The equality of the opportunities available to males and females in Germany's labor market was examined. The study compared employment patterns among women and men and the extent to which selected discretionary benefits of Germany's Federal Employment Service benefit women and men.

Selected results were as follows: (1) women are under-represented in integration and recruitment subsidies compared with their share of the unemployed but over-represented in measures of vocational training and job creation measures; (2) especially in western Germany, long-term unemployed women are more strongly under-represented in integration and recruitment subsidies than are women overall; (3) older women are over-represented in measures of further vocational training and job-creation measures; (4) in some cases, the employment status rates of women are clearly higher in western Germany; (5) women's rates of successful integration into the labor market after completing further training are lower than those of men; and (6) women in eastern Germany assess the benefit of the training measures for taking up employment more critically than women in western Germany do. The study recommendations included calls for a gender-specific monitoring system of Germany's employment and training schemes and for inclusion of women in integration and recruitment subsidy schemes. (Six tables/figures and 40 references are included.) (MN)
Petra Müller, Beate Kurtz

Active Labour Market Policy and Gender Mainstreaming in Germany
The IAB is the research division of the German Bundesanstalt für Arbeit where scientists of different economic and social science disciplines work. The range of research topics can be characterized briefly as follows:
- observation of and forecasts for the German labour market
- labour market statistics
- labour market theory and policy
- evaluation of employment programmes
- regional and international labour markets
- occupation sociology
- research in skills and qualifications
- technological development and the labour market
- business and personnel management
Active Labour Market Policy and Gender Mainstreaming in Germany:
Gender-specific aspects of participation and destination
in selected instruments of the Federal Employment Service

1 Overview

2 Gender mainstreaming and active labour market policy: from the European concept to a national strategy in Germany

3 The evaluation of equal opportunities for women and men in the context of active labour market policy

4 Data and methods

5 Results
5.1 Inflows into selected measures of active labour market policy
5.2 Employment-status rates
5.3 Gender mainstreaming in the ESF-BA programme 1995 to 1999
5.4 Summary

6 Conclusions
6.1 Lessons for practice
6.2 Lessons for research

7 References

Dr. Petra Müller and Beate Kurtz are researchers at the Institut für Arbeitsmarkt- und Berufsforschung (Institute for Employment Research – IAB).
1 Overview

In recent years the success of strategies for active labour market policy has been paid increased political and scientific attention in Germany. In this respect questions regarding gender-specific aspects have so far led rather a shadowy existence. This forms the starting-point for this paper: it outlines the political (cf. Section 2) and scientific background (cf. Section 3) of gender mainstreaming in German labour market policy and provides results for the years 1998 to 2001 on the access of women to measures, benefits and schemes of the Federal Employment Service (Bundesanstalt für Arbeit - BA) and on their destination following the measures in comparison with men. In addition the paper focuses on various target groups among women. The reference period is 1998 to 2001.1

It can be shown here that the theory and practice of gender mainstreaming in active labour market policy in Germany only correspond with each other to a certain extent: in the case of employment-accompanying benefits in accordance with the Social Code III (integration and recruitment subsidies), women are under-represented compared with their share of the unemployed, though their destination chances are particularly high with these measures. In contrast they are over-represented in measures of further vocational training but have a lower employment-status rate than men for these measures. In the case of groups requiring special support, such as long-term unemployed or older women the measures of active labour market policy have so far helped to only a small extent to overcome the placement obstacles (cf. Section 4).

From the results it is possible to derive conclusions for the need for action in practice and in scientific research. They make it clear that both from the viewpoint of arranging active labour market policy in line with demands and needs and also from the perspective of a scientific evaluation appropriate to the subject there is no getting around a further incorporation of gender-specific aspects (cf. Section 5).

2 Gender mainstreaming and active labour market policy: from the European concept to a national strategy in Germany

Active labour market policy is intended firstly to reduce the imbalance between the job requirements of the vacancies and the qualifications of the unemployed. Secondly, appropriate measures are aimed at improving the chances of unemployed people on the labour market. In view of established structural unemployment, precarious employment relationships and increasing indications of deficits in vocational qualifications, this is not only true of Germany alone (cf. Hujer et al. 2000) but also of other countries, e.g. in Northern Europe (cf. Walwei/Werner 1998).

In Germany some € 25 billion is spent on schemes and measures of active labour market policy, of this € 20 billion alone comes from the Federal Employment Service (Bundesanstalt für Arbeit) and the other € 5 billion from the regional governments and local authorities and the European Social Fund (cf. Bundesregierung 2001:3). The measures of active labour market policy provided by the Federal Employment Service include – in addition to placement and advice – in particular the “major” instruments of “further vocational training”

1 A detailed version of the results can be found in Müller/Kurtz (2002).
job-creation and structural adjustment measures (ABM, SAM) and company-specific recruitment assistance. Additional instruments are used in the context of the “free support” in accordance with § 10 of the Social Code III, the supplementary assistance from the European Social Fund or pilot projects (cf. Brinkmann 2000: 483ff.). However, these services provided by the Federal Employment Service are generally targeted in the logic of the German unemployment insurance at those people who qualify for the receipt of benefits. For the group of “people not drawing benefit”, the European Social Fund provides a supplementary benefit to the standard assistance which is actually funded from taxes. It is intended to enable women to take part for instance in measures of vocational training, especially women who, due to their specific employment biographies, have not gained any minimum benefit entitlements.

The political aims of active labour market policy in Germany are embedded in the European Employment Strategy, which was first laid down in Luxembourg in 1997 for 1998 and was continued in subsequent years (cf. also Rhein 1999). From the outset, equality of opportunity for women and men was one of four pillars of the European Employment Strategy, which was associated not only with aims of fairness but also with the intention of raising the employment rate for women. Since 1999 it has been put into concrete terms in the Employment Guidelines of the EU in its double task for the policy area of labour market policy:

- Special measures aimed at assisting women should contribute to breaking down the discrimination against women on the labour market (Guideline 17).
- Gender mainstreaming should be used as a cross-sectional task to ensure that gender-specific effects are monitored and documented both in the run-up to decisions and also in the implementation and evaluation of labour market policy programmes (Guideline 16).
- In general the reconciliation of work and family life should be improved by creating facilities for the care of children and other dependents in need of care, and returning to employment after family-related career breaks should be facilitated (Guideline 18).

From the point of view of gender mainstreaming therefore not only the results are looked at but also the structures and processes of labour market policy decisions.

---

2 A detailed overview of the measures of active labour market policy in Germany is provided by Blien et al. 2002.
3 According to § 10 of the Social Code III, employment offices are able to use up to 10% of the funds included in the integration title for discretionary benefits of active labour market policy, in the context of a “free support”. This may be done in order to augment the possibilities of the measures of active labour market policy that are laid down by law with free measures of active employment promotion.
4 Leeway only exists in the case of people returning to work and in the context of the probationary regulations on “free support” (§ 10 Social Code III), here too however, precedence is given to those drawing benefits (cf. Brinkmann 1998).
6 According to the EU (COM 2001b: 30) the employment rate of women currently stands at 53% in Europe as a whole, and is therefore still 18% below that of men. At its conference in 2000 the European Council therefore decided to set a target of an increase to 60% in 2010; at another conference in Stockholm it cited a figure of 57% as an intermediate target for 2005.
7 The numbering of the guidelines refers to the 2001 version; the corresponding individual aims can already be found - some with different numbers - in the previous versions.
In the Employment Guidelines the Member States are already shown the way they should attempt to implement these tasks: in particular in connection with the cross-sectional objective of gender mainstreaming they are urged to develop and use procedures to assess gender-specific effects and indicators to measure progress. In addition to this, concrete guidelines are set, such as the consideration of women in labour market policy measures in proportion to their share of the unemployed. The Member States of the EU undertake to consider these guidelines in their employment policy and to implement them in the context of their “National Action Plans”.

In connection with the establishment of gender mainstreaming as a key orientation at EU level, corresponding approaches have received greater political attention and a more compulsory nature in Germany too – at least at programme level. Equality of opportunity for women and men is defined as a part of employment policy both at the level of political objectives in the annual “National Action Plan for Employment” (NAP) and at the level of legal provisions in the Social Code III, and is additionally supported by the interdepartmental government programme of “women and occupation”.

In the spectrum of tasks of the Federal Employment Service gender mainstreaming is embedded in two ways:

Firstly the Federal Employment Service is bound by the guidelines of the Social Code III and has to take them into account when performing its tasks. For active labour market policy, four substantial guidelines are prominent for the practical implementation of gender mainstreaming. They originate from EU guidelines and have been taken up in the Social Code III:8

- the inclusion of women in measures of active labour market policy in proportion to their share of the unemployed, which was proposed by the EU (§ 8 para. 2 Social Code III);
- maintaining special programmes and concepts aimed at supporting women, which are intended to improve their occupational situation and eliminate existing disadvantages on the labour market (§ 8 para. 1 Social Code III);
- taking better into account the needs of women and special groups such as women returning to employment. This means that benefits and schemes of active employment promotion are to be arranged in such a way as regards time, content and organisation that they take into account women’s family circumstances (cf. § 8 para. 3 Social Code III);
- and the guideline regarding a gender-specific documentation and reporting of the results (cf. § 11 para. 2 No. 4 Social Code III). This is done in the integration balances, which are open to the public and have to be drawn up anew after the end of each financial year.9

Secondly, since 1998 the Federal Employment Service has defined gender mainstreaming as a part of its organisation-related business policy: in October 1998 the Executive Board and the Board of Governors of the Federal Employment Service resolved to include the promotion of

8 With the Job-AQTIV Law which came into force on 1.1.2002, changes in individual regulations have resulted in this legal basis with regard to gender mainstreaming, but the general orientation of aims has not changed. Since we refer in the following to the period of validity of the Social Code III up to and including 2001, these changes are not taken into consideration; appropriate references are made, however, where necessary for understanding the developments. On the considerations in the run-up to the Job-AQTIV Law, cf. e.g. Böhrnsen et al. 2001: 9ff., on the statement from the Federal Employment Service cf. Dt. Bundestag 2001, for an account of the changes cf. also Buchheit 2002: 9.

9 Explanations regarding the integration balances can be found in Brinkmann 1999.
equal opportunities for women and men on the labour market as a permanent guideline of their business policy. This is reflected among other things in the main business-policy focuses, which are laid down anew every year in order to name priority areas of action and indicators to improve the situation on the labour market. Following the guidelines of the EU Employment Guidelines and the government’s National Action Plan for Employment, “equality of opportunity for women and men” has been listed here too as a cross-sectional task since 1999 and also as an independent objective since 2000 (cf. Wenner 2001; Tischer 2001).

At programme level the incorporation of gender mainstreaming in national labour market policy is therefore relatively advanced in Germany compared with the rest of Europe (cf. Rubery 2002). The implementation and the binding and permanent establishment of detailed concepts for gender mainstreaming is still in its infancy so far, however. Individual Ländler are already one step ahead of the federal government in this respect as they have commissioned relevant manuals and catalogues of criteria regarding gender mainstreaming in connection with the ESF. At the Federal Employment Service relevant preliminary work is being coordinated by the sections for women’s issues (cf. Parsch-Haertel 2000).

3 The evaluation of equal opportunities for women and men in the context of active labour market policy

In the context of the EU Employment Guidelines the development of indicators that make it possible to measure the progress being made towards equality of opportunity for women and men in employment policy as well as the use of procedures for evaluating the gender-specific effects are a binding part of the general idea of gender mainstreaming (LL 16; COM 2001a). These guidelines are firstly to be understood as a political task and are aimed at setting up and maintaining appropriate controlling and monitoring systems. Against this background in particular in the context of the ESF, work is also being done in Germany on the development of checklists and catalogues of appropriate criteria. As was shown above, the Federal Employment Service, too, associates the demand of gender mainstreaming with its monitoring and controlling system.

These developments are important starting points for the scientific evaluation of the success of gender mainstreaming strategies, though in the sense of targeted impact and implementation research it would be necessary for this to be augmented at different levels by monitoring and controlling: this includes, for example, additions to include information that can not be quantified or routinized, causal analysis studies on the net effects or research into the selection and interpretation of the indicators used in the monitoring (cf. Brinkmann 2000). Making such a demand on the research into gender mainstreaming in active labour market

---

10 E.g. Brandenburg (Meseke/Armstroff 2001) or Saxony (Friedrich et al. 2001) have had their own concepts for implementing the gender mainstreaming approach developed in connection with the EU structural fund support programme.

11 With the Job-AQTIV Law these sections were renamed “representatives for equality of opportunity on the labour market” and their work description was adapted accordingly (§ 397 Job-AQTIV Law).

12 Cf. FN 9. On the overview of corresponding activities in Europe see the Internet database “DIGMA” (Database of Instruments for Gender Mainstreaming), which contains an extensive commented collection of instruments for implementing gender mainstreaming (http://www.destin.be/cgi-bin/amit/cgint.exe/37622-343?i&tmpl=top&GLB_BASE=digm).
policy is right in the sense of a future research programme, but at the present time it proves
to be a demand that can not be met.

This is due firstly to restrictions resulting from the monitoring and controlling system, which
by definition is not aimed first and foremost at its applicability in research contexts but at its
use in practice. Secondly, the difficulty of assessing the extent to which the “good intentions”
of gender mainstreaming in the context of active labour market policy have lead to real
success also has to do with the shortcomings of the research situation: whereas in the
meantime a number of papers are available on gender-specific occupations, career histories,
employment forms and labour market prospects (cf. the papers in Engelbrech 2002), the
gender-specific examination of the effects of active labour market policy has so far led a
somewhat shadowy existence in labour market research.

From the viewpoint of evaluation research on active labour market policy it can be stated that
irrespective of gender-specific aspects, existing empirical studies in some cases obtain highly
heterogeneous results both at the level of Germany’s political and economic system and at the
level of individual people and groups, depending on factors such as the study method, data
basis, period of the study or research issues (cf. for an overview Rabe 2000; Fitzenberger/
Speckessser 2000).14

Especially with regard to gender-specific aspects in the access to measures of active labour
market policy and the employment prospects after completing the measures many questions
remain open to date. In labour-market-policy evaluation research “gender” is treated at best as
one dimension of study among others. A more far-reaching gender-specific analysis is often
impossible due to the low number of cases and the spectrum of characteristics available in the
data sources used.15 Frequently, however, possible gender-specific differences are not taken
as a central subject at all. To our knowledge there are no empirical studies on active labour
market policy that focus on questions regarding gender-specific factors. What seems to be
obvious, however, is that those studies which pay attention to gender-specific differences
generally also find some. Active labour market policy is therefore not “gender-neutral” either
in its requirements or in its effects.

In the evaluation studies, in particular the type of measure and arrangement of the measure as
well as specific regional labour market characteristics and policies (east-west) are cited as
further important differentiating characteristics in addition to gender. Rabe (2001: 325) for
example holds the opinion on the basis of her survey of evaluation studies that women “are
even over-represented in the meantime” among the participants in further vocational training
and job-creation measures, but in contrast are under-represented in such support measures for
which the decision regarding participations is not made solely by the employment offices, but
above all by the employers and which are generally associated with greater chances of
(re)integration into the labour market; integration subsidies are one example of this.

However, a greater level of participation of women in labour market policy measures does not
automatically also mean better labour market opportunities – this is particularly true against
the background of the generally poorer labour market situation in eastern Germany (cf.

---

13 This demand is also confirmed for example – in a general form – for the research prospects until 2005 in the
7th special focus programme of the Institute for Employment Research (cf. IAB 2000).
14 This finding is also true of studies in other countries; cf. Fay 1996.
15 These are mainly the SOEP (Socio-economic panel) and the labour market monitor for eastern Germany;
with the data from the SOEP additional difficulties arise from the incomplete differentiation between private
and publicly assisted further training measures.
With regard to the destination of the participants following measures of active labour market policy there are additional problems in the evaluation for which there are no clear results to date: for instance also from the point of view of gender-specific factors it is necessary to distinguish between short-term and long-term destination and to consider the possibility of "measure careers" (Lutz et al. 1999) and of a transition from a measure into labour-market-related inactivity. Furthermore the relationship between the type of measure and its arrangement and the subsequent destination of the participants especially with regard to gender-specific aspects constitutes an important area of research for which there are hardly any findings. It is obvious, however, that the arrangement of measures as regards time and organisation contributes to whether a measure is attractive for instance to people who have to care for family members, or for parents of small children and can be completed successfully by such people.

These examples make it clear that a differentiation between women and men alone provides only limited insight. Therefore it is also important to differentiate within the group of women (and of course that of men) between different target groups as they can show quite different profiles as regards their risks or chances on the labour market. However, there are as yet hardly any results available in this respect in connection with measures of active labour market policy.

Against this background this paper is to be seen above all as a contribution to the recent discussion. With the aid of descriptive results it is intended to record points of reference for further research and to make clear the need for action in practice.

4 Data and methods

In the following it is examined first of all for selected discretionary benefits of the Federal Employment Service whether women and men are involved in the labour market policy measures in proportion to their share of the unemployed, or whether gender-specific differences exist. This is done by comparing the shares of women in the inflows to selected measures provided by the Federal Employment Service with the average share of women in the outflows out of unemployment in the period under observation (1998 - 2001).

The second step is the examination of the employment-status rate. This reports how many of the participants were no longer registered as unemployed six months after completing a measure/scheme. This provides first points of departure as to whether the completion of the various measures helps to end unemployment.

The data basis used for the evaluations is the integration balance, which has been drawn up annually after the end of each financial year since 1998.16

Unemployment is heavily concentrated on groups of people with characteristics which make placement difficult (cf. Karr 1999). Thus for instance in September 2000 67 % of the unemployed were older than 50, had no training, had health problems or showed several of these characteristics (cf. BA 2001b: 131). In order to catch particularities regarding such target groups with characteristics that hinder placement, in the following account attention is also directed towards long-term unemployed and older women as groups that require special

---

16 Further information on the integration balances can be found in Brinkmann (1999).
support. Against this background, in the following analysis referring to the years 1998 to 2001 the question is also asked as to whether a change occurred in the participation in individual measures over time.

The results are always shown first for Germany as a whole and then separately for eastern and western Germany, since previous studies conducted by the IAB have shown that there is a strong correlation between the regional development on the labour market, the structure of the participants and the level of the employment-status rate (cf. Vollkommer 2000).

In the examination we distinguish between the following labour market policy categories:

- **Measures of further vocational training:**
  These include measures aimed at promoting further vocational training (*Förderung der beruflichen Weiterbildung - FbW*) and short-term training courses (*Trainingsmaßnahmen - TM*).

- **Employment-accompanying measures:**
  We count integration subsidies (*Eingliederungszuschüsse - EGZ*) and recruitment subsidies for new businesses (*Einstellungszuschüsse bei Neugründungen - EGN*) here.

- **Measure aimed at supporting self-employment:**
  This category includes the bridging allowance (*Überbrückungsgeld - UG*).

- **Employment-creating measures:**
  These include job-creation measures (*Arbeitsbeschaffungsmaßnahmen - ABM*) and general structural adjustment measures (*Strukturanpassungsmaßnahmen - SAM*).

The following table provides a short overview of the contents and benefits of the individual measures (for detailed information cf. Blien et al. 2002).

**Table 1:** Overview of the active labour market policy instruments examined

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Instruments</th>
<th>Description of the instruments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Measures of further vocational training</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Further vocational training (<em>berufliche Weiterbildung - FbW</em>) = long term training</td>
<td>- Courses lasting several months aimed at imparting, extending and/or updating knowledge and skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Intended to contribute towards reintegration into the primary labour market and towards avoiding unemployment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The costs of the further training may be paid by the Federal Employment Service. In addition maintenance allowance may be paid (payment equivalent to unemployment benefit/assistance).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Short-term training courses (<em>Trainingsmaßnahmen - TM</em>)</td>
<td>- Courses or practical activities lasting a maximum of 12 weeks. The measures may be measures to establish aptitude, job application training, monitoring of willingness to work and employability or the teaching of knowledge and skills.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Intended to help to improve the prospects of the unemployed of being integrated into the primary labour market.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- During the training courses unemployment benefit/assistance is paid/continued, as long as benefit entitlement exists. In addition the costs of the course can be reimbursed.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Employment-accompanying measures (= integration and recruitment subsidies)

| Integration subsidies (Eingliederungszuschüsse –EGZ) | • In the case of the integration subsidy, employers receive a subsidy towards remuneration which is intended to compensate for the poorer performance of the unemployed who are hard-to-place.  
• Differentiation is made between the following types of integration subsidy: integration subsidy for the “settling-in period”, in the case of placement difficulties (for long-term unemployed people, the severely disabled and other disabled people who are hard-to-place due to their personal situation) and for older workers (from the age of 55, with at least six months of unemployment) and for people returning to working life.  
• The assistance must generally not exceed 30% (50% in the case of placement difficulties and for older workers) of the remuneration. The integration subsidy is generally paid for a maximum of 6 months (for settling-in; in the case of placement difficulties: 12 months; for older workers: 24 months). |
| --- | --- |
| Recruitment subsidy for new businesses (Einstellungszuschüsse bei Neugründungen – EZN) | • In the case of the recruitment subsidy for new businesses, employers receive a subsidy towards remuneration if they hire on a permanent contract a person who was previously unemployed and in need of support (applies for a maximum of 2 workers at any one time) and if they have been self-employed for less than two years.  
• The assistance can be paid for a maximum of 12 months and can amount to 50% of the assessable remuneration. |
| Measure to assist self-employment | • Workers who end or avoid their unemployment by becoming self-employed receive a bridging allowance during the first 6 months of self-employment, which amounts to the last unemployment benefit/assistance drawn and is intended to guarantee their subsistence. |
| Employment-creating measures = wage subsidy programme | • Providers of job creation measures can receive subsidies and loans for the employment of workers allocated to them (by the employment office) who are in need of support, as long as the jobs are additional and are in the interest of the public.  
• The subsidy amounts to between 30% and 75% of the assessable remuneration and is paid for a maximum of 12 months. |
| Structural adjustment measures (Strukturpassungsmaßnahmen allgemein – SAM) | • Providers of structural adjustment measures can receive subsidies for the employment of workers allocated to them (by the employment office) who are in need of support, as long as new jobs are created or job losses are compensated for as a result of the SAM and they are located in certain areas (environment, protection of historical monuments, ...).  
• The subsidy is paid in a flat-rate form up to the level of the average unemployment benefit/assistance for a maximum of 36 months. At present the structural adjustment measures are limited until 31.12.2008. |
5 Results

5.1 Inflows into selected measures of active labour market policy

In the following the inflows into measures of active labour market policy are examined by gender and for two groups which are particularly in need of support – long-term unemployed and older women. The analysis shows whether women are really supported in proportion to their share of the unemployed. The proportion of women among the outflows from unemployment (notifications of deregistration) serves as a reference quantity, as the inflows into measures and schemes are drawn from this group. Here it can be seen that:

- **Women are under-represented in inflows into integration and recruitment subsidies compared with their share of the unemployed, but over-represented in measures of vocational training and in job-creation measures (cf. Figure 1)**

![Figure 1](image)

**Figure 1**

Proportions of women in measures/schemes as %
Federal Republic of Germany

The examination of the inflows shows for the whole of Germany that as regards measures of further vocational training (FbW + TM) more women were involved in the measures during the entire period under observation than corresponded to their share of the unemployed. In the employment-accompanying measures, (integration subsidies [Eingliederungszuschüsse – EGZ] + recruitment subsidies for new businesses [Einstellungszuschüsse bei Neugründungen – EZN]) on the other hand the proportion of women was lower than their share of the unemployed – although an increasing trend can be determined between 1998 and 2001.

As far as the recipients of the bridging allowance are concerned the proportion of women is extremely low. This may be attributable to the double burden which is associated with setting up a business for women. Over and above the special run-up difficulties which have to be overcome mainly in the initial phase of setting up a business, family obligations constitute an

---

17 Information on short-term training courses has only been provided in the integration balance since 1999.
18 For better orientation, the average female share of the unemployed (outflow examination) for the period cited (1998 to 2001) is shown in the graphs as a parallel to the abscissa. In the period 1998 – 2001 it averaged 42.7% (outflow examination).
additional demand for many women, especially if there are children to be looked after.\textsuperscript{19} It may already be the anticipation of this double burden that makes women more likely than men to reject the intention of setting up a new business as early as the run-up. As a further reason for the low proportion of women among the recipients of the bridging allowance it is necessary to consider the business policy of banks concerning granting loans to women, which has so far been rather restrained.

For the wage subsidy programmes the picture is inconsistent. Whilst the proportion of women in job-creation measures (ABM) was higher than their share of the unemployed, it was exactly the other way around for the general structural adjustment measures (SAM). The proportion of women in the SAMs proves to be relatively constant throughout the years, whilst it declined for job-creation measures between 1998 and 2001 and thus came closer to the female share of the unemployed.

For wage subsidy programmes, further results are available from a special evaluation.\textsuperscript{20} It emerges from this that:

- In wage subsidy programmes the length of time that women spend in the measures is at least one or two months longer than that of men.\textsuperscript{21} This applies equally for both eastern and western Germany. It must be left for further analyses to investigate whether this is due to differences in the structure of the measures in which women and men participate, or whether men are more likely to find a job and therefore leave the measure before completion or drop out of the measures for other reasons.

- Across the country women worked more for public institutions and NGOs. What is especially striking is the difference in the case of SAMs, where across the country three quarters of the structural adjustment measures in the private economy were allocated to men. Combined with the thought that the probability of being taken on permanently after concluding the measure is greatest in the private economy, the below-average participation of women appears to be especially precarious.

- Women and men were represented in measures with a training or work experience module in proportion to their share of the unemployed.

\textbullet\ In western Germany women are clearly under-represented in job-creation measures; whereas in eastern Germany "measure careers" are emerging.

Compared with the development in the country as a whole, the situation in western Germany shows two differences: in western Germany women were clearly under-represented in job-creation measures. In short-term training courses their support was in proportion to their share of the unemployed.

\textsuperscript{19} As Dobler (1998: 281ff.) shows in an empirical study on women setting up their own businesses, the obligation to care for children can actually be a trigger for women becoming self-employed, however, if the women setting up the businesses associate this with the hope of being able to combine better an occupation with family activities, e.g. by being able to determine hours of work oneself. This prospect is likely to prove difficult to realise, however, especially in the initial phase.

\textsuperscript{20} In the context of a cooperation project by the IAB and the Johann Wolfgang Goethe University of Frankfurt (Brinkmann/Hujer, IAB project number 10 \textsuperscript{-} 535) "integration effects and further benefits of ABMs and SAMs for the people assisted, taking into particular account the SAMs for older workers" are examined for the year 2000. We would like to thank Stephan Thomsen, Johann Wolfgang Goethe University of Frankfurt/Main, chair for statistics and econometrics, for the computations.

\textsuperscript{21} The average duration of the measures is 327 days for ABMs and 375 days for SAMs.
Eastern Germany’s structure of inflows into the measures is similar to that in the country as a whole, but for most measures at a higher level: women are represented to an above-average extent – with a falling tendency between 1998 and 2001 – in measures of further vocational training and in job-creation measures. These results could be evidence of women going into measure careers more frequently in eastern Germany than in western Germany: it is possible that the large proportion of women in both measures of further vocational training and job-creation measures shows that women in the eastern part of the country participate in several training schemes more often than men. It can be assumed that they switch between spells of unemployment and phases of participating in measures of active labour market policy but without managing the leap into a (non-assisted) employment relationship (cf. Deeke 2002).22

➢ Long-term unemployed women are more strongly under-represented in the inflows into integration and recruitment subsidies than women overall. This applies in particular to western Germany. In eastern Germany setting up one’s own business is often used as a last way out of long-term unemployment (cf. Figure 2).

Figure 2

![Proportions of women in measures - long-term unemployed](image)

Source: Own calculations using the data of the integration balances 1998 to 2001

In the integration and recruitment subsidies, long-term unemployed women – like unemployed women overall – were under-represented compared with their share of the long-term unemployed.23 However, their share rose over the years. Unlike the group of unemployed women overall, however, long-term unemployed women are also under-represented in short-term training courses and job-creation measures compared with men in the meantime, as their participation has been falling continuously since 1998. Only in measures of further vocational training were long-term unemployed women represented to the same extent as long-term unemployed men.

---

22 Such measure careers are also possible because longer waiting periods between two measures are generally only defined by law for the same type of measure. However, a switch between different types of measure and spells of unemployment is not restricted by law if the particular assistance requirements are met.

23 On average the female share of the long-term unemployed – between 1998 and 2000 – stood at 50.3% in Germany and was thus 7.5 percentage points higher than women’s share of the unemployed overall. For women’s share of the long-term unemployed it was only possible to take into account the outflow data from the integration balances of 1998 to 2000 since the data for 2001 were not yet available.
What is noticeable is the disproportionately low participation of long-term unemployed women in any measure/scheme above all in western Germany. To put it clearly, it can be said that as far as the long-term unemployed in western Germany are concerned, active labour market policy focuses on men.

For eastern Germany the results are different: there, although women’s share of the long-term unemployed, at 59%, is clearly higher than in western Germany (45%), their participation in measures of active labour market policy is also clearly higher. In measures of further vocational training the proportion of female participants in eastern Germany is higher than women’s share of the long-term unemployed. As regards the integration subsidies and job-creation measures more than half of the participants are female, but the participation of women nonetheless does not quite correspond with their share of the long-term unemployed. The comparatively large proportion of unemployed women overall in job-creation measures in eastern Germany which could be ascertained at the beginning is therefore relativised for the group of long-term unemployed women.

The comparatively large proportion of long-term unemployed women among the recipients of the bridging allowance in eastern Germany is worth mentioning as well. The female share of the long-term unemployed recipients of the bridging allowance between 1998 and 2001 stood at one third in eastern Germany, but in western Germany was only a quarter. This could be a sign that in eastern Germany long-term unemployed women see self-employment as their last chance of getting out of unemployment.

> Older women were over-represented in inflows into measures of further vocational training and job-creation measures compared with their share of the older unemployed, whereas they were under-represented in integration and recruitment subsidies. These trends are more obvious in western Germany than in eastern Germany (cf. Figure 3).

In vocational training and job-creation measures older women are over-represented, but in integration and recruitment subsidies they are clearly under-represented. Thus women over 50 years of age show a similar structure of support across the country as women overall, but at a lower level.

In western Germany the participation of older women in the measures and schemes was even lower than in the country as a whole, which can be seen again above all in the low rate of women receiving the bridging allowance or participating in integration and recruitment subsidy schemes.

The percentages look somewhat better for older women in eastern Germany: they are taken into account in vocational training measures and job-creation measures in proportion to their share of the older unemployed (or above this level).

---

24 What is to be noted positively is the drop in the female share of the long-term unemployed in eastern Germany. Though it still stood at 61% in 1998, by 2000 it had fallen to 57.5%.
5.2 Employment-status rates

The employment-status rate shows how many participants are no longer registered as unemployed six months after completing a measure or subsidy programme. In the integration balances the outflows from measures during a financial year (e.g. January to December 2001) are used as a basis, with the result that a different 12-month period (July of the financial year (2001) until June of the following year (2002)) arises for the employment-status rate. Complete employment-status rates have only been available since 1999 (BA 2001a: 143), therefore results can only be shown below for 1999 and 2000.

Whereas the inflow data provide a reliable overview of the participant structure in measures, caution is needed in several respects when interpreting the employment-status rates: it must be taken into account that the integration balances only provide (short-term) gross destination results and do not permit statements either regarding the “pure effects of the measure” or regarding the sustainability of the effects of the measure (cf. Brinkmann 2000: 488). Although it is possible to make direct statements concerning the (registered) unemployment of the former participants on the basis of the employment-status rate, only indirect statements can be made with regard to taking up employment: the fact that someone is not registered as unemployed at the employment office after completing a measure can also be due to labour-market-related inactivity because of child-care or due to entry into another labour market policy measure – courses that have to be taken into consideration, especially for women. In order to counteract such data restrictions, in the revised version of § 11 (6) of the

---

25 In the case of ABM, SAM, EGZ, EZN and ÜG the employment-status rate provides information as to whether the participants are registered as unemployed or not on the reference date six months after the exit from the measure or subsidy programme. In the case of further vocational training measures employment-status rates are available referring to the six-month period (cf. BA 2001a: 142). For short-term training courses and mobility support no employment-status rates are (yet) shown in the integration balance.

26 The outflows from measures include both participants leaving the measures before completion and those leaving after successfully completing the measures.

Source: Own calculations using the data of the integration balances for 1998 to 2001
Social Code III ("Job-AQTIV Law") it is stipulated to show separately in the integration balance in future the “number of workers who are in employment subject to social security contributions after an appropriate period of time following the measure” in relation to the number of participants in the measure (integration rate). Nevertheless, from the viewpoint of gender mainstreaming, the descriptive analyses of the integration balances can provide important indications as to chances and problematic aspects of active labour market policy not only when comparing the sexes but also when comparing individual sub-groups.

When interpreting the results it must also be taken into consideration that in some cases different objectives are pursued with the individual subsidy programmes / measures, with the result that caution is also needed from this viewpoint when comparing the employment-status rates. For example, it is possible for the increased support of groups that are especially in need of support to be at the expense of the employment-status rates (cf. Blaschke/Nagel, 1995).

In the case of the integration and recruitment subsidy schemes, women have the highest employment-status rates and in the wage subsidy programmes the lowest (cf. Figure 4). This means that the employment-status rates are particularly high especially for those measures in which women are in part clearly under-represented in relation to their share of the unemployed.

Figure 4

![Employment-status rates of women in measures/schemes as %](image)

Source: Own calculations using the data of the integration balances 1999 and 2000

Figure 4 shows that the highest employment-status rates resulted for the integration and recruitment subsidy schemes (EGZ, EZN) and the bridging allowance (ÜG), with 80% in each case, but on the other hand the lowest rates resulted for wage subsidy programmes (ABM, SAM), with under 60% in each case. In contrast, the employment-status rates for further vocational training measures, at around 60%, were mid-table. If these employment-status rates are related to the participation of women in measures shown earlier, then this means that especially in the measures for which the employment-status rates were particularly high, women were in some cases clearly under-represented in relation to their share of the

---

27 One example is the aim of relieving the labour market in the case of the job-creation measures in contrast with the aim of integration in the case of integration subsidies.
unemployed. In 2000 the employment-status rates showed a slight increase compared with 1999 irrespective of the type of measure/subsidy scheme.

The highest employment-status rate resulted for the bridging allowance, which is paid to previously unemployed people who set up their own business, in order to safeguard their subsistence. This must be qualified, however, by pointing out that after one year women who set up their own business are still in the building up phase or are busy establishing their business. Therefore the six-month destination period under examination appears to be too short to make valid statements about the firm’s ability to survive and thus about the danger of renewed unemployment.

With regard to the high integration rates for the “integration subsidy for the settling-in period” it could be objected that in accordance with a “repayment paragraph” (§ 223 para. 2 of the Social Code III) in some circumstances the employer must pay back part of the subsidy if the employment relationship is terminated during the subsidy period or shortly after its end (max. 12 months). However, this argument can be refuted somewhat on the basis of the “recruitment subsidies for new businesses”: there the employment-status rate was similar in level to that for the “integration subsidies for the settling-in period” although there are no repayment obligations. It can therefore be presumed that in the case of integration and recruitment subsidies, women make use of the opportunity to convince the potential employer of their own occupational abilities and skills.

A comparison of the employment-status rates of women and men\(^28\) supports this supposition: here it can be seen for the country as a whole that women show an employment-status rate that is at least four percentage points above that of men for the integration subsidy and the recruitment subsidy for new businesses, whereas men do better in further vocational training measures and job-creation measures, with an employment-status rate which is at least five percentage points higher than that of women.

- The employment-status rates of women are in some cases clearly higher in western Germany than in eastern Germany.

In western Germany the employment-status rates of women showed a similar picture to those for the country as a whole in their relations to each other, but at a clearly higher level, which can presumably be attributed to the better labour market in western Germany compared with the east. Just as in the country as a whole, in western Germany the employment-status rates across all the measures increased in the year 2000 compared with 1999 – thanks to the positive development in the economy as a whole.

As mentioned earlier, the labour market situation must always be taken into consideration when analysing the employment-status rate. If the underemployment rate\(^29\) – differentiated according to employment office areas – is used as an indicator to describe the labour market, then it can be seen that the lowest underemployment rate (19.2%) of an employment office area in eastern Germany is still higher than the highest rate (18.3%) in western Germany (cf. Vollkommer 2001: 2). This explains the precarious labour market situation in eastern Germany.

---

28 The comparison of the gender-specific employment-status rates is based on the data from the integration balances of 2000.

29 In the definition used here the underemployment rate covers in addition to the registered unemployed also the participants in job-creation and structural adjustment measures as well as measures of further vocational training and short-time work in the full-time equivalent (cf. Vollkommer 2001: 2).
Against this background it is not surprising that compared with western Germany the employment-status rates of women – with the exception of the integration subsidy and the bridging allowance, for which the employment-status rate remains high – were in some cases clearly lower in eastern Germany. The exceptionally low employment-status rate for job-creation measures confirms other findings according to which job-creation measures in eastern Germany help primarily to relieve the labour market and to balance out the existing job deficit as well as to stabilise the mental and social situation of the participants in the measures (cf. for an overview Franck 2001). On the whole the employment-status rate in eastern Germany in 2000 stood slightly above that of the previous year in spite of stagnation in underemployment (cf. BA 2001a: 13).  

There are several possible explanations for this which cannot be investigated on the basis of the present data: on the one hand it is conceivable that women in western Germany have been able to benefit to a large extent from the expansion of the services sector. However, as the employment-status rate does not make it possible to give a statement as to whether and where a person has actually joined the labour market or whether he/she has only “deregistered” from unemployment, it would also be conceivable on the other hand that women in western Germany are more likely than eastern German women to withdraw into the marginal labour force after completing a measure and failing to find work. In a further step it would therefore be necessary to clarify what kind of activity (employment, family, voluntary position etc.) the female participants go into afterwards. The integration rate stipulated for the future in the Job-AQTIV Law will at least be able to provide information about how many participants in measures have actually taken up jobs liable to social security contributions.

▶ **Long-term unemployed women have a clearly lower employment-status rate than women in general. This applies in particular in eastern Germany.**

For long-term unemployed women, too, the employment-status rates were highest for the integration and recruitment subsidies (in particular for integration subsidies). Compared with unemployed women in general, the employment-status rates for long-term unemployed women were lower (in some cases significantly so) across all the measures/schemes. The difference is especially great in the case of the measures of further vocational training. What may be responsible for this are stigmatisation effects resulting from the long duration of unemployment prior to the measure. It would also be conceivable that in the group of long-term unemployed women there are fewer people who accept withdrawal into the marginal labour force as an alternative to employment by withdrawing from the measure into labour-market-related inactivity, thus being registered as “leaving unemployment”. Here, too, it will only be possible to obtain further information by comparing the future “integration rates”.

In the case of the job-creation measures only slight differences can be observed between long-term unemployed women and unemployed women overall. This can presumably be put down to the fact that the group of long-term unemployed female participants in job-creation measures differs only slightly from the female participants in job-creation measures overall as a result of the criteria for receiving the support, since job-creation measures are given above all to long-term unemployed people and people who were registered as unemployed at the employment office for at least six months during the last twelve months.

---

30 This development was accompanied by a shift in the mixture of measures towards more integration and recruitment subsidies and training measures (cf. BA 2001a: 13).
In an east-west comparison clearly lower employment-status rates result for eastern Germany just as for unemployed women in general. Exceptions to this are integration subsidies and the bridging allowance, for which the employment-status rates differ only slightly between western and eastern Germany.

If the gender-specific employment-status rates are compared with each other, then it can be seen that in Germany as a whole and in eastern Germany long-term unemployed women show an employment-status rate for integration and recruitment subsidies that is at least 5 percentage points higher. Long-term unemployed men on the other hand do better in further vocational training and in job-creation measures (an employment-status rate that is at least 4 percentage points higher); here the results are therefore also similar to those for all unemployed women and men. In contrast, in western Germany long-term unemployed women have an employment-status rate that is at least two percentage points higher than that of long-term unemployed men irrespective of the type of measure/scheme.

> Older women have the highest employment-status rates for integration and recruitment subsidies and the lowest for wage subsidy programmes. This trend is more obvious in eastern than in western Germany.

Throughout Germany the structure of the employment-status rates obtained for the sub-group of "older women" is similar to that for unemployed women overall, although at a somewhat lower level. However, there are extreme downward deviations in the case of further vocational training. There the employment-status rate of older women is 15 percentage points lower than that of unemployed women overall. Only half of the older women were no longer registered as unemployed six months after completing the further vocational training. This could be the result on the one hand of employers' scepticism regarding older unemployed people, but on the other hand it is also conceivable that the older women were trained in excess of demand. Furthermore one could suppose that older women are less likely than younger women to withdraw into the marginal labour force, in order to avoid disadvantages with regard to their pension entitlement.

An east-west comparison shows that in particular eastern German women are affected by the low employment-status rates for measures of further vocational training and for wage subsidy programmes. For groups which are especially in need of support, such as older female workers, a poor labour market situation consequently has particularly negative effects. Only for the integration and recruitment subsidies are employment-status rates recorded that equal those in western Germany.

Another basis for comparison is the employment-status rate for older men. Whereas the older men in eastern Germany and in Germany as a whole show an employment-status rate that is at least five percentage points higher than that of older women for measures of further vocational training and job-creation measures, better rates result for women with regard to integration and recruitment subsidies. Just as in the examination of the long-term unemployed, the employment-status rates of older women overall in western Germany are up to five percentage points higher than those of men.
5.3 Gender mainstreaming in the ESF-BA programme 1995 to 1999

From 1995 to 1999 active labour market policy by the government in Germany was supplemented by a programme that was co-financed from resources of the European Social Fund (ESF).\(^{31}\) On this basis with additional benefits related to the Employment Promotion Act (Arbeitsförderungsgesetz – AFG) or as of 1998 the Social Code III, the Federal Employment Service (Bundesanstalt für Arbeit – BA) promoted participation in measures of vocational training and the taking up of employment (cf. Deeke 1999).

The majority of cases of support concerned the augmentation of the statutory support in the field of further vocational training – firstly with components to augment measures,\(^{32}\) secondly with an ESF subsistence allowance for people who can not be paid subsistence allowance in the context of statutory standard assistance owing to lacking benefit entitlements.

Following the definition of the programme guidelines of the ESF, the target groups of this programme were:
- the long-term unemployed and unemployed people in danger of becoming long-term unemployed (including the disabled),
- young people without work or training,
- workers, especially female workers, who do not have adequate vocational qualifications or who wish to return to employment following a phase of non-employment, in particular after a break to bring up a family (women returners).

In order to promote equal opportunities women were to be reached not only in the specific target group of people with insufficient qualifications and women returners, but were also to be included to a greater extent in general.

In the context of the statistical reporting done by the Federal Employment Service on the ESF-BA programme, the characteristic of gender was not recorded initially. Unlike today the idea of gender mainstreaming had not yet been translated into an appropriate reporting system.\(^{33}\) Women have only been identified separately since 1997 (cf. Deeke 2002).

> In the context of the ESF supplement, women are even more strongly over-represented in measures of further vocational training than in the context of the regular support in accordance with the Social Code III.

As was shown earlier, throughout the country women are over-represented in the context of the measures of further vocational training in accordance with the Social Code III in relation to their share of the unemployed. This is even more true of the inflows into the ESF-BA support programme: both in western and in eastern Germany the proportion of women in the ESF-BA support programme was generally more than 10% higher than the already large proportion of women among all inflows into the further vocational training promoted under

---

\(^{31}\) With slight modifications the programme was launched again for the period 2000 to 2006. In this paper the precursor programme alone is considered.

\(^{32}\) In connection with regular measures aimed at promoting further vocational training (FbW): foreign language module, module with occupation-related general education, periods of work experience abroad, until 1997 also short-term measures in accordance with § 103b of the Employment Promotion Act.

\(^{33}\) The administrative data on the programme were relatively brief anyway. Only inflows (approvals for ESF support) were recorded and this was without the statistical differentiations according to group characteristics which are otherwise usual in statistics gathered by the Federal Employment Service.
the Social Code III. The ESF supplement has thus succeeded in making it possible for relatively more women to participate in further vocational training.

- **Long-term unemployed people were reached by the ESF-BA programme to a great extent irrespective of their gender.**

In the context of the evaluation research a postal survey was conducted among a representative sample of participants who had begun measures of further vocational training in the ESF-BA programme in 1996 and 1997. One important aim of the survey was to examine sociodemographic and employment-history characteristics of the participants in the measures and to gain information about their destination after leaving the measure (cf. Deeke 2002). This survey data confirmed the results cited earlier. In addition, they illustrated that men and women differ only slightly regarding other characteristics: long-term unemployed people were generally reached by the programme to an above-average extent irrespective of gender. The programme was used preventatively as it included people before they moved into long-term unemployment. However, also irrespective of gender, it was only possible in part to reach the group of people with insufficient qualifications; the participants in the ESF-BA programme had higher qualification levels both in eastern and western Germany than the people leaving unemployment. Young people and older people alike were rather underrepresented. What is also non-gender-specific are the large shares of ethnic Germans from the Eastern bloc who immigrated to Germany after 1945 (so-called *Spätaussiedler*) in the west, which were still on the increase in 1997 compared with 1996 both in western and eastern Germany (cf. Deeke 2002).

- **Differences can be seen between women in eastern and western Germany in their registration status before receiving the ESF-BA support. They substantiate the supposition that women in western Germany are more likely than women in eastern Germany to withdraw into the “marginal labour force”**.

Parallel to the increase in the proportion of *"Spätaussiedler"* among the participants in the measures, the proportion of women returners as a specific target group of the programme also fell from about 30% of all female participants in 1996 to just under 20% in the following year 1997. The drop was far more marked in western Germany than in the east. The decline in the proportion of women returners in western Germany is also reflected somewhat in falling values (1996: 27%; 1997: 21%) for the proportion of women who were not registered as unemployed before entering the programme. In eastern Germany on the other hand the proportion of women who were not registered as unemployed before entering the programme remained comparatively constant (1996: 6%; 1997: 7%; cf. Deeke 2002). The differences in the registration status discernible here between eastern and western German women once again confirm our supposition that western German women are more likely than their eastern German counterparts to withdraw into the “marginal labour force” if their search for employment fails. The high level of acceptance of the ESF-BA supplement among these women illustrates that this target group likes to make use of the possibilities of assistance intended to facilitate a return to working life.

- **After completing further training measures women succeed less frequently than men in becoming integrated into the labour market.**

The representative survey of participants in measures permits statements concerning all respondents who participated in the measures until their regular end (in other words without those who dropped out of the measures before the end), and who left the measure at least six
months before the survey. This permits details firstly about the taking up of employment during these six months – irrespective of whether the respondent was (still) employed in the sixth month (period-related examination) – and secondly about the employment status in the sixth month after leaving the measure (reference date examination).

Table 2 shows that of all the people who had ended their measure at the regular time only 41.7% were employed during the first six months after the end of the measure, whereby the rate for men, at 47.7%, was ten percentage points above that for women (37.8%). From this it can be concluded that women benefit even less from the "measures of further vocational training" than the figures from the integration balances on the destinations of the female participants had suggested. What is particularly striking are the gender-specific differences in eastern Germany: whilst 46.6% of the men there were in employment during the first six months after the end of the measure, the rate was only 32.8% for the women. In western Germany on the other hand the differences between men (48.7%) and women (44.0%) are clearly smaller.

Table 2: Transitions into employment – Percentages of all people leaving the measure (excl. drop-outs) six months after the end of the measure

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
<th>Men and Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Western Germany</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- during first six months</td>
<td>48.7</td>
<td>44.0</td>
<td>46.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- in sixth month</td>
<td>44.9</td>
<td>40.8</td>
<td>42.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Eastern Germany</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- during first six months</td>
<td>46.6</td>
<td>32.8</td>
<td>37.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- in sixth month</td>
<td>43.0</td>
<td>30.6</td>
<td>35.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Germany as a whole</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- during first six months</td>
<td>47.7</td>
<td>37.8</td>
<td>41.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- in sixth month</td>
<td>44.0</td>
<td>35.1</td>
<td>38.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Deeke 2002; IAB project 10/3-468
In sixth month overall (100 percent)
Western Germany: 2018 men, 2686 women; eastern Germany: 1913 men, 3401 women

If the results are considered not only with reference to the overall period of six months, but only referring to the sixth month after the end of the measure, then the relations remain the same, though with somewhat lower rates, which indicate that although some of the former participants in the measures were employed at some time during the six-month period, they gave up or had to give up the employment again during the course of the period under observation.

These results substantiate the supposition that women's chances of integrating into employment following a vocational training measure are dependent on the regional labour market situation to an even greater extent than is the case for men. It is also conceivable,
however, that the differences ascertained between men and women and between eastern and western Germany are associated with differences in the measures. In this context further multivariate analyses are being conducted by the IAB which incorporate further group characteristics (cf. Deeke 2002).

- **Women in eastern Germany assess the benefit of the training measures for taking up employment more critically than women in western Germany.**

The survey showed that even those eastern German women who had taken up a job following the measure assessed the benefit of the training measure for taking up employment rather critically in the survey: a quarter of them (compared with one in ten of this group in the west) reported that the measure was of no benefit at all for the job-search and only approx. 40% (compared with 56%) put their success in searching for work directly down to the training (cf. Deeke 2002). This result could indicate that in view of the difficult situation on the labour market, women in eastern Germany are more willing than women in western Germany to take up employment which does not correspond to their qualifications. In addition the question arises as to whether women in the eastern and western parts of Germany had had different expectations of the training measure beforehand. At the same time the result also raises pertinent questions regarding the accuracy of the further training measures as regards labour-market-policy and target-group orientation in eastern Germany; these questions can not be dealt with here, however.

### 5.4 Summary

In measures and benefits in accordance with the Social Code III, women were under-represented in the employment-accompanying benefits (integration subsidies and recruitment subsidies for new businesses) in the period 1998 to 2001. The employment-status rates of women were especially high for these measures. This confirms a corresponding supposition made by Rabe (2001). The low level of inclusion in this type of measure affected in particular women in western Germany; the high employment-status rate applies to both parts of the country. There is thus a need for action in connection with the below-average participation of women in such measures. Here both the actors at the labour administration when allocating appropriate support funds as well as the employers when filling appropriate vacancies are called upon to help in order, in the context of active labour market policy, to avoid another reproduction of the gender-specific segregation.

In the measures of further vocational training women were over-represented between 1998 and 2001, but showed a clearly lower employment-status rate especially in eastern Germany. The ESF-BA programme raises further the already high participation rate of women in measures of further vocational training and also opens up training opportunities for groups which can not be supported in accordance with the Social Code III due to requirements in the benefit entitlement rules not being met. The discrepancy between relatively high participation rates and relatively low employment-status rates also points to gender-specific problems of (re)integration into employment. In eastern Germany this could be associated with the generally poorer labour market situation, but it also calls into question the extent to which the measures are aimed at target groups and related to the labour market, especially as regards women.

The additionally high proportion of women included in wage subsidy programmes (job-creation measures and structural adjustment measures) in eastern Germany without correspondingly high employment-status rates confirms the findings of Lutz et al. (2000),
according to which women in eastern Germany are more likely to find themselves in "measure careers". Women in western Germany, however, seem to be more likely to "oscillate" between measures and the marginal labour force. In both parts of Germany women obviously continue to have poorer chances than men of joining the primary labour market after a measure.

These problems are intensified for the groups examined which are particularly in need of support, "long-term unemployed women" and "older women": here our results indicate that the measures of active labour market policy have so far contributed only slightly to overcoming the placement obstacles. The difference between the participation in measures and the share of unemployment was generally greater for long-term unemployed and older women than for women in general. The questions as to the reasons for this finding can not be answered here. Do long-term unemployed women and in particular long-term unemployed women in western Germany show less motivation to "try it again" on the labour market by taking part in a (further) training programme? Or are long-term unemployed women taken into consideration less frequently in the recruitment of participants for measures because they are credited with poorer labour market chances than long-term unemployed men? In this respect further studies should provide information about the causes and the need for action.

In addition to this the employment-status rates of long-term unemployed and older women were lower than those of unemployed women in general. This was particularly true of measures of further vocational training: there the employment-status rate of long-term unemployed and older women throughout the country in 1999 and 2000 was 15% below the employment-status rate of the female participants in further vocational training measures overall.

6 Conclusions

6.1 Lessons for practice

The lessons for practice gained from the analysis can be summarised into six theses:

1. Guidelines according to which women should be involved in measures of active labour market policy in proportion to their share of the unemployed constitute an important step towards implementing gender mainstreaming, but a step that is insufficient on its own. It is even more important that the implementation of these guidelines be observed and examined empirically and that the reasons for deviations be investigated.

2. In this context a gender-specific monitoring system of the employment and training schemes is an indispensable requirement. In this respect the Federal Employment Service has taken steps in the right direction with the integration balances and controlling reports. In order to obtain an actual overview of the implementation of gender mainstreaming in active labour market policy throughout the entire country, a co-operation of the federal government, regional government and local authorities would be desirable. This would make it possible to draw up regularly an overall survey, with specific subjects, of both the results of the active labour market policy in accordance with the Social Code III and national pilot schemes and of the results of regional labour-market-policy programmes.

3. The inclusion of women in integration and recruitment subsidy schemes in proportion to their share of the unemployed remains an important task. It can be influenced firstly by
means of appropriate regulations in the legislation regarding support. Secondly, however, in order to ensure a better inclusion of women, employers, too, are called upon to counteract a reproduction of the segregation on the labour market in the use of support instruments.

4. With regard to the measures of further vocational training a greater orientation towards demand and towards the needs of the different target groups among women as well as a more precise focusing on labour market demand, should ensure that the participation in measures does not remain a one-way street but becomes more than before a bridge to employment.

5. Against the background of our results, the calculation of gender-specific integration rates in addition to the employment-status rates, which is stipulated in the Job-AQTIV Law, also proves to be a key contribution to gender mainstreaming: only on the basis of such data is it possible to make reliable statements regarding the transition into a job after participation in a labour market policy measure and to adapt programmes and concepts if necessary.

6. The developments concerning measures of further vocational training refer to conceptual deficits of gender mainstreaming in active labour market policy. Such concepts must be elaborated further both from the point of view of results and also from the point of view of structure and process aspects. Here the operationalisation both in practice and in scientific discourse is still in its infancy.

6.2 Lessons for research

1. Active labour market policy in its diverse facets can only be adequately analysed and interpreted if the gender specificity of its individual, labour-market policy and social preconditions and effects are kept in sight. A corresponding “sensitisation” of labour market research is still in its infancy, however.

2. Research on the impact of active labour market policy is called upon firstly to include gender-specific aspects in its studies more intensively than has so far been the case and secondly to fill the existing gaps in research on gender mainstreaming in active labour market policy by means of specific studies on different target groups. Analyses such as the present one are a first impetus which must be followed by further studies.

3. The differences between eastern and western Germany regarding the participation in and the destination after measures have hardly changed. This confirms on the one hand the necessity for regionally differentiated analyses of the labour market prospects following active labour market policy measures. On the other hand it shows that these analyses should rather be linked with information on the continuity or change of female career orientation and life plans in the two parts of Germany.

4. In addition to the questions as to the gender-specific effects of active labour market policy, a number of questions also arise from the process-related and cross-sectional character of gender mainstreaming. Possible key questions\(^34\) at the level of the programmes (guidelines, target indicators etc.) and their structural establishment are: in

\(^{34}\) The following considerations are based on the social-science policy analysis as a heuristic instrument (cf. Heritier 1993)

IAB Labour Market Research Topics 50 (2003)
what way and with what results is gender mainstreaming taken into account when decisions are made regarding the arrangement of programmes and measures of active labour market policy? Which institutional and organisational actors are involved in these decisions?

5. At the level of implementation the question must be asked how to deal with gender-specific quotas in practice and how to organise measures with sensitivity towards gender aspects both within organisations and in cooperation between employment offices and other actors, e.g. employers in the private economy. Do the measures reflect the segregation on the labour market or is there success in counteracting this segregation? How can a “levelling down” to the level of the disadvantaged sex be avoided? Where does active labour market policy come up against “departmental boundaries” in its efforts concerning gender mainstreaming - for example boundaries to economic or family policy?

6. In addition it should be clarified how the overlapping of decision-making processes, institutional and organisational structures of active labour market policy and the results can be operationalised with regard to equal opportunities. Simple “if-then” explanations do not appear to be sufficient here. For example: although the guarantee of gender mainstreaming in decision-making processes is of great relevance politically, it is not associated either in practice or in research with the guarantee of equal opportunities emerging in the result.
References


The papers published in this series:

6. Heinz Werner: The Integration of Foreign Workers into the Labour Market, (France, Germany, Netherlands, Sweden) (1994)
The papers published in this series (continued):


23  Elmar Hönekopp: Labour Migration to Germany from Central and Eastern Europe - Old and New Trends (1997)


26  Udo Brixy, Susanne Kohaut: Employment Growth Determinants in New Firms in Eastern Germany - Based on a Combination of IAB Establishment Database and IAB Establishment Panel (1998)


37  Lutz Bellmann/Martin Brussig: Productivity Differences Between Western and Eastern German Establishments (1999)


The papers published in this series (continued):


43 Heinz Werner: From Guests to Permanent Stayers? – From the German “Guestworker” Programmes of the Sixties to the Current “Green Card” Initiative for IT Specialists (2001)

44 Ulrich Walwei/Heinz Werner/Ingeborg König: Lessons We Can Learn From Other Countries (2001)


49 Uwe Blien, Ulrich Walwei, Heinz Werner: Labour Market Policy in Germany (2002)

NOTICE

Reproduction Basis

This document is covered by a signed "Reproduction Release (Blanket)" form (on file within the ERIC system), encompassing all or classes of documents from its source organization and, therefore, does not require a "Specific Document" Release form.

This document is Federally-funded, or carries its own permission to reproduce, or is otherwise in the public domain and, therefore, may be reproduced by ERIC without a signed Reproduction Release form (either "Specific Document" or "Blanket").