What is PBIS and is it Culturally Responsive?

Positive Behavioral Intervention and Supports (PBIS) arose from the need to respond to the pervasive racial disparities in behavioral outcomes for students with, and at-risk, for disabilities. The 1997 and 2004 reauthorization of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA) positioned school-wide discipline reform as a top priority in schools across the nation. The question of how to assess disproportionality and eliminate it through early prevention was, inarguably, a central concern. In search for an answer, PBIS emerged. Although, initially PBIS was designed to provide evidence-based behavioral interventions for students with behavioral disorders (BD); the focus later shifted from the individual to the entire school in hopes of providing school-wide behavior support for all students (Sugai, et al., 2000a).

PBIS, as it is conceptually understood today, is defined as a framework for enhancing the adoption and implementation of a continuum of evidence-based interventions to achieve academically and behaviorally important outcomes for all students (Sugai & Simonsen, 2012). More specifically, PBIS operates as a noncurricular, whole-school prevention model that seeks to enhance a school’s capacity to proactively address disruptive behavior by creating and sustaining improved systems and procedures that change adult behaviors and the manner in which they engage students (Bradshaw, Mitchell, & Leaf, 2010). It applies a three-tiered approach to manage behavioral and academic supports at the primary (Tier I), secondary (Tier 2), and tertiary (Tier 3) level.

Initially, the use of culturally appropriate interventions was indirectly emphasized through PBIS (Sugai et al., 2000b). Researchers have often critiqued the framework as being culturally neutral (Cramer & Bennett, 2015). Unfortunately, too often well-meaning teachers may ignore the racial, ethnic, and/or cultural identity of their students which may lead to misinterpretation of student behavior (Monroe, 2006). Although PBIS is a promising practice intended to produce positive outcomes for everyone; it seems less effective for some students due to its race-neutral principles (Vincent, Randall, Cartledge, Tobin, & Swain-Bradway, 2011). McIntosh and colleagues (e.g., 2014, 2019) have been working to address issues of disproportionality and
culturally responsive in PBIS to ensure schools understand the complexities of these issues to ensure equity for all students. Leverson, Smith, McIntosh, Rose, and Pinkelman (2019) define culturally responsive PBIS as including: (1) Identity, (2) Voice, (3) Supportive Environment, (4) Situational Appropriateness, and (5) Data for Equity (p. 2).

Why is CRPBIS important in Transition Planning?

Students with disabilities were twice as likely to face school exclusion as compared to students without disabilities (Office for Civil Rights, 2014). One in four boys of color, and one in five girls of color, served by IDEA were suspended from school annually. There is mounting evidence that exclusionary discipline practices contribute to negative school outcomes (e.g., low academic performance, grade retention, delinquency, alienation, and drug use; Raffaele Mendez, 2003); which create barriers in effective transition planning. Studies show that culturally responsive practices and effective classroom management help to mitigate disciplinary disproportionality (Monroe, 2006), and ultimately, improve post-school success (e.g., college enrollment, reduced rate of dropout, and employment) for racially diverse students with disabilities (Achola, 2019). CRPBIS in this regard is essential in transition planning as it is designed to shift the goal of the discipline system from an ideology of control (punishment) to one of agency (power to act in one’s best interest and one one’s own behalf); forming reciprocal and productive family-school-community coalitions to build positive, supportive, effective and adaptive school wide behavioral support (Bal, 2018). CRPBIS sees diverse perspectives, goals, and lived experiences as assets, rather than deficits, to promote inclusive decision-making when preparing students for adulthood.

What does the literature say about Restorative Practices in Transition Planning?

A number of studies have outlined the importance, as well as, the impact of PBIS. Generally, the research suggests:

- High-fidelity implementation of PBIS has been repeatedly associated with overall reductions in office discipline referrals (ODRs) as well as improved academic outcomes (Bradshaw, Mitchell, & Leaf, 2010);
- Training in SWPBIS (Universal Tier I) has been shown to lead to sustained changes in schools’ internal discipline practices and systems within both urban and rural contexts (Taylor-Greene, Brown, Nelson, Longton, Gassman, & Cohen, 1997; Luiselli, Putnam, Handler, & Feinberg, 2005);
- Significant improvements to school climate have been associated with successful implementation of PBIS (Horner, Sugai, Smolkowski, Eber, Nakasato, Todd, & Esperanza, 2009); and
- Disproportionate discipline outcomes persist in schools implementing SWPBIS (Bradshaw, et al., 2010).

The purpose of this annotated bibliography is to synthesize relevant research and resources on Culturally Responsive Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports (CRPBIS). The
implementation of CRPBIS and its associated outcomes were briefly summarized. To conclude, additional resources on CRPBIS were provided.

References


cultural synchronization. *Kappa Delta Pi Record, 42*, 161-165.


Annotated bibliographies are listed chronologically from the most current publications.

**Cressey, J. (2019). Developing culturally responsive social, emotional, and behavioral supports. Journal of Research in Innovative Teaching & Learning, 12, 53-67.**

- This descriptive, participatory case study takes place in a bilingual Spanish/English elementary school. Data were collected over a three-year period using mixed methods. The author’s objective is providing readers with practical strategies to be implemented in schools to sustain culturally responsive social, emotional, behavior supports.
- Evidenced-based practice included the targeted support systems of Positive Behavior Intervention and Support (PBIS), Social Emotional Learning (SEL) practices and Culturally Responsive Practices (CRP).
• The author reflects on practices, theories, strategies, and challenges of implementing tiered support systems in a large, urban/suburban bilingual school.
• Data include “Check-in, and Check-out questions”, a table providing the results of screening student for at-risk behavior from a third grade classroom, a snapshot of one student’s individual progress displayed in a graph, and a table reporting fidelity measures of tier two scales and subscales.
• This article is relevant to district administrators, school-level administrators, practitioners, and researchers advancing the study and implementation of culturally responsive social emotional behavior supports.


• This study addresses the process of creating Learning Labs (LL) to promote systemic transformation in school discipline procedures in an effort to decrease discipline disproportionality and increase student and family involvement through culturally responsive practices.
• Data reports include Tables representing Learning Lab sessions and participants, Photographic artifacts, Cyclical modeling of systemic transformations, a Frequency graph of LL actions, Questions for interactive groups sessions, scripted modeling of group interaction, narrative, and facilitation.
• CRPBIS researchers, administrators, staff, families, and community stakeholders may find this study beneficial to replicate.


• This article presents data from a randomized controlled trial (RCT) which tested the impact of a coaching approach which utilized the element of Double Check, a cultural responsivity and student engagement model on behavior outcomes as measured by office discipline referrals.
• The RCT included 158 elementary and middle school teachers randomized to receive coaching or serve as comparisons. All participating teachers were exposed to school-wide culturally responsive professional development activities.
• Pre–post non-experimental comparisons indicated improvements in self-reported culturally responsive behavior management and self-efficacy for teachers in both conditions following professional development exposure.
• The findings suggest the potential promise of coaching combined with school-wide professional development for improving classroom management practices and possibly reducing office discipline referrals among Black students.
• This article is recommended to teachers, counselors, and state and local school personnel seeking to develop or improve cultural efficacy and culturally responsive practices.


• This qualitative single-case study of PBIS is a widely implemented, culturally responsive framework using prevention and intervention activities to promote a safe school climate and positive academic and behavioral student outcomes.
• The authors provide a rich description of PBIS implementation in an exemplary urban middle school based on school documents and the voices of several school leaders.
• The study also examined the corresponding role of the school counselor.
• Results included positive school outcomes and the emergence of five themes, including the importance of administrative leadership, proactive PBIS practices, creating consistency, building community, and school counselor integration.


• The purpose of this study included a quantitative multi-method approach, using a teacher self-efficacy survey and classroom observations to determine teachers’ use of culturally responsive teaching practices and the use of proactive PBIS.
• Data were collected from 18 schools and 274 teachers.
• School-wide implementation of proactive and positive behavior management
• Tables include “Standardized Parameter Estimates for Structural Model (N=274)”, “Structural Equation Model Displaying Standardized and Statistically Significant Associations”, and “Descriptive Statistics of Measures and Correlations”.
• This article may be beneficial for researchers, states, and districts seeking research-based practices.

• The authors of this study examined the attainable benefits of a Schoolwide Positive Intervention and Support program for students with profound disabilities.
• Using evidenced-based practices such as defining skills, using time delay for student response, reinforcement and maintenance of skills and the framework of Universal Design for Learning, (UDL), for example posting pictures, photographs, or other representations to symbolize written rules associated with PBIS.
• Three elementary schools participated in the study recruiting special education teachers to modify SWPBIS with culturally relevant lessons which incorporated the use of utilizing student voice or narrative, adding visual representation such as photos or graphs, and adapting lesson plans.
• Students participating in the study showed improvement in the duration of behaviors, or length of time behaviors occurred. Researchers coded behaviors such as physical aggression, verbal or physical disruption and social validity was expressed by teachers implementing the interventions.
• This study would be beneficial to researchers and practitioners looking to improve accessibility of SWPBIS for students with severe disabilities.


• Researchers utilizing the services of two graduate research assistants used electronic databases to compile research studies to review the extant literature between student outcomes and School-wide Positive Behavior Interventions and Supports (SWPBIS).
• The literature was coalesced from 55 studies to deduce number, validity, and kinds of SWPBIS being implemented and significance of the correlation between studies.
• The researchers concluded that the current literature provided a majority of studies which had positive findings citing improved academic and behavioral outcomes for those schools implementing SWPIS.
• School district leaders, school administrative and leadership teams and researchers should find this synthesis advantageous.


• The intent of this study was to provide an opportunity for students with an emotional and behavioral disorder (EBD) to identify characteristics and understanding of school climate in comparison with their peers without disabilities.
A state student health survey was used to gather data. Researchers explored mental health services and school climate and the correlation with victimization for students with EBD and their perceptions regarding school climate.

The setting of the study took place in a southeastern school district in the United States and involved participants from 617 schools.

Conclusions from the study included students with EBD reported experiencing fewer positive perceptions and school climate and an increased rate of mental health issues than their peers without disabilities.

Data highlighted in the article include tables on student demographics and characteristics and variable means.

This article may be relevant to researchers, school districts, mental health providers, and school counselors.


The goal of this qualitative case study was to explore the perceptions of those facilitating, implementing and sustaining Positive Behavior Interventions and Support (PBIS) through the semi-structured focus group of four stakeholders.

Components of PBIS implementation included: the perceptions outcomes of PBIS implementation, productive feedback regarding barriers, other supports needed, and a discussion regarding future implementation of practices.

Data include participant demographics which include a teacher, Guidance Counselor, School Psychologist, and an Assistant Principal and the focus group questions used during the focus group sessions.

Outcomes were outlined and discussed through four basic themes that were discovered. Those who would benefit from this case study include stakeholders and support staff within schools and researchers working to advance the study of culturally responsive PBIS, school climate and increasing student engagement.


This practitioner article provides information on how to implement a related to a CRPBIS Learning Lab and includes a case study that took place in an urban midwestern school district in three K-12 schools and focused on implementation of the CRPBIS Learning Lab. The two main goals were to bring local stakeholders (parents, families, teachers, community representatives and organizations) together as part of a problem solving process and to decrease student discipline referrals and suspensions by reconstructing school discipline practices to become more culturally responsive.
Contributions of this practitioner article include providing steps to form a CRPBIS Learning Lab in Schools. Steps included discussion on how to involve administrators in the process, forming a group, establishing inclusion, and the cycles of change in running the lab.

A case study model of the renovated discipline system at the high school is included detailing the process, proving examples, and steps to creating a culturally responsive system of support through the PBIS system.

Community stakeholders, school level staff, and researchers may potentially benefit from the model and steps for creating and sustaining CRPBIS Learning Labs in schools.


The purpose of this case study focused on a Midwestern, suburban elementary school practicing Culturally Responsive Positive Behavior Supports and Intervention (CRPBIS) and the sustainability of culturally responsive practices used by school counselors over a 5-year period.

Evidenced based practices were used to model culturally responsive practices for staff to enhance their interactions with students. Examples include the school providing training and opportunity for counselors and staff to examine and reflect on their own cultural competence and awareness and the importance of awareness of student cultural backgrounds to increase positive interactions with families and students.

The authors provide a detailed diagram demonstrating the interactions of cultural equity, validity, relevance and validation, knowledge and self-awareness. A chart of CRPBIS categories is also provided with examples and strategies for implementation. A graph of student discipline disproportionality highlighting office discipline referrals, OCRs is followed by a discussion on the validity and implications for the case study.

This article is recommended for guidance counselors, school support staff, and teachers desiring to implement CRPBIS in schools.


This field guide provides the framework of SWPBIS by aligning the core tenets with culturally responsive practices.

Cultural responsiveness includes (a) having high expectations for all students, (b) using students’ cultures and experiences to enhance learning, and (c) providing students with
and without disabilities access to adequate resources and effective instruction within the SWPBIS framework.

- Section I of the field guide is an identity awareness unit focusing on how practitioners and students’ identities affect the school culture. Section II is a resource for embedding cultural responsiveness into SWPBIS implementation.
- The field guide also provides appendices which include a glossary, lesson plans, and activities.
- This guide would benefit schools and school-based personnel in developing or enhancing their culturally responsive SWPBIS.


- The goal of this paper is to provide an overview of behavior interventions and support framed within culturally responsive practices. It seeks to bring attention to international, national and local policy-level stakeholders by describing sustainable attributes of Culturally Responsive Positive Behavior Interventions and Support (CRPBIS).
- A PBIS literature review is included which focuses on culturally responsive practices. A theoretical discussion follows targeting the main components of practice. These dispositions cover the main goals of providing cultural competence training and professional development within schools; confronting the office discipline referral, ODR, discipline disparity, and including nondominant communities and students when setting school expectations and implementing PBIS.
- Data include diagrams of \textit{Cultures in Schools and School Cultures} (p. 10), The cyclical representation of \textit{Systemic Transformation and Expansive Learning Cycle} (p.13), \textit{Constellation of activity systems with a shared object} (p. 15) and a figure representing \textit{Historical Evaluation of PBIS} (p. 24).
- The author reaches out to stakeholders and policy-makers who control and influence practices in schools to reduce discipline disparity through the implementation of CRPBIS


- The purpose of this paper was to provide a description of CRPBIS and combine it with cultural and linguistic variables to enrich interactions and behavior of culturally and linguistically diverse (CLD) students.
- Culturally responsive practices were emphasized, such as enhancing effective teaching practices, increasing staff members cultural knowledge and self-awareness, validating of other cultures, and increasing cultural awareness.
• The article also focuses on interventions, including culturally responsible effective teaching practices, problem resolution, and modeling practices to promote relationships.
• Whole school staff, teachers, administration may benefit from these principles to increase awareness on student behavior and background to help decrease behavior and special education referrals.


• A narration of the experience of a novice classroom teacher who collaborates with an experienced special education teacher to reduce subtle assumptions filled with cultural bias which playout in the classroom is showcased.
• This article reveals important implications for managing student behavior in more productive and culturally appropriate ways.
• CRPBIS is defined and the basic tenets were discussed.
• Interactions with students and families as well as home-school collaboration were discussed along with curriculum and instruction strategies.
• The article includes a checklist for CRPBIS areas for middle school teachers which include teacher attitudes/beliefs, interactions, home/school collaboration, curriculum, instruction, and management systems.
• This is a resource for practitioners and could be modified for elementary and secondary students and classrooms.


• This discussion paper includes the PBIS framework and provides a brief overview of the tiered system of support.
• Use of mindfulness-based practices, theoretical applications, and practices were discussed, such as, student self-acceptance and self-esteem and sociocultural differences between school administration and school student body.
• Examples were provided for what the inclusion of wraparound mental health services might look like modeled for each tier of support.
• School administration and school district personnel may find this discussion useful when considering providing a cultural shift in PBIS practices.

schoolwide positive behavioral supports. *Remedial and Special Education, 35* (6), 327-339.

- SWPBIS addressing racial disproportionality for students served under the Individuals with Disabilities Act (IDEA, 2004) were highlighted in this article.
- It recommends that culturally responsive practices should be included in PBIS and provides examples of implementation, for instance, enhancing school staff’s cultural competency and self-awareness and validating ethnic and cultural groups that were different than their own.
- Researchers used formative intervention methodology which is outlined as having five principles: collective activity system, systemic redesign, design of new systems, expansive learning actions, and cycles of expansive learning.
- This qualitative case study describes how the Learning Lab was designed by stakeholders developing their own culturally responsive behavior support system.
- Results include the use of cultural re-mediation from individual acts toward collective agency.
- This study could be beneficial to practitioners, administrators, school districts, and researchers to address disproportionality in school discipline.


- The aim of this exploratory study was to examine the disproportionality in office discipline referrals (ODR) of Aboriginal students in schools practicing Positive Behavior Intervention and Supports (PBIS) as compared to non-aboriginal students. The study took place in five elementary and middle schools in rural British Columbia and Alberta and participant n = (1,750) students.
- The five schools in the study had been participating in the PBIS program ranging from 2-10 years due to the high ODRs in the district. Data were collected through archival extraction of discipline data and feedback from district and school administrators.
- Researcher’s discussion includes possible reasons the hypothesis was not supported. Explanations include the use of culturally responsive practices which included: the creation of positive school culture when implementing the PBIS program; increased practitioner cultural awareness of the Aboriginal community and students; and additional support to the population of students.
- The study would be beneficial for researchers pursuing advancing the field of culturally responsive PBIS, school districts and teachers.


- The author of this article argues for improvement and renovation of the discipline systems in school districts and breaks the system down into discipline systems as nets of social control. This article contributes to the dialogue and research showing the need for
Culturally Responsive Positive Behavior Intervention and Support (CRPBIS) by calling for policy change, relationship building and cultural attentiveness in school practices.

- Figures include a graphic of the levels of school discipline nets, defining each and providing examples. Several other figures compare the nets and provide visuals for how these nets widen and deepen.
- The school discipline network uses a social constructionist heuristic frame and the author goes into detailed discussion and provides data that students of color, even in schools which provide PBIS and calls for the creation of CRPBIS in schools.
- The author mentions that this article is for administrators, teachers, school support staff and researchers.


- Authors of this descriptive case study of Positive Behavior and Intervention Support (PBIS) report on the culturally responsive practices used in PBIS implementation in a high school in a territory in the Northwest.
- An explanation of the cultural values of indigenous students and the cultural disassociation expectations of school administrators were emphasized as causal challenges in explaining cultural disconnects within the school.
- Cultural responsiveness is defined and attributes of social value, attitudes and expectations of indigenous elders, community, socialization and communication were explored and embedded in PBIS practices and implementation within the school.
- Data is displayed in a graph highlighting the sustained decline of indigenous students over a nine year period. Culturally relevant PBIS contributed to this disciple decrease in the indigenous students.
- School districts, Administrators, Practitioners and researchers would be interested in this descriptive study.


- The aim of this article is to explore School-Wide Positive Behavior Support (SWPBIS) within a cultural context.
- Researchers describe a contextual perspective on culture founded upon the principles of behavior theory and analysis.
- Cultural definitions and disciplines were provided and examples of each were given.
- Adopting Behavior Analytic terms, definitions and principles were displayed within a cultural context and examples of each were provided.
• An overview of OSEP Center on PBIS Implementation Blueprint is referenced displaying the phases of practice implementation.
• A Table with “SWPBS Elements and Suggestions for Enhancing Contextual and Cultural Relevance” highlights Elements and Suggestions for Practice.
• This article is written for multiple audiences which include practitioners, researchers, and policy makers.


• The goal of this study was to reduce discipline referrals for culturally and linguistically diverse (CLD) students while examining school-wide behavior support (SWPBS).
• SWPBS is defined and basic principles were discussed, such as, importance of positive school expectations and procedures, proactive teaching, allocation of resources.
• Universal support is outlined with interventions, support and implementations.
• The study calls for further research to include a larger sample which would include Native American and Asian American students.
• Researchers, administrators, and practitioners will benefit from this article to aid in supporting students from varying racial-ethnic backgrounds.


• SWPBS and culturally responsive practices (CRP) were outlined in this paper.
• Discussion of the four features of SWPBS include data driven decision making, evidence based behavior support, schoolwide evidence based delivery of support, and social and academic outcomes valued by all stakeholders.
• Culturally responsive educational practices were highlighted including, enhancing staff members’ cultural knowledge, and cultural self-awareness, validating others’ culture, increasing cultural relevance, establishing cultural validity, and emphasizing cultural equity.
• An overview of a school district’s activities to blend SWPBS and CRP were designated in a table for ease of navigation and reference. The table includes examples of outcomes, systems, data, and practices implemented over a one-four year span with future plans included.
• This article could benefit practitioners and staff, school and district personnel, and researchers.

Vincent, C. G., & Tobin, T. J. (2011). The relationship between implementation of school-wide positive behavior support (SWPBS) and disciplinary exclusion of students from various...

- This study examined data from 77 schools implementing school-wide positive behavior support (SWPBS) and the extent to which students from diverse ethnic groups were represented in the data.
- SWPBS is defined and indicators were outlined, for instance, overall school climate, expectations and definitions and examples of appropriate behavior, and consistent consequences.
- The researchers used existing data from office discipline referrals (ODR) with the intention of examining the correlation between ODR and student ethnicity and disability status to construct a database.
- Discussion of study analysis includes five figures displaying demographic student information.
- Researchers, school district personnel and school-based administration should find this article advantageous for arguing for SWPBS programs in schools.


- The design of this article focuses on four Positive Behavior Supports (PBS) which incorporate culturally responsive practices which include: contextual fit, relevant outcomes, assessment and collaboration with partners.
- A table contrasting Chinese cultural values and Anglo European PBS values lists the four tenets of collaborative partnership, functional assessment, contextual fit, and meaningful lifestyle outcomes.
- A diagram highlighting tips for professionals who work with culturally diverse students and families provides three steps for PBS process: steps to take prior to beginning the PBS process, conducting functional assessments, and implementation and steps for sustaining PBS.
- Research and practice recommendations were included in the discussion and conclusion.


- This article explores the student discipline disproportionality in culturally and linguistically diverse (CLD) students and the effect on families and the implementation
of Positive Behavior Support (PBS) and proactive strategies for minimizing behavioral issues in multicultural urban youth.

- Data include national trends in discipline disproportionality, a comparison of African American and European American cultural influence in 4 categories which include: behavior/mannerisms, styles of communication, styles of socialization and interaction, and eye contact.
- Tables were also displayed to compare culturally influenced social behavior of Asian American, Hispanic, and culturally influenced social behaviors of Native American children.
- A practical and ready to utilize chart of strategies for implementation is also found within the article which could be used by stakeholders including policy makers, researchers and school personnel.

Additional Resources

- PBIS Cultural Responsiveness Field Guide: Resources for Trainers and Coaches
  
  Website:
  https://www.pbis.org/Common/Cms/files/pbisresources/PBIS%20Cultural%20Responsiveness%20Field%20Guide.pdf

- The Role of Leadership and Culture in PBIS Implementation
  
  Website:
  https://www.pbis.org/topics/districtstate-pbis

- Culturally Responsive PBIS in Action: Examples and Strategies
  
  Website:
  https://www.pbis.org/resource-type/examples

- Culturally Responsive SWPBIS Self-Assessment Tool
  
  Website:
  https://www.pbis.org/resource-type/assessments
This document was developed by the National Technical Assistance Center on Transition (NTACT), Charlotte, NC, funded by Cooperative Agreement Number H326E140004 with the U.S. Department of Education, Office of Special Education and Rehabilitative Services (OSERS). Opinions expressed herein do not necessarily reflect the position or policy of the U.S. Department of Education nor does mention of trade names, commercial products, or organizations imply endorsement by the U.S. Department of Education. OSEP Project Officer: Dr. Selete Awoke. RSA Project Officer: Kristen Rhinehart-Fernandez. This product is public domain. Authorization to reproduce it in whole or in part is granted. While permission to reprint this publication is not necessary, the citation should be: