In previous research, children's empathy has been positively related to guilt and unrelated to shame. In the present study, it was predicted that guilt and empathy would have a curvilinear relationship, while shame and empathy were expected to be inversely related. Participating were 115 children: somewhat less than half were ages 8-9 years, while the remainder were 11-12 years old. Children completed the Test of Self-Conscious Affect--Children's Version (Tangney, Wagner, Burggraf, Gramzow, and Fletcher, 1990) and the Empathy Continuum (Strayer, 1993). Results were found to be conditional upon children's age and sex. Guilt and empathy were negatively related in younger boys; in all other groups guilt and empathy were positively related. Shame and empathy were negatively related in younger girls, and positively related in all other groups. Results suggested that guilt and shame undergo notable change in middle childhood. (Contains 11 references.) (Author/EV)
Guilt and shame in middle childhood: Relationships with empathic responsiveness

Sara Fraser & Janet Strayer
Simon Fraser University

Poster session presented at the biennial meeting of the Society for Research in Child Development, Washington, DC (April, 1997).
Abstract

In previous research, children’s empathy was positively related to guilt and unrelated to shame. In the present study, it was predicted that guilt and empathy would have a curvilinear relationship while shame and empathy were expected to be inversely related.

One-hundred and fifteen children participated: 24 8-9 year old boys, 24 8-9 year old girls, 38 11-12 year old boys, and 25 11-12 year old girls. Children completed the Test of Self-Conscious Affect-Children’s version (Tangney, Wagner, Burggraf, Gramzow, & Fletcher, 1990), and the Empathy Continuum (Strayer, 1993).

Present results were found to be conditional upon children’s age and sex. Guilt and empathy were negatively related in younger boys; in all other groups guilt and empathy were positively related. Shame and empathy were negatively related in younger girls, and positively related in all other groups. Present results suggest that guilt and shame undergo notable change in middle childhood.
Introduction

→ Guilt and shame operate at different levels of self-evaluation (Lewis, 1971; Tangney, 1995):
  
  - **GUILT** focuses on one’s **ACTIONS**
  
  - **SHAME** focuses on the **SELF**

→ This differential foci underlies proposed differences in how guilt and shame relate to empathy:
  
  - guilt allows for a greater other-oriented, empathic stance
  
  - shame engenders intense self-focus which should interfere with empathy

→ **Research with children** (Tangney, Burggraf, Wagner, Gramzow, & Fletcher, 1991):
  
  - guilt showed positive relationships with other-oriented empathy
  
  - shame appeared unrelated to children’s empathy

**Hypotheses**

1) Children’s guilt scores were predicted to show a curvilinear relationship to empathy scores:
   
   - children with moderate guilt scores should show higher empathy scores
   
   - children with extreme guilt scores (either high or low) should show lower empathy scores

2) Children’s shame scores were predicted to show an inverse, linear relationship with scores on a measure of empathic responsiveness.

3) Examination of age and gender effects were **exploratory**.
Method

Subjects:

- 24 8-9 year old boys (M=107.1 months)
- 24 8-9 year old girls (M=107.1 months)
- 38 11-12 year old boys (M=145.9 months)
- 25 11-12 year old girls (M=141.9 months)

Measures:

1) The Test of Self-Conscious Affect - Children's Version (Tangney, Wagner, Burggraf, Gramzow, & Fletcher, 1990)
2) The Empathy Continuum (Strayer, 1993)

Results

Summary of Correlations between Guilt, Shame, and Empathy in the 4 Age X Gender Groups.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>EMPATHY</th>
<th>GUILT</th>
<th>SHAME</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Young Boys</td>
<td>-.15</td>
<td>+.24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Young Girls</td>
<td>+.18</td>
<td>-.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Older Boys</td>
<td>+.24</td>
<td>+.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Older Girls</td>
<td>+.25</td>
<td>+.49*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*p<.05

As can be seen above, the pattern of relationships among guilt, shame and empathy was different depending upon age and gender. Therefore, exploratory analyses, using principal components analytic procedures, were conducted in order to explore the relationships among the variables within Age X Gender groups. The results
of these principal component analyses, illustrating the relationships among the
variables in each of the Age X Gender groups, can seen in Figures One through to
Four. Additionally, as has been seen in previous research using the TOSCA-C, guilt
and shame scores showed significant, positive correlations overall, and within Age
(younger, older) and Gender (boys, girls) groups.
Figure 1: Principal component loadings of Guilt, Shame, and Empathy for Younger Boys.
Figure 2: Principal component loadings of Guilt, Shame, and Empathy for Younger Girls.

PC 1

PC 2

Empathy (.01, .97)

Guilt (.84, .29)

Shame (.86, -.24)
Figure 3: Principal component loadings of Guilt, Shame, and Empathy for Older Boys.
Figure 4: Principal component loadings of Guilt, Shame, and Empathy for Older Girls.

PC 1

PC 2

Guilt (.17, .98)

Shame (.80, .28)

Empathy (.88, -.06)
Conclusions

- The present results suggest that the relationships between guilt, shame and empathy are more complex than were originally hypothesized.

- The most notable result of the present study is the finding that the relationships of guilt and shame to empathy are conditional upon children's age and gender.

- Previous research has treated children between 8 and 12 as a homogeneous group. The present results suggest that this approach may mask important age and gender differences in guilt and shame during middle childhood.

Future Directions

- Future research investigating guilt and shame in children should consider age and gender effects on the relationships between self-conscious emotions and other important developmental variables. Guilt and shame appear to have different functional roles depending on age and gender that will be important to clarify with future research.

- In the present study, the measures of guilt, shame and empathy differed in their presentation format: the TOSCA-C is a paper-and-pencil questionnaire, whereas the Empathy Continuum is a quasi-naturalistic interview measure. Future research could investigate whether this difference in format may have important implications for observed relationships between guilt, shame and empathy.
References


# Guilt and shame in middle childhood: Relationships with empathic responsiveness

**Title:** Guilt and shame in middle childhood: Relationships with empathic responsiveness  
**Author(s):** Sara Fraser & Janet Strayer  
**Corporate Source:** Simon Fraser University  
**Publication Date:** April, 1997

**I. DOCUMENT IDENTIFICATION:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Guilt and shame in middle childhood: Relationships with empathic responsiveness</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Sara Fraser &amp; Janet Strayer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corporate Source</td>
<td>Simon Fraser University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publication Date</td>
<td>April, 1997</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**II. REPRODUCTION RELEASE:**

In order to disseminate as widely as possible timely and significant materials of interest to the educational community, documents announced in the monthly abstract journal of the ERIC system, Resources in Education (RIE), are usually made available to users in microfiche, reproduced paper copy, and electronic/optical media, and sold through the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS) or other ERIC vendors. Credit is given to the source of each document, and, if reproduction release is granted, one of the following notices is affixed to the document.

If permission is granted to reproduce and disseminate the identified document, please CHECK ONE of the following two options and sign at the bottom of the page.

**Check here**  
For Level 1 Release:  
Permitting reproduction in microfiche (4" x 6" film) or other ERIC archival media (e.g., electronic or optical) and paper copy.

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 1 documents

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY  
Sample  
TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

**Level 1**

**Check here**  
For Level 2 Release:  
Permitting reproduction in microfiche (4" x 6" film) or other ERIC archival media (e.g., electronic or optical), but not in paper copy.

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 2 documents

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL IN OTHER THAN PAPER COPY HAS BEEN GRANTED BY  
Sample  
TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

**Level 2**

Documents will be processed as indicated provided reproduction quality permits. If permission to reproduce is granted, but neither box is checked, documents will be processed at Level 1.

"I hereby grant to the Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) nonexclusive permission to reproduce and disseminate this document as indicated above. Reproduction from the ERIC microfiche or electronic/optical media by persons other than ERIC employees and its system contractors requires permission from the copyright holder. Exception is made for non-profit reproduction by libraries and other service agencies to satisfy information needs of educators in response to discrete inquiries."

**Sign here please**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Signature</th>
<th>Sara Fraser</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organization/Address</td>
<td>Dept. of Psychology, Simon Fraser University, Burnaby, BC, CANADA, V5A 1S6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telephone</td>
<td>(604) 291-3354</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAX</td>
<td>(604) 299-1239</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-Mail Address</td>
<td><a href="mailto:asfraser@netcom.ca">asfraser@netcom.ca</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>97/11/21</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
August 22, 1997

Dear Colleague:

After doing a blanket solicitation for papers at the 62nd Biennial Meeting of the Society for Research in Child Development held in Washington, D.C., April 3-6, 1997, I am now contacting individual presenters, particularly in our scope of early childhood through early adolescence, to consider sending two copies of your presentations for possible inclusion in the ERIC database. As you may know, ERIC (the Educational Resources Information Center) is a federally-sponsored information system for the field of education. Its main product is the ERIC database, the world’s largest source of education information. The Clearinghouse on Elementary and Early Childhood Education is one of sixteen subject-specialized clearinghouses making up the ERIC system. We collect and disseminate information relating to all aspects of children’s development, care, and education.

Ideally, your paper should be at least eight pages long and not have been published elsewhere at the time of submission. Announcement in ERIC does not prevent you from publishing your paper elsewhere because you still retain complete copyright. Your paper will be reviewed and we will let you know within six weeks if it has been accepted.

Please complete and sign the reproduction release on the back of this letter and return it with two copies of your presentation to ERIC/EECE. If you have any questions, please call me at (800) 583-4135 or by (e-mail at ksmith5@uiuc.edu). I look forward to hearing from you soon.

Sincerely,

Karen E. Smith
Acquisitions Coordinator

Enclosures