Visual and Plastic Arts in Teaching Literacy: Null Curricula?

By Robin Gay Wakeland, M.Ed. 2010
Copyright Robin Gay Wakeland and cited institutions 2010
rgw4036@prodigy.net
Abstract. Visual and plastic arts in contemporary literacy instruction equal null curricula. Studies show that painting and sculpture facilitate teaching reading and writing (literacy), yet such pedagogy has not been formally adopted into USA curriculum. An example of null curriculum can be found in late 19th – early 20th century education the USA government provided for indigenous Navajo Diné people. Weaving, metalwork and associated design skills, as well as language arts, were ignored when educational experts advised teaching them. Contemporary studies as well as these historical events provide teachers with methods and content using visual and plastic arts to teach literacy.
Null curriculum defined. Literacy curricula do not serve the function of pouring data into the receptacle student. Amid the digital age data onslaught which provides storage and retrieval of recorded history, imagery, polemics, theory, shifting cultural identities, globalization, legal and illegal immigrations, war crimes, famine, environmental degradation, drought and natural disasters, 21st century educators beg for a sieve of facility. Curriculum creates inherently a tool of exclusivity. It selects among millions of data bytes and implements coherent subsets of methods, empirical knowledge and concepts. Curricula therefore necessarily screen both content and pedagogy. How then can curricula be evaluated and scrutinized to determine the efficacy, relevance, and validity of the dynamic which created them as well as their final form?

One way is to analyze for any null curriculum. As its name suggests, null curriculum is a tag, and a value judgment. It connotes deficiency, fault, and lacking. It applies to both content and methods (pedagogy). The concept of a null curriculum defines not any or a quantity of exclusion as obviously, curricula by definition concentrate and choose among content, contexts and methods. Rather, null curriculum connotes an exclusion of culturally or philosophically relevant content and/or pedagogy given a social, political or moral obligation to include them. The consequences of a null curriculum should be brought to light, explained, and explored. Inherent in the null curriculum evaluation/assessment is dissemination of the findings (Joseph 2000, p. 24-25, Green 2000, p. 48).

As the analysis requires a political-moral obligation to teach, assessment of any curriculum for null aspects necessarily requires evaluation of socio-political forces which forge, limit, prescribe, and generate content, context and pedagogy. No curriculum
exists in a vacuum, anyway. Budget limitations, government-articulated goals, competing lobbying groups, world trade agreements, cost of tuition, or free classes, immigration status (with companion goals such as training for employment and adjustment counseling), and any ad hoc authority, such as refugee camp jurisdictions, should be factored into the equation. Presented here are two United States of America (USA) historical null curricula as examples, one 20th century and one spanning late 19th to early 20th century. Finally, visual and plastic arts are presented as our 21st century null curricula, given contemporary research showing their efficacy in teaching literacy.

Thus teachers can become familiar with the null curriculum analysis and also find definite techniques and materials for incorporating the arts into their classrooms. Globally, the component analysis and conclusion-reaching protocol can be implemented among whatever contemporary educational setting. In so doing, teachers, administrators, government bureaucrats, and public advocacy groups can reach their own conclusions and derive applications germane to each their specific educational scenario.

**Mid-20th century, southwest USA.** Educators at a conference in 1969 concluded that defective curriculum contributed to low literacy rates and levels among non-white students by causing low self-esteem, alienation and indifference. Although mandated by government policy and educational experts to be reflective of American society, curricula had failed to portray history or personal achievements of any but white citizens. New goals were set to include ethnic group history and events in the curriculum (books, visuals and video) to reflect true American pluralism (Dunfee 1969, p. 1-3). English language achievement, including literacy, among African American, Spanish-
speaking, and native students with whom the presenters worked was proudly attributed to this new curriculum and approach (Dunfee 1969, p. 9-11).

Although they didn’t articulate the formal null curriculum terminology, the teachers instinctively applied this analysis. They compared notes about their students’ low achievement and problems with literacy. They did informal research on the existing curriculum. They then created their own visuals and historical content, emphasizing visual imagery in conjunction with text. They created an indispensable new vernacular using book illustration, posters, and video.

These solutions were nascent constructivism, implemented with visual media. Constructivist methods incorporate students’ cultural histories, beliefs and world views, into the curriculum to engage students in the learning process, giving them the tools to literally construct knowledge (Yilmaz 2008). This theory is particularly applicable to teaching English as a second language (ESL) to immigrants. ESL instruction is considered inadequate in isolation. Instead, the student’s wholistic adjustment needs to be considered by the teacher. To facilitate this, teacher training in the socio-political and cultural background of immigrant students is recommended (Magro 2007).

A review of task-based learning (a subset of constructivism) in teaching second language acquisition indicates that culturally relevant images and history alone cannot sustain real progress in literacy. The success of any language acquisition pedagogy does not flow magically from the intentions of the teacher, a content-based task, or even student participation in the task. Rather, tasks must be designed specifically to showcase the target grammatical structure, and encourage the learner to rely on grammar structures, accuracy, and fluency (Ellis 2003, p. 21, 24-27, 34, 152). Whether via task-based interaction, repetition, or text enhancement, syntax and grammar must
be presented in meaningful context and integrated manner (Izumi 2002, Ellis 2003, p. 247). Teachers must design tasks to draw attention to the form (grammar) and to promote noticing of it (Song & Suh 2008, p. 299).

This consensus supports a need for specificity when the arts are implemented into literacy pedagogy. We can see in other contemporary studies using arts to teach language listed below a level of language specificity. While grammar lessons are not always utilized, there is always some definite response required or evoked. One module focuses on “syntagmatic and paradigmatic” relationships in using language (Hayward, Das, & Janzen 2007, p. 448). These new methods represent the second generation of researchers building on the instinctive, fledgling constructivism pioneered in the American southwest (Dunfee 1969).

**Late 19th – early 20th century USA southwest.** History gives us another example of a null curriculum: that provided by the federal government for Navajo Diné people between 1864-1920. Socio-political realities during that time were such that the federal government had a mandate from the war department and 1868 treaty obligations to provide education. After the 1868 treaty, there were disputes about what the treaty meant (USA Senate 1946), appendix 9. Controversies emerged as to adequate number of schools, and their on- or off-reservation locations (Vandever 1890). An informant described schools on the reservation between 1889 and 1896 (Johnson-Frisbie 1963-65, tape 52 at 285-336). Children had to wait until existing boarding school residents graduated, to make room before they could attend (Johnson-Frisbie 1963-65, tape 52 at 285). Some parents didn’t want to send their children to school (Vandever 1890, USA Senate 1946) and decided to fight together against sending their children to school (Johnson-Frisbie 1963-65, tape 51 side B at 352-370).
Another part of the analysis focuses on the perspectives of the curriculum-maker. Was there systematic exclusion or suppression of intellectual knowledge? Michael Steck, superintendent of Indian Affairs for New Mexico territory was entrusted with providing for the tribe: “From your acquaintance, and that of your associate, with the wants and condition of those Indians, their habits and customs, and the confidence confided in your ability, and that of your associate, to control the interests of those confided to your charge” (Leavenworth 1864a). Such was his mandate during the captivity time at Bosque Redondo (1864-68) from the war department, which had taken custody of the tribe (Leavenworth 1864a,b).

He had knowledge of native language, skills in agriculture, raising animals, manufacturing, trade, and artistic endeavors. He knew Navajo Diné people were successful farmers and considered them “more advanced” than other tribes at manufacturing blankets, baskets, ropes, saddles, and other tack (Labadé 1863, Steck 1864, 1894, Neveure, n.d.). One projection for self-sufficiency factored in the cost of farm buildings (Steck 1864). However, he failed his mandate and didn’t provide any education at all (Steck 1864, 1894, Labadé 1863, Neveure n.d.). Congress didn’t appropriate any money for education during captivity, only for wagons and horses to transport the captives, and food rations (Steck 1864).

After the 1868 treaty and the tribe’s ensuing return to New Mexico, the government set up schools and sent teachers to the territories. In 1890 one school teacher, C.E. Vandever, reported about the tribe to the Commissioner of Indian Affairs, (Vandever 1890) appendix 1. He recognized historic traditions in house building, stone, metal and leather work among men and weaving and basketry among women, as well
as creativity and design. Vandever proposed that these be the focus of a curriculum which would introduce modern tools and production methods (Vandever 1890).

Vandever recognized parental distrust of the schools, and felt an obligation to encourage parents to send their children to school (Vandever 1890). He advocated that students should best not be removed from their natural surroundings. He also assumed the role of curriculum developer, although constrained by budget (Vandever 1890). He never mentioned implementing his ideas to teach weaving, basketry, art, design, animal husbandry, stone working, and metal working. He did initiate a leather-working class and carpentry class for boys. Accompanying fringe benefits were the students being able to mend their own shoes and repair the school’s crumbling walls (Vandever 1890).

Vandever recognized that Navajo Diné people were successful at adapting technologies, farming and manufacturing from Pueblos (weaving and corn cultivation) and Spanish settlers (fruit tree cultivation, animal husbandry, wool, silver smithing and leather working). By the time of the 1848 Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo, these industries had been functioning for generations and the knowledge had been passed down via the oral tradition and possibly via written Spanish (Vandever 1890, National Museum of the American Indian (NMAI) 1897-1910a-f (appendices 2-7), Center for Southwest Research (CSWR) (ca. 1970). Unfortunately, Vandever’s other curriculum ideas about teaching weaving, basketry, art and design, stone and metal working never came to fruition during his lifetime.

Government agents and educators knew about both native Navajo Diné language as well as efforts to teach English via published bi-lingual dictionaries and hymnals. Navajo Diné did not have a written form of their aboriginal language until the modern era. In the 19th and early 20th centuries Catholic priests and brothers refined
various attempts at creating a written language (Catholic Church 1910; Haile & Cullin 1929), appendices 10, 11). The Catholic missionaries in the southwest wrote bilingual English/Navajo prayer books and taught bilingual classes at Catholic mission schools in Arizona (University of Arizona 2009). Another dictionary was written by the Franciscan Fathers at Saint Michael’s mission in Arizona in 1912. It was published in two volumes for a total of about 460 pages (Franciscan Fathers 1912). Both publications were typeset using Navajo Diné characters, including subscripts and superscripts. This means the printing industry independently invested in creating these type fonts. Essentially, thus the language was mass produced and launched into mainstream society (appendices 10, 11).

In 1883 American agents wanted to hire a Navajo named Henry Dodge as a courier and interpreter. They recognized Dodge’s fluency in both Navajo and English. Dodge was recognized as being: the “only man known who can transmit speech of ordinary English speaking person into fluent Navajo … to fit himself for citizenship – can read and write and would be A-1 man for scouts” (Young, ca. 1950). Thus the federal government itself articulated a need for bilingual speakers, but as evidenced below, efforts to teach English were ineffective to null.

In 1928 the Meriam government report on nation-wide native boarding schools was issued, and was summarized by Margaret McKittrick, Chair of the New Mexico Association of Indian Affairs (McKittrick 1928), appendix 8. We can assume it covered at least 20 years previous, accounting for collecting data, writing and publishing. The report itself referencef conditions and policy continuing into the past. It reported a dearth, if not total lack of libraries. It criticized federal “Indian school course study” as based on an outdated model instead of being ideally created out of the lives of native
people, and adapted to individual interests and abilities. Modern pedagogy in 1928 emphasized such adaptation, together with mental and physical health, citizenship, participating in community, earning a living, home and family life, and good character. The unfortunate reality was that federal native curriculum was based on routine, didactic methods, which were no longer acceptable in 1928. “Reading, writing and arithmetic” were no longer recognized as valuable in isolation. Mainstream academics and educators considered these and other academic subjects valuable only if they contributed to the fundamental objectives (McKittrick 1928).

The final part of the null curriculum analysis explores what the students themselves wanted, needed, expected or desired their education to provide. This supplies the relevancy element. We can hear a description of what life was like at the government schools from interviews with someone who attended them. In 1964, Frank Mitchell, a Navajo Diné born in 1881 was interviewed by anthropologist Charlotte Johnson-Frisbie. Mr. Mitchell attended a Christian school at the age of 4, and government schools from age 8 until around age 15. His responses are entirely in his native language, translated by his daughter. This is a testimony to the failure of the schools to teach English (Johnson-Frisbie 1963-65, tape 55).

Mr. Mitchell attended boarding schools in Fort Defiance, Fort Lewis, Sherman, Phoenix, and Oklahoma (Johnson-Frisbie 1963-65, tape 52 at 285). Mostly the children went to classes one-half day and spent the other half working to maintain the school. The girls did sewing, laundry, washing, and bakery. The boys fed and took care of livestock, horses, goats, and pigs. They milked the goats, cooked, cleaned, cleaned out coal stove, and did laundry. Everyone was paid $0.25 a week except for the girls who worked in the bakery, who were paid $30 a month. They had one pair of shoes, and so
had to patch their shoes when they wore out (Johnson-Frisbie 1963-65, tape 52 side 2 at 724). Most schools had desks, benches, paper, pencils and crayons. There were few books, mostly just pictures on the wall. Subjects taught were the ABCs, and counting. If a student learned to count to 10, this was considered adequate, (Johnson-Frisbie 1963-65, tape 52 at 235).

The teachers didn’t speak Navajo except for a few words which they repeated over and over. The children didn’t know English so they didn’t understand what the teachers were saying. On Sunday and one day during the week a father from the mission visited the school. Sometimes a Presbyterian minister came. They didn’t conduct mass, just visited and talked to the students. Everyone was required to attend. The preachers and the priests likewise didn’t speak Navajo and spoke only in English, and so the children didn’t understand what they were saying (Johnson-Frisbie 1963-65, tape 52 side 2).

In a 1946 report to congress, Tribal Chair Chee Dodge presented Navajo Diné perspectives of government education from at least as early as the 1868 treaty to the time of his testimony. He reports not only current conditions but also those from 1868 treaty times via the collective memory of the tribe. “Since 1868 to the present time there are very few Navajo who understand the English language and can carry on a conversation in other than Navajo” (USA 1946). This report comprises the USA congressional record and is available electronically through subscription at many USA college and university libraries.

Chee Dodge asked for education adequate to allow tribal members to compete with white people off the reservation. He informed Senator Hatch and other committee members that present-day schools had the same results as those the old people went
Old people as well as young people were uneducated and unable to compete (USA Senate 1946). This is evidenced not only by Frank Mitchell’s description of life at the schools, by also by his interview itself. In 1964, he required a translator to communicate with the English-speaking interviewer and throughout time, to library patrons who listen to his words.

Here we have an unabashedly null curriculum of not only native Navajo Diné visual art, design, weaving and metal smithing, but of industry, technology, native language and English as a second language. We have no direct connection, through the haze of history, showing us that teaching native design arts together with literacy would have facilitated language learning. We do have the vanguard observations and recommendations of Vandeven, hoping to bring native visual and plastic arts into the classroom. As spring winds blew dust into the ramshackle territorial school house, as congress grumbled about spending money on the rez, and as mail arrived via horseback, his vision was eclipsed. The remaining legacy is only the federal government null curriculum, contravening war department, treaty, and educational standards, of native language and arts.

**Contemporary visual and plastic arts: null curricula?** Both methods and content are subject to nullification. Because of the tactile and three dimensional nature of the arts, pedagogy and content merge. The arts are multifaceted and function in society as a vehicle for expression, construction of the art object, media for communication, and social interaction via public art. Therefore any of these facets serve as tangible aspects in the null curriculum analysis. Existing studies additionally indicate visual and plastic arts pedagogy fuse with content to impact classroom learning. Our use of these studies in the null curriculum analysis doesn’t function as empirical proof.
Instead, these studies establish our perceptions from which we can analyze whether culturally or philosophically relevant content and pedagogy is being excluded and whether there exists a social, political or moral obligation to include it.

Through volunteer-taught art appreciation classes, it was discovered that lower achieving students (typically C, D and F students) scored as high as their A-B classmates on recall of visual shapes and content. Primarily large, colorful paintings were used in this activity. Art historical, literacy type information was included, such as name, date, and geographical location of the artist (Epstein & Dauber 1995, Epstein & Salinas 1991). Impediments with this method are primarily cost of the prints and logistics of storage and retrieval of the paintings (reproductions). It was unclear whether digital, projected images could be substituted as the physicality and immediacy (almost interactive nature) of the large graphic. Also, students would need to have lights on in the classroom to write responses to questions while looking at the art work.

A qualitative study was conducted at a suburban southern California elementary school using visual arts strategies to teach literacy. It implemented the “Picturing-Writing” curriculum developed at the University of New Hampshire in the 1990s. The authors, two art teachers and one literacy professor, included a literature review summarizing their own and other previous studies. Among the effects of the visual imagery surveyed and studied were motivating students to read and write, a pre-writing composing device, connecting the image with poetry, dialectic response of the artist to the art object of creation, cognitive development, and ideas changing and forming during the creative process. Working on the theory that art is a “non-linguistic’ composing device that assists children in expressing their thoughts”, researchers
concluded “art plays a critical role as a mediating event for the compositional process” (Andrzejczak, Trainin & Poldberg 2005).

Researchers in a quantitative study compared reading comprehension in groups of children with various intervention combinations: manipulating the objects described while reading, imagining manipulation objects while reading, reading once and rereading (without any manipulation). Original and previous theory hinged on the language learner’s ability to “index” words and phrases to objects or perceptual symbols (toys being manipulated). Indexing is the attachment by the reader of referent, perceptual symbols to words. The contribution made by the association of perceptual symbols (the objects being manipulated) to the words being learned/read to accompanying/resulting reading comprehension. The common English as a second language student enigma of flawless reading while comprehending nothing is recognized within first language acquisition: “To the extent that the words are not being indexed, reading becomes a meaningless exercise in word calling”, (Glenberg et al. 2004, p. 427).

Whether via a dump truck in a sand box or a pencil in a cup, the association of the physical world with the text, it is concluded, helps children make inferences to the real world and develop mental models and perceptual symbols and thus understand not merely the text itself but what the text means. This also contributes to cognitive development (Glenberg, et al. 2004, p. 434-35). While the toy manipulations are not exactly sculpture apprenticeships, the physical, tactile implications for substituting sculpture for the dump truck are obvious. The vocabulary and concepts would then change to fit the sculpture. Descriptions of previous studies in the literature encompass
any kind of manipulative activity, and drawing activity is specified in at least one. Also, visual cues are incorporated into the reported study (Glenberg, et al., 2004, p. 426).

Other emphasis on cognitive development to augment reading is contained in commercially available, packaged curriculum. One internationally taught course incorporates animal picture flash cards, asking for animal names in verbal responses. It also includes practicing and developing speed in recognizing and naming objects, shapes, and colors. Activities include sorting pictures of common objects into one of three similar, corresponding abstract shapes and reproducing a design with colored shapes after a 10 second view. Incorporating also verbal command/response exercises and other techniques, this method has generally been accepted as successful. The programs tested were Cognition Enhancement Training (COGENT) and PREP. The authors call for continued studies among different demographics (Hayward, Das, & Janzen, 2007).

Conclusion. Thus the individual teacher can review both the contemporary studies described here, as well as the example of the mid-20th century teachers and images of Navajo Diné creativity and for inspiration in using visual and plastic arts in the classroom. Without criticizing the educational establishment, teachers can in anarcho-syndicalist mode fashion lessons within existing standards, budgets, toys, and art supplies. Of course the null curriculum analysis endures for wholistic implementation, societal change, grass roots activism and institutional policy, while engaging introspection, prioritization and synthesis.
### APPENDICES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Vandeever, C.E., 1890 Report to Commissioner of Indian Affairs, Center for Southwest Research, University of New Mexico, USA, Robert W. Young Papers, MSS 672 BC, box 2 f 2, p. 160-65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>National Museum of the American Indian, 1897, N02433, Navajo Hostine Choy’s wife, Chaco Canyon, New Mexico, USA. George Hubbard Pepper, photographer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>National Museum of the American Indian, 1903, N07224, Navajo silversmith Pesh Lakai [Peshlakai], Bluff, Utah or Chinle Canyon, Arizona (different notations), USA. C.B. Lang or Charles (Chas.) M. Goodman (different notations), photographer. Notes on man’s name from Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, USA, Robert W. Young Pictorial Collection, 000-672-0040, Box 1 f 4, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico USA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>National Museum of the American Indian, 1897, N02425, Navajo man sewing moccasin, Chaco Canyon, San Juan County, New Mexico USA, George Hubbard Pepper, photographer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>National Museum of the American Indian, 1904, N02482, Navajo woman spinning wool warp, Chaco Canyon, San Juan County, New Mexico USA, George Hubbard Pepper, photographer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>National Museum of the American Indian, 1904, N02464, Navajo woman pounding mountain mahogany root for red dye, Chaco Canyon, San Juan County, New Mexico, USA. George Hubbard Pepper, photographer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>National Museum of the American Indian, 1904, N02466, Navajo woman boiling mountain mahogany root bark for red dye, Chaco Canyon, San Juan County, New Mexico, USA. George Hubbard Pepper, photographer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>McKittrick, Margaret, 1928, Chair of the New Mexico Association of Indian Affairs, Indian boarding schools, Indian Boarding Schools, findings of the Meriam Report, Eastern Association of Indian Affairs, Inc. <em>Bulletin</em> 17, December. American Association on Indian Affairs Records, Public Policy Papers. Department of Rare Books and Special Collection, Princeton University Library, p. 10-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>United States of America (USA) Senate, 1946, Senate sub-committee on Indian Affairs hearing, “Navajo Indian Education”, p. 2-5. Chair of Navajo Tribal Council, Chee Dodge testimony, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, Robert W. Young Papers, MSS 672 BC, box 2 f 31. 1946 Congressional reports also available via subscription services in many USA colleges and universities.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX 1, p. 1

Vandever, C.E., 1890 Report to Commissioner of Indian Affairs, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, USA, Robert W. Young Papers, 1860-1992 MSS 672 BC, box 2 f 2, p. 160-61.
APPENDIX 1, page 2

Vandever, C.E., 1890 Report to Commissioner of Indian Affairs, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, USA, Robert W. Young Papers, MSS 672 BC, box 2 f 2, p. 162-63.
APPENDIX 1, page 3. Vandever, C.E., 1890 Report to Commissioner of Indian Affairs, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, USA, Robert W. Young Papers, MSS 672 BC, box 2 f 2, p. 164-65.
APPENDIX 2

APPENDIX 2. National Museum of the American Indian, 1897, N02433, Navajo Hostine Choy’s wife, Chaco Canyon, New Mexico, USA. George Hubbard Pepper, photographer
APPENDIX 3

APPENDIX 3. National Museum of the American Indian, 1903, N07224, Navajo silversmith Pesh Lakai [Peshlakai], Bluff, Utah or Chinle Canyon, Arizona (different notations), USA. C.B. Lang or Charles (Chas.) M. Goodman (different notations), photographer. Notes on man’s name from Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, USA, Robert W. Young Pictorial Collection, 000-672-0040, Box 1 f 4, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico USA
APPENDIX 4

APPENDIX 4. National Museum of the American Indian, 1897, N02425, Navajo man sewing moccasin, Chaco Canyon, San Juan County, New Mexico USA, George Hubbard Pepper, photographer
APPENDIX 5

APPENDIX 5. National Museum of the American Indian, 1904, N02482, Navajo woman spinning wool warp, Chaco Canyon, San Juan County, New Mexico USA, George Hubbard Pepper, photographer
APPENDIX 6

APPENDIX 6. National Museum of the American Indian, 1904, N02464, Navajo woman pounding mountain mahogany root for red dye, Chaco Canyon, San Juan County, New Mexico, USA. George Hubbard Pepper, photographer
APPENDIX 7

APPENDIX 7. National Museum of the American Indian, 1904, N02466, Navajo woman boiling mountain mahogany root bark for red dye, Chaco Canyon, San Juan County, New Mexico, USA. George Hubbard Pepper, photographer
of view of the welfare of children in Indian schools. Capable Indians should most certainly be encouraged to get the necessary general and special preparation for such positions as these, but the positions should not be assigned to Indians solely because they are Indians.” Page 353.

EDUCATION

“It is doubtful if any state nowadays in compiling a course of study even for its comparatively limited territory would do what the national government has attempted to do, that is, to adopt a uniform course of study for the entire Indian Service and require it to be carried out in detail. The Indian school course of study is clearly not adaptable to different tribes and different individuals; it is built mainly in imitation of a somewhat older type of public school curricula now recognized unsatisfactory even for white schools, instead of being created out of the lives of Indian people, as it should be; and it is administered by a poorly equipped teaching force under inadequate professional direction.

“Like most courses of study of this type, the Indian school course... contains excellent statements about the 'use and scope of the library,' but there are in fact practically no libraries worthy of the name in the Indian Service, almost no provisions for acquiring worthwhile new books, and few if any trained librarians.” Page 371.

“The possibilities of Indian arts would make a book in themselves; already in one or two places, notably among the Hopis, Indian children have given a convincing demonstration of what they can do with color and design when the school gives them a chance to create for themselves.” Page 372.

“Whatever may have been the official governmental attitude, education for the Indian in the past has proceeded largely on the theory that it is necessary to remove the Indian child as far as possible from his home environment; whereas the modern problem is in education and social work lies stress on upbringing in the natural setting of home and family life. The Indian educational enterprise is peculiarly in need of the line of approach that recognizes this principle; that is, less concerned with a conventional school system and more with the understanding of human beings... The method must be adapted to individual abilities, interests, and needs. ... Routinization must be eliminated. The whole machinery of routinized boarding school and agency life works against that development of initiative and independence which should be the chief concern of Indian education...” Page 32.

“To get teachers and school supervisors who are competent to fit the school to the needs of the children, the Indian Service must raise its entrance requirements and increase its salary scale. The need is not so much for a great increase in entrance salaries as for an increase in the salary range which will permit of rewarding efficient teachers and offering them an inducement to remain in the Indian Service.”

PERSONNEL

“It may be convenient to appoint the wife of the engineer to a position as girls' matron. The fact that both can be employed may help to offset the fact that each salary in itself is too low to maintain a family, but the wife may have none of the qualities really needed in the position of girls’ matron. Illustrations might be multiplied almost indefinitely, but the principle is obvious. Each position must be filled by a person qualified to fill it; relationship to another employee, like Indian blood, is a matter of secondary concern.

“In establishing the qualifications for entrance into the service two highly important factors will have to be taken into consideration, despite the probable
impossibility of establishing any formal civil service tests for them. They are (1) character and personality, and (2) ability to understand Indians and to get along with them.” Page 150.

“The Indians themselves and the employees doing real work for the Indians should be protected from four types of employees: (1) The employee who has himself reached the conclusion that nothing can be done for the Indian and that it is useless to try; (2) the employee who has acquired a manner toward the Indians that outrages their self-respect and turns them against the government and all its representatives; (3) the hard-boiled disciplinarian who persists after having been shown better methods in following a course that turns the Indians away from the schools, making them quit before they have finished and sending them back to their homes to advise others against attending; and (4) the employee who has lost active interest and is marking time.

“The first need of the Indian Service in personnel administration is a thorough-going classification of positions on the basis of duties, responsibilities, and qualifications, with especial emphasis on qualifications requisite for recognized responsibilities. As has already been pointed out, the qualifications should be materially raised for those positions which involve direct contact with the Indians. No marked improvement in the Service can ever be expected unless this is done.” Page 156.

The “policy of appointing Indians is excellent the Indians possess the requisite qualifications, and every effort should be made to give them, or enable them to get, the training and experience essential. The policy is extremely wise when it is given effect by lowering standards. Teaching positions in Indian schools are created for the purpose of educating Indian children. They exist for the Indian children and not to furnish teaching positions for Indian girls where training and experience would not enable them to qualify for the positions in other schools. . . . The object of the Indian Service should be to equip Indian girls to meet reasonably high standards so that they can get positions either in Indian schools or in nearly any public school. If they can qualify under the same standards which are established for white teachers then it is reasonable to give them preference in the Indian Service. They should not have a monopoly on Indian Service positions and be unable to qualify for positions outside.” Page 156-157.

“In few if any of the larger organizations of the national government is the problem so important and more difficult or more important than in the Indian Service. In order to fill positions, when the salary scale is low, resort is almost invariably taken to the device of low entrance qualifications.” Page 155.

“A superintendent or any other local officer who has no faith in Indians and who cannot treat them with the respect and courtesy he would show a white man in ordinary business relations, has lost a fundamental qualification for his work. Page 148.

“There is need for a definite program of pre-service training for Indian school work . . . too frequently a teacher is deposited at an Indian school with no previous knowledge whatever of Indian life, of the part of the country where the work is located or of the special conditions that prevail.” Page 367.

“The present educational leave should be extended to cover at least the six weeks required for a minimum university summer session.” Existing laws give 60 days in two years.

RECOMMENDATIONS

“The whole regime at the Indian boarding schools should be revised to make them institutions for developing health. This revision should include: (a) a marked increase in quantity, quality and variety of food for all children, (b) a marked reduction in overcrowding, (c) a thorough physical examination of all school children at least once a year and often if the child has any defects, (d) a
material reduction of the working day for all children below normal if not for all children. (e) a much greater effort to prevent the spread of contagious and infectious diseases, and (f) more thorough training in the care of the person and prevention of diseases.” Page 195.

“The real goals of education are not ‘reading, writing and arithmetic,’ but sound health, both mental and physical, good citizenship in the sense of an understanding participation in community life, ability to earn one’s own living honestly and efficiently in a socially worthwhile vocation, comfortable and desirable home and family life, and good character. These are the real aims of education; reading, writing, numbers, geography, history, and other ‘subjects’ or skills are only useful to the extent that they contribute directly or indirectly to these fundamental objectives.” Page 373.

“The recommendations for heavier appropriations are made on the ground of efficiency in performing the task before the government. It could be sustained on purely humanitarian grounds. The Indians are wards of the richest nation in the world, if not the most enlightened and most philanthropic, yet the fact is that Indian children in boarding schools maintained and operated by the government of the United States are not receiving a diet sufficient in quantity, quality and variety to maintain their health and resistance.” Page 107.

When these incontestable facts are brought to the attention of the members of Congress they must surely provide sufficient funds to correct these heartrending conditions. It seems hardly credible to our Associations that Congress will need urging to give these children, the wards of the nation, their birthright of air, sun, food and play.

APPENDIX 8, p. 3. McKittrick, Margaret, 1928, Chair of the New Mexico Association of Indian Affairs, Indian boarding schools, Indian Boarding Schools, findings of the Meriam Report, Eastern Association of Indian Affairs, Inc. Bulletin 17, December, p. 12. American Association on Indian Affairs Records, Public Policy Papers. Department of Rare Books and Special Collection, Princeton University Library
APPENDIX 9, page 1. United States of America (USA) Senate, 1946, Senate sub-committee on Indian Affairs hearing, “Navajo Indian Education”, p. 2-3, Chair of Navajo Tribal Council, Chee Dodge testimony, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, Robert W. Young Papers, MSS 672 BC, box 2 f 31. 1946 Congressional reports also available via subscription services in many USA colleges and universities.
As I recall it, from the 1865 agreement, it was understood that the Government would educate the Navajo children. That has been intended for a hundred years now. Since 1865 to the present time there are very few Navajo Indians who understand the English language and can carry on a conversation in other than Navajo.

We would like to have a beginning in the near future for these Navajo people so we can see in 15 or 20 years that the Navajos will learn to talk English and be able to get around outside the reservation. By being able to understand English, they will be able to compete with other people. We do not want to take another 100 years to begin. We would like to have it taken up now and have a beginning.

The cost of establishing all these schools on the reservation of the Navajos will be expensive. But the longer we talk about it and the less action we take in the accomplishing of it will only make it more expensive for the people. From 1865 to the present is a long time. Much money has been wasted and there are no results shown, and there is no evidence that this particular appropriation to educate the Navajos has been properly used.

We are asking that these schools be boarding schools where they will stay for the school periods. That means they will send their children there to board and room.

We have had an experiment with day schools on the reservation. For the last 12 years day schools have been established on the reservation. We have not had a single product of that day school whereby we can point to one or two as a result of the experiment. It does not work with the Navajo people.

This is due to the fact that the Navajos do not live in villages but in all directions from these day schools and most of them at a great distance, and since there is no provision to get them to these schools it is a hardship to walk these distances and when they discovered it was just a hardship, especially during the cold weather, they could not keep it up.

From past experience with day schools, our tribe has taken it upon themselves to say they cannot take their children to day schools. It is a hardship and sickness to keep going and we cannot show in the last 12 years a single product of that day school. They tried to go there and could not carry it out. We want to replace that with the boarding schools and that is what we are pleading for our people.

They have delegated us to tell you about this desperate situation. Let me tell you, the census of the Navajos as I have it lately. The population now exceeds 55,000—between 55,000 and 58,000 and, of course, you will realize we are not asking for anything small to accommodate so many people.

We are asking that doctors be provided with these hospitals to go from place to place looking after the health of the Navajos and visiting nurses for the whole reservation.

That is the weighty matter we have brought to you for your consideration and I hope you may be able to give us an answer that something could be done about it.

There are others who wish to say something about the same matter here and this is my testimony so far. I would like to give another person a chance to speak.

Chair of Navajo Tribal Council, Chee Dodge testimony, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, Robert W. Young Papers, MSS 672 BC, box 2 f 31.
APPENDIX 10

APPENDIX 11

ACT OF HOPE

diyín ‘ayúít’éí šíta’, ėnába’ ēnda
God my father you are merciful and
be xa-hízí-hi do’ nahíj’ kónání’čh da,
whatever you say not aside you put again,
’élíbá’ šíl čoxo’j, ša’á’t’i’ šíyí’ xóló’ni
therefore I have hope, my sins me within that are
xa-di’léí’l, ‘áko ší’ xodiyingo
out again take thou, then my interior (all) holy (grace)
ášidí-lí’l, ēnda šít xóóó-go yá’á’šdi
me thou will make and I happy being heaven in
ná-xínshá’go ’axól’á-do’, dí’ tá’úlco
again I am going to live for all time. This all
diyín ‘ayúít’éí biyé’ ŋí’ses krásd šá
God his son Jesus Christ for my benefit
yáide’t’á’ ’élíbá’ xaño’ba’á’ ’insingó
took it away therefore mercy I seeking
’ándísní diyín ‘ayúít’éí šíta’.
I am asking this of you God my father.
t’á’ kót’é’go axól’á-do’. 
So it remaining may time go on. (Amen.)

ACT OF CHARITY

diyín ‘ayúít’éí šíta’ diyín be’ nál’dí
God my father holy by greatest one
níl’go t’á’ šíyí’dé’ t’á’ šižái
you being very my interior from right my heart

REFERENCES

[http://ijea.asu.edu](http://ijea.asu.edu)

Catholic Church (1910). *A booklet of Catholic prayers: Navajo-English*,  
*Circa 1910*, retrieved April 19, 2009 from: [http://www.library.arizona.edu/exhibits/pams/pdfs/r9791pam61.pdf](http://www.library.arizona.edu/exhibits/pams/pdfs/r9791pam61.pdf)

Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, USA (CSWR) (ca. 1970). Robert W. Young Pictorial Collection, notes 1903, 000-672-0040, box 1 f 4.


Labadé, L. (1863), letter to Steck 6/18/1863, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, USA, Michael Steck Papers MSS 134 BC, box 1 f 3.
Leavenworth, J.H., Col. (1864a), US Agent’s letter to commissioner of Indian Affairs, 7/27/1864, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, USA, Michael Steck Papers MSS 134 BC, box 1 f 16.

Leavenworth, J.H. (1864b), Special Agent’s letter to Steck, 10/4/1864, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, USA, Michael Steck Papers MSS 134 BC, box 2 f 1.


McKittrick, Margaret (1928). Indian boarding schools, findings of the Meriam Report, Eastern Association of Indian Affairs, Inc. American Association on Indian Affairs Records, *Bulletin* 17, December, Public Policy Papers, Department of Rare Books and Special Collection. Princeton University Library.

National Museum of the American Indian, USA (NMAI) (1897-1910a-f), photo archives N02433, N07224, N02425, N02482, N02464, N02466, see appendices 2-7.

Neveure, (n.d.), U.S. Agent letter to Steck, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, USA, Michael Steck Papers MSS 134 BC, box 2 f 12.


Steck, M. (1864). Indian Superintendency, Santa Fe, NM, annual report 10/10/1864, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, USA, Michael Steck Papers MSS 134 BC, box 2 f 1.


Vandever, C.E. (1890). 1890 Report to Commissioner of Indian Affairs, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, USA, Robert W. Young Papers, MSS 672 BC, box 2 f 2.


United States of America (USA) Senate (1946). Congressional Record, Senate Subcommittee on Indian Affairs, “Navajo Indian Education”, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, USA, Robert W. Young Papers, MSS 672 BC, box 2 f 31. Also available via subscription service at many USA colleges and universities.

Young, R.W. (ca. 1950). Outline of tribal government, Center for Southwest Research, University Libraries, University of New Mexico, USA, Robert W. Young Papers, MSS 672 BC, box 4 f 19.