This review of the literature about fictional and actual utopian communities focuses on parents and children in American utopias. Introductory comments explore the history and defining characteristics of utopias. The next section highlights references to women, children, education, and parenting in several fictional utopias, including Plato's "Republic," Prospero's island in Shakespeare's "The Tempest," Sir Thomas More's "Utopia," and Thommasco Campanella's "City of the Sun." A section on American utopias begins with the transcendentalist utopia Fruitlands, which based education on controlling habits and senses through the exertion of self-will and in communion with nature, with all adults sharing in children's schooling at home using a system based on Pestalozzi's school in Switzerland. Next, a description of the Brook Farm Association for Industry and Education highlights such features as the association's preschool program. Robert Owen's New Harmony experiment and Etienne Cabet's Icarian utopias are discussed next. These discussions focus on women's role in these societies. Next, an in-depth examination of Lomaland in California provides information on Katherine Tingley and other founders, the utopian characteristics of Lomaland, financial problems, the Rule of Silence, the rejection of corporal punishment, formalized action games, the influence of Buddhism on Lomaland's Theosophy, group houses and dormitories for children after the age of 5 months, children's daily routines, and the role of parents. Concluding comments indicate that the developmental environment for children in utopias was better than that in family homes of the period. Contains 61 references. (AC)
FAMILY ROLES IN AMERICA'S UTOPIAN COMMUNITIES
from the 1820s to the 1920s

Dorothy W. Hewes, Ph.D., Professor Emeritus
FSCS, San Diego State University
San Diego, California 92182-0282 USA

International Standing Working Group
for the History of Early Childhood Education
Sopron, Hungary. September 2, 1993

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS
MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Dorothy W. Hewes

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)"
Communitarian social systems designed to provide earthly happiness or future salvation for their residents were probably proposed before recorded history. However, it is only since 1516, when Sir Thomas More described his fictional colony of Utopia, that certain intentional communities have been referred to as utopian. This term implies that the primary concepts of the community include balanced harmony within and among the inhabitants and the provision of a good life with optimal pleasure and contentment. Utopians withdraw from society at large to embody their vision in an experimental community, usually intending to create a model which they expect all mankind will eventually follow. Withdrawal is an important distinction, since it eliminates organizations like trade unions or political organizations whose goals of transforming society are to be met by working from within.

The concept of community indicates mutual goals and social structuring beyond individual or familial ideologies. Holloway emphasized the need of a "fundamental belief to which all members subscribe - a belief sustaining them in all crises and unifying them in spite of minor dissentions . . . ritualized until it provides a sanction for all conduct" (1966, p. 227). In utopian communities, this has usually related to an underlying assumption of the perfectibility of mankind. Since they typically reject the dominant culture and are established outside the parameters of conventional behavior, it might be assumed that utopian societies would provide an educational plan to pass their belief on to the next generation, as well as for optimal development and education of resident young children and appropriate support services for their parents. We can examine their unique family functioning by using Goffman's 1961 sociological definition of a total institution as "a place of residence and work where a large number of like-situated individuals, cut off from the wider society for an appreciable period of time, together lead an enclosed, formally administered round of life" (p. xviii). Although he dealt with several types of total institutions, such as asylums for persons unable to care for themselves or prisons for those who are a danger to society, utopias fit neatly into those that Goffman described as " retreats from the world . . . such as abbeys, monasteries, convents and other cloisters" (p. 5). He pointed out that most persons in modern society sleep, play, and work in different locations, with different co-participants, under different authorities, and without an overall rational plan. In total institutions, there is a changed situation. "First, all aspects of life are conducted in the same place and under the same single authority," he noted. "Second, each phase of the member's daily activity is carried on in the immediate company of a large batch of others, all of whom are treated alike and required to do the same thing together. Third, all
phases of the day's activities are tightly scheduled, with one activity leading at a prearranged time into the next." This whole sequence is imposed from above through explicit formal rulings structured and enforced by a body of officials. "Finally, the various enforced activities are brought together into a single rational plan purportedly designed to fulfill the official aims of the institution." (p. 6)

Usually there is a basic split between the small group which administers the program and has contact with the outside world and the large managed group which has restricted contact with outsiders. Passage of information is also restricted between the administrative and managed groups.

A critical characteristic of total institutions pertains to the work incentive, since it differs from the usual money payment to be spent at the worker's discretion. Goffman pointed out that personal possessions are usually minimal in a utopian community and consumer goods from the outside culture are restricted. All essential needs are provided without monetary exchange, thus removing the father's traditional role of family support. At the same time, specific work outside the family home is assigned to the mother. Another contrast with usual family groupings is through what he called batch living; normal patterns of family life do not fit into the needs structure of the institution. In addition, members may be stripped of any control over looking different from one another through clothing and personal grooming. All members of the community may be required to have close cropped hair or long hair, for example, or garments may be deliberately coarse or symbolic. Specific indignities of speech and action, of specific dietary patterns or physical behavior may be enforced. Entry into the institution causes a social disconnection which is eased through what Goffman calls removal activities. Some of these are collective, such as choral singing or art classes or lectures. Others are individual, like reading or just quietly contemplating what is happening. In total institutions, these activities help individuals withstand psychological stresses and often acquire much greater significance than they would in the outside world. Planned uniformity within the community usually marks its residents as different from those in the surrounding environment, thus reinforcing the barriers that sequester them from outside influences.

Utopian communities may sound perfect to their planners but often are not so ideal in actuality. In an essay entitled "Toward more vivid utopias," anthropologist Margaret Meade pointed out that one man's dream can be another man's nightmare (1957, p. 958). This might be paraphrased to say that "dead white male social philosophers" have dreamed of patriarchal utopian societies in which the men, or certain men, were privileged while the women and children were held in a common nightmare. Kolmerten, in Women in Utopia, detailed how female members have usually lived at best with mere promises of sexual equality, never with its reality. Those living in idealistic communitarian establishments actually spent more time doing traditional domestic work than women in the world outside. This was true in fictional utopias, in those actually established in the past, and in counter-cultural communities of the 1960s. Kolmerten relates this feminist issue to early childhood education by such statements as "Traditional women's work of raising
children - arguably the most important task of a culture - has almost always been devalued or 'ghettoized' by its separation from the paid workforce" (1990, p. 3).

**Fictional Utopias**

One of the earliest documented intentional communities was designed by King Lycurgus in the ninth century B.C. To eliminate avarice, his plan abolished gold and silver coins. To assure only simple fare at communal tables, he declared it a crime to prepare a home-cooked meal. Weak or deformed babies were put to death and surviving children endured deliberate hardships and submitted to harsh discipline from birth onwards in order to create ideal citizens. Five hundred years later, for his utopian Republic, Plato recognized the need to educate women sufficiently to properly prepare their preschool sons for later leadership. An interesting satire on Plato, written by Aristophanes about 393 BC, dramatized a situation in which women took control - and used food deprivation as their strongest punishment.

White (1955, p. xv) noted that since utopias are compounded of revulsion from present reality and attraction for a better world, they are peculiarly fitted to express the conflicts of transitional ages. Hostetler prefaced an anthropological study of communitarian societies by stating that "Throughout recorded history there have been periods when people sought to exchange the tyranny of property, social hierarchy, and arthaic institutions for more humane ways to live and to share their possessions" (1974, p.1). One of these periods came during the decades following the explorations of Columbus, Vasco de Gama, and others with glorified accounts of indigenous peoples in lands previously unknown to Europeans. As one result, the best known fictional societies were written during the period of Renaissance naturalism. For example, Francois Rabelais (c. 1495-1553) was convinced that the natural goodness of humanity is corrupted by bad institutions and his idealized Abbey of Theleme satirized the monastic system. The ideal community described by Michele de Motaigne (1533-1592) was read in its English translation by Shakespeare and was incorporated into The Tempest, with Gonzalo declaiming, "Had I plantation of this isle, my lord... What would I do?... Letters would not be known; riches, poverty, and use of service, none; contract, succession, bourn, bound of land, tilth, vineyard none; No use of metal, corn, or wine or oil; No occupation; all men idle, all; And women too, but innocent and pure; No sovereignty;... all abundance To feed my innocent people. I would with such perfection govern, sir, To excell the golden age." (White, 1955, pp. 151-2)

The outstanding utopian writer of the Renaissance humanist period is Sir Thomas More, of course. Still open to discussion is whether he took the name for his fictitious Utopia from its Greek origins as meaning "no place" to emphasize the impossibility of perfection or "good place" to encourage striving for betterment, but Surtz (1964) pointed out that the witty essay was written in an oblique style appreciated by Erasmus, Giles, and others during this period of speculations about society. Apparently Henry VIII did not appreciate this satire about the English government, since he had More beheaded for heresy and high treason in 1535.
More's ideas about the education of women were advanced for his time, but those of us interested in the education of young children find little but the same old patriarchal approach. Infants in More's Utopia were breast fed by their own mothers, then cared for in a nursery until age five, when they were divided into male and female occupational training programs. Their status in Utopia was indicated by the meal routine. At the sound of a trumpet, adults assembled to eat together, with slaves doing the sordid services, women cooking, and children either serving those at the table or silently standing by to eat what was given them. Family relationships are clearly brought out at a harvest ceremony - "In the festival which concludes the period, before they go to the temple, both wives and children fall on their knees before their husbands or parents, and confess everything in which they have either erred or failed in their duty, and beg pardon for it. Thus all little discontents in families are removed, that they may offer up their devotions with a pure and serene mind" (White, 1955, p. 110). As Kolmerten and other feminist writers have pointed out, the majority of utopian communities have been patriarchal in their structure. The original Utopia was no exception.

Thommasco Campanella's City of the Sun, or Civitus Solis was published a century later, in 1623, with detailed parenting and early education plans. He adapted genetic and astrological animal breeding principles to the improvement of the City's residents. Appropriate mating of men and women was determined by the physical education teacher, based upon observations made during co-ed nude exercise sessions. Women who became pregnant ate only prescribed foods and followed a strengthening regimen. After two years of breast feeding, their children were turned over to carefully chosen Matrons and Patrons for "pleasant instruction" and parents were not expected to recognize their own offspring. Both sexes dressed alike and had the same basic education in the arts. Boys, wearing color-coded garments to show their level of accomplishment, learned the language and alphabet by the age of three by studying murals painted on the walls, began to attend lectures on the natural sciences at age six, and until their tenth year were to learn without toil and as if for pleasure.

Campanella was aware of the power of scientific studies, and as knowledge advanced in all fields there was a merging of utopian futurism and practical improvement of life for everyone. Most people in medieval and Renaissance Europe had seen only the ceaseless cycle of drudgery, disease, and death. By 1771, after French author Sebastien Mercier showed this new optimism in L'An 2440, his detailed account of the world in the year 2440, utopian fiction and intentional communities swept through Europe. Baczko wrote that "The historian is struck both by the proliferation of these texts and by their incontestable monotony. How marked is the repetition of the same themes and ideas in this literature! To visit one city in Utopia is to have seen nearly all of them (1989, p. 317).

Parents in American Utopias

Most of the original colonies along the Atlantic coast were founded in the 1600s as alternative social structures with utopian ideals and most of the early immigrants from Europe intentionally entered specific religious or secular
communities upon their arrival. Cubberly (1920) pointed out the relationship between the beliefs dominating these colonies and their educational systems - French Huguenots along the Carolina coast, Calvinist Dutch and Walloons in the area now called New York City, English Quakers in Philadelphia, Spanish Catholics in the south and west and - dominating all of them well into the present century - Calvinist Puritan dissenters from England who established Massachusetts Bay Colony in 1642. Their educational institutions, or the lack of them, were consistent with the belief systems of their founders.

It was not until the 1770s, when these isolated communities were drawn together in the revolution against England, that there was any semblance of a national policy for education. It was predominantly a matter of rote memorization, enforced by corporal punishment. At the same time, household life was radically changing. Despite the varied denominational philosophies, there had been primarily a family-based economy until the early 1800s. Developing industrialization profoundly altered family patterns because work in factories or large institutions began to replace home-based enterprises; the household became dependent upon the wage-earners. For lower income families, this meant that wives and children had to find employment outside the home. Since no wages were attached, such domestic tasks as child care lost value. At the same time, the sense of a neighborly involvement was replaced by institutions and families became more private.

(Hareven, 1976, p. 198)

Inspired by European ideas, many utopian colonies were established in the United States in between 1820 and 1860. It may be that psychologist Frank Manuel was correct when he observed that "The utopia may well be a sensitive indicator of where the sharpest anguish of an age lies" (1965, p. 294). Robert Hine proposed a different reason, saying that "Nineteenth century America witnessed not the first historically, but certainly the most extensive rash of such experiments. Bathed in the essential optimism of an era, confident of social progress, unhampered by governmental censorship, and abetted by inexpensive and expansive land, the utopian colonist found in nineteenth-century America a fertile milieu" (1953, p. 4). One might conjecture that this retreat from crass capitalism was also a reaction to the new emphasis upon large scale manufacturing, such as the nearby Lawrence cotton textile company in Lowell which had been erected in 1835 (McGouldrick, 1968). Whatever the reasons, it is easy to see why the Massachusetts philosopher Ralph Waldo Emerson wrote to his English colleague Carlyle that "Not a reading man but has a draft of a new community in his waistcoat pocket. One man renounces the use of animal food; and another of coin; and another of domestic hired service; and another of the State." (Kagan, 1975, p. 14) There were enough utopians by 1840 that they held a convention in New York City, sponsored by The Friends of Universal Reform.

Like many other, intellectual leaders of the emerging nation, Emerson's own ideas were based on those from the ancients and the Orient. He was tempted by some proposals, but felt too comfortable in his own home near Boston to have more than intellectual involvement. The new community closest to him, because of its location in an isolated valley on his own property and through his personal
relationship with fellow Theosophist Bronson Alcott, was the Consociate Family at Fruitlands. It was established jointly by Alcott and a Pestalozzian reformer, Charles Lane, who arrived from England in late 1842. Emerson visited Fruitlands on July 4, 1843, and that evening wrote in his journal "I will not prejudge them successful. They look well in July. We shall see them in December." (Harrison, in Alcott, 1981, p. 12) Emerson predicted well; Lane moved out on January 6, 1844 and the Alcotts stayed just a few weeks longer.

Despite its apparent failure, Fruitlands is significant because it represented utopian Transcendentalism, a self-conscious intellectual movement that is impossible to define. Immanuel Kant had introduced the term in 1781, in his Critique of Pure Reason, to refer to ideas received by "intuition" instead of through the direct experience of the senses. This was in direct opposition to the philosophy of John Locke which had dominated parenting and educational practices in Massachusetts and it was also a rejection of the concept of original sin that prevailed among Calvinist Protestants. Transcendental education was based upon the belief that anyone's habits and senses could be controlled through the exertion of self-will and in communion with nature. The task of the transcendental self is the processing of the raw materials of experience so that one understands the world. Lest this sound too serious, it was also seen as vitally important that much of this experience takes place outdoors and that growing children should have fun.

Most Transcendentalists of the 1820s were dissatisfied with the popular Congregationalist and liberal Unitarian denominations, although many remained members or were even ministers while they were exploring other philosophies to guide their lives. Because its advocates were constantly changing their beliefs, challenges, and pronouncements, Transcendentalism as it was developed in New England has always been impossible to define. One contemporary wrote that they were eclectic in their search, reading "Dante in the original Italian, Hegel in the original German, Swedenborg in the original Latin, ... Château Fourier in the original French, and perhaps the hardest task of all, Margaret Fuller in the original English" (Sears 1912, p. 25). It should be noted that a woman's name is included on this list; a distinguishing feature of Transcendentalism was an egalitarian relationship between intellectual men and women.

The Transcendentalist community of Fruitlands, during the few months of its existence, was composed of the Alcotts and their four daughters, Lane and his ten year old son, and a practical farmer named Joseph Palmer who did most of the physical labor. Alcott had been a schoolteacher since 1822, and had been involved with Pestalozzian infant schools from 1828 to 1830. Beginning with the birth of his oldest daughter in 1831, he had kept an introspective daily journal of his children's development. In this paternal child-rearing experiment, he recognized that children learned through play, self-awareness and imagination, with the most important learning of their lives taking place at home under guidance of both the father and mother (Strickland, 1973).

The second of the Alcott daughters, Louisa May, celebrated her tenth birthday at Fruitlands. She not only kept a diary reflecting her feelings about its rigors but in 1873 published a fictionalized account of the venture. We know that
all of the adults shared in schooling the children at home and that the system was based upon Pestalozzi's school in Switzerland. On September 1, 1843, Louisa May's diary recorded that she'd had her lessons as usual and included "Mr. Lane's piece of poetry about Pestalossi."

To Pestalozzi
On Pestalozzis sacred brow,
The modest chesnut wreath
Green yesterday but fadeing now
And pasing as a breath."

(Alcott, 1981 reprint, p 68)

This diary also contains such entries as "I rose at five and had my bath. I love cold water! Then we had our singing-lesson with Mr. Lane. After breakfast I washed dishes, and ran on the hill till nine and had some thoughts - it was so beautiful up there." (p 69) She did, however, get hungry. At Fruitlands, nothing was to be eaten or worn which had caused suffering to man or beast. This meant no sugar, molasses, or cotton because their production had involved slave labor. Dairy products were rejected because that would thwart a cow's maternal instinct - and because Alcott refused to play chambermaid to animals. Eating an egg would kill the future chick, which was compared to "Feejee cannibalism." Wool deprived sheep of their warm coats and worms had to die to produce silk, so linen was to be the acceptable fiber for clothing. The Alcott children also became aware of Lane's insistence that marriage and family structure were impediments to the nobler life and of their mother's objection to this idea. Despite high hopes that Fruitlands would become a large and flourishing community, its dissolution within a matter of months came about partly because everyone was cold and hungry, partly because of differences between two autocratic leaders, partly because there was simply no money to carry on, and primarily because high thoughts couldn't replace practical planning. The experiment had great value, however, since it brought attention to Alcott's conviction that all permanent changes in the social order must originate within individuals and then work outwards and because it brought attention to the Transcendental ideals that were to change American education and social systems.

The Brook Farm Association for Industry and Education, a less radical and somewhat more successful Transcendentalist community, was established in Massachusetts in 1841 by George Ripley and others. According to one of the participants, "It was felt at this time, that in order to live a religious and moral life in sincerity, it was necessary to leave the world of institutions, and to reconstruct the social order from new beginings" (Frothingham, 1959 reprint of 1876, p. 164). To get in touch with life's basic realities, everyone shared the menial labor. Records of this experience include letters such as that of author Nathaniel Hawthorne humorously describing the shoveling of cow manure and Emerson's sceptical observations. The Brook Farm Constitution specified that one aim was "to secure to our children and those who may be entrusted to our care, the benefits of the highest physical, intellectual and moral education, which in the progress of knowledge the
resources at our command will permit" (Brook Farm, 1844). As in so many other utopian communities, a distinctive costume was developed. The women wore a long tunic over loose trousers, described in their diaries and letters as being much more comfortable to work in than the corsets and petticoats of the period. Men wore rough peasant smocks of bright blue, with Hawthorne and others wearing them while gardening for many years after leaving their secluded community - much to the amazement of their neighbors.

As at Fruitlands, Brook Farm's educational philosophy was based upon an interpretation of Pestalozzi. Sears (1912), recalling his years a boarding student, wrote about the fun of outdoor play and the simple meals of coarse brown bread, applesauce, and skimmed milk. All students were required to do work of their choice in the orchards and fields, and he became Hawthorne's successor in helping feed and milk 18 or 20 cows each morning and evening. For a time, everyone gave up butter so that it could be sold in Boston to buy a piano. Students and adults together enjoyed "happy and blithesome" dinner conversations with the most prominent intellectuals from Boston and put on dramatic performances or concerts. This boarding school was a primary means of earning money for Brook Farm. Students from Japan, Spain and other countries were enrolled, although Mrs. Alcott's diary for February 3, 1844, noted that she had visited to see if it would be appropriate for her daughters and judged it to be "of a higher and more elaborate kind, but no better than our schools afford" (Sams, 1958, p. 104).

A unique feature of Brook Farm was its preschool program. Sears described it as a kindergarten before Froebel had been heard of. He wrote that Abby Morton, who chose the occupation of teacher as her community occupation, "gathered her group of older babies on the grass or under the elms whenever weather permitted and at other times in the parlor of Pilgrim Hall. Her first object was to make them happy and contented, and to this end she invented and arranged games and songs and stories, contrived little incidents and managed little surprises with never failing ingenuity. Learning as well as teaching, she gradually gave a purposeful bent to her song-and-dance diversions, making them effective lessons as well as pleasant pastimes. Health and strength for the growing babies were promoted by proper exercises, a good carriage and graceful movement of little arms and legs being duly considered. Polite manners, and the correct use of language were taught by precept and example. More than all, the juvenile minds were, directly and indirectly, drilled to acquire the habit of paying attention." (pp. 108-9) In later years, Sears was pleased to discover that this teacher had written books his own children were enjoying. The egalitarian nature of the Transcendentalists was again demonstrated, since both men and women took turns assisting the teacher. Another member of Brook Farm reminisced about this place where mothers could leave children "as a kindly relief to themselves when fatigued by the care of them; for a primary doctrine was 'alternation of employments' (Codman, 1894, p. 134).

Brook Farm lasted for almost eight years. From its modest inception in 1841, it was prospering enough by 1844 to begin construction of a headquarters building that would include meeting halls, apartments, and more than a hundred small private rooms. It was almost completed in 1846 when it burned to the ground.
because of a defective chimney. Finances had always been very difficult and this disaster led to talk of bankruptcy. In addition, George Ripley had persuaded the governing board that they should become "phalanx" of Fourier's New York socialist party, a somewhat altered version of his Oeuvres Completes having been translated from the original French in 1840. Neither Fourierism or Transcendentalism provided for the development of specific goals and policies and many early residents moved away. With waning financial backing, Brook Farm continued primarily as a boarding school until the property was auctioned in 1848.

Both Fruitlands and Brook Farm were developed by men whose families had been in America for generations. Other utopian communities were established by Europeans seeking land and freedom from governmental restrictions. One of these was Robert Owen, who had established his first planned community in London and written his "Explanatory of the New System of Society" in 1820. At the age of ten, in 1789, Owen had left his home in Wales to seek his fortune. After a series of apprenticeships, he was managing the New Lanark Mills in southwestern Scotland and had married the owner's daughter by 1800. Among the ideas he had for improving conditions in the mill town was the establishment of a day care center, an infant version of Pestalozzian education, in 1816.

By 1820, influenced by William Godwin and early feminists, Owen believed that the inequities of society lay in private ownership of land and that women's misery came because of their "drudgery" and inadequate education. As a communitarian socialist, he envisioned a society in which women had an equal role and in which children were educated to become fully functioning members. He recognized that it would be impossible to develop his ideal community in Great Britain and began inquiries about purchasing land in the United States. When he sailed to America in 1824, on his way to the frontier village he had purchased and re-named New Harmony, one goal was to substitute group allegiance for that of the man-wife family. Another was to demonstrate the value of Pestalozzian education, since only through shaping children's characters could they grow up to be rational adults. Word of his ideas had preceded him and Owen had immediate access to influential thinkers in New York and Philadelphia. One of these was William Maclure, a wealthy merchant who had turned his attention to educational reform following his 1805 visit to Switzerland. He had helped one of Pestalozzi's associates, Joseph Neef, establish the first Pestalozzian school in the United States and had also sponsored the transfer of two Parisian teachers, Marie Duclos Fretageot and William Phiquapel d'Arusmont, to Philadelphia. They all became involved in the New Harmony experiment, with Marie Fretageot teaching a class of boys and girls aged two to five through "sense perception" and music. Despite his belief in egalitarian adult roles, Maclure believed in separate schools for boys and girls, with the girls trained for inevitable domestic work and the boys involved with field or shop work. He proposed that "perhaps all the common occupations of women, such as sewing, cooking, washing, &c can be transformed into an amusement by early habit" (Kolmerton, 1990, p. 83).

New Harmony promised to be a thriving community with great prospects of eventually gaining the egalitarian goals. Women were given a voice in decision
making and members adopted a unisex garment made of inexpensive plain material, wide pantaloons buttoned onto a shirt for the men and the same garment with a sort of long tunic for the women. Children shared in the work of the community and in its recreations. However, this utopian dream was also doomed to failure. It disbanded in 1827. The primary cause seems to have been Owen's frequent absences and an authoritarian management style, coupled with the inability of residents to cooperate and to do the hard work required for a self-sustaining communal life.

Another European who saw America as the place to establish a utopian community was Etienne Cabet, author of Voyage en Icarie, who advocated socialism in France during the 1840s. Although he was lauded as a defender of women's rights, his position is ambiguous. He rejected the ideas of extremists who called for the abolition of the family and marriage although he advocated genetic control and planned parenthood. These ideas were never carried out by French Icarians and by the time Cabet sailed for New York on December 3, 1848, the Icarian movement for all practical purposes had ceased to exist in France. In Cabet's utopian fantasy, women were to perform their domestic chore between five and eight-thirty in the morning and be at work in factories by nine. Custodial baby-sitting was the duty of a designated "chief woman" of each household, but he believed that mothers should begin teaching their children to read and write before the age of five. Other than these conventional accommodations, his Voyage en Icarie appears to have left early education off the itinerary. Johnson, listing the occupations of Cabet's French supporters in 1846, shows only two teachers in a list of 497 subscribers (1974, pp. 305-6). Since his emphasis was upon artisans and other working people, perhaps there was simply no interest in this relatively insignificant topic. Whether in the original American commune that Cabet established near the Mississippi River in 1849, in the various communities developed by dissidents from the original core group of French immigrants, or in the California community occupied by the Iberians between 1881 to 1885, nuclear families lived together in small houses and their French-speaking children were educated within the community. Kagen attributes the demise of the Icarian utopias to this emphasis upon traditional family values and their failure to provide training in communal ideals (1975, p. 46).

During the middle years of the nineteenth century, interest in utopian communities waned. As Frothingham stated it in 1876, in an analysis of why Brook Farm and early socialist attempts had failed, "The advocates were cultivated men, literary and aesthetical, who represented the best the old world had to give, rather than the worst the New World had experienced; and their words met with no response from the multitudes in whose behalf they were spoken. America was exercised then by questions of awful moment. The agitation against slavery had taken hold of the whole country... Its issues were immediate and urgent. People had neither heads nor hearts for schemes of comprehensive scope that must be patiently meditated and matured for generations... Brook Farm was an idyl; and in the days of epics, the idyl is easily forgotten" (pp. 331-2). With a Civil War over slavery in the early 1860s, a major depression in the following decade, and the fervor of expansion from the original Atlantic coast colonies across the continent to
the Pacific Ocean, interest in the establishment of idealistic intentional communities waned until the final third of the century.

**Young children at Lomaland**

Utopian plans were part of popular culture in the last decade of the nineteenth century, particularly in the form of novels such as *Caesar's Column* by Ignatius Donnelly and *A Traveler from Altruria* by William Dean Howells. Edward Ballamy's *Looking Backward, 2000-1887*, the story of a young Bostonian who was transported into a future without the chaos and inequalities of the 1880s, became one of the most widely read works of fiction ever published in the United States. It helped spark another wave of utopian activity. Intentional communities already functioning included the devoutly religious Shakers, French Icarian socialists, mystical California winemakers, and a host of others. Old dogmas about the innate depravity of mankind were being replaced by a social gospel which, like Transcendentalism, preached of an innately good humanity reaching salvation through a positive environment. At the same time, there was widespread acceptance of occult phenomena, including crystal gazing fortune tellers and mediums who could recall the spirits of those who had departed this earthly life. This was a decade that Segal (1985) considered to be approaching a technological utopia, one in which skyscrapers and elevators changed downtowns, great rivers were bridged, and communications simplified through telegrams and telephones. And it was also a decade when the great economic depression of 1893 interrupted these unprecedented social, scientific, and technological advancements.

As the nineteenth century came to a close, families became increasingly private and child-centered. The great wave of interest in the Froebelian kindergarten of the early 1880s was replaced by a "scientific" interest in tabulating developmental characteristics and a sentimental approach that was reflected in the books and activities for young children. Although lower income women and their older children still worked for wages, this was the beginning of a period in which men were expected have a labor-force identity, to function in an economic sphere away from the home, while mothers and their children were idle, idealized and pampered. Except for philanthropic activities such as the kindergarten or settlement house service, a "cult of domesticity" reigned (Matthaei, 1982, pp. 118-119)

In her analysis of utopian plans developed by women during the Victorian era, Albinski (1990) pointed out that those written by Americans tended to be urban, communal, the result of internal changes in the residents, inspired by religious beliefs, and with an emphasis upon social change rather than legislative or political influence. It is ironic that at the turn of the century two of these women with utopian ideals, both social activists who refused to fit into society's expectations, were competing for international leadership of the Theosophical Society. Both Katherine Tingley and Annie Besant had survived troubled marriages and had been involved with social service activities before finding Theosophy. Both claimed that they were rightful successors to Helena Petrovna Blavatsky, who had founded the occult group in the 1870s. Blavatsky, a charismatic and controversial woman who aroused great controversy over her claims to divine knowledge and her management

12

13
of the fiscal and other resources, asserted that Theosophy was not a new religious doctrine, but was simply the world's original religion from which all others had sprung and to which they should return. Its fundamental ideas, as published in The Secret Doctrine and her other writings, were made up of "truths" from many ancient sources. She claimed that these were messages she had received from an Adept of the Trans-Himalayan Brotherhood who could transmit messages by embodying part of his consciousness in a disciple or chela. As a chela, Blavatsky directly transferred ideas from the minds of Tibetan masters to her own in the process called tulka...(Hanson, 1971). At times, the masters were said to have appeared "in person" to Blavatsky or others who were close to her. An official society publication, Hanson's H. P. Blavatsky and the Secret Doctrine and two recent biographies, Meade's Madame Blavatsky - The Woman Behind the Myth and Cranston's H.P.B. - The Extraordinary Life and Influence of Helena Blavatsky detail her extraordinary life, from her birth in Russia in 1831 through her extensive travels and the maneuverings to develop and maintain an international movement with its headquarters in India. She made Europeans and Americans aware of Eastern religions, influencing writers and artists of her time and paving the way for Transcendental Meditation, Zen, Hare Krishnas, yoga, gurus, vegetarianism, and other aspects of contemporary life. For educational historians, however, it is enough to know that she believed "Children should above all things be taught self-reliance, love for all mankind, and, more than anything else, to think and reason for themselves" (Whiting, 1919, p.3).

When "H.P." died in 1891, Annie Besant took over the original Theosophical Society headquarters in India, with William Judge president of a competing headquarters in New York. Katherine Tingley assumed leadership of the American society after Judge's death in 1896 and the Point Loma community became the realization of her childhood dream of a "white city . . . in a golden land on the shores of the blue Pacific" where people of all countries could be brought together and have the youth taught how to live, and how to become true and strong and noble, and forceful royal warriors for humanity" (Greenwalt, 1955, p 19). Even the site of her future utopian community was tinged with the supernatural, since her vivid description in a chance conversation with the retire, General Frémont in New York led to his assurance that her fantasy site actually existed on the headlands protecting San Diego Bay. Tingley sent instructions for its purchase and then left with other Theosophical leaders on a year-long globe-circling crusade, picking up rocks from significant locations to incorporate into a cornerstone at the dedication of the new headquarters. At Interlaken, she received a cable saying that acquisition was impossible because the land was owned by the government. At that moment, Gottfried de Purucker walked into the room to be introduced and she discovered that he had lived in San Diego. His pencil sketch of the area, now in the Theosophical Society Archives, showed that the land she wanted adjoined the government property and was still available. By the time she finally got to San Diego, not only had the Point Loma site been purchased but the public and the press were eager to know more about her plans. California newspapers of February 1987 publicized "Lomaland" with maps, photographs, and detailed accounts of the laying...
of the cornerstone. The population of San Diego was only about 17,000 but nearly a thousand people - including the mayor - formed a procession around the bay to attend the ceremony.

After this beginning, it was something of an anticlimax for Tingley to realize that some of her financial backers were walking about the treeless plateau muttering about "this God-forsaken spot." For the next two years, headquarters remained in New York City. Details of a further struggle for domination of the society and of the development of Lomaland have been well documented by Greenwalt (1955), Hine (1953), Small (1978) and in archival depositories. At the Theosophical Convention of 1898, Tingley not only changed the name to "The Universal Brotherhood and Theosophical Society" but maneuvered adoption of a new constitution that gave her lifetime autocratic powers. The 330 acre community was well underway by 1900. By 1907, supported by at least 40,000 members in lodges around the world, five hundred persons were living in Lomaland's communal Homestead or its bungalows and tents. Two of the three white large buildings had aquamarine glass domes, topped by golden hearts, that were illuminated at night. Dramatic productions took place in the first Greek theater in the United States, with seating for twenty-five hundred persons who looked out toward the open sea. Wide avenues wound through the gardens and orchards, where fast growing eucalyptus and other trees already promised to make a veritable forest; Greenwalt (1955) devotes an entire chapter to details of this "Agricultural Eden."

Although Tingley rejected the utopian label and asserted that she had not used any previous utopian communities as her model, the Point Loma colony fits into the accepted criteria. Residents saw their efforts as a practical illustration of how to develop a higher type of humanity. They came from different denominations but maintained the consistent philosophical position that Theosophy was not a religion. It was "the ancient wisdom inherent in the very fabric of cosmic being." The basic principle, according to Tingley, was the "universal brotherhood of humanity, a universal love and understanding based not merely on feeling but on a deep and abiding philosophy which affirms that all peoples, all individuals, are united in that Divine Mystery which is the root and essence of ALL." She further explained that "There are three outstanding principles of Theosophy which should never be forgotten. They are the doctrines of karma, of reincarnation, and of the actuality of human perfectibility" and she defined karma with the Biblical phrase "For whatsoever a man soweth that shall he also reap." (Small, 1978. pp 5, 79)

Like earlier utopian colonies, Tingley's White City above the high western cliffs of Point Loma was withdrawn from the outer community. Access was by a rough dirt road or a six mile boat trip across the bay. Tingley held the property in trust for the group as a whole and managed it with her selected group of financial advisers. Residents had little need for money because all their needs were met and there was no place to shop. Marriage was considered normal, with some couples living in houses they built for themselves and others in the separate bungalows provided. Everything in the community was done by residents, with no wages paid. Most of the food served in the communal dining halls was produced on the premises, with kitchen and garden work assigned by Tingley's assistant. The yellow military
type uniforms for the male residents and loose white garments for the females were made by women and older girls. Some members who had previously held prestigious positions were deliberately given the most menial tasks but the general response seems to be like that of a wealthy woman was "delighted to escape from the cares of the kitchen and the servants" (Baker, 1907, p. 233). Tingley had announced in 1896 that she was the Purple Mother prophesied in theosophical writings and almost always wore that color (Mathison, 1960, p. 150). Oral histories recorded for the San Diego Historical Association include comments upon the self-sufficiency and the unique clothing of Lomaland, indicating that it served to set the community apart in the minds of local people as well as through geographical distance.

In common with other utopias, there were always financial problems. Tingley tended not to worry about costs when something was to be done - when electricity became available from San Diego, wires were installed underground, for example. Her extensive travels, setting up other schools in Cuba and Sweden or visiting lodges in other parts of the world, not only took her away from the community but were costly. Contributions and "loans" with promissory notes for collateral were a major source of funding, although the Point Loma Community charged a five hundred dollar residence fee for each single person or family able to pay it. Some experimental projects, such as growing silkworms, were soon abandoned. There was some income from the Woman's Exchange and Mart, a shop in town selling handicrafts and stitchery, and from publications and theatrical productions. Visitors were encouraged, partly to spread information and partly to increase income. One of the first publications of the press, dated 1900, was an illustrated travel brochure with a front page message of "Theosophy: When in San Diego be sure to visit the International Headquarters." A brochure dated 1901 promotes "Loma-Land, A Delightful Place for Rest or Residence." A hundred or so tourists each day paid an admission fee at the spectacular Roman-style entrance gate, their arrival announced by the former army colonel who now sounded a welcoming bugle as his contribution to the cause.

As at Brook Farm and New Harmony, the most reliable source of income over the lifetime of the community was its boarding school. Tuition cost as much as $1000 per year, depending upon ability to pay, and the teachers were community residents who received no salaries. From five students in 1900, the school reached its maximum of 300 by 1910. Many boarders were sent by parents belonging to Theosophical Lodges in other countries, some arriving unable to speak English, so the spirit of brotherhood was demonstrated in a school representing about twenty nationalities. Others were children of tourists impressed by what they had seen on their conducted tour of the community. A few were day students from the San Diego community, recruited through local advertising. The cover of an illustrated booklet in the Theosophical Society Archives, dated 1900, gives an indication of its approach -
Lomaland School
Unsectarian - Founded in 1900
A Boarding School for Girls
A Co-Educational Day School
From Pre-Primary Through College
Light for the mind,
Love for the heart,
Understanding for the intellect.

A typewritten page at the Society Archives, written by Elizabeth Whiney, documents the appointment of a committee to develop a manual for the education of young children. "The result was the Lotus Song Book and a series of storybooks with titles like Happy Sunbeams, Tiny Buds, and Rainbow. The ideas were supplied by a teacher, with the actual writing done by the parents of 4 year old Guenn Hensley - the mother was a poet and father a musician." Although the committee was assigned to do the work, it is probable that Tingley kept firm control over what was planned, as she always did. In a 1906 letter at the society archives, for example, she wrote that the Lomaland school principal "does not deviate one-sixteenth part of an inch from the rules I have laid down."

One feature that impressed visitors to Point Loma was the Rule of Silence that prevailed. Tingley believed that excessive talking was a waste of energy, which in turn led to exhaustion of vital forces. From young children to adults, this rule applied to the communal mealtimes, classrooms, and even to casual meetings on the grounds. Its rationale and application to young children can be found in an 1897 Children's Department pamphlet edited by Elizabeth Myers. It states that the Theosophist system, unknown before, started in 1900 with 5 children and specially trained teachers. "Great difficulty has often been experienced by those who work among children on account of the restlessness and lack of attention shown by the young. To overcome this a plan has already been put into successful operation called silent moments." She describes the process of opening grouptime with a song, which is followed by a two minute silence period with eyes closed. "They should be taught to think of themselves as notes in a great song composed of myriads of notes all blending together and making harmony, and that when each child is unselfish and cheerful, a perfect note is struck. But selfishness introduces disharmony and makes the music discordant." (p. 2) The success of this plan is indicated by the reporter who wrote, "From the moment I went into the school I was conscious of one peculiar and predominant expression - of difference from ordinary schools - which at first I could not quite identify. At last it came to me; it was the unusual repose of the pupils. The girls sitting at their tables sat with singular quietude, even the little children gave the appearance of absorbed occupation" (Baker, 1907. p. 229). Joe Azevedo, in a 1974 interview recorded for the San Diego Historical Association, remembered the "tranquility" when he had visited the
"Peace Palace" sixty years earlier, and said "I have never since experienced the feeling that I had when we stepped in there. You could have heard a pin drop and yet it was full of people." No spankings or other corporal punishment were allowed. Tingley believed that all individuals have a dual nature, higher and lower, and that punishment only appealed to the lower nature. Children were under surveillance day and night to guard against their falling prey to the evil side of their natures; one of the controversial practices was Tingley's concern about masturbation and the strait-jacket the boys wore at night. The Raja Yoga system, a term taken from the Sanskrit meaning "royal union" and indicating a balance between the physical, mental, and spiritual faculties, would appeal to the higher nature. Discipline was supposed to consist of gently trying to get children to understand that they were functioning on the wrong level. There were also "reminders" such as withdrawing privileges, although for a tantrum the teacher was permitted to dip her hand in cold water and splash it across the child's face. "This was usually effective," said a former instructor, "but one young teacher, goaded to exasperation, threw a whole bucket of water on a child. This ended her teaching career" (Greenwalt, 1955, p. 84).

Theosophist philosophy is apparent in such children's books as The Raja Yoga First Reader for Little Beginners, edited by Katherine Tingley and published at Point Loma. Photographs of Lomaland children are used as illustrations. On each page, a few lines in print were supplemented by key words or phrases in script, as in -

The sun shines
The sun shines for all.
_Sun, shine, all_ (p. 2)

Sentimentality and moral teaching characteristic of all writings for children were given a Theosophical emphasis. For example -

Helping and sharing is what Brotherhood means. (p. 6)
Little boys and little girls who work and are never idle do not have bad thoughts.
Little boys and little girls cannot be naughty when the sunshine is in their hearts, and they work for all. (p. 7)
We live in pretty little houses and we sleep in nice little beds.
We have many games and pleasant things to help us be happy.
We get up in the morning when the sun begins to shine over the hills.
We go to bed at night when the sun goes down over the ocean. (pp. 19-20)

Like the Froebelian kindergarten, Lomaland teachers believed that children learned through their participation in formalized action games. For example, teachers were instructed that for the following song children should wear cardboard disks around their necks, each with a rainbow color on one side and white on the reverse. They should stand in a semi-circle, in prismatic order, and at the last line reverse their disks to show the "white light of unity."
Brothers We
Brothers we, so you see,
Blending sweetly all agree
Colors bright, all invite,
In a heavenly harmony.
To and fro, as we go,
We are wise and fair to see,
And we make for truth's sake
The white light of unity.

H. A. Hensley

One aspect of Theosophy taken from Buddhism and other Eastern religions was the belief that everyone goes through a succession of lives before reaching nirvana, or reunion with the Divine Essence. Because this reincarnation process is shortened or prolonged according to one's earthly actions, both good and bad, children did not remain in their parental homes after the age of 5 months. At that time, they were moved to a group house with white cribs grouped in alcoves, labeled nursing bottles of milk in the refrigerator, and inspiring texts lettered over the archways. Supervision was by a specially trained Swedish member of the community, assisted by those assigned to the duty. One visitor noted that children were not rocked, but that when they felt like napping they curled up like a kitten in a warm corner. His escort, the father of a toddler girl, explained that this was the "scientific and higher human way" and added that "It is better for the children to have such systematic scientific training, and it leaves the parents free for carrying out their greater work for humanity" (Baker, 1907, p 230). Although the policies changed somewhat over the years, parents could visit at any time and children were allowed to spend part of one day a week with their parents. Archival photographs of the babies in their group home show them, already dressed in the white garments that were the official uniform at Lomaland, smiling and playing under close supervision of attendants.

At age 3, children were transferred from their original cottage to the Lotus Bud class. They lived in dormitories, dressed and undressed themselves, made their beds, swept, and did other chores. Although the word "kindergarten" was not used, many of the activities were similar to those in public school kindergartens of the period. In an oral history at the San Diego Historical Society, L. Gordon Plummer said "I can so well remember the classes for three and four year olds, learning songs, learning the alphabet, learning to tell time. Children are quite capable of learning early." An archival photograph entitled "Raja Yoga tots on their way to school" shows a line of eleven very small children in white garments sedately following a young woman down a pathway. However, much free play time was allowed, and recent archeological excavations at the site indicate an abundance of games and toys (G. T. Gross, personal communication).

Like intentional communities of the past, the day started early. Children rose at six for calisthenics and a military drill with wooden rifles that was designed to give them good posture. Greeting the rising sun with a song was abandoned after it was misconstrued as primitive sun worship. Instead, a meditation was held in the
Greek Theater, facing west, with readings from the Bagavad-Gita or a similar devotional work. Breakfast at seven was followed by alternating formal lessons and gardening or vocational work, scheduled ball games and spontaneous play until bedtime. All children received training on musical instruments, with reports like one in the San Diego Union (August 30, 1915) hard to believe -

Each child carried a miniature piano keyboard, which showed the scale and the colors of the rainbow. The children, one by one, wrote on the blackboard on stage each one of the seven notes on the scale in its proper place on the staff. Each note was written in a different color of chalk, and the class altogether did the following: Called the note by its name, corresponded it with a color, named and spelled and wrote the color, pointed out the note on the miniature keyboard, and while one played it on a real piano the rest sang it at a pitch to correspond.

All of children and adults who lived at Lomaland were involved in theatrical and musical events that included a range of ages and abilities. For example, elaborate programs in the society archives indicate that "The Aroma of Athens," written by a former professor of Greek, included "games, dances and songs" and was given in 1911, 1912, 1915, and 1918. Also in 1915 was a "Cantata by the Raja Yoga Tots" entitled "Bruce and the Brownies." Much Greek and Shakespearean drama was presented, with favorable reviews in such papers as the San Diego Union, either at the Greek Theater on Point Loma or across the bay in the Isis Theater which Tingley had purchased in 1901.

Holiday festivities such as Independence Day and Christmas were conventional. For instance, for the 1902 Christmas concert, renditions by the children's choir included The Twelve Days of Christmas, Jingle Bells, Deep River and other popular favorites. The community print shop provided Christmas cards and announcements that "Santa Claus, King of the Mysterious" would "appear at 7 sharp" on Christmas Eve. No evidence was found for children's birthday celebrations.

What was the parental role? From all accounts, parents and children worked together under Katherine Tingley's direction, but the relationship can best be understood by referring to Goffman's "removal activities" and "batch living." Even the youngest children seem to have functioned primarily with their peer group, supervised by assigned caregivers and teachers, rather than in a family constellation. Parents were fond of their children, but were detached from direct involvement. Education, from habit training in tooth brushing to consideration of the afterlife, was left to designated individuals in the community system - who did what Katherine Tingley ordered.

By the 1920s, after two decades of competition for members, the Point Loma Theosophists had lost many supporters to the Adyar (India) Theosophists led by Annie Besant. Some wealthy members and supporters of Point Loma found other interests. Others died without making significant bequests or had heirs who contested wills that favored the community. Unanimity of philosophy and followership was diminishing among those who remained, partly because of flawed
leadership and partly because of changing economic and societal patterns. Since the rapidly expanding city of San Diego was encroaching upon Lomaland, the increased value from the original purchase prices of $100 an acre to about $5000 meant that badly needed funds were raised by pruning off property at the edges. Greenwalt wrote that Katherine Tingley continued her trips to Europe and that outwardly the community seemed to be flourishing, particularly as a colony for artists and musicians. At the same time, there was no logical way to bring in enough income to cover expenses. In 1929, the eighty-one year old leader of the society suffered a fatal automobile accident in Germany. Her successor at Point Loma, Gottfried de Purucker, was a Sanskrit scholar who had worked with Tingley since the day at Interlaken when he had assured her that the Point Loma site was available for purchase.

Three months after Tingley's death, the stock market crashed and the great depression of the 1930s was underway. As Mathison expressed it, "The great dream did not die overnight. Rather, it fizzled away with declining audiences" (1960, p. 159). Over the next few years, it became inevitable that the utopian community on Point Loma was finished. Vibrations from nearby naval artillery practice and the ravages of weather required removal of the distinctive glass domes from the buildings with their peeling white paint. Since irrigation cost a thousand dollars a month, gardens were abandoned and many permanent plantings died. Musical instruments were sold and there were no more dramatic productions or concerts. Purucker had no interest in the preschool program and ruled that no children under six years of age were to be admitted - a policy that lacked significance since no babies had been born for several years and families with small children had moved away. A few older children remained in the boarding school, but by the time the property was foreclosed in 1941 half of the remaining hundred and thirty members were past sixty years of age. Tax defaults, unpaid debts, and the prospect of even higher maintenance costs led to the sale of the property in 1940. The Theosophical Society headquarters moved to the Los Angeles area, although San Diego Theosophists maintain a library and continue to hold weekly meetings.

After having several owners, the central portion of the property was acquired by Point Loma Nazarene College, with an administration and students proud of their beautiful campus and its interesting past. History professor Dwayne Little can identify with the "common purpose of the two institutions" and quoted an original resident who assured him, "I'm glad you're here now. We always believed it was holy ground, dedicated to spiritualism, peace, and education of the young." (Stevens, 1980, p. E-1)

Theosophy represented an idea, not a piece of land. Ideas often spread in unanticipated ways. Rudolf Steiner, founder of the Waldorf Schools, was influenced by Theosophical ideas. The philosophy also sounds familiar to those who know the work of Maria Montessori. Annie Besant was an admirer of Montessori's work and the two became friends early in the century. Kramer documents the formation of a Montessori Society in India and the seven years Maria and Mario Montessori spent there, including classes given at the Theosophical Society headquarters, before and during World War II. She points out that "There was some affinity between these
(Transcendental) beliefs and Montessori's view of education as a process of liberating the spirit of the child, the increasingly vague and mystical language in which she spoke of her very practical classroom methods as she grew older (1976, pp 341-355). Although she denied that she was a Theosophist, Montessori's later work, especially in behalf of peace efforts, appear to have been influenced by her years in India. Although her affiliation was with Annie Besant's rival branch of the society, which was in competition with Tingley's Point Loma group for members and leadership, the three groups seem to have complemented one another in helping American nursery schools of the 1940s and 50s break away from the habit-training emphasis of previous decades.

Conclusions

No statistically valid assessment can be made to indicate the value or harm when the "ownership" and education of children passes from parents to their intentional community. Informal evaluations, including self-reports of persons who spent their preschool years at Lomaland, indicate that children developed strong positive self esteem and cooperative social skills. Recent studies of infants and young children in preschools and institutions indicates that HOW children are cared for is more critical than WHERE they are cared for. In this respect, we might generalize to say that the developmental environment for young children in utopian communities has generally been better than in the family homes at the same time period. Children seem to thrive under the care of persons who enjoy them and in virtually all utopian schemes the assignment of caregivers was by choice and efforts were made to ensure that their basic needs were fully met.

Which makes a better setting for the education of young children, a house with a nuclear family or a cottage with peers and guiding adults? The old African maxim that "It takes an entire village to raise a child" has been quoted frequently in recent years. When early childhood professionals speak of the importance of parenting and of the nuclear family, they tend to forget that this is a recent development which applies primarily to Europeans and Americans. Egalitarian activities of these intentional communities included even young children as equal partners in many functions, from gardening to pageants.

The utopian goal of inculcating the dominant philosophy of the community to the next generation seems to have been only partially met in these communities, although we lack reliable studies to trace their outcomes. Louisa May Alcott, who experienced Fruitlands at an impressionable age and maintained a close relationship with her Transcendentalist father throughout his long lifetime, refused to write a requested biography of him because "His philosophy I have never understood." (1981. p. 4). John Van der Zee Sears, who grew up in a Dutch-speaking community which is now New York, was sent to Brook Farm to learn Latin and perfect his English in preparation for college; he enjoyed the Transcendentalist education but in his memoirs wrote that he never did understand their philosophy and that "there are not many of the Socialists of 1840 now living, but the few of us left to those later days have not much interest in the Socialist dogmas now " (Sears, 1912. p. 172).
In an attempt to evaluate the Raja Yoga students of Point Loma, Greenwalt did not distinguish between children who had attended the nursery and preschool center and those who had been admitted as older boarding students. He noted that by the 1920s the younger generation saw the occult beliefs of their elders as bizarre. They were unhappy with the restrictions imposed upon them and he attributes the failure of an alumni association to this attitude. Greenwalt also quoted one father's statement that these children were "just babes in the woods when they go out in the world; they are stunned for a time." His investigation in the early 1950s included interviews and a study of archival documents, but the most he was willing to say was that "Despite conflicting claims of its supporters and detractors, Point Loma seems to have been neither ahead nor behind most schools... It did not produce the reforming statesmen for whom Katherine Tingley had hoped... It is not unlikely that Raja Yoga students who failed to distinguish themselves in later life would have failed under other systems of education, and the same can be said of those who succeeded. Judged by the Dewey dictum that 'speaking generically, education signifies the sum total of processes by means of which a community or social group, whether large or small, transmits its acquired powers and aims with a view to securing its own continued existence and growth,' the Raja Yoga experiment at Point Loma did not succeed" (1955, p. 97).

Did America's intentional communities have value? They might be seen as research and development centers for a troubled society, exploring cooperative approaches to self-actualization and mutual responsibility. The controversy and idealism developed by these social experiments during the nineteenth century was reflected by permanent changes in mainstream religious denominations, in the administration of social services, and in the ideals and behavior of the American people.

Utopian models were particularly relevant in two areas of education. The New Harmony community influenced Pestalozzian reform at all educational levels, but particularly in teacher education, and its advocates paved the way for the kindergartens (Hewes, 1992). Further, virtually every proponent of the Froebelian kindergarten during the period of adoption and expansion, from the 1860s through the 1880s, had been directly or indirectly involved with the Transcendentalist experiments. Elizabeth Peabody, who had been Bronson Alcott's assistant and had written a book about his methods, is the most obvious example. She had visited both Fruitlands and Brook Farm and had edited The Dial, the Transcendentalist periodical, before establishing the first English language kindergarten in 1860 and becoming the primary crusader for Froebelian kindergartens throughout the 1870s (Hewes, 1985).

For a quarter of a century, the Theosophical Society based on Point Loma worked toward what Leadbeater (1925) called "the existence of Perfected Men" and encouraged the optimistic belief that through our long series of successive lives we are making the world a better place. He explained that children who have been humiliated or repressed by teachers, parents, or older children stay at the same level, incarnation after incarnation, while those who are their tormenters fall back. Their goal was for society to treat children better so that they can grow up to make
a better world for us all. It is impossible to know what effect this had upon educational policies parenting styles, but the continuous publicity aroused public interest and discussion about the methodology and the results at Lomaland. The opening words of Utopian Lights make an optimistic ending to this paper. Baczko begins his book on the evolution of social progress by stating "Utopias are often only premature truths." While the teaching strategies used a century ago may not be desired today, we may hope that the concerns for children expressed by these utopian idealists can indeed help bring a future that is brighter than the past.

References

Primary sources used for the section on Theosophy were found in the Theosophical Society Library and Archives in Altadena (Pasadena), the Theosophical Library in San Diego (TLSD), the Archives of the San Diego Historical Association (SDHA), and the libraries of San Diego State University and the University of California at San Diego. Because of space limitations, archival sources are not cited in the text unless used for direct quotations. Particular appreciation is expressed to John Vanmeter at the Theosophical Archives in Altadena.


Brook Farm Association for Industry and Education. Constitution. Boston: I.R. Butts. 1844 (Microfilm)

Codman, John T. Brook Farm - Historic and Personal Memories. Boston: Arena. 1894


Greenwalt, Emmett A. The Point Loma Community in California, 1897-1942. Berkeley: University of California Press. 1955


Hewes, Dorothy W. "Compensatory Early Childhood Education: Froebelian Origins and Outcomes." ERIC/EECE EC264980 PS015596 1985
Hewes, Dorothy W. "Pestalozzi: Foster Father of Early Childhood Education." ERIC/EECE ED 353 067 PS 021 037 1992
Hine, Robert V. California's Utopian Colonies. San Marino, CA: Huntington Library. 1953
Kolmerten, Carol A. Women in Utopia; The ideology of gender in the American Owenite Communities. 1990
Sears, John Van der Zee. My Friends at Brook Farm. New York: Fitzgerald. 1912
Segal, Howard P. Technological Utopianism in American Culture. Chicago: Univ. of Chicago. 1985
Stevens, Gus. "Madame Tingley's Theosophical Society of yesteryear" in San Diego Tribune, March 5, 1908
Tingley, Katherine (Ed.). The Raja Yoga First Reader for Little Beginners. Point Loma: International Brotherhood League. 1902
Whiting, Lilian. Katherine Tingley and Her Raja Yoga System of Education. Point Loma: Aryan Press. 1919