

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 378 373

CE 067 995

AUTHOR Thomas-Fontaine, Jeannine
 TITLE Collective Consultation on Literacy and Education for All. Appraisal and Prospects.
 INSTITUTION United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization, Paris (France).
 PUB DATE Jan 93
 NOTE 42p.
 PUB TYPE Reports - Descriptive (141)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
 DESCRIPTORS *Adult Basic Education; Adult Literacy; *Developing Nations; Economic Development; Foreign Countries; International Cooperation; *International Educational Exchange; *International Organizations; International Programs; *Literacy Education; Womens Education
 IDENTIFIERS *Nongovernmental Organizations

ABSTRACT

During 9 years of operation, the Collective Consultation has provided a structure within which nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) exchange information and experience related to literacy more effectively. The bureau known as "the working group" is responsible for implementation of decisions taken during the Collective Consultation, for their follow-up, and for preparation, in collaboration with the UNESCO Secretariat, of the agenda of the Collective Consultations and the ad hoc working groups. Because it was set up to improve the level of knowledge about the literacy problem and to heighten public awareness of the subject, the Collective Consultation is naturally a forum for information, exchange, and research. From 1984-92, two periods can be clearly distinguished for the Collective Consultation. A preparatory period from 1984-88 is distinguished by no criteria or guidelines, proposals for only 27 small-scale projects, and no joint projects. The year 1989 marks a turning point in the development of the Collective Consultation due to a change of persons involved, a change of projects, and more practical and clearly defined recommendations. The scope of the Collective Consultation has been broadened to include basic education for adults and children. (Appendixes include the following: a table of NGOs illustrating years of participation, a list of projects implemented to further the UNESCO proposal on literacy, a chart showing projects proposed from 1989-92, and minutes of two meetings.) (YLB)

 * Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
 * from the original document. *

COLLECTIVE CONSULTATION ON LITERACY AND EDUCATION FOR ALL

APPRAISAL AND PROSPECTS

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION
CENTER (ERIC)

- This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it
- Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality
- Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Flaminio

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC) "

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Jeannine THOMAS-FONTAINE

January 1993

057 995

**COLLECTIVE CONSULTATION ON LITERACY
AND EDUCATION FOR ALL**

APPRAISAL AND PROSPECTS

Jeannine THOMAS-FONTAINE

January 1993

INTRODUCTION

We do not intend here to present an exhaustive study of the Collective Consultation on Literacy and Education for All, to examine in depth all the themes dealt with or to list all the people involved. Instead, we have chosen to bring out the main lines of action identified by the Collective Consultation, since they correspond to NGOs' wishes and possibilities for action as well as with UNESCO's policies and programme.

BACKGROUND

The relative failure of the first World Literacy Campaign, organized under the aegis of UNESCO, and the questions that it raised (were the achievements often short-lived? why were the populations concerned so often indifferent or even hostile? etc.) became, in the early 1980s, major subjects of concern for UNESCO and indeed for the NGOs with which it maintains official relations.

In October 1983, the NGO Standing Committee (the representative statutory body of NGOs having consultative relations with UNESCO) organized a meeting on the theme 'Literacy - Education - Safeguarding Cultures'. It is noteworthy how this theme, making a close connection between literacy and the safeguarding of cultures, now constitutes the thrust of educational activities ten years later.

On the basis of a recommendation put forward by the General Conference of UNESCO at its twenty-second session in 1983, and in implementation of the Programme and Budget adopted by the General Conference recommending a better understanding of literacy problems through awareness activities and the mobilization of world public opinion to advance the cause of literacy, the NGO symposium adopted a recommendation requesting UNESCO to organize a yearly Collective Consultation of NGOs on literacy.

That recommendation included four proposals:

that the organization of the Collective Consultation alternate between Headquarters and the field;

that a modest contribution be granted to participants for their travel and accommodation expenses;

that matters relating to society, culture, civics, health and teaching methods be considered for inclusion in the agendas of the Consultations;

that an experienced person from an NGO, on a voluntary basis and proposed by the working group, be involved in the activities of the ED/PLA Division that was to monitor the Collective Consultation.

The structural bases of the Consultation were thus clearly established.

The recommendation was favourably received by the Director-General of UNESCO. This form of consultation has in fact existed since 1977 for NGOs concerned with matters relating to youth. The process of creation was thus under way.

The first Collective Consultation for NGOs dealing with literacy was organized at UNESCO Headquarters in November 1984.

The UNESCO Secretariat hoped that, within this structure, NGOs would be able to exchange information and experience more effectively and take steps towards launching convergent activities in order to enhance participation by NGOs in the implementation of UNESCO's activities, especially within the framework of Programme II.1.

PARTICIPANTS

(a) NGOs

The Collective Consultation brings together NGOs having consultative relations with UNESCO, whether they belong to categories A, B or C. The Consultation is also open to foundations or associations which do not have consultative status. These organizations are welcomed as observers, but without the right to vote.

Because of the very intersectoral nature of the literacy problem, many NGOs take part in the Collective Consultation.

Since 1984, 78 NGOs with consultative status have participated in the Consultations (see Annex I), although not all attend regularly. On average, approximately 30 participants attend each session, some 20 of them being 'regulars' which have participated virtually in the whole series of Collective Consultations. From the general table on NGO participation (Annex I) it is apparent that the rate of NGO participation is higher when the Consultations are held at Headquarters. Nevertheless, conclusions should not be drawn too hastily. Indeed, among the NGO representatives present, there are those who attend more out of 'curiosity' in order to appraise the internal workings of the Consultation without, however, necessarily being involved in literacy endeavours as such. Although the number of participants is higher, motivation is often less strong and regular attendance throughout the whole Consultation is not maintained. Participants seek distractions either in the city or in the facilities available at UNESCO. The average NGO participation in the Collective Consultations held away from Headquarters has fluctuated between 23 in Istanbul and 31 in Cairo. The number of participants has been in itself substantially higher, reaching an average of 80 with 2 low points - Prague (1985) and Hamburg (1990). Some NGOs send several representatives, particularly local ones, bringing their number to three or four; this is especially true when the NGO hosts the meeting. There is one constant factor: when an organization is genuinely involved in literacy problems, its representative at the Collective Consultation remains the same even if local representatives are also present. This is a significant indicator of involvement and follow-up.

Year	Venue	Participants	NGO (Category A, B, C)	UNESCO Secretariat	Observers	Technical and financial co- operation institutions
1984	Paris	80	39	16	4	
1985	Prague	47	21	2	3	
1986	Paris	56	37	6	4	
1987	Bangkok	88	29	6	37	
1988	Istanbul	70	23	1	46*	
1989	Quito	89	26	5	45	2
1990	Hamburg	47	27	3	16	
1991	Paris	84	32	13	25	
1992	Cairo	80	31	1	30	1

* 33 of whom were members of the Turkish branch of Soroptimist International.

Moreover, the NGOs most heavily involved in literacy work do not necessarily belong to category A. While there were 13 at the first Collective Consultation, there were only five at the 1991 Collective Consultation (held in Paris), and not more than three of them were represented at the whole series of these meetings:

Co-ordinating Committee for International Voluntary Service;
International Council for Adult Education;
International Union of Students.

The partners which regularly attend the Collective Consultation are from categories B and C, seeking guidance, lines of action and co-operation. Their numbers remain constant: 26 in Paris in 1984; 26 in Paris in 1991. Those most regularly in attendance were representatives of nine NGOs in category B who took part in the whole series of Collective Consultations; those NGOs are as follows:

International Association of Charities (founded by Saint Vincent de Paul);
International Movement ATD Fourth World;
International Reading Association;
International League for Child and Adult Education;
Catholic International Education Office;
World Association of Girl Guides and Girl Scouts;
International Federation of Free Teachers' Unions;
Soroptimist International;
World Education.

This group of regulars (three in category A and nine in category B) may be broken down as follows:

three Catholic organizations;
one teachers' organization;
one women's organization;
one secular organization based in North America;
one secular organization based principally in South America;
one secular organization based in Europe;
one book trade organization;
two youth organizations;
one organization of international solidarity.

A broad range of interests is fairly well represented, although if we refer to the whole body of NGOs participating in the Collective Consultation, the denominational NGOs are the most significant: out of a total of 78 participating NGOs, 20 are denominational, i.e. a quarter of the total. This illustrates the importance of this permanent hard core in the work of the Collective Consultation, being characteristic of the whole body of NGOs from both a sectoral and philosophical standpoint.

(b) Sponsors

From the sixth Collective Consultation onwards, the UNESCO Secretariat and the Bureau of the Consultation have endeavoured to interest representatives of sponsors in the Collective Consultation in order to enhance mutual recognition of the work of the organizations and of the requirements of the sponsors. Admittedly, this is no easy task, and

although contacts have been made, only three representatives have attended: two in Quito and one in Cairo.

VENUES OF THE COLLECTIVE CONSULTATION

After the first Collective Consultation, held at UNESCO Headquarters in Paris, the venues for the subsequent meetings were decided upon in plenary by consensus. All proposals emanating either from the working group or individual participants in the Collective Consultation were considered.

The successive meetings were hosted by the following cities:

Paris	(1984)
Prague	(1985)
Paris	(1986)
Bangkok	(1987)
Istanbul	(1988)
Quito	(1989)
Hamburg	(1990)
Paris	(1991)
Cairo	(1992)

LINK BETWEEN SECTORAL REPRESENTATION OF NGOS AND VENUE FOR THE COLLECTIVE CONSULTATION

The universal nature of illiteracy and the approach to this problem through the teaching of functional literacy encompass several sectors:

- education of children and young people;
- adult education;
- promotion of education for girls and women;
- literacy and culture;
- literacy for the disabled.

Of course, NGOs have a broad range of specializations. Highlighting only the principal areas covered, we find NGOs active in the following spheres:

- teaching, informal education and extra-curricular activities;
- book trade;
- technical assistance;
- culture;
- charitable and denominational activities;
- aid, humanitarian action and international solidarity.

Various factors influence the participation of NGOs. From the table of venues, it will be seen that, in the Collective Consultation held in Prague in 1985, before the collapse of the Communist bloc, denominational NGOs were virtually absent, since only two participated. Political differences outweigh literacy interests.

Conversely, since the changes in the political regimes in the East, the main central trade unions, youth movements (with the exception of IUS), feminist movements (many of which had their headquarters in Eastern Europe) have almost disappeared from the Collective Consultation, and this state of affairs had the knock-on effect of a drop in African representation between 1987 and 1990. Although new networks are being set up, this clearly illustrates the keen underlying political sensitivity that permeates the world of NGOs. These organizations are not exempt from political and economic considerations - they are part of them. It is revealing to see, moreover, that WCOTP, the leading teachers' organization, has never taken part (except very briefly from 1984 to 1985) in the work of the Collective Consultation, owing to an internal crisis, on the one hand, and, on the other, the difficulty of broadening the scope of literacy problems beyond teachers' concerns.

Further examination of the participation table reveals that the meetings held in Bangkok in 1987, Istanbul in 1988, Quito in 1989 and Cairo in 1992 had the highest rates of participation, owing to the attendance of observers and of 'local associations' (37, 46, 45 and 30 respectively) seeking information, and also the availability of financial resources. These local NGOs hastened to attend Collective Consultations which did not really meet their expectations, being international and not regional in scope. However, these meetings reassured them that they were not working in isolation but shared a common goal (a boost to morale) and also provided them with information they lacked.

Furthermore, such meetings afforded an opportunity for local and national NGOs to make contact with UNESCO representatives, other than those from the National Commissions, access to whom was not always easy.

UNESCO REPRESENTATIVES

The participation of Secretariat members is obviously higher at Collective Consultations held in Paris: 16 in 1984, six in 1986 and 13 in 1991. For those held away from Headquarters, the National Commissions vary in their co-operation and attendance: there were five representatives in Bangkok and four in Quito, but none in Prague, Istanbul or Cairo. This weak collaboration is, quite plainly, a regrettable state of affairs and one to which due consideration should be given, especially since decentralization is on UNESCO's agenda.

WORKING METHODS OF THE COLLECTIVE CONSULTATION

(a) Secretariat

The Collective Consultation on literacy problems, under the joint aegis of UNESCO and the NGOs represented at UNESCO, has been under the supervision of the Education Sector since its establishment in 1984.

Three UNESCO staff members have been responsible for this task:

from 1984 to 1987	Mr Arthur Gillette (United States)
1988	Mr Ali Hamadache (Algeria)
1989 to date	Mr Marc Gilmer (France)

assisted by voluntary workers from NGOs when necessary.

(b) NGO voluntary workers

A dozen or so voluntary workers proposed by NGOs have worked in the Education Sector under the guidance of the staff members in charge of the Collective Consultation, and spent periods of three to six months there between 1984 and 1989, carrying out basic tasks which included filing, typing and other clerical work.

Since 1989 there has been only one trainee assigned to the Collective Consultation. This is regrettable, inasmuch as this afforded an opportunity for many organizations to become familiar with the workings of UNESCO and to strengthen their co-operation with the Organization.

NGOs WHICH HAVE BEEN ACTIVE IN THE FOLLOW-UP GROUP

		Co-Chairpersons	Co-Rapporteurs
1984	C.C I Paris	International Council for Adult Education International Union of Students	International Alliance of Women World Confederation of Organizations of the Teaching Profession
1985	C.C II Prague	International Council for Adult Education International Union of Students	International Alliance of Women Co-ordinating Committee for International Voluntary Service
1986	C.C III Paris	International Union of Students International Reading Association	Co-ordinating Committee for International Voluntary Service International Association of Charities (founded by Saint Vincent de Paul)
1987	C.C IV Bangkok	International Reading Association Women's International Democratic Federation	International Association of Charities (founded by Saint Vincent de Paul) Co-ordinating Committee for International Voluntary Service
1988	C.C V Istanbul	Women's International Democratic Federation International Council for Adult Education	Co-ordinating Committee for International Voluntary Service World Education
1989	C.C VI Quito	International Council for Adult Education International League for Child and Adult Education	World Education International Union of Students

		Co-Chairpersons	Co-Rapporteurs
1990	C.C VII Hamburg	International League for Child and Adult Education International ATD Fourth World	International Union of Students Catholic International Education Office
1991	C.C VIII Paris	International Movement ATD Fourth World World Association of Girl Guides and Girl Scouts	Catholic International Education Office International Reading Association
1992	C.C IX Cairo	World Association of Girls Guides and Girl Scouts World Education	International Reading Association United Bible Societies

(c) NGOs

From the NGO standpoint, the bureau known as 'the working group' is responsible for the implementation of the decisions taken during the Collective Consultation and for their follow-up. This group comprises representatives of four NGOs, from among whom are elected two joint chairpersons and two joint rapporteurs, if possible English- and French-speaking. They are elected for two years by the Collective Consultation, and two of them are replaced each year, namely, one chairperson and one rapporteur.

Nominations from NGOs to the 'working group' are sent to the UNESCO Secretariat in Paris and subsequently submitted to the Collective Consultation by the current bureau.

In 1985 and 1986, some hesitation was apparent in the selection of candidates. In order to ensure that the working group was not controlled by a handful of associations, the Collective Consultation in 1986 and 1987 laid down rules governing nominations with a view to maintaining the proper representational balance of NGOs (see table on the bureau's representation from 1984 to 1992).

The working group is responsible for preparing, in collaboration with the UNESCO Secretariat, the agenda of the Collective Consultations and the ad hoc working groups.

The chairpersons preside over the Collective Consultations and the rapporteurs draft the reports on the statutory or ad hoc meetings. They meet, in principle, at least twice between two sessions in order to ensure continuity of activities. Examination of the List of NGOs in the working group shows:

the constant presence of at least one denominational organization since 1986;

the participation of Eastern European organizations from 1984 to 1986;

the interchanging of chairpersons and rapporteurs within the regular group of NGOs mentioned above. The reasons for this are twofold: firstly, these organizations are fully involved in literacy problems and education and, secondly, there are few candidates for these positions that require commitment, work, time and financial investment on the part of the NGO represented (see table).

WORKING BUDGET FOR THE COLLECTIVE CONSULTATION

The outlay for the annual holding of the Collective Consultation on literacy problems is met under the UNESCO regular budget. The sum allocated varies between US \$15,000 and US \$50,000 for the organization, secretariat, publications and follow-up of the Collective Consultation. This is a very modest sum considering that, when Collective Consultations are held away from UNESCO Headquarters, a secretariat, office equipment (hiring of photocopying machines, computers, etc.) and interpretation have to be provided. It is for this reason that the choice of venue for the hosting of the Collective Consultation is influenced by the help that an NGO can contribute by providing free or low-cost meeting-rooms, reception facilities and voluntary staff, interpretation if possible, and accommodation facilities. Without the effective financial backing of the NGOs or that of the UNESCO National Commissions, the Collective Consultations could not be held away from Headquarters.

A budget ranging from US \$800 to US \$6,000 enables the UNESCO Secretariat to help towards travel expenses, priority being given to participants from NGOs in developing countries in the form of a lump sum allowance varying between \$200 and \$600. Otherwise, NGOs must meet the travel and accommodation expenses of their own representatives. This expenditure constitutes, in itself, a financial contribution by NGOs, estimated at approximately \$15,000 for all the NGOs which attend, excluding any reception facilities offered by the host NGO (as was the case in Cairo or Istanbul, for instance).

PURPOSE OF THE COLLECTIVE CONSULTATION

The Collective Consultation was set up in order to improve the level of knowledge about the literacy problem and to heighten public awareness of this subject. It is therefore natural that the Collective Consultation should be a forum for information, exchange and research.

- | | |
|-----------------------------------|---|
| A forum for information: | - between UNESCO and NGOs
- among NGOs themselves |
| A forum for debate and exchanges: | - on techniques, know-how, successful and unsuccessful experiences |
| A forum for research: | - to put joint thinking into practice
- to create ways and means of establishing new partnerships. |

THE COLLECTIVE CONSULTATION AS A FORUM FOR INFORMATION

Each Collective Consultation, meeting in plenary apart from the first Consultation in 1984, has organized its agenda around a special theme:

- | | |
|----------------|-------------------------------------|
| Prague, 1985 | Literacy in rural areas |
| Paris, 1986 | International Literacy Year |
| Bangkok, 1987 | Literacy for women and young people |
| Istanbul, 1988 | Adult education |
| Quito, 1989 | Literacy and post-literacy |

Hamburg, 1990	Education for All
Paris, 1991	Education and the family
Cairo, 1992	Education and the environment.

Background material on these themes is provided by the Secretariat and/or by the NGOs themselves.

Additional themes are also addressed:

languages of literacy teaching;

literacy for the disabled;

functional literacy, etc.

Information, discussions and resolutions: these form the usual working framework.

However, if we consider the Collective Consultation from 1984 to 1992, two periods can be clearly distinguished:

a preparatory period from 1984 to 1988, and

a period of concerted action from 1989 to 1992.

THE PREPARATORY PERIOD

The first Collective Consultation, held in Paris in 1984, stressed the essential role that NGOs played in the international strategy to combat illiteracy. The meeting placed emphasis on:

the need to involve young people into the literacy process designed for adults (NGOs had already realized that many developing countries were no longer able to cope with providing education for their young people);

the necessity of training managers and administrators in the field;

the training of instructors in literacy teaching, although the idea remains firmly rooted that the chief responsibility of teachers is to the formal and informal school system;

the setting-up of a data bank to take stock of literacy material(s) available for NGO use.

In its recommendations, the Collective Consultation advocates:

NGO joint action in the field of literacy;

the strengthening of co-operation between national NGOs and National Commissions;
and

the launching of NGO pilot projects.

However, no criteria have been laid down or guidelines indicated. We remain in the realm of wishful thinking, a situation which is painfully apparent, since only 27 projects were put forward by the NGOs' Collective Consultation between 1984 and 1987, i.e. an average of

five projects per year. These projects, whatever their merits, were individual, small-scale projects, and unique in their own way; they would in any event have been submitted to the Co-action Programme by the NGOs. However, some of these projects were simply feasibility studies. For example, out of the nine projects in 1988, only five were new, four were adopted, and only three contracts were signed that year. UNESCO's financial support varies from \$2,500 to \$5,000 and pilot projects flounder.

Much is said about 'joint projects', but no definition of these has been given.

A joint project is a myth. NGOs should work together on a horizontal plane, but how? From 1984 to 1988 there were few practical achievements and from 1984 to 1986 only seven projects were started. NGOs are not unwilling, but they lack direction. As mentioned earlier, NGOs cover a variety of tendencies, philosophies, sometimes divergent, even opposing. Inducing various NGOs to work together in the field, even if their senior officials are in agreement, often leads to rivalry and power struggles that add to existing difficulties; it would probably be more constructive to outline a course with the same guidelines for all concerned.

At the fifth Collective Consultation held in Istanbul in 1988, the NGOs called for directives for joint projects. It was clear that the Collective Consultation was suffering from a lack of impetus.

For the past four years, the Bureau had been composed of the same three organizations, with the result that decisions seemed to have been taken by a small select committee, thereby causing unease among the other NGOs. As early as 1986, the Collective Consultation had requested a ruling on candidatures and, in 1988, rules governing the Bureau's terms of reference. In these circumstances, the International Council for Adult Education (co-chair) proposed, within the framework of International Literacy Year, to establish on the basis of its own organization an International Task Force on Literacy (ITFL). This proposal had been accepted by the Collective Consultation in Istanbul and was submitted to the Standing Committee in 1989, which ratified it and entrusted the Task Force with its mandate.

This 'split personality' of the Collective Consultation/ITFL added to the existing confusion and discontentment of NGOs, which was further aggravated because of the then likely difficulty the Collective Consultation would have in obtaining details of ITFL's operations and accounts.

In 1989, all those facts brought about a change of stance and strategy within the Collective Consultation.

The 1985-1986 assessment was nevertheless positive in that the Consultation *defined three areas of NGO co-operation:*

- (1) fostering awareness, stimulation and co-ordination;
- (2) research, debate, statistics and stocktaking; and
- (3) practical activities.

It recommended:

a South-South approach for NGOs;

the need to seek to reach the poorest sections of society;

the training of literacy teacher-trainers;
the preparation of a guide for joint projects; and
access by NGO national branches to UNESCO's Regional Offices.

It warned against:

the risk that literacy might be used to serve other interests (more narrowly economic).

It encouraged:

the identification of possible sources of funding for literacy projects, and
prospection for UNESCO extra-budgetary resources to support NGO action.

THE PERIOD OF CONCERTED ACTION, 1989-1992

The year 1989 marked an indubitable turning-point in the development of the Collective Consultation on literacy, owing to:

a change of persons involved;
a change of projects; and
more practical and clearly-defined recommendations.

After the departure of Mr Gillette in 1988, Mr Ali Hamadache provisionally took charge of the Collective Consultation within the Education Sector. Later in the year a new senior official assumed this responsibility. His contacts with NGOs with a view to the preparations for the forthcoming Quito Collective Consultation were numerous, varied and attentive. He took note of the recommendation concerning the guide on the preparation of joint projects. In co-operation with the Bureau, he worked out directives imposing a number of rules governing the preparation of projects: local-level involvement in the preparation of projects, agreement of local authorities, participation of local NGOs in projects, a suitable and well-defined financial structure, necessary teaching materials, evaluation of achievements, and future viability of projects. Those directives were sent out several months beforehand to NGOs. New projects being presented were no longer small-scale. Small projects had not, indeed, disappeared, and continued to be submitted on an individual basis to the Co-action Programme by NGOs. But new projects were large-scale.

These projects presupposed a *bona fide* education policy, were set up in a concerted manner with the national authorities and were required to form an integral part of their education plans. They covered a relatively wide area and enlisted the participation of the populations concerned, in particular local NGOs with which collaboration is essential. The financial outlay varied between \$100,000 and \$500,000. Hence such projects could not be directly financed by UNESCO, so extra-budgetary funds needed to be sought. However, the projects implemented by NGOs were more cost-effective than identical ones executed directly by States. The Collective Consultation was staking its hopes on the future and on extra-budgetary funds from UNESCO. The directives were circulated to NGOs several months in advance.

If such changes were taking place, they were not incidental but the result of favourable circumstances. Preparations for ILY were in full swing, especially those for the Jomtien Conference on Education for All (March 1990), as well as the preparatory work for the Conference of Ministers of Education (Geneva, September 1990), and eventually, for the first time, the Collective Consultation began its work on adult education. NGOs consider themselves, and intend to be active partners; not content with words, they want to be 'promoters of action'. NGOs want to get things moving and see their potential blossom. They are deeply involved in the preparation of these projects, which call for real commitment. Indeed, a well-structured project needs preliminary reconnoitring, local contacts that offer good prospects and teaching assessments, team work and prior investment which may amount to as much as FF 25,000.

Thirty-two projects, more numerous than in the preceding five years, were submitted to the Collective Consultation which was held in Quito in 1989. The new team set up by the sixth Collective Consultation in Quito organized a selection of projects by the NGOs themselves present at the Consultation. Participants, organized by language groups, discussed and analysed the projects and requested additional information on them. This task, carried out strictly, was highly enlightening and served as an excellent training experience for all the NGOs present. Nine projects were acceptable and acknowledged as viable; certain projects needed further elaboration; in some cases this was done, while the remainder collapsed of their own accord owing to inadequate preparation. Furthermore, this process enabled NGOs to gain a deeper understanding of one another's projects and a better appreciation of their respective activities.

That same sixth Collective Consultation in Quito, followed with interest by local and regional NGOs, adopted several important recommendations, advocating:

- (1) the restructuring of the Collective Consultation to provide for regular consultation of regional, national and international NGOs at regional level by the setting up of regional Collective Consultations;
- (2) that the Collective Consultation be recognized by UNESCO as a favoured partner acquainted with ways and means of establishing new professional partnerships; a special resolution was adopted concerning ITFL which the Collective Consultation did not consider qualified to represent it at Jomtien, in view of the total lack of information on its activities (the difficulty experienced by the Bureau in being represented at the Jomtien Conference was somewhat resented by the NGOs, which had done valuable work in the course of 1990);
- (3) that audio-visual material be produced concerning the Collective Consultation in order to publicize its activities;
- (4) that literacy teaching always be aimed at functional literacy and that special efforts be made to teach basic health care, nutrition and practical skills in the economic sphere;
- (5) that strategies be worked out for implementing programmes to foster equal opportunities for women;
- (6) that UNESCO consider the financing of projects submitted to the Collective Consultation and, to that end, that the Bureau prepare a draft contract between

funding agency, NGOs and UNESCO so that the projects submitted to the sixth Collective Consultation can be implemented as required.

Standard contract

While NGOs are aware of the financial problems, they intend not to remain inactive in this area and to propose new initiatives for partnerships.

After considering several types of contracts, including those in use in the European Community, the Bureau and several other NGOs which volunteered for the task endeavoured to draw up a standard contract. This contract, original in form and lending itself to use for large-scale literacy projects submitted by NGOs, was presented by the Collective Consultation to the sixth Collective Consultation in Hamburg in 1990.

A year later, what had become of the projects submitted? Only two of them were in the initial stages of implementation; namely, one in Haiti by the International Movement ATD Fourth World and the other in Senegal by OIEC. Both organizations, either denominational or of denominational origin, were examples where funds allowing for the signing of their respective contracts were directly 'found' by the officials of the Collective Consultation in the Education Sector. This meant a great deal for them, but little when compared to the mass of projects adopted; fuller involvement on the part of BAO seemed desirable.

In order to further the implementation of the nine projects submitted at Hamburg in 1990, the seventh Collective Consultation recommended the setting up, each year, of a UNESCO special fund, instantly available for priority projects, whose criteria could be laid down by common agreement (NGO-UNESCO).

It should be noted that virtually the same proposal had been made in 1986 at the third Collective Consultation in Paris. Does its re-emergence not mean that this is a course worth following up?

The Quito (1989) and the ILY (1990) meetings gave new impetus to NGOs, so it was natural that the Collective Consultation in Hamburg recommended UNESCO to consider ways and means of broadening the scope of the Collective Consultation to cover education for all.

The seventh Collective Consultation in Hamburg invited NGOs to join two networks:

- (1) the practical information network of the UNESCO Institute in Hamburg, and
- (2) the information network set up after Jomtien by the NGOs accredited to:

UNICEF

the World Bank

UNDP.

In 1991, in accordance with the recommendation of the Quito Collective Consultation and with UNESCO's financial support and participation, the International League for Child and Adult Education organized in Porto-Novo the first subregional meeting for French-speaking African countries (see Annex V). In the light of the success of that meeting, the seventh Collective Consultation in Paris recommended an increase in subregional and regional Collective Consultations so as to clarify the needs of local and regional NGOs. The second

regional Consultation, organized by World Education, was held in Asia in October 1992 (see Annex VI).

The eighth Collective Consultation approved the broadening of the scope of the Collective Consultation on literacy to include basic education for adults and children. It thereby became the Collective Consultation on Literacy and Education for All, in conformity with the policies laid down at Jomtien. The word *literacy* is retained advisedly, since it evokes a special effort on behalf of the most disadvantaged. The Consultation drew particular attention to the literacy problems of marginalized groups, to the family and to the vital link between the environment and education.

In Cairo, in December 1992, the Collective Consultation dealt with the theme 'education-environment', a small echo of the Rio Conference. The Collective Consultation recommended to UNESCO:

that it acknowledge environmental education to be an integral part of basic education;

that programmes be based on knowledge of the milieu in which people live, their values and their attitudes;

that the costs of such studies be taken into account in the projects chosen;

that training be provided for teacher-trainers in literacy;

that suitable information be disseminated;

that co-ordination and co-operation between governmental agencies and NGOs be improved (see Recommendation No. 1 of the ninth Collective Consultation appended).

The fall in the number of projects presented is not due to lack of interest on NGOs' part, but to a degree of disappointment. Since 1989, only two large-scale projects have been financed and another is under consideration. Yet, as we have said, working out the details of projects requires a substantial initial outlay on the part of the NGOs; moreover, the studies needed in the field give rise to expectations which, when unfulfilled, render future work more difficult. Thus NGOs are cautious and do not work to their full capacity. This is a threefold loss: for the populations concerned, for UNESCO and its policy on education for all, and for the NGOs themselves.

However, it should be noted that several projects selected by the Collective Consultation have been directly implemented by NGOs, whether in part or with the support of organizations other than UNESCO.

CONCLUSIONS

The Collective Consultation has been in operation for nine years, having, it seems, overcome the structural difficulties of its establishment. The alternating election system appears to offer advantages, and collaboration with the Education Sector is good. Perhaps further consideration should be given to a contract for an NGO trainee, whose role would be a very positive factor in co-operation between NGOs and the Education Sector, and which would also relieve the staff member in charge of a number of tasks, especially those of a bureaucratic nature.

At the general secretariat level, the role of the Collective Consultation on Literacy and Education for All should have a more prominent place within the Organization, and more support should be given to the recommendations of the Collective Consultation. It would be desirable for BAO to participate in the launching of the NGO projects selected by the Collective Consultation.

The role and action of the Collective Consultation should be given a higher profile *vis-à-vis* other organizations, such as UNDP, UNICEF and the World Bank. An audio-visual montage on the Collective Consultation would be helpful in this respect.

Among the range of recommendations drawn up by the Collective Consultation, more particular attention should be paid to the following:

- A. that the drive for literacy and education for all be targeted at the poorest sectors of society;

that strategies be drawn up to teach literacy to girls and women as a means towards true equality of opportunity;

that literacy be based on the local context and always functional;

that aspects of the natural and cultural environment, together with the intrinsic values of the milieu addressed, be taken into account in the projects launched;

that post-literacy be included in all literacy programmes.

- B. At the same time, the Education Sector could undertake the preparation of:

training courses for literacy and post-literacy teacher-trainers;

training courses for teacher-trainers in the preparation of projects, budgeting techniques, management and follow-up;

feasibility studies to explore the possibility of a data bank on literacy and post-literacy teaching materials, in liaison with existing networks.

- C. Lastly, it would be appropriate:

to review the possibility of NGOs' access to extra-budgetary funds for large-scale projects selected by the Collective Consultation;

to consider the establishment of a special UNESCO fund which would be available immediately for NGO-UNESCO priority projects.

The Collective Consultation provides an excellent platform for consensus, debate and potential activities, the NGOs composing it being deeply involved in literacy problems. It would probably be appropriate to give it fresh impetus, or even perhaps to entrust it with in-depth reflection on a theme connected with basic education and the Jomtien follow-up mechanisms.

It is an excellent tool for UNESCO, and it would be a pity to let it lie idle.

ANNEX I

(In French alphabetical order)

	84	85	86	87	88	89	90	91	92
United Bible Societies	B					x	x	x	x
International Co-operative Alliance	A	x	x						
International Alliance of Women	B	x	x						x
Asian and South Pacific Bureau of Adult Education	B			x	x				
World Assembly of Youth	B		x			x			
African Association for Literacy and Adult Education	B	x			x	x	x	x	
International Catholic Association for Radio, Television and Audiovisuals	B						x		
Afro-Asian Writers' Association	B								x
International Association of Applied Linguistics	B			x	x			x	
International Association of Charities (founded by Saint Vincent de Paul)	B	x	x	x	x		x	x	x
International Association of Lions Clubs	B	x	x		x			x	
International Association of Universities	A	x							
International Reading Association	B	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
International Association for Community Development	C		x						
World Association of Girl Guides and Girl Scouts	A	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
World Association for Educational Research	B		x	x	x				

	84	85	86	87	88	89	90	91	92
World Leisure and Recreation Association									
International Federation of Library Associations and Institutions	C								x
Association of Arab Universities	A	x					x	x	x
European Bureau of Adult Education	B								x
International Catholic Child Bureau	C						x		
International Board on Books for Young People	B	x							x
World Scout Bureau	B								
CARITAS INTERNATIONALIS	B	x	x		x	x		x	x
International Centre of Films for Children and Young People	B								
Friends World Committee for Consultation	B	x	x						
Co-ordinating Committee for International Voluntary Service	A	x	x						
Committee of Youth Organizations	-								
NGO Standing Committee	-								
Baha'i International Community	C								
World Confederation of Organizations of the Teaching Profession	A	x	x						
World Confederation of Labour	A	x							
International Council for Adult Education	A	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x

	84	85	86	87	88	89	90	91	92
International Council on Social Welfare	B			x		x	x	x	x
International Council of Women	B	x		x	x	x		x	
International Council of Museums	A					x	x		
International Social Science Council	A	x							
World University Service	B							x	
Women's International Democratic Federation	B	x	x	x	x				
Federation of Arab Teachers	B	x							
International Federation of Catholic Associations for the Blind	.						x		
International Federation of Workers' Educational Associations	A						x		
International Federation of Teachers' Associations	B							x	
International Federation of Newspaper Publishers	B				x				
International Federation of Business and Professional Women	B	x							
International Federation of University Women	B	x	x	x	x		x	x	x
International Federation of Jeunes Musicales	B					x			
International Federation of Rural Adult Catholic Movements	C						x	x	x
International Federation of Catholic Universities	B	x	x			x	x	x	
International Federation for Home Economics	A	x	x						

	84	85	86	87	88	89	90	91	92
International Federation for Parent Education	B	x							
World Federation of Teachers' Unions	A	x						x	x
World Federation of Democratic Youth	B								
World Federation of United Nations Associations	A	x							
World Federation of UNESCO Clubs, Centres and Associations	B	x	x	x		x			
World Federation of Trade Unions	A	x			x				
Socialist International Women	B					x			
Ecumenical Institute for the Development of Peoples	B	x							
International Community Education Association (ICEA)	B		x				x		
International PEN	A			x					
International Young Catholic Students	B						x	x	
Women's International League for Peace and Freedom	B	x							
International League for Child and Adult Education	B	x	x		x	x	x	x	x
International League of Societies for Persons with Mental Handicap	B							x	x
International League of Esperantist Teachers	C		x						
Lire et Ecrire	-						x		
International Movement ATD Fourth World	B	x	x	x		x	x	x	x
International Baccalaureate Office	B	x							

		84	85	86	87	88	89	90	91	92
Catholic International Education Office	B	x		x	x		x	x	x	x
World Organization of Former Students of Catholic Teaching	B	x				x				
Pan Pacific and Southeast Asia Women's Association	-								x	x
Rotary Club of Bangkok	-				x					
International Federation of Free Teachers' Unions	A	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	
Latin American Peace and Justice Service	C						x			
Society of African Culture	B	x								
Soroptimist International	B	x		x	x	x	x	x	x	x
International Union of Socialist Democratic Teachers	-		x	x						
International Union of Students	A	x	x		x	x	x	x	x	
International Union of Family Organizations	B	x								
World Blind Union	B						x	x		
World Union of Catholic Teachers	B			x	x					x
Associated Country Women of the World	B			x	x				x	
World Union of Catholic Women's Organizations	B	x		x					x	
Arab Lawyers' Union	B									x
World Education - Education Mondiale	B			x	x	x	x	x	x	x
Zonta International	B			x						

ANNEX II

PROJECTS IMPLEMENTED FURTHER TO THE NGO/UNESCO PROPOSAL ON LITERACY (1985-1988)

The organization of five congresses and seminars on literacy by:

the International Reading Association (four projects)

the World Federation of UNESCO Clubs, Centres and Associations (one project)

The organization of four training workshops for literacy and post-literacy teacher-trainers by:

the International League for Child and Adult Education

the International Union of Students

a group of NGOs

one of the projects was proposed to the Collective Consultation by the UNESCO Secretariat

Three feasibility studies on the holding of the Collective Consultation away from Headquarters by:

the Co-ordinating Committee for International Voluntary Service and the World Federation of UNESCO Clubs, Centres and Associations (jointly)

the Catholic International Education Office and the World Organization of Former Students of Catholic Teaching (jointly)

Soroptimist International

The production or reproduction of two information guides for NGOs by:

the Co-ordinating Committee for International Voluntary Service

the World Confederation of Organizations of the Teaching Profession

The organization of two training courses on literacy and/or post literacy by:

the International League for Child and Adult Education

Two training sessions for the training of teacher-trainers by:

the International League for Child and Adult Education

the International Council for Adult Education

Two projects on the formation of an NGO international coalition by:

the International Council for Adult Education

Two initiatives to set up a network or subregional co-ordination by:

the International Association for the Development of Cross-Cultural Communication

the Co-ordinating Committee for International Voluntary Service

A feasibility study with a view to a forum on literacy

An information campaign on the achievements of NGOs by:

the International Council for Adult Education

The establishment of a prize for literacy activities by:

the International Reading Association

The production or reproduction of information articles on literacy by:

World Education

The conducting of surveys necessary for a literacy project by:

the International Union of Students

The organization of a world literacy campaign by:

Soroptimist International

ANNEX III

PROJECTS PROPOSED TO THE COLLECTIVE CONSULTATION FROM 1989 TO 1992

Project	Venue	Association	Year
Street libraries and literacy	Haiti	ATD Fourth World	1989
Reprographic and post-literacy units	Guinea	LJEECP	1989
Training of post-literacy teacher-trainers	Burkina Faso	LJEECP	1989
Literacy in the family	Senegal	OIEC	1989
Literacy	Cameroon	OIEC	1989
Video on functional illiteracy in French-speaking countries	French-speaking countries	ICSW	1989
Regional literacy centre		CCIVS	1989
Vocational training centre	Cambodia	LJEECP	1989
Maison de l'écriture	France	LJEECP	1989
Young people and the desert	Egypt	SANABEL	1989
Training in art and literacy	Ecuador	LJEECP	1989
Agriculture, environment and basic education	Indonesia	World Education	1989
Education of young people	Ecuador	CEDIMI	1989

Project	Venue	Association	Year
Adult education	Hong Kong	Caritas	1989
Quechua and Spanish bilingual experience	Ecuador	IRA	1989
Literacy and culture	Central America		1989
Literacy for mothers	Peru	CIF	1989
Training of literacy teacher-trainers	Peru	CIF	1989
School places for all	Senegal	OIEC	1989
Development of a literacy programme	Ghana	IRA	1989
Literacy	Colombia	ALFACIT	1989
Promotion of the written language in rural areas	Mexico	CEE	1989
Adults and technology	Mexico	CEE	1989
UNESCO Clubs and literacy	Ecuador	FECV	1989
Post-literacy for blind people	Ecuador	Elusalde	1989
Musical literacy	Ecuador	J.M.	1989
Literacy project	Zaire	UBA	1990
Literacy project	Burundi	UBA	1990

Project	Venue	Association	Year
Literacy project	Ecuador	UBA	1990
Post-literacy	India	Catholic Universities	1991
Functional literacy for women	Philippines	World Education	1990
Literacy for young people	Zaire	OIEC	1990
Literacy	Rwanda	OIEC	1990
Literacy	Burundi	OIEC	1990
Literacy for migrant workers	Belgium	Fédération Internationale des travailleurs	1990
Literacy and development	Mali	JECI	1990
Evaluation of a pilot library and education		IFLA	1992
Literacy for young herders of livestock	Ghana	OIEC	1992
Teacher-training centre	Bolivia Ecuador Peru	ACEPE	1992



ANNEX IV

NINTH COLLECTIVE CONSULTATION, CAIRO

RECOMMENDATION

The ninth Collective Consultation,

1. Considering the urgency of the environmental issue worldwide, recommends that UNESCO recognize environmental education as an integral part of basic education and ensure its promotion in intersectoral activities,
2. Considering the vital connection between education, environment, development and democracy, recommends that the programmes to be implemented be based on:

knowledge of the milieu in which the target populations live: of their natural physical, social and cultural environment;

values and attitudes that are likely to promote harmony with nature, people and societies, while avoiding any tendency towards coercion,
3. Considering the complexity of this field, recommends that UNESCO ensure the promotion of environmental education within basic education by encouraging the pooling of experience through the NGO network, and the popularization and dissemination of suitable information, and that it improve co-ordination and co-operation among governmental agencies and NGOs,
4. Considering training needs, recommends that UNESCO encourage access to information on new educational approaches by distributing guides and practical manuals to foster the emergence of new values and changes of attitude, without which programmes are bound to fail, and by making provision for the training of teacher-trainers.

ANNEX V

FIRST SUBREGIONAL MEETING OF NGOs ON LITERACY IN FRENCH-SPEAKING AFRICAN COUNTRIES

The first subregional meeting of NGOs on literacy in French-speaking African countries was held in Porto-Novo, Benin, in October 1991.

This gathering, organized by the International League for Child and Adult Education, at that time co-chair of the Collective Consultation, brought together 92 representatives of 52 NGOs from 14 French-speaking African countries.

CONCLUSIONS

The participants examined a number of issues from which the following conclusions were drawn:

(a) The link between the official language and national languages

This issue has obviously not been resolved in French-speaking countries and still gives rise to heated arguments. Intransigent and dogmatic stances seem, nevertheless, to have given way to more pragmatic debate. Without going so far as to speak of consensus, we can, nevertheless, highlight the following achievements:

Each community has its own distinctive characteristics which will make it opt for one or other solution at a given moment. Therefore, the role of the literacy worker will be to provide the necessary tools for its specific needs.

To teach people to read and write is one thing (a task usually efficiently achieved in a national language), but learning another language in order to broaden one's possibilities of communication is quite another.

It is therefore essential:

to promote a reading environment in mother tongues (literature, newspapers, etc.);

to encourage the written use of mother tongues by their gradual introduction into everyday administrative documents (billboards, road signs, maps, etc.);

to train managerial staff who are proficient in French to use their written mother tongue in order to act as intermediaries between both languages.

Needless to say, the choice of one or more mother tongues as a national language is a problem that must be dealt with, but it lies outside our present remit.

(b) The need to speed up the training of post-literacy teacher-trainers to make it easier to produce and exchange post-literacy material in French and national languages.

(c) The needs of NGOs and their role in literacy policies

The range of problems to be solved is vast. Each French-speaking African country has its own literacy policy which strives to be forward-looking and coherent; but the task calls for a general mobilization.

For this reason, each NGO must collaborate in this endeavour. What can each organization contribute?

Its aim is to solve a particular problem. Each organization's force resides in its speed of reaction, its capacity to mobilize resources for a wide range of activities requiring moderate outlay, its awareness of the field, and the low cost of its 'infrastructure'.

Its weaknesses reside in its scarce financial resources, its difficulties in circulating information, its lack of co-ordination with other NGOs, and the fact that its activities do not always fit smoothly into overall State policies.

Hence, to obviate any sense of isolation, or to eliminate redundancy, and to ensure that NGOs' pragmatic and fragmentary approach is not in conflict with regional or national literacy and development policies, the NGOs attending the Porto-Novo meeting proposed:

the establishment of a resource centre for documentary information and the exchange of teaching materials, at least at the regional level in the French-speaking countries of Africa and, as far as possible, at the local level (prefectures, districts, etc.);

the setting up of an NGO co-ordinating body, at least at regional and national levels, which is federally structured and independent of State authorities but capable of dialogue with them.

A possibility might include federations of local NGOs, where they exist.

This proposal is fully in keeping with the line of thought pursued by NGOs since the Jomtien Conference, which led to the setting up of a network for Education for All.

It may be concluded from this meeting that literacy problems are closely bound up with economic development problems in French-speaking African countries, but also that they are indissociable from the democratic process. Education for democracy can be achieved only through literacy teaching and its follow-up.

Priority must be given to combating illiteracy and in order to do so the necessary means have to be found.

LITERACY PROJECTS

At Porto-Novo the NGO participants knew they would be able to submit simple but innovative projects on literacy activities for French-speaking African countries.

NGO participants had received a standard form to be completed for the selection of the five best projects out of the 24 presented.

Five projects were selected for a subvention of \$5,000 each, for NGOs operating as follows:

one in Benin

one in Burkina Faso

one in Mali

one in Togo.

ANNEX VI -

**REGIONAL CONSULTATION OF ASIAN NGOS
ON BASIC EDUCATION AND THE ENVIRONMENT**

The meeting was held in Brastagi, north of Sumatra in Indonesia, in October 1992. It brought together 38 organizations from Indonesia, Sri Lanka, Cambodia, Laos, Thailand, the Philippines, New Guinea and the United States, as well as representatives of Indonesian governmental agencies and sponsors' representatives.

At the outset, the meeting was financially backed by UNESCO. World Education and many other sponsors provided the necessary additional funds.

Objectives

To familiarize NGO key personnel with basic education programmes for environmental protection in South-East Asia;

To take stock of environmental problems in collaboration with local populations and decide with them on ways of solving those problems;

To arrange for exchanges and transfers of skills, depending on the means available and local requirements;

To encourage the formation of groups for participation in development and to establish vertical networks.

On completion of the consultation's work, regional programmes of follow-up activities were planned, namely:

1. training in a rural participatory approach, organized jointly by NGOs from Laos and Thailand, prior to June 1993, in order to deal specifically with the identification of the needs of illiterate women's groups;
2. training of teacher-trainers in a rural participatory approach planned for November 1992 in Cambodia, jointly by NGOs and government departments of the Ministry of Agriculture;
3. visits to Indonesian rural schools in October 1993 by representatives from Cambodia and Laos;
4. the networking of Indonesian NGOs with the activities of Papua New Guinea for the prevention of AIDS by means of folk theatre programmes.