This digest contains the following two articles on mentoring: "Mentoring in Educational Settings: Unresolved Issues and Unanswered Questions" (Olga M. Welch); and "Learning from the Field: Mentoring Projects in Field-Based Settings" (Heidi Lynch). The first article describes mentoring in general and mentoring in the schools, examines some studies about the effectiveness of mentoring, notes some unresolved issues, and the feasibility of cross-gender mentoring. The second article describes five mentoring projects in support of academic achievement and career education and development, providing contact names and addresses for each. The digest also includes an annotated list of nine resources published by the Women's Educational Equity Act Publishing Center. (KC)
Mentoring in Educational Settings
Unresolved Issues and Unanswered Questions

By Dr. Olga M. Welch, University of Tennessee

For over a decade, schools have seen mentoring as playing a critical role both in fostering student success and in facilitating educators' professional development and mobility. In part because schools have been exploring new ways to address diverse student needs, an enormous amount of interest has been generated in the possibilities inherent in mentoring. Mentoring has become such a popular strategy that the view that a role model, mentor, or sponsor is necessary for success is now so widely held that it seems self-evident.

What is mentoring?
The prototype for a mentoring relationship seems to have derived from Greek mythology. As the story goes, Odysseus, a leader in the Trojan war, entrusted the care of his son, Telemachus, to his good friend Mentor. While Odysseus was away at war, Mentor was to act as a surrogate parent, teacher, role model, advisor, guide, and counselor to the inexperienced youth.

This description of Mentor's role became the foundation for more current characterizations of the mentor relationship. Over the centuries, talk about mentoring has meant to talk about a relationship between a young adult and an older, more experienced adult who supports, guides, and counsels as the young individual learns to navigate within the adult world.

Though the word "mentor" still holds these connotations, it has also come to describe a variety of relationships that occur in different contexts and with diverse emphases.

Mentoring in schools
Educational settings exhibit a variety of mentoring models designed for different purposes. A look at these models reveals programs that range from those matching students with teachers, advisors, or community leaders, to programs for supporting new teachers or helping teachers move into administration.

Programs for students are generally designed with the goal either of helping them academically or of helping them develop strong vocational skills and contacts. Mentoring experiences for faculty on the other hand are more often designed to help educators adjust more easily to a new position—as in the case of pairing new teachers or new administrators with more experienced colleagues—or to help them gain skills and contacts to move up and out of their current positions. An example of the latter includes matching a teacher with an administrator who helps the teacher develop administrative skills.

Mentoring programs have also been used to enhance the chances of African Americans and Latinos succeeding in situations in which they have had little previous experience. For instance, in universities and colleges, where faculty and administrators are traditionally White and male, students of color often have less access than White students to informal networks and support. Mentoring has been seen as an effective approach toward reducing isolation and providing support for students of color.

Does mentoring work?
As a dissertation project, S. Villani conducted in-depth interviews in an educational setting with 9 mentors and 15 protégés who had been involved in mentoring relationships either during the protégés’
Mentoring in educational settings... continued

academic lives or in the early stages of their careers. The study's findings suggest that both mentors and protégés typically viewed the mentoring relationships as influential. This was true particularly for women, who often saw themselves as needing to overcome internal barriers to the realization of their career aspirations.

Additional studies in education have supported the notion that mentoring was beneficial in reducing the time needed for advancement into management or public school administrative positions.

There remain, however, many unanswered questions about how, why, and where mentoring works.

Unresolved issues
The above-mentioned studies notwithstanding, there is not uniform agreement about (a) the roles a person must assume for the relationship to be identified as mentoring; (b) the difference between a mentor and a sponsor; (c) how a mentor normally selects a protégé; and (d) whether mentoring occurs differently and with different results for women and minorities. Thus, while research identifies the nature and dynamics of established mentoring relationships, it appears that mentors of the same ethnicity may or may not be the same or different than that of others in the organization. Because of this, there is no clear basis upon which to conduct further research.

The research also does not address whether or not mentoring [occurs] differently in different types of organizations, and with differing results. Most importantly, little documentation exists to confirm the commonly held assumption that mentoring is critical for advancement into upper levels of organizations.

Thus, despite the proliferation of research and literature on mentoring, it remains unclear whether authors are speaking about the same phenomenon.

An equally important issue involves cross-gender mentoring. Especially in relation with the definitional and role-related issues raised earlier, when women, and especially women of color, are considered for mentoring, distinct questions and concerns are raised. Many of these arise from uncertainties about whether the mentoring process is or should be the same or different than that for others in the organization. Conscious and unconscious stereotypes and biases add to these uncertainties.

While research findings are mixed in terms of conclusions on cross-ethnic mentoring relationships, it appears that mentors of the same ethnicity as their protégés can often offer added benefits, especially for students of color. For instance, a Latina mentor may be able to help a Latina protégé resolve a discontinuity between the protégé’s cultural or community values and the institution’s values. Y. T. Moses points out that “many potential mentors are unfamiliar with Black issues and women’s issues and may be unable to relate to the needs of Black women students.”

On the other hand, other researchers suggest that cross-gender and cross-ethnic mentoring partnerships add other benefits. For instance, when the mentor is White and male and the protégé not, the protégé may have an opportunity to learn more about those who currently run educational institutions.

Whatever may be the final assessment of these relationships, it is a fact that because White males make up the vast majority of educational administrators, cross-gender and cross-ethnic mentoring is inevitable, at least in some programs. It is also true that special issues arise because of these relationships.

Cross-gender mentoring
K. E. Kram offers one description of the psychosocial elements of a good mentoring relationship. These include role modeling, acceptance-and-confirmation, counseling, and friendship: “The junior person finds support for who he or she is becoming in a new work role that increases a sense of competence, effectiveness, and self-worth. In turn, the senior person can satisfy important needs at midlife that increase a sense of competence, effectiveness, and self-worth.”

Focusing on female-male mentoring partnerships, Kram discusses in particular the importance of role modeling, suggesting that in any junior-senior work relationship, both individuals benefit. She also stresses that the identification and transference that underlie the role modeling function are more complex in cross-gender relationships.

Some research suggests that men and women are inclined to assume stereotypical roles in relating to each other in work settings. Kram argues that these roles are defined by assumptions and expectations about appropriate behavior for each sex. In order to reduce the uncertainty, ambiguity, and anxiety created by the emergence of cross-gender work relationships, men and women rely on what is familiar. In doing so, they sometimes unknowingly assume traditional roles learned from past situations. These roles tend to constrain behavior and to reduce individual competence and effectiveness.

People perpetuate stereotypical roles because it is what they know and are most comfortable with. In developmental relationships, like mentoring, the challenge becomes devising strategies of behavior that permit men and women to
Learning from the field
Mentoring projects in field-based settings

By Heidi Lynch, Center for Equity and Cultural Diversity

Mentoring programs for women and girls are currently found in a wide variety of settings around the country. Ranging from efforts to support academic achievement to career education and development endeavors, these programs offer a wealth of field-based learning that can inform other programs.

The mentoring programs highlighted here illustrate ways in which mentoring can be incorporated into educational settings. These programs vary in many aspects, including how participants are recruited, the kind of training provided, who the relationships involve, and the kind of guidance partnerships are given. What these programs have in common is that all exhibit ways in which women are helping women, and all use a multicultural perspective—very apparent is the recognition that while all women share some experiences, they also have many differences in views and needs. As we evolve a concept of mentoring, programs like these can help us focus on what mentoring is, what works, and why.

High school plus: Choose Nursing!
Four young women have been accepted into nursing programs and are on their way to successful careers. A major catalyst in the process has been the Choose Nursing! Program at Boston’s Beth Israel Hospital.

Each year, 15 young women of color and low-income females are selected from the Boston public high schools to participate in this innovative two-year program. Choose Nursing! uses a comprehensive, multifaceted approach to address education and training, recruitment into the health professions, and early intervention career development. The program offers students 1,000 hours of hands-on experience and learning with professional nurses and with patients. In addition to career-related experiences, the program provides diagnostic academic testing, educational planning and counseling, liaison with students’ teachers and counselors, individualized assistance in applying for college and financial aid, and help in preparing for college entrance exams.

Students are selected for the program based on their motivation to become professional nurses and to continue their education. While students must have a C+ or better in every academic class they are enrolled in to participate, one of the focuses of the program is to encourage students academically and to provide remediation and supplemental academic work as needed. Mentors are professional nurses who have been recommended by their nurse managers, and who have completed a daylong training session.

The program starts the summer before students’ junior year with an intensive six-week training, and continues throughout a two-year period. Students and nurses spend a number of hours a week together during the school year focusing on development of clinical skills, reflection on the program experience, and planning for the future. Students receive tutoring in academic classes and participate in a number of activities designed to help them select a good college nursing program and gain admission. Partnerships with area schools of nursing offer additional opportunities, including the chance to experience actual nursing labs and visit college nursing programs.

The mentoring component of this program was only recently formalized. From the beginning of the program one-on-one work with a nurse was a critical part of the course. In the 1992–93 year, this relationship was validated and supported with mentor training for nurses. A set of materials developed through the WEEA Program—Hand in Hand: Mentoring Young Women—was adapted for use in planning activities and in assisting students to reflect on their experiences.

In three years of operation, students have overwhelmingly met the expectations hospital staff had for them. After completing the summer intensive session, over 90 percent of the students express a high interest in the nursing field, and after 10 months of the program, 86 percent continue to declare a high interest. As of the end of the second year of the program, 94 percent of the students had applied to colleges, with 88 percent applying to nursing programs.

For additional information about this program contact Eileen Hodgman, Director, Choose Nursing!, Beth Israel Hospital, 132 Brookline Avenue, BL 312, Boston, MA 02215, (617)735-3949.

College for all: Diversifying the student body
Mentoring is currently being used in a number of college and university settings to attract and retain a more diverse student body. One such program, Choices: Minority Women’s Perspectives on Equity Issues, at Triton College, provides a mentoring component for women of color that supports them during their college experience, and encourages them in setting professional goals. One participant in Choices reported, “Without this program, I never would have even considered coming to college.”

Begun under a WEEA grant in 1989, Choices paired women of color who were entering or already in their first semesters of college courses with a faculty advisor-mentor. Students were recruited into the program through targeted mailings to Triton students and high school students, and
Learning from the field... continued

One of the most exciting things about this project has been that we have discovered so many resources and role models within our own organization.

were selected based on applications. The yearlong program enrolled 21 participants, including African American, Vietnamese, Colombian, and Native American students.

Each mentor worked with their protégé to help them learn about and become comfortable within the college environment, and learn what was expected of them in classes and in behavior. As a vast majority of participants were among the first in their families to attend college, this supporting role was often cited by participants as vital to their ability to adjust to the college environment. Mentors also served as resource people, helping protégés learn where to go for specific kinds of help or materials. During the year, the students kept journals in which they recorded their feelings and reactions to school and the program.

This mentoring component supported a comprehensive program that included academic, financial, and life skills courses and counseling. Cooperative education work assignments were directed toward areas of student career interest, and gave students a modest but needed income.

Several participants of the program reported that they would not have considered college an option without the outreach and support they were given by the program. Although discontinued for lack of funding, the program generated much interest among other students who asked to participate in subsequent years.

For additional information contact Dr. Charlotte Lee, Triton College, 2000 Fifth Avenue, River Grove, IL 60171. (708)456-0300.

Mentoring for sports-related careers

The Womentoring Program, a mentoring program run by the National Association of Girls and Women in Sports (NAGWS), is encouraging women to pursue sports-related careers and to support one another in those positions. In place for several years, the program has encouraged women in careers in sports and has provided support to women pursuing training and placements. For example, one young woman who participated in the project while attending graduate school is now teaching and coaching basketball at a public high school, thanks in large part to the guidance and support of her mentor.

The program began out of the need to increase the number of women of color in sports-related fields, a goal of NAGWS and of the minority representation division of NAGWS. Upon implementation of the program, NAGWS received so much interest in the program that they expanded the program to include all women in sports, and reassigned it to the professional development division of NAGWS.

The Womentoring Program is an ongoing program that continually pairs up mentors and protégés. The program solicits applications for both career mentors and protégés. Mentors are selected based on their multicultural awareness and willingness to grow; their sensitivity and understanding of values, perspectives, and lifestyles of different cultures; and their ability to interact effectively in a pluralistic society. Protégés must be willing to be active participants in the program, and to question and listen to advice related to career development.

Once pairs are assigned, initial assistance is provided to both protégés and mentors in the form of an introductory kit to assist in starting the relationship. The way in which the mentor and protégé will interact, as well as the frequency with which they will meet, is decided between the two, with each responsible for submitting periodic progress reports.

For additional information about this program contact the National Association for Girls and Women in Sports, 1900 Association Drive, Reston, VA 22091-1599. (703)476-3450.

Encouraging education leaders

"One of the most exciting things about this project has been that we have discovered so many resources and role models within our own organization" states one participant of a mentoring project for women educational administrators in the Texas Panhandle. Another adds, "In this area we can still often be the only woman administrator in a school district. There can be a real feeling of isolation."

The Female Educators' Mentorship Project in Amarillo, Texas, tackled the perennial problem of underrepresentation of women in educational leadership roles. The percentage of women administrators in the Texas Panhandle reflects a national predicament: educational administration is not representative of the pool from which administrators come, neither in terms of gender nor race/ethnicity. Data collected by the U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission show that though female educators outnumber male educators two to one, almost 80 percent of all principals are males. Less than 10 percent are men of color, and approximately 5 percent are women of color.

The project, funded through the WEEA Program and run by the Panhandle Council of Women School Executives, solicited applications both for mentors and for protégés. A selection committee of seven persons from the council chose the mentors for the program based on their professional goals, their learning and working styles, their views on education, and their description of an ideal mentor and protégé. Initial screening of the protégé applications was done by the same screening committee, which gave preference to women newly hired into subadministrative positions or women working toward these positions. The mentors then made the final selection, choosing a woman they wanted as a partner.

After an initial two-day training retreat—which included activities designed to strengthen skills in
management, leadership, communication, interpersonal skills, team building, and career development—specific activities to be carried out were designed and planned by the mentoring partnerships themselves. The frequency of meetings was up to the pairs, and activities included specific skill development, shared projects, shadowing, and trouble-shooting. Three follow-up workshops were provided throughout the year, the contents of which were selected by the participants. In addition, informal get-togethers, such as breakfasts and parties, were initiated throughout the year by project participants.

During the yearlong mentoring project, two of the protégés were appointed principals, one of whom is now one of the few Latinas in the Panhandle holding this position. Several others, both protégés and mentors, have received promotions since then. "I was recently promoted from an education specialist to administrative assistant for my region, an advancement that I owe in large part to my experiences and contacts from the program," states Hollis Parker-Grimes, who participated in the project as a protégé. Her mentor also won a promotion during the last year.

Although the program is no longer conducted on a formal basis, mentors from the council are still available on an informal basis. Those interested in mentoring other women announce their availability in the council's newsletter.

For additional information about this program contact Hollis Parker-Grimes, Region 16 Education Service Center, P.O. 30600, Amarillo, TX 79120, (806)376-5521.

Role models for career development

Mentoring partnerships formed a support mechanism for a WEFA-funded job training and internship project developed and run by Volunteers Clearing House in Fort Collins, Colorado.

The clearing house works primarily with low-income women. Its many projects and services are designed to draw in women who may feel isolated or who are suffering from poverty-related problems, and to slowly but surely help them work toward empowerment, taking charge of their lives, and planning their futures.

The organization offers a number of activities and classes for registration fees of around $3.00. The job training and internship project fit into the overall offerings and worked in a number of ways to help participants with self-esteem, literacy, life skills, on-the-job behavior, and high school diplomas or GEDs. Fifteen women participated: eight Latinas, five Whites, and two Native Americans.

The mentoring component supported the work of this project, teaming participants primarily with women of color from the low-income community in which the participants lived, and who had worked through poverty-related issues, had set and achieved career goals, and who had time to devote to such a project. The project staff looked for some measure of personal success and a sensitivity to the problems of women, people of color, and poverty.

For instance, mentor Guadeloupe Salazar was from the same neighborhood as the participants. As director of Colorado State University's El Centro Hispanic Services, she provided a strong role model in placing great importance on retaining her Latino culture, her experience at career development, and her belief in giving back to the community.

Mentors first met together, in a session that introduced them to the organization's program and services, the kinds of women they would be working with and their needs, and information about productive mentoring. Requirements for mentors were also outlined: a willingness to meet for at least a year; the ability to be a positive role model in dress, punctuality, and professionalism; and an understanding that the relationship was to be supportive rather than fostering dependence.

Mentors and protégés then met together in smaller groups of all the participants, where the expectations and goals of the project were discussed. The timeline suggested by the project staff was to spend three months getting to know one another, setting goals, and deciding on a plan of action. During the rest of the year, the partners were to work toward the goals they decided upon. Pairs met two to three hours a month, and could attend monthly "miniseminars" on such topics as assertiveness, goal setting, employer expectations, academic and vocational opportunities, and appropriate work dress. Project staff stayed in close contact to ensure that relationships continued to be mutually satisfying.

The job training project was offered only during one year, but role models and mentors are still provided on an informal and volunteer basis within Volunteers Clearing House.

For additional information about this program contact CA-olyn Andrews, Volunteers Clearing House, 401 Linden Street, Fort Collins, CO 80524, (303)493-0909.

Additional mentoring contacts and resources

International Mentoring Association
A121 Ellsworth Hall
Western Michigan University
Kalamazoo, MI 49008-5161
(616)387-4174

Ohio Leadership in Educational Administration Development
623-H Park Meadow Road
Westerville, OH 43081
(614)891-1229

Mentoring Newsletter
Kay La Bold
P.O. Box 61070
San Angelo, TX 76906
(915)942-0494
Mentoring in educational settings ... continued

interact in a variety of ways that are appropriate within a given work context.

In cross-gender developmental relationships, while women face dilemmas similar to those of their male counterparts, there are others that are unique to being female in male-dominated organizations. This can bring special issues to the relationship.

For instance, concerns about the appropriateness of a particular behavior may appear unwarranted to a male mentor who does not understand what works for a man may not work for a woman. (The same might be said about relationships across race and ethnicity.) Concerns about balancing work and family commitments are exacerbated by women who are simultaneously advancing their careers and assuming the roles of wife and/or mother. These unique gender-related concerns make it difficult for male mentors to empathize, to provide role modeling, and to identify with their female protégés around these issues.

Project Mentor
Several years ago, with my colleagues Dr. Norma Mertz and Dr. Jan Henderson, I studied career advancement mentoring across three organizations: business and industry, higher education, and governmental agencies. One aspect of our study involved an examination of the role of gender and race in the selection of protégés and the development of the relationship.

Four issues emerged from the data. First, our findings suggest that it is difficult for some people to accept a cross-gender mentoring relationship because of a perception that the relationship may be other than professional in nature. For example, a female protégé may be seen as using her physical attributes to get ahead and the male mentor as succumbing to them.

The ease with which inappropriate motives are ascribed to this kind of relationship hurts all involved—the mentor, the protégé, and the organization. Stereotypes, gossip, and half-truths work to deny the competence of the protégé and impugn the motives of the mentor. By implication, the ability of the protégé to have secured the position on her or his merit is questioned. While most school-based mentoring programs involve students and faculty, misperceptions of the relationships cannot entirely be ignored. For example, a male counselor who takes a particular interest in the progress of a promising female student may have his motives questioned.

Risk is a second issue in cross-gender mentoring relationships. In our study, male mentors were candid about the "risks" involved in working with female protégés. Specifically, they talked about the perception that these individuals do not constitute a critical mass in most organizations, particularly at the highest levels. Consequently, the judgment of the mentor is more likely to be scrutinized when the protégé is a woman.

In educational settings, this was most often seen in situations in which a senior level person, for example in central administration, had selected a promising female administrator to mentor. Because there are few female superintendents, there was a tendency to believe that women could not or would not make it to the top. Thus, the way in which others view the relationship was colored by that perception.

Critical feedback is essential to the growth of the protégé in a mentoring relationship. However, our study suggests that male mentors are reluctant to provide such feedback to a female protégé. For a number of mentors, females as well as people of color are perceived to be unduly sensitive to critical feedback. As a result, mentors tend to filter the information given to these groups. In educational settings, such filtering deprives promising students and faculty of the kind of information they need to grow and develop. No mentoring relationship could survive such intellectual duplicity.

Finally, the study findings indicate that the behavior of female protégés receives closer scrutiny than that of their male counterparts. In some instances, their work is held to a higher standard of performance.

An illustration of this situation can be found in higher education, where in some cases, promotion and tenure is granted to female faculty much later than to their male counterparts, even when they have similar qualifications.

While these findings do not constitute exhaustive data on cross-gender mentoring relationships, they do suggest important issues for those interested in planning mentoring programs in educational settings.

Models for mentoring
With the current emphases on peer and student-adult mentoring, the definitional and role-related issues and questions discussed earlier cannot be ignored. Several researchers are beginning to examine the conflicting findings on mentoring and to challenge conventional conceptualizations of the relationship. For example, M. R. Schockett and colleagues have developed a model of mentoring that incorporates Kram’s phases of initiation, cultivation, separation, and redefinition, but focuses on collaborative roles for the mentor and protégé.

Next steps
If we believe that mentoring offers some benefits in certain settings—and there is some data to suggest that it can—it is critical that we reach some agreement regarding a number of aspects of this
I do not see a clear continuation of the text. It seems to be a fragmented excerpt of a larger document, possibly a guide or resource book. The text includes references to various resources, such as books and articles, and mentions concepts like mentoring, career exploration, and gender roles. It appears to be intended for educators and mentors, providing guidance on how to help students make informed choices about their careers. The text includes a list of resources, some of which are: 

- Choosing Occupations and Life Roles (set), #2516 $45.00
- The Whole Person Book: Toward Self-Discovery and Life Options, #2215 $14.25
- Barrier Free: Serving Young Women with Disabilities, #2732 $8.00
- Project CHOICE: Creating Her Options in Career Exploration, #2140 $30.00

The text also includes a section titled "Mentoring in educational settings... continued" which suggests it is part of a larger discussion on mentoring and career development. The text is quite technical and filled with references to research and studies, indicating a scholarly approach to the topic.
Resources for mentors and mentoring programs

The products of the Women's Educational Equity Act (WEEA) Publishing Center provide ideas and activities for mentoring programs designed to empower female adolescents and women in schools and in businesses. Developed with funds from the WEEA Program, the materials may be purchased by mail or phone. Orders under $25.00 must be prepaid. For prepaid orders, add $2.25 shipping for orders under $25.00; add $4.25 for orders $25.00 and over. For a complete listing of materials contact the WEEA Publishing Center at 800-225-3088 (in Massachusetts call 617-969-7100).

Hand in Hand: Mentoring Young Women (set). #2685 $17.50; #2686 $8.50; Student Career Journal, #2742 $6.00

Used by a wide range of counseling, at-risk, and career exploration programs, this set was developed in conjunction with the Mentor Training Project in Portland, Oregon. The field-tested materials train career women of color to be effective mentors for high school girls of color. The Ideabook serves as guidance for mentors and students for their time together. Each student uses the Journal to record their thoughts and insights as they learn about themselves, dispel fantasies about the future, and begin planning for a realistic adventure toward adulthood. This set was adapted for use in a hospital setting by the Choose Nursing Program, described on page 3.

Chart Your Course and Building Partnerships (set), #2703 $16.00

An innovative career exploration program for young women. Chart Your Course includes activities to help young women increase their knowledge of career options and generate useful skills. Using Building Partnerships, mentoring programs can plan and implement student career institutes on industry sites. The high-tech

continued p. 7, "Resources"