This intervention study evaluated the effects of using two types of explicit instruction, curriculum maps and guided questions, compared with simple reviews or repetition to teach core curriculum content to high school students with learning disabilities in a group instruction format. A repeated measures research design was used with six groups of five students each who received each of the three interventions in differing sequences. A test, representing information from each of the three lessons, was administered as a pre-test and post-test. Analysis of results indicated that the use of the curriculum map enhanced learning for the students with learning disabilities more than the use of guiding questions, and the use of guiding questions enhanced learning more than simple reviews of repeated information. Results support the use of curriculum maps to make instruction more explicit by depicting the importance and structure of the content and then using these maps to lead and review learning through guided questioning. Lesson scripts, handouts, and the tests are appended and comprise the majority of the document's contents. (Contains 29 references.) (DB)
The effects of curriculum maps and guiding questions on the test performance of adolescents with learning disabilities

B. Keith Lenz, Gary Adams, Janis A. Bulgren, Norman Pouliot, and Michelle Laraux

2002

Sponsored by the U.S. Department of Education, Office of Special Education Programs
Grant # 84.324S
Abstract

Previous research on students with learning disabilities has indicated that these students benefit most from explicit instruction. However, few studies have examined how explicit instruction can be translated to the logistical demands associated with large-group instruction in high-school general-education settings in ways that are socially acceptable to high-school teachers. This intervention study evaluated the effects of using two types of explicit instruction, curriculum maps and guiding questions, compared to the use of simple reviews of repeated information to teach core curriculum content in a group instruction format. Thirty high school students with learning disabilities participated in the study. A repeated measures research design was used to investigate the research questions associated with this study. For this design, the students were randomly assigned to six groups so that there were five students in each group. The students in each group participated in each of the interventions in differing sequences across the three lessons. A 45-item test, representing information from each of the three lessons, was administered as a pretest and posttest. The results of the comparison of student test scores associated with the three interventions indicated that the use of the curriculum map enhanced learning for students with learning disabilities more than the use of guiding questions, and the use of guiding questions enhanced learning for students with learning disabilities more than simple reviews of repeated information. Based on this study, core curriculum general education teachers may be able to begin making their instruction more explicit and powerful by incorporating simple routines comprised the use of curriculum maps to depict the importance and structure of the content and then using these maps to lead and review learning through guided and interactive questioning.
The way curriculum is currently delivered in core curriculum classrooms is an obstacle to developing an inclusive learning environment in the high school setting. Rather than ensuring student understanding, too often the major goal is to “cover” the content. The Webster’s II New College Dictionary defines “cover” as “to place something on or over, so as to protect or conceal.” Wiggins and McTighe (1998) described this approach as “teaching by mentioning it,” or covering topics and ideas by drawing attention to them without developing them with students. Three planning dilemmas must be faced for a teacher to move away from a coverage approach and toward a model that ensures student understanding for students with disabilities. First, the educator must sort through the information and select the chunks of information that are most critical to student learning. To this end, Wiggins and McTighe have argued for an approach to curriculum planning called “backward design,” whereby curriculum and instruction is based on sorting information into three levels: “enduring understanding,” “important to know and do,” and “worth being familiar with” (Wiggins & McTighe, 1998, pp. 9-10). Other educators over the last three decades have made similar suggestions (e.g., Beane, 1995; Blythe & Associates, 1998; Bruner, 1960, 1973; Caine & Caine, 1997; Perkins, 1992). Sorting the information to denote importance is critical for many students with disabilities who may not have the same background information as their peers or who have trouble distinguishing important from less important information from teacher presentations (Lenz, Alley, & Schumaker, 1987).

The second planning dilemma that must be faced by teachers is providing instruction about critical information in ways that ensures student understanding. As mentioned above, previous research on students with learning disabilities has indicated that these students benefit most from explicit instruction. (e.g. Carnine, Jones, & Dixon, 1995; Gersten, 1998; Hollingsworth & Woodward, 1993). Gersten (1998) proposed that explicit instruction is based on the use of (a) examples to demonstrate a concept or process, (b) models of proficient performance and step-by-step strategies, (c) advance organizers and guiding questions to focus attention and prompt critical thinking, (d) opportunities for student to share decision-making processes, (e) authentic, interactive, and adequate practice, and (f) frequent feedback and support for performance. However, few studies have examined how explicit instruction can be translated to address the logistical demands of group instruction frequently encountered in high school general education settings.

The third planning dilemma centers on how to find the time to identify the content, plan activities that result in explicit instruction, and then to incorporate these activities into the instructional time available during the class period. Secondary teachers have reported that many of the activities that might make content accessible to students with disabilities are simply not feasible for them to implement (Schumm & Vaughn, 1995). In addition, most of the planning time made available to teachers in not quality planning time (Joint Committee on
Teacher Planning for Students with Disabilities, 1995) and is spent administering the more functional aspects of getting through the day.

Some research on complex teaching routines has been completed that demonstrates that explicit instruction can be moved successfully into general education core classes to improve the performance of students with disabilities. These routines are comprised of combinations of devices and instructional procedures linked together to help a teacher move through common instructional challenges (e.g., teaching concepts, leading students through a unit). Several research studies have shown that when these complex routines are used on a consistent basis by a classroom teacher, the unit test scores of all students in the class improve significantly, usually by about 10 to 15 percentage points (e.g., Bulgren, Deshler, & Schumaker, 1997; Bulgren, Schumaker, Deshler, & Lenz, 2000; Bulgren, Schumaker, & Deshler, 1988; Bulgren, Schumaker, Deshler, & Lenz, in prep.; Lenz, Alley, & Schumaker, 1987; Lenz, Bulgren, Schumaker, Deshler, & Boudah, 1994).

While these routines have been found to be effective, secondary teachers have reported that these routines are too complex and time consuming for easy integration into ongoing instruction. As a result, some teachers have reported abandoning the routines before they master their use enough to become effective with students with disabilities. In addition, informal reports from teachers involved in inservice activities focused on these complex routines have indicated that simpler “starter” routines are needed that are not as complex, but can be more easily woven into daily practice and serve as a foundation and springboard for other more explicit teaching activities leading up to the use of more complex routines.

As a result of these suggestions, two complex teaching routines, the Unit Organizer Routine and the Question Exploration Routine, that had already been developed and field tested and were consistent with the criteria for explicit instruction presented by Gersten (1998), were selected and analyzed to determine how “starter” routines could be created. The Unit Organizer Routine (Lenz, Bulgren, Schumaker, Deshler, & Boudah, 1994) is based on a graphic representation of an advance organizer designed to help students achieve the learning outcomes for a unit. An advance organizer is information presented “in advance or and at a higher level of generality, inclusiveness, and abstraction than the learning task itself” (Ausubel & Robinson, 1969, p. 606). In addition, graphic representation of the organizer has been found to be an effective way to present the advance organizer to students with disabilities [Anderson Inman, Knox-Quinn, & Horney, 1996; Bui, Schumaker, & Deshler, 2002; Scanlon, Deshler, & Schumaker, 1996; for a recent review, see National Institute of Child Health and Human Development (2000).]. The unit organizer device allows a teacher and students to collaboratively explore and identify on the first day of the unit: (a) how the unit fits with other units, (b) a curriculum map that focused attention on the critical ideas and the structure of
Effects of Curriculum Maps and Guiding Questions

information in the unit, (c) relationships and types of thinking required in the unit, (d) self-test questions, (e) a schedule of assignments and activities, and (d) the beginning of an expanded map so that new information can be added as it is presented each day of the unit. Lenz et al. (1994) reported that when teachers used the Unit Organizer for unit instruction, performance of students with disabilities on classroom unit tests increased by an average of 15% points. Lenz et al. used a multiple-baseline across-classes/students design with two classes/students in each design and replicated the design two times. Therefore, the performance of six students with learning disabilities was evaluated across six secondary classes (three middle school and three high school).

The Question Exploration Routine (Bulgren, Lenz, Deshler, & Schumaker, 2001) is based on teacher presentation and use of a guiding question in a course, unit, or lesson. Gersten (1998) proposed the use of guiding questions as a form of explicit instruction and linked their use to organizers as a way of helping students with disabilities focus attention and prompt critical thinking. Guiding questions are overarching questions that are posed at the beginning of a presentation. These questions lead students to think about the critical information in the content and to prompt thinking about relationships. After a major question has been presented, background information and subquestions related to the major question are surfaced and then are revisited and discussed throughout the presentation. Specifically, the Question Exploration Routine involves the teacher posing a guiding critical question to students. Next, the teacher and students collaboratively (a) identify what information is needed to answer the question, (b) generate and answer subquestions that can lead to the answer, (c) generate a main idea or kernel answer to the critical question, (d) identify how the answer relates to other course information, and (e) extend the answer to the world or more complex situations. Bulgren, Lenz, Schumaker, & Deshler (2002) reported that students in experimental classes where guiding questions were used earned a mean score of 70% on a test taken after the first experimental lesson and a mean score of 72% on a test taken after the second experimental lesson. Students in the comparison classes earned average test scores of 48% after the first comparison lesson and 46% after the second comparison lesson. The comparison lessons were comprised of a presentation that did not include the guiding question. Students with learning disabilities in experimental classes earned a mean test score of 63% while students with learning disabilities in the comparison classes earned a mean score of 34%.

Based on a review of the Unit Organizer Routine and the Question Exploration Routine, two “starter” routines were selected for this study. From the Unit Organizer Routine, the curriculum map showing the critical idea and structure of a lesson was selected for the starter routine. From the Question Exploration Routine, the guiding critical question and the two steps
Effects of Curriculum Maps and Guiding Questions

that probed information needed to answer the question and the step that elicited and answered subquestions were selected as the components of the starter routine.

Research question. The research question for this study was: Are the effects of a starter routine based on the Unit Organizer Routine or based on the Question Exploration Routine significantly better than the effects of traditional periodic reviews of repeated information?

Methods

Setting

The study took place in classrooms typically used for language arts instruction in two high schools (serving approximately 925 and 900 students respectively) in the Puget Sound area of the state of Washington. All of the classrooms had desks, chairs, and an overhead projector and screen.

Participants

Thirty students who qualified for services for students with learning disabilities during the 2001-2002 school year and who were enrolled in general education high school language arts courses during the 2001-2002 school year were randomly selected from the two high schools. School records were reviewed to determine that the general education classroom placement was the least restrictive and most appropriate placement to receive language arts content for each student.

There were 20 males and 10 females. The average age of the students was 15.87 years (sd = .81 yr.). There were twenty 9th graders, seven 10th graders, two 11th graders, and one 12th grader. Seventeen of the students were white, eight were black, three were Hispanic, and two were Asian. The average IQ score as measured on the most recently administered Wechsler Intelligence Scale was 93.8 (sd = 6.1). Fourteen of the students were receiving the majority of their education in special education classes, and six of the students were mainstreamed into general education classes for all classes except for one resource-room special-education support class.

The Content Lessons

Three parallel language arts lessons were designed. The lessons covered the topics of "personification," "characterization," and "plot." Content to be covered in the lessons was content that had not been previously presented as a single lesson in any setting in the same or previous school year as reported by the head of the language arts department in each school. The amount of content in the lessons was controlled, with matching numbers and difficulty of informational items in each. Six language arts teachers validated the parallel nature of the lessons and the direct relationship of each lesson to state standards. (See Appendix A for a sample lesson.)
The review intervention. The review intervention served as the control intervention for the study. It was chosen as the control intervention because review is typically recommended as a method that is appropriate to use to help students organize thinking about information before moving on to new information (Shostak, 1999). In this study, the review consisted of three phases. First, the instructor specified the objective and topics of the lesson orally. Second, three times during the lesson, the instructor stopped and reviewed the information that had been presented to the students by repeating important information. Third, at the end of the lesson, the instructor again repeated key information that had been presented in the lesson. No visual graphic organizers, visual representations of the information, or guiding questions were provided. The information was not visually displayed in any way as it was reviewed. (See Appendix B for the protocol for the review intervention.)

Guiding question intervention. The guiding question intervention also consisted of three phases. First, a guiding question covering the critical outcome of the lesson was posed to the students and was written on an overhead transparency. The students were then asked to list what "must be known" to answer the guiding question and what "other questions" or supporting questions must be answered before the guiding question could be answered. The instructor wrote the elicited list of information and set of questions on an overhead transparency so that students could see them. Second, three times during the lesson, the instructor stopped, displayed the guiding question, the listed information, and other questions, and asked students questions to determine whether the "must be known" information had been acquired and whether the students knew the answers to the "other questions." Third, at the end of the lesson, an answer to the guiding question was constructed with the students, and the instructor asked the students questions to review the "must be known" information and the answers to the "other questions" (See Appendix B for the protocol for the guiding question intervention.)

Curriculum map intervention. The curriculum map intervention also consisted of three phases. First, a curriculum map depicting the structure of the content of the lesson was shown and described to the students by the instructor. The students were asked to summarize the structure. Second, three times during the lesson, the instructor displayed the map, elicited a summary of critical points from the students based on the structure, and clarified misunderstandings. A question was asked about each element of the curriculum map to elicit information from the students. Key words were added to the map to record accurate summary statements elicited by the questions. Third, at the end of the lesson, a full review of the critical points of the lesson was conducted with the students using the curriculum map; the students were then asked to summarize the lesson independently using the map. (See Appendix B for the protocol for the curriculum map intervention)
Effects of Curriculum Maps and Guiding Questions

Materials

Three scripts were constructed for the instructor to use, one for each content lesson. Each script contained all the information to be presented in the lesson in the order in which it was to be presented and had a cue inserted as to where the instructor was to use one of the interventions. Parallel and coordinated curriculum maps and guiding questions were constructed for each lesson to be used as needed in the experimental design. They met the criteria for good organizers and good questions presented by Lenz, Bulgren, Schumaker, Deshler, and Boudah (1993). The review intervention required that an objective, topics, and key points be identified for each lesson. The objective was constructed to be parallel to the guiding question, and the repeated topics and key points were constructed to be parallel to the key topics and points depicted in the curriculum map. The protocols illustrating the three interventions in one of the lessons are provided in Appendix B as an example.

Measures

Parallel tests were constructed for the three lessons, and the three tests were combined to be used as a pretest to be taken before students were introduced to any lesson and then as a posttest after all three lessons had been presented. The test was comprised of 45 items. 15 of these items were matching items, 15 of these items were fill-in-the-blank items, and 15 of these items were multiple-choice items. Five items of each type related to each of the three lessons.

An answer key was designed for the test. Scorers used the answer key to award one point for each correct answer on the test. Interscorer reliability was determined by having two independent scorers score 100% of the pretests and posttests and by matching their scores item-by-item. The percentage of agreement was calculated by dividing the number of agreements by the number of agreements plus disagreements and multiplying by 100. The total percentage of agreement was 100% (1350 agreements out of 1350 opportunities to agree.)

The lessons and the test were field tested before the study began with a group of 15 students with learning disabilities who did not participate in the study to evaluate and adjust lesson and test-item difficulty. An item analysis of test items indicated at least a .5 standard deviation dispersion across all test items indicating that the test items were acceptable. The test used for both the pretest and the posttest is provided in Appendix D.

Procedures

Instruction took place during a 90-minute time block when students were scheduled to attend class in the resource room. A 10th-grade language arts substitute teacher certified to teach language arts in the state of Washington was trained to deliver all three interventions and was asked to use the standardized scripts that were specifically controlled to ensure that students in all groups received the same information for each lesson. The same amount of time, 90 minutes, was spent delivering the information in each lesson to all groups. The lessons were timed; all
lessons began and ended within two minutes of each other. The study was conducted over a three-week period to accommodate the scheduling of the student groups, and in each week the pretest was given on Monday, the intervention lessons were presented on Tuesday, Wednesday, and Thursday, and the posttest was presented on Friday.

**Design**

The design of this study had each student participate in each of the three intervention conditions: (1) review, (2) guiding question, and (3) curriculum map. To adjust for possible order effects of presentation, six possible combinations of orders were used (123, 132, 231, 213, 312, 321). For example, if a participant was randomly assigned to the 321-combination group, she would receive the curriculum map condition for the first lesson, the guiding question condition for the second lesson, and the review condition for the third lesson. In contrast, a participant in the 231 group would receive the guiding question condition for the first lesson, the curriculum map condition for the second lesson, and the review condition for the third lesson. The 30 participating students were randomly assigned to six groups so that there were five students in each group. The students in each group participated in each of the interventions in differing sequences across the three lessons.

After students were assigned to each experimental sequence, they were given a pretest about information covered in all three lessons and then participated in all three lessons in the sequence. After the sequence of three lessons had been completed, all students were given a posttest covering the information presented across all three lessons. The overall design of this study is shown in Table 1.

The data for this study were analyzed using the SPSS repeated measures analysis of variance program with a Tukey post-hoc test to identify the differences between the groups. Also, the data were analyzed to ensure that there were no order (sequence) effects.

**Results**

No significant differences were found among the segments of the pretests measuring the content of each lesson (mean number correct for Lesson 1 = 1.13 (sd = 1.11), Lesson 2 = 1.30 (sd = 1.15), Lesson 3 = 1.37 (1.67). Also, there were no order effects. There was a statistically significant difference (t=15.6, df=29, p<.001) between the average combined pretest score per student (M = 3.80, sd = 2.52) versus the average combined posttest score per student (M = 17.77, sd = 5.85)

Based on an analysis of variance with repeated measures, there was a statistically significant difference between the three intervention conditions (F = 91.73, p < .001). The mean posttest score for the curriculum map intervention was 8.07 (sd = 2.33). The mean posttest score for the guiding question intervention was 6.43 (2.53). The mean posttest score for the review intervention was 3.27 (sd = 1.80).
A post-hoc analysis showed that each of the differences between the three groups was significant at the .001 level. The students earned significantly higher scores when they participated in the curriculum map intervention than they did when they participated in the guiding questions intervention. They also earned significantly higher scores when they participated in the guiding questions intervention than they did when they participated in the review intervention.

Discussion

The results of these comparisons indicate that the use of the curriculum map enhanced learning for students with learning disabilities more than the use of guiding questions. However, the use of guiding questions enhanced learning for students with learning disabilities more than the review.

There are several conclusions that can be drawn from these results. First, the visual formatting of information as a planning and presentation tool appears to enhance learning for students with learning disabilities. Educators who advocate that general education teachers should become more inclusive in content area classes by providing instruction that is more explicit, organized, and accommodating should seriously consider the interactive use of the curriculum map as a planning and presentation tool.

Second, while the guiding question intervention did not produce effects as strong as the curriculum map intervention, the use of a guiding question was more effective than the review intervention. The review intervention was based on routine repetition of the key topic captured in the guiding question and information depicted in the curriculum map. Therefore, oral reviews of information that are based on simply repeating information that is identified by the teacher as important do not seem to be as useful as other techniques that visually depict the information and guide students in how to process the information. This may be because repeating information is a strategy that students already use for studying and does not necessarily help them understand the information. That is, the use of the curriculum map and the guiding question may compensate for the lack of organizing and questioning strategies that are needed in processing complex content-area information. Simply identifying and presenting information in terms of importance and expecting students to know how to process this information (i.e., use organizing and questioning strategies) is not likely to be an effective instructional procedure. Another explanation might be that using one modality (the auditory modality) is a weak instructional procedure for students with learning disabilities who may have significant language-processing difficulties.

Third, all three interventions were constructed around what was identified as important information. The first step in constructing each of the three interventions was to determine the relative importance of the information and the structure of the information that was important for students to understand. In the curriculum map intervention, the important information was
Effects of Curriculum Maps and Guiding Questions

represented in a hierarchical map structure. In the guiding question intervention, the important information was represented by visually showing students the relationship between the guiding question and the hierarchical relationship of the supporting questions. In the review intervention, the teacher orally reviewed by repeating information that had been targeted as more important throughout the lesson. The findings of this study indicate that teacher time spent in selecting the critical information, showing students how that information can be structured, and visually tracking the question-answer process around the critical information can improve the performance of students with learning disabilities in content targeted for general education classrooms in high school settings.

Several concerns are worthy of note. First, although each intervention produced learning, the actual posttest scores earned by the students were not impressive. After the curriculum map intervention, which produced the highest scores, students were earning scores that would be considered "Fs" in school. Thus, these simple interventions do not seem to be powerful enough to boost students with learning disabilities into the passing range. The more complex teaching routines reviewed at the beginning of this article have produced results showing that students with learning disabilities can be boosted into the passing range. While these starter routines may be a way to introduce explicit instruction into core curriculum classes, the more complex routines and devices may well be worth the time and energy required to use them.

Second, whether or not teachers will find the simpler interventions used in this study acceptable is not clear. How easily they might incorporate these techniques into their planning and teaching processes is unknown. While the starter routines were found to increase the learning for students with learning disabilities, studies to determine the palatability of the starter routines compared to more complex routines should be conducted.

Third, also unknown are the effects of these interventions on the performance of other students without disabilities enrolled in a general education course. If students are not accepting of the procedures, and if they do not receive much benefit from the use of them, teachers might reject the procedures (Lenz, Schumaker, Deshler, & Kissam, 1991). Further research will need to be conducted in these areas.

To conclude, the purpose of this study was to examine the effects of curriculum maps, guiding questions, and reviews on the test performance of students with learning disabilities in order to support the use of starter routines that could lead to the use of more explicit instruction by general education teachers. Based on this study, content-area general education teachers can make their instruction more explicit and powerful by using curriculum maps to depict the importance and structure of the content and then by using these maps to lead and review learning through interactive questioning around these maps. The use of guiding questions will also contribute to learning by these students, but not with the same power as the curriculum map if
used alone. These methods are definitely more powerful than simple reviews that assume that students have the strategies required to organize the information and process it. Planning and teaching routines that teachers can use to select and deliver content but simultaneously work to compensate for students’ lack of strategies should be a guiding principle in attempts to make general education courses more accessible to more students. Starter routines that are based on simple components of more complex routines may be an effective way to introduce more explicit instruction and might increase the likelihood that more explicit instruction can be maintained in high school core curriculum classes.
Effects of Curriculum Maps and Guiding Questions

References


Table 1

The sequence of interventions experienced by the subjects in each group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lessons</th>
<th>Group 1</th>
<th>Group 2</th>
<th>Group 3</th>
<th>Group 4</th>
<th>Group 5</th>
<th>Group 6</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>Pretest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Curriculum Map</td>
<td>Curriculum Map</td>
<td>Guiding Question</td>
<td>Guiding Question</td>
<td>Review</td>
<td>Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Guiding Question</td>
<td>Review</td>
<td>Curriculum Map</td>
<td>Review</td>
<td>Curriculum Map</td>
<td>Guiding Question</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Review</td>
<td>Guiding Question</td>
<td>Review</td>
<td>Curriculum Map</td>
<td>Guiding Question</td>
<td>Curriculum Map</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>Posttest</td>
<td>Posttest</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

List of Appendices

Appendix A: Sample Lesson Script for lesson on "Personification" ........................................15

Appendix B: Intervention Materials ........................................................................................26
  Protocol and Curriculum Map for lesson on "Personification"
  Protocol for Guiding Question Intervention for lesson on "Personification"
  Reviewed Information Protocol for lesson on "Personification"

Appendix C: Pretest/Posttest ........................................................................................................38
Appendix A

PERSONIFICATION

Lesson Script

Objectives:

Level 1: Students will be able to understand the concept of personification.
Level 2: Students will be able to identify examples of personification and explain their meaning.
Level 3: Students will be able to create sensory images using personification.

Materials:

Transparency A: Literal paraphrase and excerpt from “Silver”
Transparency & Handout #1: Definition of Personification, excerpt from “Varick Street” and Discussion Questions
Handout #2: Independent Activity – Using Personification

LESSON SCRIPT

Anticipatory Set: (5 minutes)
The purpose of this lesson is teach you how to use a writing trick called “personification” that will help you make your writing more interesting to others and may help you improve your grades on things you write.

We are going to learn what personification is and how to use a personification strategy called FITS in your writing. You should take notes as we identify the key ideas in knowing and using personification.”

INTRODUCTION to the Intervention. [Introduce LO or GQ or RI Intervention here using the Intervention Protocol for each lesson.

Lesson Part 1: (10 minutes)

Let’s first define the term ‘personification’. Personification is a literary device that gives human qualities to an object or idea. We give human qualities to things so that when someone is reading what we write the reader gets a sensory image. A sensory image is
something that appeals to one or more of the five senses. We get a sensory image by either seeing in our minds or feeling something inside of us. We can make our writing more interesting by creating sensory images around objects and ideas.

Sensory images are based on human qualities or traits. So, a human trait or action is used to personify an object or idea. An object is something that we can see and feel. An object might be things such as a “shoe,” a “truck,” a “factory,” a “building,” or “pipes.” It could be a plant such as a “tree.” It could be an animal such as a “bird.” Yes, even if it is living but not human, we are calling them objects.

We can also personify ideas. Words that show ideas would include terms such as “fear,” “freedom,” or “peace.”

STOP #1 [Insert LO, GQ, or RI Intervention STOP #1 here.]

Lesson Part 2: (10 minutes)

“When we write, we often start by describing or referring to objects and ideas in simple ways. For example, we might start by writing things like “The wind blew through the trees,” “The fire engines came quickly down the street,” or “Everyone was happy when the prisoner was released to his family.” [Show or write these on the white board.]

We can make our writing more interesting by personifying. That is, if we think about our own personal experiences and use our feelings, moods, and behaviors and relate them to the object and ideas we are writing about, we can trick the reader into seeing inside us, understand and share our point of view. This makes our writing more interesting to others.

[Using Transparency A, read aloud and compare the literal statement, “The moon moves slowly across the night sky.” to the lines from the poem “Silver” by Walter de la Mare.

“What does the use of personification add to the poetic version?”

We commonly use personification in everyday speech. For example we could edit these sentences to say, “The wind whistled through the trees,” “The fire engines came screaming down the street,” or “Freedom finally smiled as the prisoner was released to his family.” [Edit sentences on the white board.]
So, giving human qualities to an object or idea is based on personally examining our feelings, moods, and behaviors to see if there is a match with the objects and ideas in our writing. If there is, we can use these matches to edit our writing to make it more interesting.

STOP #2 [Insert LO, GQ, or RI Intervention STOP #2 here.]

Lesson Part 3: Guided Practice: (15 minutes)

"Let’s take a look at how one author used personification to make his writing more interesting by giving objects human qualities that you can relate to."

[Distribute Handout #1. Using Transparency and Handout #1, read the excerpt from “Varick Street” aloud, then, ask the following questions.]

Discussion Questions and Sample Responses:

1. What object or idea in the poem was given human characteristics? (The factory [buildings, pipes, smokestack*])  
   *may be inferred by some students

2. What are the human qualities that were given to the object or idea? (It struggles awake, it feels uneasy, it has veins, it attempts work, it tries to breathe, it has long hairy nostrils and it stinks.)

3. What mood or feeling is suggested by giving it human qualities? (A feeling of being tired and miserable)

4. In what ways does the object or idea act like a human being? (The factory at night seems to act like a tired, disgusting, overworked laborer)
Lesson Part 4 (15 minutes)

"Now that we know what personification is, let's learn a strategy that can help us remember how to use this writing trick more easily. We call this the FITS strategy because the first letter of each step spells the word FITS. We can remember that FITS will help us use the personification trick because personification "fits" objects and ideas with human qualities just like a hat "fits" your head. It goes around it, right? Okay, let's learn the FITS strategy.

The FITS strategy can be used to personify an object or idea. There are four steps in the FITS Personification Strategy

Step 1: Find the object or idea. First, we look for words that are objects or ideas that are key to the ideas in your writing. So if you wrote, "The police car turned the corner and headed slowly towards her house." In this case the key word is "police car."

Step 2. Identify an overall mood, feeling or behavior Next, we try to identify a feeling, mood, or behavior that we have had related to this object and what we want to say about it. Overall, the feeling that I have is that the police car is trying to be "sly" and "secretive" as it moves in on a house.

Step 3. Tie the object or idea to a human quality (or experience). The human quality that I might relate to the police car would be "sneaky" like an animal moving in or creeping up on it's prey.

Step 4. State the connection. Okay, if I write the connection, my sentence now might look like this: The police car crept slowly around the corner and moved stealthily toward her house.

STOP #3 [Insert LO, GQ, or RI Intervention STOP #3 here.]

Let's do another one. Let's create an example of personification by using this idea: "I used to climb up in a tree when I was afraid."

1. Find the object or idea.
   A tree.
   The tree is a big, old, maple tree that sits in my grandmother's back yard.
It has wide branches that are low to the ground so that I can climb it easily.
It is covered with thick green leaves during the summer.

2. **Identify an overall mood, feeling or behavior.**
The tree is strong and offers protection.
It gives me a feeling of being safe and protected.

3. **Tie the object or idea to a human quality (or experience)**
The branches of the tree are like “arms” that can “embrace” me and keep me safe.

4. **State the connection** Use a verb to state the way that the tree acts like a human being.
   *The old maple tree held me securely in its arms.*

**Lesson part 5: Independent Practice:** (15 minutes)
Distribute Handout #2:
Students should complete the Independent Activity.
Collect and correct with students using the Correction Rubric provided.

STOP #4 [Final review: Insert LO, GQ, or RI Intervention STOP #4 here.]
Compare the following:

The moon moves slowly across the night sky

Slowly, silently, now the moon
Walks the night in her silver shoon [shoes]

From "Silver" by Walter de la Mare
The Personification Strategy

This strategy can be used to create examples of personification.

The four steps of the Personification Strategy are the following:

1. **Find the object or idea.**

2. **Identify the overall mood, feeling or behavior.**

3. **Tie the object or idea to a human quality (or experience)**

4. **State the connection**
Let us create an example of personification by using a tree.

1. **Find the object or idea.**
   
   A tree
   
   The tree is a big, old, maple tree that sits in my grandmother's back yard.
   
   It has wide branches that are low to the ground so that I can climb it easily.
   
   It is covered with thick green leaves during the summer.

2. **Identify the overall mood, feeling or behavior.**
   
   The tree is strong and offers protection.
   
   It gives me a feeling of being safe and protected.

3. **Tie the object or idea to a human quality (or experience)**
   
   The branches of the tree are like "arms" that can "embrace" me and keep me safe.

4. **State the connection** Use a verb to state the way that the tree acts like a human being.
   
   The old maple tree held me securely in its arms.
Definition: Personification is a literary device that gives human qualities to an object, or idea.

At night the factories
struggle awake,
wretched uneasy buildings
veined with pipes
attempt their work
trying to breathe,
the elongated nostrils
haired with spikes
give off such stenches, too.

From “Varick Street” by Elizabeth Bishop
1. What object or idea in the poem is given human characteristics?

2. What are the human qualities that were given to the object or idea?

3. What mood or feeling is suggested by giving it human qualities?

4. In what ways does the object or idea act like a human being?
Independent Activity:
On the lines below, write an example of personification for one of the objects or ideas listed:

shoe: ________________________________
truck: _______________________________
fear: ________________________________

Correction Rubric: (8 pts.)
A human trait or action is used to personify the object or idea (2 pts.)
The use of personification gives a mood or feeling (2 pts.)
The human quality used is related to the object or idea being personified (2 pts.)
The example of personification is expressed in a complete sentence (2 pts.)
Appendix B
INTERVENTION MATERIALS

Reviewed Information Protocol for lesson on “Personification”
Protocol for Guiding Question Intervention for lesson on ‘Personification”
Protocol and Curriculum Map for lesson on ‘Personification
PERSONIFICATION
Reviewed Information Intervention Protocol

The lesson on “Personification” has an Introduction and four stopping points numbered (#1-#4). After the lesson Anticipatory Set has been provided, read the Introduction to students before starting on Lesson part 1. At the end of each lesson part, stop and repeat the points that have just been presented by reading the points listed below for each section. Try to memorize the points so that the review is as natural as possible. Do not ask students any questions, but answer any questions that students may pose.

Introduction

“As I present this lesson, I am going to stop four times and repeat critical information that will help you learn about “personification.” I will repeat information that I think will help you learn the information. You can ask me questions at any time; you can also take notes on the paper that I have given to you.

By the end of this lesson:
You will understand how “personification” can be used to give objects and idea life to express your personal experience.

Do you have any questions before we begin?” [Answer any questions]

STOP #1: Repeat these points:

Personification is a literary device that gives human qualities to an object or idea.

We give human qualities to objects or ideas so that when someone is reading the reader gets a sensory image.

A sensory image is something that appeals to one or more of the five senses. We get a sensory image by either seeing it in our minds or feeling something inside of us.

So, a human trait or action is used to personify an object or idea.
STOP #2: Repeat these points:

“When we write, we often start by describing or referring to objects and ideas in simple ways.

“We can make our writing more interesting by personifying. That is, if we think about our own personal experiences and use our feelings, moods, and behaviors and relate them to the object and ideas we are writing about, we can trick the reader into seeing inside us, understanding, and sharing our point of view. This makes our writing more interesting to others.

We edited these sentences to personify objects [point to the underlined word in each sentence as you read the sentence] to say, “The wind whistled through the trees,” “The fire engines came screaming down the street,” or “Freedom finally smiled as the prisoner was released to his family.”

So, giving human qualities to an object or idea is based on personally examining our feelings, moods, and behaviors to see if there is a match with the objects and ideas in our writing. If there is, we can use these matches to edit our writing to make it more interesting.

STOP #3: Repeat these points:

“The FITS strategy helps us remember how to use the trick of personification in our writing.

“We call this the FITS strategy because the first letter of each step spells the word FITS.”

“The FITS strategy can be used to personify an object or idea. There are four steps in the FITS Personification Strategy.”

“Step 1: Find the object or idea. First, we look for words that are objects or ideas that are key to the ideas in your writing. For example, police car.

“Step 2. Identify an overall mood, feeling or behavior Next, we try to identify a feeling, mood, or behavior that we have had related to this object and what we want to say about it. For example, I might have a feeling of it being sly or secretive.

“Step 3. Tie the object or idea to a human quality (or experience) The human quality that I might relate to the police car would be “sneaky” like an animal moving in or creeping up on it’s prey.”
“Step 4. **State the connection.** Now, I write the connection: The police car crept slowly around the corner and moved stealthily toward her house.”

Here’s another example:

1. **Find the object or idea.**
   A tree.

2. **Identify an overall mood, feeling or behavior.**
   The tree is strong and offers protection.
   It gives me a feeling of being safe and protected.

3. **Tie the object or idea to a human quality (or experience)**
   The branches of the tree are like “arms” that can “embrace” me and keep me safe.

4. **State the connection** I write it out and to do this I use a verb to state the way that the tree acts like a human being.
   *The old maple tree held me securely in its arms.*

**STOP #4 Let's review everything we have learned about Personification**

Repeat the key points listed in #1-#3 for all lesson parts.
PERSONIFICATION
Guiding Question Intervention

The lesson on “Personification” has an Introduction and four stopping points numbered (#1-#4). After the lesson Anticipatory Set has been provided, read the Introduction to students before starting on Lesson part 1. At the end of each lesson part, stop and use the Curriculum Map to conduct a review. Familiarize yourself with the map and be familiar with the questions in each section so that the review is as natural as possible. As the lesson progresses, answer questions that students may pose.

INTRODUCTION

“As I present this lesson, I am going to start by asking you a question about ‘personification’ that will guide our learning in lesson. We will start by talking about what the question is asking us. During the lesson, we will stop four times to see how well we can answer the question about “personification.” You can ask me questions at any time; you can also take notes on the paper that I have given to you.

Do you have any questions about how we are going to use the guiding question before we begin?” [Answer any questions]

“The guiding question is:
“How can objects and ideas be given life to express personal your experience?”

[Write or display this question on the overhead. Make sure to leave room to write the answers as the lesson proceeds.]

“What do you need to know to answer this question?”

[Elicit and shaped a possible definition about each of these with students Write these words with the question mark on the over head. Make sure to leave room to write the answers as the lesson proceeds.]

Personification?
Ideas?
Objects?
Personal Experience?

What other questions or subquestions are needed to help answer this question?

[Help students to shape these questions. Write these questions on the overhead. Make sure to leave room to write the answers as the lesson proceeds.]

What is personification?
Why would you want to personify something?
How do you get ideas for giving life to objects and ideas?
What are the steps to personification?
How can I remember how to personify something?

"These are great questions. As we go through the lesson, we are going to keep track of our answer to these questions. Let’s get started."

Show the Guiding Questions and Subquestions Overhead and help students to answer the questions.

Here is our guiding question:
How can objects and ideas be given life to express your personal experience?

What do you need to know to answer this question?
Elicited/Shaped with students:
Personification?
Ideas?
Objects?
Personal Experience?

What other questions or subquestions are needed to help answer this question?
What is personification?
Why would you want to personify something?
How do you get ideas for giving life to objects and ideas?
What are the steps to personification?
How can I remember how to personify something?
STOP #1: Show the Guiding Questions and Subquestions Overhead and help students to answer the questions.

Here is our guiding question:
How can objects and ideas be given life to express your personal experience?

What do you need to know to answer this question?
Elicited/Shaped with students:
Personification?
Ideas?
Objects?
Personal Experience?

What other questions or subquestions are needed to help answer this question?
What is personification?
Why would you want to personify something?
How do you get ideas for giving life to objects and ideas?
What are the steps to personification?
How can I remember how to personify something?

STOP #2: Show the guiding questions and subquestions overhead and help students to answer the questions.

Here is our guiding question:
How can objects and ideas be given life to express your personal experience?

What do you need to know to answer this question?
Elicited/Shaped with students:
Personification?
Ideas?
Objects?
Personal Experience?

What other questions or subquestions are needed to help answer this question?
What is personification?
Why would you want to personify something?
How do you get ideas for giving life to objects and ideas?
What are the steps to personification?
How can I remember how to personify something?

STOP #3: Show the guiding question and subquestions overhead and help students to answer the questions.
Here is our guiding question:
How can objects and ideas be given life to express your personal experience?

What do you need to know to answer this question?
Elicited/Shaped with students:
Personification?
Ideas?
Objects?
Personal Experience?

What other questions or subquestions are needed to help answer this question?
What is personification?
Why would you want to personify something?
How do you get ideas for giving life to objects and ideas?
What are the steps to personification?
How can I remember how to personify something?

STOP #4: Show the guiding question and subquestions overhead and help students to answer the questions.
Here is our guiding question:
How can objects and ideas be given life to express your personal experience?

What is the answer to this question? What can you do that will show me that you can give life to objects and ideas to express personal experience?

[Allow students to answer the guiding question and demonstrate performance.]
PERSONIFICATION
Curriculum Map Intervention

The lesson on “Personification” has an Introduction and four stopping points numbered (#1-#4). After the lesson Anticipatory Set has been provided, read the Introduction to students before starting on Lesson part 1. At the end of each lesson part, stop and use the Curriculum Map to conduct a review. Familiarize yourself with the map and be familiar with the questions in each section so that the review is as natural as possible. As the lesson progresses, answer questions that students may pose.

INTRODUCTION
“As I present this lesson, I am going to stop four times and show you a map of the information in this lesson and ask you questions that will help you learn about “personification. You can ask me questions at any time; you can also take notes on the paper that I have given to you. Here is our lesson map.

[Show Curriculum Map of Personification Lesson.]

I am writing the word personification here because that is our topic. We are going to learn to learn that personification is about “giving human qualities.” to something. I am going to write that in the oval underneath the lesson topic. I will fill the rest of the map in as we complete the lesson. Notice that the information is divided into three groups. A part of the lesson covers each group of information.

So, tell me: What is the lesson topic? [Elicit Answer.] What is lesson about? [Elicit Answer.]

Do you have any questions about how we are going to use lesson map before we begin?” [Answer any questions]

STOP #1 Show the curriculum map and ask students to answer the questions.

So, let’s return to our lesson map. What is the lesson topic? [Elicit Answer.] What is lesson about? [Elicit Answer.]

How do we give human qualities to something? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.] What sensory images do we create? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of objects? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of ideas? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]

STOP #2: Show the curriculum map and ask students to answer these questions.

So, let's return to our lesson map. What is the lesson topic? [Elicit Answer.]
What is lesson about? [Elicit Answer.]

How do we give human qualities to something? [Elicit Answer.]
What sensory images do we create? [Elicit/Clarify Answer.]
What are examples of objects? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of ideas? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]

How can we give objects and ideas human qualities (life)?
What personal experiences do we have to examine? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of feelings? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of moods? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of behaviors? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]

STOP #3: Show the curriculum map and ask students to answer these questions.
So, let's return to our lesson map. What is the lesson topic? [Elicit Answer.]
What is the lesson about? [Elicit Answer.]

How do we give human qualities to something? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What sensory images do we create? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of objects? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of ideas? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]

How can we give objects and ideas human qualities (life)?
What personal experiences do we have to examine [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of feelings? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of moods? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of behaviors? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]

How do we give life to objects and ideas to express personal experiences?
What is the “F” step? What's it about? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
Give an example of the “F” step. [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What is the “I” step? What’s it about? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
Give an example of the “I” step. [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What is the “T” step? What’s it about? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
Give an example of the “T” step. [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What is the “S” step? What’s it about? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
Give an example of the “S” step. [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]

STOP #4: Show the curriculum map and ask students to answer these questions.

So, let’s return to our lesson map. What is the lesson topic? [Elicit Answer.]
What is lesson about? [Elicit Answer.]

[Repeat the review as it was conducted in part 3.]
"So, look at the map and tell me in your own words how do you personify using the FITS strategy?" [Help students to correct an accurate summary using the curriculum map.]
Sensory Images

Personification

Giving Human Qualities

Personal Examination

FITS Strategy

Find the object or idea.

Identify the overall feeling, mood, or behavior.

Tie it to a human quality.

State the connection.

Objects

Ideas

Feelings

Behaviors

Moods

if our

based on

by using

our

of

for

to create

it is about
Appendix C
PRETEST – POSTTEST

Section I – Matching: In the blank provided, write the letter of the choice from Column #2 which best matches the item in Column #1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Column #1</th>
<th>Column #2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Sensory image</td>
<td>A. Gives human qualities to objects or ideas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Climax</td>
<td>B. Part of the background of a story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Characterization</td>
<td>C. Revelation of a character by what he/she does</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Plot</td>
<td>D. The eyes through which the story is being told</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Direct description</td>
<td>E. Information that adds to the building of tension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Action verb</td>
<td>F. Revealing what a character thinks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Personification</td>
<td>G. A poetic way of saying something</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Actions</td>
<td>H. Giving life to a person in a story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Complication</td>
<td>I. The ending part of a story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Resolution</td>
<td>J. A compact form of literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Setting</td>
<td>K. Words that reveal what characters are saying</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Figurative language</td>
<td>L. A method used to show character or create a scene</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Point of view</td>
<td>M. A mood or feeling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Dialogue</td>
<td>N. Appealing to sight, sound, smell, taste, or touch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Poetry</td>
<td>O. Type of word needed to personify something</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P. The highest point of suspense or conflict in a story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q. The chain of events in a story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>R. The exact meaning of a word</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Section II – Fill in the blank: Write a word in the blank that correctly completes each statement below.

1. The background part of a story introduces characters, setting and ________________.
2. Personification is a literary device that gives ________________ qualities to objects or ideas.
3. Phrases such as “I imagined” or “I realized” are a way to tell when a character is revealing her ________________.
4. The stages of plot structure can also be referred to as the ________________ of events in a story.
5. Personification is based on examining the author's mood, behavior, or ____________ toward an object or idea.
6. One method used to discover character is to examine what other characters ____________ about the character.
7. The point of highest suspense in a story is called the _________________.
8. Events, or characters that add to the conflict in a story are called _________________.
9. The part of the story that ties-up plot threads is called the _________________.
10. "The wind sang in the branches of the trees" is an example of _________________.
11. If we witness an example of cruelty by a character in a story, then we have learned about him by how he _________________.
12. Personification, although used in prose, is most often used in the literary form of _____________.
13. Direct ________________ is a method used by authors to picture a scene or character.
14. In the example, "The whistle screamed," the word that shows personification is _____________.
15. Characterization helps us ________________ the characters in a story.

Section III – Multiple Choice: In the blank, write the letter of the most appropriate choice.

____ 1. Which of the following is an example of personification?
   A) "Life is a short summer"
   B) "the waves beside them danced"
   C) "the road was a ribbon of moonlight"
   D) "His eyes were hollows of madness"

____ 2. "Hold it right there." A figure emerged from the shadows, waving a gun at the man. "Up against the car and spread the feet."
   The above passage best represents the plot element of
   A) background   B) personification   C) climax   D) resolution

____ 3. We learn about real people in our everyday lives in all of the following except
   A) by what they say   B) by what they think
   C) by what they do   D) by what others say about them

____ 4. Personification is about
   A) symbolizing ideas and objects   B) comparing unlike things
   C) giving human qualities   D) repeating words and sounds
5. "He is getting to be a Big-Britches," Carl said. "He's minding everybody's business but his own. Got his big nose into everything."

In the above passage, the character referred to as "Big-Britches" is revealed by
A) what he/she says  B) what he/she does
C) what he/she thinks  D) what others say about him/her


In the above passage, the object or idea that is being personified is the
A) sun  B) desert
C) nomad  D) sun and nomad

7. Which of the following is NOT an example of personification
A) "The fish-ponds shake their backs"
B) "the haughty day fills his blue urn with fire"
C) "the hills untied their bonnets"
D) "the dawn came up like thunder."

8. When I arrived in Kalamazoo, it was October and the war was still on. Gold and silver stars hung on pennants above silent windows of white and brick-red cottages.

The above passage best represents the plot stage of
A) background  B) problem  C) complication  D) resolution

9. But the tears were somehow for myself, for the terrible failing as a son, and not for my father. I was crying for a son too small to know or love my father. All the long ride, I thought of my tears, my treason.

In the passage above, the character identified as the "son" is revealed by
A) what he/she does  B) what the author says
C) what he/she thinks  D) what others say about him/her

10. A story begins with characters setting out in a boat on a sunny day when someone asks, "Are those storm clouds I see gathering in the distance?"

The question posed in the above situation, best represents the plot stage of
A) background  B) problem  C) complication  D) resolution
Begin by reading the following very short story:

1. Keith was determined to set a new record as he ran through the streets of Boston toward the finish line.
2. He had come a long way since his skiing accident on Casey Mountain two years before.
3. Months of therapy had taught him to walk again on legs now held together with steel pins.
4. Sometimes the pain had been almost too much to bear, but he fought through it all keeping in mind his goal of not only walking again, but winning the annual 26 mile marathon.
5. Now only one more hill stood between him and the victory he so badly craved.
6. Although his legs felt like lead weights, he pushed his way against the hill which seemed to be fighting his every step.
7. For the first time, he was conscious of the sound of running feet close behind him.
8. “I can’t lose now!” he thought. “It isn’t fair to get this far and not win.”
9. His feet suddenly seemed to be tied in knots; he struggled to regain his balance reaching out in front of him clawing at the air.
10. Gasping for breath, Keith awoke on the floor beside his bed in a tangled pile of blankets ... the race was over.

Answer questions #11 – 15 about the short story you have just read:

___ 11. The sentence that tells us most about the character of Keith by what he does is
   A) Sentence #1
   B) Sentence #2
   C) Sentence #6
   D) Sentence #8

___ 12. The sentence containing a good example of personification is
   A) Sentence #2
   B) Sentence #6
   C) Sentence #7
   D) Sentence #10

___ 13. The sentence that contains the climax of the story is
   A) Sentence #5
   B) Sentence #8
   C) Sentence #9
   D) Sentence #10

___ 14. The sentence that reveals the character of Keith by what he thinks is
   A) Sentence #1
   B) Sentence #4
   C) Sentence #6
   D) Sentence #8

___ 15. The background of the story is revealed in
   A) Sentences #1 – 2
   B) Sentences #2 – 4
   C) Sentences #1 – 4
   D) Sentences #5 - 7
Abstract

Previous research on students with learning disabilities has indicated that these students benefit most from explicit instruction. However, few studies have examined how explicit instruction can be translated to the logistical demands associated with large-group instruction in high-school general-education settings in ways that are socially acceptable to high-school teachers. This intervention study evaluated the effects of using two types of explicit instruction, curriculum maps and guiding questions, compared to the use of simple reviews of repeated information to teach core curriculum content in a group instruction format. Thirty high school students with learning disabilities participated in the study. A repeated measures research design was used to investigate the research questions associated with this study. For this design, the students were randomly assigned to six groups so that there were five students in each group. The students in each group participated in each of the interventions in differing sequences across the three lessons. A 45-item test, representing information from each of the three lessons, was administered as a pretest and posttest. The results of the comparison of student test scores associated with the three interventions indicated that the use of the curriculum map enhanced learning for students with learning disabilities more than the use of guiding questions, and the use of guiding questions enhanced learning for students with learning disabilities more than simple reviews of repeated information. Based on this study, core curriculum general education teachers may be able to begin making their instruction more explicit and powerful by incorporating simple routines comprised the use of curriculum maps to depict the importance and structure of the content and then using these maps to lead and review learning through guided and interactive questioning.
The way curriculum is currently delivered in core curriculum classrooms is an obstacle to developing an inclusive learning environment in the high school setting. Rather than ensuring student understanding, too often the major goal is to “cover” the content. The Webster’s II New College Dictionary defines “cover” as “to place something on or over, so as to protect or conceal.” Wiggins and McTighe (1998) described this approach as “teaching by mentioning it,” or covering topics and ideas by drawing attention to them without developing them with students. Three planning dilemmas must be faced for a teacher to move away from a coverage approach and toward a model that ensures student understanding for students with disabilities. First, the educator must sort through the information and select the chunks of information that are most critical to student learning. To this end, Wiggins and McTighe have argued for an approach to curriculum planning called “backward design,” whereby curriculum and instruction is based on sorting information into three levels: “enduring understanding,” “important to know and do,” and “worth being familiar with” (Wiggins & McTighe, 1998, pp. 9-10). Other educators over the last three decades have made similar suggestions (e.g., Beane, 1995; Blythe & Associates, 1998; Bruner, 1960, 1973; Caine & Caine, 1997; Perkins, 1992). Sorting the information to denote importance is critical for many students with disabilities who may not have the same background information as their peers or who have trouble distinguishing important from less important information from teacher presentations (Lenz, Alley, & Schumaker, 1987).

The second planning dilemma that must be faced by teachers is providing instruction about critical information in ways that ensures student understanding. As mentioned above, previous research on students with learning disabilities has indicated that these students benefit most from explicit instruction (e.g. Carnine, Jones, & Dixon, 1995; Gersten, 1998; Hollingsworth & Woodward, 1993). Gersten (1998) proposed that explicit instruction is based on the use of (a) examples to demonstrate a concept or process, (b) models of proficient performance and step-by-step strategies, (c) advance organizers and guiding questions to focus attention and prompt critical thinking, (d) opportunities for student to share decision-making processes, (e) authentic, interactive, and adequate practice, and (f) frequent feedback and support for performance. However, few studies have examined how explicit instruction can be translated to address the logistical demands of group instruction frequently encountered in high school general education settings.

The third planning dilemma centers on how to find the time to identify the content, plan activities that result in explicit instruction, and then to incorporate these activities into the instructional time available during the class period. Secondary teachers have reported that many of the activities that might make content accessible to students with disabilities are simply not feasible for them to implement (Schumm & Vaughn, 1995). In addition, most of the planning time made available to teachers in not quality planning time (Joint Committee on
Teacher Planning for Students with Disabilities, 1995) and is spent administering the more functional aspects of getting through the day.

Some research on complex teaching routines has been completed that demonstrates that explicit instruction can be moved successfully into general education core classes to improve the performance of students with disabilities. These routines are comprised of combinations of devices and instructional procedures linked together to help a teacher move through common instructional challenges (e.g., teaching concepts, leading students through a unit). Several research studies have shown that when these complex routines are used on a consistent basis by a classroom teacher, the unit test scores of all students in the class improve significantly, usually by about 10 to 15 percentage points (e.g., Bulgren, Deshler, & Schumaker, 1997; Bulgren, Schumaker, Deshler, & Lenz, 2000; Bulgren, Schumaker, & Deshler, 1988; Bulgren, Schumaker, Deshler, & Lenz, in prep.; Lenz, Alley, & Schumaker, 1987; Lenz, Bulgren, Schumaker, Deshler, & Boudah, 1994).

While these routines have been found to be effective, secondary teachers have reported that these routines are too complex and time consuming for easy integration into ongoing instruction. As a result, some teachers have reported abandoning the routines before they master their use enough to become effective with students with disabilities. In addition, informal reports from teachers involved in inservice activities focused on these complex routines have indicated that simpler “starter” routines are needed that are not as complex, but can be more easily woven into daily practice and serve as a foundation and springboard for other more explicit teaching activities leading up to the use of more complex routines.

As a result of these suggestions, two complex teaching routines, the Unit Organizer Routine and the Question Exploration Routine, that had already been developed and field tested and were consistent with the criteria for explicit instruction presented by Gersten (1998), were selected and analyzed to determine how “starter” routines could be created. The Unit Organizer Routine (Lenz, Bulgren, Schumaker, Deshler, & Boudah, 1994) is based on a graphic representation of an advance organizer designed to help students achieve the learning outcomes for a unit. An advance organizer is information presented “in advance or and at a higher level of generality, inclusiveness, and abstraction than the learning task itself” (Ausubel & Robinson, 1969, p. 606). In addition, graphic representation of the organizer has been found to be an effective way to present the advance organizer to students with disabilities [Anderson Inman, Knox-Quinn, & Horney, 1996; Bui, Schumaker, & Deshler, 2002; Scanlon, Deshler, & Schumaker, 1996; for a recent review, see National Institute of Child Health and Human Development (2000)]. The unit organizer device allows a teacher and students to collaboratively explore and identify on the first day of the unit: (a) how the unit fits with other units, (b) a curriculum map that focused attention on the critical ideas and the structure of
information in the unit, (c) relationships and types of thinking required in the unit, (d) self-test questions, (e) a schedule of assignments and activities, and (d) the beginning of an expanded map so that new information can be added as it is presented each day of the unit. Lenz et al. (1994) reported that when teachers used the Unit Organizer for unit instruction, performance of students with disabilities on classroom unit tests increased by an average of 15% points. Lenz et al. used a multiple-baseline across-classes/students design with two classes/students in each design and replicated the design two times. Therefore, the performance of six students with learning disabilities was evaluated across six secondary classes (three middle school and three high school).

The Question Exploration Routine (Bulgren, Lenz, Deshler, & Schumaker, 2001) is based on teacher presentation and use of a guiding question in a course, unit, or lesson. Gersten (1998) proposed the use of guiding questions as a form of explicit instruction and linked their use to organizers as a way of helping students with disabilities focus attention and prompt critical thinking. Guiding questions are overarching questions that are posed at the beginning of a presentation. These questions lead students to think about the critical information in the content and to prompt thinking about relationships. After a major question has been presented, background information and subquestions related to the major question are surfaced and then are revisited and discussed throughout the presentation. Specifically, the Question Exploration Routine involves the teacher posing a guiding critical question to students. Next, the teacher and students collaboratively (a) identify what information is needed to answer the question, (b) generate and answer subquestions that can lead to the answer, (c) generate a main idea or kernel answer to the critical question, (d) identify how the answer relates to other course information, and (e) extend the answer to the world or more complex situations. Bulgren, Lenz, Schumaker, & Deshler (2002) reported that students in experimental classes where guiding questions were used earned a mean score of 70% on a test taken after the first experimental lesson and a mean score of 72% on a test taken after the second experimental lesson. Students in the comparison classes earned average test scores of 48% after the first comparison lesson and 46% after the second comparison lesson. The comparison lessons were comprised of a presentation that did not include the guiding question. Students with learning disabilities in experimental classes earned a mean test score of 63% while students with learning disabilities in the comparison classes earned a mean score of 34%.

Based on a review of the Unit Organizer Routine and the Question Exploration Routine, two “starter” routines were selected for this study. From the Unit Organizer Routine, the curriculum map showing the critical idea and structure of a lesson was selected for the starter routine. From the Question Exploration Routine, the guiding critical question and the two steps
that probed information needed to answer the question and the step that elicited and answered subquestions were selected as the components of the starter routine.

Research question. The research question for this study was: Are the effects of a starter routine based on the Unit Organizer Routine or based on the Question Exploration Routine significantly better than the effects of traditional periodic reviews of repeated information?

Methods

Setting

The study took place in classrooms typically used for language arts instruction in two high schools (serving approximately 925 and 900 students respectively) in the Puget Sound area of the state of Washington. All of the classrooms had desks, chairs, and an overhead projector and screen.

Participants

Thirty students who qualified for services for students with learning disabilities during the 2001-2002 school year and who were enrolled in general education high school language arts courses during the 2001-2002 school year were randomly selected from the two high schools. School records were reviewed to determine that the general education classroom placement was the least restrictive and most appropriate placement to receive language arts content for each student.

There were 20 males and 10 females. The average age of the students was 15.87 years (sd = .81 yr.). There were twenty 9th graders, seven 10th graders, two 11th graders, and one 12th grader. Seventeen of the students were white, eight were black, three were Hispanic, and two were Asian. The average IQ score as measured on the most recently administered Wechsler Intelligence Scale was 93.8 (sd = 6.1). Fourteen of the students were receiving the majority of their education in special education classes, and six of the students were mainstreamed into general education classes for all classes except for one resource-room special-education support class.

The Content Lessons

Three parallel language arts lessons were designed. The lessons covered the topics of "personification," "characterization," and "plot." Content to be covered in the lessons was content that had not been previously presented as a single lesson in any setting in the same or previous school year as reported by the head of the language arts department in each school. The amount of content in the lessons was controlled, with matching numbers and difficulty of informational items in each. Six language arts teachers validated the parallel nature of the lessons and the direct relationship of each lesson to state standards. (See Appendix A for a sample lesson.)
Effects of Curriculum Maps and Guiding Questions

The review intervention. The review intervention served as the control intervention for the study. It was chosen as the control intervention because review is typically recommended as a method that is appropriate to use to help students organize thinking about information before moving on to new information (Shostak, 1999). In this study, the review consisted of three phases. First, the instructor specified the objective and topics of the lesson orally. Second, three times during the lesson, the instructor stopped and reviewed the information that had been presented to the students by repeating important information. Third, at the end of the lesson, the instructor again repeated key information that had been presented in the lesson. No visual graphic organizers, visual representations of the information, or guiding questions were provided. The information was not visually displayed in any way as it was reviewed. (See Appendix B for the protocol for the review intervention.)

Guiding question intervention. The guiding question intervention also consisted of three phases. First, a guiding question covering the critical outcome of the lesson was posed to the students and was written on an overhead transparency. The students were then asked to list what "must be known" to answer the guiding question and what "other questions" or supporting questions must be answered before the guiding question could be answered. The instructor wrote the elicited list of information and set of questions on an overhead transparency so that students could see them. Second, three times during the lesson, the instructor stopped, displayed the guiding question, the listed information, and other questions, and asked students questions to determine whether the "must be known" information had been acquired and whether the students knew the answers to the "other questions." Third, at the end of the lesson, an answer to the guiding question was constructed with the students, and the instructor asked the students questions to review the "must be known" information and the answers to the "other questions." (See Appendix B for the protocol for the guiding question intervention.)

Curriculum map intervention. The curriculum map intervention also consisted of three phases. First, a curriculum map depicting the structure of the content of the lesson was shown and described to the students by the instructor. The students were asked to summarize the structure. Second, three times during the lesson, the instructor displayed the map, elicited a summary of critical points from the students based on the structure, and clarified misunderstandings. A question was asked about each element of the curriculum map to elicit information from the students. Key words were added to the map to record accurate summary statements elicited by the questions. Third, at the end of the lesson, a full review of the critical points of the lesson was conducted with the students using the curriculum map; the students were then asked to summarize the lesson independently using the map. (See Appendix B for the protocol for the curriculum map intervention.)
Effects of Curriculum Maps and Guiding Questions

Materials

Three scripts were constructed for the instructor to use, one for each content lesson. Each script contained all the information to be presented in the lesson in the order in which it was to be presented and had a cue inserted as to where the instructor was to use one of the interventions. Parallel and coordinated curriculum maps and guiding questions were constructed for each lesson to be used as needed in the experimental design. They met the criteria for good organizers and good questions presented by Lenz, Bulgren, Schumaker, Deshler, and Boudah (1993). The review intervention required that an objective, topics, and key points be identified for each lesson. The objective was constructed to be parallel to the guiding question, and the repeated topics and key points were constructed to be parallel to the key topics and points depicted in the curriculum map. The protocols illustrating the three interventions in one of the lessons are provided in Appendix B as an example.

Measures

Parallel tests were constructed for the three lessons, and the three tests were combined to be used as a pretest to be taken before students were introduced to any lesson and then as a posttest after all three lessons had been presented. The test was comprised of 45 items. 15 of these items were matching items, 15 of these items were fill-in-the-blank items, and 15 of these items were multiple-choice items. Five items of each type related to each of the three lessons. An answer key was designed for the test. Scorers used the answer key to award one point for each correct answer on the test. Interscorer reliability was determined by having two independent scorers score 100% of the pretests and posttests and by matching their scores item-by-item. The percentage of agreement was calculated by dividing the number of agreements by the number of agreements plus disagreements and multiplying by 100. The total percentage of agreement was 100% (1350 agreements out of 1350 opportunities to agree.)

The lessons and the test were field tested before the study began with a group of 15 students with learning disabilities who did not participate in the study to evaluate and adjust lesson and test-item difficulty. An item analysis of test items indicated at least a .5 standard deviation dispersion across all test items indicating that the test items were acceptable. The test used for both the pretest and the posttest is provided in Appendix D.

Procedures

Instruction took place during a 90-minute time block when students were scheduled to attend class in the resource room. A 10th-grade language arts substitute teacher certified to teach language arts in the state of Washington was trained to deliver all three interventions and was asked to use the standardized scripts that were specifically controlled to ensure that students in all groups received the same information for each lesson. The same amount of time, 90 minutes, was spent delivering the information in each lesson to all groups. The lessons were timed; all
lessons began and ended within two minutes of each other. The study was conducted over a three-week period to accommodate the scheduling of the student groups, and in each week the pretest was given on Monday, the intervention lessons were presented on Tuesday, Wednesday, and Thursday, and the posttest was presented on Friday.

**Design**

The design of this study had each student participate in each of the three intervention conditions: (1) review, (2) guiding question, and (3) curriculum map. To adjust for possible order effects of presentation, six possible combinations of orders were used (123, 132, 231, 213, 312, 321). For example, if a participant was randomly assigned to the 321-combination group, she would receive the curriculum map condition for the first lesson, the guiding question condition for the second lesson, and the review condition for the third lesson. In contrast, a participant in the 231 group would receive the guiding question condition for the first lesson, the curriculum map condition for the second lesson, and the review condition for the third lesson. The 30 participating students were randomly assigned to six groups so that there were five students in each group. The students in each group participated in each of the interventions in differing sequences across the three lessons.

After students were assigned to each experimental sequence, they were given a pretest about information covered in all three lessons and then participated in all three lessons in the sequence. After the sequence of three lessons had been completed, all students were given a posttest covering the information presented across all three lessons. The overall design of this study is shown in Table 1.

The data for this study were analyzed using the SPSS repeated measures analysis of variance program with a Tukey post-hoc test to identify the differences between the groups. Also, the data were analyzed to ensure that there were no order (sequence) effects.

**Results**

No significant differences were found among the segments of the pretests measuring the content of each lesson (mean number correct for Lesson 1 = 1.13 (sd = 1.11), Lesson 2 = 1.30 (sd = 1.15), Lesson 3 = 1.37 (1.67). Also, there were no order effects. There was a statistically significant difference (t=15.6, df=29, p<.001) between the average combined pretest score per student (M = 3.80, sd = 2.52) versus the average combined posttest score per student (M = 17.77, sd = 5.85)

Based on an analysis of variance with repeated measures, there was a statistically significant difference between the three intervention conditions (F = 91.73, p < .001). The mean posttest score for the curriculum map intervention was 8.07 (sd = 2.33). The mean posttest score for the guiding question intervention was 6.43 (2.54). The mean posttest score for the review intervention was 3.27 (sd = 1.80).
A post-hoc analysis showed that each of the differences between the three groups was significant at the .001 level. The students earned significantly higher scores when they participated in the curriculum map intervention than they did when they participated in the guiding questions intervention. They also earned significantly higher scores when they participated in the guiding questions intervention than they did when they participated in the review intervention.

Discussion

The results of these comparisons indicate that the use of the curriculum map enhanced learning for students with learning disabilities more than the use of guiding questions. However, the use of guiding questions enhanced learning for students with learning disabilities more than the review.

There are several conclusions that can be drawn from these results. First, the visual formatting of information as a planning and presentation tool appears to enhance learning for students with learning disabilities. Educators who advocate that general education teachers should become more inclusive in content area classes by providing instruction that is more explicit, organized, and accommodating should seriously consider the interactive use of the curriculum map as a planning and presentation tool.

Second, while the guiding question intervention did not produce effects as strong as the curriculum map intervention, the use of a guiding question was more effective than the review intervention. The review intervention was based on routine repetition of the key topic captured in the guiding question and information depicted in the curriculum map. Therefore, oral reviews of information that are based on simply repeating information that is identified by the teacher as important do not seem to be as useful as other techniques that visually depict the information and guide students in how to process the information. This may be because repeating information is a strategy that students already use for studying and does not necessarily help them understand the information. That is, the use of the curriculum map and the guiding question may compensate for the lack of organizing and questioning strategies that are needed in processing complex content-area information. Simply identifying and presenting information in terms of importance and expecting students to know how to process this information (i.e., use organizing and questioning strategies) is not likely to be an effective instructional procedure. Another explanation might be that using one modality (the auditory modality) is a weak instructional procedure for students with learning disabilities who may have significant language-processing difficulties.

Third, all three interventions were constructed around what was identified as important information. The first step in constructing each of the three interventions was to determine the relative importance of the information and the structure of the information that was important for students to understand. In the curriculum map intervention, the important information was
Effects of Curriculum Maps and Guiding Questions

represented in a hierarchical map structure. In the guiding question intervention, the important information was represented by visually showing students the relationship between the guiding question and the hierarchical relationship of the supporting questions. In the review intervention, the teacher orally reviewed by repeating information that had been targeted as more important throughout the lesson. The findings of this study indicate that teacher time spent in selecting the critical information, showing students how that information can be structured, and visually tracking the question-answer process around the critical information can improve the performance of students with learning disabilities in content targeted for general education classrooms in high school settings.

Several concerns are worthy of note. First, although each intervention produced learning, the actual posttest scores earned by the students were not impressive. After the curriculum map intervention, which produced the highest scores, students were earning scores that would be considered "Fs" in school. Thus, these simple interventions do not seem to be powerful enough to boost students with learning disabilities into the passing range. The more complex teaching routines reviewed at the beginning of this article have produced results showing that students with learning disabilities can be boosted into the passing range. While these starter routines may be a way to introduce explicit instruction into core curriculum classes, the more complex routines and devices may well be worth the time and energy required to use them.

Second, whether or not teachers will find the simpler interventions used in this study acceptable is not clear. How easily they might incorporate these techniques into their planning and teaching processes is unknown. While the starter routines were found to increase the learning for students with learning disabilities, studies to determine the palatability of the starter routines compared to more complex routines should be conducted.

Third, also unknown are the effects of these interventions on the performance of other students without disabilities enrolled in a general education course. If students are not accepting of the procedures, and if they do not receive much benefit from the use of them, teachers might reject the procedures (Lenz, Schumaker, Deshler, & Kissam, 1991). Further research will need to be conducted in these areas.

To conclude, the purpose of this study was to examine the effects of curriculum maps, guiding questions, and reviews on the test performance of students with learning disabilities in order to support the use of starter routines that could lead to the use of more explicit instruction by general education teachers. Based on this study, content-area general education teachers can make their instruction more explicit and powerful by using curriculum maps to depict the importance and structure of the content and then by using these maps to lead and review learning through interactive questioning around these maps. The use of guiding questions will also contribute to learning by these students, but not with the same power as the curriculum map if
Effects of Curriculum Maps and Guiding Questions

used alone. These methods are definitely more powerful than simple reviews that assume that students have the strategies required to organize the information and process it. Planning and teaching routines that teachers can use to select and deliver content but simultaneously work to compensate for students' lack of strategies should be a guiding principle in attempts to make general education courses more accessible to more students. Starter routines that are based on simple components of more complex routines may be an effective way to introduce more explicit instruction and might increase the likelihood that more explicit instruction can be maintained in high school core curriculum classes.
References


Table 1

*The sequence of interventions experienced by the subjects in each group*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lessons</th>
<th>Student Groups</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Group 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pretest</td>
<td>Pretest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Curriculum Map</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Guiding Question</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Posttest</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**List of Appendices**

Appendix A: Sample Lesson Script for lesson on "Personification" ................................................. 15

Appendix B: Intervention Materials ........................................................................................................ 26

 Protocol and Curriculum Map for lesson on "Personification"
 Protocol for Guiding Question Intervention for lesson on "Personification"
 Reviewed Information Protocol for lesson on "Personification"

Appendix C: Pretest/Posttest ................................................................................................................. 38
Appendix A

PERSONIFICATION
Lesson Script

Objectives:

Level 1: Students will be able to understand the concept of personification.
Level 2: Students will be able to identify examples of personification and explain their meaning.
Level 3: Students will be able to create sensory images using personification.

Materials:

Transparency A: Literal paraphrase and excerpt from “Silver”
Transparency & Handout #1: Definition of Personification, excerpt from “Varick Street” and Discussion Questions
Handout #2: Independent Activity – Using Personification

LESSON SCRIPT

Anticipatory Set: (5 minutes)
The purpose of this lesson is teach you how to use a writing trick called “personification” that will help you make your writing more interesting to others and may help you improve your grades on things you write.

We are going to learn what personification is and how to use a personification strategy called FITS in your writing. You should take notes as we identify the key ideas in knowing and using personification.”

INTRODUCTION to the Intervention. [Introduce LO or GQ or RI Intervention here using the Intervention Protocol for each lesson.

Lesson Part 1: (10 minutes)

Let’s first define the term ‘personification’. Personification is a literary device that gives human qualities to an object or idea. We give human qualities to things so that when someone is reading what we write the reader gets a sensory image. A sensory image is
something that appeals to one or more of the five senses. We get a sensory image by either seeing in our minds or feeling something inside of us. We can make our writing more interesting by creating sensory images around objects and ideas.

Sensory images are based on human qualities or traits. So, a human trait or action is used to personify an object or idea. An object is something that we can see and feel. An object might be things such as a “shoe,” a “truck,” a “factory,” a “building,” or “pipes.” It could be a plant such as a “tree.” It could be an animal such as a “bird.” Yes, even if it is living but not human, we are calling them objects.

We can also personify ideas. Word that show ideas would include terms such as “fear,” “freedom,” or “peace.”

STOP #1 [Insert LO, GQ, or RI Intervention STOP #1 here.]

Lesson Part 2: (10 minutes)

“When we write, we often start by describing or referring to objects and ideas in simple ways. For example, we might start by writing things like “The wind blew through the trees,” “The fire engines came quickly down the street,” or “Everyone was happy when the prisoner was released to his family.” [Show or write these on the white board.]

“We can make our writing more interesting by personifying. That is, if we think about our own personal experiences and use our feelings, moods, and behaviors and relate them to the object and ideas we are writing about, we can trick the reader into seeing inside us, understand and share our point of view. This makes our writing more interesting to others.

[Using Transparency A, read aloud and compare the literal statement, “The moon moves slowly across the night sky.” to the lines from the poem “Silver” by Walter de la Mare.]

“What does the use of personification add to the poetic version?”

We commonly use personification in everyday speech. For example we could edit these sentences to say, “The wind whistled through the trees,” “The fire engines came screaming down the street,” or “Freedom finally smiled as the prisoner was released to his family.” [Edit sentences on the white board.]
So, giving human qualities to an object or idea is based on personally examining our feelings, moods, and behaviors to see if there is a match with the objects and ideas in our writing. If there is, we can use these matches to edit our writing to make it more interesting.

STOP #2 [Insert LO, GQ, or RI Intervention STOP #2 here.]

Lesson Part 3: Guided Practice: (15 minutes)

"Let's take a look at how one author used personification to make his writing more interesting by giving objects human qualities that you can relate to."

[Distribute Handout #1. Using Transparency and Handout #1, read the excerpt from "Varick Street" aloud, then, ask the following questions.]

Discussion Questions and Sample Responses:

1. What object or idea in the poem was given human characteristics? (The factory [buildings, pipes, smokestack*]) *may be inferred by some students

2/ What are the human qualities that were given to the object or idea? (It struggles awake, it feels uneasy, it has veins, it attempts work, it tries to breathe, it has long hairy nostrils and it stinks.)

3. What mood or feeling is suggested by giving it human qualities? (A feeling of being tired and miserable)

4. In what ways does the object or idea act like a human being? (The factory at night seems to act like a tired, disgusting, overworked laborer)
Lesson Part 4 (15 minutes)

“Now that we know what personification is, let’s learn a strategy that can help us remember how to use this writing trick more easily. We call this the FITS strategy because the first letter of each step spells the word FITS. We can remember that FITS will help us use the personification trick because personification “fits” objects and ideas with human qualities just like a hat “fits” your head. It goes around it, right? Okay, let’s learn the FITS strategy.

The FITS strategy can be used to personify an object or idea. There are four steps in the FITS Personification Strategy

Step 1: Find the object or idea. First, we look for words that are objects or ideas that are key to the ideas in your writing. So if you wrote, “The police car turned the corner and headed slowly towards her house.” In this case the key word is “police car.”

Step 2. Identify an overall mood, feeling or behavior Next, we try to identify a feeling, mood, or behavior that we have had related to this object and what we want to say about it. Overall, the feeling that I have is that the police car is trying to be “sly” and “secretive” as it moves in on a house.

Step 3. Tie the object or idea to a human quality (or experience). The human quality that I might relate to the police car would be “sneaky” like an animal moving in or creeping up on it’s prey.

Step 4. State the connection. Okay, if I write the connection, my sentence now might look like this: The police car crept slowly around the corner and moved stealthily toward her house.

STOP #3 [Insert LO, GQ, or RI Intervention STOP #3 here.]

Let’s do another one. Let’s create an example of personification by using this idea: “I used to climb up in a tree when I was afraid.”

1. Find the object or idea.
   A tree.
   The tree is a big, old, maple tree that sits in my grandmother’s back yard.
It has wide branches that are low to the ground so that I can climb it easily.
It is covered with thick green leaves during the summer.

2. **Identify an overall mood, feeling or behavior.**
The tree is strong and offers protection.
It gives me a feeling of being safe and protected.

3. **Tie the object or idea to a human quality (or experience)**
The branches of the tree are like “arms” that can “embrace” me and keep me safe.

4. **State the connection** Use a verb to state the way that the tree acts like a human being.
   *The old maple tree held me securely in its arms.*

**Lesson part 5: Independent Practice:** (15 minutes)
Distribute Handout #2:
Students should complete the Independent Activity.
Collect and correct with students using the Correction Rubric provided.

**STOP #4 [Final review: Insert LO, GQ, or RI Intervention STOP #4 here.]**
Compare the following:

The moon moves slowly across the night sky

Slowly, silently, now the moon

Walks the night in her silver shoon [shoes]

From "Silver" by Walter de la Mare
The Personification Strategy

This strategy can be used to create examples of personification.

The four steps of the Personification Strategy are the following:

1. **Find the object or idea.**

2. **Identify the overall mood, feeling or behavior.**

3. **Tie the object or idea to a human quality (or experience)**

4. **State the connection**
Let us create an example of personification by using a tree.

1. **Find the object or idea.**
   A tree
   The tree is a big, old, maple tree that sits in my grandmother's back yard.
   It has wide branches that are low to the ground so that I can climb it easily.
   It is covered with thick green leaves during the summer.

2. **Identify the overall mood, feeling or behavior.**
   The tree is strong and offers protection.
   It gives me a feeling of being safe and protected.

3. **Tie the object or idea to a human quality (or experience)**
   The branches of the tree are like "arms" that can "embrace" me and keep me safe.

4. **State the connection** Use a verb to state the way that the tree acts like a human being.
   The old maple tree held me securely in its arms.
Definition: Personification is a literary device that gives human qualities to an object, or idea.

At night the factories
struggle awake,
wretched uneasy buildings
veined with pipes
attempt their work
trying to breathe,
the elongated nostrils
haired with spikes
give off such stenches, too.

From "Varick Street" by Elizabeth Bishop
1. What object or idea in the poem is given human characteristics?

2. What are the human qualities that were given to the object or idea?

3. What mood or feeling is suggested by giving it human qualities?

4. In what ways does the object or idea act like a human being?
Independent Activity:
On the lines below, write an example of personification for one of the objects or ideas listed:

shoe: 
truck: 
fear: 

Correction Rubric: (8 pts.)
A human trait or action is used to personify the object or idea (2 pts.)
The use of personification gives a mood or feeling (2 pts.)
The human quality used is related to the object or idea being personified (2 pts.)
The example of personification is expressed in a complete sentence (2 pts.)
Appendix B

INTERVENTION MATERIALS

Reviewed Information Protocol for lesson on "Personification"
Protocol for Guiding Question Intervention for lesson on "Personification"
Protocol and Curriculum Map for lesson on "Personification"
The lesson on “Personification” has an Introduction and four stopping points numbered (#1-#4). After the lesson Anticipatory Set has been provided, read the Introduction to students before starting on Lesson part 1. At the end of each lesson part, stop and repeat the points that have just been presented by reading the points listed below for each section. Try to memorize the points so that the review is as natural as possible, Do not ask students any questions, but answer any questions that students may pose.

Introduction

“As I present this lesson, I am going to stop four times and repeat critical information that will help you learn about “personification.” I will repeat information that I think will help you learn the information. You can ask me questions at any time; you can also take notes on the paper that I have given to you.

By the end of this lesson:
You will understand how “personification” can be used to give objects and idea life to express your personal experience.

Do you have any questions before we begin?” [Answer any questions]

STOP #1: Repeat these points:

Personification is a literary device that gives human qualities to an object or idea.

We give human qualities to objects or ideas so that when someone is reading the reader gets a sensory image.

A sensory image is something that appeals to one or more of the five senses. We get a sensory image by either seeing it in our minds or feeling something inside of us.

So, a human trait or action is used to personify an object or idea.
STOP #2: Repeat these points:

“When we write, we often start by describing or referring to objects and ideas in simple ways.

“We can make our writing more interesting by personifying. That is, if we think about our own personal experiences and use our feelings, moods, and behaviors and relate them to the object and ideas we are writing about, we can trick the reader into seeing inside us, understanding, and sharing our point of view. This makes our writing more interesting to others.

We edited these sentences to personify objects [point to the underlined word in each sentence as you read the sentence] to say, “The wind whistled through the trees,” “The fire engines came screaming down the street,” or “Freedom finally smiled as the prisoner was released to his family.”

So, giving human qualities to an object or idea is based on personally examining our feelings, moods, and behaviors to see if there is a match with the objects and ideas in our writing. If there is, we can use these matches to edit our writing to make it more interesting.

STOP #3: Repeat these points:

“The FITS strategy helps us remember how to use the trick of personification in our writing.

“We call this the FITS strategy because the first letter of each step spells the word FITS.”

“The FITS strategy can be used to personify an object or idea. There are four steps in the FITS Personification Strategy.”

“Step 1: Find the object or idea. First, we look for words that are objects or ideas that are key to the ideas in your writing. For example, police car.

“Step 2. Identify an overall mood, feeling or behavior Next, we try to identify a feeling, mood, or behavior that we have had related to this object and what we want to say about it. For example, I might have a feeling of it being sly or secretive.

“Step 3. Tie the object or idea to a human quality (or experience) The human quality that I might relate to the police car would be “sneaky” like an animal moving in or creeping up on it’s prey.”
“Step 4. State the connection. Now, I write the connection: The police car crept slowly around the corner and moved stealthily toward her house.”

Here’s another example:

1. Find the object or idea.
   A tree.

2. Identify an overall mood, feeling or behavior.
   The tree is strong and offers protection.
   It gives me a feeling of being safe and protected.

3. Tie the object or idea to a human quality (or experience)
   The branches of the tree are like “arms” that can “embrace” me and keep me safe.

4. State the connection I write it out and to do this I use a verb to state the way that the tree acts like a human being.
   The old maple tree held me securely in its arms.

STOP #4 Let's review everything we have learned about Personification

Repeat the key points listed in #1-#3 for all lesson parts.
PERSONIFICATION
Guiding Question Intervention

The lesson on "Personification" has an Introduction and four stopping points numbered (#1-#4). After the lesson Anticipatory Set has been provided, read the Introduction to students before starting on Lesson part 1. At the end of each lesson part, stop and use the Curriculum Map to conduct a review. Familiarize yourself with the map and be familiar with the questions in each section so that the review is as natural as possible. As the lesson progresses, answer questions that students may pose.

INTRODUCTION

"As I present this lesson, I am going to start by asking you a question about "personification" that will guide our learning in lesson. We will start by talking about what the question is asking us. During the lesson, we will stop four times to see how well we can answer the question about "personification." You can ask me questions at any time; you can also take notes on the paper that I have given to you.

Do you have any questions about how we are going to use the guiding question before we begin?" [Answer any questions]

"The guiding question is:
"How can objects and ideas be given life to express personal your experience?"

[Write or display this question on the overhead. Make sure to leave room to write the answers as the lesson proceeds.]

"What do you need to know to answer this question?"

[Elicit and shaped a possible definition about each of these with students Write these words with the question mark on the over head. Make sure to leave room to write the answers as the lesson proceeds.]

Personification?
Ideas?
Effects of Curriculum Maps and Guiding Questions

Objects?
Personal Experience?

What other questions or subquestions are needed to help answer this question?

[Help students to shape these questions. Write these questions on the overhead. Make sure to leave room to write the answers as the lesson proceeds.]

What is personification?
Why would you want to personify something?
How do you get ideas for giving life to objects and ideas?
What are the steps to personification?
How can I remember how to personify something?

“These are great questions. As we go through the lesson, we are going to keep track of our answer to these questions. Let’s get started.”

Show the Guiding Questions and Subquestions Overhead and help students to answer the questions.

Here is our guiding question:
How can objects and ideas be given life to express your personal experience?

What do you need to know to answer this question?
Elicited/Shaped with students:
Personification?
Ideas?
Objects?
Personal Experience?

What other questions or subquestions are needed to help answer this question?

What is personification?
Why would you want to personify something?
How do you get ideas for giving life to objects and ideas?
What are the steps to personification?
How can I remember how to personify something?
**STOP #1:** Show the Guiding Questions and Subquestions Overhead and help students to answer the questions.

Here is our guiding question:
How can objects and ideas be given life to express your personal experience?

What do you need to know to answer this question?
Elicited/Shaped with students:
Personification?
Ideas?
Objects?
Personal Experience?

What other questions or subquestions are needed to help answer this question?
What is personification?
Why would you want to personify something?
How do you get ideas for giving life to objects and ideas?
What are the steps to personification?
How can I remember how to personify something?

**STOP #2:** Show the guiding questions and subquestions overhead and help students to answer the questions.

Here is our guiding question:
How can objects and ideas be given life to express your personal experience?

What do you need to know to answer this question?
Elicited/Shaped with students:
Personification?
Ideas?
Objects?
Personal Experience?

What other questions or subquestions are needed to help answer this question?
What is personification?
Why would you want to personify something?
How do you get ideas for giving life to objects and ideas?
What are the steps to personification?
How can I remember how to personify something?

STOP #3: Show the guiding question and subquestions overhead and help students to answer the questions.
Here is our guiding question:
How can objects and ideas be given life to express your personal experience?

What do you need to know to answer this question?
Elicited/Shaped with students:
Personification?
Ideas?
Objects?
Personal Experience?

What other questions or subquestions are needed to help answer this question?
What is personification?
Why would you want to personify something?
How do you get ideas for giving life to objects and ideas?
What are the steps to personification?
How can I remember how to personify something?

STOP #4: Show the guiding question and subquestions overhead and help students to answer the questions.
Here is our guiding question:
How can objects and ideas be given life to express your personal experience?

What is the answer to this question? What can you do that will show me that you can give life to objects and ideas to express personal experience?

[Allow students to answer the guiding question and demonstrate performance.]
PERSONIFICATION
Curriculum Map Intervention

The lesson on “Personification” has an Introduction and four stopping points numbered (#1-#4). After the lesson Anticipatory Set has been provided, read the Introduction to students before starting on Lesson part 1. At the end of each lesson part, stop and use the Curriculum Map to conduct a review. Familiarize yourself with the map and be familiar with the questions in each section so that the review is as natural as possible. As the lesson progresses, answer questions that students may pose.

INTRODUCTION

“As I present this lesson, I am going to stop four times and show you a map of the information in this lesson and ask you questions that will help you learn about “personification. You can ask me questions at any time; you can also take notes on the paper that I have given to you. Here is our lesson map.

[Show Curriculum Map of Personification Lesson.]

I am writing the word personification here because that is our topic. We are going to learn to learn that personification is about “giving human qualities” to something. I am going to write that in the oval underneath the lesson topic. I will fill the rest of the map in as we complete the lesson. Notice that the information is divided into three groups. A part of the lesson covers each group of information.

So, tell me: What is the lesson topic? [Elicit Answer.] What is lesson about? [Elicit Answer.]

Do you have any questions about how we are going to use lesson map before we begin?” [Answer any questions]

STOP #1 Show the curriculum map and ask students to answer the questions.

So, let’s return to our lesson map. What is the lesson topic? [Elicit Answer.] What is lesson about? [Elicit Answer.]

How do we give human qualities to something? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.] What sensory images do we create? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of objects? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of ideas? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]

STOP #2: Show the curriculum map and ask students to answer these questions.

So, let's return to our lesson map. What is the lesson topic? [Elicit Answer.]
What is lesson about? [Elicit Answer.]

How do we give human qualities to something? [Elicit Answer.]
What sensory images do we create? [Elicit/Clarify Answer.]
What are examples of objects? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of ideas? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]

How can we give objects and ideas human qualities (life)?
What personal experiences do we have to examine? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of feelings? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of moods? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of behaviors? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]

STOP #3: Show the curriculum map and ask students to answer these questions.

So, let's return to our lesson map. What is the lesson topic? [Elicit Answer.]
What is the lesson about? [Elicit Answer.]

How do we give human qualities to something? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What sensory images do we create? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of objects? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of ideas? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]

How can we give objects and ideas human qualities (life)?
What personal experiences do we have to examine [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of feelings? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of moods? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What are examples of behaviors? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]

How do we give life to objects and ideas to express personal experiences?
What is the “F” step? What’s it about? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
Give an example of the “F” step. [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What is the “I” step? What’s it about? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
Give an example of the “I” step. [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What is the “T” step? What’s it about? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
Give an example of the “T” step. [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
What is the “S” step? What’s it about? [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]
Give an example of the “S” step. [Elicit/Clarify Answers.]

STOP #4: Show the curriculum map and ask students to answer these questions.

So, let’s return to our lesson map. What is the lesson topic? [Elicit Answer.]
What is lesson about? [Elicit Answer.]

[Repeat the review as it was conducted in part 3.]
"So, look at the map and tell me in your own words how do you personify using the FITS strategy?" [Help students to correct an accurate summary using the curriculum map.]
Personification

Giving Human Qualities

Sensory Images
- Objects
- Ideas

Personal Examination
- Feelings
- Moods
- Behaviors

FITS Strategy
- Find the object or idea.
- Identify the overall feeling, mood, or behavior.
- Tie it to a human quality.
- State the connection.

Effects of Curriculum Maps and Guiding Questions

Curriculum Map

BEST COPY AVAILABLE
Effects of Curriculum Maps and Guiding Questions

Appendix C
PRETEST – POSTTEST

Section I – Matching: In the blank provided, write the letter of the choice from Column #2 which best matches the item in Column #1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Column #1</th>
<th>Column #2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Sensory image</td>
<td>A. Gives human qualities to objects or ideas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Climax</td>
<td>B. Part of the background of a story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Characterization</td>
<td>C. Revelation of a character by what he/she does</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Plot</td>
<td>D. The eyes through which the story is being told</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Direct description</td>
<td>E. Information that adds to the building of tension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Action verb</td>
<td>F. Revealing what a character thinks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Personification</td>
<td>G. A poetic way of saying something</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Actions</td>
<td>H. Giving life to a person in a story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Complication</td>
<td>I. The ending part of a story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Resolution</td>
<td>J. A compact form of literature</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Setting</td>
<td>K. Words that reveal what characters are saying</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Figurative language</td>
<td>L. A method used to show character or create a scene</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Point of view</td>
<td>M. A mood or feeling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Dialogue</td>
<td>N. Appealing to sight, sound, smell, taste, or touch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Poetry</td>
<td>O. Type of word needed to personify something</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>P. The highest point of suspense or conflict in a story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Q. The chain of events in a story</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>R. The exact meaning of a word</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Section II – Fill in the blank: Write a word in the blank that correctly completes each statement below.

1. The background part of a story introduces characters, setting and _________________.
2. Personification is a literary device that gives ________________ qualities to objects or ideas.
3. Phrases such as “I imagined” or “I realized” are a way to tell when a character is revealing her _________________.
4. The stages of plot structure can also be referred to as the ________________ of events in a story.
Effects of Curriculum Maps and Guiding Questions

5. Personification is based on examining the author's mood, behavior, or ________ toward an object or idea.
6. One method used to discover character is to examine what other characters ________ about the character.
7. The point of highest suspense in a story is called the _________________.
8. Events, or characters that add to the conflict in a story are called _________________.
9. The part of the story that ties-up plot threads is called the _________________.
10. "The wind sang in the branches of the trees" is an example of _________________.
11. If we witness an example of cruelty by a character in a story, then we have learned about him by how he _________________.
12. Personification, although used in prose, is most often used in the literary form of ________.
13. Direct ________________ is a method used by authors to picture a scene or character.
14. In the example, "The whistle screamed," the word that shows personification is ________.
15. Characterization helps us ________________ the characters in a story.

Section III – Multiple Choice: In the blank, write the letter of the most appropriate choice.

___ 1. Which of the following is an example of personification?
   A) "Life is a short summer"
   B) "the waves beside them danced"
   C) "the road was a ribbon of moonlight"
   D) "His eyes were hollows of madness"

___ 2. "Hold it right there." A figure emerged from the shadows, waving a gun at the man. "Up against the car and spread the feet."
   The above passage best represents the plot element of
   A) background   B) personification   C) climax   D) resolution

___ 3. We learn about real people in our everyday lives in all of the following except
   A) by what they say   B) by what they think
   C) by what they do   D) by what others say about them

___ 4. Personification is about
   A) symbolizing ideas and objects   B) comparing unlike things
   C) giving human qualities   D) repeating words and sounds
5. "He is getting to be a Big-Britches," Carl said. "He's minding everybody's business but his own. Got his big nose into everything."

   In the above passage, the character referred to as "Big-Britches" is revealed by
   A) what he/she says
   B) what he/she does
   C) what he/she thinks
   D) what others say about him/her


   In the above passage, the object or idea that is being personified is the
   A) sun
   B) desert
   C) nomad
   D) sun and nomad

7. Which of the following is NOT an example of personification
   A) "The fish-ponds shake their backs"
   B) "the haughty day fills his blue urn with fire"
   C) "the hills untied their bonnets"
   D) "the dawn came up like thunder."

8. When I arrived in Kalamazoo, it was October and the war was still on. Gold and silver stars hung on pennants above silent windows of white and brick-red cottages.

   The above passage best represents the plot stage of
   A) background
   B) problem
   C) complication
   D) resolution

9. But the tears were somehow for myself, for the terrible failing as a son, and not for my father. I was crying for a son too small to know or love my father. All the long ride, I thought of my tears, my treason.

   In the passage above, the character identified as the "son" is revealed by
   A) what he/she does
   B) what the author says
   C) what he/she thinks
   D) what others say about him/her

10. A story begins with characters setting out in a boat on a sunny day when someone asks, "Are those storm clouds I see gathering in the distance?"

    The question posed in the above situation, best represents the plot stage of
    A) background
    B) problem
    C) complication
    D) resolution
Begin by reading the following very short story:

1. Keith was determined to set a new record as he ran through the streets of Boston toward the finish line.
2. He had come a long way since his skiing accident on Casey Mountain two years before.
3. Months of therapy had taught him to walk again on legs now held together with steel pins.
4. Sometimes the pain had been almost too much to bear, but he fought through it all keeping in mind his goal of not only walking again, but winning the annual 26 mile marathon.
5. Now only one more hill stood between him and the victory he so badly craved.
6. Although his legs felt like lead weights, he pushed his way against the hill which seemed to be fighting his every step.
7. For the first time, he was conscious of the sound of running feet close behind him.
8. "I can't lose now!" he thought. "It isn't fair to get this far and not win."
9. His feet suddenly seemed to be tied in knots; he struggled to regain his balance reaching out in front of him clawing at the air.
10. Gasping for breath, Keith awoke on the floor beside his bed in a tangled pile of blankets... the race was over.

Answer questions #11 – 15 about the short story you have just read:

___ 11. The sentence that tells us most about the character of Keith by what he does is
   A) Sentence #1  B) Sentence #2  C) Sentence #6  D) Sentence #8

___ 12. The sentence containing a good example of personification is
   A) Sentence #2  B) Sentence #6  C) Sentence #7  D) Sentence #10

___ 13. The sentence that contains the climax of the story is
   A) Sentence #5  B) Sentence #8  C) Sentence #9  D) Sentence #10

___ 14. The sentence that reveals the character of Keith by what he thinks is
   A) Sentence #1  B) Sentence #4  C) Sentence #6  D) Sentence #8

___ 15. The background of the story is revealed in
   A) Sentences #1 – 2  B) Sentences #2 – 4  C) Sentences #1 – 4  D) Sentences #5 - 7
NOTICE

Reproduction Basis

☐ This document is covered by a signed "Reproduction Release (Blanket)" form (on file within the ERIC system), encompassing all or classes of documents from its source organization and, therefore, does not require a "Specific Document" Release form.

☒ This document is Federally-funded, or carries its own permission to reproduce, or is otherwise in the public domain and, therefore, may be reproduced by ERIC without a signed Reproduction Release form (either "Specific Document" or "Blanket").