Judging a Book by its Cover: An Evaluation Tool for the Evaluation, Selection and Inclusion of Multicultural Children’s Literature in the Elementary Classroom

Suzanne Schultz

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree
Master of Science in Education

School of Education and Counseling Psychology
Dominican University of California
San Rafael, CA
July 2010
Acknowledgements

I want to thank my professors Dr. Madalienne Peters and Dr. Sarah Zykanov, for the extensive amount of time, support and encouragement they have provided me over the last 6 months. Thank you also to all of my Dominican teachers who have contributed to a truly remarkable learning experience. A special thanks to my classmates, Lindsay Hess, Katie King and Ashley Williams I would not be here without you. The last two years have been an unbelievable ride and I am grateful we made it together. Finally I wish to acknowledge my family and friends that made this truly possible. My most heartfelt thanks go out to my friends and fellow teachers Maria Bruner and Christina Greenburg who believed in me and went out of their way to support me. To my family especially my parents I am eternally grateful for their constant emotional and financial support as well as their endless patience while I was finding my way. To my best friend and more, Tehran Palmer, it was your inspiration and unwavering belief in my abilities that led me to begin this incredible journey and brought me to this point. Finally to my son Kai, thank you for sacrificing your precious time with me and for an endless supply of hugs, smiles and laughter. This was all for you.
# Table of Contents

Title Page ........................................................................................................................................... 1
Acknowledgements................................................................................................................................. 2
Table of Contents .................................................................................................................................. 3
Abstract ................................................................................................................................................ 4
Chapter 1 Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 5
  Statement of Problem ......................................................................................................................... 6
  Purpose Statement ............................................................................................................................... 6
  Research Questions ............................................................................................................................ 7
  Theoretical Rationale ......................................................................................................................... 7
  Assumptions ...................................................................................................................................... 8
  Background and Need ......................................................................................................................... 9
Chapter 2 Review of the Literature ...................................................................................................... 13
  Defining Multicultural Education and Literature ............................................................................ 13
  Effects of Multicultural Literature .................................................................................................... 16
  Using Multicultural Literature in the Classroom ............................................................................. 18
  Multicultural Literature Selection and Evaluation ......................................................................... 22
Chapter 3: Method ................................................................................................................................. 30
  Research Design ............................................................................................................................... 30
  Sample and Site ................................................................................................................................. 30
  Access and Permissions .................................................................................................................... 31
  Data Gathering Strategies ................................................................................................................ 31
  Ethical Standards ............................................................................................................................... 31
Chapter 4 Findings ................................................................................................................................. 33
  Description of Individuals, Data ....................................................................................................... 33
  Interview .......................................................................................................................................... 34
Chapter 5 Discussion ............................................................................................................................... 36
  Summary of Major Findings .............................................................................................................. 36
  Selecting and Evaluating Authentic and Accurate Multicultural Children’s Literature ............... 37
    Judging a book by its cover: Art Work and Illustration ................................................................. 37
    Questions to ask while evaluating .................................................................................................. 37
    Authors and Stories ......................................................................................................................... 38
  Strategies for Inclusion and Sharing Multicultural Children’s Literature ....................................... 41
  Limitations/Gaps in the Literature ..................................................................................................... 42
  Implications for Future Research ..................................................................................................... 43
  Overall Significance of the Literature .............................................................................................. 43
References ............................................................................................................................................. 45
Abstract

Today’s elementary classrooms are made up of a representation of all cultures, races, religions, ethnicities and abilities. The reading instruction of elementary students should equally represent the demographics of our rapidly growing student population. Students are not being provided with an equal education through a lack of accurate and authentic literature in the classroom. The portrayal of our diverse society is limited in the elementary curriculum due to the lack of knowledge and access of multicultural literature by elementary teachers.

This study is an extensive literature review including an interview with an expert in children’s literature and reading instruction. The research findings are synthesized to provide an evaluation model for teachers to use in evaluating and selecting multicultural children’s literature for inclusion into their classroom and reading curriculums.
Chapter 1 Introduction

I first became interested in researching multicultural literature during my student teaching assignment. I found that most of the reading materials lacked legitimate content of multiculturalism. The core literature for the third grade classroom consisted of: Charlotte’s Web by E.B White, James and the Giant Peach by Roald Dahl and Stone Fox by John Reynolds Gardiner. The adopted textbook offered occasional stories that featured female and culturally or linguistically diverse characters, however they were largely generic offerings of one-dimensional characters that often reinforced popular stereotypes. Of the historical characters and events depicted the majority of the stories focused on although well-known, overly used historical figures such as Martin Luther King Junior and Jackie Robinson that lacked the authenticity of the actual events and did not provide a variety of experiences within a particular cultural group.

While this individual school’s demographic is suburban, largely upper-middle class and white, it is equally important for all children to read and explore multicultural materials not just students of ethnic “so called minority” backgrounds. It would also benefit immensely the few students with culturally or linguistically diverse backgrounds in the school to be able to place a value on their experiences and bring a better sense of community to the classroom. It was this experience that developed my ultimate goal within this research project to determine the need and effects of multicultural literature in
the elementary classroom and to offer teachers an evaluation tool for the selection and inclusion of multicultural children’s literature.

Statement of Problem

Culturally and linguistically diverse students are not receiving equal instruction that optimizes student achievement in reading and their teachers are either unable or lack knowledge in selecting appropriate and authentic multicultural children’s literature for their classrooms. It is necessary to teach content that is culturally relevant to validate each student’s previous experiences. By not including multiple perspective authors and stories into the curriculum the students are not being equally taught to think critically, create personal connections to the learning process or value the ideas of all people.

Purpose Statement

The purpose of this study is to explore the use of multicultural children’s literature, the amount of access students have to multicultural literature and how teachers select authentic and appropriate multicultural children’s literature for their classrooms. “The primary goal of culturally relevant teaching is to empower students to examine critically the society in which they live and to work for social change” (Ladson-Billings, 1992, pg. 314).
Research Questions

What purpose does multicultural literature serve within the elementary classroom, do teachers include multicultural literature in the curriculum and do they possess the knowledge to accurately evaluate authentic multicultural literature?

Theoretical Rationale

Multicultural literature has the ability to provide all students with multiple points of view and helps to build toward the idea of equal education for all students. An education is not truly equal if one group of students’ background has dominance on the literature curriculum. It is the United States constitutions 14th amendment that guarantees equal protection and opportunities under the law. In a finding by the United State Supreme Court, Lau v. Nichols, all children regardless of race, class, gender, or immigration status are to be afforded the same equal opportunity and access for a public education. “Justice Douglas wrote, "Simple justice requires that public funds, to which all taxpayers of all races contribute, not be spent in any fashion which encourages, entrenches, subsidizes, or results in racial discrimination." (http://www.nabe.org) In order to guarantee equal education all students must be given the same opportunities to learn, have their ideas valued, be taught to think critically through exposure to multiple perspectives and taught in a learning environment that creates active citizenship and cultural understanding. These opportunities are all provided for with the inclusion of multicultural literature in the elementary literary canon.
Multicultural literature provides students from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds the opportunity to relate to experiences similar to their own and validate their own cultures while at the same time enables the rest of the mainstream students to gain an appreciation of cultural differences and helps to eliminate the ethnocentric dominance of white culture. Dowd (1992) states, "...from reading, hearing, and using culturally diverse materials, young people learn that beneath surface differences of color, culture or ethnicity, all people experience universal feelings of love, sadness, self-worth, justice and kindness." (p. 220) Multicultural children’s literature will be an effective means of bringing all students of diverse background to a high level of literacy achievement by creating meaningful and engaging connections to the materials.

Assumptions

That there is not enough access and exposure to authentic multicultural literature in elementary classroom. Multicultural literature and other reading materials will develop critical thinking and meaningful purpose by connecting the literature to the student’s previous experiences and validating their own cultural identity.

Teachers are not taught how to effectively evaluate and select authentic multicultural literature or lack the resources to do so effectively. Teachers of all backgrounds/race/gender can successfully teach culturally responsive literature to all students and need to hold the same high expectations for all students.
Background and Need

The historic 1954 court decision, Brown v. Board of Education, although not the first legal challenge to racial segregation, led to the deconstruction of racial segregation in schools and other public areas. African American parents challenged school segregation as early as 1849, “In the first documented school desegregation case, Roberts vs. City of Boston, 1849, the courts denied Benjamin Roberts and other African American parents the right to enroll their children in certain Boston public schools.” (brownvboard.org) It was not until the Brown v. Board of Education decision led by the NAACP, in a class action suit, that racial segregation was ultimately ruled in violation of the 14th amendment of the constitution, which grants all citizens equal protection under the law. It was this landmark decision that set into play dramatic educational reform and helped support and lead the American civil rights movement.

The roots of the term multicultural education began to take hold through action by African Americans during the civil rights movements of the 1960s. Early researchers of multicultural literature included “Baker (1977), Banks (1973), Gay (1971), and Grant (1973, 1978) each played significant roles in the formulation and development of multicultural education in the United States.” (Banks, p.19) Banks states that the current multicultural education movement while beginning in the 1960s was based openly from the “early ethnic studies movement initiated by scholars such as Williams (1882-1883) and continued by individuals such as DuBois (1935), Woodson (1919/1968), Bond (1939), and Wesley (1935).” (Banks, p. 19)
Women’s rights groups also joined in during the late 1960s and 1970s to protest the discrepancies and inequalities between female administrators compared the numbers of female teachers. “Activists, community leaders, and parents called for curricular reform and insisted on a reexamination of hiring practices.” (Gorski, p.1) By the 1980s other historically marginalized groups, including “Latinos, Asian Americans, Native Americans, disabled, gay and lesbians and the elderly” also began to join in the move for curricular reform. (Harris, Sims-Bishop, p. 1) Experts from these other ethnic groups included Carlos Cortez, Sonia Neito, Jack Forbes, and Derald W. Sue. (Banks, 1993)

Over the past three decades multicultural education and multicultural literature has evolved and countless experts, educators and researchers have proven “the unique ability of multicultural literature in improving the reading skills of minority and at risk children.” (Pirofski, paragraph 1) Pirofski also went on to cite research by early pioneer Viola Florez – Tigue, who demonstrated that culturally authentic children's literature improved the language development and thought processes of African-American students. It should also be noted that Neito’s (1992) definition of multicultural maintains that multicultural education and multicultural literature is for all students not only those that have been marginalized.

Despite the vast amount of research and data that has established the effectiveness that multicultural literature provides for all students, the inclusion of multicultural literature into the children’s literary canon has remained minimal. It is certainly not equivalent to the growing diverse population of our country. In fact the current
demographics of the state of California’s k-12 student enrollment according to the National Center for Education Statistics are: White: 29.4% which is a decline from 42% in 1994, Black: 7.7%, Hispanic: 50.2%, Asian/Pacific Islander: 11.9%, American Indian/Alaskan Native: 0.8%. There are 6,343,471 students enrolled in public schools, 75% of those students attend title one schools and 51% receive free or reduced lunch.

The NCES also reports that California has a NAEP rank of 46 out of 50 in reading achievement among 4th graders. It is a reasonable assumption to conclude that based on the current demographic of California students in comparison to the NAEP ranking, alternate methods of reading instruction and inclusion of additional multicultural literature and culturally responsive instruction, reflective of the student population, should be explored further.

A problem also exists in lack of publishing of children’s multicultural literature by non-white authors, and the literature that has been published is frequently historically inaccurate and dominated with stereotypes that are hurtful and unauthentic. This is discussed in greater detail in the literature review section of this research paper.

As pointed out by Gay (1992) there is a large discrepancy in the amount of data collected on the subject in comparison to the actual application of multicultural literature. Teachers “need more time as well as a variety of instructional materials.” (Banks, p.33) Furthermore, teachers also need more knowledge of what culturally authentic literature exists and how to accurately select and critique the literature they are using in the classroom.
While equality in education has undergone drastic changes over the past 60 years some invisible barriers still remain within the education system that unequally target students based on race, class, gender and ability. Racial segregation still exists largely in many schools due to socio-economics of the area in which the schools are located. The demographics of the United States and California have also undergone a dramatic change of its own. With an increasing number of students from culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds attending public schools, these demographic trends have and will continue to impact the way in which we need to run our education systems and how we educate our children.
Chapter 2 Review of the Literature

The purpose of this literature review is to research relevant information on the effects of multicultural children’s literature and how or if it is being used in the elementary classroom. I am using the theories and information gathered by experts and authors in the field to explore and determine the significance of multicultural literature with Elementary students. Through my research the following themes were commonly addressed:

- **Defining Multicultural Education**: What is multicultural education? What is multicultural literature?
- **Effects of Multicultural Literature**: How using multicultural literature in reading instruction addresses or meets the needs of students and creates greater achievement in reading interest and acquisition.
- **Using Multicultural Literature in the Classroom**: What have research and case studies revealed about using multicultural literature in the classroom.
- **Selection and Evaluation of Multicultural Literature**: The importance in selection and evaluation of literature that is authentic, free of bias and stereotypes, that contains historically and culturally accurate portrayals of characters of all races, genders and abilities.

The findings in this review consist of a wide range of articles from reading journals, educational journals, interviews and books. The materials were located through; Internet searches, library journal and book databases, professional reading organizations, and through references of earlier articles.

**Defining Multicultural Education and Literature**

Neito (1992) in her book Affirming Diversity, defines multicultural education as follows:

> The process of comprehensive school reform and basic education for all students. It challenges and rejects racism and other forms of discrimination in schools and society and accepts and affirms the pluralism (ethnic, racial, linguistic, religious,
economic and gender among others) that students, their communities, and
teachers represent. Multicultural education permeates the curriculum and
instructional strategies used in schools, as well as the interactions among teachers,
students, and parents, and the very way that schools conceptualize the nature of
 teaching and learning. Because it uses critical pedagogy as its underlying
philosophy and focuses on knowledge, reflection and action (praxis) as the basis
for social change, multicultural education furthers the democratic principles of
social justice (pg 208)

Multicultural environments are important for children from the dominant group in order
to feel secure about who they are without the need to feel superior to others (Derman-
Sparks & Ramsey, 2006). “For non-dominant group members, the goal is to be able to
participate fully in both their home culture and society” (Chen, 2009, pg. 111)

Authors such as Al-Hazza (2010), Norton (1990) and Barta and Grindler, (1996)
expressed the importance of including multicultural literature so children are give then
opportunity to learn to value all cultures, recognize and appreciate differences and
promote understanding of cultures different from their own that exist in our society.
When the use of dominant cultural groups that are used predominantly in the classroom
and only a few stories of non “mainstream” culture are included with little or no
discussion of cultural values and traditions, it enables the children of culturally and
linguistically diverse backgrounds to begin to question the values of their culture, and
how they are viewed by the dominant mainstream society and the community in which
they interact. (Al-Hazza, 2010)

The use of children's literature can serve as a significant tool in helping expose
children to the ways others express their culture. Multicultural literature focuses
on people of color, regional cultures, religious minorities, the disabled, or the
aged or describes female perspectives or issues (Harris, 1992). It reflects multiple perspectives of culturally diverse authors. (p. 269)

In a speech given by Au (1993) at the Annual Meeting of the National Reading Conference, she uses three characteristics to define students of diverse backgrounds: “ethnicity or cultural background, socioeconomic status, and primary language” (Au, 1993) The social confidence that is promoted through multicultural literature and culturally responsive teaching is echoed by Carpenter (2000 pg. 15) in detailing how historical facts that are taught in the mainstream curriculum often overlook the achievements of people of color and women. In the United States, culturally and linguistically diverse students are seen as African American, Latino American, or Native American (Au 2002). Banks (1993) additionally includes Asian/Pacific Islander, women, disabled, gays and lesbians and the elderly. This is based on all whom felt victimized, oppressed or discriminated against in someway by the dominant majority. It is taken into account that these groupings minimize the subgroups that make up each of these ethnic groups. For the sake of this review the main point will be the focus on the “mainstream” dominance of students of culturally and linguistically diverse backgrounds and their reading achievement (Au, 2002).

For literature to truly be multicultural it should not only represent the “The Other” – people “other” than the white middle class because that then reinforces and helps maintain outdated social patterns categorizing the American white middle class as the “norm”, and all others as “multicultural”(Bishop, 1997, pg 3). The literature in effect
should be multicultural by full inclusion of all backgrounds. While the real necessity for multicultural or culturally responsive teaching has been previously outlined it should also be taken into consideration that unless it follows the theories presented students will not gain the proper insight that is desired. As demonstrated by Hoffman (1996) when students, “are encouraged to look at culture through the lens of categories that are familiar to them, assuming that needs, wants, and so forth are basically the same no matter where one goes. Rather than teach students to challenge such assumptions and to look critically at how they shape their own and others’ thinking and behavior, this exercise simply reinforces the categories, values, and world-views that are already in place. (p. 552)

Effects of Multicultural Literature

For the sake of this literature review I have narrowed down the “effects” of multicultural literature into three categories: comprehension, critical thinking and reading motivation "[a] basic assumption is that what people are taught to read is as significant as the fact that they read" (Ladson-Billings, 2000, p. 141).

Comprehension at a basic level is being able to understand the meaning of the text. Meanings can then differ in some instances between readers based upon how the reader perceives the information based on their background knowledge and experiences. Experts on reading instruction have stated “it is also important to teach students to activate prior knowledge before, during, and after reading (Gordon & Pearson, 1983; Pearson et al.,
1992), perhaps by encouraging readers to relate to or connect with the text ” (Keene & Zimmermann, 1997, pg. 65). This relates directly to the use of multicultural literature in increasing the comprehension of students from linguistic or culturally diverse backgrounds by providing them with literary materials that are relevant to their cultural experiences.

If we view reading not as comprehending existing messages, but interpreting certain signs with which we have a relationship that includes experience, culture and value, we can see readers as becoming more powerful interpreters of their reading and of their world (Hade as cited in Harris, 1997, pg. 247).

Critical thinking is reached deeply through multicultural literature. Ladson-Billings (2000) pointed out that "the primary goal of culturally relevant teaching is to empower students to examine critically the society in which they live and to work for social change" (p. 142). Hade along with Baker (2001) express the idea that comprehension is used to help develop critical thinking and that critical reading is used to, “help question, analyze, problem solve, compare and contrast, and evaluate the literature they read with their own world views” (p. 143).

Student choice in reading selections was another common finding in creating reading interest and increasing comprehension. Authors such as Wigfield and Glenn-Paul found that reading is an effortful activity that often involves choice and plays a crucial role to reading engagement (Wigfield, p. 299). “Among the instructional elements that the report recommends are increasing motivation and self-directed learning by allowing student choice during free reading and including texts relevant to students’
lives” (Wigfield, Pg 234). Glenn- Paul found that, “…once my students felt that their own lives and cultures had been validated, they were more willing and interested in examining texts that featured characters, both Anglo, and from other diverse groups.” (Harris, 1997 p. 266).

Using Multicultural Literature in the Classroom

Throughout this common theme I have collected information and research on how teachers should approach multicultural literature and multicultural education. I will also be presenting a comparison of two case studies, the comparison consists of one case study that uses culturally responsive or multicultural literacy instruction practices and one case study that does not.

Teachers must know how to draw on students’ culture as a basis for learning, capitalizing on students’ prior knowledge, and seeing their culture not as an impediment to learning but rather as the means through which students can learn (Chen, 2009)

This means being able to apply this knowledge to everyday classroom practices. The teacher is patient, curious, and eager to learn about the students, and sees them as individuals as well as part of the group (Nieto, 1999). Au writes, "There should not be a different set of standards for students of diverse backgrounds, but there should be a recognition that these students may require more powerful instruction and additional time to meet the standards" (Au, 2000 p. 844).

When looking specifically at two case studies presented by Barone (2002) and Ladson-Billings (1992) both featured schools that were considered at risk and compared
two different classrooms/teachers in their articles, although Ladson-Billings initial research included eight classrooms. Both articles featured classrooms that were considered at risk, or contained children considered to come from minority or low-income backgrounds.

In the case of Barone (2002) “Howard Elementary School is considered at-risk because of the students who are enrolled in it. These children come largely from poor families who are often minorities and have a home language that is not English.“ (p. 416). Barone conducted a yearlong study of two kindergarten classrooms on the west coast. The classrooms had 15 children that were labeled as “culturally and linguistically diverse”. One classroom contained 8 of these students and 7 were in the other kindergarten classroom. Barone observed the children in their classroom settings as well as interviews with teachers, parents, and evaluation of student work. None of the students received ESL or special education support. The children were read to daily and both included take home books, shared reading, and independent reading. The article does not identify what types of stories were read to the children. However teachers failed to include interactions and conversations about the stories with the children. By the end of her study only 4 of the 15 focus students had developed into beginning readers. The students participated in very few opportunities to display their voice and did not design instruction that was based on the student’s needs and background knowledge. “At the end of the year when I asked each teacher for her view of the school year, all thought that they had "done [their] best with the kind of children who [were] zoned to [their] school.”
(p. 430) This is in direct conflict with the assumptions and beliefs that Barone (2002) had entering the school that she,

…values teaching that includes the voices of students as well as the voice of the teacher. Teachers provide the most appropriate instruction for children when they assess the knowledge that children bring to the classroom and develop instruction based on the students' strengths...(pg. 417)

In the case presented by Gladson-Billings she studied eight teachers’ classrooms in a small predominately Black elementary school district in northern California. In this article she presents a comparison between two of these teachers/classrooms. Both teachers grew up in the district, attended school together growing up and have many mutual friends as well.

The first teacher she reviews is Ann Lewis (names have all been changed) a white, Italian American, and sixth grade teacher. The class consists of 29 students including 17 African Americans, 9 Mexican Americans, 2 Pacific Islanders, and 1 Vietnamese. The class has 16 boys, 9 of whom are African Americans, and 13 girls, 8 of whom are African Americans.” During her observations she witnessed the students read multicultural story about an African American girl and her father who is in the Vietnam War. The teacher promotes discussion, sharing of ideas and opinions, in most cases it is the boys who dominate the conversation. Anne embraces that all of her students as capable and encourages them. She ties in the story of the Vietnam War to the then current event of the Gulf War, and she helped and encouraged the students to express their fears and opinions. This aspect is particularly important as it is noted by many experts including Gladson-
Billings, that the culturally relevant teaching and multicultural literature is to empower students and encourage critical thinking. The students created paper cranes like in the story they read as their protest to stopping the war.

Gladson-Billing next reviewed, teacher Julia Devereaux, an African American who teaches 4th grade. Julia has, “25 students, 21 of whom are African Americans (12 girls and 9 boys) and 4 of whom are Latinos.” (p. 316) She voluntarily moved to the district to teach a “back to basics” approach where her literature is preselected. By order of the school she does not have reading groups but seats the students in ways inclusive to their reading levels. Because of the mandates on her school she relies heavily on her textbook and uses vocabulary instruction and read alouds. She does take the time to discuss and develop a purpose for reading the story. “Julia's teaching appears more discrete than Ann's, that is, she makes clear distinctions among activities such as reading, spelling, writing, and mathematics” (p. 316).

However despite the technical differences in literacy instruction between the two teachers “both Ann's and Julia's classrooms are literate and performing on grade level.” (p. 316) The reason is “In both of the classrooms, the teachers legitimate African American (and Latino) culture by making it a frame of reference for all texts.” In both examples the teachers discussed and read about the issues of race and culture, In Julia’s case this was done through supplemental read alouds. This case study demonstrates that different approaches to literacy can be taken and still be successful and that while multicultural literature is essential that it needs to be used in a culturally responsive
environment and the benefits of multicultural literature will not always have positive outcomes on its own without the proper discussion and support of the issues being related within the literature.

Multicultural Literature Selection and Evaluation

There were three major themes about the selection and evaluation process of multicultural literature that was discovered through my literary research. The first being that teachers should first begin with evaluating their own “diversity practices” (Chen 2009, pg. 103) As Chen (2009) and Osbourn (1996) discuss the need to look at our own beliefs and practices, “recognition of ones internal attitudes, assumptions and history leads to the deeper levels for transformational practice” (Chen, 2009).

The findings of Chen and Osbourn are further supported by the racial demographics of teachers in the State of California. According to the National Center for Education Statistics in 2007–08, some 76 percent of public school teachers in California were female, over 70% are identified themselves as White. These statistics show that teachers are far more likely to be white than the general student population. As previously stated in my assumptions I believe that teachers of a different racial or linguistic background from their students can still be effective and successful. However, as Osbourn suggests we, “…need to be aware of our own subjectivities first. By subjectivity I mean the ways of making sense of the world that emanate from our ethnic, gender, and class backgrounds” (p. 293).
The second theme was a lack of knowledge by teachers on how to select and include authentic multicultural literature into their curriculum. In a study conducted by Stallworth, et al (2006) 142 English teachers in the state of Alabama were interviewed on their experiences with multicultural literature. During the study teachers “narrative responses” stated that teachers lacked experience and knowledge as the largest “prohibitor” of the selection of multicultural literature in their curriculum. “… teachers reported that their own lack of knowledge about multicultural literature restricted their curricular choices.” (p. 485) The survey’s collected responses showed two “categories” of responses either teachers who claimed inexperience and did not include multicultural literature or those who claimed to use multicultural literature, however the titles listed of the literature used lacked authenticity and did not meet the definition of true multicultural literature.

Finally the last theme in the research and readings was the access or lack there of to authentic multicultural literature. As previously stated there is a problem in the lack of authentic multicultural children’s literature in the publishing industry. The Children’s Cooperative Book Center in association with the American Library Association reported that approximately 5,000 children’s books were published in 2009. Of these 5,000 books published 83 were written by Black authors while a total of 157 books were written about Blacks/African Americans by an author of a different racial background. American Indian authors comprised just 12 of these books with a total of 33 books published about American Indians. Of the 80 books published about Asian/Pacific Islanders, Asian
authors wrote 67 of these books. While Latino students make up the largest student population in California and the fastest growing population in the country, only 61 of the 5,000 books published were about Latinos, although Latino Authors wrote 60 of those books. Based on the information collected by the CCBC the total number of “multicultural” children’s books being published is 331 of 5,000 for a total of just 15% of all children’s books. Further more this figure does not take into account if the literature represents authentic and accurate information, characters, and pictures. With only 15% of all children’s books published per year written by or about people of color it does not equally match the approximately 71% of student population in California, that are from culturally or linguistically diverse backgrounds. While there is still an unequal amount of literature available an increase in quality literature over the last few years has provided teachers the ability to “…make multicultural libraries a reality for all classrooms” (Sims-Bishop as cited in Harris, 1997, p. 7).

The Cooperative Children’s Book Center (CCBC) is a research library at the school of Education at the University of Wisconsin- Madison. Their book collections consist of current, and historical books for children and young adult readers. The CCBC, established in 1963, supports the research, learning and teaching related to children’s literature and was It is available for use by any adults who have an academic, professional or career interest in children and young adult literature. (www.education.wisc.edu/ccbc/about/default.asp) The CCBC has many special collections including a multicultural booklist titled “50 Multicultural Books Every Child
Should Know”. The CCBS defines multicultural literature as, “…books by and about people of color: African and African Americans, American Indians, Asian/Pacific and Asian Pacific Americans, and Latinos.” In the definition I previously introduced from Sonia Nieto and James Banks, multicultural literature may also include gender, ability and sexual orientation. The CCBC also offers lists on community, gender, and sexual orientation that offer additional titles that can be determined to be multicultural based on my previously accepted definition of multicultural literature. “We strive to integrate multicultural literature into all of our work here at the CCBC. All of our bibliographies include books by and about people of color.”

(CCBC:www.education.wisc.edu/ccbc/books/multicultural.asp)

The multicultural reading list provided by the CCBC introduces a variety of authentic multicultural children’s books by a various range of authors. The 50 books are broken down into sub-sections based on the age of reader.

Preschool


Heo, Yumi. One Afternoon. Orchard, 1994. Ages 2 - 4


**Ages 5-7**


Pinkney, Sandra L. *Shades of Black: A Celebration of Our Children*. Illustrated by


**Ages 7-9**


Alarcon, Francisco X. *From the Bellybutton of the Moon, and Other Summer Poems / Del ombligo de la luna, y otros poemas de verano*. Illustrated by Maya Christina Gonzalez. Children's Book Press, 1998. 32 pages. Ages 7 - 10


Ages 9-12


This list from the Cooperative Children's Book Center, School of Education, University of Wisconsin-Madison was compiled by Ginny Moore Kruse and Kathleen T. Horning, and was last updated in 2010. While these books have been evaluated as being authentic multicultural literature and are categorized into recommended age groups it is important that teachers should still familiarize themselves with the subjects in the literature and select appropriate literature for their classrooms based on their students individual needs and development levels.
Chapter 3: Method

Research Design

The purpose of this study was to determine the outcome of multicultural children’s literature in the elementary classroom and amount of teacher’s knowledge and expertise in evaluating and selecting multicultural literature for the curriculum in the elementary classroom. My research design combined an extended literature review with an interview of an expert in the field of reading instruction and children’s literature along with classroom observations as a parent and as a student teacher.

The design is beneficial because it was created using successfully proven evaluation and selection of core reading literature combined with strategies and guidelines helpful in selecting multicultural literature. In using this tool you will learn how to evaluate and select the literature and also learn ways to successfully implement multicultural children’ literature into the classroom curriculum. Through a series of questions and implementation strategies you will be able to create well rounded reading instruction that will promote and develop deeper critical thinking and comprehension skills for all students.

Sample and Site

My research consisted of an extended literature review as well as an interview with an expert in the area of reading instruction to develop an evaluation and selection
model to serve as a guideline for teachers to use in selecting multicultural children’s literature for use in the elementary classroom.

Access and Permissions

The interviewee was given consent forms approved by Dominican University of California’s institutional review board that clearly stated the goals and purpose of this study. All subjects were voluntary and were insured of their anonymity and that all information will remain confidential. Names of people, schools and other identifying characteristics were changed or omitted to protect the privacy of those interviewed.

Data Gathering Strategies

The person interviewed were selected for their expertise in reading instruction. The interview was conducted by phone and the interviewee has vast experiences in the selection of literature at the elementary school level. In addition to interviews I used three published books or articles on reading selection and evaluation of reading materials for my evaluation tool. One model was directly related to selection of multicultural literature and the other two were based on models for selecting general core literature, not otherwise specified.

Ethical Standards

All procedures are in line with local, state and federal guidelines and regulations is regard to the use of human subjects. All authors of the books and articles used within
my model were cited and quoted accurately in accordance to APA style and copyright laws. The study also followed the ethical principles in the conduct of research with human subjects as set forth by the Dominican University of California IRBPHS Handbook.
Chapter 4 Findings

Description of Individuals, Data

The goal of this study was to explore the outcomes of multicultural literature in the elementary classroom and to determine teacher’s knowledge in the selection and implementation of multicultural children’s literature in the curriculum. The literature and programs used for my model were: The Essential Guide to Selecting and Using Core Reading Programs By Dewitz, et al, From Cover to Cover Evaluating and Reviewing Children’s Books by Kathleen Horning and Using Multiethnic Literature in the K-8 Classroom by Editor V. Harris, et al., Dewitz provides a historical background on selecting core reading program, how reading programs are created and how to implement them with the best outcomes in the classroom. I used this literature in helping to shape and develop the implementation portion of my evaluation tool. Hornings, “Cover to Cover” includes advise in selection of genres, development of characters and settings and how to evaluate picture books and illustrations. Her literature was used extensively in writing the questionnaire portion of the guidelines particularly in evaluating the illustration and artwork and the character development of the evaluation tool. Horning is the director of the Cooperative Children’s Book Center of the School of Education at the University of Wisconsin–Madison. She was a contributing member to the multicultural booklist that was detailed earlier in this paper. Harris’ using multicultural literature in the
K-8 Classroom was used in determining many of the questions and examples used in the questionnaire portion of the evaluation tool. This book contains articles written by a collection of authors that are experts in various aspects of multicultural literature and multicultural education. My literature review included the works by Sims-Bishop “Selecting Literature for a Multicultural Curriculum”, Harris, “Children’s Literature Depicting Blacks”, Barreta “Mexican American Literature in the 1990’s”, Debbie Reese, “Native Americans in Children’s Literature”, Glenn-Paul’s, Toward Developing a Multicultural Perspective”, Cheryl Willis Hudson’s “Creating Good Books for Children: A Black Publisher’s Perspective.”

Interview

I was able to interview an expert in the area of reading instruction and children’s literature to add to my evaluation tool. Her background includes teaching numerous grades from 1st – 8th grade, reading specialist instructor, and principal. She is now a reading specialist and teacher education instructor. She began her teaching career at the High School level. Troubled by meeting students at who could not read and lacking knowledge in reading instruction, she returned to school to learn how to teach reading. Although she does not specialize directly in multicultural literature she always incorporated it into her classroom regularly and found it a wonderful and necessary part of the curriculum.
She implemented multicultural literature into her classroom in various ways. Her school participated in a multicultural day at the end of the year and that throughout the year the students studied, read, learned about a particular country. At the end of the year the students had read many books, learned authentic cooking, songs and a dance from their selected country. The children loved learning through multicultural literature and using their knowledge across curriculum. She also stated that it was important to connect with the parents of all students and when speaking with parents of culturally or linguistically diverse students that she would discuss their expectations for their child and how that can be achieved in combination of school and cultural expectations. Parents were often asked to participate or share knowledge of their culture in the classroom and she often incorporated some type of heritage assignment for the students to be able to learn and share with each other their home values, traditions and cultures. Sharing each other’s backgrounds was especially embraced and enjoyed by the students.

She found that when the students could relate to the material and you share it with them they are spurred to start reading on their own. Providing examples Journey to Johannesburg, The Color of Us, Children Just Like Me, and so on.

She found so many good multicultural books out there it would have been impossible for her to not include them into her daily reading curriculum. Multicultural literature in her classroom was shared by read alouds, book boxes with leveled books, multicultural day, heritage project, and adds music and art often into her multicultural literature projects.
Chapter 5 Discussion

Summary of Major Findings

The focus of this research was to explore the outcomes of multicultural children’s literature in the elementary classroom and the amount of knowledge teachers possess in evaluating, selecting and including multicultural literature into the curriculum. Through the research of this study I discovered the need for teachers to gain the knowledge and ability to evaluate and select authentic multicultural literature. My method was to study various reading selection methods, and to create the following tool as a qualitative method for selecting and evaluating multicultural children’s literature by teachers for use in their classrooms.

While the selection of multicultural literature can be complicated based on many factors including controversial issues and there may not be a simple checklist to follow, the ultimate goal for this tool is to provide teachers with the knowledge, ability and confidence to select culturally authentic literary materials for inclusion into the curriculum. The resulting tool was created to develop and incorporate the most necessary elements in selecting and evaluating multicultural children’s literature. The addition of multicultural literature to the curriculum will begin to adequately and equally represent the needs and experiences of the students in their classroom.
Selecting and Evaluating Authentic and Accurate Multicultural Children’s Literature

The objective in selecting multicultural literature for inclusion in the curriculum is to include a variety of experiences in the classroom that teach self-esteem, acceptance and open mindedness for all students. In addition to validating the ideas, thoughts and beliefs of the students in the classroom by including multicultural literature we are developing and instilling students with an authentic perception, value and appreciation for all people. All, which will better prepare students for realistic life in the world that, includes people of all racial, religious, age, orientation, class, and ability backgrounds.

Judging a book by its cover: Art Work and Illustration
The first thing a child sees when picking up a book is the picture on the cover so we will begin our evaluation model by looking at the artwork and illustration.

Questions to ask while evaluating
While color, medium, space, contrast, and variation are important factors in creating exceptional art work for a picture book (Horning p.85) you should also ask your self the following questions while evaluating the illustration or art work in selecting multicultural children’s literature. Just as teachers cannot teach what they do not know students will not believe if they do not see, positive images are necessary to make lasting impressions.

1. How are the characters being portrayed? ex: “Are native people shown as savages?” (Harris et el, Reese, p. 182)

2. Do all of the characters of the same background look exactly alike?
3. How does the illustrator portray hairstyles of the characters? ex: are all black female characters shown wearing straight hair or braids? “For many years the dominant portrait of Black child in American children’s literature was the common pickaninny, and part of what made them comical was their hair…” (Harris et al, Sims-Bishop, p. 8)

4. How has the Illustrator chosen to depict their clothing/dress? Does it vary, is it authentic or does it portray stereotypes? Ex: Native people dressed only in feathers.

5. Are the colors used for the “diverse” characters skin tone a realistic hue?

6. Is the illustrator “overloading”? (Harris et al, Barrera p.140) Does the illustrator use excessive amounts of “stereotypical symbols” in creating the setting?

Authors and Stories

1. Who is writing the story?
   a. Why are they writing the story?
   b. “What is their authority?” (Horning 2010, p 47)

2. What is the story saying?
   a. Stories should be factual and accurate.
b. Meaningful stories should reflect a range of values and lifestyles (Harris et al, Hudson, p.223)

3. Who are the characters?
   a. Characters should be multidimensional and complex.
   b. Are they realistic and believable?
   c. “Cultural references” need to “reflect the authentic experiences and backgrounds” of the group of people being depicted. (Harris et al, Hudson, p.223)
   d. Who are the main characters?
   e. Do any of the main characters fit the definition of “multicultural”?
   f. Who are the secondary characters? “Secondary characters play smaller roles” (Horning, p. 152)
   g. Are the “multicultural” characters limited to only secondary character roles?

4. How are the characters described?
   a. Ex: Are all black characters portrayed as African Americans? This ignores and inaccurately portrays black people from other regions.
b. How do they speak? Are “diverse” characters only given voices including broken or “non-proper” English?

c. How do they dress? Are they only wearing traditional attire? Is that attire authentic to their background? Ex: Natives dressed in paint and feathers is that an accurate portrayal to their tribal traditions?

5. How are the characters developed?

   a. Are the characters all the same or do they reflect a variety of accurate values and lifestyles within that culture?

   b. Are they typecast as the maid, the gangster, the taxi driver, etc?

6. What is the setting for the story?

   a. Where is the story taking place?

   b. Does the setting assume a monoethnic setting?

   c. Why was this setting selected?

   d. Is it authentic?

   e. If it is a historical work whose perspective is being told?

   f. Are the events portrayed accurately?
Strategies for Inclusion and Sharing Multicultural Children’s Literature

After one evaluates and selects the multicultural children’s literature it is essential to incorporate the literature into the classroom so that it is meaningful and accessible to all students. In my interview with an expert reading specialist, she discussed the need for multiple types of literature to be included. The classroom should contain books as well as magazines, newspapers, electronic books, and comic or graphic novels. In addition to having a variety of reading materials and forms of literature available she also highlighted the importance and absolute necessity that the literature be leveled and accessible to students of all reading levels and abilities. She suggested the use of a book box surrounding a topic or theme that includes literature with multicultural perspectives in various reading levels. Dewitz states that very little differentiation is used in core reading programs and it is essential to reach readers of all levels. He suggests the need for book clubs or literature circles using outside literature along with core textbook reading. (Dewitz & Jones International Reading Association, 2010)

The most obvious way to share multicultural literature is with read alouds. As Harris (1997) states “One essential strategy for eliciting meaningful engagement… is simply to share it.” (p. 49) The powerful impact for reading aloud was also echoed by the reading specialist who used, “a lot of read alouds” that featured literature which depicted and “celebrated” diversity and contained “positive imagery.” The types of books you read to your student’s places an importance in the minds of your students. They will value and find importance in multicultural literature if you place an importance on it my
reading it to your students. It is then necessary to have that literature visible in the classroom and available for them to read on their own or take home.

Following the reading of any type of literature a discussion should take place. This is particularly important when reading multicultural children’s literature. It is not enough to just expose them to positive images and authentic stories and think that the material will stand alone in teaching students about multiculturalism, a dialog must take place followed by students actively interacting with the information. “The environment instructs through the materials, the language, the materials, and the attitudes in the classroom” (Dewitz & Jones International Reading Association, 2010).

Activities should include reading, writing and social action projects. “Music, language and art” were all given as examples of excellent ways to tie in multicultural literature across curriculum by both the reading specialist as well as Harris (1997) “Art offers many possibilities for thinking, talking, writing, enjoying and inspiring.”

Limitations/Gaps in the Literature

Certain limitations exist within the research exist time constraints and limited access to a classroom influenced my decisions in making my methods and research largely based on an extended literature review. In addition pre-service teacher and teachers educational background varies and cannot be generally assumed that all teachers do not include or lack knowledge of multicultural children’s literature. The literature research shows that teachers sited resources and lack of knowledge as a reason for not
including multicultural literature in their curriculum, further information could have been
 gathered including a sample of teacher surveys to determine their level of expertise in
 multicultural literature including how and why they do or do not include multicultural
 literature in their curriculum and student’s reading achievement and attitudes involving
 Multicultural children’s literature.

Implications for Future Research

It would be beneficial to look at what and how much multicultural literature
students are exposed to. Other areas for future research could include do pre-service
teacher education programs teach selection of literature and multicultural literature? What
are student’s attitudes in relation to using multicultural literature in the curriculum? As
well as research to discover if conclusive evidence can be found that using multicultural
children’s literature in the elementary classroom can lead to a closing of the reading and
educational gap among students of culturally or linguistically diverse background in
relation to “mainstream” student population.

Overall Significance of the Literature

While still lacking in the amount of quality multicultural books published, there
are many wonderful books and literature being published that embraces the diversity and
cultural representations that make up our growing and changing student population. With
the inclusion of multicultural literature and increasing educational awareness surrounding
multicultural education it seems likely that teachers will be able to gain a greater
knowledge and understanding for their students and the background knowledge and experiences that they bring with them into the classroom. Once multicultural literature finds a place in which it “permeates the curriculum” (Harris et al, Neito, pg. 4) we will be able to fully include all students in critical thinking and learning and hopefully it can change the way in which all students look at the world in which they live, and develop an appreciation for one another.
References


Baker, K., Gormley, K., Lawler, M., & McDermott, P. (2001). *Discovering the voices of multiethnic literature through critical reading and discussion*


Harris, V. (Ed.) Using multiethnic literature in the K-8 classroom, (pp. 1-19). Norwood, MA: Christopher-Gordon Publishers.) Includes articles by, Sims-Bishop, R.


Pirofski, K., Multicultural Literature and the Children's Literary Canon, San Jose State University, www.edchange.org, accessed June 7, 2010

