

Noela Hogg, music educator: reminiscences of a past student

Harry Burke

Monash University, Australia

Abstract

Continual changes to Victorian secondary education since the 1990s have severely effected the teaching of classroom music in many schools. Similar to the 1970s-1980s, there is a need for music educators and teachers to develop innovative concepts and insights into teaching school music. From 1975 to 1984, a group of determined women music-educators at Burwood Teachers College Melbourne, guided by Noela Hogg (1941-2013) developed and taught an innovative and creative classroom music course to pre-service secondary music students. As little development had occurred in Victorian secondary music education since the 1930s, there was an urgent need to revitalize school music and make it relevant for the general music student. It was Hogg's intention to develop and introduce a model of classroom music that was centered on the philosophy of R. S. Peters, John Paynter and R. Murray Schafer. Severe cutbacks to classroom music education in Victoria in the 1990s have meant that the vision Hogg had for school music has not eventuated. Today, there is an urgent need for the development of an innovative and effective music program for teaching general lower secondary classroom music comparable to what Noela Hogg proposed during the 1990s. This paper outlines the work of Noela Hogg at Burwood Teachers College/Deakin University during the 1980s-1990s.

Key words: creative music education, general classroom music, lifelong learning, progressive education, performance-based music education

Australian Journal of Music Education 2014:2,36-45

Introduction

For a short period of time during the early 1980s, a cohort of women music-educators led by Noela Hogg (1941-2013), Belle Farmer and Betty Scarlett taught tertiary music education to pre-service secondary music students at the Burwood Teachers College Melbourne (later Victoria College, now Deakin University). Although not well known or recognized for their contribution to Victorian secondary school music, these women were powerful advocates for the advancement of classroom music, particularly for the general secondary student. As an undergraduate student in the final intake of

the four year Bachelor of Education (secondary music) in 1981, the researcher considers himself fortunate to have had Noela Hogg as a lecturer. At that time, Hogg offered pre-service secondary music students an insight into the rapidly changing face of state secondary education and the urgent need to develop and implement a new philosophy and direction in classroom music after nearly fifty years of stagnation in state secondary education.¹ Along with other Victorian tertiary music educators that included

1. H. Burke. (2010). *The Introduction of Creative Music Education in Victorian State Secondary Schools 1957 to 1988*. Unpublished PhD. Monash University. Melbourne.

Geoffrey D'Ombain and Keith Humble,² Hogg developed an innovative approach to teaching general classroom music that focused on the English model of creative music education and the development of new concepts in education that included personal development, catering for individual differences and a commitment to lifelong learning.³ As well as a music-educator, Noela Hogg contributed to the Astra Chamber Music Society, Yamaha Music Foundation Australia and the Suzuki Music Association. Unfortunately, the vision and concepts she had for the revitalization of classroom music for the general student, particularly in Victorian state secondary schools did not eventuate due to the introduction of standards-based Arts education, budget restraint for general classroom music education and the expansion of instrumental programs for the talented performer.

Burwood Teachers College commenced in 1954, specializing in teaching primary education, becoming the State College of Victoria Burwood in 1973. To help alleviate the secondary teacher shortage in Victoria in the 1970s, Bachelor of Education (B. Ed) secondary degree courses commenced in 1975.⁴ Compared to other Victorian tertiary music institutions, Burwood Teachers College was more progressive in the teaching of school music.⁵ During the 1960s, Frank Higgins, then Head of the Music Department had established an innovative course for primary school music education that included creative music and student centered learning.⁶ Higgins argued that primary music education concentrated on teaching students a watered down adult version of music that

did not consider the interests and needs of the young child.⁷ Burwood's new B. Ed. secondary music degree consolidated the work of Higgins, emphasizing classroom music for the general student, Preparatory (Kindergarten) to year 12. An oversupply of secondary humanities teachers in Victoria in the early 1980s, together with a review of tertiary education by the Federal Australia government led to the cancellation of the Burwood B. Ed. secondary music degree at the end of 1981.⁸ This decision seriously curtailed and hindered the innovative work in music education that lecturers at Burwood had been developing since the 1970s. Although disappointed with the decision to terminate the B. Ed secondary music degree, Hogg continued her research into secondary music education in Victoria, developing an innovative approach to classroom music education that was centered on events that had transpired in classroom music in England during the late 1980s.⁹ Further changes to state secondary education in the 1990s with the introduction of standards-based Arts education together with the drastic reduction to budgets for general classroom music has made it difficult for music teachers to establish the rationale Hogg developed for the teaching of classroom music education.

Victorian secondary classroom music Education: The 1960s

Victoria, like the other Australian states was slow to introduce new curriculums to school music after the Second World War. There had been little change to classroom music in Victoria since the 1930s.¹⁰ By the 1960s, classroom music still consisted of teaching students theory and music

2. H. Burke. (2013). Influential Pioneers of Creative Music Education in Victoria, Australia. *Australian Journal Music Education*. In press.

3. N. L. Hogg. (1993). *Identifying and Resolving the Dilemmas of Music Teaching: A study of junior secondary music classrooms*. Unpublished PhD. Monash University, Melbourne.

4. M. J. Abbott. (1997). A History of the Burwood Teachers' College 1954-1981. *Education Research and Perspectives*, 24, (2).

5. J. Ferris. (2006). Personal Communication, 6.12.2006.

6. Ibid.

7. F. Higgins. (1973). *Music Education in the Primary School* (1973 ed.). Melbourne: Macmillan.

8. Abbott. (1997). A History of the Burwood Teachers' College 1954-1981.

9. Hogg. (1993). *Identifying and Resolving the Dilemmas of Music Teaching*.

10. Burke. (2010). *The Introduction of Creative Music Education in Victorian State Secondary Schools 1957 to 1988*.

appreciation lessons, with little if any practical music making activities.¹¹ Donald Peart, Professor of Music at the University of Sydney realized that if school music was to advance in Australia, new concepts that were occurring in England, for example creative music education, and in the USA, the Contemporary Music Program, and later on the Manhattanville Music Curriculum Program should be established in Australian schools.¹² As Chairman of the Second Australian UNESCO Seminar on school music held in Sydney in 1965, Peart invited two leading English experts on creative music education, Peter Maxwell-Davies and Professor Wilfrid Mellers to discuss the benefits and possibilities of creative music education.¹³ Maxwell-Davies captivated the Seminar with his papers and discussion of teaching creative music at Cirencester Grammar school in the late 1950s.¹⁴ After the Seminar, many participants were convinced of the need for change in Australian music education. The introduction of a voluntary progressive child-centered secondary curriculum in Victorian state secondary schools in the late 1960s gave classroom music teachers the opportunity to develop innovative music programs that were discussed at the 1965 Sydney UNESCO Seminar.¹⁵

Innovations in Victorian state secondary schools

With the introduction of new educational concepts from England and the USA in state secondary education in the 1970s, many Victorian classroom music teachers introduced concepts of progressive education, that included catering for individual differences, personal development initiatives for students and lifelong learning

through education.¹⁶ During the 1960s, a wave of pioneering rationales in general education and classroom music swept the conservative English education system. The 'new sociologists' Michael Young¹⁷ and Basil Bernstein¹⁸ believed that it was time to restructure education to help the less privileged student in the community. Young argued that all knowledge is socially constructed and through this practice, dominant groups control the social structure.¹⁹ Goodson pointed out the imbalance in the English education system with the high status of English and mathematics and the low status of art, craft and music.²⁰ The Newsom²¹ and Plowden²² Reports noted the inadequate schooling for many less privileged students and called for a remodeling of the English education system. In particular, these Reports commented on the poor teaching, resources and accommodation for classroom music. With the introduction of comprehensive education in England during the 1960s, teachers in these schools quickly developed innovative and different ways to teach subjects including classroom music.²³

A new era for Victorian music education

The young English composer-educators, Paynter,²⁴ Maxwell-Davies,²⁵ and Canadian

11. Mrs. Vanson. (1975). Keeping it Kontemporary. *Agitato*. (3).

12. D. Peart. (1965). *Australian Panorama*. Paper presented at the Australian UNESCO Seminar on School Music, Sydney Teachers' College and University of Sydney.

13. *Ibid.*

14. *Ibid.*

15. Burke. (2010). *The Introduction of Creative Music Education in Victorian State Secondary Schools 1957 to 1988*.

16. *Ibid.*

17. M. F. D. Young. (1971). *Knowledge and Control: New Directions for the Sociology of Education*. London: Collier-Macmillan Publishers.

18. B. Bernstein. (1971). *Class, Codes and Control* (1973 ed.). St. Albans: Paladin.

19. Young. (1971). *Knowledge and Control*.

20. I. Goodson. (1983). *School Subjects and Curriculum Change: Studies in curriculum history* (1987 ed.). Basingstoke: The Falmer Press.

21. Central Advisory Council for Education (England). (1963). *Half Our Future. (The Newsom Report)*. London: HMSO.

22. Central Advisory Council for Education (England). (1970). *Children and their Primary Schools. (Plowden Report)* (6th ed.) Vol. 1. London: HMSO.

23. Goodson. (1983). *School Subjects and Curriculum Change*.

24. J. Paynter. (1970). *Creative Music in the Classroom*. Unpublished PhD thesis. University of York.

25. P. Maxwell-Davies. (1963). *Music Composition by Children*. Paper presented at the Fourteenth Symposium of the Colston Research Society, Bristol University.

Schafer²⁶ who had first trained as composers argued strongly for changes in the way music was taught in school. They maintained that all students should create and perform their own music, rather than recreate the music of other composers. Paynter was dismayed at the outdated classroom music curriculum for lower secondary students that consisted nearly entirely of students learning about music rather than participating in, or creating their own music.²⁷ Schafer argued that he had yet to meet students who could not create their own music.²⁸ Vulliamy and Lee²⁹ contended that there was an urgent need to broaden classroom music by introducing popular, ethnic and contemporary music. Christopher Small commented that teaching music students a pseudo Western classical tradition that was based on music theory and the great composers of the nineteenth century, made students consumers of music not creators as adults.³⁰ He remarked, "school music traditionally has little to offer; they tend to undergo a kind of caricature of professional training, being told about music rather than being involved in its creation"³¹

By the 1970s, many of the educational concepts that had been developed in England became part of state secondary education in Victoria. The more liberal minded music educators and teachers for example Hogg realized that students had their own ideas of what they wanted to learn and pursue in music education. Similar to Small, Hogg commented, many teachers take it for granted that they are the sole providers of musical knowledge, and to suggest that they might adopt

a facilitating role instead would be to question a way of thinking that that has been perpetuated within the European tradition since the time of ancient Greece.³²

The author was a student in Hogg's classes from 1981-1984. During this period, she fostered the philosophy of the new sociologists and the English creative music movement with the pre-service secondary students. In her lectures, she discussed the need for classroom music teachers to cater for all students in the class, not just the gifted music performer. Hogg stressed the point that in any year 7-8 class there could be students who would have had little if any music education in their primary school, yet others who were learning an instrument either at school or out of school and already understood the rudiments of music theory. She frequently reminded her pre-service students that each lesson with year 7 students should have three levels of the activity being taught that would help to cater for the differences in student's background and ability. She argued that it was ineffectual to ask students already familiar with the basics of music to study it, or to help other students in the class who were having difficulties.³³ Hogg remarked that it was no wonder that young students easily became bored with learning music theory from a book in a lesson that lasted for fifty minutes.

Hogg found a sympathetic resonance with the writings of Keith Swanwick who maintained that the curriculum for classroom music should be balanced and include skill development as well as creative music education.³⁴ In England, Swanwick had observed that many music teachers during the 1970s either concentrated entirely on creative music education ignoring other aspects of the curriculum, or taught no creative music education. Hogg realized that without basic skills and knowledge in music, students would

26. R. M. Schafer. (1969). *The New Soundscape: A handbook for the modern music teacher*. Toronto: BMI Canada.

27. Paynter. (1970). *Creative Music in the Classroom*.

28. J. Southcott & H. Burke. (2012). An 'Attunement for Change': R. Murray Schafer and the Introduction of Creative Music Teaching in Australia. *Canadian Music Educator*, 54, (2).

29. G. Vulliamy & Ed. Lee. (1976). *Pop Music in School*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

30. C. Small. (1977). *Music, Society, Education*. London: J. Calder.

31. *Ibid.*, p. 195.

32. Hogg. (1993). *Identifying and Resolving the Dilemmas of Music Teaching*, p. 13.

33. N. L. Hogg. (1994). Strategies to Facilitate Student Composing. *Research Studies in Music Education*. 2, (June).

34. K. Swanwick. (1979). *A Basis for Music Education*. Windsor: NFER.

be limited to what they could accomplish as an adult. She embraced the philosophy of R. S. Peters who highlighted the difference between training and education. Peters argued that training usually gives a person a limited amount of knowledge and competence in a specific subject, whereas education involves the transmission of valuable beliefs in a subject.³⁵ Peters' philosophy became an important aspect of Hogg's rationale for classroom music education in Victoria in the 1990s.

Until the Victoria state secondary education reforms of the late 1960s, the dearth of practical music making activities for lower secondary students had resulted in few students continuing with school music in the middle and senior years of schooling.³⁶ Hogg argued that creative music education offered naive year 7 students with few skills in music an opportunity to participate in practical music making activities instead of spending most of their time learning about music. Over a period of two years, pre-service Burwood secondary students participated in preparing and performing numerous examples of creative music education as well as movement to music that included a unit of work presented by Hogg based in part on the Laban movement to music method.³⁷ Students were required to read and prepare assignments on Paynter and Schafer. Many of the Burwood undergraduate secondary students who had been educated in the traditional ways of learning classroom music however found the concepts of Paynter and Schafer difficult to accept as a suitable curriculum for lower secondary classroom music, with the result few persisted with creative music after graduation.

Hogg frequently discussed with the Burwood undergraduate students the boredom and

resistance of lower secondary students when expected to spend whole lessons studying music theory in silence. She considered that having students work on music theory exercises from an outdated Australian Music Education Board (AMEB) theory book without once hearing or playing a note of music was a misuse of class time.³⁸ Hogg argued the result of this practice was that,

teachers valued music notation and basic concepts so highly that they were prepared to set unmusical tasks, accept unmusical and non-musical learning outcomes, ignore forms of musicking³⁹ that did not require the reading of notation, use AMEB theory examinations as the measure of their students' progress, and tolerate student resistance to the musical program as a whole.⁴⁰

Regrettably, the researcher can recall during the middle of the 2000s, a state secondary school with a large instrumental program in Melbourne still insisting that all year 7-8 students, learn theory from an old 1970s AMEB theory book for a whole lesson in silence. The music faculty considered that lower secondary students were immature and required skills in notation they could participate in creative music making activities.

As her past student, the author has clear recollections of her teaching. Before undergraduate secondary students went out on their teaching rounds, Hogg would remind us not to spend too much time teaching year 7 students instruments of the orchestra. She questioned the way music appreciation and listening lessons were presented to year 7 students. Hogg argued that in these lessons, emphasis was placed on

35. R. S. Peters. (1970). *Ethics and Education* (1972 ed.). London: Allen & Unwin.

36. Vanson. (1975). Keeping it Kontemporary.

37. Rudolf Laban, 1879-1958. Hungarian dance educator. Laban developed a system for notating dance movements, the Laban Movement Analysis. This notation system is still widely used in choreography today.

38. The researcher can recall during the late 1980s, a Deputy Principal who had an interest in music education being adamant that all lower secondary students in the school study music theory from the AMEB syllabus and that the instrumental students sit for the examinations, much to the anguish of many students.

39. A term used by C. Small in *Music of the Common Tongue*, to describe the various musical activities people participate in.

40. Hogg. (1993). *Identifying and Resolving the Dilemmas of Music Teaching*, p. 294.

students naming the instruments being heard, with little if any attention given to the mood or ambiance of the music or the effect it was having on students. She asked the question, "Why do we give priority to the naming of instruments rather than to discussing the work in terms of mood, spirit, energy level or some other relevant factor which focuses upon the overall impact of the music?"⁴¹ In her frequent visits to Victorian secondary schools, Hogg noticed that during these lessons, students soon lost interest in the work and began to resist, "by combing each others' hair, reading a book, doing homework for other subjects or playing noughts and crosses. Teachers seemed to accept such resistance provided it was not disruptive."⁴² The result of this style of teaching meant that students declined to study classroom music past year 8 when music became an elective subject. Hogg remarked, "poor classroom practices pass unchallenged, and the small number of students in elective classes is explained only in terms of the students' needs to select subjects more appropriate to their future career choices."⁴³

The need for renewal in classroom music: The 1990s

With many years' experience teaching primary and secondary pre-service students and observing secondary classroom music lessons, by the late 1980s Hogg had come to the conclusion that there had been little advancement in general classroom music in many Victorian secondary schools since the 1970s. Although music teachers were now able to design and develop their own curriculums with the introduction of progressive secondary education in the late 1960s, music teachers still emphasized the teaching of theory

and music appreciation lessons. Writing in 1991, Hogg commented, "in Victoria composition still seems to be treated as something students are unable to do until they have been taught 'the basics'"⁴⁴ In many secondary schools, classroom music remained in the doldrums. The general student still found the subject to be of little interest or benefit. Although music is very popular with teenagers, Hogg argued that the teaching of general classroom music was seen by many in education as a leisure activity, or a form of entertainment that teenagers get involved with after school.⁴⁵ As many educational approaches and strategies from the USA have been established in Victorian state education since the 1980s, it is interesting to note some of the outcomes that have occurred in Arts and music education in the USA. Writing in 1992, Geahigan commented, "American educators have tended to regard the arts as more enjoyable than necessary, as something to be attended to after the serious business of schooling had been finished."⁴⁶ John Kratus, Professor of music education at Michigan State University has argued that school music education in the USA is at a tipping point.⁴⁷ He noted that, "during times of fiscal uncertainty, the arts in education is perceived as less valuable than other, more pragmatic subjects that provide skills directly related to the workforce."⁴⁸ Hogg noted similar concerns to Geahigan and Kratus with school music in Australia commenting,

Because music is valued by many merely as entertainment, as a respite from the real business of education, or as a preferable alternative to other

41. Noela Hogg. (1984). *Socialization into the Profession of Classroom Music Teaching*, p. 126.

42. N. L. Hogg. (1991). *Music Education: A matter of the human spirit*. Paper presented at the Music Educators: Reflective Practitioners. Association of Music Education Lecturers, Hobart, p. 16.

43. Hogg. (1993). *Identifying and Resolving the Dilemmas of Music Teaching*, p. 2.

44. Hogg. (1991). *Music Education: A matter of the human spirit*, p. 17.

45. Kratus writes that teenagers in the USA listen to music two to four hours a day. J. Kratus. (2007). *Music Education at the Tipping Point*. *Music Educators Journal*. (November).

46. G. Geahigan. (1992). The Arts in Education: A historical perspective. In B. Reimer & R. A. Smith (Eds.), *The Arts, Education, and Aesthetic Knowing: Ninety-first Yearbook of the National Society for the Study of Education* (pp. 1-39). Chicago: University of Chicago, p. 2.

47. Kratus. (2007). *Music Education at the Tipping Point*, p. 45.

48. Ibid, p. 44.

*less savoury activities, it is an enormous task to help others to understand that music has a vital role in the overall development of every person.*⁴⁹

Arts education in Victoria in the 1990s

Frequent curriculum changes to state education in Victoria, lack of resources, inservicing and budget constraints to education since the late 1980s have meant that there has been little opportunity for classroom music teachers to investigate and introduce programs that might interest lower secondary students to continue with school music. Unfortunately, these changes have impacted on senior music education.⁵⁰ Since the introduction of standards-based Arts education in Victoria in 1995, the emphasis is firmly centered on teaching students' literacy and numeracy skills in the lower secondary school not the Arts that many students enjoy and look forward to each week.⁵¹ In an ever-increasing number of disadvantaged Victorian state primary and secondary schools this century, there has been little change or improvement to classroom music education that Hogg fought so hard for.

The difficulties of teaching secondary classroom music that Hogg had discussed in her talks with undergraduate secondary school music teachers in the 1980s have been highlighted in numerous Arts reports.⁵² The last major Australian music Report, the 2005 *National Review of School Music Education: Augmenting*

the Diminished (NRSME Report) stated, "Music education in Australian schools is at a critical point where prompt action is needed to right the inequalities in school music."⁵³ It went on to say that in many Australian primary schools, "Music is the first subject that is omitted from the curriculum. Where it is being taught, it is usually in a non-sequenced, non-planned way."⁵⁴ Furthermore, it commented, "Where schools have instrumental or choral programs, these are often used as the total music program for the school with non-participating students receiving little or no music."⁵⁵ Compared to England that had investigated the conflicts between traditional and progressive classroom music education through the Schools Council for Curriculum and Examinations⁵⁶ during the late 1960s to early 1970s, Hogg noted that there was little research that had studied or investigated classroom music at the lower secondary level in Australia.⁵⁷

A serious state recession in Victoria in the late 1980s, followed by the reforms to state education has meant that Victorian state schools are finding it challenging to fund classroom music programs for the primary and the general lower secondary student. Many schools still do not have suitable accommodation and resources for teaching classroom music. Instead, an ever-increasing number of Victorian state secondary schools are replacing general classroom music education with the USA band model for the talented performer. This policy has meant that students who are not involved in a performance-based program do not receive any music education. This helps to perpetuate the belief in the eyes of education bureaucrats and school administrators

49. Hogg, (1993). *Identifying and Resolving the Dilemmas of Music Teaching*, p. 202.

50. W. E. Miles. (2006). *Towards an Improved Model for Senior-Secondary Music Education: A multi-faceted perspective*. Unpublished PhD thesis. Monash University, Melbourne.

51. Board of Studies. (1995). *The Arts Curriculum & Standards Framework*. Melbourne: Board of Studies.

52. See 1. Schools Commission-Australia Council. (1977). *Education and the Arts: A Joint Study of the Schools Commission and the Australian Council: National, State and Territory Reports*. Canberra: Summit Press. 2. Recreation Senate Environment, Communication and the Arts References Committee. (1995). *Arts Education: Report of the Senate Environment, Recreation, Communication and the Arts References Committee*. Canberra: Senate Printing Unit. 3. Department of Education Science and Training. (2005). *National Review of School Music Education: Augmenting the diminished*. Canberra: AGP.

53. Department of Education Science and Training. (2005). *National Review of School Music Education: Augmenting the diminished*, p. v.

54. *Ibid.*, p. 56.

55. *Ibid.*

56. G. Cox. (2002). A House Divided: Music Education During the Schools Council Era of the 1970s. *Living Music in Schools 1923-1999: Studies in the History of Music Education in England* (pp. 74-96). Aldershot: Ashgate.

57. Hogg, (1993). *Identifying and Resolving the Dilemmas of Music Teaching*.

that classroom music is a low status 'fill and frill' subject for entertaining the general student. As fewer and fewer education administrators have experienced the benefits of a wide-ranging classroom music program themselves, they are less inclined to demand classroom music programs in their school. Hogg remarked, "Unfortunately, those who have not experienced the power of music in the shaping of their own lives are unlikely to recognize its importance in the shaping of the lives of others."⁵⁸

Hogg noted a number of concerns with the USA performance-based music programs that only concentrated on teaching performance skills. She highlighted to pre-service secondary students at Burwood the need for students to have skills in all areas of music. The result of concentrating on performance-based programs is that in many regions and suburbs of Melbourne there are not the opportunities for students to continue playing an orchestral instrument once they leave school. As an advocate of the R. S. Peters model of education, Hogg understood that many instrumental and vocal students would be limited in what they could achieve in music as adults as they had a limited exposure to music at school.⁵⁹ Instead, Hogg argued that school music should cater for a larger range of students' interest and capabilities. She remarked, "What does it mean, educationally, for a student to play third clarinet or tuba in a band for several years, especially if this experience is not of their own choosing, or a part of a wider music education program?"⁶⁰

Kratz has a number of forebodings over the teaching of instrumental music programs

in schools in the USA. In his 2007 article, he highlighted the point that school band repertoire is often unrelated to student's life in their local community.⁶¹ As students age, they frequently develop different tastes and interests in music to what they participated in at school. He remarked, "Students perform music in school that they rarely, if ever, hear outside of school."⁶² Kratz argued that school music is taught in a different way to other school subjects. He explained that when compared to language that is taught in a contextual way, music is taught sequentially. He commented, "It is an autocratic model of teaching that has no parallel in any other school subject."⁶³ Furthermore, he added, "many of our music education practices take students through a step-by step approach, dominated by the teacher, and leading toward a result that is anything but an independently functioning musician."⁶⁴ With a background in creative music education, Kratz censures the way future music teachers are being taught in college. He commented, "Collegiate music schools are in many cases the most out-of-touch, clinging to outmoded nineteenth century model of conservatory training for professional classical performers, even in the preparation of music educators."⁶⁵

Hogg's rationale for secondary classroom music education

In response, to the paucity of progress and direction in classroom music, Hogg began an extensive program of research into secondary music education in Victoria and England during the late 1980s. It was her intention to try to develop a rationale for Victorian classroom music,

58. Ibid., p. 202.

59. Recently a senior school student who had been learning the trombone at school since year 7 asked the researcher questions regarding MIDI, writing popular songs and playing keyboard in popular based music band. The only experience of school music the student had was playing in the school concert band. Experience with composing and working with modern computer operated music technology would have been of great assistance to him in his endeavor to develop skills in popular music.

60. Hogg. (1991). *Music Education: A matter of the human spirit*, p.14.

61. Kratz. (2007). *Music Education at the Tipping Point*.

62. Ibid.

63. Ibid., p. 45.

64. Ibid., p. 46.

65. Ibid., p. 45. Kratz completed his doctorate on how young children manage the process of composing. J. Kratz. (1985). *Rhythm, Melody, Motive, and Phrase Characteristics of Original Songs by Children Aged Five to Thirteen*. PhD thesis, NorthWestern University.

comparable to what was occurring in England with the development of the English National Music Curriculum.⁶⁶ Hogg realized that teaching school music is a complex task, especially at the lower secondary level. She listed three paradoxes; a support for music at the official level, but low status in schools; acceptance of performance-based music programs in schools, but not classroom programs and active student participation in music outside of school, but not in the music classroom.⁶⁷ Hogg began to develop a rationale for school music that was based on the teachings of R. S. Peters and John Paynter. She argued that by giving students a broad based music background rather than a limited performance one, it would give students a lifelong interest and involvement in music after they had left school. Analogous to what Hogg had discussed with pre-service secondary students at the Burwood Teachers College in the early 1980s, she argued in her doctorate that the lower school curriculum should contain a balance of composition, performance, movement, playing of instruments, singing and listening to music that had been established in England with the introduction of the National Music Curriculum.⁶⁸ Hogg argued the program should not concentrate entirely on creative music or performance based programs as, “teachers have a responsibility to provide a program which not only has its own value, but also nurtures and sustains the continuation of a rich and lively musical culture” throughout life.⁶⁹

As part of her 1990s research, Hogg had observed lower secondary classroom music classes in a number of different English schools. She discovered that the more effective teachers had a balanced curriculum. These teachers also

catered for individual differences, personal development and musical growth in students that seemed to be lacking in the majority of lower Victorian secondary schools.⁷⁰ In England, she also observed that “teachers sought to have their students find the composer, listener and performer within themselves, and focused their attention on both the expressive qualities of the musical products and the personal growth of their students”⁷¹

As part of her doctorate, Hogg developed the concept of music as an empowering agent, which she described as, “the enrichment of students’ lives and, indeed, of their very being, through their active engagement with expressive form”⁷² In teaching composition and performance to pre-service primary students at Deakin University in the late 1980s, Hogg put into practice her concept of empowerment in music education. In these units, she argued, “students come to care very much about the work they produce and that the cognitive side of education is not being neglected”⁷³ She commented that this approach to composition, gave students ownership and enjoyment in the process of music making. In a video she presented to the annual conference of the Association of Music Education Lecturers in Hobart in 1991, Hogg asked the participants to “Look at the energy in the bodies and the smiles on the faces, and try to feel the spirit of the music that they are projecting”⁷⁴

Conclusion

Unfortunately, Hogg’s philosophy of music as an empowering agent together with her emphasis on classroom music for the general lower secondary student has not come to fruition in state secondary education in Victoria. The rationale for introducing standards-based

66. The introduction of the National Music Curriculum combined composing and a skill based music curriculum. K. Swanwick. (1992). *Music Education and the National Curriculum*. London: Tufnell Press.

67. Hogg. (1993). *Identifying and Resolving the Dilemmas of Music Teaching*.

68. *Ibid.*

69. *Ibid.*, p. 306.

70. *Ibid.*

71. *Ibid.*, p. 299.

72. *Ibid.*, p.298.

73. Hogg. (1991). *Music education: A matter of human spirit*, p. 22.

74. *Ibid.*

education in Victoria rejected the philosophy of child centered learning and progressive education of the 1960s. To many classroom music teachers, the English creative music movement of the 1960s is rather passé and not considered an effective principle for music education in the twenty first century. Once more in lower state secondary schools, emphasis is being placed on music theory and students learning about music. It is disappointing to note that little has changed since Miles pointed out in his 2006 doctorate that many students still do not have the appropriate musical knowledge to successfully complete year 12 VCE music.⁷⁵ Unlike in England, there is still no effective national or state music curriculum for composition for year 7-10 students in Victoria. Although composition was introduced in the Victorian Certificate of Education for years 11-12 students in 2011,⁷⁶ anecdotal evidence suggests that the lack of emphasis on composition in the lower and middle years of secondary schooling and the failure to inservice teachers and pre-service teachers in ways to present compositional activities effectively to students has hindered students from enrolling in the unit. Whilst design and development commenced on the Australian National Arts Curriculum in 2010,⁷⁷ political differences and budget squabbles between the two major Australian political parties has so far delayed it being introduced in Victoria.

The devolution of authority to Victorian state schools principals since the late 1990s together with the implementation of the Arts framework curriculum and the lack of support for classroom music has meant that it was always going to be difficult for Hogg to initiate changes to classroom music in Victoria. Today in many disadvantaged Victorian state secondary schools, classroom music is in a similar position to what it was in during the 1970s. The shortage of resources and the lack of commitment to general classroom music by school administrators in Victoria since the 1990s have meant an increasing number of general lower secondary students are not being given the opportunity to participate in any classroom music programs as the 2005 NRSME Report noted.⁷⁸ Perhaps it is time Victorian state education should take heed of Kratus' contention that by schools focusing on performance-based instrumental programs instead of general classroom music it has forced many schools in the USA to a tipping point. As a previous classroom music teacher educated by Noela Hogg at the Burwood State College during the early 1980s, the researcher can recall the enjoyment and satisfaction that many naïve lower secondary student who had little if any primary school music education achieved from participating in creative music making activities. Today in classroom music education, the aims and ideas that Noela Hogg developed and fought so hard for are still important for the future development of music education in Victoria.

75. Miles, (2006). *Towards an Improved Model for Senior-Secondary Music Education*.

76. Victorian Curriculum and Assessment Authority. (2010). *Music:Victorian Certificate of Education Study Design*. Retrieved 14.1.2011, from vcaa.edu.au.

77. Australian Curriculum Assessment and Reporting Authority. (2010). *Draft Shape Paper of the Australian Curriculum: The Arts*. Retrieved 14.11.2010, from www.acara.edu.au.

78. Department of Education Science and Training, (2005). *National Review of School Music Education: Augmenting the diminished*.

Harry Burke completed his PhD in music education at Monash University in 2010. He has taught classroom and instrumental music in Victorian state secondary and primary schools since the middle of the 1980s. His research has included the history of curriculum developments in classroom music education in England, Victoria and the USA from the 1900s.