Educators are beginning to look at authentic assessment as a valid alternative to standardized tests and traditional objective tests. Although authentic assessment means different things to different people, it is understood to focus on whether or not students can use the skills and strategies they have learned and apply them in appropriate situations. Two important tools for authentic assessment are learning logs and reflective journals kept by students. To use these tools appropriately, educators should keep in mind the multiple intelligences identified by Howard Gardner (1983). Successful use of any authentic assessment approach requires specific criteria for the assignment developed by the teacher and students, along with examples that show students acceptable performance and opportunities to engage in higher order thinking. Likert scales, other evaluative scales, and descriptive scales are other tools that can be used in authentic assessment. Among the variety of other assessment tools for authentic assessment is the observation checklist, which focuses on the process more than the final product. Students need to learn to regard both process and product, but no one strategy for assessment is best. The tools discussed in this paper help students monitor their own learning and internalize the process of learning and evaluation. (Contains 9 figures and 19 references.) (SLD)
Assessing Thoughtfulness: A New Paradigm

Sister Linda Conrad, S.N.D.

Center for Excellence in Education

Notre Dame College of Ohio

South Euclid, Ohio
Assessing Thoughtfulness

Most educators would agree that we are living in the midst of what has been called a “knowledge explosion.” It has been estimated by some researchers that our “knowledge base” changes at a rate of 80% every five years (Lazear, 1994). If this is true, then educators must ask themselves some serious questions about what they are teaching and assessing in our schools. Should we be focusing on student’s learning certain specific bits of information that will likely change several times before they graduate from high school? Or should we be more concerned with teaching them how to think and process information?

As we move to redefine what it is that we are about in education we must also redefine what it is that we mean by assessment. For so many educators assessment, evaluation of student learning, is a dreaded aspect of their teaching. Many teachers agonize over report cards. They know all too well how difficult it is to put a grade or percent on what a student knows, can do, or feels. Grades mean promotion from one grade to another. Grades are a “status” symbol for some students and their parents. Grades can be used to determine who is and who is not in a gifted program. Grades mean being on the honor roll and receiving recognition. Grades determine whether or not a student remains on an athletic team. Grades determine retention or failure. Grades -- not an easy part of an educators job as they can affect a student’s self-
Assessing Thoughtfulness

esteem, self-confidence, motivation, and the future of that student (Burke, 1994).

So, one asks, what is assessment? How can it be a meaningful part of the schooling process? The root word of assessment - assess - comes from the Latin word “assidere” which means to sit beside, to observe, talk with, and learn from and with another (McTighe, 1993). Wiggins (1989) defines authentic assessment as assessment in which students must perform exemplary tasks that are typically required when one has mastered a particular discipline. Other definitions of assessment follow.

- Methods that emphasize learning and thinking, especially higher order thinking skills such as problem solving.
- Tasks that focus on student’s ability to produce a quality product or performance.
- Meaningful tasks at which students should learn to excel.
- Challenges that require knowledge in good use and good judgment.
- An examination of differences between trivial school tasks and more meaningful performance in non-school settings (Burke, 1994).

There are many definitions for the term “assessment.” Today, however, educators must begin to look upon authentic assessment as a valid alternative to standardized tests and
the traditional true/false or multiple choice tests. Today's emphasis on assessment must refer to the direct examination of student performance on significant tasks that are relevant to life outside of the school (Worthen, 1993).

Authentic assessment means many things to many people. Archbald and Newmann (1988) perhaps say it best: "A valid assessment system provides information about the particular tasks on which students succeed or fail, but more importantly, it also presents tasks that are worthwhile, significant, and meaningful - in short, authentic" (p. 1).

With these definitions in mind one can see that authentic assessment focuses on whether or not students can use the skills or strategies learned and apply them in appropriate situations. This, then, leads one to ask: "what does authentic assessment look like?" Perhaps before this question is answered a word of caution needs to be uttered. Archbald and Newmann (1988) believe that before educators try to assess authentically, they should make sure they teach authentically. To do so teachers must start with prior knowledge, build on this knowledge, work to integrate the curriculum, show relationships, and finally, show how the knowledge fits together as a whole. Teachers must also show that what they are teaching has some value outside the classroom. Students should not be learning something just to "pass a test".

What does authentic assessment look like? Authentic
assessment is part of regular classroom lessons and activities and occurs regularly throughout the year. Authentic assessment measures relevant real-life skills. Authentic assessment encourages higher order thinking and creativity in projects, writing, and open-ended questions. Authentic assessment allows students to demonstrate their knowledge in various ways (Learning Magazine, 1995). It teaches students how to meet challenges; how to adapt, transfer, and integrate the content they learn in school into the task of daily living. Through authentic assessment educators have the power to create thoughtful environments that will model the very behaviors they wish to cultivate in their students.

The question that is now posed is if educators begin to teach authentically, then how are students authentically assessed? There are many authors who have tried to help educators understand how to authentically assess students. Persons such as James Bellanca, Carolyn Chapman, and Elizabeth Swartz (1994), Kay Burke (1994), Linda and Bruce Campbell and Dee Dickinson (1992), Carolyn Chapman (1993), and David Lazear (1994) have written books and presented teachers with "tools" to assist them in assessing students authentically. Some of these assessment tools will be presented in this paper so as to give teachers the necessary instruments they need when they begin to shift to this new paradigm of assessment.
Learning logs and reflective journals are beginning to play a more important role in education. These tools were often used by English teachers but educators are finding that they have much value in any subject taught.

**LEARNING LOGS**

Learning logs can be used after direct instruction or a lecture. Students would be asked to take 5-7 minutes and write the key ideas from the discussion and explain how this lesson connects with ideas which the student has. If the student has questions these can be included in the learning log as well. Students then spend five minutes sharing their logs with a partner or in their cooperative groups. They discuss the key ideas they have written and try to answer any questions the group members may have. The teacher then reinforces the important information and answers any other questions the students may still have. By following this reflective process the students will retain key ideas, their writing skills will improve, and the students who need more time to process information will find the reflective learning log very helpful (Burke, 1994).

**JOURNALS**

Journals are another useful assessment tool. Journals are usually written in a narrative style and deal more with feelings, opinions, or personal experiences related to the lesson or activity the students have engaged in. A journal entry is usually longer, free-flowing, and more descriptive
than a learning log. In a journal students are encouraged to connect what they have just learned with material they are learning in other classes. They are also encouraged to relate the material with their everyday lives outside of the classroom.

Research on the use of learning logs and journals in the classroom has been done by Brownlie, Close, and Wingren (1988), Jeroski, Brownlie, and Kaser (1990), Barrell (1992), and Costa, Bellanca, and Fogarty (1992). These authors recommend the use of learning logs and journals in the following ways:

1. To record key ideas from a lecture, movie, presentation, field trip, or reading assignments.

2. To make predictions about what will happen next in a story, movie, experiment, the weather, or in school, national, or world events.

3. To record questions.

4. To summarize the main ideas of a book, movie, lecture, or reading.

5. To reflect on the material presented.

6. To connect the ideas presented to other subject areas or to the students' personal lives.

7. To monitor change in an experiment or event over time.

8. To respond to questions posed by the teacher or
other students.

9. To brainstorm ideas about potential projects, papers, or presentations.

10. To help identify problems.

11. To record problem-solving techniques.

12. To keep track of the number of problems solved, books read, or homework assignments completed (Burke, 1994, P. 86).

Certain prompts or lead-ins can also be used to promote higher order thinking. Some examples of prompts or lead-ins might be:

At the beginning of the lesson:
+ What questions do you have from yesterday?
+ Write two important points from yesterday's lesson.

In the middle of the lesson:
+ What do you want to know more about?
+ How is this like something else you are familiar with?
+ Is this easy or hard for you? Explain why.

At the end of the lesson:
+ Something I heard that surprised me...
+ How will you use this outside of class?

On the group process:
+ I helped my group’s thinking forward because...
+ The group helped my thinking because...
+ An example of collaboration today was...

Fogarty and Bellanca (1987) suggest lead-ins that encourage the students to analyze, synthesize, and evaluate:
Assessing Thoughtfulness

+One thing I'm excited about is...because...
+I hate it when...because...
+This is like a movie I saw...because...

There are different ways to assess the learning logs and journals. Some teachers assign points. Such as:

- 20 points for completing the logs or journals
- 10 points for completing the logs or journal on time
- 15 points for originality
- 15 points for evidence of higher-order thinking
- 15 points for making connections
- 25 points for personal reflection

Such a point system can be used in any number of ways. A teacher may want to zero in on just two or three of the above criteria, change the number of points, or change the criteria to meet the needs of the students. Some teachers may prefer to use a Likert scale and measure such criteria as:

- descriptive words
- number of entries
- length of response
- use of concrete images
- dialogue
- connections to other subjects
- thoughtfulness
- originality
- creativity

A Likert scale may look something like the one presented on the next page (Burke, 1994):
Another way to assess a learning log or journal might be the use of the following format (Burke, 1994):

Other assessment possibilities for teachers could be that students just turn the learning logs or journals in periodically for feedback from the teacher and/or a grade provided that the criteria for the grading was set ahead of time and the students knew what was being graded. Students may wish to share their journals and logs with a partner and/or the cooperative learning group who may give oral and/or written feedback on predetermined criteria. Students and/or teachers may select a few entries to be rewritten and
submitted for a grade or to be placed in the portfolio.

There is no limit to the ways a learning log or journal can be used in the classroom. Examples of the learning log and journal methods of authentic assessment are presented on the next two pages.

According to the new cognitive perspective, learning must be meaningful and constructive. Students should be able to show teachers they can apply the knowledge they have learned to real life situations. How does a paper and pencil test adequately demonstrate what a student knows when all students do not learn in the same way?

Howard Gardner (1983, 1993) suggests in his theory of multiple intelligences that there are at least seven intelligences possessed by each person.

- **Verbal/Linguistic** - This intelligence is related to both written and spoken words and language. This form of intelligence dominates our Western educational system.
- **Logical/Mathematical** - This intelligence deals with deductive thinking and reasoning. In addition, it deals with numbers, and the recognition of abstract patterns.
- **Visual/Spatial** - This intelligence relies on the sense of sight, on being able to visualize an object, and on the ability to create internal mental images/pictures.
- **Body/Kinesthetic** - This intelligence is related to physical movement and the knowledge/wisdom of the body. This includes the brain's motor cortex which controls body
**Assessing Thoughtfulness**

---

**MATH LOG**

1. Write your number problem.

   \[ \frac{5}{2} = 2 \frac{1}{2} \]

2. Draw the problem.

   \[ O \bigcirc \bigcirc \bigcirc \bigcirc \bigcirc \]

3. Explain the problem to a partner.

   My mom left five cookies for my sister and me after school. We decided to split them and each eat two and a half cookies.

---

**DOUBBLE-ENTRY JOURNAL**

**Name:** Juan  
**Grade:** 7  
**Topic:** Home Economics  
**Date:** September 3

**Initial Observation (Sept. 3)**

I think it's really stupid that boys have to take Home Economics. Why should I have to learn to sew and cook—I don't plan on ever doing it—I'd rather take a computer or another physical education course. There's only five guys in this class. I'm going to go to my counselor during homeroom tomorrow and try to Get Out Of Here!

**Upon Reflection (Sept. 15)**

Well, the counselor said all the sections of computer were full—so I'm stuck in here for the quarter.

I still don't believe it but my Apple Brown Betty was pretty good! I guess it wouldn't hurt to learn a few cooking tricks—maybe this won't be so bad.

---

**JOURNAL STEMS**

**Student:** Penny  
**Topic:** Social Studies  
**Date:** Sept. 10  
**Grade:** 10

Select one of the following stem statements to use in your journal entry:

**Stem Statements**

A. The best part about...  
B. An interesting part is...  
C. I predict...  
D. I wonder...  
E. How...  
F. Why...  
G. A connecting idea is...  
H. I believe...

**Journal Entry:**

I predict that P.E. classes will be required for all students through 12th grade. Right now it is an elective after 10th grade, but one of the most important things in life is staying healthy. Exercise is a life skill that is as important as English or math.

---

**PROBLEM-SOLVING LOG**

**Name:** Jeff  
**Class:** Comp 101  
**Date:** September 10

**My problem is...**

1. I'm stuck on... choosing a thesis statement for my research paper
2. The best way to think about this is... writing a statement that states my opinion
3. Something that is similar to this problem is... my senior year research paper
4. A question I still have is... Do I have three major subpoints for the thesis?
5. One solution I think could work is... doing some preliminary research
6. I need help with... writing the statement so it is parallel

©1993 by IRIS/ Skylight Publishing, Inc.
REFLECTIVE LESSON LOG

Directions: Try using this log with your students during a lecture.

Name: ___________________________ Date: ____________

Topic: __________________________________________

1. Key ideas from this discussion ____________________
   _______________________________________________
   _______________________________________________
   _______________________________________________
   _______________________________________________
   _______________________________________________

2. Connections I can make with other ideas ___________
   _______________________________________________
   _______________________________________________
   _______________________________________________
   _______________________________________________
   _______________________________________________

3. Questions I still have ___________________________
   _______________________________________________
   _______________________________________________
   _______________________________________________
   _______________________________________________
Assessing Thoughtfulness

motion.

Musical/Tonal - This intelligence is based on the recognition of tonal patterns, including various environmental sounds, and on a sensitivity to rhythm and beats.

Interpersonal - This intelligence operates primarily through person-to-person relationships and communication. It relies on all other intelligences.

Intrapersonal - This intelligence relates to inner states of being, self-reflection, metacognition, and awareness of spiritual realities.

When thinking about authentic assessment it is critical to keep Gardner's theory in mind. Students may need to demonstrate what they have learned in a more meaningful way than a simple multiple choice test. Students may prefer to use a graphic organizer, a mind-map, write a song, rap, poem, or story. Some students may use a flow chart, mural, collage, or sculpture to demonstrate their meaningful learning. Other students may produce a video, give a speech or produce a play or mime.

The following page, taken from David Lazear's book entitled *Multiple Intelligence Approaches to Assessment*, offers many suggestions of possible ways students can apply what they have learned.

Guidelines, however, need to be considered when students are asked to prepare a performance, exhibition,
### Multiple Intelligence Assessment Menu

#### Verbal-Linguistic Intelligence (Language Arts-Based Assessment Instruments)
- written essays
- vocabulary quizzes
- recall of verbal information
- audiocassette recordings
- poetry writing
- linguistic humor
- formal speech
- cognitive debates
- listening and reporting
- learning logs and journals

#### Logical-Mathematical Intelligence (Cognitive Patterns-Based Assessment Instruments)
- cognitive organizers
- higher-order reasoning
- pattern games
- outlining
- logic and rationality exercises
- mental menus and formulas
- deductive reasoning
- inductive reasoning
- calculation processes
- logical analysis and critique

#### Visual-Spatial Intelligence (Imaginal-Based Assessment Instruments)
- murals and montages
- graphic representation and visual illustrating
- visualization and imagination
- reading, understanding, and creating maps
- flowcharts and graphs
- sculpting and building
- imaginary conversations
- mind mapping
- video recording and photography
- manipulative demonstrations

#### Musical-Rhythmic Intelligence (Auditory-Based Assessment Instruments)
- creating concept songs and raps
- illustrating with sound
- discerning rhythmic patterns
- composing music
- linking music and rhythm with concepts
- orchestrating music
- creating percussion patterns
- recognizing tonal patterns and quality
- analyzing musical structure
- reproducing musical and rhythmic patterns

#### Interpersonal Intelligence (Relational-Based Assessment Instruments)
- group "jigsaws"
- explaining to or teaching another
- "think-pair-share"
- "round robin"
- giving and receiving feedback
- interviews, questionnaires, and people searches
- empathic processing
- random group quizzes
- assess your teammates
- test, coach, and retest

#### Bodily-Kinesthetic Intelligence (Performance-Based Assessment Instruments)
- lab experiments
- dramatization
- original and classical dance
- charades and mimes
- impersonations
- human tableaux
- invention projects
- physical exercise routines and games
- skill demonstrations
- illustrations using body language and gestures

#### Intrapersonal Intelligence (Psychological-Based Assessment Instruments)
- autobiographical reporting
- personal application scenarios
- metacognitive surveys and questionnaires
- higher-order questions and answers
- concentration tests
- feelings diaries and logs
- personal projection
- self-identification reporting
- personal history correlation
- personal priorities and goals
or project. These guidelines may include:

- Specific criteria for the assignment developed by the teacher and students. Criteria for the projects may include some of the following: timeliness, originality, creativity, quality, appearance, organization, evidence of understanding, transfer of skills, richness of ideas, and presentation. Specific indicators under each criterion must be established as well so that students, peers, and teachers can assess the final project.
- Students must see examples of projects or performances that are acceptable and not acceptable according to the criteria that has been established.
- Choices of topics should be given to the students.
- Students can use their multiple intelligences.
- Learner outcomes are listed and monitored.
- Students are provided opportunities to engage in higher order thinking, problem solving, and decision making.
- Students are given time to think about how they approach learning tasks and share how they plan, monitor, and evaluate their thinking (metacognition and reflection).
- Students share performance, exhibition, or project with class and/or an outside audience.
- Teacher and students provide feedback which is prompt, positive, and specific.
Assessing Thoughtfulness

- Students are given time for self-evaluation (Burke, 1994).

Much time and effort is put into producing a quality project but the advantages far outweigh the disadvantages. A project, performance, and/or exhibition provide the following advantages to students.

- Allows students time to formulate their own questions and then try to find answers to them.
- Provide students with opportunities to use their multiple intelligences to create a product.
- Allows teachers to assign projects at different levels of difficulty to account for individual learning styles and ability levels.
- Can be motivating to students.
- Provide an opportunity for positive interactions and collaboration among peers.
- Provide an alternative for students who have problems reading and writing.
- Increases the self-esteem of students who would not get recognition on tests and traditional writing assignments.
- Allows students to share their learning and accomplishments with other students, classes, parents, or community members.
- Students can achieve essential learning outcomes through application and transfer (Burke, 1994).
Asking students to do a project, exhibit, or performance is not a new idea for teachers, but the whole idea of authentic assessment is not something teachers are adequately doing.

The Likert scale is one assessment tool that can be used very easily by the students as well as by the teacher. On the following two pages there are examples of Likert scales. It is important to remember that the criteria and rubrics used be discussed with the students so they feel ownership of the assessment tool.

Another scale used for assessment is the Descriptive scale. This scale, as explained by Herman, Aschbacher, and Winters (1992) does not use explicit standards to judge a project, exhibit, or performance, but rather neutral terms are used. A descriptive scale might look like the one which follows below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Descriptive Scale</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No evidence... minimal evidence... Partial evidence... Complete evidence...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Task not attempted... Partial completion... Completed... Goes beyond...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Off task... Attempts to address task... Minimal attention to task... Addresses task but no elaboration... Fully elaborated and attentive to task and audience...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Herman, Aschbacher, and Winters, 1992, p. 67).
### Verbal Skills Rubric

**Name:** Mary  
**Date:** May 19

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ORAL LANGUAGE</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Verbal in Class</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Talks with Friends</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Talks in Class</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Talks in Sentences</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>READING</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reads Own Name</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Knows Key Words</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knows Key Words</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>WRITING</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scribbles</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Can Write First Name</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Can Write Words</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Oral Presentation Rubric

**Name:** Mary  
**Date:** October 3

**Subject:** Science Project  
**Final Grade:** 4

The subject is addressed clearly  
Speech is loud enough and easy to understand  
Visual aid is used effectively  
Well-organized  

The subject is addressed adequately  
Speech has appropriate volume  
Eye contact is intermittent  
Visual aid helps presentations  
Good organization  

Speech needs more explanation  
Speech is difficult to understand at times  
Speech gets "off track" in places  

Speech does not address topic  
Speech cannot be heard  

Lack of adequate eye contact  
Poor visual aid  
Lack of organization  

Scale: 5 = A; 4 = B; 3 = C; 2 = D; 1 = Not Yet

General Comments: You did a good job demonstrating your project and delivering the speech. Your organization, however, was a little sloppy and you read your notes too much.

### Group Project Rubric

**Name:** Sue, Pete, and Joe  
**Date:** November 5

**Topic:** Historical Re-enactment of the Scopes Monkey Trial

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accuracy of Information</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smattering of Applause</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Standing Ovation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Round of Applause</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Costumes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smattering of Applause</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Standing Ovation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Round of Applause</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dialogue</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smattering of Applause</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Standing Ovation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Round of Applause</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acting Ability</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smattering of Applause</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Standing Ovation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Round of Applause</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Total Grade: 17 points divided by 4 = 4.2

Comments: Your group created costumes and dialogue that enhanced your performance. You had two factual errors in your courtroom scene that lowered your accuracy grade. Also, two characters had trouble remembering their lines.

### Weighted Writing Rubric

**Name:** Mary  
**Date:** May 23

**Piece of Writing:** Persuasive Paper

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Score (1-5)</th>
<th>Score: 1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CONTENT</td>
<td>evidence of reason • key ideas covered • appropriate quotes • supportive statistics • topic addressed</td>
<td>Score 4 x 7 = 28 (35)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ORGANIZATION</td>
<td>creative introduction • thesis statement • appropriate support statements • effective transition</td>
<td>Score 5 x 6 = 30 (30)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USAGE</td>
<td>correct subject-verb agreement • correct run-ons, fragments, or comma splices • correct verb tense • mix of simple and complex sentences</td>
<td>Score 3 x 5 = 15 (25)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MECHANICS</td>
<td>few or no misspellings • correct use of punctuation • correct use of capitalization</td>
<td>Score 5 x 2 = 10 (10)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Scale: 93-100=A, 87-92=B, 78-86=C, 70-77=D, Below 70 = Not Yet

Total Score: 83 (100)

Comments: Your content and organization are good, but you need to work on your sentence structure. 1 comma splice.

©1993 by IRISkylight Publishing, Inc.
Assessing Thoughtfulness

**MYTHOLOGICAL RAP SONG**

Assignments: Students will work in groups to write and present a rap song about the gods and goddesses in Greek mythology.

SCORING RUBRIC

1. Criterion: Accuracy of Information
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes, Yes!
   - Many factual errors
   - Some errors
   - No errors

2. Criterion: Music (Words, beat, rhythm)
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes, Yes!
   - Words & music do not match
   - Some problems
   - Everything jives

3. Criterion: Costumes do not match gods
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes, Yes!
   - Costumes are appropriate
   - All costumes appropriate
   - Costumes are not appropriate

4. Criterion: Presentation
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes, Yes!
   - Some glitches
   - No glitches

COMMENTS: You did an excellent job creating the music and costumes and singing the song. You did, however, confuse Zeus and Apollo in some of your stories.

**PAMPHLET ON A DISEASE**

Assignment: Each group selects and researches a disease and prepares an instructional pamphlet to present to the class.

SCORING RUBRIC

1. Criterion: Quality of Research
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes!
   - 1 Source
   - 2 Sources
   - 3 Sources
   - 4 Sources
   - 5 Sources

2. Criterion: Question and Answer Section
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes!
   - Many factual errors
   - Some factual errors
   - No factual errors

3. Criterion: Graphics
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes!
   - No graphics
   - Graphics that explain disease
   - Graphics that instruct as well as dazzle!

4. Criterion: Costume and props
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes!
   - No evidence
   - Some evidence
   - Much evidence

5. Criterion: Closing Statements
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes!
   - No statement
   - Adequate closing statement
   - Commendable closing statement

COMMENTS: You need to use more computer graphics to make your pamphlet more attractive.

**THE MEETING OF THE MINDS**

Assignment: Each student will select a famous writer, artist, politician, or philosopher from the Renaissance period and become that person on a panel of experts.

SCORING RUBRIC

1. Criterion: Research on person and time period
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes!
   - Little evidence
   - Some evidence
   - Much evidence

2. Criterion: Responses to questions addressed to panel members
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes!
   - Incorrect responses
   - Adequate responses
   - Competent responses

3. Criterion: Costume and props for person from the Renaissance
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes!
   - None
   - Questionable
   - Authentic

4. Criterion: Closing Statements
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes!
   - No statement
   - Adequate closing statement
   - Commendable closing statement

COMMENTS: It is evident that your knowledge of Dante is extensive. You responded to questions beautifully. Perhaps, however, you could have brought another prop besides a book of matches to symbolize the Inferno!

**VIDEO TAPE COMMUNITY PROJECT**

Group: Mary Sam Pete Date: November 3
Type of Project: Videotape of Community Project

Evaluation:
- Teacher
- Group members
- Self

Brief Description: We videotaped students in our class who spent Saturdays volunteering at a retirement home.

CRITERIA WE DEVELOPED FOR ASSESSMENT:

1. CONTENT: Did we include key scenes that conveyed the relationships between the students and the elderly people they helped?
   - Little evidence
   - Some evidence
   - Much evidence

2. NARRATION: Did we frame the pictures with words that captured the tone and emotion of the scenes?
   - Little evidence
   - Some evidence
   - Much evidence

3. SOUND: Was the narration and the dialogue in the video clear and distinct?
   - Little evidence
   - Some evidence
   - Much evidence

4. PHOTOGRAPHY: Did the camera work to enhance the video?
   - Little evidence
   - Some evidence
   - Much evidence

5. MUSIC: Did the background music contribute to the video's overall effectiveness?
   - Little evidence
   - Some evidence
   - Much evidence

COMMENTS: We need to work on our narration because it detracts from the video.

**THE MEETING OF THE MINDS**

Assignment: Each student will select a famous writer, artist, politician, or philosopher from the Renaissance period and become that person on a panel of experts.

SCORING RUBRIC

1. Criterion: Research on person and time period
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes!
   - Little evidence
   - Some evidence
   - Much evidence

2. Criterion: Responses to questions addressed to panel members
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes!
   - Incorrect responses
   - Adequate responses
   - Competent responses

3. Criterion: Costume and props for person from the Renaissance
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes!
   - None
   - Questionable
   - Authentic

4. Criterion: Closing Statements
   - Not Yet
   - Almost There
   - Yes, Yes!
   - No statement
   - Adequate closing statement
   - Commendable closing statement

COMMENTS: It is evident that your knowledge of Dante is extensive. You responded to questions beautifully. Perhaps, however, you could have brought another prop besides a book of matches to symbolize the Inferno!
The Evaluative scale uses grades. Herman, Aschbacher, and Winters (1992) explain that the evaluative scale requires scoring criteria that include standards of excellence, competence, or significant outcomes. An evaluative scale may look like this:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Student addresses topic logically and used effective delivery style to present case.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Student addressed topic in organized way and used effective speaking techniques.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Student addressed topic but did not use effective speaking techniques (eye contact, gestures).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>Student did not address the topic.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>Student did not give speech (Burke, 1994, p. 65).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It does not matter which assessment tool is used, but it is crucial that one is chosen and the students have had some input into the criteria by which a project, performance, and/or product is to be assessed.

There are many assessment tools and much more that can be said about authentic assessment. This paper has only touched the “tip of the iceberg” so to speak. I would like to conclude with one more assessment tool: the observation checklist. Checklists are based on rubrics and need to focus on the learning process rather than on the final product. It is important that the students understand that not only is the final product important, but it is also important to look at the process of learning.

Teachers can use checklists to focus on thinking skills,
or any other specific behavior. Teachers also need to emphasize the importance of self-assessment and self-reflection (metacognition). Students can learn to reflect and assess their progress using checklists. From the checklists students can develop an improvement plan and set goals for themselves.

The students need to know what behaviors/skills the teacher is targeting so teachers should discuss with the class what skills are being targeted. The sample T-chart and matrix on the following page are two examples of ways to help students understand what is being observed and assessed on the checklist. Because observation is one of the most effective ways for a teacher to determine what students can do and what they are learning the checklist is a very valuable tool. On page twenty-four examples of four different checklists that can be used in the classroom are presented.

Are checklists the best means of assessment? Authentic assessment requires many different approaches. No one strategy is the best. As in all educational actions, there needs to be a balance with regard to the types of assessment tools used in the classroom.

Using different assessment tools in the classroom enriches the lives of the students and enhances the academics. Glover, Ronning, and Bruning (1990) explain that
ENCOURAGEMENT

What does it look like? | What does it sound like?
---|---
1. Looking at the person who is talking. | 1. "I like that idea."
2. Nodding your head. | 2. "Tell me more."
3. Patting the person on the back. | 3. "What do you think?"
4. Using a sign like "thumbs-up" or "high-five." | 4. "Good job."
5. Applauding appropriately. | 5. "We really want your opinion."

For example, if students are going to be observed on persistence, they should work with the teacher to list observable indicators of persistence:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion—&quot;Persistence&quot;</th>
<th>Observed Frequently</th>
<th>Observed Sometimes</th>
<th>Not Yet Observed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Indicators:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. knows how to access information</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. tries several approaches</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. does not give up quickly</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. has patience</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. brainstorms alternative solutions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. checks own work</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**PRIMARY**

**SOCIAL SKILLS CHECKLIST**

**ASSESSMENT OF SOCIAL SKILLS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Skill 1</th>
<th>Skill 2</th>
<th>Skill 3</th>
<th>Skill 4</th>
<th>Skill 5</th>
<th>Celebrations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>O</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comments:** Work with Lois on a regular basis. Change her seat and group.

---

**MIDDLE SCHOOL**

**OBSERVATION CHECKLIST**

**Student:** Denise  **Class:** Science  **Date:** 12/5

**Type of Assignment:** Work Habits

- **Teacher:** Date ___ Signed _____
- **Peer:** Date ___ Signed _____
- **Self:** Date 12/5 Signed _____

**Work Habits:**
- Gets work done on time
- Asks for help when needed
- Takes initiative

**Study Habits:**
- Organizes work
- Takes good notes
- Uses time well

**Persistence:**
- Shows patience
- Checks own work
- Revises work
- Does quality work

**Social Skills:**
- Works well with others
- Listens to others
- Helps others

**Comments:** I always get my work done on time, and I am really organized. I just need to check my own work and help my group work. Future goal: I need to be more patient with my group and try to work with them more. I worry about my own grades, but I don’t do enough to help them achieve their goals.

---

**HIGH SCHOOL**

**BASKETBALL SKILLS**

**Teacher:** Ms. Mn.  **Class:** 12th Period P.E.  **Date:** 10/5

**Target Skills:** Students will develop basketball skills and teamwork

**STUDENTS DEMONSTRATE THE FOLLOWING**

- **COORDINATION SKILLS**
- Passing Skills
- Dribbling Skills
- Putting Shots
- Team Sport
- Fast Break
- Spirit

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Students</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Toni</td>
<td>+ + + +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Casey</td>
<td>+ + + +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James</td>
<td>+ + + +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juan</td>
<td>+ + + +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beth</td>
<td>+ + + +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael</td>
<td>+ + + +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Judy</td>
<td>+ + + +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charles</td>
<td>+ + + +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dave</td>
<td>+ + + +</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lisa</td>
<td>+ + + +</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

**COLLEGE**

**WRITING CHECKLIST**

**Student:** Robin  **Class:** English 102  **Paper:** Teaching for Transfer

**Key:**
- + = Good
- = OK
- O = Not Yet

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Usage</th>
<th>Date: 3/1</th>
<th>Date: 3/5</th>
<th>Date: 3/7</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Topic Sentence</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Complete Sentences</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Complex Sentences</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Wide Vocabulary</td>
<td>O</td>
<td>+</td>
<td>+</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Mechanics**

- Capitalization | + | + | + |
- Punctuation | + | + | + |
- Spelling | O | + | + |
- Grammar | + | + | + |

**Strengths:** My topic sentences, sentence structure, and capitalization are good.

**Not Yet:** I need to write more complex sentences - most of my sentences are simple.

cognitive psychology views the student as a whole person, promotes active rather than passive learning, and values the individual differences of each student. This is the paradigm shift in education. This is the role authentic assessment is playing for our students.

Standardized tests, grades on tests, and the report card only give a one-dimensional picture of a student's learning. If learning is to be authentic, then students need to be actively engaged in a variety of authentic tasks and must be in control of their own educational process (Burke, 1994).

A process driven curriculum is not compatible with standardized tests. Students still need to learn facts but not for the sake of a test. The facts and figures students learn should become tools for solving problems, completing complex projects, and exploring new dimensions of learning (Bellanca, Chapman, and Swartz, 1994).

The assessment tools discussed in this paper help students monitor their own learning and internalize the process of learning and evaluation. Students who are active learners, able to reflect and evaluate their own learning process become life-long learners. Authentic assessment must accompany authentic teaching. Such an educational system brings meaning to the ancient Chinese proverb which says: “Give a man a fish and he will eat for a day; teach him how to fish and he will eat for a lifetime.”
Assessing Thoughtfulness

References


Assessing Thoughtfulness


Assessing Thoughtfulness


I. DOCUMENT IDENTIFICATION:

Title: Assessing Thoughtfulness: A New Paradigm

Author(s): Linda Conrad, S.N.D.

Corporate Source: Center for Excellence in Education
Notre Dame College of Ohio

Publication Date: Aug. 1995

II. REPRODUCTION RELEASE:

In order to disseminate as widely as possible timely and significant materials of interest to the educational community, documents announced in the monthly abstract Journal of the ERIC system, Resources in Education (RIE), are usually made available to users in microfiche, reproduced paper copy, and electronic/optical media, and sold through the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS) or other ERIC vendors. Credit is given to the source of each document, and, if reproduction release is granted, one of the following notices is affixed to the document.

If permission is granted to reproduce and disseminate the identified document, please CHECK ONE of the following two options and sign at the bottom of the page.

Check here For Level 1 Release:
Permitting reproduction in microfiche (4" x 6" film) or other ERIC archival media (e.g., electronic or optical) and paper copy.

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 1 documents

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND
DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL
HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Sample

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

Level 1

Check here For Level 2 Release:
Permitting reproduction in microfiche (4" x 6" film) or other ERIC archival media (e.g., electronic or optical), but not in paper copy.

The sample sticker shown below will be affixed to all Level 2 documents

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND
DISSEMINATE THIS
MATERIAL IN OTHER THAN PAPER
COPY HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Sample

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

Level 2

Documents will be processed as indicated provided reproduction quality permits. If permission to reproduce is granted, but neither box is checked, documents will be processed at Level 1.

"I hereby grant to the Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) nonexclusive permission to reproduce and disseminate this document as indicated above. Reproduction from the ERIC microfiche or electronic/optical media by persons other than ERIC employees and its system contractors requires permission from the copyright holder. Exception is made for non-profit reproduction by libraries and other service agencies to satisfy information needs of educators in response to discrete inquiries."

Signature: Linda Conrad, S.N.D.

Organization/Address: Notre Dame College of Ohio
4545 College Rd.
South Euclid, Ohio 44121

Printed Name/Position/Title: Linda Conrad, SND Director-Center for Excellence in Education

Telephone: 216-381-1680
FAX: 216-381-3802
E-Mail Address: Date:

(over)