Utah Valley University

The Role Ethnicity Plays in Who Elementary Students Choose as Friends

by

Bryan Waite, Genan Anderson, Elaine Byrd, Talitha Hudgins, Julie Nelson, Mike Patch, Sue Simmerman

11/16/10
ABSTRACT

Friendships and their formation are an important part of the educational experience for K-12 students. With the ever increasing ethnic and racial diversity that is filling our schools, it is paramount that we examine how children choose their friends. This study examined whether or not race and ethnicity play a role in how children choose with whom they will spend their time. In order to determine this, a pre and post test was administered to two groups, treatment group and control group, of elementary students to determine with whom they would choose to be friends. The treatment group was given the opportunity to engage in a personal narrative activity where their stories were translated into Spanish and shared with their classmates. Our hypothesis was that children’s baseline choice to interact with another child in close proximity would most often be a child of their own ethnicity. Therefore, our second hypothesis was that introducing children to the first language of their classmate in a literacy context that facilitated connections to similarities between their cultures would increase children’s choices to interact with another child in close proximity across ethnic lines.
Introduction

Classrooms in the United States are becoming ever more diverse. McGoldrick (2003) claims, "We are experiencing the greatest rise in immigration in 100 years. More than 1 million legal and undocumented immigrants are arriving annually, most from Asia and Latin and South America... American society has become characterized by unparalleled diversity" (p. 235). With this in mind, it is increasingly important for researchers, as well as classroom teachers, to better understand what motivates student friendships in these diverse classrooms. The Millennial generation, with their increased exposure to technology, has helped to create students who are much more exposed to diversity than other generations (Broido, 2004); however, does that translate to children choosing friends that do not necessarily look like them?

Knowing that past research has shown that children pick their friends based on race (Aboud, Mendelson, & Purdy, 2003), this study examines the effect of a community classroom intervention of translated pupil stories on pupils’ regard for peers of diverse races and/or ethnicity. Earlier research (Cristol & Gimbert, 2008) suggests that children exposed to multicultural curricula show a reduction in biased attitudes than those of other children. Cristol and Gimbert (2008) posit that emergent intervention may help children conceptualize similarities in cross-race groups rather than viewing members of other groups as homogeneous. The essential focus of the present study is the impact of translated pupil personal narratives to mediate cross-racial/ethnic friendships in classroom communities.

Historically, the majority of studies on multi-ethnic classrooms have sampled Black and White children with a limited amount representing young children of other ethnicities (Spencer & Markstrom-Adams, 1990). As such, there is a need for more research where the primary ethnic groups are White and Latino/a, as found in many classrooms throughout North America. The current study, conducted in the state of Utah, finds state immigrants in step with national trends.
Utah State’s Hispanic population more than doubled (138%) from 1990-2000 (Perlich, 2002). In the year 2007, racial and ethnic minorities were estimated at 18% of the Utah population, 24% in Salt Lake County, and 35% for the U.S. Of those foreign born, it is estimated in 2007 that 60% of Utah’s population were of Hispanic origin (U.S. Census Bureau). This diversifying shift is characteristic of Utah’s schools. Nearly one-fourth of preschool-aged persons in Salt Lake County were estimated to be a minority in 2007 (Perlich, 2008).

Based on these changing demographics, the purpose of this study was to observe same-race play preferences in elementary school children and how the use of translated pupil narrative incommunity-building activities might impact those preferences. The salient questions that guided this research were: First, to what degree is same-race play preferences manifest in elementary school children? Second, how does the use of translated pupil narratives in community-building activities reduce and reverse same-race friendship trends as reported through direct teacher observation and post-testing?

**Literature Review**

Studies on social preferencing in schoolchildren concur that children’s friendships cleave along marked racial lines in racially integrated peer groups (Cristol & Gimbert, 2008; Finkelstein & Haskins, 1983; Rowley, Burchinal, Roberts, & Zeisel, 2008; Tuma & Hallinan, 1979). As children mature, they tend to become more selective and exhibit ingroup/outgroup behavior (Adoud, Mendelson, & Purdy, 2003; Cristol & Gimbert, 2008; Rowley et al., 2008). The primary focus of previous research has been on bias in older children, adolescents and adults. However, “racial stereotyping agreement begins in very young children and remains in children up to 7 years of age” (Cristol & Gimbert, 2008, p. 201; also see Stevenson & Stewart, 1958). Leman and Lam’s (2008) study population of 7-year-old children found race influenced interpersonal contact within children’s conversations. Addressing this issue in the elementary school years is imperative because
“it is generally held that racism is a negative attitude based on faulty assumptions and that attitude is developed early in a person’s life” (Cristol & Gimbert, 2008, p. 202).

Research on cross-race relations has examined causal processes of ethnic bias in selection of classmate friendships. A major factor that increases the probability of biased friendship selection includes unequal racial classroom composition of power where the majority receives more positive peer nominations than the minority (Aboud & Skerry, 1984; Hallinan & Smith, 1985; Kawabata & Crick, 2008; Kitsner, Metzler, Gatlin, & Risi, 1993; Jackson, Barth, Powell, & Lochman, 2006; St. John & Lewis, 1975).

Urie Brofenbrenner’s ecological theory defined a bi-directional component where the individual is embedded within various levels of the ecosystem (as cited in White & Klein 2002). The mutual exchange between a child and school context is influence by the larger exosystem (resources and support systems available to the family) and macrosystem (cultural attitudes, values, ideologies, and beliefs) as well as the microsystem (the family). Thus, socioeconomic status permeates the classroom environment from the macrolevel and becomes a mechanism for peer evaluation and stereotyping. Society’s evaluation of race translates into form and function within the classroom setting of peers (mesosystem). For instance, a preponderance of White heroes in children’s literature idealizes and fosters pro-White attitudes when children attribute positive traits to classmates. Systems theory reveals that stereotyping, whether emanating from home or society, intersects in the classroom, a critical juncture in a child’s development.

Studies report several positive outcomes in cross-race peer selection. When cross-racial/ethnic friendships are measured within the classroom, researchers have found acceptance behaviors in children are also linked to social confidence, adjustment, leadership skills, empathy, and showing few disruptive or fighting behaviors (Kawabata & Crick, 2008; Wasik, 1987). Previous studies have suggested that explicit community-building activities can reverse prejudiced
behavior and attitudes that lead to improved student behaviors (Battistich, Solomon, Kim, Watson, and Schaps, 1995). Community-building classrooms prioritize activities that promote cooperation and respect among all ethnic groups (Battistich et al., 1995; Cochran-Smith, 1995; Rule & Kyle, 2009). However, there is scant literature exploring how specific intervention strategies that foster cooperative classrooms can reverse early trends of racial cleavage in young children.

Another study using literature intervention examined the “extended contact effect,” which suggests that children may internalize vicarious experiences of cross-race friendships to ameliorate White British children’s prejudice against refugees (Cameron, Rutland, Brown, & Douch, 2006). Cameron et al. (2006) found a significant improvement in children’s outgroup attitudes toward refugees after intervention. The two groups in Cameron et al.’s (2006) study are similar to the present study, using children ages 6- to 8-years-old and 9- to 11-years old, extending the treatment period to six weeks, and introducing children’s stories as an intervention. However, whereas Jordan and Hernandex-Reif (2009) and Cameron and associates (2006) used either a hypothetical story model or pre-existing fictitious children’s literature, the current study implements a real-life application of pupil translated stories.

Piagetian theory (as cited in Ginsburg & Opper, 1979) outlines cognitive constraints that might interfere with cross-race friendships and hinder significant results from previous studies. Young children are transitioning from the preoperational to the concrete operational stage, focusing on the concrete rather than the abstract characteristics in their environment. Hence, using symbolic models found in pre-existing fictitious or non-fictitious literature limits a child’s ability to ascribe those same attributes to children of race in their immediate environment. Additionally, children operating within concrete cognitive levels are likely to sort stimuli into simple or rigid models associated with characteristics found in literature (Bigler, 1999). Therefore, multicultural stories with ethnic characters in specific cultural domains will tend to reinforce differences among ethnic
groups (Bigler, 1999). Moreover, children with preconceived attitudes about other races may not adapt or bridge theoretical narratives into their own concrete reality. For example, a child listening to a book about a girl living in Japan may not engender a relationship between the storybook girl and the actual Japanese girl sitting in the next chair, nor may that actual girl be defined by a narrow, culturally-laden story.

In contrast, the present study uses developmentally appropriate intervention tools. The children produce and illustrate their own stories that are translated into the predominant languages spoken in the classroom. These personal stories emphasize the similarities among individuals rather than differences between groups (Bigler, 1999) and ascribe multi-attributes to children rather than single-set characteristics. They are used during a two-week intervention in cooperative learning activities children manipulate through active participation.

Another piece of the current research study was the use of photos for children to choose from when selecting whom they would most likely be friends with. Use of multi-ethnic photos as a sociometric modality is supported by LeVine’s (1978) finding that second- and fifth-grade children can accurately discriminate ethnicity from photographs. LeVine (1978) found that combing two measurement modes of photographic and sociometric instrumentation led to “sharper conclusions that results elicited from separate instrumentation analysis. Thus, the need for multi-instrumentation in ethnic choice research is demonstrated” (p. 187). LeVine (1978) found that in order of strength, Latinos, then Blacks, and then Whites chose same-race friendships.

With the current literature reviewed, the researchers for this study felt a need to determine cultural biases in elementary aged children. What follows is explanation of that study and how it was conducted.

Methods
The present study offers a robust design for evaluating racial play preferences and building community-centered classrooms. The approach consists of pre- and post-measurement of in-class race preferences with control and treatment classrooms over time and offers a variety of intervention strategies. It addresses tools that extend and personalize Jordan and Hernandez-Reif’s (2009) pre- and post-tests. The teachers targeted first through fourth grade children using Writer’s Workshop to assist students in writing and illustrating, for publication, their own story of a family celebration. The unique characteristic of this study is the translated pupil personal narratives used for intervention that can be adapted to other school aged classrooms.

This study examined the effect of community classroom interventions of translated pupil stories on pupils’ regard for peers of diverse races and/or ethnicity. As previously discussed, past research has shown that children select friends based on race, therefore, our hypothesis was that children’s baseline choice to interact with another child in close proximity would most often be a child of their own ethnicity. Therefore, our second hypothesis was that introducing children to the first language of their classmate in a literacy context that facilitated connections to similarities between their cultures would increase children’s choices to interact with another child in close proximity across ethnic lines.

Setting / Participants

This study was completed in two elementary schools in a mountain-west suburban school district in the state of Utah. The selection of the treatment classrooms was based on the student teaching classroom assignment of the three senior elementary education majors who spoke fluent Spanish and agreed to participate in the study. The control classrooms were chosen to match the grade level and demographics of the treatment groups, but also required a senior student teacher be assigned to administer the pre- and post-test for comparisons.
There were 93 children ranging in age from seven to ten who participated in our study. They were in six classrooms located in a mountain-west suburban school district. There was both a control and treatment group Second, Third, and Fourth Grades. Forty-nine were girls and 44 were boys. In the control group there were 13 Latino and 32 White children and the treatment group had eight Latino, one Black, one Asian, and 38 White children.

**Procedures**

**Instruments**

In order to collect the data, the researchers used the Bogardus Social Distance Scale created by E.S. Bogardus in 1926 at the University of Southern California. The scale was designed to investigate attitudes about tolerance for ethnic and/or racial diversity and consists of eight questions (Pohan & Aguilar, 2001). The scale was then modified to include five questions rather than eight (see Table 1). To avoid having the students in the study state an ethnicity as a preference, two sets of five pictures—one set boys and one set girls—were created to eliminate the factor of gender from student choice of preferred child. Each set of pictures included a picture of a child of Latino, Asian, African American, Pacific Island, and Caucasian heritage. Pictures were obtained from commercial picture websites that labeled the children by ethnic origin or from parents in the community who defined the ethnicity of the child in the photo. Each set of pictures had different children to control for participants seeing a favorite photo and selecting it for every question. Photos were head shots of equal size, child facing the camera with a slight smile and wide open eyes. Backgrounds of pictures were standardized. All pictures were in color. Every attempt was made to make all five photos equally appealing with the only dominant variable being ethnicity.

The photographs were placed on PowerPoint slides mixing the placement of each ethnicity such that they did not appear in the same position on a slide twice. The students were called to the back of the room one at a time by the student teacher who had worked with them at least a week
prior to the testing. The ethnicity of the child as reported by their parent on the parental consent form was recorded. The student made their selection by pointing to the picture on the computer screen to designate which child would prefer to participate with in five varied social settings. The peer-preference measure was re-administered at the end of the treatment period.

**Intervention**

In addition to the above described activity, the student teachers also engaged their students in a Writer’s Workshop. Student teachers assisted the students in their classroom to write a description of a favorite holiday tradition and to illustrate it in color. The stories were all written in English even though all children were given the option to write or dictate their stories in Spanish if that was their first language. All stories were translated into Spanish by a native Spanish speaker and published in a class book with the picture and both English and Spanish text. The class books were also provided to the student and classroom teachers as a PowerPoint file. The storybooks and PowerPoint files were then introduced in several ways in the various classrooms. In one room, the student teacher read each story aloud in both English and Spanish to the entire class. At first the Spanish-speaking children did not admit that they spoke or understood Spanish, but after a few stories were read, they began calling out words, and even correcting the student teacher’s pronunciation. The students were asked to guess whose story was being read and then to share if their own traditions were similar. As the children recognized the similarities, they participated more readily. The PowerPoint file was not used in this classroom.

In another classroom, the student teacher invited the children to read their stories from the class book during transition periods because the time was limited. After each student read, the student teacher asked if anyone had similar traditions. When the students were slow to answer, she prompted responses by posing questions such as, “Have you ever had a birthday party?” or “Do you visit your grandparents, too?,” etc. Again as the children started to recognize connections, they
eagerly participated. The Spanish-speaking children began to correct the student teacher’s pronunciation as she read the stories in Spanish. If she forgot to include the Spanish version, the children quickly reminded her to do so. The entire class was engaged, especially the Spanish-speaking children. The PowerPoint file was not used in this class either.

In the third intervention classroom, the student teacher took the students out in the hallway two at a time and had them take turns reading their stories from the PowerPoint file on a laptop computer. After the readings, the children responded to questions such as, “Do you have parties in your home?” or “Do you do some of the same things?” The student teacher said that the children were excited to describe the connections they had to their classmates’ stories. Next, she gathered the entire class together in a circle and invited the students to take turns sitting in “the author’s chair” and reading their stories first in English and then in Spanish. The children responded with interest and enthusiasm, easily identifying similarities with their classmates.

**Design**

The pretest-posttest control group design which controls for all the simple sources of invalidity was utilized. In this design two groups are employed, the treatment group, which receives the treatment and the control group which does not receive the treatment. The subjects in both groups are given a pretest and a posttest. The design for the pretest and posttest were a set of five pictures: one set of boys another set of girls. The Bogardus Social Distance Scale was modified to use five questions rather than eight. See table 1.

**Social Preference Scale. Table 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A1</th>
<th>To come to your birthday party</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B1</td>
<td>To play together on the playground</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C1</td>
<td>To work on a project at school</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
To be in your classroom

To be in your school

Study Participant Ethnicity. Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1=Latino</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>41.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2=Black</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3=Asian</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4=White</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>58.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5=Island</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Analysis

The data for this study was analyzed in both a qualitative and quantitative way. The purpose of this study was to gain an understanding of students’ social preferences regarding ethnicity. The study specifically focused on the effect of a community classroom intervention of translated pupil stories on pupils regard for peers of diverse races and/or ethnicities. It is considered that when children become more aware of things they have in common, their friendships cross racial barriers. Therefore, it was hypothesized that introducing students to the first language of their classmates, using literacy context connecting similarities between cultures, would increase students’ choices to interact with other students across racial barriers.

In order to examine students’ social preferences, we conducted non-parametric analyses. The most appropriate non-parametric test used was the Chi-Square Test of Independence. This test determines if two variables are independent of each other. Thus, the test would indicate that two variables are not independent, meaning the results are not due to chance. In using Chi-Square analysis the assumption is met when each cell in a specific test has an expected cell size (or N) of five or more. However, most statisticians allow for 20% of the cells to have less than five. Data were coded using SPSS, a statistical analysis software program. The data were reported in table
format. The Chi-Square analysis test is discussed to determine the significance as well as whether the size assumption was met.

The data from the modified Bogardus Social Distance Scale was also analyzed to determine the frequency students chose a particular photo, the most commonly chosen photo for each question by gender, and how often those choices corresponded with the student’s own ethnicity. The probability a child would choose a picture representing a particular ethnicity was calculated for all five questions and a comparison made by gender and age. A comparison of those calculated probabilities was made between Time 1 and Time 2 and between the control and treatment groups.

Results

The results were interesting in that they, for the most part, contradicted our initial hypothesis. In the beginning the researchers believed that students would choose friends based on others who shared similar ethnicities. What we found was that was not the case. When the choice of picture for each of the five questions was tested for Time 1 and Time 2 independently, there were no significant differences in those choices. In other words, there was no predictable pattern of ethnicity to the students’ choice of pictures. It also means that there was no change in the Chi Square from Time 1 in November and Time 2 in March. The student choices of pictures were equally unpredictable both times. This random pattern of choices held true with the comparison of choices from Grade 2, Grade 3, and Grade 4 and in a comparison of the control group with the experimental group. This sample of primarily White students chose a pictured child to invite to a birthday party, to play on the playground, to work on a class project or to be in their classroom or school randomly with no evidence of awareness of ethnic differences.

In Grade 2 our sample had two Latino children and 27 White children, in Grade 3 our sample had three Latino, one Black, one Asian, and 28 White children giving our sample almost no
diversity and very small numbers of ethnically diverse students in each classroom. However, in our 4th Grade sample, we had 15 Latino children and 22 White children, a much more balanced number of Latino and White children. Even with this balance in diversity, there were no significant differences in the students’ choices of pictures for four or our five questions. Only for the question, ‘Who would you choose to play with you on the playground?’ Latinos selected another Latino 30% of the time and Whites chose another White 32.6% of the time. This similarity in in-grouping choice was more than random with a Chi Square of 9.2 (p<.05). Even more interesting, Latinos chose the picture of a White child 6.7% of the time while the White child chose a Latino 20.9% of the time.

Based on these findings we only found one of the questions, question 4 about the playground, where there were any significance of ethnicity chose and it was only in the 4th Grade classes. None of the other questions asked showed any pattern of who children would choose to play with or spend time with. These findings can seen in the following tables outlining the percentages of the choses in both the control and treatment classrooms. Some grades show slight differences but the only one the researchers identified as “significant” were those of Grade 4.

Although the quantitative results of the intervention were not significant, the student teachers who participated in the control group were interviewed after the intervention. All three described the intervention as positive and meaningful for their students and said that they would definitely use student-generated tradition stories in their future classrooms. One student teacher said that she felt the intervention validated dual languages, even in some instances championed the minority language. She said that after the intervention, she noticed that the Spanish-speaking children spoke their native language more freely and seemed much happier. Another student teacher said that she wished she would have had time to more fully incorporate additional activities connected to the stories such as bingo, wall charts, etc. She also said that in the future she planned
to initiate the intervention early in the school year so that the children could reap the benefit of connection-making sooner.

The cooperating teachers were also interviewed. All agreed that the intervention was positive. They said that they liked the idea of writing about traditions and felt like the students enjoyed sharing their experiences and identifying similarities.

**Discussion**

The initial findings of this exploratory study indicate the need for more in-depth research. Despite the differences found in the 4th grade with regard to the question of who students would invite to a birthday party, there were really no significant changes from Time 1 and Time 2. Whether this trend continues and the racial preferences become more distinct, and whether interventions such as translated stories, help to minimize racial or ethnic separations, has yet to be studied.

One thing these findings tell us is that there was no sign of ethnicity preference when choosing friends from the beginning. This tells us two things. One, the instrument that was used (i.e., the adaptation of the Bogardus Scale) was consistent between Time 1 and Time 2. If children did not show a bias of who they would play with in Time 1 then they wouldn’t necessarily show any bias in Time 2. This instrument seems to be a good indicator of measuring how children go about choosing with whom they will be friends.

What do findings tell us then? Does this mean that the younger generation is becoming more tolerant and accepting of others who look different than them? Possibility. Perhaps this is the new direction in which future research should go.

**Conclusion**

The purpose of this study was to gain an understanding of how elementary students go about choosing their friends and whether or not ethnicity plays a role in that choice. The study specifically
focused on the effect of a community classroom intervention of translated pupil stories on pupils’ regard for peers of diverse races and/or ethnicities. It was hoped that as students become more aware of things they have in common, their friendships would cross racial barriers. By allowing students to read stories from their classmates in their classmates first language, we hoped to see new friendships develop.

Although the intervention did not produce the evidence of the researchers’ initial hypotheses, the fact that little bias in whom children would play with is significant in and of itself. More research in this area is important and needed. The researchers plan to revamp the study and look at more school districts, that perhaps have more of an ethnically diverse population, to implement the study.

There are multiple limitations to this particular study which we believe led to the lack of a significant findings. These limitations include small sample size as well as the lack of ethnic diversity in the sampled population. Also, a limitation which was found was the lack of time the student teachers who participated in the study and collected the data in the classrooms actually had to work with the elementary students and develop authentic uses of the literary stories. These students were very busy with their own course work and with fulfilling their requirements of student teaching in the field. This lack of time might have contributed to the lack of significant findings.

In the future, the researchers of this study plan to spend more time with those who will be implementing the treatment to better train them in how to administer the intervention. We hope to continue to learn how we can better help students choose friends more based on commonalities rather than strictly ethnic similarities. With our ever growing diverse population, it is essential teachers help their students to accept and befriend all those with whom they will associate in their classrooms.
References


U.S. Census Bureau, *American Fact Finder*. Retrieved from [http://factfinder.census.gov/servlet/STTable?geo_id=04000US49&qr_name=ACS_2007_1YR_G00_S0501&ds_name=ACS_2007_1YR_G00](http://factfinder.census.gov/servlet/STTable?geo_id=04000US49&qr_name=ACS_2007_1YR_G00_S0501&ds_name=ACS_2007_1YR_G00)

