This report presents evaluative information of the effectiveness of the Career Awareness and Resource Education (Project CARE) program in New York City. The program served 346 students of limited English proficiency. Participating students received instruction in English as a second language ESL, native language arts (NLA), the content areas, and career education that had a particular focus on enhancing career skills. The project provided staff with materials on the education of LEP students and offered staff opportunities to attend conferences and workshops on the subject. Parents participated in Open School Day/Evening at the project's two sites, acted as chaperons on project trips, and participated in ESL classes provided to them by the project. Data show that Project CARE met its objectives for career advisement, career development, increasing appreciation of the American culture and citizenship, student attitudes toward school, dropout prevention, attendance, and parental involvement. The project partially met its content-area objective. Project CARE failed to meet its objectives in ESL and NLA. No recommendations are made. Appendices contain a list of instructional materials and class schedules. (GLR)
Career Awareness and Resource Education (Project CARE)
Transitional Bilingual Education Grant T003A80307
EVALUATION REPORT
1992-93
Career Awareness and Resource Education (Project CARE)
Transitional Bilingual Education Grant T003A80307
EVALUATION REPORT
1992-93

Mr. Gilberto Vega
Project Director
1171 65th Street, Room 503
Brooklyn, NY 11219
(718) 236-3584
NEW YORK CITY BOARD OF EDUCATION

Carol A. Gresser  
President

Irene H. Impellizzeri  
Vice President

Victor Gotbaum  
Michael J. Petrides  
Luis O. Reyes  
Ninfa Segarra-Vélez  
Dennis M. Walcott  
Members

Andrea Schlesinger  
Student Advisory Member

Ramon C. Cortines  
Chancellor

9/13/93

It is the policy of the New York City Board of Education not to discriminate on the basis of race, color, creed, religion, national origin, age, handicapping condition, marital status, sexual orientation, or sex in its educational programs, activities, and employment policies, and to maintain an environment free of sexual harassment, as required by law. Inquiries regarding compliance with applicable laws may be directed to Mercedes A. Mesafield, Director, Office of Equal Opportunity, 110 Livingston Street, Room 501, Brooklyn, New York 11201. Telephone: (718) 935-3320.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Career Awareness and Resource Education (Project CARE) was an Elementary and Secondary Education Act (E.S.E.A.) Title VII-funded project in its fifth year of operation at Eastern District High School in Brooklyn and Flushing High School in Queens. Project CARE served a total of 346 students of limited English proficiency (LEP). This represented a decrease of 259 students from the previous year.

Participating students received instruction in English as a second language (E.S.L.), native language arts (N.L.A.), the content areas, and career education. There was a particular focus on enhancing career skills. Multicultural activities both in the classroom and in extracurricular activities were a major part of Project CARE.

Project CARE provided staff with materials on the education of LEP students and offered staff opportunities to attend conferences and workshops on the subject. Project staff maintained contact with parents throughout the school year. Parents participated in Open School Day/Evening at both sites, acted as chaperons on project trips and participated in E.S.L. classes provided to them by the project.

Project CARE met its objectives for career advisement, career development, increasing appreciation of American culture and citizenship, student attitude toward school, dropout prevention, attendance, and parental involvement. The project partially met its content area objective. Project CARE failed to meet its objectives in E.S.L. and N.L.A. The Office of Research, Evaluation, and Assessment (OREA) could not measure the objective for cultural awareness due to lack of data.

OREA is not offering any recommendations to the project since this was its final year of funding.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This report has been prepared by the Bilingual, Multicultural, and Early Childhood Evaluation Unit of the Office of Educational Research. Thanks are due to Ms. Trudy Wesio Licht, Mr. Edward Angelina, and Ms. Carrie Klinger for collecting the data and writing the report.

Additional copies of this report are available from:

Dr. Tomi Deutsch Berney
Office of Educational Research
Board of Education of the City of New York
110 Livingston Street, Room 732
Brooklyn, NY 11201
(718) 935-3790 FAX (718) 935-5490
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## I. INTRODUCTION
- Project Context 1
- Student Characteristics 1
- Project Objectives 4
- Project Implementation 5
- Parent and Community Involvement Activities 10

## II. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY
- Evaluation Design 11
- Instruments of Measurement 12
- Data Collection and Analysis 13

## III. FINDINGS
- Participants’ Educational Progress 15
- Former Participants’ Progress in English Language Classrooms 21
- Overall Educational Progress Achieved Through Project 21
- Case History 25
- Staff Development Outcomes 25
- Parental Involvement Outcomes 26

## IV. SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS
- Achievement of Objectives 27
- Most and Least Effective Components of the Project 28
- Recommendations to Enhance Project Effectiveness 28

### APPENDIX A
- Instructional Materials 29

### APPENDIX B
- Class Schedules 31
LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TABLE 1</td>
<td>Number of Students in Project CARE, by Grade and Site</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE 2</td>
<td>Students' Countries of Origin</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE 3</td>
<td>Project Staff Qualifications</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE 4</td>
<td>Qualifications of Non-Title VII Staff</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE 5</td>
<td>Pretest/Posttest N.C.E. Differences on the Language Assessment Battery, by Site</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE 6</td>
<td>Pretest/Posttest N.C.E. Differences on El Examen de Lectura en Español (ELE), by Site</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TABLE 7</td>
<td>Final Grades in Content Area Courses, by Site</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
I. INTRODUCTION

This report documents the Office of Research, Evaluation, and Assessment's (OREA's) evaluation of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act (E.S.E.A.) Title VII project, Career Awareness and Resource Education (Project CARE).

PROJECT CONTEXT

The program operated at Eastern District High School in Brooklyn and Flushing High School in Queens.

Of the 2,838 students registered at Eastern District High School, 73 percent were Latino, 26 percent were African-American, 1 percent was Asian-American, and a fraction of one percent was European-American.* Of these students, 26 percent were of limited English proficiency (LEP), and 78 percent came from low-income families.

At Flushing High School, 2,238 students were registered during the period under review. Forty-five percent were Latino, 23 percent were African-American, 16 percent were Asian-American, 16 percent were European-American, and less than 1 percent was Native American.* Of these students, 26 percent were LEP, and 24 percent came from low-income families.

STUDENT CHARACTERISTICS

Project CARE served a total of 346 Spanish-speaking LEP students in grades nine through twelve. (See Table 1.) Scores at or below the 40th percentile on the

*Numbers exceed 100 percent because of rounding.
Language Assessment Battery (LAB) determined LEP status. Other qualifying factors were low language literacy on the Spanish LAB or failure in two or more academic subjects in a semester. The project also considered teacher recommendations.

TABLE 1
Number of Students in Project CARE, by Grade and Site

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Site</th>
<th>9</th>
<th>10</th>
<th>11</th>
<th>12</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eastern District High School</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flushing High School</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>346</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Of the 346 students served by the project, 133 (38.4 percent) were female and 213 (61.6 percent) male. All students had Spanish as their native language. For countries of origin, please see Table 2. Many students in Project CARE's target population had recently emigrated to the United States. Almost all (97.4 percent) of the students in the target population were eligible for the free-lunch program, an indication of low family income.

Needs Assessment

Before instituting this program, Eastern District and Flushing High Schools conducted an exhaustive needs assessment of the targeted LEP population, their families, and the educational staff who would serve them. The data obtained indicated three primary needs: (1) to provide target students with intensive instruction to improve both their English and Spanish language skills; (2) to prepare...
### TABLE 2

**Students' Countries of Origin**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Number of Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dominican Republic</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Puerto Rico</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecuador</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El Salvador</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colombia</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Honduras</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nicaragua</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peru</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Panama</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guatemala</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bolivia</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Venezuela</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unreported</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>346</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

LEP students for careers by providing them with a comprehensive program of instruction, support services, and information about career skills and opportunities; and (3) to provide parents and adult relatives of participants with English as a second language (E.S.L.) courses, familiarize them with the American educational system, and prepare them to contribute effectively to the education of their children.
PROJECT OBJECTIVES

Student Objectives

- As a result of participating in the program, 70 percent of the targeted students will demonstrate an appropriate increase in English proficiency.

- As a result of participating in the program, 75 percent of the targeted students will demonstrate a significant increase in native language achievement.

- As a result of participating in the program, 70 percent of the targeted students will achieve scores at or above the passing criterion of 65 in the content areas: social studies, science, and mathematics.

- The program will organize at least two field trips to historical museums, the United Nations, and the White House, etc., to increase their familiarity with American culture and citizenship.

- As a result of participating in the program, 75 percent of the targeted students will demonstrate an improvement in attitude toward their cultural heritage.

- As a result of participation in the program, the students will demonstrate an improvement in attitude toward school.

- All graduating students will meet with the bilingual career specialists for advisement during the school year.

- The program will organize at least one conference for students in which representatives of business and industry will present information on career options and skills requirements.

- As a result of participating in the program, the dropout rate of the project students will be significantly lower than that of non-program students.

- As a result of participating in the program, project students' attendance will be significantly higher than that of mainstream students.
Parental Involvement

- The proportion of program students’ parents who participate in Open School Day/Evening will be equal to or greater than the proportion of mainstream students’ parents who participate in this activity.

PROJECT IMPLEMENTATION

Project CARE provided instructional and support services to 346 Spanish-speaking students and their families during the 1992-93 school year. The project’s main goals were to promote LEP students’ acquisition of language and content area skills and to prepare them for careers after graduation from high school.

Project CARE offered a wide variety of in-service staff development activities, including workshops, observations, and a staff development day.

Materials, Methods, and Techniques

The project offered E.S.L. at all levels from literacy to transitional at both sites. Literacy through intermediate levels met 15 periods each week; advanced and transitional level E.S.L. classes met 10 periods each week. A peer-tutoring approach was used at lower levels, while cooperative learning was emphasized at higher levels. Computer-assisted instruction (C.A.I.) was used in E.S.L. classes. The resource teacher also worked with students individually as time allowed.

Native language arts was offered at both sites at all levels, from literacy to advanced placement. Literacy level N.L.A. courses met for 10 periods each week; all other levels met for 5 periods. Advanced placement students served as peer tutors. As with E.S.L. classes, cooperative learning, C.A.I., and individual attention from the resource teacher were instructional strategies for N.L.A.
The project incorporated a strong multicultural component into classroom and extracurricular activities in order to increase knowledge and understanding of the different cultures represented by project students. Multicultural activities included participation in an "International Extravaganza" and a food festival, trips to see plays at the Repertorio Español, and observation of Dominican Independence Day and Puerto Rican History Month.

Content area courses were taught in Spanish. Peer tutoring, cooperative learning, and C.A.I. were emphasized.

For a list of instructional materials used in the project, please see Appendix A.

Capacity Building

This was the fifth and final year of Title VII funding for Project CARE. Next year, tax-levy funds will pay for an educational assistant at each site, as well as for field trips, textbooks, and supplies.

Staff Qualifications

Title VII staff. Title VII fully funded an office aide at Eastern District High School and a resource teacher at each site. It also partially funded a paraprofessional at each site. For a description of degrees held and language competencies (teaching or communicative proficiency*) please see Table 3.

*Teaching proficiency (TP) is defined as the ability to use LEP students' native language in teaching language arts or other academic subjects. Communicative proficiency (CP) is defined as a non-native speaker's basic ability to communicate and interact with students in their native language.
TABLE 3
Project Staff Qualifications

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position Title</th>
<th>Degree(s)</th>
<th>Language Competence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Resource teachers (2)</td>
<td>Masters (2)</td>
<td>Spanish TP (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paraprofessionals (2)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Spanish N.S.* (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Office aide</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Vietnamese N.S.*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*N.S. = native speaker.

The responsibilities of the project director included the supervision and coordination of activities, staff selection and training, and the provision of evaluation data. The director had a supervisory license and more than five years of teaching experience.

Each resource teacher assisted classroom teachers in the development and implementation of instructional activities, provided in-service training to teachers, helped plan activities for parents of participating students, and selected instructional material. The research teachers had at least five years of teaching experience, and each held E.S.L. and Bilingual licenses.

Other staff. Tax-levy funds paid the salaries of 66 teachers, 4 guidance counselors, and 7 paraprofessionals who provided services to Project CARE students. For degrees held, certifications, and language competencies, please see Table 4.
Fifty-seven of the teachers taught in areas in which they were certified. Five teachers taught two subjects, including one in which they were not certified. Four others taught in areas for which they were not certified.

**TABLE 4**

Qualifications of Non-Title VII Staff

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position Title</th>
<th>Degree</th>
<th>Language Competence</th>
<th>Certifications*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>66 Teachers</td>
<td>17 Bachelor's 1 P.D. 1 Ph.D. 1 Unknown</td>
<td>Spanish 38 TP, 9 CP Korean 1 CP</td>
<td>22 E.S.L. 15 Spanish 2 Mathematics 8 Bil. Math 4 English 4 Social Studies 5 Bil.Soc.Stud. 3 Bil.Science 1 Science 1 French 1 Physical Ed. 1 Bil.Spec.Ed. 1 Speech 1 Not specified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Guid. Counselors</td>
<td>4 Master's</td>
<td>Spanish 3 TP, 1 CP</td>
<td>3 Bil.Guidance 1 Guidance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Paraprofessionals</td>
<td>5 H.S. 1 Bachelor's 1 Unknown</td>
<td>Spanish 5 CP</td>
<td>N.A.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Some teachers held multiple certifications.

**Staff Development**

Project CARE included a wide variety of staff development activities. Staff participated in conferences, workshops, and meetings on such topics as effective
interaction with parents, the use of computers as a pedagogical tool, lesson planning, and multicultural and interdisciplinary educational techniques. Materials of interest to teachers of bilingual students were disseminated to project staff.

Instructional Time Spent on Particular Tasks

See Appendix B for examples of class schedules.

Length of Time Participants Received Instruction

Students had a mean of 7.4 years (s.d. = 1.7) of education in a non-English-speaking school system and 3.2 years (s.d. = 1.7) of education in the United States. The median length of time students participated in the program was 20 months.

Activities to Improve Pre-referral Evaluation Procedures

Teachers referred students with academic or social problems to a Project CARE resource teacher, who worked with the guidance staff to determine causes. If necessary, the student was referred to the School-Based Support Team (S.B.S.T.), consisting of a psychologist, social worker, and educational evaluator, for tests and interviews. The psychologist and social worker on the S.B.S.T. were fluent in Spanish. When deemed necessary, the student was recommended to the Committee on Special Education (C.S.E.) for a specific special education program.

Since the project targeted LEP students who had demonstrated academic weakness, there was no gifted and talented component in Project CARE.
Instructional Services for Students with Special Needs

Students identified as requiring a special education program were placed in an appropriate program based on their evaluation by the C.S.E.

Students needing extra help received peer tutoring and individual attention from Project CARE resource teachers.

The more successful students in the program were encouraged to serve as peer tutors and to contribute to the literacy magazine or to become service aides and interpreters for various school offices.

PARENT AND COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT ACTIVITIES

Project CARE parents participated in Open School Day/Evening at both sites during the period under review. Individual meetings were held with parents to discuss their children's progress. Parents also participated in the Bilingual Parents' Advisory Council (BPAC) and the P.T.A. and served as chaperons on field trips. Project CARE offered E.S.L. classes to parents and adult relatives of project students.
II. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

EVALUATION DESIGN

Project Group’s Educational Progress as Compared to That of an Appropriate Non-Project Group

OREA used a gap reduction design to evaluate the effect of language instruction on project students’ performance on standardized tests. Because of the difficulty in finding a valid comparison group, OREA used instead the groups on which the tests were normed. Test scores are reported in Normal Curve Equivalents (N.C.E.s), which are normalized standard scores with a mean of 50 and a standard deviation of 21.1. It is assumed that the norm group has a zero gain in N.C.E.s in the absence of supplementary instruction and that participating students’ gains are attributable to project services.

Applicability of Conclusions to All Persons Served by Project

Data were collected from all participating students for whom there were pre- and posttest scores. (There were no pretest data on students who entered the program late; therefore, posttest data for them will serve as pretest data for the following year.) Instruments used to measure educational progress were appropriate for the students involved. The LAB and El Examen de Lectura en Español (ELE) are used throughout New York City to assess the growth of English and Spanish skills in populations similar to those served by Project CARE.
OREA compared pre- and posttest scores on the LAB to assess the E.S.L. objective and the ELE to assess the N.L.A. objective. The content area objective in mathematics, science, and social studies was assessed through course grades, as specified.

All students were tested at the appropriate grade level. The language of the LAB and ELE was determined by the test itself.

According to the publishers' test manuals, all standardized tests used to gauge project students' progress are valid and reliable. Evidence supporting both content and construct validity is available for the LAB. Content validity is confirmed by an item-objective match and includes grade-by-grade item difficulties, correlations between subtests, and the relationship between the performance of students who are native speakers of English and students who are LEP. To support reliability, the Kuder-Richardson Formula 20 (KR20) coefficients and standard errors of measurement (SEM) are reported by grade and by form for each subtest and total test. Grade reliability coefficients, based on the performance of LEP students on the English version, ranged from .88 to .96 for individual subtests and from .95 to .98 for the total test.

El Examen de Lectura en Español (ELE) was prepared by New York City educators who were native speakers of Spanish and represented several Latino linguistic and cultural groups. The ELE was administered in two forms to all New York City students who were receiving language arts instruction in Spanish. For
form 1, the grade reliability coefficients ranged from .94 to .96. Comparable data for form 2 will be generated as soon as possible after its administration in the spring of 1993. Items on the test were grade-specific. Construct validity is evidenced by grade-to-grade decreases in item difficulty within level. This characteristic reflects the acquisition of increased amounts of the underlying construct (reading proficiency) as students progress through the grades.

DATA COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS

Data Collection

To gather qualitative data, an OREA evaluation consultant carried out on-site and telephone interviews with the project director several times during the school year and also observed two classes on each of two visits. The project evaluator collected the data and prepared the final evaluation report in accordance with the New York State E.S.E.A. Title VII Bilingual Education Final Evaluation Report format, which was adapted from a checklist developed by the staff of the Evaluation Assistance Center (EAC) East in consultation with the Office of Bilingual Education and Minority Language Affairs (OBEMLA).

Proper Administration of Instruments

Qualified personnel received training in testing procedures and administered the tests. Test administrators followed guidelines set forth in the manuals accompanying standardized tests. Time limits for subtests were adhered to; directions were given exactly as presented in the manual.
Testing at Twelve-Month Intervals

Standardized tests were given at 12-month intervals, following published norming dates.

Data Analysis

Accurate scoring and transcription of results. Scoring, score conversions, and data processing were accomplished electronically by the Scan Center of the Board of Education of the City of New York. Data provided by the Scan Center were analyzed in the Bilingual, Multicultural, and Early Childhood Evaluation Unit of OREA. Data collectors, processors, and analysts were unbiased and had no vested interest in the success of the project.

Use of analyses and reporting procedures appropriate for obtained data. To discover the proportion of students gaining skills in English, Spanish, and the content areas, OREA computed the percentage of students showing gains on the LAB and ELE and the percentage of students passing their content area courses each semester. To assess the significance of students' achievement in English, Spanish, and mathematics, OREA computed a correlated t-test on the LAB and ELE N.C.E. scores. The t-test determined whether the difference between the pre- and posttest scores was significantly greater than would be expected from chance variation alone.

The only possible threat to the validity of any of the above instruments might be that LAB norms were based on the performance of English Proficient (EP) rather than LEP students. Since OREA was examining gains, however, this threat was inconsequential—the choice of norming groups should not affect the existence of gains.
III. FINDINGS

PARTICIPANTS' EDUCATIONAL PROGRESS

Project CARE carried out all activities specified in its original design.

LEP Participants' Progress in English

The development of students' English language skills was a major goal of Project CARE, and all students spent 10 to 15 periods each week in an E.S.L. class.

An OREA evaluator observed a literacy level E.S.L. class of ninth grade students at Flushing High School. Nineteen students were present. The lesson was on the weather and seasons of the year. Instruction was in English supplemented with a very small amount of Spanish. Students used a worksheet at the beginning of class, and a paraprofessional walked around the room to help as necessary. Later, the teacher offered new vocabulary. The class ended with the teacher calling individuals to the board to write their answers to simple questions. Students were cooperative and enthusiastic.

An OREA evaluator also observed an E.S.L. class at Eastern District High School with 16 students from grades nine through eleven. The lesson for the day was on English terms for family members. The class was enthusiastic and often volunteered answers. Students worked in groups, employing cooperative learning techniques and communicated in English throughout the period. Toward the end of the period, the teacher called on individuals to talk about the composition of their families.
The evaluation objective for English as a second language was:

- As a result of participating in the program, 70 percent of the targeted students will demonstrate an appropriate increase in English proficiency.

There were complete pre- and posttest scores on the LAB for 269 students from grades nine through twelve. Overall, 40.7 percent of project students for whom data were available demonstrated a gain. The mean gain was 3.4 N.C.E.s (s.d. = 8.6) and was statistically significant (p < .05). (See Table 5.)

The project did not meet the E.S.L. objective. Last year, the project also failed to meet this objective.

**Participants' Progress in Native Language Arts.**

The evaluation objective for N.L.A. was:

- As a result of participating in the program, 75 percent of the targeted students will demonstrate a significant increase in native language achievement.

There were complete pre- and posttest scores on the ELE for 47 students from grades nine through twelve. The mean gain from pre- to posttest for project students was 2.3 N.C.E.s. (See Table 6.) Of the students for whom data were available, 46.8 percent demonstrated an increase.

The project did not meet its N.L.A. objective.
TABLE 5
Pretest/Posttest N.C.E. Differences on the Language Assessment Battery, by Site

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>High School</th>
<th>Total number of students</th>
<th>Number of students for whom data were available</th>
<th>Pretest Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>Posttest Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>Difference Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>f value</th>
<th>t value</th>
<th>p&lt;.05</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eastern District</td>
<td>217</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>12.0</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>5.22</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flushing</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>9.1</td>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>4.02</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>346</td>
<td>269</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>10.7</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>6.58</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Students at both sites made statistically significant gains on the LAB.
**TABLE 6**

Pretest/Posttest N.C.E. Differences on El Examén de Lectura en Español (ELE), by Site

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>High School</th>
<th>Total number of project students</th>
<th>Number of students for whom data were available</th>
<th>Pretest</th>
<th>Posttest</th>
<th>Difference</th>
<th>t value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eastern District</td>
<td>217</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>29.2</td>
<td>39.8</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>2.70*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flushing</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>37.1</td>
<td>37.1</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>14.1</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>346</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>35.4</td>
<td>37.7</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>1.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*p < .05

- Project CARE students at Eastern District High School made significant gains on the ELE.
LEP Participants' Academic Achievement

Project teachers taught all content area classes in Spanish. They used a wide variety of pedagogical strategies, including peer tutoring, cooperative learning, and C.A.I.

An OREA evaluator observed a mathematics class at Eastern District High School. There were 13 students in the class, from grades nine through eleven. Students had different skill levels and worked on projects individualized to suit their needs and abilities. Each student had a folder of his or her work which was used to monitor progress. Some were using a Spanish-English workbook, others worked on handouts, and still others were taking a test. Students appeared motivated and were cooperative and quiet. The teacher and a paraprofessional helped individuals throughout the period, communicating in Spanish. Several computers in the classroom were not used, but the teacher reported that when they were, they were very helpful.

An OREA evaluator also observed a pre-algebra class at Flushing High School with 22 students at several grade levels. The teacher presented a lesson on equations. Students were attentive and worked diligently at their desks, using the rules listed on the board to solve problems. The teacher walked around the room giving help to individual students and then called students to the board to do exercises. The students interacted productively, and all were involved.

The objective for content area subjects was:

- As a result of participating in the program, 70 percent of the targeted students will achieve scores at or above the passing criterion of 65 in the content areas: social studies, science, and mathematics.
Over 70 percent of project students passed their science courses in both the fall and the spring and their social studies courses in the fall at Flushing High School. At Eastern District High School, at least 70 percent of the students passed social studies in the fall. (See Table 7.)

Project CARE partially met its content area objective. This was true in previous years as well.

**TABLE 7**

Final Grades in Content Area Courses, by Site

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>High School</th>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Fall 1992</th>
<th>Spring 1993</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Number of students for whom data were reported</td>
<td>Percent Passing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eastern District</td>
<td>Math</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>57.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Science</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>40.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Studies</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>72.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flushing</td>
<td>Math</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>39.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Science</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>81.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Studies</td>
<td>91</td>
<td>73.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Only in social studies in the fall did at least 70 percent of the participating students at both sites pass.
FORMER PARTICIPANTS' PROGRESS IN ENGLISH LANGUAGE CLASSROOMS

No students were mainstreamed at the end of the school year previous to the one under review.

OVERALL EDUCATIONAL PROGRESS ACHIEVED THROUGH PROJECT

At Flushing High School, project participants were encouraged to become members of the Hispanic Club and Students Against Drunk Driving (SADD). A Project CARE newsletter was published to inform project students about school activities and the accomplishments of their peers.

American Culture and Citizenship

The project posed one objective for increasing familiarity with American culture and citizenship:

- The program will organize at least two field trips to historical museums, the United Nations, and the White House, etc., to increase their familiarity with American culture and citizenship.

Flushing High School's Project CARE students visited the Aquarium at Coney Island, the Statue of Liberty, the United Nations, and the American Museum of the Moving Image to see Charlie Chaplin's film The Immigrant. Project students from Eastern District High School visited the Statue of Liberty and the United Nations.

Project CARE met its objective for increasing familiarity with American culture and citizenship as it did last year.
Cultural Heritage

The project proposed one objective for students' appreciation of their cultural heritage:

- As a result of participating in the program, 75 percent of the targeted students will demonstrate an improvement in attitude toward their cultural heritage.

Project CARE students participated in an International Festival and a Latino College Fair. The Hispanic Club offered information regarding Latino culture. Project CARE students participated in "Somos El Futuro," a conference held in Albany.

Project CARE could not evaluate its objective for cultural awareness, as attendance records were not provided.

Attitude Toward School

Project CARE's objective for improving student attitudes toward school was:

- As a result of participation in the program, the students will demonstrate an improvement in attitude toward school.

The project director reported that, at both sites, student attitudes improved, as measured by the over-90 percent participation rate in project activities.

The project met its objective for student attitude toward school.

Career Advisement

The evaluation objective for career advisement was:

- All graduating students will meet with the bilingual career specialists for advisement during the school year.
The project director reported that all graduating students met with the bilingual career specialist, grade advisor, bilingual guidance counselors, and the college advisor at least twice during the school year.

Resource teachers at both sites kept ongoing contact with graduating project students, assisting them in selecting colleges and filling out college applications. Students who were not planning to attend college were given guidance regarding employment options.

Project CARE met its objective for career advisement, as it did last year.

**Career Development**

The career development objective was:

- The program will organize at least one conference for students in which representatives of business and industry will present information on career options and skills requirements.

Project CARE integrated many career development activities into E.S.L. classes. Filmstrips and videos on a variety of careers and decision-making and problem-solving skills were offered. Students told the OREA evaluator of referral services within the school and the community to help them make career choices.

Flushing High School held a career workshop at Noticias Del Mundo in the spring. Several speakers addressed the students. Students also attended the Latino College Expo. At Eastern District High School, students visited The State University of New York (SUNY) at Purchase in the fall and heard various speakers during the spring semester.

Project CARE met its career development objective, as it did last year.
Grade Retention

During the year under review, four Project CARE students were retained in grade. Project CARE did not propose any objective for grade retention.

Dropout Prevention

The project proposed one objective for dropout prevention.

- As a result of participating in the program, the dropout rate of the project students will be significantly lower than that of non-program students.

No project students dropped out in the year under review. The mainstream dropout rate was 6.2 percent at Eastern District High School and 5.9 percent at Flushing High School. This difference was statistically significant at both sites.

The project met its objective for dropout prevention. It partially met this objective in the previous year.

Attendance

The project's objective for attendance was:

- As a result of participating in the program, project students' attendance will be significantly higher than that of mainstream students.

The attendance rate for project students at Eastern District High School during the period under review was 83.7 percent, compared to a schoolwide rate of 62 percent. The difference was statistically significant ($p < .05$).

At Flushing High School, the attendance rate for project students was 91.6 percent, compared to a schoolwide rate of 79 percent. The difference was statistically significant ($p < .05$).

Project CARE met its attendance objective.
Enrollment in Post-secondary Education Institutions

Four of the six graduating project students at Flushing High School and four of eight at Eastern District High School indicated that they would be enrolling in post-secondary educational institutions upon graduation. Last year, the project did not provide information on the number of students enrolling in post-secondary education.

CASE HISTORY

When C.L. entered the project, he barely wrote in Spanish, and he almost never spoke in class. The Spanish teacher encouraged him to go to the resource room during his lunch period and helped him with his homework. The project director felt that the resource room made the school a less anonymous place, and C.L. felt he had a place to go for help. He went on field trips, began to interact with other students, and improved scholastically as well as socially. He appeared to be happier and more outgoing.

STAFF DEVELOPMENT OUTCOMES

Project CARE proposed no staff development objectives for the year under review, but staff development activities were a major component of programming. Training was provided to staff members on teaching strategies and lesson-planning techniques, and they were given the opportunity to attend conferences and workshops. Teachers had access to a learning center where they could obtain pedagogical materials for classroom use. They regularly received copies of articles from the project on the problems and needs of bilingual students.
PARENTAL INVOLVEMENT OUTCOMES

Project CARE's parental involvement object was:

- The proportion of program students' parents who participated in Open School Day/Evening will be equal to or greater than the proportion of mainstream students' parents who participate in this activity.

In the spring of 1993, the attendance rate for parents of project students at Eastern District High School Open School Day/Evening was 22 percent and for mainstream parents 19 percent; fall attendance rates were not available for project or mainstream parents. At Flushing High School, the attendance rate for parents of project students at Open School Day/Evening was 41 percent in the fall and 43 percent in the spring, while the schoolwide parental attendance rate was 39 percent in the fall and 34 percent in the spring.

Project CARE met its objective for parental attendance at Open School Day/Evening, as it had the previous year.
IV. SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

ACHIEVEMENT OF OBJECTIVES

Project CARE met its objectives for career advisement, career development, increasing appreciation of American culture and citizenship, student attitude toward school, dropout prevention, attendance, and parental involvement. The project partially met its content area objective. Project CARE failed to meet its objectives in E.S.L. and N.L.A. The Office of Research, Evaluation, and Assessment (OREA) could not measure the objective for cultural awareness due to lack of data.

Participating students in Project CARE showed academic progress: they posted significant gains on the LAB and the ELE, although not at the rate projected. Their attitude toward school also became more positive.

Project services not only benefited the students academically, but also increased their awareness of the importance of education—the attendance rate of participating students was appreciably higher and the dropout rate lower than those for the schoolwide population. Students increased their appreciation of American culture and citizenship and became involved in activities related to their cultural heritage.
MOST AND LEAST EFFECTIVE COMPONENTS OF THE PROJECT

Highly effective components of Project CARE included parental involvement and the heightened awareness of the students concerning the importance of education.

The academic components were the weak areas of the project. In no instructional area did students show the projected gains.

RECOMMENDATIONS TO ENHANCE PROJECT EFFECTIVENESS

Since this was the project's final year of funding, OREA is not making any recommendations to the project.
## APPENDIX A

**Instructional Materials**

*English as a Second Language*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Literacy</td>
<td>Starting to Read</td>
<td>Linda Mrowicki</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Picture Stones for Beginning</td>
<td>Sandray Heyer</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Communication</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beginning</td>
<td>Turning Points book one and workbook one</td>
<td>Iantorno</td>
<td>Addison Wesley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>English with a Smile book one</td>
<td>Zuffran and Krulak</td>
<td>National Textbooks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate</td>
<td>Five Folk Tales</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Prentice Hall/Regents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ready to Write</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Longman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Turning Points book three and workbook three</td>
<td>Iantorno</td>
<td>Addison Wesley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advanced</td>
<td>The Reader’s Anthology, The World</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Globe Book Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Anthology, The Student’s Anthology</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Turning Points book four and workbook four</td>
<td>Iantorno</td>
<td>Addison Wesley</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transitional</td>
<td>Globe Writing Program</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Globe Book Company</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hurricane Bay</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Regents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spanish for Mastery, series</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>DC Heath</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>El Español al día, series</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>DC Heath</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Aventuras en la Ciudad</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Houghton Mifflin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conozca su Idioma</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Minerva</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cultivemos Nuestro Idioma, series</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Lectorum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>El Español y su Estructura</td>
<td>Burunat</td>
<td>Holt, Rinehart, Winston</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Perspectiva</td>
<td>Middle and Wegman</td>
<td>Holt, Rinehart, Winston</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Literatura Hispanoamericana #1 and #2</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Holt</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Dates of publication not submitted.

**Not submitted.
APPENDIX A

Instructional Materials

Science

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Publisher*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>**</td>
<td>La materia y la energía</td>
<td>Heimier-Price</td>
<td>Merrill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>**</td>
<td>La ciencia de la tierra y del espacio</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Merrill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>**</td>
<td>Biología</td>
<td>Alexander, et. al.</td>
<td>Lectorum</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Social Studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Publisher*</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>**</td>
<td>Comprende tu mundo</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Jarrett Publishing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>**</td>
<td>Nueva historia de los Estados Unidos</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Lectorum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>**</td>
<td>Japón: Tierra del origen del sol</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>Barrons, Inc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Date of publication not submitted.
**Not submitted.
## APPENDIX B

### Class Schedules

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period*</th>
<th>Grade 9</th>
<th>Grade 10</th>
<th>Grade 11</th>
<th>Grade 12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8:15-8:55</td>
<td>E.S.L. 1</td>
<td>N.L.A. 4</td>
<td>Basic Programming</td>
<td>Physical Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reading Lab</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:00-9:40</td>
<td>Physical Education</td>
<td>Business</td>
<td>Bilingual U.S. History 2</td>
<td>Music Guitar 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Keyboarding</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:40-10:20</td>
<td>E.S.L. 1</td>
<td>English 6</td>
<td>Spanish 5-2</td>
<td>Criminology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Writing Lab</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:20-11:00</td>
<td>N.L.A.</td>
<td>U.S. History/Government 1</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
<td>E.S.L.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00-11:40</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
<td>Sequential Mathematics 1</td>
<td>English Literature</td>
<td>Sequential Math 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:40-12:20</td>
<td>E.S.L. 1</td>
<td>Marine Biology</td>
<td>Physical Education</td>
<td>N.L.A. 8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:20-1:00</td>
<td>Art</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
<td>Chemistry</td>
<td>Bilingual U.S. Hist/Gov't. 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:00-1:40</td>
<td>Bilingual Mathematics</td>
<td>Physical Education</td>
<td>Pre-Algebra</td>
<td>Transitional E.S.L.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*All classes met five days a week.*