An instrument was developed and used with grade 11 students and university teacher education students (intending English teachers) in British Columbia to explore their beliefs about appropriate ways to interpret segments of Shakespeare's "Macbeth." This is the second in a series of instruments designed to explore students' and teachers' reactions to concepts underlying critical theory. Research grants from Lakehead University and the University of British Columbia were used to develop and validate such instruments. This second instrument was developed and validated using similar methods to those used in developing the first: questions were developed by the team, validated by a panel of experts, piloted with a group of subjects, and revised by the team in light of comments. It differs from the first in that subjects are asked to choose between two paragraphs each illustrating critical response for the bulk of the questions (8 to 21) and to choose from among four 1-sentence descriptions of five others (22-26). Administration of the instrument required approximately 25 minutes including the video clip of Lady Macbeth's "Raven" speech. Subjects were not told the critical stances each response illustrated. Contains an informed consent form, instructions for the test, and the test itself. Appended is the list of critical stances illustrated by each response. (NKA)
An instrument to measure teachers’ and students’ critical preferences in interpreting Macbeth: Text Based through Critical Theory and Post-modern Hegemonies

Philip V. Allingham, Ph.D. (Lakehead University); Joe Belanger, Ph.D., Walt Werner, Ph.D. and Bill Davison (University of British Columbia).

The instrument below was used with grade 11 students and university teacher education students (intending English teachers) to explore their beliefs about appropriate ways to interpret segments of Shakespeare’s Macbeth. This is the second in a series of instruments designed to explore students’ and teachers’ reactions to concepts underlying critical theory. Researchers such as Appleman (2000), Applebee (1993) and Corcoran (19xx) have pointed out that secondary schools have been almost impervious to the tenets of Critical Theory. Unfortunately, we were unable to locate empirical data to support these claims; indeed, we could not locate instruments which measured attitudes toward the tenets of Critical Theory. Consequently, using research grants from Lakehead University (Lakehead University SSHRC Research Grant [Internal]) and the University of British Columbia (Dean’s faculty research grants and Humanities and Social Sciences Grant) we set out to develop and validate such instruments.

The first instrument we developed (found in ERIC: ED 461 902) was based on the Harfleur speech in Shakespeare’s Henry V. Students were shown clips of the Branagh and Olivier film versions; they were then asked to read six paragraphs which illustrated different critical approaches (new critical, resistant reading, psychological, cinematographic, feminist, and new historicist) to the scene and rate them on two Likert scales: their personal opinion of the approach and their estimate of its usefulness in their own classrooms. The questionnaire also asked respondents to rate their knowledge of and their propensity to use twelve critical approaches in their classrooms.

The second instrument, reported below was developed and validated using similar methods to those used in developing the first: questions were developed by the team, validated by a panel of experts, piloted with a group of subjects, and revised by the team in light of comments. It differs from the first in that subjects are asked to choose between two paragraphs each illustrating one critical response for the bulk of the questions (8 to 21) and to choose from among four one-sentence descriptions of five others (22-26). The instrument below is prefaced by the consent form approved by the Behavioural Research Ethics boards of each university.

Administration of the instrument required approximately 25 minutes including the video clip of Lady Macbeth’s “Raven” speech. Subjects were not told the critical stances each response illustrated. The category each response falls into is listed as an appendix to the instrument.
Informed Consent Form

Title of Project:
Secondary English Methods Students' Responses to Types of Literary Criticism
[Post-Secondary Version]

Principal Investigators:
Dr. P. V. Allingham, Faculty of Education
Lakehead University, 807-343-8897
Dr. Joe Belanger, Department of Language and Literacy Education,
University of British Columbia, 604-822-5479
Mr. William Davison, Graduate Student
Department of Language and Literacy Education
University of British Columbia

Purpose

As English methods instructors, we are interested in the attitudes toward and backgrounds in literary criticism which our students bring to our classes. Clearly, what we teach in secondary school classrooms and how we teach it depend on our beliefs about the purposes of teaching literature. We hope that the following activity will help you as university English students and pre-service teachers of English to consider various purposes for teaching literature; we also hope to gain a better understanding about what the English teaching profession in general needs to understand about the spectrum of beliefs about the purposes of teaching literature in secondary schools.

Study Procedures

The activity in this study asks you to respond to interpretations of The Tragedy of Macbeth (in particular, Lady Macbeth’s “Raven” speech in I, v) based on work by critics belonging to various schools of literary criticism in terms of your judgment of the usefulness of the approach for interpreting the play.

Use of the Data

Please do not write your name or any identifying mark on this questionnaire, the substance of which will be discussed in class. However, you are under no obligation to allow your responses to be used in the research report which will arise from the questionnaire. To indicate whether or not you allow your responses to be used in the research report, please check the appropriate sentence on the next page:

Informed Consent

I WILL allow my responses to be used in the research report _____.

I WILL NOT allow my responses to be used in the research report _____.
To protect your right to refuse, this permission page will not be visible as you submit your response booklet. Before the researcher examines the class's response booklets, the teacher, investigator, or an assistant will sort the forms into two piles: those for which research consent has been granted, and those for which such consent has not been granted. Only those responses for which research permission has been granted will be used in this study. Since these questionnaires are to remain anonymous, number codes will be used in the research report. Your participation or non-participation will have no bearing on your class standing. Hard-copy data will be retained in the Faculty of Education at the University of British Columbia’s Department of Language and Literacy (Faculty of Education) for not more than two years.

Including watching a single video clip, this questionnaire requires approximately 25 minutes to complete.
Instructions

Each of the following references to Shakespeare’s *The Tragedy of Macbeth* (1606) is accompanied by two or more quite different commentaries or explanations. No one critical response is inherently “right” or “wrong,” but each set of answers offers very different critical perspectives. Part One asks you to read the references to the play and to choose the interpretations that you feel comfortable with, accept without reservation, or simply like. Part Two asks you to read over Lady Macbeth’s “Raven” speech, and then to respond to eleven multiple-choice questions. Part Three asks you to indicate your familiarity with a small selection of critical terms.

**Part One: Survey of Responses to Literature**

Please do **not** write your name on the following survey. In order to relate your responses to the passages in the survey to demographic variables, it will help us to know a number of facts about you. Please share any of the information below that you feel comfortable with sharing. If you would prefer to omit any item, please omit it and move on to the other items, which ask you to circle the letter of the interpretation you prefer.

1. High school graduation was in Ontario ___; British Columbia ___; other Canadian province __________________; other______________________

2. Which of the following characterize your post-secondary status? (Please check any appropriate descriptions.)

   A. I have attended a two-year college to take university-transfer courses. ___
   B. I have taken trades or vocational training. ___
   C. I am attending a university in my own province. ___
   D. I am attending a university outside my own province. ___
   E. I am majoring or taking a concentration of courses in ________________________

3. Please list any concentration of subject courses taken at secondary and post-secondary levels:

   ________________________________

4. Please list the English and associated courses such as creative writing that you have taken at secondary or post-secondary levels:

   ________________________________
5. Mother tongue (please circle one):
   a. English  
   b. Other __________________________

   Please list any other languages you speak/write fluently:
   __________________________
   __________________________

6. Gender (please circle):  F  M

7. Age range (check one):
   _____ under 22.  _____ 23 to 30  _____ 31 and older

7a. I studied the play *The Tragedy of Macbeth* _____ in high school English;
   _____ in college/university English; ____ on my own;  ____ I have not studied it

For questions 8 through 26, circle the letter of the interpretation you prefer.

8.  No: this my hand will rather
    The multitudinous seas incarnadine,
    Making the green one red. (II, ii, 64-66)

   A.  The term “incarnadine” literally means “to make flesh-coloured,” but clearly
        indicates “to stain red” the “many-waved” (“multitudinous”) oceans, echoing
        
    OR

   B.  How the last line was intended to be stressed is not known; Macbeth may mean
        “totally red” or he may mean that he will transform the green seas into the Red
        Sea, contaminating all with his guilt. Thus, in the last line the dramatist has
        created for the actor playing Macbeth an *aporia*, a deadlock in the speech act,
        since the actor must choose one of the two possible meanings.
9. In the recognition scene at the end of the play, Macduff as the avenger of his slain wife and children confronts Macbeth, but the King, believing himself invulnerable, tries to persuade Macduff not to fight. He retains, despite the horrors he has committed, a sense of honour: “But get thee back, my soul is too much charged/With blood of thine already” (V, viii, 4-5).

A. By “charged” Macbeth may be suggesting a burden of self-accusation by his conscience, or perhaps “weighed down” or “burdened.”

OR

B. Influenced by Aristotle’s conception of the tragic hero, Shakespeare shows his protagonist to be a man neither thoroughly good nor thoroughly evil, who has moved from happiness to misery as the result of his own error in judgment (“hamartia”), which he now perceives at the moment of anagnorisis.

10. One may argue that what is important in I, v, is not the information conveyed by Macbeth’s letter (“Whiles I stood rapt in the wonder of it, came missives from the king, who all-hailed me, ‘Thane of Cawdor’; by which title, before, these weird sisters saluted me, and referred me to the coming on of time, with ‘Hail, king that shalt be!’”) but Lady Macbeth’s response to this news of the witches’ prophecies.

A. Hence, film-maker Roman Polanski defamiliarizes this scene and the sleepwalking scene in Act V by introducing the letter in the former and having the demented Lady Macbeth read part of it in the latter.

OR

B. Historically, silent reading was not common in the Middle Ages and early Renaissance, so that Lady Macbeth’s reading her husband’s letter aloud to the audience would not have been perceived as self-consciously theatrical or unrealistic in Shakespeare’s time.

OR

C. Without equivocation in the fifth scene of Act I (in contrast to her husband’s doubts and fears) Lady Macbeth abandons the world of light for that of darkness “until she is nearing her end and must seek the comfort of one small taper to illuminate the murkiness of Hell” to quote Edith Sitwell.
11. In II, iv, Shakespeare uses the story of Duncan’s horses’ eating each other to underscore the chaos that Duncan’s murder unleashes:

Ross: And Duncan’s horses—a thing most strange and certain—Beauteous and swift, the minions of their race,Turn’d wild in nature, broke their stalls, flung out,Contending ‘gainst obedience, as they would makeWar with mankind.

Old Man: ’Tis said they did eat each other.

Ross: They did so, to the amazement of mine eyes,That look’d upon’t. (II, iv, 16-24)

A. The reversals of natural law reflect the enormity of Macbeth’s crime against the Great Chain of Being.

OR

B. In Polanski’s film, when Macbeth kills Duncan he sends his crown spinning across the floor to suggest, as Shakespeare does textually, that orderly rule has been destroyed.

12. When Macbeth ridicules his enemies (his former nobles led by Malcolm and Macduff, and the invading English army led by Siward) as “false thanes” and “English epicures” (V, iii,7-8),

A. Shakespeare increases the gulf between his hero and his highly nationalistic audience, whom Macbeth denigrates as lovers of luxury and therefore unsuited to war.

OR

B. The grammatical parallelism implies that the adjectives “false” and “English” are synonymous to Macbeth, and that his disloyal former adherents are worthy companions of the foreign gluttons and sybarites.
13. In the last movement of Act Two, Scene One, Macbeth sees the “fatal vision” (line 35) of a dagger that leads him in the direction of the sleeping Duncan. A plausible argument can be made that this bloody weapon “sensible” to sight but not to touch

A. has been sent by the powers of darkness as further incentive to have Macbeth commit the assault on the Great Chain of Being that must inevitably lead to Macbeth’s damnation.

OR

B. is but a creation of the would-be killer’s “heat-oppressed brain,” a manifestation of his overwhelming guilt and overwrought imagination.

14. One of the play’s pervasive patterns of imagery concerns clothing. For example, his rebellious nobles refer to Macbeth as a “dwarfish thief” (V, ii, 213) who possesses neither the stature nor the bulk to wear “a giant’s robe” (21).

A. The metaphor links titles, clothing, and ambition, implying that what Macbeth has stolen, Duncan’s title, ill becomes him.

OR

B. Angus, once loyal to Macbeth, subtly justifies breaking the oath he gave Macbeth at Scone by implying that the new king is spiritually much inferior to his sainted predecessor, using the humorous image to win his change of heart some credence with the other rebel lords.
15. In the ninth scene of Act Five, Shakespeare creates a sense of closure through Malcolm’s “calling home our exiled friends” (line 33) and summoning his people to see him “crowned at Scone” (line 42).

A. In particular, Shakespeare’s Malcolm, like his historical counterpart, creates Scotland’s first “earls” to reward his closest supporters.

OR

B. However, “What’s more to do/Which would be planted newly” (lines 31-2) echoes Duncan’s words to Macbeth (“I have begun to plant thee, and will labour / To make the full of growing.” I, iv, 32-33), supporting Polanski’s contention—illustrated by the return of Donalbain—that the old cycle of trust and betrayal will renew itself and lead to further chaos.

16. The lines below allude specifically to King James the Sixth of Scotland, who, by Elizabeth’s death in 1603, became ruler of England and Ireland (thus, the United Kingdom).

Macbeth: What, will the line stretch out to th’ crack of doom?
Another yet? A seventh? I’ll see no more.
And yet the eighth appears, who bears a glass
Which shows me many more. And some I see,
That two-fold balls and treble scepters carry... (IV, i, 126–131)

A. The reference to Judgment Day is a piece of fulsome praise for his company’s sponsor by the dramatist, who wrote the play to bolster James the First’s somewhat tenuous claim to the English throne.

OR

B. The scene of the Stuart monarchs intensifies Macbeth’s increasing sense of powerlessness and leads directly to his hastily and ill-conceived plan to massacre Macduff’s family.
To assist you in responding to questions 17 through 27, the text of Lady Macbeth's “Raven” speech from Act One, Scene Five, lines 40-57, is provided below.

*LADY MACBETH*: Give him tending;
He brings great news. [*Exit Messenger.*]

The raven himself is hoarse
That croaks the fatal entrance of Duncan
Under my battlements. Come, you spirits
That tend on mortal thoughts, unsex me here,
And fill me from the crown to the toe top-full
Of direst cruelty! make thick my blood;
Stop up the access and passage to remorse,
That no compunctious visitings of nature
Shake my fell purpose, nor keep peace between
The effect and it! Come to my woman's breasts,
And take my milk for gall, you murdering ministers,
Wherever in your sightless substances
You wait on nature's mischief! Come, thick night,
And pall thee in the dunnest smoke of hell,
That my keen knife see not the wound it makes,
Nor heaven peep through the blanket of the dark,
To cry 'Hold, hold!'

[*Enter MACBETH.*] Great Glamis! worthy Cawdor!
Responses to Lady Macbeth's "Raven" Speech

17. The play's moral inversion of things as they should be is reflected in Lady Macbeth's invoking the powers of darkness in I, v. She does so because she is
   A. acutely aware of her husband's emotional and mental instability.
   B. determined to play a role that 'Nature' or social conventions prevent her from doing.

18. In Holinshed, one of Duncan's nobles, Donwald, is persuaded to assassinate the king by his wife as Duncan lies sleeping in their castle; utilising this story, Shakespeare
   A. transfers the blame for the murder from his hero to his wife.
   B. omits the historical blood-feud between Lady Macbeth's family and Duncan's.

19. The phrases "pall thee" (line 49) and "blanket of the dark" (51) may suggest that
   A. the stage is hung with black for a tragedy.
   B. evil has enveloped the natural and human spheres.

20. That Lady Macbeth is prepared to invoke the powers of darkness and renounce her own sexual identity shows that
   A. she is not inherently evil, and requires external assistance to kill the king.
   B. In order to get what she wants she is prepared to make use of whomever she can.

21. Given the sentiments that Lady Macbeth expresses in this speech, we should characterize her as
   A. a character who initially appears strong willed but who later reveals her inadequacies.
   B. a female deprived of her own name ("Gruoch") who can conceive of becoming a murderer only if she is not a woman.

22. The chronicler of British history, Raphael Holinshed, remarks in his popular 1577 text that Macbeth "slew the king at Envers [Inverness], or (as some say) at Botgosuane, in the sixth year of his [Duncan's] reign." That Shakespeare depicts Lady Macbeth planning to kill her guest, the venerable King Duncan, reveals that the dramatist
   A. disapproved of violence designed to further personal ends.
   B. realised that historical truth and entertaining theatre could be very different.
   C. was distinguishing between acceptable and unacceptable ways of seizing power.
   D. wished to consider the implications of a contemporary event, The Gunpowder Plot.
23. Victor Hugo likened the Macbeths as a couple to Adam and Eve; thus,
   A. Shakespeare has Lady Macbeth use imagery reminiscent of the Witches'.
   B. Lady Macbeth invokes the powers of darkness to assist her in killing Duncan.
   C. Lady Macbeth uses both her sexuality and verbal persuasiveness on her husband.
   D. Shakespeare has Lady Macbeth renounce her identity as a female to embrace evil.

24. By “unsex me here” (line 39) Lady Macbeth probably means
   A. “Make me into a man so that I shall be capable of murder.”
   B. that the actress playing Lady Macbeth is to gesture at her groin.
   C. that the actor playing Lady Macbeth is to gesture at his (stage) breasts.
   D. "Make me into something other than a human so that I shall be capable of violence."

25. Lady Macbeth wants the spirits that are waiting or attending on human thoughts to thicken her blood (lines 42-3) so that
   A. she will show her victim no compassion.
   B. she will be ruthless and cruel in order to satisfy her ambitions.
   C. neither emotional nor psychological changes can occur within her.
   D. neither womanly tenderness nor feminine sensitivity will prevent her from acting.

26. The “compunctious visitings of nature” (line 48) that Lady Macbeth mentions are probably
   A. the menstrual cycle.
   B. human compassion or pity.
   C. fearfulness natural to her gender.
   D. qualms of conscience sent by God.
27. Please rate each of the following elements in terms of relative importance to understanding Lady Macbeth's "Raven" speech using this scale:
1 = unimportant . . . 5 = very important.

A Lady Macbeth's psychological state. 1 2 3 4 5

B. Lady Macbeth's relationship with her husband. 1 2 3 4 5

C. Lady Macbeth's yearning for power in a male-dominated society. 1 2 3 4 5

D. The speech's having been designed to be delivered on the Jacobean* stage. 1 2 3 4 5

E. The speech's reflecting a number of Shakespeare's personal anxieties. 1 2 3 4 5

F. The speech's reflecting a number of the Jacobean* audience's concerns. 1 2 3 4 5

G. The speech's reflecting a number of Jacobean* society's beliefs about evil. 1 2 3 4 5

H. How Lady Macbeth reflects the desires and aspirations of all human beings. 1 2 3 4 5

I. How some people say they are going to do something but fail to follow through. 1 2 3 4 5

J. How some people manipulate others into doing things for them. 1 2 3 4 5

* Jacobean = from Latin "Jacobus" (English, "James"); of or pertaining to the reign of the former King James VI of Scotland, who succeeded Queen Elizabeth I of England in 1603 to become King James the First of Great Britain (1603-25).
PART THREE: CRITICAL TERMINOLOGY FOR THE CLASSROOM

Please help us determine which of the following terms or phrases you know and which you would be prepared to use in your classroom.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Familiarity</th>
<th>Potential Usefulness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 = unfamiliar . . .5 = very familiar</td>
<td>1 = not useful; 5 = very useful</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. Deconstruction 1 2 3 4 5
2. Hegemony 1 2 3 4 5
3. Patriarchy 1 2 3 4 5
4. Privileged reading 1 2 3 4 5
5. Post-modern 1 2 3 4 5
6. Culture text 1 2 3 4 5
7. Commodity text 1 2 3 4 5
8. Intertextuality 1 2 3 4 5
9. Transparent text 1 2 3 4 5
10. Voice 1 2 3 4 5
11. Subaltern 1 2 3 4 5

PART FOUR: We welcome your personal observations and comments.

________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________

Thank you for your help. We appreciate it. Philip, Joe, and Bil
Appendix: Critical stances illustrated by each response

8. A. Philological  
   B. Text Based [Deconstruction]
9. A. Psychological  
   B. Text Based [Formalist]
10. A. Text Based [Cinematographical]  
    B. New Historicist  
    C. Archetypal
11. A. New Historicist  
    B. Text Based [Cinematographical]
12. A. New Historicist  
    B. Text Based [New Criticism]
13. A. New Historicist  
    B. Psychological
14. A. Text Based [New Criticism]  
    B. Psychological
15. A. New Historicist  
    B. Archetypal
16. A. New Historicist  
    B. Psychological
17. A. Psychological  
    B. Feminist
18. A. Feminist  
    B. New Historicist
19. A. New Historicist  
    B. Archetypal
20. A. Feminist  
    B. Psychological
21. A Psychological 
   B. Feminist

22. A. Philological [Biographical] 
   B. Text Based [Formalist]  
   C. Philological  
   D. New Historicist

23. A. Text Based [New Criticism] 
   B. Archetypal  
   C. Psychological  
   D. Feminist

24. A. Feminist 
   B. Text Based [New Criticism]  
   C. New Historicist  
   D. Philological

25. A. Philological 
   B. Archetypal  
   C. Psychological  
   D. Feminist

26. A. Philological 
   B. Archetypal  
   C. Feminist  
   D. New Historicist

27. A Psychological 
   B. Psychological  
   C. Feminist  
   D. New Historicist  
   E. Psychological [Biographical]  
   F. New Historicist  
   G. New Historicist  
   H. Archetypal  
   I. Psychological/Reader Response  
   J. Psychological/Reader Response
I. DOCUMENT IDENTIFICATION:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title:</th>
<th>An instrument to measure teachers' and students' critical preferences in interpreting Macbeth: Text based through Critical Theory and Post-Modern Hegemonies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Author(s):</td>
<td>Philip Victor Allingham, Ph.D; Joseph F. Belanger, Ph.D</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

II. REPRODUCTION RELEASE:

In order to disseminate as widely as possible timely and significant materials of interest to the educational community, documents announced in the monthly abstract journal of the ERIC system, Resources in Education (RIE), are usually made available to users in microfiche, reproduced paper copy, and electronic media, and sold through the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS). Credit is given to the source of each document, and, if reproduction release is granted, one of the following notices is affixed to the document.

If permission is granted to reproduce and disseminate the identified document, please CHECK ONE of the following three options and sign in the indicated space following.
The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 1 documents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level 1</th>
<th>Level 2A</th>
<th>Level 2B</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="sample1.png" alt="Sample" /></td>
<td><img src="sample2.png" alt="Sample" /></td>
<td><img src="sample3.png" alt="Sample" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY**

**TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)**

- **Check here for Level 1 release, permitting reproduction and dissemination in microfiche or other ERIC archival media (e.g. electronic) and paper copy.**

Documents will be processed as indicated provided reproduction quality permits. If permission to reproduce is granted, but no box is checked, documents will be processed at Level 1.

---

I hereby grant to the Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) nonexclusive permission to reproduce and disseminate this document as indicated above. Reproduction from the ERIC microfiche, or electronic media by persons other than ERIC employees and its system contractors requires permission from the copyright holder. Exception is made for non-profit reproduction by libraries and other service agencies to satisfy information needs of educators in response to discrete inquiries.

Signature: [Signature]

Printed Name/Position/Title: Assistant Professor, SL Eng. Lang. Arts

Organization/Address: Faculty of Education, Lakehead University, 955 Oliver Rd., Thunder Bay, ON P7B 5E1

Telephone: 807-343-8897

Fax: 807-343-6807

E-mail Address: philip.allingham@lakeheadu.ca

Date: June 12, 2003

---

**III. DOCUMENT AVAILABILITY INFORMATION (FROM NON-ERIC SOURCE):**

If permission to reproduce is not granted to ERIC, or, if you wish ERIC to cite the availability of the document from another source, please provide the following information regarding the availability of the document. (ERIC will not announce a document unless it is publicly available, and a dependable source can be specified. Contributors should also be aware that ERIC selection criteria are significantly more stringent for documents that cannot be made available through EDRS.)