In an average classroom period, a teacher has twenty or more opportunities to interact with students and thereby influence learning outcomes. As such, teachers should use these opportunities to reinforce instruction or give positive corrective feedback. Typical methods used in schools emphasize error correction at the expense of calling attention to the information students have already mastered. Instead, teachers should acknowledge what students already know, build upon it, and then reteach poorly understood material by guiding the student through an analysis of mistakes. Teachers often dismiss a student's incorrect response because they are concentrating what to say next. Teachers then lose a valuable opportunity to interact with students. A good way to avoid this may be for the teacher to plan beforehand some responses to students. Examples of responses which can be used when a correct answer is given include: "Good"; "Thank you"; "Yes, that's it"; "Keep working on it"; "You are getting much better"; "I knew you could do it"; and "Terrific." An example of a response which can be used when an incorrect answer is given is: "Let's look at this...Nice work with this first part, now let's start from here." (JW)
Twenty Golden Opportunities to Enhance Student Learning: Use Them or Lose Them

Introduction

In the fairy tale about the farmer, the goose and the golden eggs, the ungrateful farmer becomes impatient with only one golden egg a day and eventually kills the poor goose to get all the gold. Unfortunately, this rash action has the opposite effect and the farmer's family (and we) sadly learn not to kill the goose that lays the golden eggs. Don't be impatient, don't be greedy and don't waste golden opportunities by failing to recognize them! This tale can also serve as a reminder for teachers who repeatedly lose golden eggs (opportunities) during almost every lesson they teach. The major difference between the farmer and the teacher is that while the farmer never gets another chance the teacher keeps trying to kill the goose over and over again.

Teachers should remember the moral of the fairy tale whenever they give students feedback about their performance. By expecting only the correct answer to their questions, and by impatiently dismissing incorrect responses, teachers often fail to capitalize on many marvelous opportunities for enriching students' understanding of complex procedures and concepts. Every student response to a learning stimulus is a golden opportunity to reinforce instruction or to give positive corrective feedback. Unfortunately, teachers often fail to appreciate this precious treasure; instead they ignore, trivialize or kill the source of students' learning and self-worth (the golden goose), namely, their motivation to participate in an educational environment.
References


A recent search of the Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) database turned up over 1000 articles describing the use of positive reinforcement and corrective feedback in the classroom. Unfortunately, it is often easier to talk about effective teaching practices than to use them in the classroom. Since research in educational psychology generally confirms the benefits of positive reinforcement over punishment, negative reinforcement, or no reinforcement at all, it benefits teachers to take the time to examine the way they respond to students (Biechler & Snowman, 1990). During an average thirty minute class period a teacher will have twenty or more opportunities to interact with students and to reinforce learning outcomes. These golden eggs appear during question and answer sessions, while making instructional presentations or when working with individual students. They emerge, in fact, almost every time a student responds to a teacher.

If teachers insist upon receiving only the anticipated correct answer then they are losing their best chance to help students bridge the gap between what they know and what they are trying to learn. Moreover, a lack of positive feedback can cause many students to quietly lose much of their motivation and self-confidence, especially those who are characterized as underachievers. In short, teachers must seize upon these twenty golden opportunities for positive reinforcement and constructive feedback in every class period or risk killing a gaggle of geese that lay golden eggs.

Always Build On the Positive

Teachers usually spend a lot of time explaining concepts and procedures to students and then providing remedial or individualized instruction for those who are slower to catch on. For many, teaching involves The Universal Helping Interaction (Jones, 1987), which assumes "that when students are stuck you explain to them what they do not understand and then help them to do it right" (p. 23). Consequently, if a student fails to grasp an operation such as the division of two digit numbers the teacher focuses on the student's difficulty by calling attention to his or her mistakes, reteaching the appropriate procedures and then providing additional problems to check for understanding.
Unfortunately, this *Universal Helping Interaction* tends to emphasize error correction, often at the expense of reinforcing the information that students have already mastered. "We make the error, and the failure experience it represents, the best-remembered portion of the effort (p. 48)." The *golden opportunity here is to acknowledge, and build upon, what students already know instead of focusing on their mistakes.* Then, reteach the poorly understood operation by showing them how to proceed. After all, understanding "is not an all-or nothing affair; rather it varies in degree and is probably never complete (Nickerson, 1985 p. 235)." Hence, students are given credit for at least understanding something, corrective feedback for what they don't understand, and directions on how to progress. Not only does this approach save classroom time, it helps to motivate students to take risks and not be afraid of failure.

**Golden Eggs**

Many chances for giving students positive reinforcement and successful corrective feedback transpire quickly and can be lost unless teachers learn to anticipate these opportunities. Question and answer sessions can be particularly useful if teachers pay attention to good principles of inquiry (Dillon, 1988; Sponder, 1993). The following dialogue and the suggested improvement illustrate the *golden egg-hunting process.*

**Teacher** : Remember, one meter is made up of one hundred centimeters. Yes student?

**Student** : It is also one thousand millimeters

**Teacher** : I haven't taught that to you yet. Wait until tomorrow! Don't bring these things up before we cover them in class.

**An Alternative:**

**Teacher** : Remember, one meter is made up of one hundred centimeters. Yes student?

**Student** : It is also one thousand millimeters
Teacher: Good. We will work with millimeters tomorrow. You really know this metric system and I am glad that you made that connection.

A summary of some of these golden eggs are summarized in Table 1, as follows:

**Table 1. Some possibilities for giving positive corrective feedback and positive reinforcement to students during a lesson.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Golden Opportunity</th>
<th>Teacher's response</th>
<th>Teacher's response</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>slow killing the goose</td>
<td>Teacher: Next</td>
<td>Teacher: Good. Next question</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher: How many centimeters in one meter? Student: One hundred.</td>
<td>Teacher: Wrong. Next student</td>
<td>Teacher: Okay, let's look at the meter and see what it shows.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher: How many centimeters in one meter? Student: Ten?</td>
<td>Teacher: No. Who knows the correct answer?</td>
<td>Teacher: Well the moon is in the sky and I'm glad you remembered it. Let's look at this model of the solar system again and we can see which objects move or revolve around the sun and which bodies only revolve around planets...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher: Who can tell me which planet is closest to the Earth? Student: The moon.</td>
<td>Teacher: Incorrect. You made a mistake with that second digit and you didn't borrow. or Teacher: Incorrect. Who can help and show him/her how to do it?</td>
<td>Teacher: Let's look at this... Nice work with this first part. Now let's start from here.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student: (on the board) Two hundred and fifty five divided by twelve is twenty seven</td>
<td>Teacher: Incorrect. You made a mistake with that second digit and you didn't borrow. or Teacher: Incorrect. Who can help and show him/her how to do it?</td>
<td>Teacher: Let's look at this... Nice work with this first part. Now let's start from here.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 1. Continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Golden Opportunity</th>
<th>Teacher’s response slowly kills the goose</th>
<th>Teacher’s response gets the golden egg</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Teacher:** Remember, one meter is made up of one hundred centimeters. Yes student?  
**Student:** It is also one thousand millimeters | **Teacher:** Well, we haven’t covered that yet.  
or  
**Teacher:** I haven’t taught that to you yet. | **Teacher:** Good. We will work with that tomorrow.  
You really know this metric system. |
| **Teacher:** Can you tell me which way is west?  
**Student:** I’m not sure | **Teacher:** Sit down! Who knows the answer? | **Teacher:** Okay, now remember in which direction does the sun rise?  
**Student:** East?  
**Teacher:** Good, point to the east. (Student does.)  
Yes. Now remember that west is in the opposite direction. Can you point to the west? (Student does.) I knew you could do it. |

Twenty-Five Ways to say “Good”

When students answer a question thoughtfully, correctly and in a way that moves the lesson forward there is nothing more satisfying than to receive their teacher’s acknowledgement. This feedback lets them know they are performing well and it can increase their motivation to learn and their desire to perform. Teachers often fail to appreciate a student’s response because they are already thinking about what they want to say next. They can change this behaviour by preparing responses in advance and using them at the appropriate moments. This is not to suggest that praise be indiscriminately used for everything that students do since research clearly indicates that unless students perceive that praise is earned, it may be counterproductive (Weiner, 1986). Below is a list of twenty-five ways to communicate the idea that a student has done good work. The reader is challenged to come up with additional possibilities.
1. Good  
2. Thank you  
3. Yes, that's it  
4. I like that answer  
5. Quite good  
6. That's it!  
7. That's right  
8. Yes  
9. Good work  
10. You are learning fast  
11. Keep working on it, you are getting much better  
12. Exactly right  
13. You're doing a good job  
14. I knew you could do it  
15. That's the way to do it  
16. Terrific  
17. Good remembering  
18. Nice work  
19. I like the way you did that  
20. Great answer  
21. Good thinking  
22. That is a very good answer  
23. Outstanding  
24. Nice answer  
25. I like the way you said that  

Summary

The fairy tale about killing the golden goose underscores the importance of attitudinal change. If the farmer had patience, eschewed greed and recognized his good fortune he would have been wealthy and successful. Teachers can also learn from this parable by patiently considering a student's answer, acknowledging their good efforts and by recognizing that even an errant response contains something to build upon for corrective feedback. Unlike the farmer, teachers have many chances every day to kill the golden goose of student motivation. However, they can also collect golden eggs by giving students positive corrective feedback and by learning to say good work in many different ways. Teachers should learn to use the twenty golden opportunities they have in each lesson or they will lose them.

References


### I. DOCUMENT IDENTIFICATION (Class of Documents):

| All Publications: | 1) Techniques for promoting interdisciplinary education in the classroom  
| Series (Identify Series): | 2) Twenty Golden Opportunities to Enhance Student Learning: Use Them While You Can  
| Division/Department Publications (Specify): | 3) Reformulating useless questions for classroom instruction  
| | From Teaching and learning (Singapore)  
| | Elementary & Early Childhood Education (PS) |

### II. REPRODUCTION RELEASE:

In order to disseminate as widely as possible timely and significant materials of interest to the educational community, documents announced in the monthly abstract journal of the ERIC system, Resources in Education (RIE), are usually made available to users in microfiche, reproduced paper copy, and electronic/optical media, and sold through the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS) or other ERIC vendors. Credit is given to the source of each document, and, if reproduction release is granted, one of the following notices is affixed to the document.

If permission is granted to reproduce the identified document, please CHECK ONE of the following options and sign the release below.

- **Level 1**: "PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

  [Sample]

  TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

- **Level 2**: "PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL IN OTHER THAN PAPER COPY HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

  [Sample]

  TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

Documents will be processed as indicated provided reproduction quality permits. If permission to reproduce is granted, but neither box is checked, documents will be processed at Level 1.

"I hereby grant to the Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) nonexclusive permission to reproduce these documents as indicated above. Reproduction from the ERIC microfiche or electronic/optical media by persons other than ERIC employees and its system contractors requires permission from the copyright holder. Exception is made for non-profit reproduction by libraries and other service agencies to satisfy information needs of educators in response to discrete inquiries."

**Signature:** Barry Spondr

**Position:** Senior Lecturer

**Printed Name:** Barry Spondr

**Organization:** NANYANG TECHNOLOGICAL UNIVERSITY

**Address:** Block 92 #103  
KISMIS Avenue  
Singapore 2159

**Telephone Number:** (65) 664-1927

**Date:** July 28, 1995
III. DOCUMENT AVAILABILITY INFORMATION (FROM NON-ERIC SOURCE):

If permission to reproduce is not granted to ERIC, or if you wish ERIC to cite the availability of these documents from another source, please provide the following information regarding the availability of the document (for a document unless it is publicly available, and a dependable source can be specified. Contributors should also be aware that ERIC selection criteria are significantly more stringent for documents which cannot be made available through EDRS).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Publisher/Distributor:</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Address:</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Price Per Copy:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quantity Price:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

IV. REFERRAL OF ERIC TO COPYRIGHT/REPRODUCTION RIGHTS HOLDER:

If the right to grant reproduction release is held by someone other than the addressee, please provide the appropriate name and address:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name and address of current copyright/reproduction rights holder:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Name:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Address: N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

V. WHERE TO SEND THIS FORM:

Send this form to the following ERIC Clearinghouse:

If you are making an unsolicited contribution to ERIC, you may return this form (and the document(s) being contributed) to:

ERIC Facility
2440 Research Boulevard, Suite 400
Rockville, Maryland 20850-3238
Telephone: (301) 258-5500

(Rev. 9/91)