

90

48p.; For other Dunford House Seminar proceedings, see FL 021 247-257.

English Language Division, The British Council, Medlock Street, Manchester M15 4AA, England, United Kingdom.

Collected Works - Conference Proceedings (021)

Case Studies; Developing Nations; Economic Development; Elementary Secondary Education; *English (Second Language); Foreign Countries; Government Role; Higher Education; *Long Range Planning; *Program Administration; Program Evaluation; Second Language Instruction; *Second Language Programs; *Technical Assistance

Ethiopia; Kenya; Malaysia (Sabah); Sri Lanka; *United Kingdom

Proceedings of a seminar on the management of English second language training (ELT) in British technical assistance programs are presented in the form of narrative summaries. An introductory section gives an overview of the conference. Four subsequent chapters summarize presentations and discussions on these topics: project management, documentation, coordination, and evaluation; the views on project sustainability of the British overseas aid agency, the private ELT sector, and a construction firm involved in projects in developing countries; case studies for Sri Lanka, Kenya, East Malaysia, and Ethiopia; and suggestions for ways the British Council can help enhance project longevity. Appended materials include an article entitled "Pulling Out of a Project: Twelve Tips for Project Planners" (Paul Woods); a framework for planning and evaluating projects; a chart of typical project structures; a list of participants; and a seminar schedule. (MSE)
Managing ELT aid projects for sustainability
The British Council promotes Britain abroad. It provides access to British ideas, talents and experience in education and training, books and periodicals, the English language, the arts, the sciences and technology.

All enquiries to

English Language and Literature Division
The British Council
10 Spring Gardens
London SW1A 2BN

Cover design by Sue Scullard
Engraving of Dunford House, near Midhurst, West Sussex, where the seminar has generally been held since 1979

Published by
The British Council 1990

© The British Council 1990

Cover printed in Britain by TWP Services Ltd
The Dunford House Seminar

This is an annual residential seminar run by the English Language and Literature Division of the British Council, on behalf of ODA, as part of its commitment to the provision of training and updating for ELT specialists. The seminar serves not only British Council career officers but also Council-recruited ELT staff, especially those working on schemes funded by the Overseas Development Administration (English Language Teaching Officers - ELTOs, formerly KELTs) whose attendance at the seminar is funded by ODA. As last year the seminar included participants from public and private sector institutions. The desirability of promoting exchange of experience between these various groups guides the selection of the participants. During the six days spent at Dunford House in West Sussex the participants are able to meet and discuss issues with academics, ELT Council staff and others in similar situations to themselves from all over the world, and to exchange ideas and experiences in both formal and informal settings.

Previous seminar topics

1978 ESP course design
1979 ELT course design
1980 Communicative methodology
1981 Design, evaluation and testing in English language projects
1982 Teacher training and the curriculum
1983 Design and implementation of teacher-training programmes
1984 Curriculum and syllabus design in ELT
1985 Communication skills training in bilateral aid projects
1986 Appropriate methodology
1987 ELT and development: the place of English language teaching in aid programmes
1988 ELT in development aid: defining aims and measuring results

Copies of reports of these seminars are available on request from:

English Language and Literature Division
The British Council
10 Spring Gardens
London SW1A 2BN
Acknowledgements

English Language and Literature Division of the British Council would like, once again, to thank the staff of Dunford House and in particular the Principal, Mr Sam Hall, for their conscientious attention to the needs of the seminar participants, and their willingness to help in every way possible to make the event a success.

Further acknowledgements are due to:

The Intermediate Technology Workshop for the video 'Wheels of change'
Staff Training Department, The British Council, for the loan of the video 'Taking the critical path'
Oxford University Press for permission to print the article 'Pulling out of a project: twelve tips for project planners', by Paul Woods: ELTJ, Volume 42/3, July 1988, pp 196-200
Miss Meriel Blakely for her temporary assistance as typist during the last two days of the seminar
Central Typing Service, The British Council, for typing the report manuscript
## Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Overview</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part I: Project management</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part II: Sustainability and ELT aid projects</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part III: Case-studies</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part IV: Action plans</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Appendices

1. Pre-seminar reading                        | 39   |
2. Project framework                          | 45   |
3. Project structures                         | 46   |
4. List of participants                       | 47   |
5. Seminar programme                          | 48   |
The Director-General of the British Council, Sir Richard Francis, attended the closing dinner of the course and gave a short address in which he made the points which follow.

After regretting that he had not been able to attend an actual session of the seminar, since he always liked to see the Council's work at first hand, the Director-General focused on 'projectization' and 'sustainability'. Although they are not particularly agreeable as words, as concepts they represent the sort of new thinking the Council has become involved in over recent years in order to meet the demands of sponsors and clients. ELT has a particularly important role in the Council's activities, not only as a large revenue-earner (and we no longer need to feel embarrassment about talking money), but also in the role carried out by the participants at the seminar - brokerage between overseas governments and what the UK can offer in terms of expertise, training and other resources. In this regard, as in others, the Council offers value for money and need not fear competition.

This has also been noted in Whitehall. With its first Corporate Plan the Council demonstrated its ability to manage its business in a serious and committed way. This earned it the respect of the Government and an increase in the core budget. What the Corporate Plan had principally shown was that the Council was not in business simply for its own sake, but was addressing the question, 'what can the Council do for others?'. Again this was a central concern of the present seminar, not only in the work with host governments, but also in relation to establishments and institutions in this country. The mix of participants at the seminar reflected the Council's desire to involve as wide a range of institutions as possible in its efforts.

As well as confidence in the future of the ELT practitioner, the Director-General expressed his confidence that the government - the new government ministers concerned with the Council's affairs after the recent cabinet reshuffle - appreciated the importance of ELT and would continue to support the Council in its work.
Overview

The Dunford House Seminar was shorter this year. Hopefully it was no less productive than usual in its attention to central issues in the management and implementation of ODA-funded ELT aid projects.

Sustainability, this year's seminar theme, is not, of course, a new concept; it appears widely in the donor literature, has reared its head before at Dunford (e.g. Judy White, 1987) and is neatly addressed in an article in the professional literature (ELTJ, 1988) which provided the pre-seminar reading and appears in this report at Appendix A.

The sub-title of that article is rightly twelve tips for project planners (my emphasis - TD). This is the third seminar specifically concerned with project management, but the fact that we have progressed from project design, through monitoring, to what one of this year's contributors referred to as 'project afterlife', does not, of course, mean that the sustainability issue should be newly addressed half-way through or towards the end of projects. As more than one speaker emphasized during the week, sustainability should be built in from the design stage and managed throughout implementation. Thus seminar participants were selected from Council field-managers, ELTTO Heads of Project and some of the Council's most experienced outside consultants.

Sustainability then, is engendered through the project outputs, which, as stated in the early sessions of the week on project frameworks, should derive logically from inputs. Some of those inputs were the subject of a debate held half-way through the seminar; although training emerged by popular acclaim as the most powerful sustaining input in an 'if-you-were-to-be-allowed-only-one ....' situation, benefits from training (like the desert-island exercise from which this was drawn) will need back-up from the right equipment, books, dialogue, advice and technology. In other words, what won the debate for training (apart from the quality of its apologist's presentation!) was its inclusivity, and the fact that successful sustainability, like successful projects in the last analysis, depends on people (see Carew Treffgarne's emphasis on the human resource).

One of the most revealing sessions of the week (according to the seminar evaluations) was the presentation by Rod Capper from Howard Humphreys, the civil engineering company, contracted by ODA for some of its 'hard' projects. Rod Capper put pay to any facile comparisons between 'hard' (e.g. engineering and construction projects) and 'soft' (e.g. education) projects as far as sustainability is concerned, since, here too, sustainability is essentially dependent on transfer of attitudes and training and so the same issues must sooner or later be faced; involvement, motivation, awareness, three of the seven points he dwelt on, are concerned with the human resource and the shaping of attitudes.

Robert Bellarmine drew attention to the importance of shaping attitudes on both sides - donor and recipient too must be aware of differences in approach to the problems and resources the project addresses and a recurrent plea in the seminar, and a thread running through the action plans, is for more involvement by beneficiaries in project planning. This could lead to a double skill-transfer; alongside the project's main focus, project management, and indeed, the management skill in general - which economists and others focus on as a one-root cause of low rates of return on aid investment - would provide its own benefits.

The other major lesson of the week was perhaps the reminder of the organic nature of sustainability (see Roger Bowers' case-studies analysis). It is not a question of merely keeping the same attitudes and inputs going, following donor withdrawal, but of providing a generative capacity so that syllabuses will continue to be modified and adapted, trainees will continue to have access to new approaches and methods, textbooks will not turn into fossilized teaching tools, and the identification of new language needs will provide new course designs. The action plans from the case-studies all reflect this (including Sri Lanka's! While they name their last section 'Institutional preservation', what the content of that section clearly means (thank goodness!) is institutional growth!).

The seminar's own action plan, arising from the closing session, tries to mirror some of these principles itself. It is based on participation and co-operation by both the Council and ODA; it focuses particularly on interpersonal developments and the human resource and, while using extant practices and documents as its starting point, it aims for adaptation. It has already been passed to ODA's Education Division for consideration.

As usual an agreeable English summer and the gentle greens of the West Sussex environment provided, for many of the participants, a welcome respite from harsher climes and concerns. Dunford House's food and recreation sustained the palate as well as thought, and thus, indirectly, it is to be hoped, sustained the projects there represented.
Part I: Project management

The first two days of the seminar were devoted to practice and procedures involved in managing projects for ODA. The first three sessions defined the roles of ODA, the Council and, more particularly, ELMD. On the second day the important techniques involved in drawing up project frameworks - a project design and management tool - were explained and practised through the case study of an ELT project at present being set up in Nigeria.

Project management and project documents

Myra Harrison, ODA

As an aid to understanding ODA's approach to project management it is perhaps important, first of all, to look at the structure of the organization. The speaker described it as follows:

Permanent Secretary (Tim Lankoaster)

Under-Secretaries

Heads of Departments

Geographical Desk Officers

Higher Executive Officers (HEOs)

Executive Officers (EOs)

Just posed against this structure are the five development divisions, which have their own internal structures similar to ODA Headquarters. The development divisions are:

British Development Division for Eastern Africa (BDDEA)

British Development Division for Southern Africa (BDDS)

South East Asia Development Division (SEADD)

Caribbean Development Division

Pacific Development Division

Both the development divisions and the UK departments receive professional advisory input from education, agriculture, economic advisers, etc.

Not all of these development divisions have education advisers attached to them as is the case in London. The personnel in development divisions have evolved differently according to need and vary in character according to the range of their programmes.

Projects worth £2.5 million and over need to be approved by the Projects Evaluation Committee (PEC); below this figure heads of department can approve projects.

To improve management and design of aid projects, ODA has adopted the project frame. This is a document approximately two pages long, which provides an easy overview of a project under the following headings:

- wider objectives
- immediate objectives
- inputs
- outputs

By presenting project content in a matrix under these headings several advantages are achieved. It clarifies the objectives of the project; it brings the key project components together, it is systematic, it establishes key stages of the project under 'indicators of achievement', and it makes provision for monitoring.

The second part of the project documentation required by ODA is the project memorandum, which is divided into twelve sections. The most important of these sections are those which refer to means of monitoring the project, to evaluation, and to implementation arrangements.

One source of confusion in drawing up project frameworks and memoranda is the distinction between immediate objectives and project outputs. To avoid confusion in this area it is advisable to begin thinking about a project in terms of its objectives. The outputs can then be seen more clearly as a means to achieving these objectives, rather than as ends in themselves.

Hector Munro

Since ODA is tying in increasingly with the World Bank project cycle as a scheme for describing projects from beginning to end, so it is important to keep track of World Bank sector policy in this and other areas. The project cycle, as used by ODA, can be described under the following five major headings:

- identification
- preparation
- appraisal
- implementation
- evaluation

There are useful ODA documents or guidelines on the subject of the project cycle including: Guidelines to the evaluation of ODA projects, project completion reports, and evaluation summaries (Evsms). Under the appraisal ODA must take into account the following factors:

- ODA policy (country/sector)
- recipient government policy
- economic viability
- social impact
- environmental impact
- political context
- commercial considerations
- institutional development considerations
- professional viability
- management viability

Economic considerations which merit attention include a comparison of benefits against costs (i.e. both actual costs and the shadow/opportunity costs). In this context the following questions are pertinent:
who benefits?
- how do you compare benefits 'with the project' as opposed to 'without the project' (i.e. what would the difference be if the project were not implemented)?
- what does the project actually fund?
- manpower analysis? This demands a diagnostic approach to the manpower benefits derived from a project

In order to arrive at some answers to these questions economists include the following analyses among their approach:

- cost-effectiveness
- unit cost per trainee in institutional development
- target-benefit analysis

The speaker then described the features of the cycle applied to institutional development with particular reference to the importance of training. The World Bank has produced documentation on institutional development including *The lessons of success*, *Improving institutional development practice* and *The learning process approach*.

The formation of Projects Group within the British Council has been prompted by two major factors.

1. The changing nature of ODA work, which has seen a significant move towards projectization, a change in organizational strategy and a financial dictate to guarantee value for money.

2. The changing nature of the ODA/BC relationship, which has been characterized by reviews including: the review of TETOC; the Connor report on non aid administration activity; the Baker/Hardman review of aid administration activity; and the report to establish Projects Group.

Tony Deyes

ELMD includes an ELT Aid Unit, which looks after ELTOs. Following the Baker/Hardman review a list of services is being drawn up for ELT projects which will describe the Council's responsibility for the delivery of services and the link which ELMD provides between the ELT constituency in the UK and recipient institutions of ELT aid. ELMD will observe the same procedures for managing, reporting and monitoring projects as Projects Group but, because ELTOs are long-term experts rather than the short-term consultants normally managed by Projects Group, extra services are required, namely: recruitment, co-ordination and professional services/support.

While Oead largely looks after the recruitment process, co-ordination and professional services are mainly in the hands of ELMD and involve the following services:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Co-ordination</th>
<th>Overseas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>reporting, recording (ELTO database), TC award allocation, tendering for equipment</td>
<td>distribution of inputs, project integration, meeting with ELTOs and institutions, reporting and monitoring</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Council, and ELMD, is therefore well placed to manage ELT projects because:

- ELT is a central Council activity
- there is an overlap between co-ordination and professional services (the concept of adviser/manager)
- ELTOs are long-term experts who identify with the Council as a sort of home base institution

Taking the critical path (a video presentation)

Barbara Zaslona

The video was on the subject of project planning using 'critical path analysis'. It traced the methodology of this approach back to the development of the Polaris missile system, when the huge number of activities generated by the numerous sub-contractors had to be co-ordinated.

The video used big organizational events (a motor rally, winter Olympics, a factory process) to demonstrate the applicability of the critical path analysis approach. It explained the method as breaking down related activities into networks based on time and duration. Activities are labelled, the networks decided and time and cost fed into a computer for the final programme analysis. Events which take the maximum time to implement and have a critical dependency upon each other are trained together in the 'critical path'. Events subordinate to those key events must be completed by the key event due date at each stage of the chain otherwise the aim of the project will not be achieved.

The video explained how this method saved millions of dollars at the last Olympics compared with the 1984 event, when the less efficient 'departmentalized' planning system was used. It also stressed the prime importance of people and human factors in project planning.

Making the project framework work

Hector Munro

Most agencies use the 'project framework' (or 'logical framework') approach to project management; the World Bank uses its own more rigorous approach.

The division of the framework into four columns was described. The columns are labelled as: project structure; indicators of achievement; ways of assessment; assumptions/risks. The vertical path through the framework was described, showing the logical progression from the bottom row ‘inputs’ to the next row up’s ‘outputs’, which contribute to the ‘immediate objectives’ of the project in the third row up. The
logical path is completed by the contribution of the project to the wider (national) objectives. Trifuguration of terms was given, illustrated by examples showing the difficulties/considerations involved in completing the matrix. Handouts of ODA project frameworks showing completed examples and listing project framework terminology were distributed.

One of the major points of discussion following the presentation was how far project framework ideas and drafts need to be shared with aid recipients. The question of how much of ODA’s plans, views and commitments could be shared was asked and, in particular, sensitive items might be involved in the final column of the project framework, where assumptions and risks are listed. The general feeling of the group was that as much information as possible should be put into the framework and should be shared with the host government where this could be done without offending sensibilities.

The seminar then split into four groups to work on a case-study. The project concerned was the Nigerian Junior Secondary School Project (JSS), at present in the proposal stage. Suggestions for this project had first been put forward at a Nigerian teachers’ workshop, and although different strategies were advocated in these early proposals, the Dunford participants were first of all—following the order suggested the previous day by Myra Harrison—asked to extrapolate from the Nigerian papers what the immediate objectives of the project seemed to be. The groups then came back for feedback and discussion before going away to work in groups and return again on the wider objectives, the outputs and inputs.

The results of these discussions are shown in the project frameworks displayed on the following pages. A round-up discussion at the end of the session included views of the project by Richard Walker (ex-ELO, Nigeria) and by John Burke (College of St Mark and St John, consultant to the JSS project). Among the points made were the following:

- one of the groups set up their framework as a pilot project. This is a useful strategy in a country as large as Nigeria and, where there is a federal system, as in Nigeria, one state or a small number of states can provide a microcosm of the project before it is implemented on a national scale
- some of the case-studies see the output as teacher trainers; others see the output as teacher trainers and trained teachers. One leads into the other and it is important to distinguish what the major focus of the project is to be. Where a national centre is to be established, as in one of the case-study proposals, this would suggest institutional development with the staff of the centre (i.e. teacher trainers) being the major focus for the project
- where a project develops in phases, objectives and indicators of achievement should be developed for each phase, so that, should there be slippage in time or local commitment during the latter phases, it is still possible to point to achievements and improvements already made as a result of the project
- one group, mindful of project sustainability, asked how the quality of teachers was to be judged in order that training could be considered successful. Was a cadre of inspectors also available to be trained?
- in a country like Nigeria where English is the medium of instruction, the trainer training and teacher training proposed should also be available to teachers and trainers in the fields of mathematics, science and other curriculum areas
- the input and output rows of the framework can be considered as the area of manageable interest; in other words it is these components which the project manager directly controls, and which, if successfully managed, will lead to achievement of the immediate objectives
- the inclusion of recruitment of ELTOs in the assumptions/risks column was questioned, since this is directly under the control of the donor agent. It is generally considered, however, that risks can be both on the part of the donor agent as well as of the recipient government; for example, it may be difficult to find ELTOs with appropriate training for some projects

Appendix B shows the different sorts of inputs, outputs and objectives that are likely to be encountered in different categories of project types.

Illustrated report on an ELT aid project; the University of Alexandria ESP Project, Egypt

Tony Lilley

In this session the speaker described and illustrated with slides and video the work he and his team have been doing over recent years in establishing an English for Specific Purposes Centre at Alexandria University.

The importance of maintaining an on-going project was stressed, and two models of sustainability were advanced:

- The elementary model - relevance of project rationalization of existing structures reward of those involved
- The advanced model - status united front system training awareness innovation negotiation

The need for English in Egyptian universities for research and other purposes was outlined, contrasting with the perceived decline of ability in English over the last ten years. The problems identified were; large numbers of students, shortage of suitably qualified instructors, lack of appropriate materials and lack of co-ordination.
The aim of the ESP project is to help Alexandria University and other selected universities and institutions in Egypt to raise the level of English language proficiency in those faculties that need English for professional and academic purposes and research. Junior academic staff, at postgraduate and undergraduate level, are targeted, particularly in the fields of science, technology, agriculture, commerce, tourism and health. A centre has been established in Alexandria University providing advisory, planning, training and ESP teaching facilities. The centre is self-sufficient in that it can charge faculties and students for compulsory courses. These funds can then be channelled into equipment and bonuses for staff. These incentives, together with training awards, ensure that the centre has no difficulty in attracting and keeping suitable staff. The project provides not only direct teaching but also consultancy services, workshops and seminars at Alexandria and elsewhere, encouraging research and dissemination of special English language programmes. The reaching out to Mansoura University was highlighted in the talk.

The project includes many of the features described by Paul Woods in the article distributed for pre-seminar reading and reproduced at Appendix A. The Alexandria University ESP project is likely to be sustainable for the following reasons:

- local colleagues at all levels are involved at all stages using seminars and newsletters
- appropriate materials have been, and can continue to be, produced
- adequate financial incentives for staff are provided
- internal resources for maintenance are secure
- support is provided for replication and development
- all interested parties, e.g. Fulbright, VSO, are involved
- a group of counterparts has been created and control gradually relinquished
- job descriptions have been worked out
- examinations are appropriate
- 'expensive' personnel, who have provided continuity over the last twelve years, are gradually being replaced, some by volunteers
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Wider objectives</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To improve the English ability of students from Nigerian secondary schools</td>
<td>Post JSS performance</td>
<td>Grade &amp; exam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>WASC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Feedback - tertiary institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Feedback - employers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Immediate objectives</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>An adequate level of professional competence in the cadre of English teachers in junior secondary schools</td>
<td>In-life of project opportunity for AIS teachers</td>
<td>Increasing number annually being trained</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A sustainable INSET for teachers of English in JSS</td>
<td>Staff, premises, budget in place and plans for future decided</td>
<td>Post-course evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Inspectors' reports (including classroom observations)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Centre reports and monitoring reports</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outputs</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Establishment of a national INSET centre</td>
<td>Centre programmes, including job descriptions, travel schedules, organogram courses run (increasing annually)</td>
<td>Centre remains an autonomous body</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establishment of a cadre of competent INSET teacher trainers</td>
<td></td>
<td>Funds and personnel released on time (for training teachers)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inputs</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Training - UK and in-country</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>Host</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personnel, equipment and materials</td>
<td>2 ELTOs 6 TCTPs 2 Land Rovers Equipment and materials</td>
<td>2 counterparts Administrative staff Secretarial staff Accommodation - office - staff Consumables</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Counterparts bonded after training</td>
<td>Adequate GoN budget provided</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Equipment, accommodation, etc delivered on time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicators of achievement</td>
<td>How assessed</td>
<td>Assumptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Wider objectives</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To contribute to national development</td>
<td>Feedback from ministries/Planning Commission</td>
<td>Relevant reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To improve standards of English attainment worldwide</td>
<td>WASC exam results</td>
<td>Annual published results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To improve teacher training nationally, learning from the experience of the pilot project</td>
<td>Demand for a national project</td>
<td>Official requests for extending support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To improve standards of English attainment in schools affected by the pilot projects</td>
<td>Monitoring WASC exam results</td>
<td>Annual published results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Immediate objectives</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A cadre of teacher trainers operating efficiently and effectively in the three state teacher training colleges</td>
<td>Evaluation reports, Drop out rate, Meeting performance targets, Learner feedback, Professional assessment</td>
<td>TCO and relevant Nigerian professional reports, learners’ diaries, Three-monthly statistics, Performance checklist (including action plan/logistics), Questionnaires, feedback sessions, summaries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outputs</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Twenty-five trained teacher trainers in post after one year from start date</td>
<td>Monitoring missions</td>
<td>Appropriate teacher trainees selected and released for project duration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One teacher-training package (syllabus materials, techniques, evaluation)</td>
<td>Project statistics</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establishment of effective and agreed support system on the three institutions</td>
<td>Package developed and in use</td>
<td>Replication facilities made available</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Reports from institutions (qualitative and quantitative)</td>
<td>Involvement of institutions from beginning of project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indicators of achievement</td>
<td>How assessed</td>
<td>Assumptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Inputs</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODA: two UK trainers for one year, training materials (books, videos, etc), evaluation visit, transport</td>
<td>Internal reports</td>
<td>Equipment/resources in place for start of project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local: Nigerian trainer counterparts, administrative support staff/system, commitment (local salaries, etc)</td>
<td>Monitoring missions</td>
<td>Appropriate counterpart staff released for project duration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Project statistics</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wider objectives</td>
<td>Indicators of achievement</td>
<td>How assessed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To improve the standard of English amongst university entrants to contribute to Nigeria's development in science and technology</td>
<td>Improved levels at university entrance</td>
<td>University entrance exam results in English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Improved levels of subject attainment through better English during university course</td>
<td>Exam results and survey of subject specialist departments</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Immediate objectives</th>
<th>Indicators of achievement</th>
<th>How assessed</th>
<th>Assumptions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To improve in-service training of English teachers at junior secondary school level</td>
<td>Numbers of courses run and numbers of teachers attending</td>
<td>Statistics from inspectorate, etc</td>
<td>Trainers stay in jobs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Competent training</td>
<td>Observation and report, evaluation by trainees</td>
<td>Trainers initiate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Competent teaching</td>
<td>Observation by trainers, inspectors, etc</td>
<td>Resources provided and continued</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Improved levels of English at end of junior secondary school</td>
<td>Exam results at junior secondary school</td>
<td>Incentives provided</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Trainees can attend</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outputs</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A cadre of trained teacher trainers</td>
<td>Project reports including end-of-course assessment</td>
<td>Trainees turn up</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Resources provided</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Existence of local administrative structures</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inputs</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Consultancy, workshops, materials, personnel, training</td>
<td>Project reports</td>
<td>Various parties agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Recruitment of ELTOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Trainers stay in jobs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Resources provided and continued</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Incentives provided</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Trainees can attend</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wider objectives</td>
<td>How assessed</td>
<td>Assumptions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To raise the standard of English in secondary schools</td>
<td>National exam results in schools affected</td>
<td>WAEC results</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Immediate objectives</th>
<th>How assessed</th>
<th>Assumptions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To produce more effective English teacher training at secondary level</td>
<td>Evaluations by: inspectors, deans of admission, heads of departments, headmasters, pupils, tutors/trainees</td>
<td>Seminar reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To produce more effective English teaching at secondary level</td>
<td>Ministry of Education official reports</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outputs</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher trainers</td>
<td>Project reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Days' training</td>
<td>Ministry of Education reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluation Unit reports</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inputs</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of trainers</td>
<td>Project reports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Days' training at £ cost (including residential/travel costs for producing more effective teacher training and English teaching at secondary level)</td>
<td>ELT profile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Three views on sustainability

In this session an aid-agency (ODA) point of view of sustainability was presented, alongside views from the private ELT sector and from a construction firm involved in 'hard' projects in developing countries.

Dr Carew Treffgarne

The speaker prefaced her contribution, entitled *Is there life after the project?*, by stating that the views she was about to express were her own and did not necessarily reflect those of ODA. She added that sustainability was a relatively new, but important, concept. In respect of this concept, the speaker saw four issues. These issues were:

- the nature of the afterlife
- the concept of counterparting
- the ownership of the project
- the relationship between the project partners (ODA and host government)

She also drew participants’ attention to the elements that constitute the World Bank’s view of sustainability. In the World Bank context, sustainability is particularly achieved through institutional development, human resource development and conditionality. The speaker then proceeded to examine the similarities between her views and those of the World Bank, and these are set out below.

**Institutional development**

Curriculum, staff and departmental development is a necessary constituent in the nature of sustainability.

**Human resource/counterpart development**

This presents problems that have to be solved in a realistic and non-patronizing way. It is unrealistic and patronizing to assume that the TCO (or ELTO) and his or her counterpart share identical assumptions and commitment. Nor is a one-to-one relationship essential. The speaker’s view was that it is the host government’s responsibility to select counterparts and that in-country training should not be underestimated.

**Conditionality**

Equates roughly with project ownership and relations between the project partners. The project needs to be seen as a sharing of inputs. To avoid creating a dependency relationship, the host government must contribute to projects. Equally, the host government must be involved at every stage of the projects from conception through donor withdrawal to final sustainability.

Lewis Kerr (Bell Educational Trust, Overseas Division)

Here, two ELT projects in India and China, in which the Bell Educational Trust has been closely involved, have been described. After indicating the principal aims, objectives and inputs the speaker went on to talk about sustainability as far as these projects are concerned, which he described as ‘the ability to continue to contribute to the wider objective’. This, he suggested, cannot happen without such things being established as institutional strength (financial support, management strength), competent teaching staff and/or the ability to train new staff, continuing needs to be met by the institution, and finally, the ability to respond to changing needs and resources, e.g. updating materials and syllabuses and professional development.

The speaker then described the specific problems and specific advantages of being a contractor rather than an agent of government.

**Problems**

- non-involvement in initial discussion between donor and recipient
- inability to determine project goals
- possible lack of awareness of the gap in perceptions between donor and recipient
- lack of political influence if the project is subverted or changed
- no direct access to host government bodies able to influence the project
- no representation at review discussions
- no involvement in budget discussions

**Advantages**

- close relationships with local counterparts
- minimal lines of authority and command
- the ability to fine tune the project

The speaker finally focused on the risks/assumptions column of a project framework in the context of operating in China.

Rod Capper (Howard Humphreys Partners Ltd)

The speaker depicted the construction industry’s approach to sustainability by setting out a series of problems and examples. Until recently, the construction industry had not been particularly successful in the maintenance and training aspects of projects, and this problem was now being tackled with specific funding in order to close the gap between the design and construction elements and the education and training aspects of a project.

The speaker then developed a list of requirements for sustainability in construction industry projects. The principal factors are:

- standardization in order to avoid too wide a range of equipment which would subsequently require maintenance
• appropriate technology which, the speaker stressed, did not mean low technology

• involvement of people experienced in the post-commissioning operation and in the maintenance of the end product during the design stage

• political awareness; an illustrative example was quoted to support this particular point, namely that of the World Bank arranging a series of seminars for ministers of transport and public works in Africa in order to increase their awareness of the importance of allowing for highway maintenance within national budgets

• motivation of host country staff must be encouraged, if not by increased remuneration, which was often impossible, then by improved career structures

• the funding agencies must look into the whole life of a project in order to ensure sustainability. A further solution can also be provided by twinning arrangements, for instance with UK highway and water authorities; but here the speaker was careful to stress that attention has to be paid to what he called technological difficulties. How far, for instance, would a UK road construction company be able to advise on dirt roads for Tanzania, there being no such roads in Surrey?

• finally, withdrawal must be properly planned and phased, to be followed by an agreed series of monitoring and control visits at set times and for pre-determined periods

The speaker went on to illustrate his points by giving a series of examples. In the first (a roads project in Tanzania) flexibility had been shown by the funding agency in order to meet particular local conditions; the funding agencies must specifically allowed for sustainability through a minimum requirement for foreign funding agency in order to meet particular local conditions; the Tanzania) flexibility had been shown by the funding series. In the first (a roads project in Dar-es-Salaam main drainage rehabilitation Corporation) and appropriate technology had been an important aspect of deep-well installation in Somalia and in the Dar-es-Salaam main drainage rehabilitation scheme.

Finally the speaker showed how sustainability can be achieved through a sequence of carefully co-ordinated factors (see critical path analysis, above). Thus a project starts with the design stage and continues through other stages such as choice of technology, political will, provision for foreign currency and adequate training plus proper motivation of in-country personnel. These should all lead to the vital objectives of project sustainability in the operational stage after withdrawal by the contractor. The importance of donors taking all these factors into consideration from the outset was emphasized in the speaker’s concluding remarks.

Debate on project inputs for sustainability

Up to this point in the seminar training, funding and documentation had all been mentioned as of some importance in sustaining project momentum after donor withdrawal; further project components with sustaining potential are mentioned in the Paul Woods pre-seminar reading article (Appendix A), as well as in a World Bank paper distributed to seminar participants.

At this stage in the seminar, therefore, a debate was held in which six speakers discussed the contribution made to sustainability by a range of possible project inputs. In order to provide a little light-hearted competition at the end of the session, seminar participants were asked, ‘If you had to choose only one of the inputs presented, which one would best provide for the sustainability of the projects you are involved in?’

The summaries below are in the order in which they were presented.

Input: university links

Chris Housden (British Council Higher Education Group)

The speaker described the importance of establishing institutional links in ensuring project sustainability.
Such links, he argued, provide a flexible, inexpensive, non-bureaucratic and lasting means of helping to develop institutional capacity, thereby contributing to project success and sustainability. In support of his argument he quoted from Pat Holden, ODA's Social Development Adviser, who had pointed out the relevance of university links to ODA's Human Resource Development Policy, which "seeks to strengthen institutions and individuals in order to achieve self-reliance and sustainability". He also drew heavily on the World Bank's experience in measuring sustainability, and attempted to show how institutional links, particularly in universities, fulfilled the criteria identified by the Bank as being necessary for sustainability.

Input: post-project consultancy

John Burke (College of St Mark and St John)

Six features of project sustainability were suggested: continuing local support, a permanent or formal status for the project, incentives, flexibility, links to the original funded project and the absence of design faults. A number of roles and responsibilities were then suggested for the post-project consultant.

1. Maintenance: the consultant is a sounding-board, a source of updating and a source of momentum
2. Propagation: the consultant supports and suggests
3. Identification: the consultant can identify problem areas, training needs, etc
4. Direct participation: the consultant can be an adviser at workshops, an external examiner, etc
5. External representation: the consultant can be a link with other projects and institutions

In order to fulfil these roles successfully and effectively, however, the consultant must also meet certain conditions. He or she must have:

- a precise, carefully thought out specification of his/her role
- the right framework of values and cultural knowledge of the project and the environment in which he/she is to work
- strong links with an appropriate UK institution able to provide the necessary back-up
- local agreement that a consultancy is appropriate and that certain costs will be met
- local agreement on the precise nature of his/her role
- collaboration from all parties concerned

Consultancy time is expensive. Ways of accommodating or reducing the cost might include the following:

- an 'after-sales service' approach where consultancy costs are agreed as part of project funding
- an 'exchange value' agreement whereby consultancy services from the UK institution are offered in exchange, for example, for project-related students coming to the UK institution
- the 'piggy-back model' where the consultancy task is linked to another formal role, such as external examiner
- UK institutions recognizing the benefits of 'recent and relevant experience' among higher education staff and spreading the financial pressure of financing consultancies in various ways among the institutions concerned

Input: training of host country personnel

Jim Morrison (Moray House College)

A crucial element in the success of a project is consensus. This is achieved through the commitment of the stakeholders, which in turn can be obtained through incentives. A powerful incentive is UK training.

The arguments for UK training include the following:

- incentive
- process - for training experience as well as for training content
- perceptions - contact with others facing similar problems
- pressures - freedom from 'local' pressures of the job
- project continuity - the trainee will return home. It is also important, however, that in-country training be sustained and developed

This training would involve advanced professional study for key personnel, short (e.g. three-month) courses and training in project management - e.g. resource management, project evaluation and distance learning.

On the question of funding, the speaker listed a number of possible agencies. In addition to British Council scholarships and ODA PC awards he mentioned UNICEF, UNESCO, ILO and Rotary International, all of whom can be contacted through their regional or country officers, as well, of course, as the host country's ministry or institute. A further list for funding training can be found at Appendix C to this report. In-country training can take place through British Council Spectours, local ministry or institute initiatives, as well as voluntary organizations such as VSO and SIDA or charities such as the Harold Macmillan Trust, and BP General Educational Trust.

Input: educational technology

Brian Hill (Brighton Polytechnic)

The speaker proposed that educational technology could be an important tool for developing countries, but that it might be some years before it could represent an acceptable return on an investment. However, rapid advances in technology were occurring in business and
commerce and education was in danger of not taking full advantage of these developments.

The following technology is available, each with its own advantages:

- audio cassettes: simple, easily duplicated, wide range of material
- radio: easy dissemination of material, possible feedback
- video: motivating, strong impact, materials and technology available
- television: as video but with feedback, satellite links available within five years
- computers: networks and international links available, limited uptake
- interactive video: the ultimate autonomous learning device although still technically problematic

The speaker listed the following aspects as keys to sustainability through education technology:

- institutional support; adoption of technology through adaptation
- the development of autonomous learning
- links with 'outside constituencies'
- the importance of evaluation
- the importance of understanding the cultural and social environment
- the need for early planning
- the need for flexibility in the system to meet local constraints
- the importance of training in the transition period

Education technology is here to stay, according to the speaker, but it is not a panacea and needs gradual introduction. In ten years time education technology will be making a real contribution to autonomous learning.

**Input: professional advice and support**

John Keleher (British Council, ELMD)

Since 'advice' may be conceived as somebody telling somebody else something, the speaker preferred to use the term 'dialogue'. 'Professional' was taken to mean anything to do with the project's main objectives.

A relationship exists between project efficiency, 'which includes sustainability', and inputs. Towards the end of the implementation period, the donor inputs are phased out and, at this point, host inputs should be increased. Sustainability problems are most likely to arise when the donor inputs stop altogether; during implementation, therefore, continuing dialogue on the hosts' inputs is needed. The speaker described the communication links involved in a typical ELT project, starting with the host to the project, moving thence to the local British Council Representative and finally on to British Council HQ. In HQ, a large number of departments are available for advice, but, to ensure professional relevance and focus, the ELLD adviser is well placed to provide the key link to the project as well as to ODA advisers and other constituency institutions. Although this network is heavily used during implementation there is a danger that it can fall into disuse during the period of post-project sustainability, partly because the link between the project and the British Council Representative is weakened. It is therefore important, during the implementation stage, that the dialogue takes place and that the ELTOs' counterparts understand the cooperation arrangements between the British Council and the host institution, so that the counterparts themselves may have continued access to advice/dialogue when the ELTOs have left.

By judicious use of ELMD adviser's time and mixed money, advice on projects previously funded by ODA can be sustained beyond the project's formal lifetime.

**Input: books**

Jeff Samuelson (British Council Libraries Department)

As an introduction, it was pointed out that 'books' was too narrow a term and that journals should certainly be included. The contribution which both could make to sustaining a project was the access to subject knowledge which they provided. But the books presentation programme need not stop at the provision of the printed word alone; it was suggested that the initial establishment or enhancement of a project-based library could also be through the mechanism of BPP. If the library were to be sustained after the project-funding period had ended, it was essential for the ELTO, with the active participation of professional colleagues, to be involved in four interrelated areas:

- seeking the support of policy makers
- attempting to secure recurrent funding
- attempting to ensure that the collection is properly managed
- ensuring access to current bibliographical information

If these matters were resolved during the project, it was suggested that books and journals themselves could help to sustain it thereafter.

After due consideration of the importance of inputs to project sustainability, as well as to the quality of presentation by the speakers, participants elected the training of host country personnel as the key factor in the sustainability of projects.

**Cross-cultural constraints on sustainability; a view from South India**

Robert Bellarmine (English Studies Officer, British Council, Madras)

The speaker made some broad statements about culture in the aid context, before passing on to some personal experiences and in particular to the situation in India.
In order to achieve sustainability of influence, it is necessary for the two parties in a project to have a broad understanding of each other's culture, but this should not be too broad; it is more desirable merely to assimilate certain features. The elements that can particularly change from one culture to another are the sources of motivation; the donor's cultural values may be imposed on, or challenged by, the recipient. Cultural issues need to be faced in the aid context in order to avoid the deception that aid is culturally neutral.

There are three cultural peculiarities in the Indian context.

1 A looser coupling between occupation and identity; teachers form social groups based not on their profession but on other factors, e.g. ethnicity. There is thus weak loyalty to the work institution and weak occupational motivation. This is seen in the South India project where, between the annual eight-week consultancy visits, there is almost no follow-up activity by the recipient teachers. Only two of the eight teacher-development groups are functioning on an occupational basis.

2 Perspectives on time differ between the UK specialists, who are consultants to the project, and the local participants. The Indian view is to see time as an 'inexorable cosmic frame of reference', whereas the western view is to see time as a resource.

3 A cultural communication problem is the Indian tendency to say 'yes' out of politeness; there is thus another India-western tension between the politeness-driven 'yes' and the fact-driven 'no'. Indians have a different concept of contradiction, exacerbated by social roles in the hierarchical structure, which dictates this reference.

What are the solutions in the aid context with sustainability in mind?

As regards loose-coupling, all teachers must be involved in the project from the outset, and need, probably, to be given some sort of career counselling regarding the project's relevance to them.

Both sides need to understand the time problem, especially as regards staff-development programmes; this can be helped by counterparts keeping a project diary.

English for what?

Dr Digby Swift (Education Adviser, ODA)

The speaker's concern was to emphasize that the valuable aspect of an ELT project to be sustained was not its contribution to English for its own sake, but to English for a clear developmental purpose. If well designed, English projects could be as valuable developmentally as any other projects. Indeed, competence in English language is often needed to make, e.g. health sector or agriculture sector projects, sustainable. This sustainability arises from the enabling power of English whether as the medium of instruction or as the language through which people have access to science and technological information and ideas. The importance of ESP is to help students to learn and to communicate more effectively in these areas.

The speaker then indicated that there exists a range of options to support ELT initiatives and that providing ELTOs was not the only answer. As an example, UK publishing expertise should be tapped where appropriate. In terms of sustainability, it is important to recognize that a project is a local government initiative which ODA is supporting. Projects need to be well thought out and contain clearly stated objectives about the reason for supporting English in relation to its wider developmental impact. The project framework and memorandum are good tools for these purposes. Monitoring of progress towards the objectives is an important aspect of any project and allows factors that are supporting or detracting from its sustainability to be identified.

In discussion the speaker indicated that, in general, there should be immediate objectives to be achieved within the project lifetime; wider objectives could often only be achieved after the project was completed, although there would often be a follow-up project to take the initial project further. As to the question of supporting ELT in EFL situations, the speaker indicated that this would normally need to be justified in terms of vital manpower needs in commerce, science and technology. As to ODA's support for primary education, the speaker acknowledged its poverty-focus potential, but noted that ODA could sometimes relieve poverty more effectively through secondary and tertiary level projects. When asked about the political nature of aid to ELT, the speaker stated that the primary concern with ELT was as a developmental tool but that obviously political considerations were taken into account.

Management issues in sustainability

Bob Steedman (British Council Representative, Oman)

This was an extra discussion section organized in response to questions raised earlier.

The presenter asked four questions related to the theme of sustainability.

1 At what level does a project 'bolt on' to the host institution? If the contact is at too low a level this could be a problem because it could lead to insufficient attention to the project during the implementation phase and people involved on the host government side could lack influence to ensure continuity of the project after ODA funding ceased.

2 Managing and reporting structures: who does Head of Project report to in the host government and in ODA? Again, there is the need to report a right level or sustainability could be affected.

3 Public relations: the project must be known to decision-makers in the host government, in the UK mission and in international aid agencies.

4 Local administration procedures and regulations: it must be ascertained whether counterparts are in
established posts or merely seconded to the project and thus likely to be called back immediately after the project ends. Attention also needs to be given to any government regulations that may affect release of personnel for training.

Discussion on the four topics was as follows:

- one solution to question 1 above is to involve the Ministry closely in planning the project, with lines of communication detailed in the project document. Where levels of access are unclear, it is profitable for both parties to attempt to decide together at what level the projects should 'bolt on'; counterparts, of course, may find it difficult to maintain contacts at the levels of government to which ELTOs may have access.

- question 2 above raises the further question; 'whose project is it anyway'? Monitoring is also needed from the host government to show that they have a management and organizational interest (as happens for example in Kenya). The point was strongly made that a report needed to go to host governments after a British Council/ODA inspection or monitoring visit.
Part III: Case-studies

Sri Lanka - Higher Institute of English Education

Case-study leader: James Drury

Background

The Sri Lankan Higher Institute of English Education is a legally constituted institute of the National Institute of Education (NIE), and confers, through NIE, degrees, diplomas and certificates in the teaching of English; it is hoped that shortly it will also be able to offer a B.Ed. It has eight academic staff plus two ELTOs, and is supported by a library staff of two and an administrative staff of three. It is concerned not only with the training of teachers, but also with the training of trainers for other NIE institutes, and it is this institutional development that the ODA project is particularly concerned with at present.

The task

To identify positive elements in the present project which contribute to its sustainability, and to identify factors that militate against, or threaten, sustainability.

To determine strategies that will exploit the strengths and offer potential solutions to factors that threaten the sustainability of the project.

In light of these strategies, to complete a revised project framework for the current project (until 1992).

To draft a project framework for a phase 3 project. It needs to be established that the ODA three-year financial management cycle is not likely to be sufficient for successful institutional development of an educational project, where the training-cycle frequently exceeds that time-scale. What it should do is provide an opportunity to review the scale of inputs and determine how to manage phased disengagement (i.e. possibly, increase) of external aid commitments. It is also clear that in all project planning a 'maintenance phase' should be included after major withdrawal, with expatriate staff input (either resident or visiting).

Discussion

Discussion led to a SWOT analysis of the project. Potential weaknesses and threats relating to sustainability were then proposed (see action plans below).

SWOT analysis: HIEE project, Sri Lanka

Strengths

1 Staff quality: involvement and commitment to HIEE, especially Director

2 Strong student motivation

Opportunities

1 Provision of management/counselling training, formal and through inputs from Director and experienced head teachers

2 Introduction of graduate programmes (two-year B.Ed. ELT, one-year MA ELT)

3 Involvement in project from outset by both BC and host government

4 Strong infrastructure: good resources

5 Good plant and buildings

6 Salary structure established which gives better remuneration than in TTCs

7 Potential staff recruits already under training on suitable MA courses in the UK

Weaknesses

1 Dependence on Director

2 All management/administration decisions taken jointly by Director and ELTO Chief Advisers may indicate some consultant dependency

3 Problems over staff and student accommodation; cost of living in Colombo; staff loyalty

4 Staff nearly all trained before inception of project on MA courses of variable relevance; happier with theory than with practice, especially teaching practice

Threats

1 Political instability may lead to difficulty in maintaining geographical and ethnic spread

2 Physical plant may be envied by other, more powerful, institutions

3 Institutional jealousy because of HIEE success, universities may offer courses in the same area which could confer higher status

4 HIEE does not have power of appointment for staff appointed by NIE, so far supportive because of sympathy to project by Assistant Director-General, National Institute of Education
7 Dependence on external bid for equipment and maintenance

Action plans

Below are listed strategies and responsibilities for mitigating the weaknesses and forestalling the threats as agreed by the group (numbers in brackets refer to the weaknesses (W) and threats (T) in the SWOT analysis).

1 Management capacity

a Short course training in management administration for chief project officers to strengthen confidence amongst senior staff (W1)

b Activation of Deputy-Director’s responsibility during absence on training of Director (W1)

c Provide on-the-job management training through responsibility for course co-ordination with ELTO counterpart support

d Expatriate presence, on a reduced scale, should be maintained in a phase 3 project (W2)

2 Professional capacity

a Increase staff awareness as practical classroom operators through suitable training (W5)

b Develop means of reorienting staff to perceive themselves as practical experts through maintaining ‘recent and relevant’ classroom experience (W5)

c Chief ELTO adviser to recommend to Assistant Director-General that the Director of HIEE be an ex-officio member of the HIEE Appointments Board (W4)

d Work towards early filling of the three established, but at present, vacant APO posts (W6)

3 Institutional preservation

a The NIE should be persuaded to introduce accommodation, or an accommodation allowance, for HIEE staff and students (W3)

b Tie the provision of future aid-funded equipment to the establishment in HIEE of a technician-level resources post (W7)

c Provide appropriate training for the post (W7)

d In negotiating phase 3, introduce a requirement for host country provision of a maintenance and renewals budget (W7)

e Fill vacant established posts, run more courses, maximize visible utilization (T2)

f Encourage and develop institutional loyalty among alumni, e.g. through enlisting support of former students in outreach activities, encouraging them to

Responsibility

ODA

Local

ODA

Local

Local

ODA

Local

Local

Local

ODA

Local

Local
return to HIEE to follow degree courses and through newsletter (T2)

g Sustain credibility of HIEE programme through quality, and media exposure, e.g. HIEE promotional video on national TV (T3)

h Maximize utilization of staff and facilities on core programmes (T4)

i Make it plain that external inputs, e.g. book presentations, cannot be diverted from project-related objectives (T4)

j Work towards early filling of the three established, but currently vacant, DPO pools (W6)

4 Phase 3

Not only will the present project be sustained, but its area of activity and its influence be increased, if, well before the conclusion of the present project, agreement can be reached on a successor project (see attached project outline) at degree level but with reduced ODA input.

Remarks

Lessons for sustainability which have been learnt from successes in project to date.

1 Involvement of host government in the project from the outset is important, especially if it enables strategies for reducing consultant dependence over time to be devised

2 Assimilation of ELTOs into the project team is essential at the earliest opportunity

3 A staggered withdrawal of ELTOs should be planned with a view to trained local staff taking responsibility progressively to reduce dependence

4 A staggered introduction of ELTOs should be considered to fit the needs of the project and to reduce overdependence at the beginning

5 Continued financial support is required from all parties after the withdrawal of ELTOs

6 The three-year project planning cycle should be regarded as a financial planning tool, but the project should effectively be planned and documented for its entire life, even if such a time-scale is in excess of three years

7 The project will tend to succeed if it clearly fills a need, has relevant and motivated staff and selects the best students. This will enhance the multiplier effect. Physical location and political will are also important factors

8 Counterparts must have clearly designated job responsibilities, for which appropriate training should be given

HIEE phase 3 (draft project framework)

Wider objectives

1 To improve and sustain the position of English as a link language in line with Sri Lankan government policy

2 To improve the standard of ELT and learning in Sri Lanka

Immediate objectives

1 To produce HIEE trained graduate language teacher educators

2 To produce an increased number of better trained language teachers, with the capacity to operate as INSET teachers

3 To obtain HIEE senior staff with management competence

4 Research skills, reports, publications and conference presentations

Outputs

1 ELT programmes at first degree and higher levels

2 Sustained general professional training on Dip. TESL and other ELT courses, both within HIEE and by increased outreach activity

3 The enhanced and sustained professional and managerial development of HIEE staff

4 Research in ELT and related management fields

Inputs

Local: provision of suitable staff, provision of an operating and maintenance budget, plant, utilities, furnishing and spares

ODA: ELTOs, consultancies, training, books, equipment

Kenya - Secondary English Project

Case-study leader: Richard Arden

Background

While the first phase of the project has concentrated on training tutors for INSET, the next phase will focus on developing a sustainable in-service system based at district level. The success of this system will depend on the setting-up of a teachers' advisory centre, a
cadre of trainers, and co-ordination of interest groups (heads, inspectors, teachers, education administrators).

In addition, this district focus must link up with a national and provincial structure to ensure commitment at all levels, and a proper system of monitoring and updating.

**The task**

The group examined various ways of ensuring sustainability, and focussed on institutional development and consensus - building and functioning in relation to the district teachers' advisory centres (TACs).

**Discussion**

The following problems/questions were considered:

- where should the system be focussed?
- who contributes to it?
- what activities do they carry out?
- what are the criteria for siting TACs?
- who runs them?
- what skills should those who run them have?
- how are the TACs funded?
- how can the system be monitored and updated?
- how can commitment of all parties be maintained at district level?
- how can this commitment be incorporated into the official system?

**Solutions**

In answer to the first two questions, it was felt that the most effective way of developing a sustainable system would be as that set out below.

The teachers' advisory centres would act as a catalyst for teachers' views and needs. They would be administered through a district education committee, consisting of the TAC tutor, teachers, chairman of the district heads' association, the District Inspector (secondary), and the DEO. Other interested parties such as parents, businessmen, etc. could be co-opted when required. The running of the centres and planning of in-service courses would be monitored through reports by District Education Officers to the Provincial Inspector in the Provincial Education Office. The latter could also pay visits to centres to check their administration.

In relation to the third, fourth and fifth questions above were the following guideline answers:

**role of TACs**

- provision of professional information
- dissemination of official information
- support through professional books and class library sets
- support through other printed material/visual aids, etc
- base for meetings and INSET
- social centre for teachers

**criteria for siting of TACs**

- local demand and evidence of initiative
- number of teachers/schools nearby
- accessibility
- building availability (new construction would be avoided)
- other resources (e.g. primary support programme already initiated through ODA)
- official/inspectorate support
- visibility (i.e. impact on other districts, who could follow the model)
- ethnic/geographical issues
- cost/design issues

On the question of who should run the centres and the skills they should have, it was felt that a number of key tutors should be selected from those already trained as INSET trainers by the project and given further training in organization, administration, negotiation, training and information organization. Initial funding would come from BPP through the Secondary English Project. For future funding it was suggested that continued support could come from BPP, coupled with match-funding by ODA/Kenya, a recurrent vote for each District Education Office and fund-raising activities by the TAC tutors.

In addition to monitoring by the Provincial Inspectorate, there was a need for updating and retraining at national level. This would be carried out by national trainers and would be organized through the National Secondary English Panel which incorporates both Inspectorate and Kenya Institute of Education (KIE) personnel. Since KIE is a curriculum development and materials production centre, they would also play a strong role in equipping and assisting the TACs (see Appendix to this section).

Finally, the group felt that, despite the need for a formal institutional structure, the actual target group - the teachers - would be the most vital element in success of the TACs. Therefore there was a need to tap the project into existing initiatives such as teachers of English associations, teachers unions and subject panels and encourage them in all districts. This could also be done through the District Education Committees (DECs). In addition, an annual ELT newsletter,
published by KIE would be a useful supplement to the activities of the TACs.

**Action plans**

The group focussed on the immediate procedure to be adopted by the project in developing the above requirements and came up with this implementation plan.

1. Needs analysis; survey of existing TACs, questionnaire on teachers' needs, consultancy visit
2. Proposals to Ministry; structure, responsibilities, funding, scale and phasing, setting up DEC
3. Drawing up criteria for siting and equipping
4. Drawing up criteria for selection of TAC tutors
5. Training plan; in-country, UK content, timing, structure
6. Setting up district education TAC committees (through provincial inspectors)
7. Setting up teachers' associations at district level
8. Setting up and monitoring eight teachers' advisory centres (phase 1)

**Remarks**

It should be noted in the above action plan that training, involvement of local personnel at all levels, building into existing local structures and consultancies are included as factors for sustainability.

The group recognized that some attempts to set up teachers' resource centres in the past have met with failure. However, in Kenya there are already existing primary TAC centres, and the wish of the Ministry is that the better ones be selected for combining with the initial secondary centres proposed in the project. Therefore it was felt that, with careful planning and realistic aims, a viable system could succeed. It should also be noted that, while the group concentrated on this aspect of the Secondary English Project for the exercise, there are other features (such as the development of an INSET handbook and a national training institutional structure) which are intended to contribute to future local development after the project life itself.
Appendix
Institutional structure

KEY

TAC - Teachers' Advisory Centre
DEC - District Education Committee
DIS - District Inspector of Schools
PIS - Provincial Inspector of Schools
DEO - District Education Officer
PEO - Provincial Education Officer
NSC - National Steering Committee
SEP - Secondary English Panel
KIE - Kenya Institute of Education
East Malaysia - Rural primary teacher training

Case-study leader; George Taylor

Background

The Rural Primary English Project has, as its main aim, the training of English language primary teachers through:

- forty-five hour INSET course (the basic course)
- training of language instructors, i.e. teacher trainers (LIs)
- development of materials for the INSET course
- development of materials for courses run by LIs
- development of sustainable procedures and practices

It is being funded over the period 1986-91 by ODA (£760,000) and locally (£150,000).

To date the following activities have been developed on a divisional basis for six divisions (i.e. geographical regions):

- basic courses run
- LIs identified
- materials for basic course and LI courses produced

Problems arose however when implementing the original design. Transfer of training from one geographical region to another on a rolling basis was a flawed concept.

The task

The group set itself the task of producing a matrix to underline the problems at different levels of the project which affect sustainability. Solutions and action plans were then proposed as shown in the following tables.
### Sustainability problems

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Staff development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>State LI may not be as active/effective as ELTO, Project Leader</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Divisional LIs post not formally established and not formally linked to Divisional Education Officer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Solutions</th>
<th>Action/Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provide UK training as requirement of post</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A deputy in UBI/BLK should be appointed and have UK training (with bonding) after a year in post</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State LI to meet with Committee of Divisional LIs thrice yearly at UBI/BLK to discuss Divisional LI plans and problems</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regular meetings between State LI and Divisional Education Officers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly reports from State LI to UBI (collected for annual consultant)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Negotiate appointment of Divisional LIs to the supervisor posts in Divisional Education Office as these become vacant</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attach training to Divisional LI supervisor posts in Divisional Education Office</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual consultancy visits/semiinar to help cement links between Divisional Education Officers and Head of BLK re project</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher training</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher-training colleges, lack of links with these four pre-service colleges and cessation of the forty-five hour basic in-service course</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning; need to develop planning in UK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Class observation techniques; lack of back-up support for teachers and need to identify problems for District/Divisional LIs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Solutions</th>
<th>Action/Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Closer links; incorporation of project teaching methods into TTC curriculum</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Involve TTC staff and students in project in-service workshop</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual consultant to assist with planning an annual training programme for State, Divisional and District LIs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Make training videos for training District and Divisional LIs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Action/Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recurrent TCTP as necessary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Further discussion necessary with Head Languages Section</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Committee to produce agenda for discussion with State LI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELTO to establish during life of project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discuss with Head BLK, Divisional Education Officers and Head Appointments Division</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discuss with Head BLK, Divisional Education Officers and Head Appointments Division and seek funding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agree with Head BLK, Divisional Education and seek funding</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial talks with TTCs and TTC principals in progress; to continue further</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial talks with TTCs and TTC principals in progress; to continue further</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Request ODA funds (HED link?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Write scripts/make video film</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainability problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality control</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanism for measuring progress; an additional and more</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>reliable measure than national exams needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training program; need to ensure quality annual training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training filming; to ensure feedback from independent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>source on quality of training</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

HED - Higher Education Department, British Council  
LI - Language Instructor  
UBI - Unit Bahasa Inggeris (English Language Unit)  
BLK - Bahagian Latihan dan Kurikulum (Division of Training and Curriculum)
Ethiopia - Curriculum renewal

Case-study leader; Oliver Hunt

Background

The components of the present projects are as follows:

- to establish service English courses at universities and colleges
- to improve the service English courses at Addis Ababa University, Asmara University and the teacher training colleges
- to introduce textbook/curriculum renewal plus INSET for the secondary level
- to prepare radio and television programmes for schools

The task

A decision was made to draw up a new project to cover curriculum renewal and INSET. Two possible scenarios presented themselves.

Scenario 1 The ELTO initiates discussion on whether to produce new textbooks for grades 6-12

This proposal is accepted by the Ethiopian Ministry of Education

A consultancy visit is organized to report on the feasibility/mechanics

A new project is drawn up (1990-1995/6)

The curriculum ELTO begins work (September 1989)

A new co-ordinating panel for ELT is established

Scenario 2 The Ethiopian Ministry of Education rejects the idea of producing new textbooks

The curriculum ELTO initiates work on syllabus revision, exam revision, the production of teachers' guides for the existing textbooks and a programme of INSET

Discussion

Discussion focused on whether the Ethiopian project was one project or four. A SWOT analysis of the situation revealed the following strengths:

- the project was nationwide
- co-ordinated approach (primary, secondary, tertiary)
- the existence of many counterparts

and the following weaknesses:

- the scale of the project
- a possible change in language policy
- no curriculum ELTO as yet

Solutions

Elements of these scenarios were then combined, showing that the project, as presently drawn up, could be completed on time with a major part of the objectives fulfilled.

September 1989 The curriculum ELTO begins work in late 1989 on syllabus and exam revision, the production of teachers' guides, and INSET

June 1991 Revisions and teachers' guides complete. 1,000 teachers have received INSET (one-seventh total number of teachers)

1992 A new project is initiated, with the objectives of producing new textbooks, new teachers' guides, continuing and developing INSET

1993 The syllabus and materials for pre-service teacher training are revised in line with the new textbooks

The radio and TV support programmes are revised in the light of the new textbooks

1996 Project completed

A review of the different components of the project and of the time line suggested that work on the curriculum would sustain work on pre-service training and media support.

Action plans

1 To capitalize on the existing systems at the universities and colleges, including highly qualified staff, administrative back-up, etc

2 To employ a trained resource person to run the resource centre at Addis Ababa University (training of this person to be added to the job description of Dr Hicks, ELTO, Addis Ababa University)

3 To organize a national co-ordinating committee for ELT, to be suggested and promoted by Oliver Hunt, co-ordinating ELTO (see below)

4 To arrange one BC consultancy visit per year

5 To implement short UK courses for Ethiopian teachers (at least one per year)

6 To provide for maintenance of equipment

7 To set up the possible new textbook project

Recommended tasks/roles of the co-ordinating committee:

1 To monitor the integration of the various project outputs

2 To monitor the resource centre
3 To monitor the link between the school and higher education sectors (via the national exam and curriculum)

4 To evaluate the curricular and materials innovations, by monitoring all possible sources of feedback, including exam results, subject lecturer feedback, etc

5 To consider curriculum renewal

6 To make recommendations regarding future development

7 To identify and monitor appropriate project-related research areas for MATEFL students

8 To disseminate information to relevant parties

9 To explore the feasibility of an annual national ELT symposium

10 To promote public and official awareness of the project impact

Suggested membership of the ELT committee:

- The Deputy Minister, Higher Education Division, Ministry of Education, or his nominee
- The Dean, Institute of Language Studies, Addis Ababa University, or his nominee (hopefully, the Head of the English Department)
- The Head of the English Department, Kotebe TTC
- The Head of the English Department, Bahr Dahr TTC
- The Head of the Department of Mass Media, MoE
- The Head of the English Panel, Curriculum Department, MoE
- The four ELTOs
- The British Council Representative (to act as Secretary)
- A school's representative
- The VSO Field-Director (when VSOs enter the project)
- A representative from the Ministry of Planning

Analysis of case-study solutions

Dr Roger Bowers (Controller, British Council English Language Literature Division)

The speaker indicated that, in his view, most of the case-study groups had been concerned with project effect rather than sustainability per se. He said that in any discussion on sustainability three principal questions should be considered.

1 What are we trying to sustain - The project? The project benefits? The trained staff?

2 When does a project actually start, and when does it actually end - at the end of the ODA cycle, or at the end of the sustainability period?

3 When do we need to start thinking about sustainability?

There are several levels in any project which have to be considered in any discussion on project sustainability:

- the original endorser of the project
- the management
- the professional scale
- the support staff
- integration

The higher levels are more important but also more volatile. The things to be sustained are:

- a continuing programme
- continuing resources (including staff)
- a change in attitudes

It was pointed out that education is what projects are about, not just training; maintenance of what has happened as a result of the project is not sustaining that project, since sustainability must be further designed to expand a project, renew a project or close a project down. Thus the major concerns in any project's sustainability consideration are creativity and criticality.

A project needs, both before its inception and after its ODA end:

- aims
- objectives
- aftercare
- evaluation measures
- management
- resources
- contracts
- accessibility
- incentives

- and, above all, a driving force.

The session was then offered for open forum and three issues of concern were discussed.

1 Textbook projects: it was generally felt that textbook projects, as long as they were well set up and could be guaranteed for use in schools and colleges, were a good means of achieving sustainability of input. They
involved the training of writers among counterparts, could give rise to a form of in-service training, and achieved a wide effect at a relatively low cost over a long period of time.

Arguments against textbook projects focused on the time/money wasted if books produced were not adopted in the school system, and there was also some feeling that production of supplementary material might be a better means of training local personnel.

2 Planning: there was a widely agreed view among all participants that the financial planning of projects for a three-year period only created difficulties for host governments in a number of ways:

- the host government fears withdrawal of ODA aid and a lack of commitment by Britain and therefore sees no point in trying to sustain what Britain walks away from

- if ODA only plans funding for three years, how does the host government know how to plan contributions it is expected to make in the future?

- in such a short span of time, there is likely to be some difficulty in predicting and solving problems

Whilst it is acknowledged that the project framework can be changed as far as input/output is concerned, the immediate objective has to remain and may be found to be unrealistic once the project has started. In terms of finance an incremental or 'rolling' plan seemed a much more attractive and functional way of planning project expenditure.

3 Have previous projects - now finished - been sustained? If so, how?

While it was acknowledged that such things as buildings, course books, etc. were partial indicators of a substantial project, the most important evidence of sustained input, such as change of attitude, trace memory, education theme/policy change was not quantifiable; perhaps the previous project was only a contributory factor to them in any case. Sustainability must be seen as after life, not after-care.
Part IV: Action plans

Preamble
At a closing session of the Dunford House Seminar some suggestions were put forward as to how ODA and the British Council might better enhance the sustainability of ELT projects. These proposals derive, in general, not from radical departures in project design and implementation, but from the refinement and emphasis of already existing principles, as set out, for example, in ODA’s Guidelines for the preparation of project memoranda or Policy guidance note 40. The proposals are under three headings.

1 Project design
   a Transfer of management skills to host staff should receive more consideration by ODA/BC staff involved in project design. This could be achieved through spending more lead-in time on familiarizing local staff with project management issues and during implementation, encouraging training of a wider cadre of local staff in project management at their respective levels.
   b The project memorandum should clearly state, under paragraph 11, what arrangements are to be made for project sustainability (see Guidelines for the preparation of project memoranda prepared by ODA’s South East Asia Division), and such measures should be built into the project framework and costings.
   c Given that human resource development is a long-term investment, consideration should be given to somehow minimizing the potentially adverse effects on sustainability of the three-year financial planning cycle.
   d When drawing up job-descriptions and recruiting for ELTOs and Education Advisers, ELLD should explicitly refer to required management skills where appropriate.

2 Project inputs
   a Any equipment provided for a project should, as a major consideration, be locally serviceable.
   b The role of the UK higher education sector, not only in the provision of academic professional and project-related training, but also in consultancy links, in-country training and evaluation, is such that consideration needs to be given as to how it might contribute more effectively to the project-planning and implementation process. Controller ELLD has offered to arrange a meeting with interested groups in the higher education sector to consider a fuller definition of respective contributions to project management.
   c Due to the potential value of good written materials as a factor in the sustainability of ELT projects, and the repeated demand for these by host governments and institutions, ODA/BC should devise guidance notes on the involvement of ELTOs, UK publishers and local resources (printing facilities, etc) in materials-writing projects. Policy guidance note 40 offers some advice in this respect and could usefully be expanded or supplemented through Council/ODA channels.

3 Information
   a Reporting structures and the question of readership and ‘ownership’ of project documentation should be set out clearly in project memoranda.
   b ODA should make available relevant parts of their handbook on project management and design, so that the concepts and procedures of ‘projectization’ are understood more fully by all concerned, including in-country authorities.
   c One edition of ELLD’s English studies should focus on project management with particular emphasis on sustainability, drawing on the experience of those in the field.
   d Under ‘projectization’ there is a clear need for the deployment of ELTOs and TCOs with management skills. Consideration should be given by ODA/BC to the most effective forms of training and briefing in this area.
Pulling out of a project: twelve tips for project planners

Paul Woods

This article considers some of the problems inherent in language-teaching projects, particularly in the Third World, which rely heavily on external funding and expatriate personnel. Various strategies are suggested to help ensure that innovative ideas and approaches continue to develop well beyond the withdrawal of external human and financial resources.

The design of ELT projects

Many language teaching 'experts', particularly in the less developed countries, now operate as part of a project team rather than working in the isolated singleton posts which were characteristic of most external aid to ELT in the developing world in the 1960s and early 1970s. A great deal of thought has been given to the design and implementation of projects. The characteristics of a project, including clearly specified aims and objectives and a limited life-span have been delineated (Mountford 1981), and numerous case studies in project design have been documented (see, for instance, ELD/CIS, The British Council, 1980; Brumfit (ed.) 1983). The design and implementation of ELT projects, particularly in teacher education, has been the subject of several in-house seminars for educators and teacher trainers organized by the British Council (for example Coffey (ed.) 1983). There is general agreement on the need for detailed initial planning at the start of the project, formative evaluation allowing for changes of emphasis during implementation, and a final summative evaluation towards the formal conclusion of a project.

Maintenance of projects

However, it seems to me that until recently not a great deal of thought has been given to maintenance after the formal end of a project, once the foreign so-called 'experts' have left and only local resources, human and financial, remain. In a discussion of projects of a slightly different kind, Mike Beaumont has pointed out that the development of windpumps and similar items of intermediate technology entails the following steps: research—design—manufacture—installation—maintenance. I believe that ELT projects often include the first four steps, but make little or no provision for long-term maintenance.

Throughout the Third World one cannot travel far without spotting some rusting relics, the tangible remains of failed agricultural or industrial projects. The projects may have failed for a variety of reasons: inappropriacy, maladministration, overdependence on high-tech equipment, lack of spare parts for machinery, to name but a few. There is a danger that, unless we pay far more attention to the aspect of long-term maintenance, our language-teaching projects will similarly fall into disuse—though with fewer obviously visible reminders left as blots on the landscape.
In this article I pinpoint twelve areas on which project planners and coordinators could focus in order to ensure that their projects have long-term effects extending well beyond the date when external funding is cut off and high-cost aid personnel are withdrawn. I have taken most of my examples from the Sierra Leone Key English Language Teaching (KELT) Project, which I coordinated from 1984 to 1987. This project, set up in 1981 with assistance from the Overseas Development Administration and the British Council, ended in July 1987. The main aim of the project was to improve the quality of English teaching at primary level in Sierra Leone through pre-service teacher education in the country’s five primary teachers’ colleges and in-service teacher education at local level. One of my major concerns was to ensure that the considerable investment of time and money made by the British Council and the Overseas Development Administration (ODA) was safeguarded, and that after July 1987 ELT activity in these areas continued to promote dynamic, progressive change.

**Twelve Tips**

1. **Involve local participants at all stages of the innovation process.**

   Change is often best initiated by local personnel themselves. If a project in syllabus design or materials production is to succeed in the long term, local participants must be involved at all stages in the process, from any initial exploratory ‘consciousness-raising’ exercises, through writing and editing, to evaluation and final revision. In Sierra Leone a new teachers’ college ELT syllabus and twenty units of supporting materials for lecturers and students were produced at a series of five workshops held over a period of two and a half years. This might seem an inordinately long time, but the outcome has been that lecturers view the finished product, however imperfect or apparently dated it might seem to an inside observer, as their own work. They thus have a stake in its success, and are far more likely to want to promote and develop it, with suitable adaptations and additions to suit their individual circumstances, than if a team of writers had produced a professionally more polished and up-to-date piece of work to be imposed from the top down.

2. **Leave behind materials which local personnel can utilize.**

   People come and go, but print lives on. In most developing countries print materials are hard to come by, expensive, and often not entirely relevant to local circumstances. We can gain the maximum mileage from high-cost expertise by ensuring that project personnel create appropriate and relevant print materials which will be left behind when the ‘experts’ leave. In Sierra Leone, a package of 16 topic-based instructor’s notes and supporting materials for in-service workshops has been created. The package was largely the work of VSO and CUSO volunteers attached to the project, along with their Sierra Leonean counterparts. Each unit was edited by a KELT lecturer, and the whole package is currently being revised and re-issued. It is anticipated that this package will provide source materials for local teacher supervisors and others involved in primary level INSET (for example, Peace Corps volunteers) for at least the next ten years.

3. **Provide adequate incentives.**

   In most developing countries, teaching, as in Britain, is a low-status, low-paid profession. We can help to ensure that loyalty and morale are maintained by providing incentives. In Sierra Leone a major incentive has been...
the opportunity for further study overseas. While it is important to realize
that awards for training are allocated on merit and are necessary to the
success of the project—they are not just an incentive—the opportunity
afforded to the best performers ensures that other teachers perform at their
best, in the hope of being themselves selected for further training. ODA has
sponsored several lecturers from each primary teachers' college for diploma
courses, and thirteen teacher supervisors for short, three-month courses in
the UK. In addition, a few lecturers have been sent for MA courses, and
teacher supervisors for one-year diplomas in ELT. Higher qualifications
automatically guarantee a higher salary, so the incentive is financial as well
as purely academic or educational. Other incentives in Sierra Leone have
included the provision of T-shirts with a printed motif for teacher super-
visors, and files for college lecturers. Other possibilities might include the
provision of project pens and pencils, or presentation packs of resource
books for teacher supervisors.

4 Secure internal resources for maintenance.

If project activity is to continue beyond the formal end of external input,
internal/local resources for maintenance must be guaranteed. This is some-
thing which project planners might consider writing into bilateral agree-
ments from the start of a project. Local costs saved by the departure of
foreign experts, for example the costs of salaries or housing for volunteers,
could be diverted to provide spare parts or fuel for transport, or paper and
ink for materials production. It is vital that a Ministry or Institute of
Education which inherits a project should include the project in its forward
financial planning and make adequate budgetary provision for continued
activity.

5 Provide on-going support for replication and further development.

There is an unfortunate tendency for projects to be totally abandoned by
external aid agencies once expatriate or volunteer personnel have been
withdrawn. However, it is essential that provision should be made for
replication and further development, so that a dynamic process of change
continues to be fostered. Within the ODA-funded KELT scheme, provision
exists for UK personnel funded by ODA and the British Council to run a
continuing programme of education seminars. This arrangement worked
well in Tanzania, where prior to and following the withdrawal of ODA-
funded lecturers from primary teachers' colleges, a series of visits by a
colleague from the Leeds Overseas Education Unit led to the production of
a manual on reading for college tutors, with an accompanying students'
text. The manual embodies a highly prescriptive approach with an overt
teacher-training function. There is also a need for the provision of funds to
reprint and revise materials produced during the life of a project (for
example, Foston 1985), or which are produced by local personnel after the
formal end of the project.

6 Involve all interested parties.

Towards the end of a project, it would seem wise to adopt an octopus-like
approach, giving as many different parties and agencies as possible an
interest in its success. In Sierra Leone, the KELT project has fostered close
ties with VSO, CUSO, the Peace Corps, UNDP/UNESCO, and IDA. A
policy of openness and involvement helps to guard against petty jealousies
and territorial disputes which can jeopardize even the best-run schemes. It

Paul Woods
also ensures that, if the primary donor agency is unable or unwilling to put in further funding beyond the agreed formal ending of the project, there are other sources to which to turn. In Sierra Leone on the withdrawal of the majority of VSO volunteers from the project in 1984, ODA donated their motorcycles to the Ministry of Education for use by Sierra Leonean counterparts—but was not able to fund running costs. However, CUSO, which had earlier provided two of the volunteers attached to the project, provided funds for petrol, oil and spare parts from 1984 to 1987, and thus kept the wheels turning.

7 Create a nexus of counterparts.

The philosophy of most aid donors involves a theory of ‘counterparting’, under which the host country or institution provides counterpart staff to be trained, either on-the-job or overseas, and who will eventually assume the responsibilities of the expatriate ‘experts’. However, to place undue reliance on one or two individuals can lead to acute embarrassment if those identified for training and eventual succession are promoted or transferred. It would seem wise, therefore, to create a nexus of counterparts who together can assume the responsibilities of the foreign experts. In Sierra Leone, such an approach has led to the KELT Coordinator working closely with an official of the Ministry of Education at in-service level, and with a different official from the Institute of Education at pre-service level. Other officials, however, have been involved in the running of workshops and seminars at both levels, and are involved in coordinating and advisory committees for the planning and supervision of project activities. In the sixteen districts, teacher supervisors conduct in-service workshops, one per district, and virtually all members of college English Departments are involved with teaching the new syllabus. Thus a substantial network of ‘counterparts’ has been created, without undue reliance on any single individual.

8 Invoke the principle of gradually diminishing control.

Towards the formal end of a project, the ‘experts’ must repress the instinct to take charge and direct operations. Local personnel must be allowed to assume responsibility and take decisions on the future direction and day-to-day running of the project, even if this appears (at least from some points of view) to lead to some fall-off in efficiency or focus. After all, if local staff cannot be entrusted with responsibility while the ‘experts’ are still around, they are even less likely to perform effectively once the last ‘expert’ has stepped onto the plane home. Project-planning sessions can be handed over to a local committee, and local officials can assume responsibility for filing in requests for support or compiling reports on project activities. In his or her last few months at post, a project leader should be able to assume the role of a ‘fly on the wall’, stepping in only if things appear to be going badly wrong.

9 Establish forecasting and reporting procedures and feedback loops.

Teachers often get impatient with apparently unnecessary bureaucracy, but one important aspect of maintenance involves the filing of forecasts of activity, submitting of reports on work done, and supplying feedback to the centre on methods and materials. In Sierra Leone, teacher supervisors complete forecasts at the start of each term, detailing anticipated workshops and follow-up visits to schools. Then at the end of the term, they file a
separate report on the work actually done during the term. Having become accustomed to this procedure, it is to be hoped that they are continuing with such routines beyond the formal end of the project, as the local coordinator is likely to be considerably less mobile than the former expatriate coordinator. College lecturers are encouraged to complete an evaluation questionnaire after each unit they have taught. This enables information to be gathered for any later revision of the materials, and also provides a check on what is actually being taught.

10 Ensure that examinations fit with revised syllabuses and materials.

In the developing world especially, examinations have a tremendous influence over what is taught and on how learning and teaching take place. The most innovative and up-to-date curriculum packages will not succeed unless assessment and examination procedures and formats are correspondingly revised. All too frequently, it is the examinations cart which leads the curriculum horse. It is therefore absolutely vital to the success of any syllabus or materials design project to ensure that examinations are modified to fit the revised curriculum. In Sierra Leone, some progress has been made towards this goal: a national seminar on Assessment was held in February 1986, and a seminar specifically on ELT Assessment was projected for early 1988. The format of the teacher’s certificate examination is gradually being modified to reflect the new syllabus and materials, and it is anticipated that by July 1988 external final examinations will be set wholly on the new syllabus for the first time.

11 Replace high-cost ‘experts’ by low-cost volunteers.

Once highly qualified, widely experienced, and highly paid ‘experts’ are due to leave, local personnel may feel abandoned and powerless in the face of apparently insurmountable problems. One way of dealing with this is to replace the experts with qualified and enthusiastic volunteers for a specifically planned period. In Sierra Leone, the phased withdrawal of experts began in 1985, and a KELT lecturer at one of the teachers’ colleges was replaced by an experienced and competent volunteer who will be withdrawn in July 1988.

12 Expect some loss of momentum but retain an optimistic attitude.

The withdrawal of external financial and human resources can lead to some loss of momentum and a fall-off in the level of project activity. This is only to be expected. Frequently during the closing stages of a project, the planner or adviser is sure to wonder if he or she has been building a house of cards. Donors may be reluctant to continue to support the project financially because they fear that there might not be the same degree of checks and balances within the system.

Advisers may feel that it is useless to try yet again to extract the promise of financial support from a hard-pressed Ministry because they have tried many times before and failed each time. Counterparts may be apprehensive about losing the back-up and support provided by the external donor to the experts, once these have left. However, a positive, optimistic attitude will often produce the required result. This is perhaps the equivalent of the ‘Hawthorne effect’. If you believe a project can succeed without you, it will, and vice versa.

Received March 1987

Paul Woods
Notes
1 This observation was made during a talk curiously entitled ‘Windpumps, materials design and John Harris’s recipe for spaghetti carbonara’ given at the 1986 Dunford House seminar for ELT specialists employed or sponsored by the British Council.
2 See Jarvis and Mingham (1986) and Jarvis (1987).
3 Mike Foston wrote The Animal Story Books 1 and 2 while serving as a VSO volunteer attached to the Sierra Leone KELT Project, and these were published in mimeo form. They have now been re-issued by the newly-formed People’s Educational Association of Sierra Leone (PEA).

References

The author
Paul Woods began his ESL career in Nigeria and Brunei. After completing his MSc in Applied Linguistics at Edinburgh in 1977, he worked as a British Council KELT lecturer at primary teacher-training colleges in Tanzania and Sierra Leone. He was professional coordinator of the Sierra Leone KELT Project from 1984-7, and last year joined the British Council’s Overseas Career Service. He is co-author with R. Hicks of English for Teachers, especially written for trainee teachers in Africa and recently published by Longman.
## Appendix 2
### Project framework

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project narrative</th>
<th>Indicators of achievement</th>
<th>Means of verification</th>
<th>Important assumptions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Wider objectives</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are the wider (national) objectives or problems which the project will help to resolve?</td>
<td>What are the quantitative or qualitative ways of assessing whether wider objectives have been achieved?</td>
<td>What sources of information exist or can be provided cost-effectively?</td>
<td>What conditions, external to the project, are necessary if the project's immediate objectives are to contribute to the wider objectives?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Immediate objectives</strong> (project purpose)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What are the intended benefits and changes which the project will bring about?</td>
<td>What is the quantitative evidence or qualitative evidence by which effects and benefits will be judged?</td>
<td>What sources of information exist or can be provided cost-effectively? Does provision for collection need to be made under inputs-outputs?</td>
<td>What are the factors outside the control of the project authorities which, if not present, are liable to restrict progress from outputs to achievement of immediate objectives?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outputs</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What outputs (kind, quantity and by when) are to be produced by the project in order to achieve the immediate objectives?</td>
<td>What are the sources of information?</td>
<td>What external factors must be realized to obtain planned outputs on schedule? What risks have been considered? Are any conditions attached to improve prospects of success?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Inputs</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>What services (personnel, training, etc) or equipment/materials are to be provided, at what cost and over what period by: donor, other donors, recipient?</td>
<td>What are the sources of information?</td>
<td>What decisions or actions, outside control of the donor, are necessary for inception of the project?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 3
Project structures

The ODA project framework: typical paradigms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Wider objectives</th>
<th>Vocational/ professional training</th>
<th>Teacher-trainer training</th>
<th>Institutional development</th>
<th>Research</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sectoral effect, e.g. improved industry, agriculture, management</td>
<td>Sectoral effect, e.g. improved teacher performances</td>
<td>Sectoral effect, e.g. improved performance in sector of institution</td>
<td>Sectoral effect, application of research conclusions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Immediate objectives</th>
<th>Vocational/ professional training</th>
<th>Teacher-trainer training</th>
<th>Institutional development</th>
<th>Research</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Function/work/roles being fully undertaken by those trained</td>
<td>Function/role fully undertaken by those trained, e.g. the training of teachers</td>
<td>Function/role of institution being fully performed, achievement of management, behavioural tasks</td>
<td>Hypothesis of research proved or otherwise, research conclusions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outputs</th>
<th>Vocational/ professional training</th>
<th>Teacher-trainer training</th>
<th>Institutional development</th>
<th>Research</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Trained staff in job</td>
<td>Trained teacher trainers/trainers in their posts</td>
<td>Agreed policy changes, programme of institutional activity, development</td>
<td>Research results, data obtained</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inputs</th>
<th>Vocational/ professional training</th>
<th>Teacher-trainer training</th>
<th>Institutional development</th>
<th>Research</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Equipment, courses, workshops, training</td>
<td>Equipment, courses, workshops, training for teacher trainers or trainer trainers</td>
<td>Consultancy</td>
<td>Equipment, training, research link arrangements, consultancy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Appendix 4

**List of participants**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ELTOs</th>
<th>Country</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Richard Arden</td>
<td>Kenya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Drury</td>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oliver Hunt</td>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George Taylor</td>
<td>Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chris Ramsden</td>
<td>Somalia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bill Reed</td>
<td>Angola</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tony Lilley</td>
<td>Egypt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alec Besey</td>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chasser Jessop</td>
<td>Mali</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>British Council Representatives</th>
<th>Country</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bob Steedman</td>
<td>Oman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jim McGrath</td>
<td>Yemen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harley Brookes</td>
<td>Cote d'Ivoire (designate)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caroline ffrench-Blake</td>
<td>Mozambique</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colin Stevenson</td>
<td>Cameroon (designate)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert Bellarmine</td>
<td>ELO Madras</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ian Marvin</td>
<td>ELMD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barbara Zaslofa</td>
<td>STD</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Private/Public sector</th>
<th>Organization</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>John Burke</td>
<td>College of St Mark and St John</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ros Hurst</td>
<td>West Sussex IHE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jim Morrison</td>
<td>Moray House</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mulachy Mulholland</td>
<td>Bell Educational Trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pauline Robinson</td>
<td>CALS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Fell</td>
<td>VSO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sylvane Bayers</td>
<td>VSO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ken Cripwell</td>
<td>ULIE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Seminar staff</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tony Deyes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jay Mehta</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 5
Seminar programme - 24-29 July 1989

Managing aid projects for sustainability

**Monday**

1100 Participants arrive/coffee
1130 Introductory session (Tony Deyes, Ian Marvin)
1245 Lunch
1400 Project management/Project documents (Myra Harrison, Hector Munro, Tony Deyes)
1700 Discussion
1800 Cocktails
1900 Supper
2000 Video: Managing projects (Barbara Zaslona)

**Tuesday**

0900 The project framework (Hector Munro)
1000 Project management case-study (Hector Munro)
1245 Lunch
1400 Case-study continues
1700 Report back/discussion
1900 Dinner
2000 Cross cultural constraints on sustainability; a view from South India (Robert Bellarine)

**Wednesday**

0900 Presentation on sustainability (Dr Carew Treffgarne - ODA, Lewis Kerr - Bell Educational Trust, Rod Capper - Howard Humphreys Partners)
1200 Video: Wheels of Change
1245 Lunch
1400 Debate on project inputs for sustainability;
Training (Jim Morrison, Moray House)
Consultancies (John Burke, Marjohns)
Educational technology (Brian Hill, Brighton Polytechnic)
Professional advice (John Keleher, ELMD)
University links (Chris Housden, Higher Education Group)
Books (Jeff Samuelson, LIBID)
1700 Discussion
1900 Dinner
2000 ELTO illustrated report (Tony Lilley)