



A Solution-Finding Report

Title: *Technology to Create a Positive Learning Environment for Diverse Students*

Date: November 17, 2017

Compiled by: Robert Sullivan, CIL Senior Editor

This Solution-finding Report provides information, requested by Anushka Shirali with the Northeast Comprehensive Center | RMC Research, on behalf of New York State, for resources on research-based best practices and instructional strategies so the districts that wish to use technology to create a positive learning environment for their diverse students can receive needed assistance. New York State's Office of Educational Design & Technology would like to foster best practices state-wide using technology, by building digital resources, instructional models, strategic planning documents, stakeholder engagement resources, etc., to help districts utilize technology to support culturally- and linguistically-responsive learning environments.

The list of resources is divided up into four categories. The first is **Technology to Create a Positive Learning Environment for Diverse Students**, where diversity and technology are directly linked. The remaining three categories have been compiled so that districts can make them available online for educators to read or download, since computer availability of these resources is a form of technology. If districts were to make the links available to educators in a database, they might go a long way toward resolving or helping with some of the problems educators meet in creating a positive learning environment for diverse students. The three categories are: **Culturally-Responsive Learning Environments**, **Linguistically-Responsive Learning Environments**, and **Culturally- and Linguistically-Responsive Learning Environments**.

Solution-finding Reports are intended to provide a quick response to the request for information; they are not intended to be a definitive literature survey or synthesis of the topic.

Table of Contents

Technology to Create a Positive Learning Environment for Diverse Students	3
Culturally-Responsive Learning Environments.....	19
Linguistically-Responsive Learning Environments.....	29
Culturally- and Linguistically-Responsive Learning Environments	32

TECHNOLOGY TO CREATE A POSITIVE LEARNING ENVIRONMENT FOR DIVERSE STUDENTS

Beerer, K. (2017). Building Culturally Responsive Classrooms with Digital Content. Federal Way, WA: Getting Smart.

<http://www.gettingsmart.com/2017/02/culturally-responsive-classrooms-digital-content/>

This article deals with meeting the needs of increasingly diverse groups of learners. It says more and more educators are turning to a culturally responsive teaching framework for actionable strategies to address needs of diverse learners within the classroom. It says Gary Howard's work in outlining principles of culturally responsive teaching is one of the frameworks at the forefront of this effort. His research calls for: Ensuring the learning environment is physically and culturally inviting; Accommodating the differences in learners through student-centered instruction; Stressing collectivity of interactions as well as individuality; and Affirming students through cultural connections, particularly in relationship to the curriculum.

Catterick, D. (2008). Do the Philosophical Foundations of Online Learning Disadvantage Non-Western Students? In A. Edmundson (Ed.), *Globalized E-Learning Cultural Challenges* (pp. 116–129). Hershey, PA: Idea Group Inc.

<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/7bb9/ab32adf043b2a8214be4dcd4af480bf62f39.pdf>

A product of its historical origins, online learning is firmly rooted in the educational values that dominate post-secondary education in Britain, Australasia, and North America. With the increasing numbers of international students studying degree programs online, this chapter asks whether students from diverse educational cultures are disadvantaged in their learning by the teaching approaches implemented within online teaching environments. Active learning, reflective practice, and collaborative learning are all based on a cognitive, constructivist tradition, one which is evidently not shared by much of the rest of the world. Employing evidence from the field of cross-cultural psychology and taking Chinese students as an example, the author suggests that there may be some cause for concern within online instructional practices. The chapter concludes with three possible responses to the issue, two of which might go some way towards ensuring that international students find themselves on a more even playing field in their online degree program of study.

Deng, L., Chen, Y.-H., & Li, S. C. (2017). Supporting Cross-Cultural Online Discussion with Formal and Informal Platforms: A Case between Hong Kong and Taiwan. *Research and Practice in Technology Enhanced Learning*, 12(5), 1–15.

<https://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1186%2Fs41039-017-0050-z.pdf>

This paper reports on a collaborative project on fostering cross-cultural online discussion between two universities with one in Hong Kong and the other in Taiwan. Two online platforms—Moodle as a formal channel for course-related discussion and Facebook as an informal channel for social-oriented interaction—were employed. The study pays special attention to instructional design based on research-derived strategies and reflects on the effects of various strategies as well as students' experiences and perceptions. The results show that the students perceived the online discussion as valuable for exchanging perspectives and enhancing cross-cultural understanding. However, they were less motivated to use Facebook as the informal channel for socialization. The challenges encountered, especially those concerning using Facebook in formal learning environments, are discussed. The paper ends with recommendations for better utilizing and bringing together formal and informal online platforms.

Dyson, L. E. (2007). Constructing Shared Online Learning Environments for Indigenous Cultural Inclusiveness. Ultimo, New South Wales: University of Technology, Sydney.

<https://opus.lib.uts.edu.au/bitstream/10453/7486/1/2003001664.pdf>

The Faculty of Information Technology at the University Technology, Sydney has begun a project to improve the participation of Indigenous Australians in the Information Technology sector. As Indigenous students begin to move into computer studies, issues arise of how to provide them with an online learning environment which is culturally inclusive. A major challenge lies in the fact that this new cohort must share online learning with other students from diverse cultural backgrounds. A review of several studies of Indigenous distance education reveals that online technology must satisfy certain conditions to be effective, including flexibility, interactivity, minimal text, and cultural appropriateness. Generally, this Indigenous experience agrees with theories of culturally inclusive educational technology design. However, there remain issues of cultural specificity of certain aspects of screen design which cannot be ignored. A model for constructing an online learning environment is proposed consisting of a shared domain, included in which is an Indigenous-specific virtual space and optional customization for individual learners.

Dyson, L. E. (2007). Design for a Culturally Affirming Indigenous Computer Literacy Course. In A. Williamson, C. Gunn, A. Young, & T. Clear (Eds.), *Winds of Change in the Sea of Learning: Proceedings of the 19th Annual Conference of the Australasian Society for Computers in Learning in Tertiary Education* (pp. 185-194). Melbourne, Australia.

<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/3458/5a9d3d77adfccac0e99eb650b95dfadb5c87.pdf>

This paper formulates a design for the proposed computer literacy module of the Pre-IT course. Principles in the design will then be applied to other modules and future courses delivered to Indigenous students. The challenge in the design and implementation of any course for Indigenous students is how to make the course engaging and empowering for them. Despite improvements in Indigenous university education, the rate of students failing to complete courses remains unacceptably high. A range of factors has been pinpointed, but an important one that recurs in the research literature is the assimilationist nature of much university education. If a computer literacy course is to be successful, it must be culturally affirming and appropriate to Indigenous students' interests, perspectives, values, learning styles, and identity. The first part of the paper briefly presents evidence for low levels of computer literacy amongst Indigenous university students and the need for a computer literacy course. Then the issue of assimilation and tertiary education is examined. This is followed by an analysis of Aboriginal learning styles theory, which has been the dominant theory of Indigenous education in Australia since the 1980s, and the application of this theory to computer education. In conclusion the design for a culturally affirming computer literacy course is presented based on Indigenous learning styles but also taking into account the needs of individual students.

Edmundson, A. (2007). Decreasing Cultural Disparity in Educational ICTs: Tools and Recommendations. *Turkish Online Journal of Distance Education*, 4(3). 1–23.

<http://dergipark.ulakbim.gov.tr/tojde/article/view/5000102991/5000096086>

The purpose of this article is to help educational planners decrease cultural disparities in educational information and communication technologies (ICTs), especially in those being introduced into lesser-developed countries. The author begins by reviewing assessment techniques that have been used by educational and development professions. Then, based on the results of cross-cultural research in educational anthropology and educational technology, the author creates and pilot tests a questionnaire used to assess cultural differences between learners in two different countries. Based on the results of the pilot study and further research, the author revises the questionnaire. The revised online questionnaire will be utilized in the author's dissertation research and is available for other researchers to test as an assessment tool for educational ICTs.

Eglash, R., Gilbert, J. E., Taylor, V., & Geier, S. R. (2013). Culturally Responsive Computing in Urban, After-School Contexts: Two Approaches. *Urban Education*, 48(5), 629–656.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/0042085913499211>

The academic performance and engagement of youth from under-represented ethnic groups (African American, Latino, and Indigenous) in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM) show statistically large gaps in comparison with their White and Asian peers. Some of these differences can be attributed to the direct impact of economic forces. But cultural factors also play a role. This essay examines two culturally responsive math education technologies and report on evaluations of the technologies in urban out-of-school settings that suggest both approaches can be effective for integrating math education into urban, after-school contexts.

Heitner, K. L., & Jennings, M. (2016). Culturally Responsive Teaching Knowledge and Practices of Online Faculty. *Online Learning*, 20(4), 54–78.

<http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1124634.pdf>

Cultural differences between faculty and their students can create important challenges that affect the quality and efficacy of online teaching and learning. The objectives of this study were to: (a) create and pilot test an assessment for online faculty to measure culturally responsive teaching knowledge (CRT) and culturally responsive educational practices (CREP) in teaching and advising students of color, military students, LGBTQ students, religious minority students, and international students; (b) describe participants' CRT knowledge, value, and CREP; and (c) examine differences between their knowledge and their practices.

Henderson, L. (2014). Reeves' Pedagogic Model of Interactive Learning Systems and Cultural Contextuality. In C. McBeath & R. Atkinson (Eds.), *Proceedings of the Second International Interactive Multimedia Symposium* (189–198). Perth, Western Australia: Promaco Conventions.

<http://www.ascilite.org/conferences/aset-archives/confs/iims/1994/hj/henderson.html>

Although much of the literature on interactive multimedia continues to be an objectivist recipe on how to manipulate interactive multimedia (IMM) software and present it in stipulated ways, research is increasingly focused on using IMM for enhanced learning outcomes. For this reason, Reeves' (1992) work is important. The pedagogic model of interactive learning systems offers instructional designers 14 pedagogic dimensions for consideration when developing IMM and other interactive learning systems (ILS). However, cultural contextuality is invisible, although it may be seen as subsumed within most dimensions. The paper argues that instructional design is about the formation of cultural identity, that it is socially and culturally constructed. Minority cultures add further dimensions to the paradigm. In terms of instructional design, consideration of cultural contextuality as a variable of consequence means that variability and flexibility will be obvious features of the IMM package in order to promote effective learning.

Ilgaz, H., Mazman, S. G., & Altun, A. (2015). A Cross Cultural Perspective on Information Communication Technologies Learning Survey. *Technology, Knowledge and Learning*, 20(2), 159–168.

http://members.aect.org/publications/iTech/iTECH_DIGEST_v5n4.pdf

Information behavior has been at the core of researchers' interest for a long time. According to researchers, attention in the field of information research has shifted over the years from a dominant interest in the use of channels and sources to an emphasis on the encountering and seeking of information and the interpretation of meaning from that information. However, measuring this disposition to seek and its related skills is a challenge. In this study, the "Information Seeking Strategies Scale" was adapted to the Turkish language. Recommendations are discussed.

Kim, G. M. (2016). Transcultural Digital Literacies: Cross-Border Connections and Self-Representations in an Online Forum. *Reading Research Quarterly*, 51(2), 199–219.

<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/rrq.131/full>

Research on multicultural learning has focused on formal and local settings, such as schools, but young people are interacting with, and therefore learning from, informal settings and nonlocal contexts, including online platforms. That is, multicultural education is no longer limited to formal institutions, local contexts, or the printed word. Young people consume new media texts produced by geographically distant places but also compose their own multimodal texts around these media. Transcultural digital literacies refer to this phenomenon as using new technological affordances to learn, imagine, and create knowledge that traverses national boundaries and conventional cultural borders. To illustrate transcultural digital literacy practices, this study analyzes youths' engagements with digitally mediated texts to construct cross-border connections and self-representations.

Lal, V. (2002). Cultural Difference and Its Influence on Learning with Computer-Based Technologies in Schools. State College, PA: CiteSeerX, Pennsylvania State University.

<http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.122.2843&rep=rep1&type=pdf>

This paper focuses on how learner's cultural backgrounds influence learning with computer-based technologies. It begins by noting the lack of research in this area and then looks at the importance of understanding the cultural backgrounds of learners in designing computer-based learning experiences for them. After this it reviews the current debates, research, and thinking in the literature relating to cultural differences and learning with computer-based technologies. This paper also highlights the different nature of computer-based learning environments of public schools in New South Wales, Australia and the need for future research to address such learning contexts and the differences, which abound within them.

Larsen, N., Bruselius-Jensen, M., Danielsen, D., Nyamai, R., Otiende, J., & Aagaard-Hansen, J. (2014). ICT-Based, Cross-Cultural Communication: A Methodological Perspective. *International Journal of Education and Development using Information and Communication Technology*, 10(1), 107–120.

<http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1071199.pdf>

This article discusses how cross-cultural communication based on information and communication technologies (ICT) may be used in participatory health promotion as well as in education in general. The analysis draws on experiences from a health education research project with Grade 6 pupils in Nairobi, Kenya, and Copenhagen, Denmark, addressing the topic of physical activity in everyday life. The article outlines a sequence of educational events (the Cross-Cultural Communication [3C] model) comprising exchange of letters, recording and exchange of films, and Skype communication sessions interchanging with reflection sessions in the classes. The educational rationale for using cross-cultural communication is that meeting the unfamiliar (different children, cultures, schools and contexts) leads to curiosity and reflection about one's own situation, and subsequently that reflectivity builds action competence. In the present case study, 3C was used as a means of health promotion, but the approach may be used in relation to almost any topic. The 3C model is discussed in relation to theories of co-learning, knowledge guiding and sharing and genuine participation. The article discusses methodological potentials and challenges.

Li, N., & Kirkup, G. (2007). Gender and Cultural Differences in Internet Use: A Study of China and the UK. *Computers and Education*, 48(2), 301–317.

http://tpub.scu.edu.tw/scutwebpub/website/DocUpload/CourseTeaching/cyc20078393742_2.pdf

This study investigates differences in use of, and attitudes toward, the Internet and computers generally for Chinese and British students, and gender differences in this cross-cultural context. Two hundred and twenty Chinese and 245 British students' responses to a self-report survey questionnaire are discussed. Significant differences were found in Internet experience, attitudes, usage, and self-confidence between Chinese and British students. British students were more likely to use computers for study purposes than Chinese students, but Chinese students were more self-confident about their advanced computer skills. Significant gender differences were also found in both national groups.

McLoughlin, C. (1995). Assessment of Writing in Multicultural Settings. In L. Summers (Ed), *A Focus on Learning: Proceedings of the 4th Annual Teaching Learning Forum* (pp. 165–171). Perth, Australia: Edith Cowan University.

<http://clt.curtin.edu.au/events/conferences/tlf/tlf1995/mcloughlin.html>

Assessment in education has many purposes, the most important of which is to encourage students to learn. Surface approaches to learning (memorization rather than deeper understanding) are adopted by students when study demands are excessive and students are under pressure. There is thus a conflict between the summative objectives of assessment, selecting, grading, and maintaining standards, and the formative role of encouraging learning. In a multicultural learning context, as characterized in tertiary learning contexts, the formative role of assessment procedures is critical in developing self-directed learning strategies. Assessment strategies should therefore promote and match these higher order cognitive activities. Assessment then, should form an integral part of the learning process. It is also a way of helping students to learn more effectively. In this article, several strategies are presented which aim to enhance the quality of student writing, by considering the different perceptions students may have of essays and the influences that cultures exert on writing patterns.

McLoughlin, C. (1999). Culturally Inclusive Learning on the Web. In K. Marline, N. Stanley, & N. Davison, N. (Eds.), *Teaching in the Disciplines/Learning in Context: Proceedings of the 8th Annual Teaching*. (pp. 272–277). Perth, Australia: University of Western Australia.

<http://clt.curtin.edu.au/events/conferences/tlf/tlf1999/mcloughlin.html>

In tertiary contexts, Web-based instruction may be tailored to the needs of a particular cultural group, and recognize the specific learning needs, preferences and styles of learners. At a time when open learning markets are very competitive, many WWW sites are developed with an international audience in mind. The internationalization of education has led to the development of two distinct types of WWW sites: those made for one particular context and culture, but visited by a global audience; and those made specifically for cross-cultural participation. An investigation of these sites reveals many different learning features and instructional design paradigms. Sites aiming for cross cultural participation and seeking a bridge to multiculturalism need to take certain design features into consideration, and utilize culturally appropriate forms of instructional design (ID). A critique of current ID approaches shows that many lack the depth and scope to enable them to provide culturally inclusive learning. At the same time, WWW sites that aim for cultural portability of courseware need to adopt cross-cultural design features that ensure access by culturally diverse learners. The contrasting orientations and pedagogic features of culture-specific as opposed to cross-cultural sites are discussed and the implications for design are considered.

McLoughlin, C. (2001). Inclusivity and Alignment: Principles of Pedagogy, Task and Assessment Design for Effective Cross-Cultural Online Learning. *Distance Education*, 22(1), 7–29.

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/0158791010220102>

This paper offers a framework for culturally inclusive pedagogy that can be applied to online environments. It proposes a theoretically grounded framework linking culturally inclusive learning with curriculum and assessment design, using the principle of constructive alignment so that instruction is flexible and relevant to students from a diverse range of cultural and language backgrounds.

McLoughlin, C. (2010). Learner Support in Distance and Networked Learning Environments: Ten Dimensions for Successful Design. *Distance Education*, 23(2), 149–162.

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/0158791022000009178>

How do educators and instructional designers assess the effectiveness of the learning environments they design? One important means of ensuring the effectiveness of instruction in distance and face-to-face settings is through provision of learner support. Increasingly, as learners utilize the World Wide Web for collaborative learning, support systems contribute to the processes of learning and assist the learner in developing competencies and confidence in self-regulated learning and social interaction. Originating in the socio-cultural perspective of Vygotskian theory, the term scaffolding refers to learning support based on social constructivist models of learning. As the World Wide Web becomes increasingly integrated into the delivery of learning experiences at primary, tertiary, and secondary levels, the concept of scaffolding needs to be reconsidered because it is not readily translated into contexts where the teacher is not present, such as in online learning environments. The aim of this paper is to offer a conceptualization of the term scaffolding in distance learning, to provide examples of how learners can be supported in the processes of constructivist inquiry in a range of learning settings, and to offer principles for the design of learning support that can be applied across a range of instructional settings.

McLoughlin, C., & Lee, M. J. W. (2000). Mapping the Digital Terrain: New Media and Social Software as Catalysts for Pedagogical Change. In R. Atkinson, & C. McBeath (Eds.), *Hello! Where Are You in the Landscape of Educational Technology?* (pp. 641–652). Geelong, Victoria, Australia: Deakin University.

<http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.516.1134&rep=rep1&type=pdf>

In the emerging digital landscape of the Web 2.0 era, where social software tools like blogs, wikis, and podcasts provide instant connectivity, promises of engagement, and community building, there is a need to rethink models for teaching and learning. In this paper, the authors argue that outmoded didactic models, which place emphasis on the delivery of information by an instructor and/or from a textbook, may need to be replaced in order for student-centered learning to come to fruition. Currently, e-learning pedagogies at universities and colleges appear to be fueled largely by learning management systems (LMSs) that replicate these traditional paradigms in an online setting. They conform to a “student-as-information consumer” model, thereby reinforcing instructor-centered approaches to teaching, learning and knowledge, as opposed to being conducive to constructivist modes of learning that enable a high degree of learner self-direction and personalization.

McLoughlin, C., & Lee, M. J. W. (2000). Using Web and Problem-Based Learning Environments to Support the Development of Key Skills. In J. Winn (Ed.), *ASCILITE '99 – Responding to Diversity: Proceedings of the 16th Annual Conference of the Australian Society for Computers in Learning in Tertiary Education* (pp. 249–256). Brisbane, Australia: Queensland University of Technology.

<http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.305.555&rep=rep1&type=pdf>

This paper reports on a project in which the development of key skills among university students was considered in the context of a problem-based learning environment delivered online. The results suggest that such learning environments provide many opportunities for students to develop key skills and there is great prospect in further exploring these opportunities and outcomes.

McLoughlin, C., & Lee, M. J. W. (2007). Social software and participatory learning: Pedagogical choices with technology affordances in the Web 2.0 era. In *Proceedings of ASCILITE – Australian Society for Computers in Learning in Tertiary Education Annual Conference 2007* (pp. 664–675). Tugun, Queensland, Australia: Australasian Society for Computers in Learning in Tertiary Education.

http://researchbank.acu.edu.au/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=3049&context=fea_pub

The two-way Web has arrived, accompanied by a raft of affordances that expand how we teach, communicate, learn and create knowledge. New trends are emerging in the way information is distributed and consumed. Emerging “Web 2.0” services such as blogs, wikis and social bookmarking applications, as well as social networking sites like MySpace, Friendster and Facebook, are seen as more social and personal, and based on “microcontent” – i.e., digital content in small fragments that may be combined and recombined by individuals to produce new patterns, images and interpretations. This paper investigates the affordances of Web 2.0 and social software and the choices and constraints they offer to tertiary teachers and learners. A discussion of emerging pedagogical models is presented to demonstrate that we now have access to an enabling suite of tools to support greater learner choice and self-direction.

McLoughlin, C., & Lee, M. J. W. (2010). Personalised and Self Regulated Learning in the Web 2.0 Era: International Exemplars of Innovative Pedagogy Using Social Software. *Australasian Journal of Educational Technology*, 26(1), 28–43.

<https://ajet.org.au/index.php/AJET/article/viewFile/1100/355>

Research findings in recent years provide compelling evidence of the importance of encouraging student control over the learning process as a whole. The socially based tools and technologies of the Web 2.0 movement are capable of supporting informal conversation, reflexive dialogue, and collaborative content generation, enabling access to a wide raft of ideas and representations. Used appropriately, these tools can shift control to the learner, through promoting learner agency, autonomy, and engagement in social networks that straddle multiple real and virtual learning spaces independent of physical, geographic, institutional, and organizational boundaries. As argued in this article, however, in order for self-regulated learning to come to fruition, students need not only to be able to choose and personalize what tools and content are available, but also to have access to the necessary scaffolding to support their learning. Emerging practices with social computing technologies, a number of examples of which are showcased in this article, signal the need for pedagogies that are more personal, social, and participatory. The authors conclude with a discussion of some of the key implications for practice, including an outline of the current challenges faced by tertiary educators.

McLoughlin, C., & Luca, J. (2001). Quality in Online Delivery: What Does It Mean for Assessment in E-Learning Environments? In *Proceedings of the 18th Annual Conference of the Australasian Society for Computers in Learning in Tertiary Education: Meeting at the Crossroads* (pp. 417-426). Melbourne, Australia.

<http://ro.ecu.edu.au/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=5840&context=ecuwor>

While a great deal has been written on the advantages and benefits of online teaching, and research continues to proliferate, many practitioners are seeking guidelines that can be applied to the design of assessment in online environments. The last decade has seen the convergence of traditional distance education with on-campus modes of delivery and work-based training signaling new models of flexible delivery. In addition, demand-driven education accentuates the learner's role and needs, while the teacher has become a manager, mediator, and motivator of student learning. Issues raised by national and international bodies and quality assurance agencies now seem to be addressing the same questions. How can a teaching and learning process that differs so markedly from what has been practiced for hundreds of years maintain and support quality? Who will be the guardians of quality and the innovators of learning and assessment design? This paper addresses current definitions of quality in online assessment and examines emerging expectations of what constitutes appropriate online assessment. A case study is presented of a World Wide Web-based assessment framework that is both interactive and product-oriented and involves learners in making contributions to course resources through learning activities. It is proposed that an interactive participatory model of assessment utilizes the communicative features of technology while affording a motivating and authentic assessment experience.

McLoughlin, C., & Marshall, L. (2000). Scaffolding: A Model for Learner Support in an Online Teaching Environment. In A. Herrmann and M. M. Kulski (Eds.), *Flexible Futures in Tertiary Teaching. Proceedings of the 9th Annual Teaching Learning Forum*, February 2–4, 2000. Perth, Australia: Curtin University of Technology.

<https://clt.curtin.edu.au/events/conferences/tlf/tlf2000/mcloughlin2.html>

When students are introduced to online learning, they are faced with a new learning environment and the expectation that they will have independent learning skills and the capacity to engage in activities that require self-direction and self-management of learning. While universities are now fostering lifelong learning skills and preparation for the workplace, the cultivation of these skills is now core business at tertiary institutions across Australia. The learning opportunities of Web-based instruction are enormous. Students can select and employ resources, employ strategies, and assess their overall progress. Yet, how do students respond to such environments? Are they capable of maximizing the learning potential of the Web, developing metacognitive awareness, identifying learning needs, and revising plans and actions?

McLoughlin, C., & Oliver, R. (2000). Designing Learning Environments for Cultural Inclusivity: A Case Study of Indigenous Online Learning at Tertiary Level. *Australian Journal of Educational Technology*, 16(1), 58–72.

<http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.880.1215&rep=rep1&type=pdf>

This article considers cultural diversity in Web design and traces the design processes involved in the development of an online learning environment for indigenous Australian learners entering university. Highlights include culture, constructivist learning, and situated cognition; cultural pluralism in instructional design; and ten design principles for culturally inclusive instructional design.

McLoughlin, C., & Oliver, R. (2000). Instructional Design for Cultural Difference: A Case Study of the Indigenous Online Learning in a Tertiary Context. *Australian Journal of Educational Technology*, 16(1), 58–72.

<http://www.ascilite.org/conferences/brisbane99/papers/mcloughlinoliver.pdf>

In this paper, the authors trace the design processes involved in the development of an on-line unit for Indigenous Australian learners preparing to enter university, and account for the cultural issues that impacted on creation of learning tasks and styles of communication. The paper argues for cultural localization, which means incorporating the values, styles of learning, and cognitive preferences of the target population. It also means going beyond surface-level design considerations to achieve a meaningful constructivist learning environment. It is recommended that, when creating WWW-based course support sites for maximum flexibility, systematic attention must be given to particular design guidelines, which include cultural contextualization.

Miller, A. (2011). *Culturally Responsive Online Teaching*. Alexandria, VA: The Whole Child, Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.

<http://www.wholechilddeducation.org/blog/culturally-responsive-online-teaching>

This article asks, “So what is culturally responsive online teaching? Culturally responsive online teachers identify and take advantage of cultural strengths and resiliencies through aligned online teaching best practices, while using diverse discourse structures and curriculum. These resiliencies vary across culture and experience.”

Morong, G., & DesBiens, D. (2016). Culturally Responsive Online Design: Learning at Intercultural Intersections. *Intercultural Education*, 27(5), 474–492.

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/14675986.2016.1240901?scroll=top&needAccess=true>

This article presents evidence-based guidelines to inform culturally responsive online learning design in higher education. Intercultural understanding is now a recognized core learning outcome in a large majority of Canadian public universities; however, supporting design methodology is underdeveloped, especially in online contexts. The authors' search for valid intercultural learning design criteria began with two questions: What is the research evidence for learning design practices that support intercultural learning? In what ways do current course design rubrics address intercultural learning?

Piazza, S. V., Rao, S., & Protacio, M. S. (2015). Converging Recommendations for Culturally Responsive Literacy Practices: Students with Learning Disabilities, English Language Learners, and Socioculturally Diverse Learners. *International Journal of Multicultural Education*, 17(3), 1–20.

<http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1104910.pdf>

This study examines culturally responsive pedagogy across the fields of special education, multicultural literacy education, and teaching English language learners. A systematic review of recommendations identified culturally responsive practices in five key areas: dialogue, collaboration, visual representation, explicit instruction, and inquiry. Educators are encouraged to adopt a critical and responsive stance that incorporates students' cultural knowledge and lived experiences when implementing these recommendations. Creating classrooms that promote culturally responsive and effective instruction is grounded in the definition of literacy as a social practice and leads to more equitable learning opportunities in all areas.

Scott, K. A., Sheridan, K. M., & Clark, K. (2015). Culturally Responsive Computing: A Theory Revisited. *Learning, Media and Technology*, 40(4), 412–436.

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/17439884.2014.924966?needAccess=true>

Despite multiple efforts and considerable funding, historically marginalized groups (e.g., racial minorities and women) continue not to enter or persist in the most lucrative of fields—technology. Understanding the potency of culturally responsive teaching (CRT), some technology-enrichment programs modified CRP principles to establish a culturally responsive computing (CRC) experience for disenfranchised groups. The authors draw from their respective praxes, developing two such initiatives, and reconceptualize CRC as a heuristic. In this theoretical article, they offer a more nuanced vision of CRC considering intersectionality, innovations, and technosocial activism. Implications for the newly defined tenets consider programmatic, theoretical, and methodological concerns.

Sieffert, S. (2006). *Placing Culture at the Forefront*. Saskatoon, Canada: University of Saskatchewan.

<http://etad.usask.ca/802papers/seiffert/seiffert.pdf>

With the ability to reach broader and more diverse audiences of learners, the issue of cultural differences and their effects on instructional technology and design are becoming more and more important. In order to capitalize on this potential, instructional designers must be able to design for emerging audiences. We don't really know for sure what the audiences of the future will look like, but we need to be able to adapt to whatever cultural demands and opportunities they present. This paper examines some definitions of culture and how culture in turn affects instructional design. Specific cultural issues in designing instructional materials are discussed and guidelines are also examined in order to guide the design of culturally sensitive materials.

Smith, D. R.; Ayers, D. F. (2006). *Culturally Responsive Pedagogy and Online Learning: Implications for the Globalized Community College*. *Community College Journal of Research & Practice*, 30(5-6), 401–415.

https://libres.uncg.edu/ir/uncg/f/D_Ayers_Culturally_2006.pdf

Implicit in the open-door mission of the community college is the mandate that every learning experience should offer full equity and inclusion for all learners, including those of diverse cultural backgrounds. This mission is paramount, given the cultural diversity represented among learners served by the globalized community college. This paper presents a cross-section of research, practice, and discourse focused on expanding our knowledge and understanding of the diverse learning needs of community college learners. The relevance of the literature to the planning, design, and implementation of distance learning is discussed. In the end, the authors offer distance-learning instructional strategies that may accommodate the unique needs of Hispanic/Latino learners. Implications for community college educators are discussed.

Taliaferro, A. (2011). *Developing Culturally Responsive Leaders through Online Learning and Teaching Approaches*. *Journal of Educational Technology*, 8(3), 15–20.

<http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1102107.pdf>

The article discusses culturally responsive leadership theory as a means to developing pre-service Master of School Administration (MSA) students as culturally responsive leaders who understand and are able to bridge differences that arise in diverse educational settings. The issues explored include those related to the cultural heritages and educational histories that students, faculty, and stakeholders bring with them to the educational setting. The article discusses ways that educational leadership can employ 21st Century technologies to enhance online instruction and teaching strategies. The article explores how online teaching approaches are effective in providing a forum for meaningful and in-depth experiences for students.

Vatrapu, R. (2002). Culture and International Usability Testing: The Effects of Culture in Interviews. Thesis submitted to the Faculty of the Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Science in Computer Science and Applications.

https://theses.lib.vt.edu/theses/available/etd-09132002-083026/unrestricted/Vatrapu_Thesis.pdf

Designing global interfaces for users has always been a challenge. This challenge is even greater today with the current trend of globalization, which leads to highly diverse users of the same product. The global audiences for the software and information technology products belong to different countries, different religions, speak different languages, have different life styles, belong to different cultures and have different perceptions and expectations of the same product. A truly global product must inherently accommodate this diversity in order to be effective and successful. A major impediment is that there is very inadequate understanding of the role of culture in user interfaces and how they are built. This lack of understanding is further compounded by the fact that very little empirical work exists regarding the role of culture in usability testing. The objectives of this research are to study and empirically establish the effects of culture on the usability assessment technique of structured interviews.

Wang, M. (2016). Designing Online Courses that Effectively Engage Learners from Diverse Cultural Backgrounds. *British Journal of Educational Technology*, 38(2), 294–311.

<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1467-8535.2006.00626.x/full>

This study examines the effect of an important cultural dimension—power distance index (PDI)—on learners’ perceptions of their online learning experiences. PDI refers to the degree to which a learner’s response to another individual in a learning setting is inhibited or otherwise negatively altered when the other individual holds a position that is superior or inferior to the learner’s own position. This study aims to generate guidelines for better design and facilitation of online courses that can effectively engage all students in the learning process. Research findings are particularly relevant to researchers and practitioners who are interested in the cultural aspects of online learning. This study contributes to the current knowledge base about designing effective online courses and about practicing culturally responsive teaching in an online setting.

Wong, A. L. (2007). Cross-Cultural Delivery of e-Learning Programmes: Perspectives from Hong Kong. *International Review of Research in Open and Distance Learning*, 8(3). 1–16.

<http://www.irrodl.org/index.php/irrodl/article/view/426/937>

The growing popularity of e-learning may pose one of the greatest challenges currently facing traditional educational institutions. The questions often asked are how, rather than whether, to embrace this new form of instructional delivery and how to create an appropriate learning environment for the learners. Educational institutions in Hong Kong have the option of adopting programs or learning materials developed in other parts of the world for local learners, or not. Such an approach of acquiring learning materials is not without risks in terms of the suitability of materials embedded with cultural contents “foreign” to local learners, or in terms of the suitability of assumptions in the communication context. What are the issues involved in the globalization of education through e-learning? This paper explores--from a critical-dialectical perspective—the implications of globalization on educational policy through cross-border delivery of educational programs by e-learning, with particular attention given to the threat of cultural imperialism. The paper concludes that Hong Kong seems to be coping with “cultural imperialism” rather well because of its unique history of being a cross-road for East and West, and also with some recommendations to e-learning providers to mitigate the potential damage of cross-cultural delivery of e-learning.

Woodley, X., Hernandez, C., Parra, J., & Negash, B. (2017). Celebrating Difference: Best Practices in Culturally Responsive Teaching Online. *TechTrends: Linking Research and Practice to Improve Learning*, 61(5), 470–478.

<https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11528-017-0207-z>

Culturally responsive teaching and design practices flip the online classroom by creating an environment that acknowledges, celebrates, and builds upon the cultural capital that learners and teachers bring to the online classroom. Challenges exist in all phases of online course design, including the ability to create online courses that reflect the instructor’s commitment to inclusive excellence, diversity, and social justice. Designing an online environment that supports all learners regardless of their backgrounds is important in their future success as professionals; thus, it is important for faculty to design courses with all students in mind. The purpose of this article is to share best practices in the design of culturally and linguistically responsive online courses that support the culturally and linguistically diverse (CLD) students educators serve.

CULTURALLY-RESPONSIVE LEARNING ENVIRONMENTS

Achinstein, B., & Ogawa, R. T. (2012). New Teachers of Color and Culturally Responsive Teaching in an Era of Educational Accountability: Caught in a Double Bind. *Journal of Educational Change*, 13(1), 1–39.

<https://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1007%2Fs10833-011-9165-y.pdf>

The purpose of this article is to examine how and to what extent schools' responses to accountability policies in the United States influence the ability of new teachers of color to draw on their own and their students' cultural resources to engage in culturally responsive teaching. A 5-year study of 17 new teachers of color reveals that these teachers identified three principal tensions which correspond to the three dimensions of culturally responsive teaching: (a) cultural and linguistic relevance versus standardization, (b) community of learners versus teacher transmission, and (c) social justice versus enhanced test scores. The teachers also described two mechanisms by which accountability-based programs and policies were enforced: fear of monitoring and internalizing the link between testing and educational opportunity. The authors applied the metaphor of "double bind" to explain the tensions and enforcement mechanisms encountered by these teachers. The "double bind" forced the new teachers of color to enact contradictory systemic demands promoted by government policy and the teaching profession and exacted an individual toll. The authors conclude with implications for policy, practice, and research.

Banks, J. A., Cookson, P., Gay G., Hawley, W. D., Irvine, J. J., Nieto, S., Schofield, J. W., & Stephan, W. G. (2001). Diversity within Unity: Essential Principles for Teaching and Learning in a Multicultural Society. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 83(3), 196–198.

http://www.uwyo.edu/education/_files/documents/diversity-articles/banks_2001.pdf

This article discusses 12 essential principles to help schools teach democratic values in a multicultural society. Derived from findings of the Multicultural Education Consensus Panel to review and synthesize research on diversity, the 12 principles are organized into five categories: Teacher learning; student learning; intergroup relations; school governance, organization, and equity; and assessment. The principles, derived from both research and practice, are designed to help practitioners in all types of schools increase student academic achievement and improve intergroup skills.

Bazron, B. (2005). *Creating Culturally Responsive Schools*. Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.

<http://sparkaction.org/node/31052>

This article begins, “During the last 10 years, U.S. schools have experienced a rapid growth in ethnic and racial diversity. In the near future, the young people now filling classrooms will be paying taxes, working in the public and private sectors, and consuming the goods and services that fuel our economy. Given the increased diversity of the student population, how can schools ensure that all students master the social, emotional, intellectual, and technical competencies necessary to fulfill these essential roles?”

Bergeron, B. S. (2008). Enacting a Culturally Responsive Curriculum in a Novice Teacher’s Classroom: Encountering Disequilibrium. *Urban Education*, 43(1), 4–28.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/0042085907309208>

Many educators suggest that novice teachers lack the preparation necessary to be successful in today’s urban classrooms, particularly when the experiences of those novices are vastly different from their students. However, it can also be suggested that culturally responsive practices have the potential to counteract the “cultural disequilibrium” that many novices encounter. In this narrative case study, the author traces one novice teacher’s journey within a diverse, urban classroom. Data from this study suggest that a novice teacher’s support systems, administrator, professional development, and the capacity to take risks contribute to his or her effectiveness in the classroom. Implications for teacher educators include providing instructional and experiential modeling of culturally responsive practices, informing preservice teachers of current educational policies and strategies for becoming student advocates, and becoming engaged within schools to support the implementation of induction programs that authentically prepare novices to turn cultural “disequilibrium” into cultural responsiveness.

Brown, J. E., & Doolittle, J. (2008). A Cultural, Linguistic, and Ecological Framework for Response to Intervention with English Language Learners. *Teaching Exceptional Children*, 40(5), 66–72.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/004005990804000509>

Response to Intervention (RTI) has been heralded by many as the long-awaited alternative to using a discrepancy formula for special education eligibility decisions. RTI focuses on intervening early through a multi-tiered approach where each tier provides interventions of increasing intensity. RTI has the potential to affect change for English language learners (ELLs) by requiring the use of research-based practices based on individual children’s specific needs. The focus of this article is to provide an initial framework in the use of RTI that considers students’ life experiences, including their language proficiencies in their first and second language, as well as the contexts in which they are taught.

Griner, A. (2013). Addressing the Achievement Gap and Disproportionality Through the Use of Culturally Responsive Teaching Practices. *Urban Education*, 48(4), 585–621.

http://etd.fcla.edu/CF/CFE0003880/Griner_Angela_C_201108_EdD.pdf

Culturally responsive practices in schools and classrooms have been shown to be an effective means of addressing the achievement gap as well as the disproportionate representation of racially, culturally, ethnically, and linguistically diverse students in programs serving students with special needs. While there has been much research discussing these issues, teachers and school staff lack clear examples and tools for best practices toward addressing these issues effectively. This research provides a practical tool to encourage teachers and school staff to engage in reflective, culturally responsive practice as well as highlighting the need to include a range of stakeholders in the process of developing, implementing, and evaluating tools for educational practice.

Kea, C. D., & Trent, S. C. (2013). Providing Culturally Responsive Teaching in Field-Based and Student Teaching Experiences: A Case Study. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Teaching and Learning*, 3(2), 82–101.

<http://www3.subr.edu/coejtl/files/download/ijtl-v3-n2-summer2013-kea-trent-pp82-101.pdf>

This mixed design study chronicles the yearlong outcomes of 27 undergraduate preservice teacher candidates' ability to design and deliver culturally responsive lesson plans during field-based experience lesson observations and student teaching settings after receiving instruction in a special education methods course. While components of culturally responsive instruction were embedded in the lesson plans written as a part of course requirements, few participants incorporated them during lesson observations in their field-based placement and student teaching experiences. Recommendations for research and practice for teacher education programs are provided.

Nichols, W. D., Rupley, W. H. Webb-Johnson, G., & Tlusty, G. (2000). Teachers Role in Providing Culturally Responsive Literacy Instruction. *Reading Horizons*, 41(1), 1–18.

<https://search.proquest.com/docview/236472794?pq-origsite=gscholar>

This article notes that all teachers must be prepared to meet the varying educational, social, and emotional needs of all children. It states, “Culturally and linguistically diverse students are on the same reading and learning continuum as other children; however, they often have experiences that are different from the mainstream. Culturally responsive reading instruction bridges the gap between the school and the world of the student. Culturally responsive instruction is consistent with the values of the students' own culture aimed at assuring academic learning. This type of reading instruction encourages teachers to adapt their instruction to meet the learning needs of all students.” It concludes that, to ensure equal educational opportunities for all students, the educational system must be transformed so that all students have an equal chance to succeed.

Nieto, S. (1994). Affirmation, Solidarity, and Critique: Moving Beyond Tolerance in Multicultural Education. *Multicultural Education*, 1(4), 9–12, 35–38.

<http://www.sonianieto.com/OLD/PDF/Moving%20beyond%20tolerance%20Mult%20Ed%201994.pdf>

Educators are challenged to move beyond tolerance as a goal in the conceptualization and practice of multicultural education. Tolerance is actually only a low level of support. It should be surpassed by acceptance, respect, and finally, affirmation, solidarity, and critique. Some examples illustrate these steps.

Nieto, S. (2000). Placing Equity Front and Center: Some Thoughts on Transforming Teacher Education for a New Century. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 51(3), 180–187.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/0022487100051003004>

This article explores what it means for teacher education programs to place diversity front and center. Using a social justice perspective on teacher education, the author argues that schools and colleges of education need to radically transform their policies and practices if they are to become places where teachers and prospective teachers learn to become effective with students of all backgrounds in U.S. schools.

Nieto, S. (2003). Profoundly Multicultural Questions. *Educational Leadership*, 60(4), 6–10.

<http://www.ascd.org/publications/educational-leadership/dec02/vol60/num04/Profoundly-Multicultural-Questions.aspx>

The author argues that multicultural education practices in most schools today have not adequately addressed the larger issues of social justice and equal access to educational resources. She discusses four profoundly multicultural questions educators must address: Who's taking calculus? Which classes meet in the basement? Who's teaching the children? How much are children worth?

Nieto, S. (2005). Cultural Difference and Educational Change in a Sociopolitical Context. In A. Hargreaves (Ed), *Extending Educational Change* (pp.138–159). New York, NY: Springer.

https://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1007%2F1-4020-4453-4_7.pdf

This chapter points to the significant phenomenon of growing cultural diversity and the challenges it presents for educational change. Reviewing the evidence on ways of learning and what counts as learning in diverse cultures, and on the strong association between various levels of cultural diversity and poverty, the author argues that, beyond the rhetoric, differences of race, culture, and language are rarely taken very seriously in educational reform efforts. Yet, she shows how taking cultural and linguistic diversity into account in educational reform initiatives can make a real difference in student learning and achievement — and she outlines numerous, concrete and practical examples of how this can be and sometimes has been achieved. She argues for better preservice teacher education that will prepare teachers effectively to work in contexts of diversity; for a more positive view of the strengths to be drawn from cultural difference; for whole-school policies that are sensitive to diversity issues; and for making social justice central rather than peripheral to an educational reform agenda that is currently too preoccupied with other interests and concerns.

Paris, D. (2012). Culturally Sustaining Pedagogy: A Needed Change in Stance, Terminology, and Practice. *Educational Researcher*, 41(3), 93–97.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.3102/0013189X12441244>

While the author Django Paris had been inspired by what it means to make teaching and learning relevant and responsive to the languages, literacies, and cultural practices of students across categories of difference and (in)equality, recently Paris has begun to question if the terms “relevant” and “responsive” are really descriptive of much of the teaching and research founded upon them and, more importantly, if they go far enough in their orientation to the languages and literacies and other cultural practices of communities marginalized by systemic inequalities to ensure the valuing and maintenance of our multiethnic and multilingual society. In this essay, Paris offers the term and stance of “culturally sustaining pedagogy” as an alternative that, Paris believes, embodies some of the best research and practice in the resource pedagogy tradition and as a term that supports the value of our multiethnic and multilingual present and future. In the face of current policies and practices that have the explicit goal of creating a monocultural and monolingual society, research and practice need equally explicit resistances that embrace cultural pluralism and cultural equality.

Phuntsog, N. (1998). The Magic of Culturally Responsive Pedagogy: In Search of the Genie's Lamp in Multicultural Education. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association (San Diego, CA, April 13–17, 1998).

<http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED420632.pdf>

In recent years, there has been growing interest in helping teachers develop culturally responsive teaching strategies. This paper profiles crucial aspects of a culturally responsive pedagogy and proposes a holistic framework for integrating different levels of culture into culturally responsive teaching. A literature review examined 13 documents published between 1992 and 1997. The research suggested that culturally responsive teaching encompasses respect for diversity; creation of a safe, inclusive, respectful environment; integration of responsive teaching practices in all disciplines; and transformation of curriculum to promote social justice and equity in society. The literature review highlighted problems and issues that researchers consider crucial for developing culturally responsive teaching. A main finding was that educators' attitudes play a vital role in either empowering or disabling diverse students. The proposed framework integrates salient features of culturally responsive practices, recognizing the teacher's central, crucial role. It shows interrelationships between four levels of culture (personal, microculture, macroculture, and global culture). Its five essential features are cultural literacy, self-reflective analysis, caring and inclusive classrooms, respect for diversity, and critical pedagogy/transformational curriculum.

Phuntsog, N. (2001). Culturally Responsive Teaching: What Do Selected United States Elementary School Teachers Think? *Intercultural Education*, 12(1), 51–64.

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/14675980120033966?needAccess=true>

In this paper, culturally responsive teaching is viewed as one way of implementing the concept of multicultural education in schools. In recent years, scholars have devoted considerable attention to the importance of aligning classroom experiences with students' home culture as a way of enhancing social, academic, and cultural enrichment of all children. This study was, therefore, designed to identify perceptions of teachers toward the importance of culturally responsive teaching in elementary schools in the United States. The data analysis clearly indicated that over 96% of the respondents considered culturally responsive teaching to be an important part of working with culturally diverse students.

Prater, M. A., & Devereaux, T. H. (2009). Culturally Responsive Training of Teacher Educators. *Action in Teacher Education*, 31(3), 19–27.

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/01626620.2009.10463525>

Given that the numbers of culturally and/or linguistically diverse students being educated in U.S. public schools are growing immensely, teacher educators must take responsibility for preparing teacher candidates to work in today's diverse classrooms. This can be difficult, however, if teacher educators are not culturally responsive in their curricular content and pedagogy. Teacher educators could benefit from engaging in professional development in this area. In this article, the authors discuss the professional literature on culturally responsive higher education training. They focus on the intended outcomes of professional development, including faculty knowledge, skills, and dispositions, as well as activities to promote cultural responsiveness among teacher education faculty.

Rendon, L. I. (1993). *Validating Culturally Diverse Students: Toward a New Model of Learning and Student Development*. University Park, PA: National Center on Postsecondary Teaching, Learning, and Assessment.

<http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED371672.pdf>

This study examined minority and nontraditional students and how new approaches to learning and student development may validate culturally diverse students and thus approve their achievement. A key finding was that when external agents took the initiative to validate students, academically or interpersonally, students began to believe they could be successful. Analysis explored how students who arrived expecting to fail were transformed to confident, successful students.

Richards, H. V., Brown, A. F., & Forde, T. B. (2007). Addressing Diversity in Schools: Culturally Responsive Pedagogy. *Teaching Exceptional Children*, 39(3), 64–68.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/004005990703900310>

As more and more students from diverse backgrounds populate 21st century classrooms and efforts mount to identify effective methods to teach these students, the need for pedagogical approaches that are culturally responsive intensifies. Today's classrooms require teachers to educate students varying in culture, language, abilities, and many other characteristics. To meet this challenge, teachers must employ not only theoretically sound but also culturally responsive pedagogy. Teachers must create a classroom culture where all students, regardless of their cultural and linguistic background, are welcomed and supported and provided with the best opportunity to learn. This brief defines culturally responsive pedagogy and explains how it might be used effectively to address the instructional needs of a diverse student population.

Shealey, M. W., McHatton, P. A., & Wilson, V. (2011). Moving Beyond Disproportionality: The Role of Culturally Responsive Teaching in Special Education. *Teaching Education*, 22(4), 377–396.

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/10476210.2011.591376?needAccess=true>

For over 30 years, the field of special education has grappled with the problem of disproportionality. The discourse around this issue has predominately focused on possible causes, and yet the problem persists. This paper will provide an overview of the research on disproportionality and multicultural special education. In addition, the authors will examine the extent to which culturally responsive teaching has been implemented in special education and will propose future directions for research and practice.

Siwatu, K. O. (2011). Preservice Teachers' Culturally Responsive Teaching Self-Efficacy-Forming Experiences: A Mixed Methods Study. *Journal of Educational Research*, 104(5), 360–369.

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/00220671.2010.487081?needAccess=true>

The author used an explanatory mixed methods research design. The first phase involved the collection of quantitative data to examine the nature of preservice teachers' (N = 192) culturally responsive teaching self-efficacy beliefs. Follow-up face-to-face interviews were carried out with a subsample selected from Phase 1 participants. These interviews were used to identify the types of culturally responsive teaching self-efficacy-forming experiences that preservice teachers encountered during their teacher education program and the perceived influence that these experiences had on the development of their self-efficacy beliefs. The face-to-face interviews uncovered disparities among preservice teachers regarding the aspects of culturally responsive teaching that were discussed, modeled, and practiced. The theoretical and practical implications of this study are discussed.

Stairs, A. J. (2007). Culturally Responsive Teaching: The Harlem Renaissance in an Urban English Class. *The English Journal*, 96(6), 37–42.

<http://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/30046750.pdf>

The author of this article advocates culturally responsive teaching, a practice that explicitly highlights “issues of race, ethnicity, and culture as central to teaching, learning, and schooling,” and emphasizes the necessity of interrogating the themes of race, power, and privilege in the urban classroom. She observes two student teachers as they actively integrate rap lyrics, jazz and blues music, the poetry of Langston Hughes, discussion of figurative language, and analysis and imitation activities to examine elements of racism and prejudice during the Harlem Renaissance.

Strahan, D. B., & Layell, K. (2006). Connecting Caring and Action through Responsive Teaching: How One Team Accomplished Success in a Struggling Middle School. *Clearing House: A Journal of Educational Strategies, Issues and Ideas*, 79(3), 147–153.

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.3200/TCHS.79.3.147-153>

In *Turning Points 2000: Educating Adolescents in the 21st Century*, Anthony W. Jackson and Gayle A. Davis noted that “changes in middle grades practices have least often occurred where they are needed most: in high-poverty urban and rural communities where unacceptably poor student achievement is rampant.” Even so, in many struggling schools, some teams have achieved success. Their classrooms have been safe havens for students; lessons have been energizing; learning has mattered. The authors of this article report a case study that describes how one middle school team achieved success in a struggling school. Interviews and observations were conducted to document the four principal ways that the school “beat the odds” in promoting academic achievement: (1) Teachers created a classroom learning community through shared responsibility, team building, and positive discipline; (2) Teachers created a learner-centered environment, that featured warm, supportive relationships with students; (3) Teachers centered assessment on students’ learning strengths as well as areas of need; and (4) Teachers created a knowledge-centered environment by connecting inquiry, collaboration, and real-world experiences.

Villegas, A. M., & Lucas, T. (2002). Preparing Culturally Responsive Teachers: Rethinking the Curriculum. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 53(1), 20–32.

http://www.smc.edu/StudentServices/TitleV/Documents/Faculty/Teaching_Pedagogy/Preparing_20Culturally_20Responsive_20Teachers.pdf

This article explains that culturally responsive teachers are socioculturally conscious; have affirming views of diverse students; see themselves as responsible for and capable of bringing about change to make schools more equitable; understand how learners construct knowledge and can promote knowledge construction; know about the lives of their students; and design instruction that builds on students’ prior knowledge while also challenging them.

Walker-Dalhouse, D., & Dalhouse, A. D. (2006). Investigating White Preservice Teachers' Beliefs about Teaching in Culturally Diverse Classrooms. *Negro Educational Review*, 57(1/2), 69–84, 140–141.

<https://search.proquest.com/docview/218971097?pq-origsite=gscholar>

Ninety-two White preservice teachers from middle to upper socioeconomic backgrounds were asked to respond to questions on a five-point Likert-type scale to estimate their beliefs about awareness of culture, diverse families, cultural communications, uses of assessment, and their teaching in multicultural classrooms before and after a junior level diversity practicum and seminar. Results of data seemed to show that White preservice teachers' beliefs moved toward classroom diversity in the desired direction. Overall, they were less inclined after their practicum and seminar to refer students for testing (based on ethnicity and culture), and were less likely to accept the use of ethnic jokes and phrases in their classroom. The results make the authors optimistic that their White preservice teachers will be more culturally aware and sensitive to the needs of their future students. Also, results seem to indicate that the task of preparing culturally sensitive teachers is enormous.

LINGUISTICALLY-RESPONSIVE LEARNING ENVIRONMENTS

Dost, G. T. (2016). Preparing Linguistically Responsive Teachers through Experiential Foreign Language Tasks: A Phenomenological Study. *Cogent Education*, 3(1), 1–17.

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/2331186X.2016.1169614?needAccess=true>

This article reports a phenomenological study of four prospective teachers' experiences with four foreign language tasks. The purpose of the study was to propose and examine a research-based practice to raise awareness about preparing linguistically responsive teachers in teacher education programs.

Feiman-Nemser, S. (2001). From Preparation to Practice: Designing a Continuum to Strengthen and Sustain Teaching. *Teachers College Record*, 103(6), 1013–1055.

http://www.geocities.ws/cne_magisterio/4/curricfomdocente.pdf

This paper was written to stimulate discussions and debate about what a professional learning continuum from initial preparation through the early years of teaching could be like. Drawing on a broad base of literature, the author proposes a framework for thinking about a curriculum for teacher learning over time. The paper also considers the fit (or misfit) between conventional approaches to teacher preparation, induction and professional development and the challenges of learning to teach in reform-minded ways and offers examples of promising programs and practices at each of these stages. [NOTE: This paper was included because it is cited in Lucas & Villegas, 2013, below].

García, E., Arias, M. B., Harris Murri, N. J., & Serna, C. (2010). Developing Responsive Teachers: A Challenge for a Demographic Reality. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 61(1-2) 132–142.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/0022487109347878>

In this article, the authors reflect on the preparation of teachers for English learners (ELs) and articulate the importance of enhancing teacher knowledge through contact and collaboration with diverse ethnolinguistic communities. The authors build on recent research on the preparation of teachers for cultural responsiveness and linguistic diversity and recommend a situated preparation within EL communities that fosters the development of teacher knowledge of the dynamics of language in children's lives and communities. The authors summarize the most recent research on culturally and linguistically responsive teacher preparation and focus on a framework that includes developing teacher knowledge through contact, collaboration, and community.

Heineke, A. J., Coleman, E., Ferrell, E., & Kersemeier, C. (2012). Opening Doors for Bilingual Students: Recommendations for Building Linguistically Responsive Schools. *Improving Schools*, 15(2) 130–147.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/1365480212450235>

In this article, the authors outline the necessary action steps for schools to improve the achievement of bilingual students. They review, summarize, and utilize the pertinent scholarly literature to make suggestions for school-wide, collaborative efforts to support the achievement of bilingual learners through linguistically responsive pedagogy and practice. Their research-based recommendations include the need for school actors to negotiate language policy and mandates, lay the necessary ideological foundations, build effective school structures and systems, and foster meaningful collaboration with families and communities. When teachers, administrators, counselors, families, and community members work together, schools can improve to promote the social, cultural, linguistic, and academic achievement of bilingual students.

Honigsfeld, A., & Giouroukakis, V. (2011). High-Stakes Assessments and English Language Learners. *Delta Kappa Gamma Bulletin*, 77(4), 6–10.

<http://www.deltakappagamma.org/NH/DKGBulletinsummer2011.PDF#page=7>

In this position paper, the authors argue that high-stakes, standardized assessments place an enormous challenge both on learners for whom English is a second language and their teachers. Yet, based on a thorough review of the literature and their own recent research on standardized test preparation practices for English Language Learners, they also claim that employing culturally and linguistically responsive instructional strategies may lessen the stress associated with test-driven instruction and improve student learning outcomes as well.

Lucas, T., Villegas, A. M., & Freedson-Gonzalez, M. (2008). Linguistically Responsive Teacher Education: Preparing Classroom Teachers to Teach English Language Learners. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 59(4), 361–373.

http://cmmr.usc.edu/FullText/Lucas_Villegas.pdf

In this article, the authors identify a small set of principles that can serve as the linguistic foundation for the teaching of English language learners in mainstream classes. The authors then outline linguistically responsive pedagogical practices that flow directly from those principles. They conclude with concrete suggestions for how teacher education programs can incorporate the knowledge and skills that will prepare all preservice teachers to be linguistically responsive.

Lucas, T., & Villegas, A. M. (2013). Preparing Linguistically Responsive Teachers: Laying the Foundation in Preservice Teacher Education. *Theory Into Practice*, 52(2), 98–109.

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/00405841.2013.770327?needAccess=true>

This article examines preservice teacher education as the first phase in the continuum of teacher development for teaching ELLs. Drawing on the authors' framework of orientations and pedagogical knowledge and skills for preparing linguistically responsive teachers, they show how Feiman-Nemser's (2001) framework of central tasks for learning to teach can serve as a guide for identifying tasks for learning to teach culturally and linguistically diverse (CLD) students and for guiding the construction of a coherent approach to preparing teachers of CLD students that begins in preservice programs, laying the foundation for continued development throughout the teaching career.

Lucas, T., & Villegas, A. M. (2010). The Missing Piece in Teacher Education: The Preparation of Linguistically Responsive Teachers. *National Society for the Study of Education*, 109(2), 297–318.

https://www.researchgate.net/profile/T_Lucas2/publication/292697945_The_missing_piece_in_teacher_education_The_preparation_of_linguistically_responsive_teachers/links/57444c7008aea45ee84f157b.pdf

In this chapter, the authors present a synthesis of the small but growing body of literature examining what some teacher educators are already doing and what all teacher educators need to do to prepare mainstream classroom teachers to teach ELLs. While the discussion applies to teachers of immigrant and refugee students who are ELLs, the authors focus their attention on language-related issues, which have received considerably less attention than cultural issues.

Méndez, L. I., Crais, E. R., Castro, D. C., & Kainz, K. (2015). A Culturally and Linguistically Responsive Vocabulary Approach for Young Latino Dual Language Learners. *Journal of Speech, Language, and Hearing Research*, 58(1), 93–106.

http://jslhr.pubs.asha.org/epdf.aspx?doi=10.1044/2014_jslhr-1-12-0221

This study examined the role of the language of vocabulary instruction in promoting English vocabulary in preschool Latino dual language learners (DLLs). The authors compared the effectiveness of delivering a single evidence-informed vocabulary approach using English as the language of vocabulary instruction (English culturally responsive [ECR]) versus using a bilingual modality that strategically combined Spanish and English (culturally and linguistically responsive [CLR]).

CULTURALLY- AND LINGUISTICALLY-RESPONSIVE LEARNING ENVIRONMENTS

Barnes, C. J. (2007). Preparing Preservice Teachers to Teach in a Culturally Responsive Way. *The Negro Educational Review*, 57(1-2), 85–100.

<http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.458.3111&rep=rep1&type=pdf>

A teacher education program designed to adequately prepare preservice teachers to instruct culturally and linguistically diverse students in their classrooms is described. Under the supervision of a professor and a graduate assistant in a required methods course at a private Midwestern Christian university, 24 preservice teachers, who use a culturally responsive teaching framework to teach reading to urban elementary children who scored between low and intermediate levels on their state reading examination, participated in this study. Implications regarding how teacher education programs can create a learning environment where future teachers can learn to welcome and support all students, specifically those from diverse cultural and linguistic backgrounds, are discussed.

Blanchett, W. J., Klingner, J. K., & Harry, B. (2009). The Intersection of Race, Culture, Language, and Disability: Implications for Urban Education. *Urban Education*, 44(4), 389–409.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/0042085909338686>

To date, few researchers have sought to examine the effect of issues of race, culture, language, and disability, let alone to look specifically at the intersection of these issues, as it relates to special education identification, special education service delivery, and students of color's access to an equitable education. This article attempts to help urban education researchers and educators understand (a) why the intersection of race, culture, language, and disability is an urban education issue; (b) how issues of race, culture, language, and disability affect students' and their families' quest for an equitable education; (c) how to advocate for and provide culturally responsive services to racially, culturally, linguistically, and economically diverse students and their families; and (d) the implications of the intersection of race, culture, and disability for urban education practice, research, and policy.

Bui, Y. N., & Fagan, Y. M. (2013). The Effects of an Integrated Reading Comprehension Strategy: A Culturally Responsive Teaching Approach for Fifth-Grade Students' Reading Comprehension. *Preventing School Failure*, 57(2), 59–69.

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/1045988X.2012.664581?needAccess=true>

The study evaluated the effects of the Integrated Reading Comprehension Strategy on two levels. The Integrated Reading Comprehension Strategy integrated story grammar instruction and story maps, prior knowledge and prediction method, and word webs through a culturally responsive teaching framework; the Integrated Reading Comprehension Strategy Plus added multicultural literature and cooperative learning. The study was conducted with 49 fifth-grade students from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds and used a quasi-experimental nonequivalent group, pretest-posttest design. An informal reading inventory was the measurement instrument. The results indicated that both groups' mean scores for word recognition, reading comprehension, and story retell increased significantly. There were no statistically significant differences between the groups. These findings support the integration of research-based practices with culturally responsive teaching, which promotes connecting the school's learning environment with the students' personal experiences.

Callins, T. (2006). Culturally Responsive Literacy Instruction. *Teaching Exceptional Children*, 39(2), 62–65.

http://www.niusileadscape.org/docs/FINAL_PRODUCTS/NCCREST/practitioner_briefs/%95%20TEMPLATE/DRAFTS/AUTHOR%20revisions/annablis%20pracbrief%20templates/Literacy_Brief_highres.pdf

Teaching ability, over and above reading programs, is the major contributor to students' literacy success. Culturally and linguistically diverse students are not receiving “a free and appropriate education” when teachers are not implementing instructional strategies that optimize student achievement or positively reinforcing their cultural identity. Teachers who embrace culturally responsive literacy instruction will serve as a catalyst for improved reading achievement among students who are culturally and linguistically diverse. In this article, the author focuses on literacy instruction and discusses the importance of (1) multiple forms of literacy; (2) early reading success; (3) culturally responsive pedagogy; and (4) skills, reading for meaning, and multicultural literature.

Cartledge, G., & Kourea, L. (2008). Culturally Responsive Classrooms for Culturally Diverse Students with and at Risk for Disabilities. *Exceptional Children*, 74(3), 351–371.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/001440290807400305>

Culturally and linguistically diverse (CLD) students with and at risk for disabilities evidence the greatest need for quality instructional programs of all students in our schools because of disproportionate academic underachievement, special education referrals, and disciplinary actions. Authorities on culturally responsive instruction consistently point to the cultural dissonance between the home and school as a contributor to poor educational outcomes. Other researchers argue that these students are least likely to be taught with the most effective evidence-based instruction. This article discusses culturally responsive classrooms for CLD students with and at risk for disabilities within the context of culturally competent teachers, culturally effective instructional principles, and culturally appropriate behavior development. It discusses implications for educators and suggestions for a future agenda.

Cartledge, G., Singh, A., & Gibson, L. (2008). Practical Behavior-Management Techniques to Close the Accessibility Gap for Students Who Are Culturally and Linguistically Diverse. *Preventing School Failure*, 52(3), 29–38.

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.3200/PSFL.52.3.29-38?needAccess=true>

Students from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds are disproportionately identified for special education in the most restrictive placements. These students tend to have the least access to the general education curriculum and experience the greatest levels of school failure. Educators see an obvious need to change this pattern. These students would benefit most from positive, proactive interventions that enable them to adjust to their school's culture and to master the requisite behaviors leading to their success in school. To achieve these ends, teachers and administrators need to acquire cultural competence and skills related to culturally sensitive behavior management and social-skill development. They also need to realize the importance of effective instruction and academic achievement. Because early intervention is most efficient and promising, applications in this article focus on a young child, but the basic principles are equally applicable to older learners.

Chamberlain, S. P. (2005). Recognizing and Responding to Cultural Differences in the Education of Culturally and Linguistically Diverse Learners. *Intervention in School and Clinic*, 40(4), 195–211.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/10534512050400040101>

Cultural differences between educators and culturally and linguistically diverse (CLD) students can have negative effects on the education of CLD learners. Much of the special education literature pertaining to the education of CLD learners has focused on biased assessment practices that lead to overrepresentation. It is important to consider that overrepresentation is also a function of inappropriate referrals from general education teachers. Understanding how cultural differences can influence the teaching/learning process is paramount if educators are to provide culturally responsive instruction. This article describes a variety of ways that culture influences teacher-student and teacher-parent interactions and provides recommendations to help educators respond to the educational needs of CLD students with and without disabilities.

Chu, M., Martínez-Griego, B., & Cronin, S. (2010). A Head Start/College Partnership: Using a Culturally and Linguistically Responsive Approach to Help Working Teachers Earn Degrees. *Young Children*, 65(4), 24–29.

<https://search.proquest.com/docview/873822766/fulltextPDF/7D4527E355EA4AF8PQ/1?accountid=14270>

Education qualification requirements for early childhood teachers are increasing in many types of federal, state, and community-based early childhood programs. The 2007 reauthorization of Head Start requires all teachers to have associate degrees and 50% to have earned a baccalaureate degree in early childhood education by the year 2013. At the same time that teacher standards are rising, Head Start and other early childhood programs report difficulty in finding and retaining bilingual staff qualified in early childhood education. In Washington State, because the agricultural valley of Skagit County has a significant Latino population, the authors set out to support early childhood teachers in meeting higher educational requirements, including preparation to teach dual language learners. This goal led to a vision of community collaboration to increase teachers' college graduation and develop course work in which teachers experience an infusion of language and literacy strategies for working with dual language learners, children who are learning in both Spanish and English. In this article, the authors discuss the key strategies in this effort and share a collective reflection by teachers and collaborators.

Chu, S.-Y. (2011). Teacher Efficacy Beliefs toward Serving Culturally and Linguistically Diverse Students in Special Education. *Education and Urban Society*, 45(3), 385–410.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/0013124511409401>

Educating a nation of culturally, ethnically/racially, and linguistically diverse (CLD) students is one of the many challenges facing teachers and teacher educators, resulting in teachers' questioning their ability to improve learning for these groups. Yet teacher efficacy is significantly related to student achievement, motivation, and students' own sense of efficacy. Given continuous patterns of disproportionate representation of CLD students in special education, as well as inadequate services, it is important to understand the relation between teacher efficacy and success of CLD populations. The purpose of this pilot study not only examined the reliability of newly developed survey instrument but also investigated urban in-service special education teachers' perceptions about their abilities to teach CLD students.

Chu, S.-Y. (2011). Teacher Perceptions of Their Efficacy for Special Education Referral of Students from Culturally and Linguistically Diverse Backgrounds. *Education*, 32(1), 3–14.

http://go.galegroup.com/ps/i.do?id=GALE%7CA269228794&sid=googleScholar&v=2.1&it=r&inkaccess=fulltext&issn=00131172&p=AONE&sw=w&authCount=1&u=temple_main&selfRedirect=true

Accompanying the growth in student diversity, the disproportional representation of culturally and linguistically diverse (CLD) students in special education categories has drawn the attention of researchers and educators. However, teachers often reported a lack of competence to work with CLD population with and without disabilities. The purpose of this review is to investigate the relationship between perceptions of teacher efficacy and special education referrals. This review reports on the literature to identify competencies, attitudes, beliefs, expectations, and behaviors that educators demonstrate in working with CLD students.

Chu, S.-Y., & Garcia, S. (2014). Culturally Responsive Teaching Efficacy Beliefs of In-Service Special Education Teachers. *Remedial and Special Education*, 35(4), 218–232.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/0741932513520511>

Although teaching efficacy has been noted as an attribute of successful teachers of students from culturally and linguistically diverse (CLD) backgrounds, special educators have not been represented in this research, nor have the influence of personal and professional factors on teacher efficacy been examined for this population. This descriptive, correlational survey research was conducted to investigate the influence of selected personal and professional variables on special educators' culturally responsive teaching efficacy for serving exceptional CLD students. Statistically significant differences were found in respondents' perceptions of self-efficacy as well as outcome expectancy by the perceived effectiveness of their teacher preparation in addressing diversity. Teachers' language characteristics, instructional setting, certification in bilingual education/English as a second language, and perceived quality of professional preparation also emerged as significant predictors. Implications for future research are discussed.

García, S. B., & Ortiz, A. A. (2006). Preventing Disproportionate Representation: Culturally and Linguistically Responsive Prereferral Interventions. *Teaching Exceptional Children*, 38(4), 64–67.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/004005990603800410>

In this brief, the authors highlight four key elements of culturally and linguistically responsive prereferral intervention for culturally and linguistically diverse students. These elements are (1) Preventing School Underachievement and Failure, (2) Early Intervention for Struggling Learners, (3) Diagnostic/Prescriptive Teaching, and (4) Availability of General Education Problem-Solving Support Systems.

Klingner, J. K.; Artiles, A. J., Kozleski, E., Harry, B., Zion, S., Tate, W., Duran, G. Z., & Riley, D. (2005). Addressing the Disproportionate Representation of Culturally and Linguistically Diverse Students in Special Education through Culturally Responsive Educational Systems. *Education Policy Analysis Archives*, 13(38), 1–43.

<http://www.redalyc.org/html/2750/275020513038/>

In this article, the authors present a conceptual framework for addressing the disproportionate representation of culturally and linguistically diverse students in special education. The cornerstone of their approach to addressing disproportionate representation is through the creation of culturally responsive educational systems. Their goal is to assist practitioners, researchers, and policymakers in coalescing around culturally responsive, evidence-based interventions and strategic improvements in practice and policy to improve students' educational opportunities in general education and reduce inappropriate referrals to and placement in special education.

Lee, T. S. (2015). The Significance of Self-Determination in Socially, Culturally, and Linguistically Responsive (SCLR) Education in Indigenous Contexts. *Journal of American Indian Education*, 54(1), 10–32.

<http://www.jstor.org/stable/pdf/10.5749/jamerindieduc.54.1.0010.pdf>

Community control is essential for educational self-determination for Indigenous peoples. Several models demonstrate that education that includes socially, culturally, and linguistically relevant (SCLR) curriculum and pedagogy does not compromise academic rigor. However, more research investigating the connections, outcomes, benefits, and challenges is needed, particularly in this era of educational accountability. The connection between SCLR education, self-determination, and sovereignty are critical to discussions on Indigenous education. This article discusses those connections by (1) summarizing the research on SCLR education, with a particular concentration on language; (2) examining the impact of current educational policies; and (3) emphasizing a research focus on the connections between state/federal policies and school-based practices, models of SCLR education, and Indigenous sovereignty and self-determination in education.

Naqvi, R., McKeough, A., Thorne, K., & Pfitscher, C. (2012). Dual-Language Books as an Emergent-Literacy Resource: Culturally and Linguistically Responsive Teaching and Learning. *Journal of Early Childhood Literacy*, 13(4) 501–528.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/1468798412442886>

In this study the authors analyzed culturally and linguistically responsive teaching and learning in dual-language book reading vignettes to demonstrate how teachers and volunteer readers build on linguistic and cultural repertoires of emergent-literacy learners to help them gain metalinguistic awareness, cultural empowerment and identities as capable learners. They argue that diversity can be embraced and multilingualism can be positioned as normal by using dual-language books to motivate discussion about language and cultural artefacts.

Nieto, S. (1999). What Does It Mean To Affirm Diversity? *School Administrator*, 56(6), 32–35.

<https://www.aasa.org/SchoolAdministratorArticle.aspx?id=14894>

According to this article, educators must recognize five realities before meaningful affirmative actions can occur. Affirming diversity is about social justice. Nonwhite and poor students bear the brunt of structural inequality. Diversity is a valuable resource. Effective teaching entails respecting who they are. Affirming diversity means becoming a multicultural person. The article asks, “What do educators—teachers, aides, curriculum developers, principals, superintendents and school board members—need to know to create effective schools for students of all backgrounds, and how can they learn it? Let me suggest five realities that educators need to appreciate and understand if this is to happen.” The five realities, discussed at some length, are: (1) Affirming diversity is above all about social justice; (2) Students of color and poor students bear the brunt of structural inequality; (3) Diversity is a valuable resource; (4) Effectively teaching students of all backgrounds means respecting and affirming who they are; and (5) Affirming diversity means becoming a multicultural person.

Nieto, S. (2005). Public Education in the Twentieth Century and Beyond: High Hopes, Broken Promises, and an Uncertain Future. *Harvard Educational Review*, 75(1), 43–64.

<http://www.hepgjournals.org/doi/pdf/10.17763/haer.75.1.31r4357517211566?code=hepg-site>

What have been some of the high points and disappointments of K–12 education over the past 75 years? How have shifting demographics in terms of race, ethnicity, social class, and other differences shaped the educational experiences of various segments of the U.S. population? Sonia Nieto examines these questions, beginning with a discussion of the impact of demographic changes on U.S. educational policy. Nieto traverses 75 years of theory, attempting to explain the differences in achievement among U.S. students; explicating cultural inferiority, social reproduction, cultural incompatibility, voluntary and involuntary immigrant, resistance, and various other achievement theories. Nieto then discusses three movements towards the eradication of these inequities: desegregation, bilingual education, and multicultural education, contending that all three of these advancements have been systematically eroded by domestic pressure and policy. Nieto concludes that U.S. education has drifted far from its democratic ideals, and that a recommitment to the possibilities of U.S. education envisioned by John Dewey and Horace Mann is necessary.

Nieto, S. (2006). Solidarity, Courage and Heart: What Teacher Educators Can Learn from a New Generation of Teachers. *Intercultural Education*, 17(5), 457–473.

<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/14675980601060443>

What does it take to become effective teachers of students of culturally, ethnically, linguistically, and racially diverse backgrounds? Based on research with teachers over the past several years, this paper discusses what it means to teach students of diverse backgrounds with heart, courage and conviction, and the implications of their practice for professional development. A review of relevant literature finds that some of the widely acknowledged qualities of effective teachers include a solid general education background; a deep knowledge of subject matter; familiarity with numerous pedagogical approaches; strong communication skills; and effective organizational skills. Although these qualities are essential for good teaching, the purpose in this paper is to suggest that they are insufficient because they fail to take into account the sociopolitical context of education as well as the tremendous diversity of language, social class, ethnicity and race, among other differences, that are a fact of life in many school systems around the world.

Orosco, M. J., & O'Connor, R. (2014). Culturally Responsive Instruction for English Language Learners with Learning Disabilities. *Journal of Learning Disabilities, 47*(6), 515–531.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/0022219413476553>

This case study describes the culturally responsive instruction of one special education teacher with Latino English language learners (ELLs) with learning disabilities in an urban elementary school setting. This study was situated in a social constructivist research based framework. In investigating this instruction with ELLs, this study focused on how one teacher's knowledge of culturally responsive pedagogy affected her special education instruction. Findings resulted in three major themes that were aligned with the current literature in this area: Cultural Aspects of Teaching Reading, Culturally Relevant Skills-Based Instruction, and Collaborative Agency Time. The results indicated that the success of special education with ELLs at the elementary education level might be dependent on how well the special education teacher integrates culturally responsive instruction with ELLs' cultural and linguistic needs.

Santamaria, L. J. (2009). Culturally Responsive Differentiated Instruction: Narrowing Gaps Between Best Pedagogical Practices Benefiting All Learners. *Teachers College Record, 111*(1), 214–247.

<http://educ625spring2011.pbworks.com/f/Culturally%20Responsive%20Differentiated%20Instruction.pdf>

Because of its special education association, differentiated instruction (DI) is a topic of concern for many educators working with culturally and linguistically diverse (CLD) learners, whereby bilingual, multicultural, and culturally responsive teaching (CRT) is considered more appropriate for responding to cultural and linguistic diversity. Furthermore, although the literature base on DI recognizes cultural and linguistic diversity, it offers little in terms of ways to address these differences. The focus of this research is to assist the educational community in recognizing pedagogical differences, while finding common ground, in identifying complementary teaching practices for all students, including culturally diverse students and English language learners (ELLs).

Siwatu, K. O. (2007). Preservice Teachers' Culturally Responsive Teaching Self-Efficacy and Outcome Expectancy Beliefs. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 23*(7), 1086–1101.

<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0742051X06001168>

The findings from this study suggest that preservice teachers are more efficacious in their ability to help students feel like important members of the classroom and develop positive, personal relationships with their students, than they are in their ability to communicate with English Language Learners. Preservice teachers' culturally responsive teaching outcome expectations was highest for the possibility that a positive teacher–student relationship can be established by building a sense of trust in their students. Item-specific means were lowest among the preservice teachers for the possibility that encouraging students to use their native language will help to maintain students' cultural identity. The implications for these findings for both research and teacher education are discussed.

Villegas, A. M., & Lucas, T. (2002). The Culturally Responsive Teacher. *Educational Leadership*, 64(6), 28–33.

<http://worldview.unc.edu/files/2012/02/Reading-2.pdf>

This article states, “Successfully teaching students from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds—especially students from historically marginalized groups—involves more than just applying specialized teaching techniques. It demands a new way of looking at teaching that is grounded in an understanding of the role of culture and language in learning.”

Vincent, C. G., Randall, C., Cartledge, G., Tobin, T. J., & Swain-Bradway, J. (2011). Toward a Conceptual Integration of Cultural Responsiveness and Schoolwide Positive Behavior Support. *Journal of Positive Behavior Interventions*, 13(4), 219–229.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/1098300711399765>

Within the context of widely documented racially disproportionate discipline outcomes, the authors describe schoolwide positive behavior support (SWPBS) as one approach that might provide a useful framework for culturally responsive behavior support delivery. They conceptualize cultural and linguistic diversity as the result of a divergence between individual students’ and entire schools’ cultural identities, and identify culturally responsive educational practices that might facilitate greater continuity between students from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds and school environments. They propose an expansion of the key features of SWPBS implementation (practices, data, systems, and outcomes) to facilitate culturally responsive behavior support delivery. They provide recommendations for future research and present the efforts of one school district to blend SWPBS implementation with training in cultural responsiveness.

Zhang-Wu, Q. (2017). Culturally and Linguistically Responsive Teaching in Practice: A Case Study of a Fourth-Grade Mainstream Classroom Teacher. *Journal of Education*, 197(1), 33–40.

<http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/pdf/10.1177/002205741719700105>

As a result of increases in immigration, more students from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds are entering K–12 classrooms in the United States. Thus, the need to study the education of diverse learners is intensified. Drawing upon semi-structured interviews, observations, and informal conversations, this case study examined how a fourth-grade mainstream teacher at an urban public school put culturally and linguistically responsive instruction into practice. The data analysis was informed by a framework that focused on three levels: instructional, institutional, and societal. Directions for future research are discussed.