited: