
Participating in the study were 36 black and 36 white low-income preschool children (average age 53 months). The children were given two types of false belief (FB) tasks, standard and narrative FB tasks. It was hypothesized that black children would perform better than white children on narrative FB tasks and that black children would perform better on narrative questions than they would on standard questions. Results indicated that black children's scores on the standard and narrative questions were equivalent, but that white children's narrative FB scores were significantly lower than their standard FB scores. Overall, black children had higher scores than white children on narrative questions. Black children's cultural experience with storytelling is cited as a possible reason for their performance on FB tasks. (Contains 14 references.) (KB)
Black Preschoolers' Social Cognition: Storytelling and False Belief

Stephanie M. Curenton, Melvin N. Wilson, & Angeline S. Lillard


Please direct correspondence to:
Stephanie M. Curenton
University of Virginia
Department of Psychology
P.O. Box 400400
Charlottesville VA 22903

BEST COPY AVAILABLE
ABSTRACT
Low-income preschoolers (36 Black, 36 White) were given two types of false belief (FB) tasks, Standard and Narrative FB tasks. Black children's scores on the Standard and Narrative questions were equivalent, but White children's Narrative FB scores were significantly lower than their Standard FB scores. Overall, Black children had higher scores than White children on Narrative questions. These findings are explained by ethnographic research emphasizing Black children's strength and talent with storytelling.

BACKGROUND
The false belief (FB) task tests whether children understand that people act according to their beliefs (Wimmer & Perner, 1983). Low-income children are less likely to pass FB tasks than middle-income children are (Cole & Mitchell, 1998; Holmes, Black, & Miller, 1996; Hughes & Dunn, 1998). This finding has either not been explained (Holmes, Black, & Miller, 1996; Hughes & Dunn, 1998) or has been explained by authoritarian parenting styles which provide children with little insight into other's mental states (Cole & Mitchell, 1998). None of the researchers discussed cultural practices that may help or hinder children's grasp of mental states, even though both Holmes et al. (1996) and Hughes and Dunn (1998) had adequate numbers of Black children in their samples. One cultural practice that may aid Black children's understanding of mental states is storytelling. Ethnographic research recognizes storytelling as a valued and common part of Black culture (Heath, 1982). Thus, Black children's experience with stories may help them pass FB questions that are embedded in narratives.
Hypotheses

- Black children are expected to perform better than White children on narrative FB questions.
- Black children are expected to perform better on narrative questions than they do on standard questions.

METHOD

Participants. See Table 1 for a description of the participants.

Materials & Procedure. Experimenters told children scenarios about puppets and asked them 3 Standard FB questions along with memory questions. Also experimenters told children a story using a wordless picture book (Mayer, 1969) and asked them 3 Narrative FB questions along with memory questions. Children received a correct score only if they answered both the test and the memory question correctly. Table 2 lists the specific questions.

Children were also given the language and cognition subscale of the Early Screening Inventory—Revised (ESI-R; Meisels, Marsden, Wiske, Stone, & Henderson, 1997).

RESULTS

A Race x Age MANCOVA with language scores as the covariate was conducted. Language scores were used as a covariate because prior research indicates a relationship between language ability and FB performance (Astington & Jenkins, 1999). Results revealed a significant difference between Black (M = 1.00) and White (M = .44) children's performance on the Narrative questions,
(1, 71) = 6.18, p < .05. However, there was no significant difference between the groups on the Standard questions. Paired samples t-tests revealed that Black children's scores on the Narrative and Standard questions were equivalent, but White children's scores on Narrative questions (M = .44) were lower than their Standard question scores (M = 1.33), t (35) = -4.23, p = .00.

**Conclusions**

Black children's performance could be due to their cultural experience with storytelling. From the time Black children are babies they are surrounded by stories and encouraged to tell them (Heath, 1982). Their stories tend to be imaginative (Vernon-Feagans, 1996) and revolve around social relationships (Sperry & Sperry, 1995). Therefore, when Black children were asked about the character's beliefs, this was not difficult for them because they may be accustomed to hearing detailed stories about people's actions and making inferences about their mental states. Perhaps Black children have a talent for narrative comprehension. If so, this talent could be incorporated into the classroom.
References


Table 1. Demographics of Participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Black (n = 36)</th>
<th>White (n = 36)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>53 months (SD = 8.35)</td>
<td>53 months (SD = 9.23)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrolled Head Start</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrolled non-Head Start</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>20 girls, 16 boys</td>
<td>20 girls, 16 boys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language Score</td>
<td>7.44 (SD = 2.88)</td>
<td>8.36 (SD = 2.65)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Questions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STANDARD QUESTIONS</th>
<th>NARRATIVE QUESTIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Where will Pam look first for a Band-Aid? Will she find Band-Aids there?</td>
<td>When Robert first looked in the hole, who did he think might be there, his frog or a mole? Who was really there, his frog or a mole?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>When Debbie first sees this, what will she think this is, a candle or an apple? What is this really and truly, a candle or an apple?</td>
<td>When Robert first looked inside the hollow, who did he think might be there, an owl or his frog? Who was really there, an owl or his frog?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Where will Mark look first for his book? Will he find his book there?</td>
<td>When Robert was leaning on the long, skinny black things what did he think they were, tree branches or antlers? What were they really and truly, tree branches or antlers?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 1. Narrative Score by Race

Figure 2. Comparison of Black and White children's scores by Question type
**I. DOCUMENT IDENTIFICATION:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title:</th>
<th>Black Preschoolers' social cognition: Storytelling and False Belief</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Author(s):</td>
<td>Stephanie M. Curenton and Melvin N. Wilson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Source:</td>
<td>University of Virginia, Charlottesville VA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publication Date:</td>
<td>August 2000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**II. REPRODUCTION RELEASE:**

In order to disseminate as widely as possible timely and significant materials of interest to the educational community, documents announced in the monthly abstract journal of the ERIC system, Resources in Education (RIE), are usually made available to users in microfiche, reproduced paper copy, and electronic media, and sold through the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS). Credit is given to the source of each document, and, if reproduction release is granted, one of the following notices is affixed to the document.

If permission is granted to reproduce and disseminate the identified document, please CHECK ONE of the following three options and sign at the bottom of the page.

- **Level 1**
  - Permission to reproduce and disseminate this material has been granted by TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
- **Level 2A**
  - Permission to reproduce and disseminate this material in microfiche, and in electronic media for ERIC collection subscribers only, has been granted by TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
- **Level 2B**
  - Permission to reproduce and disseminate this material in microfiche only has been granted by TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

Documents will be processed as indicated provided reproduction quality permits. If permission to reproduce is granted, but no box is checked, documents will be processed at Level 1.

I hereby grant to the Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) nonexclusive permission to reproduce and disseminate this document as indicated above. Reproduction from the ERIC microfiche or electronic media by persons other than ERIC employees and its system contractors requires permission from the copyright holder. Exception is made for non-profit reproduction by libraries and other service agencies to satisfy information needs of educators in response to discrete inquiries.

Signature: [Signature]

Printed Name/Position/Title: Stephanie Curenton, M.A.

University of Virginia, Psychology, PO Box 400400, Charlottesville, VA 22903-4400

Telephone: 804-982-4750  FAX: 804-982-4766
E-Mail Address: smc4u@virginia.edu  Date: 11/30/00
III. DOCUMENT AVAILABILITY INFORMATION (FROM NON-ERIC SOURCE):

If permission to reproduce is not granted to ERIC, or, if you wish ERIC to cite the availability of the document from another source, please provide the following information regarding the availability of the document. (ERIC will not announce a document unless it is publicly available, and a dependable source can be specified. Contributors should also be aware that ERIC selection criteria are significantly more stringent for documents that cannot be made available through EDRS.)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Publisher/Distributor:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Address:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Price:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

IV. REFERRAL OF ERIC TO COPYRIGHT/REPRODUCTION RIGHTS HOLDER:

If the right to grant this reproduction release is held by someone other than the addressee, please provide the appropriate name and address:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Address:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

V. WHERE TO SEND THIS FORM:

Send this form to the following ERIC Clearinghouse:
University of North Carolina at Greensboro
ERIC/CASS
201 Ferguson Building
PO Box 26171
Greensboro, NC 27402-6171

However, if solicited by the ERIC Facility, or if making an unsolicited contribution to ERIC, return this form (and the document being contributed) to:

ERIC Processing and Reference Facility
4483-A Forbes Boulevard
Lanham, Maryland 20706

Telephone: 301-552-4200
Toll Free: 800-799-3742
FAX: 301-552-4700
e-mail: ericfac@inet.ed.gov
WWW: http://ericfac.piccard.csc.com

EFF-088 (Rev. 2/2000)