A masters degree action research project implemented a program for higher order thinking skills through the use of journaling art history, elements, criticism, materials in the production of art. The targeted population consisted of 19 middle school students (grade 8) in a suburban area in northern Illinois. The problem of filling the need for combining the disciplines within art education to create a higher level of thinking is documented in student surveys and teacher observations. Analysis of probable cause data revealed that students showed evidence of a lack of connection between art history, elements, criticism, and art production. A student survey reported little transfer among various art education components. Review of the curriculum suggests lack of connection in various aspects of art. Teacher observations and surveys suggest the need for transfer among various aspects of art education to create holistic learning for the student. A review of the solution strategy suggests the need for a tool that would create a cohesive transfer of ideas. The practice of keeping a student journal throughout the art course filled the need for student privacy and provided a safe place for visual exploration. Post-intervention data indicated that students maintained their knowledge of art vocabulary and concepts throughout the study. On average, they discussed art more with their parents and felt more comfortable discussing their art work with others. Appended are consent forms, movement worksheet, journal idea sheet, an upside down drawing exercise, journal rubric, art element study guide, art element and color test, student critique format, and self-portrait evaluation. (Contains 1 table, 8 figures, and 24 references.) (Author/BT)
STUDENT JOURNALING TOWARD A HIGHER UNDERSTANDING OF ART

JELENA TODOROVICH

An Action Research Project Submitted to the Graduate Faculty of the School of Education in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Masters of Arts in Teaching and Leadership.

Saint Xavier University & IRI/Skylight
Field-Based Masters Program
Chicago, IL
April, 2002
This project was approved by

Dr. Hillary L. Thombs
Advisor

Marguerite A. Vanscuyk
Nancy Chriest
Advisor

Beverly Bulley
Dean, School of Education
ABSTRACT

This report describes a program for increasing higher level thinking skills through the use of journaling art history, elements, criticism and materials in the production of art. The targeted population consisted of middle school students in a suburban area, located in Northern Illinois. The problem of filling the need for combining the disciplines within art education in order to create a higher level of thinking is documented in student surveys and teacher observations.

The analysis of probable cause data revealed that students showed evidence of a lack of connection between art history, elements, criticism and art production. A student survey reported little transfer between the various components in art education. Review of the curriculum suggests lack of connection in the various aspects of art. Teacher observations, and teacher surveys suggest the need for transfer between the various aspects of art education to create holistic learning for the student.

A review of the solution strategy suggests the need for a tool that would create a cohesive transfer of ideas. The practice of keeping a student journal throughout their art course filled the need of the students privacy, and provided a safe place for visual exploration.

Post intervention data indicated that the students maintained their knowledge of art vocabulary and concepts throughout the study. Students on average discussed art more with their parents and felt more comfortable discussing their art work with others.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

**CHAPTER 1 – PROBLEM STATEMENT AND CONTEXT**

- General Statement of the Problem ........................................... 1
- Immediate Problem Context ................................................... 1
- The Surrounding Community .................................................. 4
- Nation Context of the Problem ................................................ 5

**CHAPTER 2 – PROBLEM DOCUMENTATION** ................................ 9

- Problem Evidence ..................................................................... 9
- Probable Causes ....................................................................... 13

**CHAPTER 3 – THE SOLUTION STRATEGY** ................................ 16

- Literature Review .................................................................... 16
- Project Objectives and Processes ............................................. 28
- Project Action Plan .................................................................. 29
- Methods of Assessment ............................................................ 30

**CHAPTER 4 – PROJECT RESULTS** .......................................... 31

- Historical Description of the Intervention ............................... 31
- Presentation and Analysis of Results ....................................... 41
- Conclusions and Recommendations ........................................ 52

**BIBLIOGRAPHY** .................................................................... 54

**APPENDICIES** ....................................................................... 56
CHAPTER 1

General Statement of the Problem

Students in the targeted eighth grade class experience a lack of transfer between visual art production, art history, art concepts, and art aesthetics. This deficit limits the student's ability to connect the various aspects of art. Evidence for the existence of the problem includes teacher observation, poor knowledge of vocabulary terms, large projects that are not connected with one another, and a lack of ability to communicate similarities and differences between works of art.

Immediate Problem Context

The school is a middle school housing grades six through eight. For the purpose of this study, the targeted level is eighth grade. The school is one of three in the district that services eighth grade students. This school was built to house 450 seventh and eighth grade students in 1961. The school began a renovation project in 1997 with the addition of 13 classrooms as the school changed status and became a middle school that housed grades, six, seven and eight. During the summer of 2001, four more classrooms were under construction, and completion was set for March of 2002. The current school population is 740 students.
The school building is arranged in a large square layout with only one floor. There are currently 54 rooms in the school building. The school is organized in grade level hallways. There is a sixth grade hallway, a seventh grade hallway, and an eighth grade hallway in which the core subjects for each grade level are housed. There is also a special subject hallway where the gymnasium, multi-purpose/lunchroom, art room, band, choir, industrial technology room, and home economics room are located.

The administrative staff consists of one head principal, an assistant principal, and two secretaries. There is a health clerk, media specialist with an assistant, a single guidance counselor, a social worker with two social work interns, and one speech pathologist. The school staff consists of 55 certified teachers and nine teacher assistants. This includes one sixth grade self-contained learning disabilities teacher, one self-contained behavior disorder teacher that services grades six through eight. There are also two teachers in classrooms for the mentally impaired, and four Regular Education Initiative (R.E.I.) teachers.

The racial-ethnic groups within the school are as follows: 73.4% White, 11.9% Hispanic, 10.7% Asian/Pacific Islander, and 4% African American. The attendance rate at the school is 95% with a mobility rate of 10.2% and a 0.9% rate for chronic truancy. The percentage of students who come from low-income families is 16.8%. The students coming from limited-English-proficient families is 2% (Illinois State Board of Education, 2001).
The average class size for the targeted grade level is 25.6 students. There are 30 teachers responsible for teaching science, mathematics, social studies, language arts, and literacy. The curriculum for each grade level is broken into four quarters of instruction. The students also receive physical education, and have the option to receive Spanish instruction year round. Industrial technology, home economics, art and music are required study for one term each. All class periods are 45 minutes in length.

There are several after school activities provided for the students. Boy and girl programs are available in cross-country, basketball, and volleyball. There is also a choir and orchestra program for the students at the school.

District Context

The school district in which the site is located consists of 11 schools with an enrollment of 4,600 students. There are eight elementary schools that service Kindergarten through fifth grade. There are also two middle schools housing grades six through eight. There is also a community school that services Kindergarten through eighth grade. This community school is considered a year-round school and is an alternative choice for parents in the district from the traditional education calendar.

There are several small ethnic communities that make up the district. This is reflected in the student background information. The racial-ethnic groups within the district are as follows: 60% White, 27.7% Hispanic, 8.8% Asian/Pacific Islander, and 2.8% African American. The average attendance rate of the district is 95.1% with a mobility rate of 14.7% and a 0.3% rate for chronic truancy. The
percentage of students that come from low-income families is at 22%. The students coming from limited-English-proficient families is 15.1% (Illinois State Board of Education, 2001).

The instructional climate for the district includes a 26.6 average class size. The staff to student ratio is 16.8:1. The pupil to certified staff ratio is 11.9:1. The pupil to administrator ratio is 220.6:1.

The full-time teacher racial makeup is 97% White, 1.4% Hispanic, 1.4% Asian/Pacific Islander, and 0.3% African American. The average teaching experience is 13.2 years. There are 63.5% of teachers with bachelor’s degrees, and 36.5% of the teachers with a master’s degree or above. Of the 365 teachers in the district, 83.2% are female, and 16.8% are male. The average teacher salary is $55,503.00 and the average administrator salary is 94,883.00 (Illinois State Board of Education, 2001).

The Surrounding Community

The school district is located in a suburb that borders a major Midwestern city. The city was founded by German immigrants and incorporated 140 years ago. The combination of being located on a river, and along the path between two major Midwestern cities via the railroad industry made this a desirable industrial and residential area.

The city has a population of approximately 52,900. The median age of the residents is 37.2 years. The median household income is $51,633, and the median rent is $725. The average housing for a single family home is $191,340 and $106,454 for multiple family unit housing.
There are many systems that service the members of the community. Passenger trains run into the city regularly. There is a suburban bus system. A major international airport is within a few miles of the suburb. Shopping, and the library are all located in the downtown region of the city.

There are many programs and organizations in the community of this suburb. There is a very strong park district, offering classes and camp programs to residents. There is a community college within the suburb. There is a hospital in the community. Daycare programs are available to residents. Shelters, food pantries, clubs and organizations all provide support and a healthy community atmosphere.

National Context

"It is development of the artistic or aesthetic lens through which to experience and understand the world that is the primary goal of art in general education. Without this lens the fundamental means for construing meaning in the world, the very lives of children will be diminished." (Day & Hurwitz, 1991, p.44). Art education has the means to educate and allow children to experience the ideas and significance of the world that surrounds them.

Finding a place in the curriculum for art in the education system in America is a constant struggle for art advocates and legislative representatives. Art is not considered a fundamental subject in a curriculum. A fine arts degree is often not required for teachers of the subject. A background in fine arts is considered a positive aspect only by hiring administrators knowledgeable in art.
The national goals and requirements of art education are broad. They are mainly construed for the benefit of state education leaders to interpret and consider on the state level. Art is not a required subject statewide or nationally. The state of Illinois has produced a set of state goals for fine arts. This includes goals in dance, drama, music, and visual art. These goals can only apply to the school districts that provide these classes to their students. "Illinois provided a model for the nation when it adopted 34 state goals for learning in 1985 (Illinois State Board of Education, 2000, p.2)."

The Illinois state goals for fine arts are based on several different aspects involved in art education. Student goals focus on historical perspectives, analytical skills as well as experience in producing works of art. "A comprehensive generalized arts program includes all components of the Illinois Fine Arts Learning Standards: development of conceptual understanding, perceptual sensitivity, and historical and cultural awareness as well as skills needed for performance and/ or production." (Illinois State Board of Education, 2000, p.3).

It is the responsibility of each school district to create a curriculum in which these goals can be met, if art is considered a part of the curriculum. School districts look at standardized testing results for areas of improvement and concern in the curriculum. Art is not a part of the Illinois Student Achievement test. This can prove the point that the value of art in the educational system is considered very low. The lack of testing leads to lack of improvement and factual information needed in the evaluation process. This can also explain why art is
one of the first programs in a school that is dropped when an organization experiences time or money concerns.

There is no accurate, concrete study to determine the length or frequency in which art should be taught in the curriculum. It has been cited time and time again that art is beneficial to student learning and understanding. In a 1995 college board study, arts students were reported to have scored higher on mathematical and verbal portions of the SAT test (Brewer, 1998, p.5). Students that are not taught art in school tend to test lower than those students that receive art instruction on a regular basis.

There have been many studies involving the arts integrated with mathematics, history, language arts, as well as the interdisciplinary arts. Research studies and test scores based on the individual, state, and national assessments reveal basic skills and to what degree the students have mastered these skills. Teachers need to be educated in the pedagogy in order for student learning to occur. The information presented can be tied together by the student, and create a meaningful curriculum in which the learner is motivated to investigate further.

They learn to understand nuances, to revise and change directions as a process unfolds, to relate parts to the whole, to solve problems that have more than one solution and to experiment into opportunities for new explorations (An Artsmart Education, 1994, p.14).
Holistic learning and curriculum integration are increasingly more popular methods to connect subjects. As academia looks for answers as to why the curriculum standards are not working, these methods along with teacher training hold the key to furthering student achievement.
CHAPTER 2

Problem Documentation

Problem Evidence

Students of the targeted eighth grade class exhibit a lack of transfer between art production, history, vocabulary and concepts. Evidence for the existence of this problem include student surveys, a survey of art teachers in the district and, teacher observations and student journal entries.

In order to document this problem, a student survey was administered, and an art evaluation test was given to the students in order to measure the retention of student knowledge, and gain an understanding of the holistic, authentic learning that occurred. Journal entries were observed over the nine week study. Group and individual critiques were recorded over the nine week period as well.

The teacher observed that the students involved in the survey were a very rambunctious group. Other teachers more familiar with the students had observed in the past that the students were difficult to deal with. It was evident within the first two weeks of the course that there were definite attempts among
students to create their individual roles within the class. As a whole, the students were very social. The class quickly divided into sub-groups in which they continually gravitated toward despite the teacher's efforts to create a total class environment. A seating chart was formed the second week of class, and there was always one or two students that would stray from their assigned seats. Very few cooperated with the limitations set, resulting in many warnings and detentions being administered.

The students seemed to be interested in the art experience. The idea of receiving their own journal was very exciting to them. This was a new program in which the students realized that they were a select group. It was a week and a half before the students actually were given their journal sketchbook. The students mounted pressure on the instructor, as the majority was excited to start this experience.

Through teacher's observations, the researcher found the need to challenge these students, both visually and intellectually in order to engage them in their school work. The students had a wide variety of needs, from being Regular Education Initiative (REI) students to very gifted students, in addition students demonstrated borderline behavior disorders. The need to have the students internalize the material and feel a connection with the art experience was definite.

The researcher analyzed the student's pre-study survey and compared it to the survey given to teachers in the school district. The findings showed that the majority of the students involved in this study had attended the school district
for more than six years, which indicated that they had participated in at least six years of art education classes. The teacher survey found 83% of teachers feel art history, production, vocabulary, and criticism are all important component in art education. In response, 17% felt that this was true sometimes. The survey also found 50% of the teachers surveyed say that they use a Discipline Based Art Education (DBAE)(Arts EdNet, 1998) approach in teaching art all of the time, and 33% say they use it sometimes, with 12% stating that they did not use this model. The students responded to the survey with an average confidence level in their knowledge of art history.

Teachers in the district were surveyed as to what approach they chose to teach art education. Fifty percent of the teachers surveyed use the DBAE method in their art programs. Although 66% of the teachers said that they plan out lessons so that their ideas build off of one another sometimes. This is one of the components in the DBAE model of teaching art. This shows that teachers in the district are using ideas associated with the DBAE approach to art education.

The teacher survey found that 83% of art teachers in the district agreed that they felt art production, history, vocabulary and concepts are all important in a well rounded art education. Only 17% disagreed with the statement. The survey results showed that the teachers in the district agreed with the main objectives in the DBAE model, but might not realize it due to a lack in teacher training.

The student’s survey showed 38% of the students felt comfortable applying only three or four art materials. The next highest level of art materials
that the students felt comfortable was with nine or more, with 29% of the students agreement. The survey also found that 17% felt comfortable with five or six art materials, 13% report that they were comfortable with seven or eight materials, and 4% say they felt comfortable with one or two art materials. The number of art materials that the students felt comfortable using was very random and inconclusive. With the majority of the students participating in over six years of art classes, it is surprising having such a variety in answers. This may have been due to the format of the question on the survey and the introduction of the teacher into the existing program.

The majority of the students said that they felt comfortable discussing their artwork with others, as 59% agreed with this statement. There were still 41% of the students that responded that they did not feel comfortable talking about their artwork. This implies that they have had some experience in the past in the critique process, and self-evaluation.

The results overall seem to be quite fragmented and inconclusive. The students were divided on most of the questions asked on the survey. At this age level, the students feel insecure, and it is not highly regarded to show enthusiasm or interests of their own. This was evident as the final question on the survey which asked the students if they enjoyed discussing their artwork. The number that answered no was 59% of the students. This clearly exceeds the 41% of the students that answered yes.
Probable Causes

The major concern addressed was the lack of holistic thinking in art classrooms in America today. The Getty Foundation model of a Discipline Based Art Education (DBAE) is the leading theory for art educators to follow in order to achieve a balanced study of visual art. The idea includes using art history, aesthetics, criticism, and art production in order to lend more structure and meaning to art programs.

In using all four aspects of the DBAE model, teachers need to include at least four parts to each lesson. This can be time consuming, and very drawn out especially if the art production component has many steps, or is complicated. The benefit of the model is that students gain a deeper knowledge, or more holistic sense of the art being studied.

A DBAE also calls for "written, sequential, lesson units and learning experiences (that) engage students in balanced attention and study derived from the content of the four foundational art disciplines" (Arts Ed Net, 1999, p.3). Lessons must be put into context in order for a higher meaning to be attained, and students will be allowed to build off of their previous knowledge.

The lack in holistically teaching art leads to the second probable cause, which is of transferring and promoting higher order thinking skills in the art classroom.

Generally, the idea of teaching for higher order thinking (also called teaching for understanding) involves helping students learn in active,
constructive ways so that what they learn in one situation is transferable to new circumstances (Kowalchuk, 1996. p1).

There is no evidence that art students are able to apply what they have learned in their art classes to new situations. The program at this site is set up with hope that students will be able to build off of their experiences, yet there is no tool or vehicle in which it all comes together.

A third possible cause to the problem is a lack of teacher training. The teacher survey conducted in the district finds evidence that supports more staff development on the idea of a DBAE program is needed, as the results are contradicting. Time, education, and a more cohesive art curriculum would benefit all that teach in the district.

Another contribution to the problem at hand is that the district art department is in the process of creating a revised curriculum this year. The goal is to keep the curriculum current and aligned with the current state goals, update the art materials that are being used by the instructors, and set goals as to what will be covered during the students education at a particular grade level. See Appendix A. “One way to ensure a balance between the intrinsic and the instrumental may be to use national and state arts standards as the basis for local curricula.”(Brewer, 1998, p.7)

The school district has recently excluded administering a state reviewed achievement test. This test was created by the school district, and is evaluated by the state board of education. This program included two tests administered at
the third grade level and at the eighth grade level. The fine arts department has recently decided not to administer the eighth grade test until a more appropriate and meaningful evaluation can be created.

The last concern is the lack of art teacher support in America today. As art is evolving into a more disciplined subject, teachers are finding it more difficult to balance art history, criticism, vocabulary, aesthetics and concepts and still provide a creative outlet for student production. There is need for students to be able to tie all of the information together in order to process and truly understand the subject. It is a rarity for a district to have an updated, working art curriculum. It is even more rare for art teachers to have textbooks for the students to study, read, and learn from. It is the art teacher's job in most cases to create their own curriculum, write or research any material they feel is important to cover, create their own text, and create cohesive lesson plans for students to follow. This is the job of at least four highly trained professionals without even addressing classroom management and challenges that every teacher encounters. These concerns create fragmentation, and time deficiencies for most teachers. As these problems face the modern day art teacher, they are carried on into the quality of art education for the students.
CHAPTER 3
THE SOLUTION STRATEGY

Literature Review

Students in the targeted eighth grade class experience a lack of transfer between art production, art history, art criticism and art aesthetics. This deficit limits the student's ability to make connections with the various components related to the study of visual arts. These components of a well rounded art education can all be classified as separate disciplines, as shown in the Getty model, and referred to as "discipline based art education" (Arts Ed Net, 1999, p.1). Research supports the idea that student journals can facilitate learning between the different elements necessary for a complete art education program. In linking these various elements of art education, students are able to transfer their knowledge, interpret, and expand upon their prior learning.
In reviewing the literature, numerous approaches in teaching visual art are found. The history of art education itself helps put into perspective how the goals of the present have come about. Art teachers, and in many cases regular education teachers, have been teaching art to their students with limited training on the subject and theories involved. There has also been very little support in school administration, and community involvement as well as limited resources. (Arts Ed Net, 1999).

From the beginning of visual art being taught in schools, art was considered a utilitarian skill. Advancing hand–eye coordination was the primary goal. This could help train factory workers, as well as improve penmanship. ‘Picture study’ was introduced at the turn of the last century, where students learned to copy older, classical or romantic works. When these drawings or paintings were paired with text, the key was to teach moral and social behavior. Manual arts study was another focus of art education in which student objectives were to create objects that were utilitarian.

Walter Smith, an art educator that established an art education training center in the 1870’s in Massachusetts, felt that art production was the most important aspect of teaching art. Smith and his colleagues theories set the course for an arts education dominated with the production of art. Until recently, most programs have focused primarily on the production of art. (Arts Ed Net, 1999).

Psychologists began to study children and human behavior in the late nineteenth century. Their findings included art as a means for children to
communicate their feelings in a personal manner. These studies proved art to have an important place in a child's basic education. This research was a precursor for the art education system that is in place today.

John Dewey and the progressive era in the 1920's and 1930's felt that creativity and play were important tools in a child's development. "The child's own artwork was viewed as a special opportunity for idiosyncrasy in a school culture dominated by rules in every other subject area" (Arts Ed Net, 1999, p.14). On the flip side of this trend, the basic principles of design were beginning to be introduced in order to teach appreciation of the art world around them.

The 1940’s and 50’s proved to focus on incorporating art and the world around the student. This school of thought incorporated the teachings of good citizenship and social skills through the arts. The movement focused little on the art component. Victor Lowenfeld, an art educator and psychologist took these ideas one step further and paired the expression of the child with personality development. His ideas have carried on and been very influential in the last part of the twentieth century.

Throughout the evolution of art education in this country, minimal instructional time in the classroom, or art room, has proven to be a very large obstacle for teachers including art in the curriculum. The time that was set aside to teach art, usually by classroom teachers, was taken over by holiday crafts. The content and depth of learning has been minimal. Art has also been phased out in the upper grade levels traditionally. Uninspiring projects, with little content
and theory have proven to be unworthy of additional support, funding, and need in the general curriculum of schools.

In providing art making that incorporates study, practice, and history, students are able to learn more about themselves, the art they will encounter in their lives, and the world around them. The ideal art education provides a "learning environment that furnishes opportunities for students to learn about art through the lenses of the four disciplines" (Arts Ed Net, 1999, p.15) involved in a Discipline Based Art Education. Most of the time in art classrooms is devoted to art making. A discipline based art education provides students with a more rounded, and knowledgeable view of all aspects of art.(Arts Ed Net 1999). This DBAE model classifies the different disciplines involved in creating this quality education as art production, art history, art criticism, and art aesthetics. The study of all is essential in order to gain a well-rounded look at visual art.

The most obvious of the disciplines is in art production. Traditionally teaching art meant simply that students would produce a painting, drawing, sculpture, or craft. Students, parents and teachers would be outraged if an art class were to not include producing art forms.

Children are highly motivated to make objects with art materials, and art production is at the center of a good elementary art program. Students should have opportunities to work with a variety of materials, including three-dimensional media such as clay (Day & Hurwitz, 1991, p.44).
The art production is the way in which all elements of art can be incorporated. The art experience also is much richer, and more fulfilling as students learn more about the study of art.

Art history is essential in placing significance and meaning in works of art. Students will learn "by inquiring into the historical, social, and cultural contexts of art objects by focusing upon aspects of time, place, tradition, functions, and styles to better understand the human condition" (Arts Ed Net, 1999, p.2).

Students also gain a more comprehensive understanding of world history as they can relate historically significant works of art with world events and cultures of that period in time.

Art criticism is essential in the fact that students analyze, evaluate, and interpret works of art. In cultivating the skills that accompany art criticism, students gain an appreciation, and a higher level of understanding toward art and the art making experience. These skills are important, as students are able to critique famous works of art for their importance. Students are also able to critique their own works of art for a higher understanding of the processes and ideas they are trying to create.

Art aesthetics are the final, and most confusing of the art disciplines included in the Getty Foundation's model of a Discipline Based Art Education. Art aesthetics prove important by

raising and examining questions about the nature, meaning, and value of art, which leads to understanding about what distinguishes art from other
kinds of phenomena, the issues that such differences give rise to, and the
development of criteria for evaluating and judging works of art (Arts Ed

When a curriculum incorporates the various disciplines related to a quality
art education, student higher-order thinking will flourish.

Conditions for creativity will be enhanced if art education constantly
integrates production with perception and reflection – that is, if students
are given ample time to look, talk, write and to think as part of the creative
process (Lindstrom, 1997, p.7).

As the students are immersed in the creation of art, conversations will arise that
include ideas, vocabulary and historical references if quality components are
provided for the students to study. This can provide an interesting and
meaningful experience for the students. Art vocabulary, historical references,
process techniques and conversations can be addressed when meaningful
content is taught. The student objectives may be amplified into higher-order
thinking as students process the information on many different levels with various
learning modes exercised. The whole story is experienced as the students learn
all aspects of a work of art, and are able to communicate these ideas orally, in
writing, and through their own artwork.
Dialogue is a great tool that teachers should utilize in teaching art to their students. Engaging students in conversations, previous concepts are built upon, and both teacher and student are able to learn from one another. Ideas that were taught in the past can be reintroduced as a means to keep communication strong, which enables more openness in the student-teacher relationship, and keeps self-esteem high. The more comfortable the student becomes at communicating about art work, the more the student learns ultimately. (Arts Ed Net, 1999).

Critique exercises should be included with the production assignment. As the students begin to discuss art that they are learning about, they should be able to connect these ideas to their own production of art. This level of discussion can easily lead to transfer and incorporate other learning experiences as well. The students are creating art in a variety of ways, “so that what they learn is transferable to new circumstance"(Kowalchuk, 1996, p.1) or higher order learning.

In order to collect ideas and understand in a manner conducive to higher-order thinking, students can utilize journal keeping as a vehicle for understanding. A creative journal is a collection of thoughts ideas, and experiences unique to the individual author. In keeping a creative journal, students have a place to process information, experiment with ideas, and reflect upon their findings. (Arts Ed Net, 1999).

As Kowalchuk found in 1962, “Higher order thinking challenges the individual to interpret, analyze, and manipulate prior learning in a new
Kowalchuk outlines three major stages in which higher order thinking is attained. These stages are gathering information, processing that information, and then applying the information in new ways. Students must understand the basic information, or foundation ideas in art on a higher level in order to process and apply them in new situations. Journals are the perfect vehicle for students to gather, experiment or process the information, and then to create new ideas or solutions to problems. Students can utilize creative journals as a non-threatening, non-judgmental means to explore and create. They can apply their own ideas in the personal space, and do not have to share these ideas, or be criticized by anyone other than themselves, and occasionally their teachers.

The practice of keeping a journal is used by teachers across the board as a means for students to communicate their ideas, record their own thoughts, and reflect on their actions. There are several studies that relate to different aspects of journal keeping in the art curriculum, as well as in the English curriculum.

One art teacher, Wales, has had students keep journals in his art classes in the past. Wales’ view is that writing is “a small but important part of classroom activities in the art room” (Wales, 1998, p.47). Students responded to writing as a form of punishment in the art room. The solutions chosen for this problem was to make the journal experience fun, and to start the children writing at younger ages in order to get them used to the idea. “Writing is another creative tool to help them accomplish their creative goals” (Wales, 1998, p.47). Through experiments, fourth and fifth grade student journals and asked them to write after
every major unit of study. The kinds of questions he posed were to probe the students about the choices they made in creating their artwork. Each writing assignment also included some kind of drawing in order to keep the students motivated (Wales, 1998).

Charlene Root conducted a study in which her High School students write in a journal for the length of their course. Her study focused on the writing process in relation to the total art experience. The assignments were given once or twice a week, and the students started the process by answering questions such as, ‘How should student art work be graded?’ and ‘Is there a difference between the artwork you do in class, and the artwork you do on your own?’. Students responded to the study in a variety of ways, yet many were concerned with how writing related to the art experience, and why they needed to do these exercises when it took away from their studio time. The researcher noticed a trend in the individual writing styles, and an overall maturity (Root, 1996).

The findings of the study were that students still did not see the value of writing and it's relationship to art. It altered the teacher's view of the student. She felt the need to allow more freedom and responsibility in curriculum direction from the students. It also led the researcher to reassess her evaluation process, as the students wrote of how they were fulfilling their work only to please the teacher. Root reflected on the fact that she had not thought about the format of the journal prior to starting the project. She is looking toward the future in which she can incorporate drawings, and use more substantial journal books. She
regrets using only a regular notebook, feeling that in this format the students did not respect the process enough. (Root, 1996).

Karen Ernst, a resource teacher has used her sketch journal to teach an in-service based on using pictures and words, daily experiences, and community in order to make learning more meaningful. Ernst demonstrated that by simply looking at pictures one can tell a story. This process, and linking it with writing was demonstrated and exercised in the teacher's training meeting. Another one of the ideas she was trying to express was of how the students can learn from their teachers ideas both visually and literally. Ernst led art teachers through this thought process, and then discussed the impact it had on their learning. Both students and teachers can benefit from the ideas and lessons that journals can teach us. (Ernst, 1999).

Gary Cobine offers another approach to journal keeping, used to teach English. It offers organizational structure for teachers in setting up a journal experience for the students. His design indicates that the journal might be divided up into different parts in which students could model it after a book; a preface, a body of chapters, and a glossary (Cobine, 1997).?

The term journal is very broad as one discovers upon further inquiry. A journal is a collection of ideas, personal to the student and more open ended than a log (Burke, 1999). Literary journals, as Cobine describes could be "a written record of personal responses to passages from literature" (Cobine, 1997, p.2). This could be altered to fit the subject and instead relate to responses to different works of visual art. Both student work, and master artist's work can be
examined in the journal. Ultimately the goal of the different types of journaling is for the student to take a closer look at the subject, analyze and interpret the information. This falls in line with the Illinois State Goals for Art Education perfectly (Illinois Fine Arts Resource Manual, 2000).

As writing across the curriculum becomes an issue in schools to improve student’s skills, Cheri Louise Ross provides information on how journaling can provide writing experiences across the curriculum. She suggests selecting a type of journal best suited for your student’s needs. Reading the students journal entries is also another component to keep the program successful. The students will realize the teacher is serious about what the student is writing in the journal and not write nonsense in order to fill a quota of pages per week. Ross feels that the amount of work completed in the journal, as well as the content should be considered as part of the grade. The journals should also be collected frequently to keep students on task, and content fresh to the teacher, as they are grading them. (Ross, 1998).

Karen Ernst, an art teacher that promotes journaling in her classes, finds journals to be a “simple strategy that helps students connect drawing, writing and learning." Her program encourages journaling to be done at home, in art and other subjects such as writing workshop and science class. "Journals provide students – as well as artists, writer’s and scientists – with a tool for observation and a place to practice writing, respond to literature, take notes, solve problems, express themselves and to think in words and pictures”.(Ernst, 1997, p.26).
Ernst urges teachers to keep a journal of their own, in order to model the practices of journal keeping. Ideas emerge, and lessons can develop from teacher findings and experiences. This also helps create a classroom environment that encourages and is accepting of one another (Ernst, 1997).

"Sketch journals let the teacher begin to see through the eyes of the students" (Ernst, 1997, p.27). As Ernst encourages her students to keep a journal recording all aspects of their life, Ernst has found that the student's unique attributes are very evident in the journal. The further one takes the assignment, the greater the benefits can be. Ernst also feels that the journal process is circular. The writing in her student's journals lead to drawings, and back into writings. The reflective connections are never ending (Ernst, 1997).

Art therapist, and educator, Capacchione has written a book entitled "The Creative Journal for Children". Capacchione has used the methods in a variety of settings including with children with special needs and has found that children that have the chance to express themselves creatively, they are able to acquire basic skills easily and naturally. It was found that creativity journals can provide students with: safety, relaxation, spontaneity, integrity, experimentation, communication, oral language, gathering ideas, imagination, creativity, verbal and non-verbal expression, right brain development, left brain development, integration, emotional release, self-understanding, auto-biography, self-confidence, values clarification. It has been her finding that when writing and drawing are combined, both the right side of the brain and the left side of the
brain are utilized. Capacchione feels that this creates a harmony or balance in learning and communication (Capacchione, 1982).

Capacchione piloted a journal program in the Garvey School District in Rosemead California. Journals were given to every student in two schools as part of a federally funded program in which the author chaired the visual arts program. "Of all the activities in the arts curriculum, the journal seemed to be the most successful" (Capacchione, 1982, p.12). Parents, administrators and students all had very positive feedback about the journal experience. All students seemed to benefit from the study including English as a Second Language students. The study found reading and math scores to have gained twenty-percentile-points in many of the classrooms involved in the program (Capapcchione, 1982).

This study will use the sketch journal as a vehicle for higher-order thinking. The journal experience has been proven to be effective in transferring ideas to artwork, verbal and non-verbal skill as well as attributes related to higher-order thinking skills.

**Project Objectives and Processes**

As a result of the ongoing journal process involving several aspects of a complete art education, during the period of August 27, 2001 to October 26, 2001, the eighth grade students from the targeted class will incorporate art history, criticism, and the process of making art, as measured by student survey, journal entries, art critique exercises, and teacher constructed tests.

In order to accomplish the project objective, the following processes are necessary:

1. Develop new instructional materials that identify art vocabulary, art processes, and concepts individually.
2. Combine art terminology, processes, and concepts with art history through journaling.

3. Provide opportunities for group discussion and critique in which these ideas will be exercised daily and built upon.

4. Develop lessons rich in all aspects of art which the students may easily work with the art vocabulary, concepts and history.

Project Action Plan

The action plan is in outline form as follows:

Teacher Preparation

- Design the curriculum to fit the sequence and course of study
- Collect visuals, materials, and student journals
- Prepare pre- and post- tests
- Design sequential journal assignments
- Prepare lesson plans

Week 1: August 27-31, 2001
- Parent permission notes sent home
- Student survey given
- Pre-test given
- Student vocabulary list presented for first project
- Student journals made and introduced
- First journal assignments given

Week 2: September 3-7, 2001
- Parent permission slips due back
- First vocabulary test is given
- Students are introduced to critiquing projects
- Daily journal assignments presented in conjunction with presenting critiques

Week 3: September 10-14, 2001
- Daily journals assignments referring to vocabulary, elements, critique and assignments

Week 4: September 17-21, 2001
• Art Elements bingo
• Review for mid-term
• Daily journals referring to vocabulary, elements and assignments
• Art Elements test

Week 5: September 24-28, 2001

• Mid-term test given
• Group art critique #1
• Daily journal assignments referring to all aspects of art and focusing on art criticism

Week 6: October 1-5, 2001

• Individual art critique #2
• Daily journal assignments referring to all aspects of art and focusing on art criticism
• Art criticism game

Week 7: October 8-12, 2001

• Group art critique #3
• Daily journal assignments reflecting on student work

Week 8: October 15-19, 2001

• Review for final test
• Daily journal assignments focusing on higher level thinking exercises related to knowledge needed for final exam

Week 9: October 22-26, 2001

• Game review for final test
• Daily journal assignments reflecting on the journal experience, and how the student can use their knowledge in everyday circumstances
• Final test
• Student Survey given again

Methods of Assessment
In order to assess the growth of the student knowledge, a pre-test, midterm and final test are given to the students. Tests based on knowledge of vocabulary and the elements of art are given in the first half of the class. Other ways to assess the learning is through student journals, presented as a
portfolio. Student rubrics for critique exercises offer both student and teacher input. The student survey presented in the first week is given again at the conclusion of class to show the development of the student over the course of study.
CHAPTER 4

PROJECT RESULTS

Historical Description of the Intervention

The objective of this project was to increase student's higher order thinking skills by using journals to connect the various disciplines associated with art education. The implementation process included students keeping creative journals, an art element and color theory test, and student critiques all accompanied the art program in order to create a more complete curriculum conducive to higher order thinking and produce the desired changes.

The first week of the school year consisted of only two days, one of them consisting of a shortened 20 minute class period. This time was used to complete a people search, in order for the students to become comfortable with one another, creating rules for the classroom environment, and addressing the expectations for the duration of the school quarter.

The project time line was already moved back due to shortened schedules, therefore the survey was not given to the students, permission slips were not sent home, and a pre-test was not given during the first two days. The student vocabulary list was not given until a few weeks later in the term. Student journals were discussed briefly. The researcher had found several student sketchbooks in the art closet, and decided to purchase more for the students instead of having the students make their own. These sketchbooks would be
handed out in the third week of the class.

The second week of class was shortened to four days due to a holiday. During this week the students were informed of the process of the study they would be involved in at greater detail, parent permission slips were also sent home. (See Appendix A). The students began their first art assignment. This consisted of studying a modern British artist, Bridgette Riley, whose work can be categorized as Op art. Her artwork suggests movement, and the students filled out a worksheet in which they experimented with ways to create the implied movement on a two-dimensional surface. The students read several articles about the artist, her work, her intentions, and what art elements she utilizes in order to achieve her desired outcome. The class discussed these topics, as they read and experimented. Upon completing a practice worksheet, the students designed a black and white cover for their journal using movement and contrast as their primary focus in order to achieve the effect of movement. The students would include this assignment in their journals. (See Appendix B). The students were approximately half way completed with this assignment by the close of the week. The students were also given the assignment of bringing in an object from home, or a photograph that they enjoyed, or found interesting in which they would draw for their next assignment.

The researcher deviated from the proposed time line, and action plan due to the amount of material needed to be covered at the start of this project. The action plan changed from testing students separately on art vocabulary terms and art elements. It became apparent that these were the same thing, and testing them separately would not benefit student learning, yet only create confusion. Student journal assignments were not addressed at this time, as planned. The researcher was more concerned about the students preparing and concentrating on their journal covers.
At this time, the students in the classroom started feeling more comfortable in their environment, and the student's own personalities were beginning to emerge. Up until this point, the instructor had not set a seating chart into place. The students were given a seating chart, arranged in a boy, girl pattern. The art room has eight tables, each seating four students. Seven of the eight tables were used in this arrangement, and one table was left for supplies and assignment collections. There were a few students that had very loud voices, and rebellious tendencies. These students were closely monitored, and arranged next to quieter classmates.

The start of the third week brought new journals and new possibilities to the students. The students were each given 100 page, spiral bound, nine by twelve inch, spiral bound sketchbook. The students that had completed the cover assignment could mount their paper onto construction paper, and affix it to the cover of the journal. The instructor applied contact paper to the cover of the journal to protect and make it more permanent. Three days of this week were left for students to finish their journal covers. Students that were finished were allowed to explore in their sketchbooks. On the fourth day of the week, students were introduced to the new assignment that related to the artist Mondrian. The teacher showed many examples of his work in which the students would be using as inspiration for the new project. The idea of the new project was to take the item, or image that the students brought from home, and draw it showing many angles and sizes. The students were instructed to divide their piece of white paper into at least five sections, using a thick black line. Students could use their journals and view finders to help them create interesting ways to represent the item differently on the paper.

The students were asked to complete their first journal assignment this week. The number of journal drawings to be completed each week was
determined in a class discussion in which the researcher found the student population not capable of being responsible enough to complete more than two outside drawings per week. This strays from the original action plan of daily journal assignments. The assignment was also cut shorter because the researcher did not want the students to feel that this experience was a punishment, or a chore. The class decided upon two outside journal pages to be completed per week, one being a teacher assignment related to the curriculum, and the other based on student choice. The students would also be given journal assignments in class that related to their learning. The first week journal assignment was for the students to create a cover page that represented themselves. This could be quite elaborate, and personal as the examples that the teacher showed in class suggested. An idea sheet was also given to the students for future reference (See Appendix C).

Approximately half of the students completed their two independent drawings. Some of the entries were very original, and the student’s interest and commitment to the assignment was impressive. The idea of creating a rubric to more effectively grade the journal entries came to the researcher’s mind.

Student behavior, and attitudes were quickly declining. The teacher was new to the school district, and in teaching this grade level, so sensing a negative classroom tone was not immediate. The majority of the class was working well on their own, and was respectful during the teacher’s presentation of the new assignment. A few students continually talked out of turn, changed seats in order to socialize, and produced very little work in class. The teacher sought advice from more experienced teachers in the school, and created a new seating arrangement, and talked to certain individual students privately toward their disruptive behavior. The teacher also started to utilize detentions.
By the fourth week of class it was apparent that the students were not very confident in their drawing skills. This particular group of students did not demonstrate strong visual skills necessary in order to help their self-confidence, and allow the students room to take risks within their artwork. On Monday morning the students were given a drawing challenge in which they would use the class period to work on. This drawing assignment was taken from the book Drawing For Older Children & Teens by Mona Brookes (1991) (see Appendix D). The assignment was to closely observe the drawing as it was upside down, and draw the shapes and spaces as the student’s saw it. The objective of the assignment was for the students to look at something as shapes and spaces closely, without recognizing the image itself. If the students did not cheat, the drawings that they created should look much more realistic, and the detailed observations are very noticeable. The students did a great job on this journal assignment. The student drawings were very realistic and true to their observations. This boosted the self-confidence of the students, as they were able to realize how to really look at an object before drawing it. The researcher did feel that this was a beneficial exercise in observations.

The study progressed as students experienced the first assessments of the semester in the Mondrian project, and the journals were evaluated by a rubric (see Appendix E). The students filled out a rubric self-evaluation for the Mondrian drawing. The student evaluations were very low scoring, as a whole. The teacher also used the same rubric for evaluation and graded much higher. The students also worked individually with the teacher in evaluating their journal assignments for the week using a rubric. The newly formed rubric included three categories, each worth five points, include completed assignments on time, student exploration, and craftsmanship. The students had also been given a suggestion for one of their drawings, as some of them had been having trouble
coming up with what they should explore. The assignment was to represent the fall leaves in some way. Some of the students seemed to like this direction. Students were also given surprise bonus points for turning in their journals on time in order to positively influence and reward the students that were committed to the journal process. All but five of the students received the extra credit, partially due to the persistence of the teacher in reminding the students of their Friday assignment.

This week also included the introduction to the art elements and color theory. The students were given art element handouts that included the vocabulary list, and visual examples to match (see Appendix F). The class studied each element individually, recorded the definition and drew their own example into their creative journal. The purpose of this was for the students to internalize the information presented, evaluate, and redefine visually in their own way. These ideas all lead to the goals attained in higher order thinking.

The original action plan called for students to be studying for their midterm test this week. This was changed to the actual art element and color theory test to be given the following week, and again the final week of class to determine the student’s retention of knowledge. Due to the rush at the beginning of the quarter for the students to create their journals and become oriented with the class, this time frame was established.

The fifth week of the study included a test, journal assignments, and starting a new art project related to the color wheel, also studied for on the test. Monday was devoted to studying the color wheel. The students were given a color theory handout, in which the class discussed. The students also created their own (twelve color) color wheel using tempera paints. On Tuesday, the students reviewed their knowledge using a more kinesthetic approach, and played art elements and color bingo that was created by the teacher (see
Appendix G). This act seemed to help the student's memory improve. During the class period in which bingo was played, the students remembered very little at the beginning of the class, and were shouting out answers to questions by the end of the study session. The test was given on Thursday of the week (see Appendix H).

A new assignment was also presented during this week. The instructor had taken pictures of each student using a digital camera. The photos were printed and given to the students to enlarge using a grid system. This mathematical task was very challenging, and difficult for the students to achieve. The second step of the project was demonstrated after the grid task had been started, as not to discourage or overwhelm the students. The instructor demonstrated how to use the grid to draw the lines and shapes that are present in the photos in order to create an enlarged drawing of their own face. The third step in the process is for the students to divide the drawing into four sections, select four color schemes, and apply those color schemes to the different quarter sections of the drawing using oil pastels.

More students were ready on Friday to assess the journals than the previous week. This was probably due to the bonus points awarded the previous week. One of the two drawings of the week was supposed to be a composition created using only one color scheme, such as using only the primary colors. The students seemed to be catching on to the routine journal assignments. Most students were beginning to form a pattern in their interests expressed in their journals, this was encouraged by the teacher. More ideas for the student to explore related to the student's individual interests were also suggested.

The tone of the classroom continued to be social, and beginning to gain a hierarchy of personalities in class. A few of the students refused to stay in their assigned seat, were loud and disruptive, and were disrespectful to the teacher.
and the other students. The permission slips required for the students to participate in the study were very tardy, as some of the consent forms were still being returned five weeks in the study. The teacher was forced to change some of the seats of the students again. The problems involved with the seating chart increased, as some of the students that were working well on their own were forced to change seats and did not feel this was fair. The teacher that was new to this grade level sought the advice from other teachers as how to address this. This resulted in the teacher sitting at the tables next to the students that were having problems.

The sixth week of the study marked the beginning of the second part of the semester. This week was dedicated to students working on their new project. The majority of the students were still struggling with the first step of the project, making the grid. The instructor was very busy helping individuals grasp the enlarging process and using the grid system. The process was demonstrated to the class again as a whole in addition to working with the individuals in need of guidance. The journal assignment for the week was for the students to draw themselves without using a grid. The class discussed this on Friday, as they could evaluate the differences in the outcomes.

Students were also asked to critique a famous portrait in groups. The students were arranged in groups, according to their tables. They were given a format to follow in order to address the important elements included in the artwork (see Appendix I). The researcher had originally planned for this week to be the second critique the student participated in, yet due being behind schedule, this was the first critique of the quarter. There was also no art criticism game to be played.

The seventh week of class was basically a continuation of week six, only students were slowly progressing in their color theory self-portrait project. The
process of dividing the drawing into four sections, and selecting and applying unrealistic color schemes to the portrait was discussed again for the students to better understand. The student journal assignment for the week was to select an object and create it using unrealistic colors. This was discussed on Friday, as the students applied their art element vocabulary.

The students participated in a cooperative group critique based on Surrealism, the inspiration for the portrait. Students were divided into task groups and asked to discuss the artwork presented to the group, and write a critique. The students were again given a format to follow that included answering the what, where, when, and how involved with the piece of work. The students were asked to present their critique to the class when finished. The depth was minimal in the written critiques. The students brought up interesting, more informative descriptions and analysis during the verbal presentation of the critique process. The oral presentations were cut short, however, due to a lack of respect by the student's listening to the presentations. The researcher observed that this was partly due to some of the groups critiquing the same piece of artwork.

In the beginning of the eighth week of class, the students filled out a self-evaluation of their portrait project. The evaluation included several probing questions that dealt with the student's artistic choices, the effect these choices produced, and reflections about how they would like to change their project if they could (see Appendix J). The researcher was surprised to see the responses, as some students that might not have produced the most technically sound pieces felt very close to at least one aspect of the project. The thought process behind the project was well represented in the evaluation. The student journal assignment was to create a collage of at least two different facial features from photos, and create a face. The students shared their artwork with the class
on Friday, and most enjoyed the assignment. The use of photos mixed with drawing eliminated pressure from some of the students to create such a realistic outcome, as the photos represented different sizes, coloring, and points of view.

Once again, the researcher deviated from the original action plan, due to scheduling, and difference of assessment methods. Week eight originally included a review for a final test. This test would not be administered due to lack of relevance to the subject matter the student had learned, as well as the art department had decided recently to not use this form of evaluation. The students would instead be given a surprise re-testing of the art elements and color theory test that they completed in the fifth week of the study. The reason for administering the same test the final week, was for the amount of student retention of subject matter to be determined.

The last project was introduced the ninth week of the study. This project had been briefly described before hand, as students were asked to bring in a product package in which they would like to design differently. The student's choices ranged from car steering wheels, to fresh raspberries. The students were told to utilize their sketchbooks for ideas and experimentation as they were instructed to design a logo for their product. Laptop computers were brought in for the students to select a font, and design their packaging. The product labels were printed and drawn over by the students and affixed to the proper container during this week and the next. The journal assignment was for the students to design a storyboard for a commercial for their project, including a sequence, the product, and text to accompany the commercial.

The final week of the quarter, the tenth week due to a short introductory week, the instructor and students utilized to finalize projects, evaluate and reflect on the semester. Students finished their product design and wrote a reflection on the process they took in order to fulfill the assignment. The students were given
the same survey as at the beginning of the quarter in order to record any changes in attitude, self-esteem, or knowledge of subject matter. The students also took the art element and color theory test again in order to evaluate the retention of the knowledge the students had attained and utilized throughout the semester. The students were able to submit two journal entries of their own choice for their final journal evaluation. Any outstanding student work that had not been turned in previously were handed in during this time, or not accepted as a part of their grade. Several of the product design projects were not handed in to the instructor, 36%. On the final day of the semester, the students were asked to write a one-page evaluation of the art course, their experiences, their findings, and the journal process.

Presentation and Analysis of Results

In order to assess the effects of student journaling and higher order thinking, students were given an art elements and color theory test, during the study and afterwards in order to document the student retention of knowledge. A student survey was given the second week of class and on the last day of class, and student reflections on the class were collected.

The instructor created the student test based on basic art elements and color theory. The test consisted of twenty-five questions. In these questions, matching terms with definitions, multiple choice, fill in the blank, as well as drawing and adding color were necessary (see Appendix H). Student results were above average on both tests. Results are found in table 1.
Table 1
Student Art Element and Color Theory Test at Midterm and End of Term and the Changes that Occurred.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student</th>
<th>Correct Answers (Midterm)</th>
<th>Correct Answers (Final)</th>
<th>Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student 1</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 2</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 3</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 4</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 5</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 6</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 7</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 8</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 9</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 10</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>+3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 11</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 12</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 13</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 14</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 15</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 16</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>+2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 17</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 18</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student 19</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>+1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The range in test results shown in table one is very minimal. The students were given the final assessment as a surprise quiz. They were not able to study for the final assessment, unlike the Pre-test which allowed time and group study.
The students were very consistent with their original scores on their final week surprise test. This shows that authentic learning did occur. The students had no way to study for the final test, leaving only their experience and prior knowledge as the determining factor.

All of the test results are well above average, or the grade of a C. This might result from a number of reasons. The test preparation went extremely smoothly, and the art element bingo worked very well, as the researcher described earlier. The test itself might have been easy for the students. The instructor was new in teaching this grade level, and might not have challenged the students to their ability level. The students could have also just been able to apply their knowledge, whether previous or current in order to score very high on this assessment.

One of the reasons the researcher chose to test at the mid-term, and then again at the end of the quarter was for the amount of retention the students achieved in the subject area. As shown in Chart 1, the students had an excellent record for retaining their knowledge throughout the semester.

The researcher also conducted a student survey at the beginning of the quarter, and at the end of the quarter. The different questions are divided up, and for the most part show little difference in opinion.
Question four on the student survey seems to show that the students' confidence level in terms of their art history knowledge grew from the low end of the spectrum, and hit the middle or average range. The students that felt they knew a lot did not vary at all.
Figure 2

Student Survey Question 5: How many art materials do you feel comfortable with?

The students seemed to feel less comfortable with their experience with art materials over the course of the study. The students were able to use as many art materials as they would like in their journals, and used a variety in their daily class projects. This could have resulted from the students not understanding the question fully on the student survey, due to an oversight by the researcher.
The percentage of students that feel comfortable discussing their artwork jumped from 60% to 75% during this study. Students were given self-evaluations, rubrics, or reflections that went with each of their projects. This might have helped them feel more comfortable with their artwork.
Figure 4
Student Survey Question 7: How comfortable do you feel with the basic principles of art?

Pre-Study Survey Question 7

Post Study Question 7

The numbers represented in this question are fairly consistent. In the pre-study survey, the majority of students answered 'comfortable'. This highest percentage point dropped and answered 'Kind of' in the final survey. Seventeen percent said that they did not feel comfortable in the first survey, where only 5% said that they did not feel comfortable in the second survey.
Figure 5
Student Survey Question 9: Do you feel that you need to know the basic principles of art in order to produce art?

The majority clearly feels that you do not need to know the principles of art in order to produce it. These numbers even rose over the study from 65% to 74% agreeing with the statement.
The students remained very consistent in their answering of this question. There was only a 4% change throughout the course. This change could have been caused by the amount of reflecting, and sharing the group participated in during this study.
Figure 7

Student Survey Question 11: Do you discuss works of art with your parents?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Never</th>
<th>Sometimes</th>
<th>Frequently</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre- Study</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>52%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post Study</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>53%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The percentages of students that discuss art with their parents increased 22% in the sometimes category. This could be because of the correspondence between the researcher and the parents and students throughout this course.
The answers only varied 3% in this category. This could mean that a few of the students changed their minds about art history and how artists can learn from it.

Informal student reflections of the class were given the final week as well. These verbalized some of the thoughts and ideas that were expressed through the students daily.

Student 19 responded to the freedom that the journals gave her. "I liked this art class because I got to do things how I wanted to do them." Student 18 stated, "I think I learned a lot more art terms than I knew when I started this class."

More critical responses to the class include student 13, "I enjoyed this class except for the fact that I couldn't really concentrate on what I was doing due
to lots of people yelling and talking.” Student 10 stated, “I didn’t learn that much because I did most of those things when I was younger.” Student 6 stated, “I didn’t like journals because they were too much responsibility, because we had to draw in them and I don’t enjoy drawing at all.

Conclusion and Recommendations

Based on the presentation and analysis of the data on student surveys, test results and student reflections, the students maintained their knowledge of the subject matter. The attitudes and ideas about art and the various disciplines stayed in the same range as before the study. The student journals created an opportunity for students to gain a higher understanding of art, and this is shown in the student reflections and daily attitudes. The students that were interested in the idea of recording their thoughts and ideas gained the most from this experience. Student reflections showed that the students that did not take the class seriously did not change their mind during the course.

This action research was influenced by many factors. The researcher changed districts of employment during the course of planning the study. Adjustments to the new school, administration, and colleagues while smooth, limited the flexibility to deviate from the district ongoing curriculum. The adjustments for students to a new faculty member, while challenging, went well over the course of the year. This also influenced the willingness of the subjects, which the researcher believes impacted the study. The researcher also believes that there were greater gains than the research protocol was able to capture.

The researcher recommends student creative journals in any art class. The researcher has used them from as young as five and six year old students, up to the targeted age level in this study. The reward of recording progress, growth and understanding is very helpful and encouraging to students. The journal assignments are optional, yet can add a new dimension to the subjects
that the instructor would like to cover. The journal assignments that were given to the students were much more thoughtfully done than the student choice journal pages. The researcher was very pleased with the students in this study that took the assignments seriously, and watched them grow into more thoughtful, creative people.

The drawbacks to student journaling lies in the students that refuse to take part in the assignment. Several of the researcher's students over the course of the year have decided not to participate. The choice made by these students creates unfavorable grades, and negative thoughts toward art.

The instructor continues to have students keep journals for art class. The structure, privacy, creative outlet, and possibilities are matched by no other assignment. In the creative arts, this is a tool that all teachers should use to benefit themselves and their students.
REFERENCES


Artsmart Arts Education Awareness Campaign, 1994, An Artsmart Education.


<http://www.educationworld.com/a lesson/lesson002.s> (6/26/01)

<http://www.getty.edu/ArtsEdNet/Read/Liata/1.>1991, Arts Ed Net


APPENDICES
Appendix A

Consent to participate in a Research Study
Consent to Participate in a Research Study
Student Journaling Toward a Higher Understanding of Art

Dear Parent or Guardian and Student,

I am currently enrolled in a master's degree program at Saint Xavier University. This program requires me to design and implement a project on an issue that directly affects my instruction. I have chosen to examine student journaling toward a higher understanding of art.

The purpose of this project is to create a continuing record of ideas, art vocabulary, materials, and art history. It will help you or your student gain a higher understanding of the many aspects of a fully rounded art education.

I will be conducting my project from August until October, for the first quarter of school. The activities related to this project will take place during the regular instructional delivery. The gathering of information for my project during these activities offers no risk of any kind to your child or yourself.

Your permission allows me to include your student in the reporting of information for my project. All information gathered will be kept completely confidential, and information included in the project report will be grouped so that no individual can be identified. The report will be used to share what I have learned as a result of this project with other professionals in the field of education.

Participation in this study is completely voluntary. You may choose to withdraw from the study at any time. If you choose not to participate, information gathered about your student will not be included in the report.

If you have any questions or would like further information about my project, please contact me at Chippewa Middle School.

If you agree to have your student participate in the project, please sign the attached statement if you wish.

Sincerely,

Jelena Todorovich

[Signature]

Consent to Participate in a Research Study
Student Journaling Toward a Higher Understanding of Art
Consent to Participate in a Research Study
Student Journaling Toward a Higher Understanding of Art

I, ____________________________, the parent/legal guardian of the minor named below, acknowledge that the researcher has explained to me the purpose of this research, identified any risks involved, and offered to answer any questions I may have about the nature of my child’s participation. I freely and voluntarily consent to my child’s participation in this project. I understand all information gathered during this project will be completely confidential. I also understand that I may keep a copy of this consent form for my own information.

NAME OF MINOR: ____________________________________________

__________________________________________
Signature of Parent/Legal Guardian Date

__________________________________________
Signature of Student (if 12 or older) Date
Appendix B

Movement Worksheet
1. Draw a long organic shape
2. Fill in the shape with curved lines that overlap on the edges.

Draw 3 other ways to create movement....

[Blank spaces for 3 drawings]
Appendix C

Journal Idea Sheet
Journals

Welcome to your journal! This is your place to write, draw, solve problems, be creative, work, have fun! You will be given assignments during your art class. You are also expected to complete at least two outside drawings per week. The idea is to see how art can relate to our lives and better our understanding of the world in which we live. You may include in your journal: poetry, cartoons, paintings, articles, assignments, notes, photos, fabric, anything you wish (remember that I must collect them from time to time, so don’t include it if you don’t want me to see it). Be adventurous, and good luck!!!
Appendix D

Upside Down Drawing Exercise
FIGURE 1.49
Sample of upside-down contour project.
COPYRIGHT 1986 BY MONA BROOKES/PUBLISHED BY JEREMY P. TARCHER, INC.
Appendix E

Journal Rubric
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

# Journal Rubric

**Completed Assignments—on time**

- **1:** nothing
- **2:** completed half-late
- **3:** completed all on time

**Exploration**

- **1:** one style only
- **2:** some variety
- **3:** broad range of work & materials

**Craftsmanship**

- **1:** sloppy, careless
- **2:** rushed, some effort
- **3:** neatly organized, careful
Appendix F

Art Element Study Guide
The Basic Elements of Art

Please use this handout as a reference for all projects. These terms will be used every class period and will become an important part of your vocabulary. These terms will help you understand one another more clearly. It will also help you understand famous pieces of art and analyze the basic elements very easily.

OUTLINE
-When end points connect.
Boundaries

SHAPE
-Color, or the interior or exterior space of outline.

LINE
-A series of points infinite.

TEXTURE
-Is surface quality. Sensory
2-D
- Length and width.

3-D
- Length, width and actual physical space.

DOMINANCE
- That which has the greatest effect, the uppermost importance, control, authority, guiding influence.

UNITY
- An agreement among elements, wholeness, cohesion.

BALANCE
- An equal distribution of weight, equilibrium. Symmetrical, Asymmetrical, Radial.
RHYTHM
- Regular succession of sounds or motion based on repetition of elements that are the same or slightly modified.

PATTERN
- Elements that repeat to create order, specific or random.

PROPORTION
- The comparative relationship between parts and things or elements with respect to size, amount, or degree.

MOVEMENT
- The actual or implied act of changing place. Passage through time. Indicated direction.

VARIETY
- Diversity of a kind. Partially or repeatedly altered. To change form, nature, substance, to modify.

- Cut along the solid line
- Fold along the dotted line
- Paste in the 4-D space
Appendix G
Art Element Bingo Card
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>UNIT</th>
<th>UNIT</th>
<th>UNIT</th>
<th>UNIT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>BRIDGET RILEY</strong></td>
<td><strong>Negative Space</strong></td>
<td><strong>Born in 1869</strong></td>
<td><strong>HENRY MATISSE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Shape A line space repeated as a group</strong></td>
<td><strong>Emotions</strong></td>
<td><strong>Born in 1869</strong></td>
<td><strong>Geometric Shapes</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
<td><strong>2 Dimensional</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Shape A line space repeated as a group</strong></td>
<td><strong>Emotions</strong></td>
<td><strong>Born in 1869</strong></td>
<td><strong>2 Dimensional</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Shape A line space repeated as a group</strong></td>
<td><strong>Emotions</strong></td>
<td><strong>Born in 1869</strong></td>
<td><strong>2 Dimensional</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Shape A line space repeated as a group</strong></td>
<td><strong>Emotions</strong></td>
<td><strong>Born in 1869</strong></td>
<td><strong>2 Dimensional</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
<td><strong>UNIT</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix H

Art Element and Color Test
### Basic Elements of Art/Color Test

1. Match the vocabulary word with the definition that best describes it

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Vocabulary Word</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Line</td>
<td>the surface quality - sensory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Proportion</td>
<td>a series of points infinite</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhythm</td>
<td>when end points connect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outline</td>
<td>regular succession of sounds or motion - based on repetition - the same or slightly modified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texture</td>
<td>the comparative relationship between parts and things or elements</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Fill in the blank

A) Something that is ______- Dimensional is a flat surface.

2 3

B) The interior or exterior of space ________ of outline.

Pattern     Shape

C) When end points connect and create boundaries it creates an ________

Outline     Proportion
D) ____________ is diversity of a kind.
Unity Variety

E) In _____-Dimensional art, time is incorporated with height, width, and depth.
2 4

F) The actual or implied act of changing place can be called
______________.
Movement Shape

G) Silk has a smooth ____________.
Texture proportion

H) In ____________, elements repeat to create order, either specific or random.
Dominance Pattern

3. Find the picture that matches the art term and draw a line.

Dominance

Texture

Unity
4. Fill in the blank

A) Red, yellow and blue are the ________________ colors.
   Tertiary          Primary

B) By mixing the primary colors, you make ________________.
   Intermediate colors          Secondary Colors

C) Colors opposite on the color wheel are
   _____________________. Complimentary          Triadic
Draw an example of the art term in the space below

Warm Colors

Cool Colors

Movement

Line
Appendix I

Student Critique Format
Critique Format

What—Name of artwork and Artist, date:

Where—Location of work, background, etc.

How—What did the artist do to create this piece of work, what materials?

Feeling—What feeling does this piece create, how does it make you feel?

Opinion—What is your opinion of this work of art?
Appendix J

Self – Portrait Evaluation
Self Portrait Evaluation

1. Label each of the four color schemes that you applied to your self portrait in the appropriate boxes below.

2. Which of the color schemes you selected was your favorite?

3. Why was this your favorite?

4. What effect or feeling did you get from this color scheme?

5. What feeling do you get from your self-portrait overall?

6. What created this effect?

7. Are you pleased with the final product?

8. Why are you pleased or not pleased?
9. It is your turn to critique your own piece of art. Include the

- WHAT
- WHEN
- WHERE
- HOW
- FEELING
- OPINION
I. DOCUMENT IDENTIFICATION:

Title: STUDENT JOURNALING TOWARD A HIGHER UNDERSTANDING OF ART

Author(s): Todorovich, Jelena

Corporate Source: Saint Xavier University

II. REPRODUCTION RELEASE:

In order to disseminate as widely as possible timely and significant materials of interest to the educational community, documents announced in the monthly abstract journal of the ERIC system, Resources in Education (RIE), are usually made available to users in microfiche, reproduced paper copy, and electronic media, and sold through the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS). Credit is given to the source of each document, and, if reproduction release is granted, one of the following notices is affixed to the document.

If permission is granted to reproduce and disseminate the identified document, please CHECK ONE of the following three options and sign at the bottom of the page.

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 1 documents

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEminate THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Sample

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

Check here for Level 1 release, permitting reproduction and dissemination in microfiche or other ERIC archival media (e.g., electronic) and paper copy.

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 2A documents

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE, AND IN ELECTRONIC MEDIA FOR ERIC COLLECTION SUBSCRIBERS ONLY, HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Sample

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

Check here for Level 2A release, permitting reproduction and dissemination in microfiche and in electronic media for ERIC archival collection subscribers only.

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 2B documents

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL IN MICROFICHE ONLY HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Sample

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

Check here for Level 2B release, permitting reproduction and dissemination in microfiche only.

Documents will be processed as indicated provided reproduction quality permits. If permission to reproduce is granted, but no box is checked, documents will be processed at Level 1.

I hereby grant to the Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) nonexclusive permission to reproduce and disseminate this document as indicated above. Reproduction from the ERIC microfiche or electronic media by persons other than ERIC employees and its system contractors requires permission from the copyright holder. Exception is made for non-profit reproduction by libraries and other service agencies to satisfy information needs of educators in response to discrete inquiries.

Sign here:

William Crannell, Ed.D.

Student/FBMP

Saint Xavier University

3700 W. 103rd St. Chicago, IL
III. DOCUMENT AVAILABILITY INFORMATION (FROM NON-ERIC SOURCE):

If permission to reproduce is not granted to ERIC, or if you wish ERIC to cite the availability of the document from another source, please provide the following information regarding the availability of the document. (ERIC will not announce a document unless it is publicly available, and a dependable source can be specified. Contributors should also be aware that ERIC selection criteria are significantly more stringent for documents that cannot be made available through EDRS.)

Publisher/Distributor:

Address:

Price:

IV. REFERRAL OF ERIC TO COPYRIGHT/REPRODUCTION RIGHTS HOLDER:

If the right to grant this reproduction release is held by someone other than the addressee, please provide the appropriate name and address:

Name:

Address:

V. WHERE TO SEND THIS FORM:

Send this form to the following ERIC Clearinghouse:

ERIC/CHESS
2805 E. Tenth Street, #120
Bloomington, IN 47408

However, if solicited by the ERIC Facility, or if making an unsolicited contribution to ERIC, return this form (and the document being contributed) to:

ERIC Processing and Reference Facility
4483-A Forbes Boulevard
Lanham, Maryland 20706

Telephone: 301-552-4200
Toll Free: 800-799-3742
FAX: 301-552-4700
e-mail: ericfac@inet.ed.gov
WWW: http://ericfacility.org

188 (Rev. 2/2001)