Research studies that have investigated the effects of interventions aimed at reducing prejudice are reviewed, and a synthesis of their findings is presented. Some generalizations are offered that have the potential to lead towards a less prejudiced society. Research is summarized according to the intervention approaches used in the following categories: (1) the use of special materials; (2) cognitive approaches; (3) direct approaches; (4) shared-coping approaches; (5) various classroom approaches; (6) audio-visual approaches; (7) consideration of school-wide conditions; (8) teacher training; (9) human relations training; (10) positive reinforcement approaches; (11) a variety of approaches; and (12) social contact theory approaches. A summary is also presented of changes in attitudes toward handicapped people as a form of prejudice reduction. In spite of the problems in research in prejudice reduction, there is a body of knowledge that suggests that, in working with young people, it is possible to reduce existing prejudice and even to prevent its formation. Increasing an individual's self-esteem, helping them perceive others as individuals, and sharpening cognition skills are helpful. In addition, genuine multicultural education shows great promise in prejudice reduction. (Contains 117 references.) (SLD)
PREJUDICE REDUCTION
AND THE FINDINGS
OF RESEARCH

GLENN S. PATE
COLLEGE OF EDUCATION
UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization
originating it
Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality
Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official
OERI position or policy

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS
MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY
GLENN S. PATE
Univ. Arizona
TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC).

1995

BEST COPY AVAILABLE
TABLE OF CONTENTS

PROBLEMS OF RESEARCH ON PREJUDICE .................................................. 1
THE USE OF SPECIAL MATERIAL ............................................................... 2
COGNITIVE APPROACHES ........................................................................ 4
DIRECT APPROACHES .............................................................................. 7
SHARED-COPING APPROACHES ............................................................... 8
A VARIETY OF CLASSROOM APPROACHES .......................................... 11
AUDIO-VISUAL APPROACHES ................................................................. 13
A CONSIDERATION OF SCHOOL-WIDE CONDITIONS .......................... 16
THE TRAINING OF TEACHERS ................................................................. 18
HUMAN RELATIONS TRAINING .............................................................. 20
POSITIVE REINFORCEMENT APPROACHES ....................................... 22
A VARIETY OF APPROACHES ................................................................. 24
SOCIAL CONTACT .................................................................................. 27
A SUMMARY OF CHANGES IN ATTITUDE TOWARD THE HANDICAPPED .. 33
CONCLUSION ......................................................................................... 34
BIBLIOGRAPHY ...................................................................................... 35
Each year hundreds of thousands of words are written about prejudice. The vast majority of the writings are sermon-like essays exhorting people to be nice to each other, to be less prejudiced. In spite of the motives and attitudes of the writers, such essays do not seem to have much impact on people - at least not on the people who have firmly held prejudice attitudes and beliefs. People are very effective at blocking messages they do not want to hear. The second most common type of writing is a report of research which describes the extent or type of prejudice. These studies are helpful in that they document any changes in degree of prejudice or changes in what groups hold prejudiced beliefs and what groups are prejudiced against. These studies, however, do not add to our body of knowledge of how to prevent and reduce prejudice. A relatively small number of studies have examined the effects of various intervention efforts toward the reduction of prejudice. It is with these intervention studies that this report is concerned. The attempt here is to survey the research studies that have attempted to reduce prejudice, to synthesize their findings, and to make generalizations which have the potential to lead up toward a less prejudiced society.

PROBLEMS OF RESEARCH ON PREJUDICE

Before considering the research findings, we should examine some of the problems of research on prejudice. Many writings and intervention efforts treat prejudice as though it is a singular phenomenon. It is not; rather is has the complexity of the three dimensions of cognitive, affective, and behavioral. The cognitive dimension refers to a person’s belief system, knowledge base, and thinking system. This dimension may be seen in a person’s believing negative stereotypes about a certain group. The affective dimension refers to a person’s attitudes or feelings toward certain groups of people. It is the non-cognitive part of a person’s mental state. For instance, the affective dimension may refer to an individual’s feeling uncomfortable while sitting next to a person from a different group. The third dimension, behavior, is the most visible of the three. This is what a person actually does and the way she does it. It not only includes obvious and deliberate behavior such as voting, but also more subtle forms of behavior as tone of voice and facial expressions.

It is important that we remember the three dimensions because they can serve to guide our understanding. Many intervention efforts have failed to distinguish among the dimensions and consequently met with limited success. While it is clear that the dimensions are related, they are not perfectly related. Through some form of experience an individual may have one of the dimensions changed, but the other two do not necessarily change. For example, a teacher may successfully change a student’s cognition, but should not expect an inevitable change in their affect or behavior. When we attempt to reduce prejudice, we need to thoughtfully consider on which dimension to focus and not attempt to reduce prejudice in general.

Another problem with the field is that attitudes are difficult to change and difficult to measure. Many of our attitudes are developed subconsciously over a lifetime of experiences. Some attitudes may be so embedded they are virtually impossible to change, or may be so subconscious we may not even be aware of them. Changing the way a person views the world, views other people, and way of thinking is an extremely difficult task, and many researchers have chosen other, more fruitful, areas for research. This problem is exacerbated by the factor of time. While we are not completely sure of how long it takes to lessen an individual’s prejudice, it may take longer that most researchers are willing to invest. An equally confounding issue of the duration of change. Most intervention efforts have used some measurement immediately following the treatment and frequently have gotten positive results. Very few studies have used delayed post-test measures of been of a longitudinal nature. To assess the permanence of a change in
prejudice due to a particular intervention takes many years, and researchers are more likely to invest their efforts in projects that have a quicker pay-off.

One of the most acute problems in research in prejudice reduction is measurement. Most assessment means have been the paper and pencil type. These are easily administered and quickly scored. Many of us, however, have a distrust of these measures. We fear that an individual may not be completely honest or may attempt to please the test-giver. This can be especially true if the individual is aware that he is being assessed on prejudice and has a desire to give the "right answers".

The last problem with the research to be mentioned lies with the overall scheme of the intervention efforts. The total research has not been the result of a coordinated plan but has been more scattered. For instance, one study may be with first graders with treatment "A", another with high school students with treatment "B", another with military personnel with treatment "C", and another with a church summer camp with treatment "D". With each study our level of understanding is increased, but in small steps. Each researcher pursues her own line of inquiry independent of other researchers and is not part of an organized campaign toward the reduction of prejudice. The field may also benefit from a structure based on theories of the causes of prejudice. We do not yet know if an individual's prejudice is a symptom of some personal malfunction or rather the result of larger socio-cultural causes. If we pay more attention to possible causes of prejudice, we should be in a better position to direct our prejudice reduction efforts.

In spite of the above mentioned problems, we do know something about the reduction of prejudice. The remainder of this report is a summary of intervention findings which are grouped according to the intervention method used.

THE USE OF SPECIAL MATERIAL

The arena in which most intervention efforts has taken place is the classroom. Researchers have used the range of grade levels from kindergarten to high school, some successful and some less so. One fairly obvious and relatively simple approach is to expose students to particular materials selected for their potential prejudice-reducing influence. We will review four such studies. Litchner (1969) worked with 68 second grade students in an all white school. The special materials used were reading books with multi-ethnic characters portrayed as middle class people who worked hard, dressed nicely, and were clean. The teacher did not initiate any discussions of a racial nature, and the students made very few comments on the race of the book characters. This treatment was conducted for four months and had positive results. Four different assessment techniques were used, and the students exposed to the multi-ethnic readers had significantly more positive attitudes toward blacks than did students who had read the traditional books. The books were the same except for the pictures which showed the race of the characters. This study is noteworthy because it reflects the philosophy of the multi-ethnic education movement and infuses different races into curriculum material rather than treating them in a separate part of the curriculum.

White, urban high school students were the subjects in a study utilizing readings (Hayes, 1969). Students were required to read nine books, six of which were fiction, two were non-fiction, and one was a photographic essay. The overall results showed a more positive attitude toward blacks as a result of the reading. Interestingly, boys had a greater attitude change than did the girls and also had a stronger correlation between intelligence scores and attitude than did girls. This study touches on an issue we will focus on later,
that of required participation in a prejudice reduction experience. Some studies have shown that people resent being manipulated and result in a negative reaction.

A study which did not result in positive findings was conducted by Lessing and Clarke (1976). An eight-week intergroup relations curriculum which included readings and guest speakers was used with junior high students attending a nearly all-white suburban school. Most of the students were of working class, lower middle class SES. Students were to read a book focusing on each of the target minority groups of American Indians, Latinos, Blacks, Jews, and Orientals. The students also completed a written book report and an oral report. Measurement using descriptive adjectives indicated that the students' attitudes did not change significantly as a result of exposure to the special course. The researchers feel that the fact that the community was experiencing racial tensions at the time of the study contributed strongly to the negative findings. They also feel that reading materials, per se, are not enough to change ethnic attitudes.

A study which used a different type of materials, dramatic plays, was conducted with fourth, fifth, and sixth grade students in New York City (Gimmestad and Chiara, 1982). Four plays concerned a Puerto Rican family that comes to New York City in the 1940's and has problems gaining acceptance; Marian Anderson's rise to fame as a black opera singer; a Jewish boy pursuing an acting career; and Chinese railroad workers in 1867. The plays were read and discussed, contributions of each ethnic group were identified, and the feelings of the characters considered. The results show that students who had been part of the treatment group had significantly more acceptance toward other ethnic groups than did a control group of students who had not been exposed to the plays and discussion. The results also show that the attitudes of the treatment group became significantly more positive as a result of the experience. While the use of dramatic plays was demonstrated to be an effective means of reducing prejudice, the researchers feel that the treatment may not have been necessary for these particular students since social acceptance was already a reality with them. Most of the students were Hispanic or black and were living in an integrated society.

The above studies show that the use of certain materials can reduce prejudice, although not in all cases. The important variables are the quality of the materials themselves, the manner in which they are presented and used, and the surrounding conditions of the setting. Two of these studies were with elementary students, one with junior high, and one with high school students. This is a somewhat limited sample of studies on which to base generalizations; however, the findings are strong enough to encourage educators and researchers to seriously consider using carefully selected materials as a vehicle for the reduction of prejudice.

Generalizations About the Use of Special Materials

1. The use of materials designed to reduce prejudice has proven to be effective, especially with younger students.
2. Elements of multiethnic education such as integrating middle class blacks in reading books reduced prejudice.
3. The use of dramatic plays based on actual minority members did reduce prejudice.
4. Required inter-group relations training may not effectively reduce prejudice.
COGNITIVE APPROACHES

Perhaps the most frequently used avenue to reduce people’s prejudice has been directed at their cognitive domain. The assumptions underlying this approach are that if people know more about other groups and think more clearly then they would be less prejudiced. These assumptions imply that prejudice is, in part, due to ignorance and to faulty thinking. These ideas have been around for a long time and carry a flavor of common sense. The studies by Glock, et al. (1975) gave added weight to the cognitive approach. The term, cognitive sophistication, was introduced and the concept was supported with impressive evidence. Cognitive sophistication meant, simply, the information that a person had and the way she processed information. It included not only knowledge, but also a thinking ability and an interest in mental or intellectual activities. We will see in the studies to be reviewed that the acquisition of facts may not be enough to reduce prejudice, and we will also see some confusion among the three dimensions of prejudice referred to earlier.

Handler (1966) worked with kindergarten students in an integrated, suburban school. The treatment included the use of materials, puppets, discussions, art, and visitors. The intent was to improve white students’ attitudes toward black people. Based on pre- to post- measures and compared with a control group the treatment was successful. For our consideration, the primary finding was that the students began to verbally correct their faulty generalizations about blacks. A key part of the treatment was to ameliorate the manner of the students to think in sharp, dichotomous terms. This study included both information and a thinking process. This approach is quite important as highly prejudiced people do tend to think in terms of ‘all’, ‘none’, or ‘always’. Over-generalization is a manifestation of poor thinking and is found with highly prejudice people.

Supporting the idea that information alone is not sufficient, Simpson, et al. (1976) worked with elementary age students. The study was intended to determine the effects of two experimental treatments on the attitudes toward the handicapped. One treatment consisted of increasing the students’ information through the use of lectures, filmstrips and lectures. Another group experienced controlled integration activities. While each approach was somewhat effective in modifying attitudes, the most effective treatment was to use both the informational and integration activities.

An interesting correctional study with college students was conducted by Merz and Pearlin (1972). They looked at the influence of information on the three dimensions of prejudice through the use of a questionnaire. Students were asked the question, “How much do you think your factual knowledge about Negroes increased since you have come to college?” Those students who reported the most knowledge gained scored as the least prejudiced on the cognitive dimension, and those who reported the least knowledge gained scored as the highest prejudice. Interestingly, there was no pattern or relationship between knowledge gained and degree of prejudice on the emotional scale. The results of this study support the belief that we can reduce an individual’s prejudice by influencing the cognitive domain; however, the amount of information gained was a self-report, and we do not know if the report was accurate of the result of a predisposition or mindset. The study does show that the three dimensions of prejudice are not perfectly related.

A clear relationship between cognitive and prejudice as illustrated in a study by Davis and Fine (1975). They had white students read a summary of the report of the U.S. National Advisory Commission on Civil Disorders (the Kerner Report) and compared their knowledge and attitudes with a control group of students. Those who read the report became significantly more favorable toward social change and civil rights action. The
attitude shifts were accompanied by increases in factual information. Those students who had not read the report were still more opposed to civil rights actions such as busing for school desegregation and federal enforcement of fair housing measures. The researchers believed that exposing students to material such as the Kerner Report has a liberalizing influence. While the experiment did include measurements three weeks following the treatment, we do not know the long-term effects of reading the material. Nevertheless, this study is an effective demonstration of the relationship between prejudice and the cognitive domain.

People at the University of Georgia developed an extensive and thorough set in instructional materials entitled The Anthropology Curriculum Project. Using three projects from the unit, Man and Myth: A Unit in Ethnic Relations, Kleg (1970) studied the effects of the instruction on high school students in several different urban settings. The findings that are most relevant to this report include reference to the association between cognition and prejudice. The results showed that the students who had been exposed to the instruction had more positive scores on a cognitive-affective scale than did a control group of students. Unfortunately, similar measures taken a month after the unit was completed did not reflect the same differences between the groups. More importantly perhaps is the fact that the findings indicated significant relationships between cognitive achievement and attitudinal change in eight of twelve correlations. Of special note in the finding is a significant relationship between cognitive retention and attitude change in nineteen of twenty correlations. As we are concerned with change that may last over time these findings regarding cognitive retention and change in prejudice attitude are quite important.

Gardiner (1972) conducted a study which focused directly on the relation between the cognitive domain and prejudice. The study tested the assumption that inadequately developed cognitive structures produce a predisposition for a person to engage in prejudice behavior. It was also believed that the predisposition would be increased when the individual is confronted with moments of stress such as frustration or the sanctions of the normative group. To test the relationship the researcher employed high school students engaged in cognitive complexity training. One group of students was involved with multi-conceptual thinking while another group was involved with uni-conceptual thinking; both groups reacting to video tapes of people of various races and competencies. The results showed that both groups improved their cognitive complexity structures and had a concomitant reduction in prejudice. While the multi-conceptual group outperformed the uni-conceptual group in both conceptual thinking and had lower prejudice scores, the differences were not significant. This study clearly supports the relationship between the cognitive domain and prejudice; and we should note that cognition is treated as much more complex than the acquisition of facts.

A complex and cogent study (Grossarth-Maticek, et al. 1989) categorized almost 7,000 people according to four personality types. Three of the types indicated a higher than the norm level of frustration and concomitantly a higher level of prejudice than did the subjects in the fourth type. The theory that the frustration led to aggression which led to prejudice was borne out. The subjects were then exposed to 20-25 hours of cognitive behavior therapy designed to give them techniques of coping with their frustration and had been told that the therapy would help lessen the risks of cancer and heart disease. The treatment did produce a significant lessening of prejudice while control groups showed no change. This study comes close to proving a casual relationship between personality characteristics and prejudice as well as demonstrating the power of cognitive intervention.

Butler (1982) conducted a study on the relationship between cognition and prejudice with the added element of empathy. One group of high school students studied racism and prejudice with a sociological approach with little or no use of empathy. Another
group studied the subject in a generally traditional manner with moderate attention to empathy by using role playing activities. A third group used a high degree of empathy by simulating the life of minority group members. The results showed a clear pattern in favor of using empathy in addition to cognitive learning. The group with the greatest emphasis on empathy had the greatest reduction on prejudice; the group with some empathy attention had the second greatest reduction in prejudice; and the strictly cognitive approach had the lowest prejudice reduction. This study is important in that inclusion of the affective domain is an effective complement to the cognitive domain.

A cognitive approach which combined an English and history unit was used by Toepfer, et al. (1987). Teachers worked with eleventh graders in a Brooklyn high school and included critical thinking with the content of race relations and attitudes in the post-Civil War South. Students worked with a variety of fiction, essays, primary and secondary source materials. The focus was on why blacks lost the political and civil rights they had gained during the Reconstruction Period, on issues involving blacks and whites in the early twentieth century, and on changing conditions for American blacks and whites. While no hard data were collected, the teachers did believe the unit was successful.

A study which used elements of empathy in conjunction with increased cognition was focused on fifth grade students' attitudes toward handicapped people (Wurzel, 1980). The treatment was comprised of activities designed to promote empathy for and understanding of people with disabilities. There was also direct contact with people representing various disability groups. The results indicate that the treatment group significantly improved their attitudes due to the treatment and in comparison with a control group. The researcher believed that the acquisition of factual knowledge did help the students correct previous inconsistent and fallacious thinking. This study supports the findings of the previously reviewed study: cognitive instruction with a strong inclusion of empathy effectively reduced prejudice. Inclusion of empathy can be a result or a cause of vicarious experiences. In identifying successful and unsuccessful attempts at reducing prejudice Weiner and Wright (1973) state, “It appears that in all successful attempts, the aim has been directed at having the target vicariously identify with the minority group member.” (p.99) Thus the power of cognitive approaches can be increased by going beyond the purely cognitive.

We need to recognize that the above studies focusing on cognitive approaches were not limited to factual information. Even today many teachers still believe that teaching facts about other people is an effective means of reducing prejudice. The three quotes below serve to put the acquisition of facts in a proper perspective. Notice the dates of the writings.

"We need to realize, that although sound knowledge is necessary to combat false information, it is not sufficient to change attitudes. Facts do not speak for themselves; rather they are interpreted through the experience and biases of those hearing them." (Morland, 1963, p.125)

"Perhaps the most glaring defect of intercultural education as it functions at present is that it is geared for the most part only to intellectual values. It assumes - an assumption yet to be empirically confirmed - that ignorance is the real barrier, that the truth will set men free, that the objective facts about race and race prejudice are sufficient automatically to eliminate bias and suspicion and hatred." (Glicksberg, 1946)

"From the prejudice expressed by the children, it appears that a child's possession of facts about a group does not
necessarily preclude his feeling hostile toward the group. The implication for methods of preventing or counteracting prejudices is clear. Giving information about differences—long discounted as an effective method of changing adult prejudices—is no more likely to be adequate, in itself, for affective children’s prejudices.” (Trager and Yarrow, 1952)

**Generalizations About Cognitive Approaches**

1. The cognitive domain is an appropriate subject for intervention efforts for the reduction of prejudice.

2. Factual information alone is not sufficient for the reduction of prejudice.

3. Intervention efforts which include empathy in addition to increased knowledge and understanding of other groups are effective.

4. Increased cognitive achievement and cognitive retention are related to attitude change.

5. Training which increases student’s cognitive complexity can lead to clearer thinking, a lessening of faulty generalizations, and a lessening of prejudice.

**DIRECT APPROACHES**

Not all efforts to reduce prejudice have been successful. For instance, we saw earlier in a study by Lessing and Clarke (1976) that assigning certain books to be read by junior high school students did not result in a lessening of prejudice. The researchers felt that racial tensions in the community at the time of the study may have interfered with potential positive effects of the experience. While this is probably true, it may also be that the students recognized the intent of the treatment, and for some reason chose to retain their original attitudes. The phenomenon at work may be as simple as the fact that people do not like to be manipulated. A study conducted in a military setting illustrates this point (Tansik and Driskill, 1977). Supervisors at a large military installation were required to attend a human relations course which had the stated intent of “to educate different ethnic groups on the culture and mores of others.” A small but positive attitude change was observed immediately following the course. Of greater importance, however, is the fact that in the ensuing weeks, attitude scores dropped. After nine weeks following the course, many of the scores had dropped below those of a control group of supervisors who had not taken the course. The researchers theorized that many of the supervisors felt they were being manipulated through the required course and saw the information presented as propaganda.

Another example of negative findings is a study by Black (1971). This study will be discussed in more detail later, but a part of it is relevant to the point under consideration. One group of eleventh grade students were taught our anti-prejudice unit in their English class. Measurements taken following the unit showed that the students increased their levels of prejudice as a result of the unit.

A study by Dent (1975) also showed that a direct approach against prejudice may not be the most effective method. Females in a Catholic high school were taught anti-
prejudice lessons twice a week for ten weeks. The lessons were taught by a black male and included films, discussions, and printed materials designed as anti-prejudice materials. Results following the treatment showed that only those who had low prejudice before the treatment improved their attitudes. The researcher felt that the lack of positive results may have been due to an insufficient length of treatment or due to stabilized and fixed attitudes.

A teaching unit on human relations which did result in positive findings was reported by Earnest (1973). Ninth grade students were matched on sex and scholastic aptitude and were sorted into a treatment group and a control group. The treatment was successful in that the treatment group did significantly improve attitudes due to the unit and were less prejudiced than the control group. It would be valuable if we could determine the long-range effects of the treatment.

**Generalizations About Direct, Anti-Prejudice Approaches**

1. While some direct approaches may be effective, students may resent the instruction and retain, or actually increase, levels of prejudice.

2. Direct approaches should include delayed measures to determine long-term effects of attitude change.

3. Of all approaches studied, direct approaches appear to be the least effective.

**THE USE OF SHARED-COPING APPROACHES**

One of the most promising approaches of classroom activities which leads to the reduction of prejudice is the learning teams or cooperative learning concept. Although the idea of shared-coping strategies is not new (it is actually part of the social contact theory to be discussed later) some recent applications have been led by Robert Slavin and his associates at Johns Hopkins University. One study by Slavin (1979) investigated bi-racial learning teams and cross-racial friendships in desegregated junior high schools. Each of the English teachers involved in the study taught one or two experimental classes and one or two control classes for a period of ten weeks. The experimental students studied worksheets in four or five member bi-racial teams and received recognition based on the sum of team members' quiz scores. The control students studied alone and received individual quiz scores in a traditional manner. Results of the study showed that students in the experimental classes increased more than control students in the number of cross-racial friendship choices made on a sociometric instrument. Measurements given nine months after the project was completed showed that the effects of the treatment were maintained over time.

A similar study by Weigel, et al. (1975) also demonstrated that classroom organization can influence intergroup relations. They studied the impact of two different teaching methods on Anglo and Hispanic students in the seventh and ninth grades. The control group used traditional whole-class teaching methods, and the experimental group used learning teams. The learning teams classes had small, ethnically heterogeneous groups working together with shared goals and shared rewards. Intergroup competition was used to foster intragroup cooperation. The small group, learning teams approach was better evaluated and endorsed by the teachers and resulted in less conflict and much more cross-ethnic friendship choices. The researchers caution, however, that a given group should experience success in the competition, and that an unsuccessful experience may result in negative effects.
DeVries, et al. (1978) conducted a major study with four experiments in different geographical locations, different grade levels, different subjects, and a range of proportion of black students. The approach used was referred to as Teams-Games-Tournament and had students working in small, multi-racial or bi-racial teams. In this approach the teacher would make a presentation, then the students engaged in peer tutoring practice sessions within each team. At the end of each week a tournament was held with each team competing against other teams to answer questions based on the learned subject material. Although the teachers were not aware of the real purpose of the study, the approach did yield significant position changes in cross-racial friendship patterns.

In a different form of the approach, Chennault (1967) studied the socially acceptance of unpopular educable mentally retarded students. These students were included in a group activity of planning, rehearsal and presenting a dramatic skit. The small groups worked together twice weekly for five weeks. Results showed that the mentally retarded students were more accepted by their peers as compared with control students and also increased their perception of being accepted.

Another version of the shared-coping approach is the Aronson's Jigsaw method. This method was used in a study by Ziegler (1981) with high school students in Toronto. Students were grouped into small teams which were heterogeneous on the basis of race, ethnicity, sex, and ability. The team members were inter-dependent with each one's effort being required for the success of all. Each student on a team learned a separate portion of the assigned instructional material, then taught it to her teammates. We can see why the term, jigsaw, is used for this method. After each student had shared his learning with teammates, weekly or bi-weekly quizzes were held. An individual's grade was a composite of the individual's score plus the average score of the team. This scoring procedure fostered substantial helping behavior and inter-dependence. Measurements of the treatment effect included a sociometric self-report and a scale assessing attitude toward others who are different. The results showed that the cross-ethnic friendships increased significantly due to the method and also were significantly different from a control group. Measurements given ten weeks following the experiment showed that the increased cross-ethnic friendships were maintained, also that the attitudes were not quite as positive as they were immediately following the treatment.

An interesting study which used cooperative learning as part of a larger comparison was conducted by Damico and Sparks (1986). They were concerned with the quality of verbal interactions with other-race and other-sex students and studied a middle school which was organized to maximize contacts among students. Instruction was given on inter-disciplinary units to multigrade and heterogeneous teams with random assignment of students to teams. The teachers used more multi task, individual, and cooperative learning activities and relied less on recitation-mode and competitive instructional formats. This situation was compared with a junior high organized on more traditional lines. Students were segregated by grade and were tracked by ability in reading, language arts, and math classes. These classrooms were composed of predominantly same-race students with teacher lecture and student recitation as the primary mode of instruction. In both schools about one-third of the students were black. The findings show that the students in the middle school engaged in significantly more cross-race and same-race communication.

Working with fourth graders, Warring, et al. (1985) put the cooperation-competition issue in a new and perhaps quite important light. They found intergroup cooperation to be superior to intergroup competition. With the intergroup cooperation mode, the class was divided into groups with each member helping its group's members and then helping other groups. The idea was to get the entire class to reach particular
standards. Each day the teacher gave feedback to the class on how well the entire class was doing. Reaching the criteria for excellence, the class was awarded ten points, for adequacy, five points. If the class got 80 points over a ten day period, each student got a prize. The researchers found that the intergroup cooperation approach promoted more positive cross-sex and cross-ethnic relationships than did intergroup competition. They also found that the positive relationships built within cooperative learning groups generalized to and were sustained in voluntary, self-initiated interaction in non-structured classroom, school, and home settings.

Referring to the generalizability of cooperative learning, Miller, et al. (1985) suggest that generalized outgroup acceptance will be produced by promoting an interpersonal orientation toward team members and by assigning students to teams on the basis of their unique attributes rather than the category they represent.

Special education students and how they were perceived by other students provided the focus of a study by Armstrong et al. (1980). Students met daily for 90 minutes over a four week period in either a cooperative condition or an individualistic condition to study reading and vocabulary. The results were quite positive, and the authors stated, “When learning-disabled students are members of heterogeneous, cooperative learning groups, they are perceived as being more valuable and smarter and are chosen for friends more often than are learning-disabled students in individualistic learning situations.” (p.107)

In reviewing a large number of studies of cooperative learning, Slavin (1983) states, “The results of the studies relating cooperative learning to intergroup relations clearly indicate that when students work in ethnically mixed cooperative learning groups, they gain in cross-ethnic friendships. This research indicates that the effects of cooperative learning on intergroup relations are strong, long lasting, and are more likely to be seen on close, reciprocated friendship choices than on distant or unreciprocated choices.” (p.87)

In a later writing, Slavin (1985) relates cooperative learning to Allport’s theory of social contact. He reviewed research on instructional methods designed to operationalize key elements of Allport’s theory and found that methods which employ ethnically mixed learning groups who are rewarded for learning as a group have had positive effects on inter-group relations.

A review of the above studies does indicate that learning teams, either with competition or the jigsaw method, do have great potential for the reduction of prejudice. Key elements are that students share common goals, help each other, and share in each other’s success. A caution, however, is given by Brewer and Miller (1988). Based on their own research and a study of the field, they state: “In the long run, cooperative programs that rely on inter-team competition seem to be less effective than programs (such as jigsaw) that do not have a competitive element. It is our assumption that the effect of competition is to increase task focus during group interaction in a way that decreases attention to the personal characteristics of fellow team member. It is also possible that inter-team competition enhances the threat of potential failure, which reduces positive identification with other members of one’s own team.” (p.324) A limitation is that heterogeneous teams cannot be formed in a homogeneous classroom.

**Generalizations About the Shared-Coping Approaches**

1. Ethnicity or racially heterogeneous learning teams can be an effective means of prejudice reduction.

2. Variations of the general approach, such as games and tournaments or the jigsaw approach are effective.
3. There does appear to be long-term effects of the prejudice reducing techniques.

4. Teams in competition do need to experience success for the technique to have positive effects.

5. Cooperative experiences which do not include competition seem to be more effective in the long-run than competitive experiences.

**A VARIETY OF CLASSROOM APPROACHES**

There have been intervention efforts that do not fall into the above categories and which should be included in this review. Researchers have used a variety of approaches with different subject matter areas and a range of grade levels and settings. There have been some impressive results which can aid us in our understanding of prejudice reduction.

Based on the rationale that prejudice is the result of a faulty cognitive process, Black (1971) used the study of semantics as an approach. He felt that prejudice results when something happens to the way people think because they have allowed words to use them instead of their using words. Four English teachers in a high school in New York City taught classes of semantics and other comparison classes for six weeks. Pre and post measurements used were a social distance scale and scales of ethnocentrism and authoritarianism. The results showed that the students in the semantics classes decreased their levels of prejudice on all three scales. This study's findings are consistent with the results of other studies which focused on the cognitive dimension.

An interesting and thought provoking approach called counter-stereotypy has been developed by Freedman (1983). A key element in this approach is for the teacher to use examples of an ethnic group which are counter to a popular but misleading stereotype. For instance, the teacher would make reference to Jewish athletes such as Mark Spitz or Sandy Koufax, Dr. Papanicolaou, the Greek-American physician who developed the Pap smear test, Hispanic-American white collar workers, and black intellectuals. In addition to focusing on individuals, characteristics of a group as a whole which defy the popular image should be addressed. An example of this point is the fact that the vast majority of Puerto Ricans in New York City are gainfully employed. Freedman tested the approach using students in several schools in the New York area. On both the experimental and comparison classes, students worked in committees studying the target group of blacks, Jews, Italians, Puerto Ricans, and Poles. In the experimental classes the teachers assigned counter-stereotype personalities to be studied, and in the comparison classes students were allowed to select the people on whose lives they reported. The results of the study indicate that this is an approach which deserves continued attention. On the post-test eight of ten comparisons on the stereotype-statement questionnaire yielded differences between the two groups in favor of the counter-stereotype classes. There were two findings that are quite interesting. The counter-stereotype classes showed less stereotyping toward some ethnic groups which had not been studied. The experimental group also made many written comments deploring being asked to make judgment of an ethnic group as a whole. It is not likely that the counter-stereotype approach can eradicate all the stereotypes that people develop, but it does seem to hold good promise.

A cultural immersion approach was used by Ijaz (1981) with fifth and sixth grade Canadian students. The students were involved in nine weekly sessions of seventy minutes each which focused on various aspects of East Indian culture. The program
provided information about India, not in the traditional classroom fashion of input followed by recall, but through active participation in dance, music, and crafts. The strategy was to immerse the students into situations that were typical of Indian culture, to elucidate the meanings and significance of activities performed in these situations while providing an opportunity for the students to identify with members of the target culture through role playing. In addition, the values reflected in the customs and traditions of the Indian culture were related to similar values in the students’ own culture and in other parts of the world. Results showed that the program was successful. The findings showed significantly improved attitudes toward East Indians in all students, regardless of age, grade, sex, or ethnicity. Measurements taken three months later showed that the improved attitudes were maintained. An important bonus result was that East Indian students in the program had improved attitudes toward their own ethnic group.

A small group approach was demonstrated to lessen elementary students’ preconceived ideas about race and to increase their social acceptance of members of another race. (Colca et al. 1982) An integrated pair of undergraduate social work students received specialized training and then worked with randomly selected small groups of fourth and fifth grade students in desegregated schools. Activities included: discussions, films, role playing, games, music, and sensitivity exercises. Each group met for one hour per week for a period of eighteen weeks. Pre-post measurements as well as observations indicated a marked improvement in the students’ attitudes which carried over to actual behavior.

Another intervention effort with elementary school students was conducted by French (1975) who worked with fourth graders in four different schools in Georgia. French had hypothesized that much ethnic prejudice or ethnocentrism is the result of faulty or inadequate knowledge of other cultures. Thus he prepared teachers and supplied materials to give instruction on a unit of cultural anthropology. The focus was on the two concepts of cultural universals and trait variation - universal elements shared by all cultures and the variations arising within each of these universal elements as people seek to meet their basic needs. The unit lasted for 25 days and involved 568 students who were compared with control classes being taught their regular social studies. The measurements used were the word meaning section of the Stanford Achievement Test, a cognitive test of anthropology concepts, and a specially designed attitude scale. The intervention did prove to be successful as the results showed that the training in cultural anthropology did facilitate a moderation of ethnocentrism. Note the differences between this approach and the approaches we referred as simply giving the factual information about other groups of people.

Eight-year old gifted students were involved in a program to determine if their attitudes toward handicapped students would change as a result of a specially designed instructional program. They were enrolled in a four-week special workshop conducted on a college campus. Part of the workshop included a special unit on creative Americans, some of whom were handicapped. Emphasis was on the creative achievements with the particular handicaps treated as incidentals but not of major importance. Special guests came to the workshop who involved the students in lessons and activities which were designed to emphasize common characteristics with minor attention given to various handicaps. The results showed a marked difference in the experimental students’ attitudes due to the workshop. (Lazar, et al. 1971)

An interesting study with college students was conducted by Moore (1979). The experimental group was 87 students in a child development program who were compared with psychology majors as a control group. The essence of the intervention was to have college students plan and implement learning activities which could lead to a lessening of gender stereotyping. Initially an in-service training program with college personnel
Consisted of eight full-time faculty, six part-time faculty, and four staff people. This training consisted of talks, consultancies with the leader, readings, and the production of non-sexist materials. The college students in a child development program then engaged in similar activities. They planned and implemented activities for young children in the areas of art, science, math, dramatic play, creative movement, and music. The college students also participated in educational programs for parents concerning non-sexist child raising. Based on pre to post measures and in comparison with the control group, the intervention was successful in that the college students demonstrated less stereotyping and less sex bias.

While the use of value clarification techniques is something of a controversial topic in educational communities, the approach was used by Lassiter (1984) to determine changes in students' attitudes toward ethnically diverse groups. He found the approach was successful in improving students' racial attitudes and in changing their process for selecting friends. After the program, students were more likely to choose friends for non-racial reasons and were less likely to choose them based on racial values.

**Generalizations About a Variety of Classroom Approaches**

1. A study of semantics can lead to improved cognitive functioning and a lessening of prejudice.

2. The counter-stereotype approach can be effective and shows fine promise.

3. A cultural immersion can effectively alter the attitudes of elementary school students.

4. A study of cultural anthropology can reduce ethnocentrism.

5. Student developed instructional materials with the goal of lessening sex bias in young people can reduce the bias and stereotyping of college students who developed and implemented the materials.

6. Techniques of value clarification can improve students' racial attitudes.

**AUDIO-VISUAL APPROACHES**

One of the easiest intervention methodologies to use, and perhaps one of the more effective, is showing film. It has the advantage of being relatively inexpensive, is easily adaptable to a classroom setting, and does not require a specially trained adult leader. Films are also applicable to a wide range of student ages and may be shown regardless of the group's ethnic, religious, or racial composition.

Two studies focused on elementary students. Houser (1978) worked with 153 students, ages from five to nine. She showed films of 10-15 minutes length which were designed with the theme that appearance or color should not be considered important in relating to others. The measurement used pictures of Black, Oriental, Mexican-American, and Anglo-Americans. The students were asked to match labels such as “the hardest worker,” “is lazy,” etc. Pre to post measurement showed a significant reduction in negative responses and a significant difference from a control group.

Sixteen television programs which were designed to improve inter-ethnic attitudes among elementary students were used in a study by Mays (1975). A total of 240 students...
saw the programs and 240 control students did not. The measurements included observation of comments made by students while watching the programs and an attitude assessment instrument. The questions asked were: Did the child who saw the programs 1) show evidence of fostering positive identification with his/her own ethnic? 2) develop greater feelings of acceptance for others new to the group? 3) feel more friendly or affiliative toward others? and 4) have less a tendency to stereotype what people could or could not do occupationally on the basis of race and sex? The results showed the students who saw the programs were significantly more positive that the control students on the first three questions. While the fourth question was not statistically more positive for the experimental group, observations of student behavior during viewing was positive. We should notice this study included the idea that a person’s identification with his or her own ethnic group may be related with an acceptance of other groups. We will see more of this idea later.

Kraus (1972) in a study involving white eleventh grade students investigated the effects of a film and also the variable of race of principal actors. He created four versions of a film with an original script about the efforts of two high school teachers to secure the admittance of a Negro student to a white, private college. The recordings were produced with identical dialogue which differed in all respects as little as possible, except in the races of the performers. Version I used two white performers; Version II used two Negro performers; Version III used one white and one Negro; Version IV the same as Version III but with the roles reversed. The measurements used were a scale designed to assess attitude and a section of the California Ethnocentrism Scale. The results showed that the first two versions (the all-white and the all-black casts) did not produce significant changes in attitudes, but the latter two versions (with the integrated cast) did. The researcher felt that the findings indicated that the students were more convinced as to the sincerity of the communicator when he is practicing what he preaches, or when actions speak louder than words. When the students saw two white individuals preaching about the rights of blacks, or when they saw two blacks in a similar discussion, they tended to reject the message. However, when they saw a white person talking about the rights of blacks in a favorable context to a black, they tended to accept the message and were impressed with the sincerity of the communicator. They had a greater degree of empathy and ended to modify their previously held attitudes. This study not only supports the effects of film in the modification of attitudes, but adds the dimension of the race of the communicator. As the students may have perceived the first two versions of the film with the same race communicators as a propaganda effort, the study reinforces earlier findings that a direct appeal to prejudice reduction may not be very effective.

Similar inferences can be made about the approach from a study by Goldberg (1974). One group of adults saw the films, Boundary Lines and Picture in Your Mind. These films used a generalized approach to a reduction of prejudice and intergroup hostility and included dramatic music and narration. Another adult group saw the film, The High Wall, which was a realistic enactment of a social situation involving minority relations. The California Ethnocentrism Scale was administered immediately following viewing. The results showed there was an overall improvement in attitudes due to seeing the films. Of special note is the fact that those who saw the realistic enactment improved more than those who saw the generalized approach. It is also interesting to note that those who changed the least were those whose ages were over 60 and those with less formal education.

An interesting study by Kraemer, et al. (1975) investigated the effects of modeling attitude change. They showed the film Black and White to 200 white soldiers and subdivided them into four groups. Group I watched a video tape recording of a soldier viewing the film and having positive reactions regarding his racial attitude. Group 2 also watched a video tape, but in this case the model’s attitude was not affected. Group 3 saw
the film only, and Group 4 did not see the film or the video tape. The results showed that Groups 1 and 3 became significantly less prejudiced than Groups 2 and 4. The inferences from this study are that the film did decrease prejudice and especially that the vicarious attitude change affects the soldiers' attitude change.

In using a videotape as a stimulus for a structured discussion Gottlieb (1980) produced a more positive attitude toward mentally retarded students. Elementary age students were shown a two and a quarter minute videotape of an eight-year old mentally retarded boy who did not have any obvious physical stigma. The experimenter then guided each group into a general discussion of the mentally retarded actor in particular and mentally retarded children in general. The treatment did have a positive effect.

While the above studies were specifically designed to reduce prejudice and were conducted under controlled, experimental conditions, we must question the effects of mass, public media. It does appear that television, for instance, has improved in recent years by reducing programs and commercials which promote stereotyping. Considering the massive numbers of hours that an individual watches television, especially during the formative years, the effects on his perceptions of other groups are substantial. relatively little research has been done on this issue. It is unlikely that seeing a film in school can undo the cumulative effects of thousands of stereotype-building hours of television viewing.

A study which demonstrated that a short film alone will not have great results used fourth graders who were shown a 13 minute film showing handicapped children in wheelchairs participating in physical education and classroom activities with nonhandicapped children. The focus was on a boy in a wheelchair, and the narration pointed out that he likes and does many of the same things a nonhandicapped child enjoys. The results showed very little improvement in subjects' attitudes and no apparent effects on a posttest given nine days later. "However, the film alone does not appear to be sufficient to handle all questions that a nonhandicapped child might have about a handicapped peer, and its effect does not appear to be permanent." (p.295)

A study with disturbing findings was conducted by Cherry Banks (1977). She studied television programs which had black actors integrated in the casts and those which had segregated programs with all-black casts. She concluded "the all-black programs contain a number of negative elements that are traditionally associated with Afro-Americanisms. These elements may reinforce and/or instill stereotype images of Blacks in the viewer." (p.339) We recognize the immense power to television which can create positive as well as negative attitudes. This reviewer recalls the beneficial efforts in his eighth grade students by watching The Autobiography of Miss Jane Pittman. Undoubtedly, other teachers have experienced similar reactions by students viewing films such as Roots, The Holocaust, or The Color Purple.

A flaw common to many research studies has been neglecting to assess long term effects of an intervention effort. Some attention has been given to the lasting effects of media on attitudes. Summary statements by Hovland, et al. (1949) and by Klapper (1960) indicate that attitudes which have been changed due to audio-visual media are likely to persist over a substantial time period. Additionally, results of a study by Alper and Leidy (1970) indicate that attitude change fostered in adolescent viewers of the CBS National Citizenship Test lasted a minimum of six months.
Generalizations About Audio-Visual Approaches

1. Certain audio-visual approaches have proven to be effective in lessening negative stereotypes and reducing prejudice.

2. Realistic dramatic presentations which induce empathy and identification are more effective at reducing prejudice than direct message films.

3. Racially integrated casts are more effective that segregated casts.

4. Modeling attitude change promotes attitude change in a viewer.

5. A positive acceptance of one's own ethnic group may be accompanied by an increased acceptance of other groups.

6. Television may create negative stereotypes as well as positive images.

7. There does appear to be long-term effects of attitude change fostered by audio-visual approaches.

A CONSIDERATION OF SCHOOL-WIDE CONDITIONS

Administrators and teachers have the capacity for creating a variety of conditions which can affect how students view and relate with each other. This section reviews studies that have examined some of these conditions and have drawn inferences relative to prejudice.

Wellisch, et al. (1976) studied schools that had received funds based on the Emergency School Aid Act and found that schools with segregated seating patterns in desegregated classrooms were less likely to have students mixing across racial lines during recess and lunch than those with mixed seating patterns. While a cause and effect relationship cannot be demonstrated, segregated seating is done with adult sanction and the students know it. The researchers also found a relationship between increased cross-race interaction during lunch and recess and an emphasis on social goods such as improved student-teacher or student-student relations by the principal.

It was also found that the principal played a key role in race relations in a study by Forehand, et al. (1976). This study, which investigated 96 elementary schools and 72 high schools, also found that certain teaching methods directed at improving race relations were highly effective. These methods are consistent with practices reviewed in earlier studies and include: multicultural curricula, the teaching of minority history and culture, the systematic use of project on social and attitudinal issues related to race, and the assignment of black and white students to work and play together.

Slavin (1979) examined questionnaire data from over 2,000 individuals, students, and teachers in 51 schools and had a slightly different focus. In trying to determine what school practices were most correlated with good race relations, he concluded, "Put simply, the practices that most consistently affect interracial attitude and behaviors are those that directly involve students, as opposed to teachers, and more specifically structure black-white interaction. Multicultural texts, intergroup workshops for teachers, and biracial advising committees do not change the way students interact, and have weak effects, if any, on interracial attitudes and behavior. Among the attempts to change student attitudes,
class discussions of race relations are closest to students, and they have some effects on interracial behaviors for white students, although not on student attitudes. However, students who work with members of another race are far more likely than those who do not to have positive relationships with them." (p.178-179)

Focusing on one important variable of schools' practices, Mercer (1976) reviewed studies and identified status-ranking processes used in most schools. She concluded that many practices perpetuate the lower status of many minority group students. The status-ranking practices she identified and which need to be changed are: (1) the use of norm-referenced tests rather than criterion-referenced tests to measure attainment of specific objectives, (2) organizing classrooms by ability grouping based on test performance and/or academic skills, (3) depending on individual competition as a motivator rather than stressing group evaluation and cooperation, (4) providing monocultural rather than multicultural programs and curricula, (5) allowing majority parents and teachers to exercise greater influence than other parents and teachers, and (6) following a normative structure that fails to support and sanction equal status contacts among students, parents, and teachers of all ethnic/racial groups.

Sedlack and Brooks (1976) have developed a plan for reducing racism in schools and have identified twelve practices needed for positive change. They are:

1. Change the concept of teacher quotas and develop a fair policy.
2. Integrate minority and racism-related content in the curriculum.
3. Instigate effective preplanning and programming in newly desegregated schools.
4. Eliminate inappropriate discipline.
5. Change the use of standardized test scores.
6. Find ways of involving minority students' parents in school affairs.
7. Make sure there is a follow-up after a conference or workshop.
8. Develop proper techniques for teaching standard English to black youngsters, while making sure that their native speech style of not put down in the process.
9. Achieve central administration support for positions that are taken to reduce or eliminate racism.
10. Find appropriate standards for judging and developing programs for blacks in a positive way.
11. Experience and understanding of racism and race relations should be required of all school personnel.
Black artists and scholars should be included in the curricula. (p. 102-106)

Although not an intervention effort, a project sponsored by the Los Angeles County Commission on Human Relations and the Los Angeles County Schools should be noted. The project was to identify and recognize exemplary elementary and secondary schools that were educating pupils effectively in a positive human relations climate which demonstrated appreciation of diversity. The criteria used to identify the exemplary schools can serve as a standard and goal for all schools. The criteria were:

1. Academic achievement.
2. Mutual acceptance and respect among teachers, students, and staff.
3. Demonstrated appreciation of diversity.
4. Cultural pluralism in the curriculum.
5. Means for resolving intergroup tension and conflict. (Blumenberg, et al., 1983)

Generalizations About School-Wide Conditions

1. The principal plays a key role and should lead a school-wide emphasis for good inter-group relations.
2. School or classroom practices which segregate students, such as seating patterns, tend to lead students to practice segregated behavior on their own.
3. Teachers should use practices that promote a good inter-group relations and respect for various cultures.
4. Teachers should use practices that promote students to have positive interaction with each other.
5. Schools should avoid status-ranking practices such as norm-referenced tests.

THE TRAINING OF TEACHERS

If we believe that a teacher who has the skills and knowledge to manage classes in ways that reduce students’ prejudice, then the teacher should have beneficial effects on large numbers of students. It should also follow that appropriate training of teachers would have benefits for a tremendous number of students. The training of teachers could have benefits which would grow with geometric proportions. With the apparent logic of this approach, a surprisingly small number of researchers have investigated such training.

A group of pre-service college students in a course on the teaching of social studies was exposed to a multicultural experience (Bennett, 1979). The treatment included sensitization to societal forces that led to negative assumptions about social and ethnic groups. Each student selected an ethnic group and studied it in depth. The students than taught a short lesson about the group to high school students and conducted a micro-lesson
using a discovery approach. Measurements given at the conclusion of the course showed that the experimental students were significantly less prejudicial than a group of students who had taken a traditional social studies methods course.

Another study of college pre-service students supports a multicultural approach (Baker, 1977). One group of students attended workshops in addition to their regular classes. These students did display a more positive attitude toward ethnic groups as a result of the workshops, but not as much as students who had been exposed to multicultural approaches in their courses. "The findings imply that the students in the longer, more integrated multicultural training program produces the desired response. Workshops and other less involved approaches have some benefits, but when compared to more comprehensive training, it appears that both time and intensity produce more desirable outcomes." (p.33)

A study involving 27 elementary and secondary teachers who were taking a graduate course was conducted by Amodeo and Martin (1982). The course included discussions with representatives of various cultural groups and films on the history and culture of ethnic groups. The results showed that the teachers did increase their knowledge of other groups, but did not change their attitudes or lessen their stereotypes. The conclusions were that a six week course was not long enough to effect attitude change and that there was a need for more interaction with members of other groups. The researchers also felt that there was a need for greater emphasis on the teachers' self-awareness of lack of knowledge and understanding. We might be able to infer from this study that adults' attitudes are more difficult to change that younger people. Of course.

A study was conducted with an in-service training program in Houston (Preston and Robinson, 1974). The program was intended to improve the attitudes of black and white teachers toward each other and help with local desegregation efforts. A bi-racial faculty of 20 educators and consultants led the program which enrolled 81 black and 69 white teachers. The group met for full days on 12 successive Saturdays with much of the time being spent in small groups. The program included films, discussions, lectures, presentations, and bi-racial sensitivity sessions. Assessment instruments were used which measured racial tension, distastefulness, stereotyping, social discrimination, and general prejudice. Most of the material presented was designed to modify white stereotypes of blacks; while positive change on the part of blacks towards whites was largely ignored. The results showed that there was some decrease in prejudice, but when race was introduced as a control, the statistical significance for blacks on all scales was eliminated. In addition to directing efforts toward only one side of the black-white relations, the lack of positive results may be due to the direct appeal to prejudice reduction, which may be seen as propaganda and manipulation.

An in-service experience with positive results is reported by Sneed (1979). Teachers in Montgomery County, Maryland, were involved with an extensive course entitled “Black Experience and Culture” which had the goal of developing more positive attitudes by white teachers toward blacks. The content of the course included the historical, sociological, and psychological aspects of blacks in America. Assessment of the effects of the training showed positive changes regardless of participants’ age, sex, and locus of control. The researcher recommended that additional studies assess effects of such training on teachers’ behavior in their classrooms and long-term effects.

Only one university has developed a systematic and extensive program to reduce prejudice as part of its teacher education program. A number of faculty members at the University of Nebraska-Omaha worked together and produced curricula and materials to be infused into their regular teacher education courses. (Mortenson, 1980) The courses
covered a wide range of areas such as social studies methods, educational psychology, and business education courses. There are no assessment results known, but the effort is certainly commendable, and the potential impact is great.

**Generalizations About the Training of Teachers Approach**

1. Special programs to reduce prejudice in pre-service and in-service teachers can be effective and have great potential.

2. The practice of pre-service college teachers developing curriculum and materials designed to reduce prejudice in elementary and secondary students can result in a lessening of prejudice in the college students.

3. Integrated multicultural approaches are more effective that workshop approaches.

4. For positive changes to occur, teachers must confront their own attitudes and knowledge levels.

5. As with other approaches and settings, teacher training approaches which are direct, anti-prejudice messages may not be effective.

6. In order for teacher training experiences to effectively reduce prejudice, they must be intense and of a duration longer than a few weeks.

7. There is a need to assess the effects of teacher training approaches by observing teacher classroom behavior.

**HUMAN RELATIONS TRAINING APPROACHES**

In the wake of society's moves toward integrated schools, military, and work places, affirmative action programs, and sexual equality, many people have turned to human relations training. While this seems to be a reasonable thing to do, there are some problems with the approach and the research shows mixed results.

A study was conducted with military and civilian employees at an army medical facility (Loria, 1981). Almost 200 people attended a race relations seminar which was designed to produce changes in the racial attitudes and perceptions of the participants. There was a nearly equal representation of black and white participants. Although the results were mixed and most assessments did not reach significance level, it was concluded that the seminar was successful. An interesting correlation was found between participants' dogmatism and their initial score on the racial attitude scale. The more dogmatic people had the most negative attitudes. The people with the more negative attitudes also had very limited contact with people of other races in their off-duty time.

Teachers and classified staff in San Diego were involved in a sixteen-hour intensive race/human relations program (Hashimoto, 1979). As with the above study, results were mixed. It was determined that there was a positive change in participants' attitudes toward ethnic minorities, although there was no significant difference in attitudes toward self or toward significant others.

Black and white educators attended a summer institute on inter-personal relations. (Richards and Gamacher, 1979). As with the Loria study, a participant's levels of dogmatism played a key role in determining attitude change. It was found that the least
dogmatic people experienced positive changes in attitude toward the other race. Blacks who were more dogmatic exhibited little attitude change. Of considerable concern is the finding that the whites with high dogmatism became even more entrenched in their anti-black attitude. Perhaps we need to attempt to change a person’s level of dogmatism first, and if successful, then attempt attitude change.

A brief one and a half hour workshop was attended by professional counselors (Bowman and Nickerson, 1975). The intent of the workshop was to change the counselors’ attitudes toward women. The results showed that the counselors did experience increased liberalized attitudes toward women and that the attitude change was maintained for at least one month following the workshop.

Kelly (1970) also worked with school counselors. Twenty-four counselors attended a summer institute which had the goal of improving their racial attitudes. In the first year of the institute there were no real changes in attitudes. Working with a different group of participants, several changes in the program were made for the second year. They eliminated large group lectures and spent more time in small groups with encounter-type activities. Each group had black and white co-leaders. Results showed that the black counselors were considerably less prejudiced that the whites at the beginning of the institute and less so at the conclusion. The white counselors became significantly less prejudiced as a result of the experience.

A group of Jewish youth was involved in twelve seminars of two hours each on black-Jewish relations (Fishman and Fishman, 1977). The leaders for the seminars included males and females, black and Jewish. The results showed positive changes in attitude by the Jewish youth toward blacks.

A workshop which did not achieve positive results was conducted by a private corporation. (Sie, 1977). A two-day workshop for managers and employees was held with the intent of producing attitude change on affirmative action, racism, sexism, and human relations. The pre to post measures indicated that there had not been any actual attitude change. The author concluded, “In order to affect attitudinal change in affirmative action programs in a corporate setting, one must look beyond the workshop approach.” (p.6) It may be that the participant resented what they may have perceived as manipulation.

While some of the above studies did indicate positive changes, the overall success is limited. In addition to the possible manipulation perception and the short duration of most efforts, other problems exist. In referring to human relations courses, Corter (1976, p.48) writes, “Courses of this type are developed in an effort to reduce prejudice and prejudicial attitudes among students. These courses frequently involve students in an examination of their personal attitudes toward minorities, without an in-depth examination of their own ethnicity or the role ethnicity plays in their lives. Commonly in these courses there is such an emphasis on encouraging students to say and do the ‘right’ thing that they do not really express ideas that trouble them. In addition, there is a tendency to project the attitude that there is a certain standard or pattern of behavior that is desirable; students often believe that everyone must be alike if U.S. democracy is to work.”

**Generalizations About Human Relations Training Approaches**

1. Some human relations training programs seem to have positive effects, although some are not successful.

2. The programs are more likely to be successful if participants do not perceive them to be required and manipulative.
3. Brief and superficial workshops are not usually effective in changing attitudes.

4. The type of activities in human relations training is a key to their success: lectures are not effective.

5. The level of dogmatism is highly influential in attitude change: more dogmatic people strongly resist change.

6. A disadvantage of many human relations training programs is the tendency to encourage participants to conform in a superficial manner to saying and doing the "right" thing, thus promoting lip service.

POSITIVE REINFORCEMENT APPROACHES

For many years researchers have demonstrated the power of positive reinforcement. The technique has proven effective in changing behaviors in many areas of life, and the psychologist, B.F. Skinner, has achieved considerable fame with the approach. Put simply, the technique involves a person's receiving a positive reward whenever the desired behavior occurs, and no reaction or no reward when the desired behavior does not occur. It is contingent upon there being an experimenter or some authority figure present in order to make judgment of the desired behavior and to give the reward. The rewards may be in the nature of money, tokens, smiles, or verbal comments - anything he recipient perceives as pleasant or positive. In spite of the proven effectiveness of the approach, a relatively few researchers have applied it to the reduction of prejudice.

In North Carolina 84 white five-year old children were involved in a study using positive reinforcement (Williams, 1969). They were shown pictures of toys and animals, some of which were primarily black and some white. The students were asked questions such as "Which one is dirty? Which one is nice?" Students in one group were rewarded with candy or pennies each time they gave the desired response, i.e., associating the black picture with something positive. Students in another group had candy or pennies taken away for each incorrect response. A third group of control students did the experiment but had no reinforcements based on their responses. results showed no substantial differences between the two treatment groups but considerable differences when compared to the control group. Two weeks following the treatment there was a significant difference in the responses given to pictures of black and white people. The students who had experienced the reinforcement treatment tended to evaluate pictures of black people less negatively than did the control students. A disturbing finding was that 48 percent of the treatment group and 70 percent of the control groups displayed strong anti-black attitudes. These students were five years old.

Another study with successful results using positive reinforcement was conducted with 18 Caucasian students. (Parker, et al., 1976). In one control and experimental condition the students read statements printed on index cards, and selected which statement to read aloud. The experimental students were reinforced with poker chips whenever certain anti-ethnocentric statements were read. Control students received no reinforcement regardless of which statements they read. In a separate condition students underwent a structured interview with experimental students being reinforced for anti-ethnocentric statements. Results showed that the position reinforcement applied to the experimental students did effect changes in ethnocentrism while the control students did not experience any changes.
Classical conditioning procedures were also used with 73 white kindergarten students. (Parish, et al., 1975). Using 36 pairings of the color black with neutral words the experimenters were interested in determining if the reinforcement technique would affect changes in the students' racial attitudes. The study conducted in 1971 did get significant reduction in prejudice attitudes. While the study conducted in 1971 did get significant reduction in prejudice attitudes, a similar study in 1972 did not.

Sixth graders were the subjects in another similar study. Pictures of Vietnamese and African-Americans were shown paired with positively evaluated words. The results indicated that there was a positive shift in the attitudes toward the Vietnamese but not toward the Afro-Americans. The researchers felt that the attitudes of the students toward the African-Americans were too well established to be changed in a single session of conditioning. (Parish and Shirazi, 1976).

A study of the effects of positive reinforcement with white southern student nurses who had been assessed as having prejudiced attitudes was conducted by Primad (1980). The student nurses were shown pictures of black people in various situations and were asked to give adjectives which could fit with the pictures. Each time they gave a positive adjective the experimenter said “good.” No feedback was given following a neutral or negative adjective. The results showed that the positive adjectives increased with time and negative adjectives decreased. It may appear that the conditioning had a beneficial effect; however, the student nurses only gave the positive responses to the experimenter while giving highly unfavorable comments to a peer. Thus the students seemed to become aware of what pleased the experimenter and did what pleased him while maintaining the previous prejudiced attitude. The researchers concluded that after the conditioning of the positive concept, the tendency was to return to the original level of unfavorable responsiveness or to retain the original prejudiced attitude. This study is interesting in that it may reveal the fact that students have a desire to please the teacher or experimenter without undergoing true attitude change.

**Generalization About Positive Reinforcement Approaches**

1. Techniques of positive reinforcement have appeared to alter attitudes and reduce prejudice.

2. The techniques have been successful over a wide range of ages of subjects.

3. The positive reinforcement studies were conducted in controlled conditions; we do not know how effective they are in natural settings.

4. There is a great need for studies to assess the long-term effects of positive reinforcement approaches and to assess how apparent attitude change may be seen in behavioral change.
A VARIETY OF APPROACHES

This section is devoted to studies which do not categorize easily into the above sections. There is a wide range of approaches, and the studies do add to our total knowledge.

The relationship between self-esteem and prejudice has been well established for many years. A study by Rubin (1967) helps to more clearly identify the relationship. He worked with a group of adults who attended a two-week summer workshop. Assessments at the outset of the workshop demonstrated a significant correlation between self-esteem and degree of prejudice. Those who scored as more prejudiced had lower self-esteem. Much of the time in the workshop was spent in sensitive training with the intent of increasing the participants' self-esteem. At the conclusion of the workshop, measurements showed that the participants had significantly increased their self-esteem and that there had been a concomitant significant decrease in levels of prejudice. While it is difficult to prove a cause and effect relationship, this study does identify the key role that self-esteem plays in an individual's prejudice.

One of the characteristics of stereotyping is that we tend to think of everyone in an out-group as being alike, even looking alike. Katz (1973) conducted an interesting study relative to this point. She worked with 96 second and sixth grade students who had been identified as prejudiced. She worked with a perceptual differentiation approach and had the students study pictures of black faces. They were to focus on details of the faces such as smiles, frowns, hair, and glasses and then identify these faces from another set of faces. By focusing on the details of faces, the students discovered that all black people did not look alike. This simple treatment resulted in a significant decrease in levels of prejudice which was maintained four months later. This study strengthens our recognition for the need to help students avoid over-generalizations and to perceive members of a given group as individuals.

Resarching along similar lines, Wilder (1978) worked with college students. He tested and proved the theory that out-group members may be more convenient targets of bias if they are seen as a single entity rather than as individuals. He divided the students into groups and told them that the groups were either unanimous in their opinions or had some dissenters. Students displayed more bias and antagonism toward the groups which they thought had unanimous opinions. No bias was displayed toward the groups with dissenters. In addition, assistance from an out-group was found to be more effective in reducing inter-group bias when the out-group responded as individuals than when it responded as a group.

Perceiving differences within a group was one of the salient features found in a completely different type of study which was concerned with high school students' attitudes toward inmates in an institution for the mentally retarded. (Cleland and Cochran, 1961) Groups of students were given a guided tour of the institution with a key variable being the scope and sequence of degree of severity of retardation shown. Exposures were from the least shocking wards to the most shocking; from the most shocking to the least shocking; the low shocking only; and the high shocking only. While the tours did indeed produce attitude changes in general, our attention is focused on the relative effectiveness of the sequence variable. "Although all tours included five wards, the greatest number of changes occurred where the wards ranged from non-shocking to shocking or vice-versa, rather than only shocking or only non-shocking. It appears from this study that heterogeneity is productive of greatest change per se ." (p.479)
A study which also dealt with high school students touring a residential institution for the mentally retarded was conducted by Sellin and Mulchahay (1965). They had the students take the same tours so did not observe the role of differences within a group factor. They did find that the tour did effect attitudinal changes and that the experiential differences within the study group was a key variable affecting attitude change.

In studying the interrelations of factors within the contact hypothesis, Brewer and Miller (1988) strengthen the importance of perceiving differences within members of an out-group. They point out that exposure to diversity alone is not sufficient to ensure greater differentiation of traits; the individual must pay attention to relevant data which distinguishes one category member from another. When we perceive the heterogeneity within an out-group instead of perceiving the group as relatively homogeneous, we are much more likely to reduce our stereotypes.

A study which also attended to individual characteristics was conducted by Chamberlin-Robinson (1977). She worked with 60 black and white six year old children who were generally of a lower middle class. The intent of the treatment was to have the children alter their biases by attending to social perception cues such as facial cues, gestures, and contextual cues as appropriate for decision making, while recognizing that other cues such as race were irrelevant for decision making. She exposed the students to pictorial stimuli with stories incorporating evaluative adjectives and taught them to attend to social perception cues within the pictures and to make decisions only in the presence of these cues. A verbal correction procedure was used for errors. Additionally the children were exposed to pictorial stimuli with irrelevant, non-social cues such as no gestures, neutral expressions, and no activity. For these non-cued probes, the correct responses were “I can’t tell from the picture,” or “There’s not enough information in the picture.” The results of the study showed that the treatment was highly successful as the children showed less bias based on irrelevant data, pre to post, and when compared with a control group. These studies illustrate the need for studies to perceive members of other groups as individuals and to base their opinions of them on meaningful and individual characteristics rather than on such global traits as race.

Separating the relevant from the irrelevant and being trained to make distinctions made sixth graders more perceptive and appropriately judgmental toward handicapped people. (Langer, et al. 1985). They increased the mindfulness (active distinction making) of some students who came to view handicaps as function specific and not people specific. They were less likely to inappropriately discriminate for or against handicapped stimuli.

An in-depth study with college female students to determine the conditions under which attitude change would occur with increased self-insight and prejudicial attitudes was conducted by Stotland, et al. (1972). The students had a case history designed to increase self-insight and the psychodynamics of prejudice. In addition other conditions were used to vary the conditions which might facilitate the acceptance of the case history and its implications for the students’ own prejudice. One condition was to have the students increase their involvement by ordering in logical sequence statements about the psychodynamics of prejudice. Another condition was to make the materials of direct relevance to prejudice against blacks. The third was an appeal to the rationality and self-consistency of the individual. One group did all three conditions, another did two, and so forth. The findings indicate that the combination of all three conditions (self-activity, relevance, and self-consistency) produced the most consistent changes in reducing stereotyping about blacks. There was also a change on chauvinistic items on an ethnocentrism scale. Additionally, it was found that those who were less ego-defensive changed more than those who high in ego-defense. Interestingly, they also found that the changes required an internal re-structuring which required time. Immediately following the
treatment there were few changes observable, but several weeks later there were significant changes in positive directions. This study may be linked to Rubin’s study on self-esteem. Students not only need to think well of themselves, but also need to understand themselves and have an internal consistency.

The roles of self-esteem and views of other people are also emphasized in a study by Foley (1976). She studied a state prison for males and identified various residential areas in terms of degree of prejudice. New black and white inmates were administered several instruments to assess interracial attitudes and other variables. It was found three weeks after admittance that the inmates’ attitudes changed to be more consistent with those of their living area. It was also found that the amount of change was dependent on the individual’s self-esteem, an attitude toward people in general, and cognitive complexity. The relationships among these variables were also demonstrated in a study by Pate (1994). The findings of these studies are consistent with many studies reviewed earlier.

Parker and Wittmer (1976) investigated the effects of a communication training program on the racial attitudes of college fraternity members in a southern state. They felt that communication skills are essential for effective interracial communication in all life situations. They worked with four groups, each of which had five black and five white students. In addition to receiving the communication skills training, the students shared common athletic contests, a mixed race walk exercise, and mixed race teams preparing a dinner. Pre to post measures did not yield any significant attitude changes. The failure to obtain demonstrated changes may have been due to inadequate assessment instruments and also to the fact that the students of both races did not want to display bigotry. The authors of the study did believe that the experience was positive.

Ever since Jane Elliott conducted her well-known blue eyes-brown eyes activity with her third graders in rural Iowa in 1968, educators and researchers have been interested in using role-playing and participation in simulations as a means toward the reduction of prejudice. Byrnes and Kiger replicated the Elliott treatment with university students and did find a changed attitude in the positive direction. (1990). While there is some evidence of the power of simulations in affecting changes in both cognitive and affective domains (see for example Weiner and Wright, 1973), there is the question of the ethics involved in inducing trauma in individuals. Byrnes and Kiger (1992) discuss this interesting issue with a rebuttal by Williams and Giles (1992).

Activities which may be considered as simulations were used with elementary students. The children participated in two 150 minutes sessions divided into six activities each. The children rotated through the activities in small groups. The activities were designed to enable the children to observe and experience the needs and abilities of handicapped people: questions and answers of a deaf junior high student and her interpreter; instruction in sign language and the manual alphabet; conversations with an adult with severe spastic quadriplegia; experience with wheelchairs, prostheses, and other orthopedic appliances; observation, interaction, and arm wrestling with a severely mentally retarded adolescent; conversation with a blind college student; experience with the Braille code; performance of routine activities and games while blind-folded; and watching a film on the participation of blind people in sports. The results were quite positive as the subjects attributed a wide range of positive traits to handicapped people. (Jones, et al. 1981)
Generalizations About a Variety of Approaches

1. There is a clear relation between an individual's self-esteem and degree of prejudice. Those with higher self-esteem have lower levels of prejudice.

2. When we see members of another group as looking alike or thinking alike, we tend to over-generalize and stereotype. When we see them as individuals, we display lower levels of prejudice.

3. Students who were taught to attend to meaningful social cues rather than to race, displayed less bias.

4. Students who increased self-insight and consistency in thinking became less prejudiced.

5. People with high ego-defenses are more resistant to attitude change than those with lower ego-defense.

6. We tend to change our attitudes to be consistent with the prevailing attitudes of the group we join.

7. Role-playing activities and simulations, especially those that involve participants emotionally, can result in attitude change.

Social Contact

Gordon Allport is credited with giving birth to the social contact theory as an approach for reducing prejudice. The basic idea is that if people from different groups come into contact with each other, they will develop a more positive attitude toward the other group. The issue, of course, is much more complicated than that, and the contact will have favorable results only if certain conditions are met. "Prejudice (unless deeply rooted in the character structure of the individual) may be reduced by equal status contact between majority and minority groups in the pursuit of common goals. The effect is greatly enhanced if this contact is sanctioned by institutionalized supports (i.e., by law, custom, or local atmosphere), and if it is of a sort that leads to the perception of common interests and common humanity between members of the two groups." (Allport, 1954, p. 267). Notice that Allport identified several contingent conditions for the contact to be beneficial. The key idea is that the contact alone is not enough. As one write put it, "There is no general agreement about the effects of interracial contact on attitude change. Some studies have found heightened tolerance; some heightened resistance; some no change. There seems to be, however, a general agreement that racial contact per se will not bring about increased tolerance or acceptance." (Carithers, 1970, p. 41). Ford (1986) has synthesized many studies on intergroup contact and identified serious deficiencies in the research and limitations of just what we know about the actual lives of individuals involved in studies.

If the contact alone is not enough, and if certain conditions need to be met if the contact is to be beneficial, we need to know what the conditions are. Not only do the conditions meet our common sense judgment, but research results have consistently supported the prerequisite conditions. A good, succinct overview of the conditions is given by Selltiz and Cook.
“It appears that personal association with members of an ethnic group other than one’s own generally leads to favorable changes in attitudes toward that group - if the following conditions hold.

1. There is an opportunity to get to know one another as individuals.
2. The individuals in the two groups have equal status in the situation.
3. They have common interests and are similar in characteristics such as age or occupation.
4. The norms are favorable to association between the two groups.
5. The circumstances of the situation favor co-operation or at least do not introduce competition or conflict.
6. The presence or the activities of members of the two groups help in the achievement of the individual’s goals or at least do not present an obstacle to them.” (Selltiz and Cook, 1963, p. 159).

As indicated, one of the key conditions is that the social norms need to favor the contact. Perhaps the most influential change in recent American history on inter-racial relations is that the United States government, a prime norm setter, has approved of the contact. In fact, through court-ordered desegregation of housing, transportation, schools, etc., the government has insisted on the contact. The authority figure, whether it be in a governmental, civic, educational, or parental role, must approve of the contact. In a school, the principal and the teachers clearly play crucial roles. “One of the most solidly supported findings about intergroup contact is that the social climate within which it takes place - and especially by the standards and the example set by leaders in the situation - strongly influence the outcome.” (Selltiz and Cook, 1963, p. 160).

In studying intergroup relations in desegregated schools, Christine Bennett measured and categorized climate as being low acceptance, moderate acceptance, high acceptance, and mixed acceptance. She studied contact initiations and sociograms for students’ patterns of friendship and concluded that friendship patterns across race and sex lines were strongly associated with the classroom climate and the teacher’s influence. (Bennett, 1979). These findings are consistent with studies discussed earlier under the section of school-wide considerations.

The equal status condition may be modified by having the minority group have a higher status. A study was conducted with black and white junior high students to assess status ranking and its functions. When the students first played a game, the white students socially dominated even though they had no special competence. Then the researcher gave special training to the black students who, in turn, taught the white students. This time there were no racial patterns in the playing of the game. A part of the change was the whites saw the expertise of the blacks. The researcher had similar results with a special summer lab school. She not only gave special training to black students, but also informed the whites that the blacks had special expertise. The students were working with non-traditional academic tasks of high interest and did function with equal status. She concluded that it is possible to create equal status, or higher status for the minority, but how to do it in a regular classroom may be another matter. She also points out that most schools are run by whites and that usually classes develop a status ranking based on perceived academic competence. (Cohen, 1973).
Not only is equal status difficult to achieve in natural settings, but the contact needs to be of enough duration with significant others to make a generalizable difference. Both the equal status and duration factors were missing in the natural environment setting in a study by Sampson (1986). Not surprisingly, he found that the interracial contact of college students did not reduce prejudice.

In experimenting with the race of teachers of young elementary children, Charley found “The children were found to exhibit the characteristic pre-prejudicial preference regardless of teacher race. It would seem that the cultural influences which predispose children to prefer white persons are of such a magnitude that contact in one role situation does not alter developing racial preference. The children seem to accept the person in the teacher role without modification of racial preference.” (Charley, 1969, p. 824).

Stuart Cook (1990) relates four experimental studies which include the factors of equal status and cooperative interracial contact. The dates of these studies are between 1951 and 1971. In all of these studies, two of which were especially involved with the subjects' being manipulated over a three-week period, the results show increase in favorable beliefs about and liking for blacks by formerly prejudiced whites. Cook uses these findings and other research to identify measures which seem likely to extend the scope of social justice.

The status role of contact may include problems associated with class prejudice. Again, it is difficult to obtain equal status in natural settings. Mack and Duster ad perception to the issue. “The answer to the tricky question of contact and conflict now seems to be fairly well documented by social science research. Intergroup conflict is reduced when there is contact between equal status members of the two groups. That is, it does no good for a lower or working class Negro to have intimate personal contact with a middle or upper class white. This goes on very frequently in the kitchens and basements of the country, with no lessening of intergroup conflict. To be sure, the personal association with the individual cook may be warm and friendly, but the view of the group remains indeed, m be reinforced by contact with individuals who act as evidence to confirm the stereotype of the race.” (Mack and Duster, 1963, p. 57). The criteria for determining status may be whatever the people involved deem as important. Status may be based on academic ability, athletic ability, appearance, etc. and may change from one setting to another, such as the classroom to the football field.

A study which has minority students in a higher status than majority is reported by Ichilov and Even-Dar (1984). In Israel Jews from Europe generally have higher economic and political status than Jews from North Africa and Asia. The Shelef project had high school seniors from the cities (western Jews) spend a year living, studying, and working with citizens in less developed towns. In these towns they were numerically the minority while enjoying higher status. The findings indicated that the tendency to generalize and to relate to people categorically decreased over the year and was replaced by a more individualistic approach to people different from one’s own.

Another key condition for two groups in contact is the presence of common goals. Sherif defines these as “goals which are compelling and highly appealing to members of two or more groups in conflict but which cannot be attained by the resources and energies of the groups separately. In effect, they are goals attained only when the groups pull together.” (1958, p. 350). He tested the role of goals in a classic experiment with 11 and 12-year old boys in a camp setting. He divided the boys into two groups and deliberately created competition through the use of tournaments with prizes. Each group developed hostile attitudes and unfavorable stereotypes regarding the other group. There was name
calling, physical conflict, and raids on the others’ cabins. There was a concomitant increase in in-group solidarity and cooperation. The boys were then placed in non-competitive contact such as having meals and seeing movies together. The hostile relations continued. Then Sherif introduced superordinate goals. He had the boys work together to combat a water shortage, to obtain food, and to secure a much desired film. The groups did cooperate with each other, and there was a significant improvement in the relationships with lessening of stereotype and name calling and an increase of cross-group friendships. (Sherif, 1958).

Members of a football team have obvious common goals, and the contributions of all players help the team be successful. A high school team with 20 percent black players was studied for a period of three years. Observations of the players found that members of both races walked together to the practice field, sat together on the bus, etc. The players had more contact with members of the other race and less friction than for the school in general. Thus, the contact with common goals was seen to be beneficial. Unfortunately, the interracial contact and positive relations did not carry over to non-school activities. (Miracle, 1981) A similar lack of carry-over has been observed in military and work-place settings. People seem to be able to compartmentalize their attitudes and behavior. At least though, we have the positive contact with common goals and equal status in some situations.

A thorough study by Ashmore was conducted with college students to assess the relative power of aspects of the contact theory on the reduction of prejudice. He studied white male students working in pairs with black students in a range of experimental conditions. The variables tested were reward mechanism, simple stereotype destruction, role interpretation, cognitive dissonance, and a shared-coping approach. His results indicated the reward mechanism, which asserts that the prejudice reducing power of intergroup contact varies as a positive function of the rewardiness of the contact situation. The shared-coping approach, which sets cooperative interdependence at the center of successful contact was also supported. (Ashmore, 1969). Thus we see that not only are equal status and common goals important, but also that the contact needs to be successful or at least pleasant.

In a detailed lab experiment, white college students who had earlier indicated an anti-black attitude were used to test several variables of the contact theory. They worked with black cohorts in management tasks which required the competence and cooperation of each student. The conditions which were created included: (1) equal status (2) interdependence - each needed the other for goal success (3) the black students were counter to the traditional stereotypes, i.e., personable, able, ambitious, self-respecting (4) personal, intimate information about the black students was given (5) situational norms approved the interracial contact. The results did indicate significant position changes of attitudes of the white students. The treatment was effective for students who had indicated high degrees of prejudice. For instance, a student with changed attitudes had previously rejected the idea of having blacks on her city council, sharing rest rooms and beauty parlors, was adverse to exchanging social visits or having a black person as a dinner guest. The findings held up at least two to three months later. (Cook, 1972).

Scott and Damico (1983) asked the question: Does interracial contact in high school predict interracial contact in college? Through a correlational study with white university students, they found the answer to be yes, and that the previous interracial contact had positive effects on students’ attitudes. Of special note is the list of recommendations they make for schools to increase the value of interracial contact.
1) “Since school-sponsored extracurricular activities are the most frequent areas in which cross-race contact is experienced in high school, the potential for improving interracial attitudes and behaviors should be capitalized upon. The most obvious way in which this could be accomplished would be to avoid the use of restrictive criteria for participation such as grade point average.

2) Sponsors of school related-activities should be sensitive to the opportunities available for equal status and cooperative contact and encourage these types of interactions.

3) Avoid school policies which may result in a racial division of the school’s extracurricular programs.

4) Efforts should be made to attract wider participation in school extracurricular activities.” (p. 142)

One condition of the social contact theory that is clearly needed is the opportunity for the people involved to see and get to know the other people as individuals. It would stand to reason that we would have more positive views of others who shared our views. This belief congruity was tested as a necessary condition by Barnard and Benn (1987). They arranged for white male college students to lead discussion groups in which some black and some white students were to agree or disagree with the naive subject. It was predicted that more positive interpersonal perceptions would occur when the group members of both races exchanged similar as opposed to dissimilar beliefs. The results indicated that there was a degree of prejudice reduction across all interracial contact groups, suggesting that belief congruity was not necessary. It is noteworthy, however, that the prejudice reduction did follow the situations in which subjects were deliberately exposed to the belief system of others.

The opportunity to get to know one another and to work on common goals were conditions inherent in a program designed to train college student leaders. Representatives from various campus groups met in a three-hour workshop following a weekend leadership conference. They worked in randomly assigned groups to discuss stereotypes and their own personal attitudes regarding blacks, gays, women, Hispanics, and Jews. They were also charged with developing specific action strategies which would lead to more positive attitudes by other students toward the target groups. Although no statistical pre-post measurement was used, the general consensus among the participants and involved faculty was that the experience was of clear value and promoted a feeling of commonality in being human. (Fasenza and Troutt, 1990).

While not controlling separate aspects of the social contact theory, we assume several essential components were present in a mainstreaming study by Sheare (1974). He studied the social acceptance of educable mentally retarded (EMR) ninth grade students in three schools. One pool of EMR students were integrated in regular classes for physical education, health, art, crafts, music, metal ship, wood shop, cooking, sewing, clubs, activities, and athletics. A control group of non-retarded students attended classes which did not have any EMR students. The only contacts the control group may have had with EMR students were during lunch, passing in the halls, and outside school. The integrated EMR students were not identified as such by the teachers, but it should be noted that the non-retarded students were likely aware of who was in special classes through conversations, home room assignments, and the association with the special-class teachers.
who were well known. Results showed that the non-retarded students who had contact with the integrated EMR students had a significantly higher acceptance rate of EMR students than the control group of students who did not have the social contact. Another study by Towfighy-Hooshyar and Zingle (1984) demonstrated the role of social contact in changing attitudes toward handicapped peers and also reinforced the idea that intervention programs are most successful when they are administered at an early age.

Another study concerned with mainstreaming involved the attitudes of nonhandicapped children toward orthopedically handicapped children. The elementary age students' attitudes were assessed prior to the opening of an orthopedically handicapped unit on the school’s grounds and about a year later. A result of the contact was that the nonhandicapped children’s attitudes changed toward a more positive perception. After integration orthopedically handicapped children were seen as less weak and less in need of attention and help. (Rapeir, et al. 1972).

Previous sections of this report have concluded with generalizations about the given approach based on the relevant research. This section will also, but with a difference. Yehuda Amir has already collated research findings and made generalizations which are presented below. (Amir, 1972, p. 246).

Generalizations About The Social Contact Approach

1. There is increasing evidence in the literature to support the view that contact between members of ethnic groups tends to produce changes in attitude between these groups.

2. The direction of the change depends largely on the conditions under which contact taken place; ‘favorable’ conditions tend to reduce prejudice, ‘unfavorable’ ones may increase prejudice and intergroup tensions.

3. If a change is produced, it does not necessarily follow that the change is in the direction of the attitude. Change may be found in the intensity of the attitude (or in other, not yet explored, dimensions).

4. In many cases where an attitude change is produced as a result of the contact situation, change is limited to a certain area or aspect of the attitude (such as work situations), but does not generalize to other aspects.

5. Although most of the investigations on the effects of contact on the reduction of prejudice report ‘favorable’ finds, this outcome might be attributed to the selection of favorable experimental situations. It is doubtful whether intergroup contact in real life takes place generally under favorable conditions and whether, therefore, in most cases contact actually reduces prejudice.

6. Some of the favorable conditions which tend to reduce prejudice are (a) when there is equal status contact between the members of the various ethnic groups (b) when the contact is between members of a majority group and higher status members of a minority group (c) when an authority and/or the social climate are in favor of and promote the intergroup contact (d) when the contact is of an intimate rather than a casual nature (e) when the ethnic intergroup contact is pleasant or rewarding (f) when the members of both groups in the particular contact situation interact in functionally important activities or develop common goals or superordinate goals that are higher ranking in importance that the individual goals of each of the groups.
7. Some of the unfavorable conditions which tend to strengthen prejudice are:
(a) when the contact situation produces competition between the groups (b) when
the contact is unpleasant, involuntary, tension laden (c) when the prestige or status
of one group is lowered as a result of the contact (d) when members of a group or a
group as a whole are in a state of frustration (i.e., inadequate personality structure,
recent defeat or failure, economic depression, etc.) Here contact with another group
may lead to the establishment of an ethnic scapegoat (e) when the groups in contact
have moral or ethnic standards which are objectionable to each other (f) in the case
of contact between a majority and a minority group, when the members of the
minority group are of a lower status or are lower in any relevant characteristic than
the members of the majority group.

A SUMMARY OF CHANGES IN ATTITUDE TOWARD THE
HANDICAPPED

Although we have already referred to several studies which investigated attitudes
toward the handicapped, Marcia Horne (1987) has presented a comprehensive review of
research findings which can aid our understanding of prejudice reduction in general. While
her summary statements are specific to attitudes toward the handicapped, the principles
involved are virtually identical to principles identified earlier in this paper. As has been
done throughout this paper, the findings are grouped according to approach studied.

Contact: Studies examining the effects of contact between nonhandicapped with
handicapped report mixed results. Most of the contact involved mainstreaming
handicapped elementary students. By separating the elements of experiences with positive
results from the other experiences we can identify the conditions which seem to make the
difference in results. The essential conditions are much the same as the conditions
discussed earlier regarding the social contact theory.

Information: As with contact, the results of giving information are inconclusive. It does
appear that information alone is not sufficient to alter attitudes. Films have frequently been
used as the vehicle for transmitting information, and some uses are more appropriate than
others. A planned, structured teacher-led discussion following a film is recommended.

Contact and Information: It comes as no surprise that a summary of studies which combine
information with contact finds, “Programs that have provided both contact and information
usually have been more successful in modifying participants’ attitudes toward disabled
peers than either alone.” (p. 206)

Small-Group Nonacademic Experience: We continually come back to the desired
conditions of the social contact theory; one of which is the opportunity for participants to
get to know each other as individuals. Several studies had handicapped and nonhandicapped
work together in small-group settings. These experiences usually led to better liking and
increased acceptance of each other although these changed attitudes were not maintained
over time. It may be, as is the case with contact and information, this singular experience
is not enough alone.

Role Playing: Ever since simulations entered the educational scene during the 1960’s,
people have been impressed with the potential of experiential and vicarious activities to alter
both cognitive and effective factors. Several experiments have been conducted using role
playing to modify the attitudes of nonhandicapped people with mixed results. It does
appear though that thoughtfully developed activities which include the input and
cooperation of handicapped individuals and includes attention to cognitive, behavioral, and emotions elements do hold fruitful promise.

Peer Tutoring: The close working relationship of a tutor and tutee would seem to have the potential for attitude change. Studies which have examined this method have found mixed results. The situations are confounded by the variables of appropriate age, setting, content, rewards, relative status and type of handicapped. In spite of the difficulties and limited success of ventures thus far, it does seem worthwhile to explore the possibilities and varying conditions of peer tutoring as a means toward attitude change as well as the obvious cognitive growth.

Bibliotherapy: As is the case with giving information, the use of reading materials is more productive when accompanied by a discussion. The material read could be in the form of autobiography thus including identification, catharsis and empathy or non-fiction thus including additional information. The books read should be carefully screened to avoid stereotypes or inaccurate information. Considering the ready accessibility of books, this approach should be researched further and refined as an attitude changing method.

Games: Given the nature of certain play and game activities the potential for cooperation and familiarization is high. Several studies have found that the attitudes of nonhandicapped students have become more positive due to participation in games and that the changes were maintained over time. A limitation of this research is that it has been conducted with very young elementary students and with pre-school children; nevertheless, there is good potential with the use of games.

Media Presentations: Just as we have seen with the research on changing attitudes regarding race and ethnicity, films and video can be used to change attitudes toward handicapped persons. Considering the power of television, it is unfortunate that some programs have portrayed handicapped persons in an inaccurate or unrealistic manner. Given the almost ubiquitous availability of television, this approach to attitude change should receive great attention.

CONCLUSION

In spite of the problems of research in the reduction of prejudice, we do have a body of knowledge. It seems likely that if we apply what we know in working with young people, we may not only reduce existing prejudice, but may actually prevent its formation in the minds of a great many people. Several of the approaches such as increasing a student's self-esteem, helping them perceive others as individuals, and a sharpening of cognition skills are very likely to help a person resist stereotyped messages and not become prejudiced. Multicultural education, if presented in a genuine fashion rather than superficially, shows great promise. When we engage in prejudice reducing efforts we need to clearly identify the particular goal, which of the three dimensions is the focus of the effort. We also have a great need to assess long-term effects of the efforts. A simple post-test measure does not really tell us if there are lasting effects of the intervention. As a society there is a clear need for us to apply the principles of what we do know in order to realize the ideals of our democratic dream.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Chennault, Madelyn (1967). Improving the social acceptance of unpopular educable mentally retarded pupils in special classes, American Journal of Mental Deficiency, 70, 455-458.


Fishman, Howard & Fishman, Walda Katz (1977). A cast study in black-Jewish relations or the only thing wrong with Jews is that they just ain’t Jewish enough. ERIC ED 146 285.


Parker, Max & Wittmer, Joe (1976). The effects of a communications training program on the racial attitudes of black and white fraternity members. *Journal of College Student Personnel*, 17 (6), 500-503.


