To help families leave public assistance and escape poverty, the public sector must invest in career advancement strategies that enable parents to access jobs with family-supporting wages, benefits, and opportunities for career advancement. Welfare time limits have made career advancement more important than ever. The following services promote career advancement for welfare recipients and low-wage workers: job placement and career planning; skill development through education and training; long-term employment and economic development strategies in specific sectors; and support services. The following are among recommendations for agencies selecting vendors or designing career advancement programs: (1) work closely with employers to identify jobs in demand; (2) focus on the quality of jobs and target firms with good jobs and opportunities for growth and advancement; (3) develop training curricula in terms of documentable competencies and skills; and (4) provide support services to help clients with family and employment-related needs. Partnerships are critical for career advancement initiatives. They can include public agencies, employers, unions, community and economic development agencies, training providers, and social support agencies. Research has identified program models and innovative practices that have proved successful in promoting good jobs and advancement among...
welfare recipients and the working poor. (Nine resource contacts and 22 references publications are listed.) (MN)

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made from the original document.
Career Advancement for Welfare Recipients and Low-Wage Workers

Nanette Relave

Welfare Information Network
Career Advancement for Welfare Recipients and Low-Wage Workers

by Nanette Relave

Background

To help families leave public assistance and escape poverty, the public sector needs to invest in career advancement strategies that enable parents to access jobs with family-supporting wages, benefits, and opportunities for career advancement. Welfare and workforce development agencies have a stake in career advancement in order to meet low-income individuals' need for gainful employment and employers' needs for skilled workers. Helping parents advance in the workforce requires a range of services and the participation of public and private organizations.

The current work-first orientation of the welfare and workforce development systems has moved many clients into the workforce. Now is the time to help these individuals realize the promise of self-sufficiency through work. This Issue Note describes key strategies to promote career advancement and examines targeting, program design, collaboration, and funding issues.

Employment retention is an important goal for low-income clients, but alone it does not ensure access to good jobs. Both job retention and career advancement strategies are needed to help families achieve self-sufficiency. For more information on employment retention, see the Welfare Information Network (WIN) Issue Note "Promoting Employment Retention," available at http://www.welfareinfo.org/issuenotepromotingemploymentretention.htm

Policy and Program Issue

Why is career advancement important in welfare reform? With the time limits that welfare reform imposes, combining work and welfare or cycling between welfare and low-wage work is not a long-term option in most states. To help families permanently move off public assistance, states and localities have to help needy parents qualify for and access good jobs that pay family-supporting wages, offer fringe benefits, and provide opportunities for income mobility. A work-first approach alone is not likely to achieve this goal. Studies indicate that the hourly wages of women who leave welfare grow very modestly, so many remain poor or near poor even years after leaving welfare (Strawn and Martinson, 2000). Low educational levels, limited skills, and the nature of the low-wage labor market—intermittent work, stagnant wages, few fringe benefits, and limited opportunities for advancement—are barriers to income and career mobility. Structural economic changes have favored individuals with greater educational and technical skills. There are fewer good jobs for low-skilled workers and fewer career ladders for entry-level workers. States and localities cannot rely on the low-wage labor market to move families to self-sufficiency; they need to pursue strategies to promote skill development, wage progression, and career advancement.
Helping families become self-sufficient is a complex and challenging task that requires a range of strategies and services. This is not the job of a single agency; numerous public and private organizations must contribute to the effort. These include welfare and workforce development agencies, education and training providers, employers, unions, social service agencies, and other community-based agencies.

Who should be targeted for career advancement initiatives? Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (TANF) agencies can provide career advancement services to current and former welfare recipients, and even low-income working families that have not received cash assistance. Possible target groups include individuals with limited educational and job skills, recipients combining welfare and work, and those in low-wage employment. Individuals with limited or no work experience may need to focus on job retention first before they are ready to engage in postemployment career advancement activities. To recruit clients for postemployment services, agencies can strengthen links between pre and postemployment services and market services to employers, community-based agencies, and low-income families directly.

Although the focus of programs targeting hard-to-serve welfare recipients is generally on mitigating employment barriers and stabilizing employment, these individuals also face time limits and ultimately need to earn enough to leave public assistance. Agencies can target these clients for more intensive services to improve employment outcomes and increase earnings. The National Supported Work Demonstration, which targeted very disadvantaged welfare recipients, increased hourly wage rates and the number of hours worked (Fishman et al., 1999).

The Workforce Investment Act (WIA) directs local areas to give priority for intensive and training services to welfare recipients and other low-income persons, unless the local area can show that this priority system is unnecessary. Intensive and training services include the types of services that promote career advancement, such as on-the-job training and skill upgrade training.

What types of strategies promote career advancement for welfare recipients and low-wage workers? In the current work-first environment, postemployment services are critical in helping welfare recipients and low-wage workers advance. An agency's or a program's work does not end with job placement. In addition, agencies and programs must focus on the needs of employers as well as the needs of families to help individuals qualify for and access good jobs.

Job placement and career planning. Starting out in jobs with higher wages and benefits is linked to greater employment retention and higher wage growth over time. Careful job placement along with career planning can help put families on the path to self-sufficiency. To help individuals qualify for and access better jobs, job placement staff needs to have good information on the local labor market and understand the skill requirements of quality jobs. This knowledge can be attained by working closely with employers. Job development and placement staff can target employers who provide training to entry-level workers and industries or occupations that have internal career ladders.

Effective job placement also requires assessing clients' skills, interests, and employment barriers to facilitate good job matching and help clients identify viable career paths. Career planning is a critical element in job advancement (Strawn and Martinson, 2000). Staff can work with clients to establish short- and long-term career goals and use strategies such as skill upgrading that open doors to better jobs. To further support career advancement, agencies can provide career counseling to clients who are employed and offer job search assistance to workers to help them make strategic job changes that will build skills and increase wages. States and agencies interested in job placement as a career
advancement strategy can use incentives and performance measures to focus placement activities on good jobs and viable career pathways.

**Skill development through education and training.** Low skills and limited education are significant barriers to career advancement. Attaining job skills and educational credentials is linked to wage growth and access to better jobs. Historically, welfare and workforce development agencies have directed resources to education and training for low-skilled and low-income individuals prior to job placement. The work-first approach that has evolved with welfare reform and that has influenced the workforce development field has shifted policy and program priorities from preplacement education and training to rapid workforce attachment. Yet, given the importance of skill development to career advancement, state and local agencies need to find ways to support education and training in the work-first context. The current literature on career advancement points to work-based learning, as well as efforts to combine education and training with work, as effective ways to promote skill development (see Stillman, 1999).

Strategies that promote work-based learning and that improve access to education and training outside of work can help welfare recipients and low-wage workers combine work and skill development activities (Brown et al., 1998). Public agencies can partner with employers to develop work-based learning programs, such as on-the-job training, customized training, and supported work, that have proven effective in increasing earnings and productivity.

For working parents, finding time to participate in learning outside of work is difficult. Agencies can work with community colleges, training providers, and employers to improve access to education and training opportunities. Access can be enhanced by shortening courses, providing education or training at neighborhood or work sites, and negotiating release time for employees. To promote access to better jobs, education and training programs must emphasize job skills and credentials linked to good jobs in the local labor market. Postsecondary education also is linked to better jobs. See the WIN Issue Note "Postsecondary Education Options for Low-Income Adults," available at http://www.welfareinfo.org/postseced2.htm.

**Sectoral interventions.** Sectoral interventions are long-term employment and economic development strategies that target an occupation or industry, build relationships with key stakeholders, and improve the economic opportunities for low-income individuals in that occupation or industry (see the National Network of Sector Practitioners Online at http://www.nedlc.org/nns/index.html). These initiatives use different strategies, including skill upgrading through education and training, increasing the pay and professionalism of low-wage jobs, restructuring jobs to create higher quality positions, developing internal career ladders, creating multifirm career ladders, and providing support services. Public and community-based organizations are involved in sectoral initiatives. Publicly initiated sectoral interventions are more likely to be industry-driven, while privately initiated ones aim to achieve systemic change in the targeted labor market sector to benefit low-income individuals.

In Jobs and the Urban Poor: Publicly Initiated Sectoral Strategies (1995), Siegel et al. identify the key roles of public agencies in sectoral initiatives. Public agencies can help initiate these efforts and are critical in facilitating and brokering the participation of key organizations. Public funds help seed initiatives, support programs, and leverage funds from other partners. Although a collaboration or nonprofit organization often undertakes implementation, public agencies have an important oversight role to ensure that public policy goals are addressed along with industry concerns. The public sector can also make use of its roles as a regulator and as a purchaser of goods and services in sectoral initiatives.
Public agencies can develop new relationships with business through sectoral projects. These projects give agencies in-depth information on the employment opportunities and training needs within the sector. Sectoral initiatives also enable agencies to reach multiple firms and address broader workforce development needs.

Support services. Work supports such as child care subsidies, housing and transportation assistance, and health insurance can help welfare recipients and low-wage workers stay in the workforce and advance. Achieving self-sufficiency often is a long process, and working families may need assistance in meeting work and family responsibilities. Combining work with education and training can be especially demanding. Support services can make it possible for workers to take advantage of skill development opportunities.

Public agencies need to conduct marketing and outreach activities to let working families know about the benefits for which they are eligible. Agencies also need to address administrative barriers to accessing support services. Having evening and weekend hours, outstationing staff, and simplifying enrollment procedures are ways to increase access to benefits. Agencies can work with providers to expand reverse commuting routes to good jobs in the suburbs and to offer evening child care for workers in education and training programs. TANF agencies can provide work supports to a broader range of low-income working families by setting higher income standards to establish eligibility for services

Postemployment case management, career counseling, and reemployment assistance also support job retention and advancement. These services can help working parents map career paths, address employment barriers, access work supports, and change jobs strategically.

What should agencies consider in selecting vendors or designing a career advancement program? Program design and delivery affect how well programs help clients access better jobs. For more information, see the how-to guide Steady Work and Better Jobs (Strawn and Martinson, 2000). Effective programs:

- work closely with employers to identify jobs in demand, respond to employers' needs, and include employers in program design and development;
- focus on the quality of jobs and target firms with good jobs and opportunities for growth and advancement;
- provide a mix of basic and occupational skills, soft skills, and work-base learning;
- have capacity and expertise in a specific training area;
- develop training curricula in terms of competencies and skills that can be documented;
- link short-term training to opportunities for further skill upgrading and postsecondary education;
- can be flexible in delivering services;
- understand the demands on working families and strive to make services and training accessible; and
- help clients with family and employment-related needs by providing support services or working with other agencies to deliver needed services and work supports.

With whom can welfare and workforce development agencies partner to promote career
advancement? Partnerships are critical for career advancement initiatives in order to address the complex challenge of helping families escape poverty. The collaboration can include public agencies, employers, unions, community and economic development agencies, training providers, and social service agencies. Welfare and workforce development agencies can play a role in initiating, facilitating, and supporting collaborative efforts. These agencies have several powerful tools to shape and support career advancement initiatives, including public funds, goods and services procurement, and client referrals.

Public agencies can improve their capacity to help families achieve self-sufficiency by strengthening interagency relationships and improving coordination across welfare, workforce development, education, and economic development systems. Through collaboration, government agencies can develop a more comprehensive approach to assisting low-wage workers and can reach a broader working poor population. The Workforce Investment Act provides the opportunity to bring together the welfare, workforce development, and training systems to develop a more integrated system for providing employment, training, and support services to families. See the WIN Issue Note "Collaboration Between the Welfare and Workforce Development Systems," available at http://www.welfareinfo.org/workforcecollab.htm, for examples of interagency collaboration.

Developing strong relationships with employers also is critical for helping low-wage workers advance. Workforce boards, employer organizations such as chambers of commerce, and industry partnerships provide opportunities to work with employers. Welfare agencies can use intermediaries to connect with employers. To promote career advancement, public agencies need to sell employers on working with the public sector and on investing in training for entry-level and low-skilled workers. Public agencies can engage employers by marketing the kinds of benefits the public sector provides, such as basic skills training, case management, and support services; organizing customized training for a single firm or multiple firms; and providing a training marketplace through one-stop workforce centers. To involve firms in training, agencies need to demonstrate the bottom-line benefits (see Bloom and Lafleur, 1999). Agencies can use public funds to leverage private investments in training and to provide financial incentives to employers to support work-based learning.

Community colleges comprise the largest local delivery system for training (Gruber, 2000) and are key partners in promoting career advancement. Public agencies can help bring together community colleges and employers to design market-oriented training programs. Through partnerships, public agencies can work with community colleges to develop more flexible models for delivering training to accommodate employers and working families. Welfare and workforce development systems that serve low-wage and low-skilled workers need to form closer ties with public and private education and training systems to improve access to skills training (Brown et al., 1998).

How can public funds support career advancement activities? TANF and state maintenance-of-effort (MOE) funds, Welfare-to-Work grants, and funding through WIA can support the kinds of services and programs that help individuals get better jobs. TANF monies can fund postemployment services for employed and former welfare recipients, such as support services, case management, career counseling, and job training activities. TANF and MOE funds can help clients participate in educational activities by, for example, providing tuition assistance and using separate state funds for living expenses. TANF agencies have the flexibility to extend eligibility for these kinds of work supports and employment-related services to low-income families not on TANF assistance. Welfare-to-Work grants are designated for employment-related activities that facilitate career development among hard-to-serve clients (Trutko et al., 1999).
The Workforce Investment Act can also support workforce development services for low-income individuals. In particular, individual training accounts can fund skills training and upgrading for welfare recipients and low-income individuals. WIA also makes funds available for on-the-job training, customized training, and incumbent worker projects. Performance measures will hold states, local areas, and training providers accountable for employment retention and wage progression outcomes.

Public agencies can use funds in strategic ways to promote advancement for welfare recipients and low-wage workers. For example, public funds can be used to leverage investments from employers or to develop the infrastructure—training networks, employer consortia, and one-stop workforce centers—that support career advancement efforts. Financial incentives are another way to promote career advancement goals. For example, agencies can establish performance measures for themselves and vendors that reward job quality and wage progression outcomes.

**Research Findings**

Although there is a dearth of research on career advancement strategies, policymakers and program administrators can review evaluations of welfare-to-work strategies to see how different types of programs affect employment and earnings. The National Evaluation of Welfare-to-Work Strategies (NEWWS), funded by the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, analyzed education-focused, employment-focused, and mixed-strategy programs operating under the federal Job Opportunities and Basic Skills (JOBS) Training Program to assess their effects on employment, earnings, and other outcomes. (Visit the NEWWS home page at http://aspe.hhs.gov/hsp/NEWWS/index.htm.).

In her review of welfare-to-work strategies, Strawn (1998) found that the most effective programs use a flexible approach that incorporates job search, education, job training, and work. Effective programs have close ties with local employers and provide services that are individualized and intensive. Programs that help recipients find better jobs emphasize building job-related skills.

Program models that have been successful in promoting good jobs and advancement point to promising strategies for career advancement. The JOBS program in Portland, Oregon, was unusually successful in increasing employment and earnings and helping clients get good jobs. This program offered high-quality education and training alongside job search assistance, had strong job development and placement services, emphasized the quality of jobs, and allowed those in need of more skills to initially enroll in short-term education or training. For more information, see National Evaluation of Welfare-to-Work Strategies: Implementation, Participation Patterns, Costs, and Two-Year Impacts of the Portland (Oregon) Welfare-to-Work Program, available at http://aspe.hhs.gov/hsp/isp/Portland/xsportld.htm Other effective program models include those of the Center for Employment Training (see http://www.best.com/cfetlmain.htm) and Project QUEST, a sectoral approach (see http://www.QUESTsa.com/).

The Administration for Children and Families of the U.S. Department of Health and Human Services is launching the Employment Retention and Advancement Evaluation project. This multisite evaluation will assess the implementation, impacts, costs, and benefits of programs designed to promote stable employment and career progression among TANF recipients, former recipients, or families at risk of needing TANF benefits.

**Innovative Practices**
The Maryland Department of Human Resources launched the Job Skills Enhancement (JSE) pilot program in 1998. The program targets current and former TANF recipients who are employed in entry-level positions that have limited potential for advancement. Program participants take part in skill development activities to enhance their job-related skills, gain additional or alternate skills, and develop basic workplace skills. Local departments participating in the program have developed their own education and training strategies and partnerships to serve clients. For example, the Montgomery County Department of Health and Human Services has implemented several JSE programs. One program uses a voucher-based model to provide skills training tailored to individual needs. Another program provides information technology training that leads to certification in Excel or Word/Powerpoint through Montgomery College, a community college serving the county. Clients receive career counseling and transportation and child care assistance. For more information on the Job Skills Enhancement program, contact Yolanda Parker, special projects coordinator, Office of Work Opportunities, Maryland Department of Human Resources, at 410/767-5598.

Milwaukee is one of six cities participating in the Annie E. Casey Foundation's Jobs Initiative. The Casey Foundation launched the Jobs Initiative in 1995 to support organizations that help connect low-income individuals to family-supporting jobs. The Milwaukee Jobs Initiative (MJI) is a cooperative effort of business, labor, and the community to improve the functioning of the regional labor market for employers and low-income individuals. MJI works on both the demand and supply sides of the labor market to develop projects that connect central city residents to good jobs in the regional economy and to promote systemic reforms in the labor market that sustain these connections. MJI projects are sector-based, working with employers and labor representatives in industry sectors that need workers and that offer good jobs. MJI currently works in the manufacturing, printing, hospitality, and automotive/trucking sectors to help establish and support intermediary organizations that improve employment and training systems in order to connect central city residents to good jobs. MJI projects work with community organizations to engage low-income individuals in the Jobs Initiative and to coordinate the supports that are needed to get and stay employed. For more information, contact Caroline Schultz, project oversight associate, Milwaukee Jobs Initiative, at 414/372-7387; or visit http://www.mii.org/. Also visit the Center on Wisconsin Strategy at HTTP://www.cows.org/.

The Nebraska welfare reform program, Employment First, aims to help families and individuals reach economic independence through education, training, job preparation, and support. The state invests in helping clients increase their employability and earning potential. Under a state waiver, clients can engage in two years of vocational or post-secondary education and unlimited job search. Career counseling, exploration, and planning and educational planning are provided to all clients. Job preparation activities incorporate retention and advancement strategies such as how to take advantage of stepping stone opportunities and advance on the job. Case management, individual counseling, and support groups are provided for at least six months after clients have lost their eligibility for cash assistance due to earned income to assist clients with retention and advancement goals. Transitional supportive services are also available. Employment First resource development staff and program contractors work with employers to identify jobs that have career ladder opportunities and work-based training. For more information, contact Dennis Ellis, program specialist, Office of Economic Assistance, Nebraska Department of Health and Human Services, at 402/471-6792.

The Oregon Adult and Family Services Division (AFS) of the Department of Human Services is focusing on helping clients remain on the job and advance to better positions. Postemployment services delivered through local partnerships are part of the AFS self-sufficiency strategy. Services include case management and brokering for family resources, career assessment and planning,
short-term training, support services, and access to workforce development services through resource centers or one-stop workforce centers. Services are available to current and former TANF recipients as well as low-income families at risk of qualifying for TANF. Local partnerships bring together welfare and workforce development agencies, community colleges, substance abuse and mental health agencies, and other public and private organizations to plan and deliver services. In the Portland area, the community college partnerships are building a career ladder approach. The Up with Wages initiative in the Salem area is providing career development services at the work site to entry-level state employees. The state has developed performance measures for local AFS offices and prime contractors that establish goals for placement, employment retention, and wage progression. For more information, contact Bob Proctor, program analyst, Oregon Adult and Family Services, at 503/945-6115.

Engaging employers in welfare to work is a key component of Virginia's welfare reform efforts. The Virginia Department of Social Services has been building innovative employment and training partnerships with business and industry to promote job retention and career advancement for VIEW (Virginia Initiative for Employment not Welfare) participants moving into the workforce. The business and industry partnerships aim to provide career advancement and increased earnings for clients in work activities and to provide employment opportunities with career paths for those considered hard to employ. The Department of Social Services (DSS) acts as a single point of contact for employers at the state level to facilitate the development of employment and training partnerships. The state has also developed marketing tools to help inform and sell employers on its services. With a low unemployment rate and other positive economic conditions in the state, many employers have been eager to participate in the state's Business Development and Welfare to Work initiatives.

In one example, DSS and the Tidewater Community College have partnered with employers to provide skills training programs in nontraditional fields such as automotive technician and manufacturing and to provide programs in customer service and other areas. The training programs involve a close partnership between the local department of social services, employers, and the training provider/community college. The employment and training programs have the active involvement of employers and provide short-term training, built in work activities, supportive services, and placement into employment. In another example, DSS has been teaming up with a variety of high-technology firms to establish employment opportunities for clients. For more information, contact Deanie Powell, acting program manager, Business Development and Welfare to Work, Virginia Department of Social Services, at 804/692-1268.

Labor unions are taking on the challenge of helping low-income and low-skilled workers move out of poverty and into good jobs. Unions are intervening in low-wage sectors of the economy to improve working conditions, wages and benefits, and opportunities for advancement. Union-based education and training programs are developing new approaches to address the skill needs of low-wage workers, individuals moving from welfare to work, and entry-level workers. In 1998, the AFL-CIO established the Working for America Institute to help the union movement create, retain, and expand good jobs for working families in the new economy. At the heart of this effort to build good jobs and strong communities are "high road partnerships" that bring together unions, employers, community groups, and often public agencies to create improvements in jobs, skills, and career opportunities. These partnerships employ a range of strategies from training and skill upgrading programs to articulating career ladders for workers to setting workplace and job standards. The partnerships draw on a wide range of private and public funds, including TANF, Welfare-to-Work, and WIA funds. For case studies of high road partnerships and further information on union efforts, visit the Working for America web site at http://www.workingforamerica.org/.
For More Information...

**RESOURCE CONTACTS**

Center for Law and Social Policy, contact Julie Strawn, 202/797-6536; or visit [http://www.clasp.org/](http://www.clasp.org/).

The Lewin Group, contact Michael Fishman, 703/269-5655; or visit [http://www.lewin.com/](http://www.lewin.com/).

National Governors' Association, contact Susan Golonka, 202/624-5300; or visit [http://www.nga.org/](http://www.nga.org/).

National Network of Sector Practitioners Online, a clearinghouse of sectoral intervention strategies and resources nationwide, visit [http://www.nedlc.org/nnsp/index.html](http://www.nedlc.org/nnsp/index.html).

Public/Private Ventures, contact Mark Elliott, 212/822-2400; or visit [http://www.ppv.org/](http://www.ppv.org/).

Urban Institute, contact Demetra Smith Nightingale, 202/833-7200; or visit [http://www.urban.org/](http://www.urban.org/).


**Publications**


The Welfare Information Network is supported by grants from the Annie E. Casey Foundation, the Charles Stewart Mott Foundation, the David and Lucile Packard Foundation, the Edna McConnell Clark Foundation, the Ford Foundation, and the Administration for Children and Families, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, and the U.S. Department of Labor.
NOTICE

Reproduction Basis

This document is covered by a signed "Reproduction Release (Blanket)" form (on file within the ERIC system), encompassing all or classes of documents from its source organization and, therefore, does not require a "Specific Document" Release form.

This document is Federally-funded, or carries its own permission to reproduce, or is otherwise in the public domain and, therefore, may be reproduced by ERIC without a signed Reproduction Release form (either "Specific Document" or "Blanket").

EFF-089 (3/2000)