What Did We Say; How Did We Say It; and Who Said It? A Review of a Decade of General Academic Library Publishing.


Reports - Research/Technical (143) -- Speeches/Conference Papers (150)

MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.

Academic Libraries; Authors; Citations (References); *Data Analysis; Higher Education; Indexing; Library Catalogs; *Periodicals; Professional Occupations; Reference Materials; Writing Research

*College and Research Libraries (Journal); *Journal of Academic Librarianship

This is a preliminary report on an ongoing research project examining the "Current Index to Journals in Education" indexing of two major, general interest academic library journals: the "Journal of Academic Librarianship" (JAL) and "College and Research Libraries" (C&RL). The data are presented "as is," and readers may draw their own conclusions. The only opinion formed thus far is that the literature presented in JAL came from more diverse sources than expected. The data are drawn from an examination of the major articles in volumes 1-14 of JAL (1976-1989). The examined articles excluded editorials and recurring invited columns such as "On My Mind" and "Library Instruction." The data source does include the apparently invited paper included in the frequent "Symposiums" that gather the responses of a number of noteworthy or appropriate authors on a topic of interest to academic librarians. The researchers looked at various author characteristics, including professional position of the first author, sex of authors, and most frequently appearing authors. In addition, they noted those institutions with which 7 or more first authors were affiliated; the average number of references in relation to the professional position of the authors; those articles with 40 or more references; and the length of titles. Included are three charts and four tables. (MAB)
"What Did We Say; How Did We Say It; and Who Said It? A Review of a Decade of General Academic Library Publishing"

Joseph A. Starratt
&
Roland C. Person

ABSTRACT

This is a preliminary report on an ongoing research project examining the Current Index to Journals in Education indexing of two major, general interest academic library journals: the Journal of Academic Librarianship (JAL) and College & Research Libraries (C&RL). This data is presented "as is." Reader's may draw their own conclusions. The only opinion formed thus far by the authors is that the literature presented in JAL came from more diverse sources than expected.

SCOPE

This data is drawn from an examination of the major articles in Volumes 1 - 14 of JAL (1976-1989). The examined articles excluded editorials and recurring invited columns such as "On My Mind" and "Library Instruction." The data source does include the apparently invited papers included in the frequent "Symposiums" that gather the responses of a number of noteworthy or appropriate authors on a topic of interest to academic librarians. The researchers looked at various author characteristics, including professional position of the first author, sex of authors, and most frequently appearing authors. In addition, they noted those institutions with which seven or more first authors were affiliated; the average number of references in relation to the professional position of the authors; those articles with 40 or more references; and the length of titles.

AUTHORSHIP

FIRST AUTHOR OF ARTICLES BY GENERAL POSITION (ILLUS # 1)

Although it was sometimes difficult to assign specific positions (or at least specific position titles) into general classes, it was possible to group most of them into five broad groups. In some cases, the author had written the paper while holding one position but held another position upon publication. The latest position was taken in these cases.
As the Illustration indicates, the largest group of authors, 39%, tell in the occupational category of library administrators. This figure was influenced by the number of Symposium articles which seemed to rely heavily on administrative respondents. Public service librarians accounted for 27%; technical service librarians for 10%. Subject specialists were included as a group because it was hard to determine if they were catalog, reference or collection development librarians; or if they were a bit of each. Library school faculty accounted for 18%. The authors are interested in comparing this result with the yet to be determined C&RL figure.

INSTITUTIONS WITH SEVEN OR MORE FIRST AUTHORS (ILLUS #2)

Five of the nine schools producing seven or more first authors were from the Midwest, four from the Big Ten, two were from the east and there was one each from the west and southeast.

OTHER CHARACTERISTICS OF AUTHORSHIP (ILLUS #3)

Multiple authorship appears to be more restrained in JAL than in many academic journals since the average of 1.6 authors per article includes the author-rich symposium articles. Richard Dougherty, Charles Martell and the ubiquitous Hernon and McClure were the most frequently appearing authors. 41% of the first authors appeared to be female (names are not entirely conclusive evidence of gender).

REFERENCES AND TITLES

AVERAGE # OF REFERENCES BY GENERAL POSITIONS OF FIRST AUTHOR (ILLUS #4)

& ARTICLES WITH 40 OR MORE REFERENCES (ILLUS #5)

Public service librarians tended to write articles with more citations. This might be because there is more to refer to on their topics or because they are used to providing many sources of information to their users. Technical service librarians included the fewest citations, perhaps because they are used to searching for the precise rule or reference in their daily activity.

The average number of references per article was 12.2; the average page length was 5.33.

AVERAGE # OF WORDS IN TITLES (ILLUS #6)

& CHARACTERISTICS OF LONGEST & SHORTEST TITLES (ILLUS #7)

An ominous trend towards wordy titles is made obvious in this graph. Brief respites in the growth of titles over the 14 volumes have usually been
followed by surges in title length. It will be interesting to see if volume 15 breaks the trend. The first article in the first volume tied for the shortest title. The title of this present work, not included in this study, weighs in at 23 words!

CONCLUSIONS

The careful reader would already be aware that the authors do not intend to draw conclusions from this preliminary data. The larger study, of which this is a part, will examine ERIC’s use of subject descriptors and indicators for the many articles in these two journals over a 13 year period. The authors hope that this will reflect changes in article emphasis over this time, but also that it may show how subject descriptors (and subjects) have also changed. It may show that some subjects have disappeared and new ones have appeared. It also may show flaws or irregularities in the indexing process. We intend to report these results in more detail at the conclusion of this study, but we hope we have whetted your appetite at the possibilities yet to come.
Illustration II

INSTITUTIONS WITH SEVEN OR MORE FIRST AUTHORS

7 University of Illinois at Urbana

8 University of California at Berkeley
   University of Kentucky

9 Northwestern University
   State University of New York at Buffalo
   (SUNY)

10 Southern Illinois University at
    Carbondale

11 University of Michigan

12 Indiana University*
   Pennsylvania State University*

   * includes branch campuses
Illustration III
Most Frequently Appearing Authors

Richard Dougherty appeared four times as a first author and once as a second author and once as a tenth author for a total of six (this does not count his regular editorials in his journal).

Charles Martell appeared five times as a first author.

Peter Hernon appeared twice as a first author and once as a third author for a total of four.

Charles McClure appeared twice as a first author, once as a second, and once as a fourth for a total of four.

The average number of authors per article was 1.6.

Other Authorship Characteristics

Of the 399 articles, 89 (22%) had two authors.

124 (31%) had at least two authors.

35 (9%) had at least three authors.

22 had four or more authors.

20 had five or more authors.

15 had seven or more authors.

1 had fourteen authors.

Sex of Authors

Of the 652 total authors, 275 appeared to be female, 42%.

Of the 399 first authors, 164 appeared to be female, 41%.
Illustration IV

AVG # OF REFERENCES BY GENERAL POSITIONS OF AUTHORS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Avg # of Refs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Library Faculty</td>
<td>15.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library Administrators</td>
<td>10.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Services</td>
<td>16.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Technical Services</td>
<td>9.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subject Specialists</td>
<td>10.60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Illustration V

Articles with 40 or More References

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pages</th>
<th># References</th>
<th>1st Author's Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>Librarian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>Documents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>Lib Sch Dean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>Coll Develop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>Lib Sc Faculty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>Lib Sc Faculty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>Other Admin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>Asst. Dir Pub Serv</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>Lib Sc Faculty</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>Circulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>Other Faculty</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Of these fourteen, four are Directors or Administrators in libraries; four are Library School Faculty or Deans.

The overall average number of references per article was 12.2.

The overall average number of pages per article was 5.33.

The average number of references per page was 2.3. The most references per page (averaged) was 11.3.
Illustration VI

Average Words in Titles

Average words/title

VOL 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14

7.00 7.65 8.00 8.50 9.00 9.50 10.00 10.50 11.00

JAL VOL 1-14 1978-1989
Illustration VII

Characteristics of Longest Titles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pages</th>
<th>Ref</th>
<th>Job</th>
<th>Words</th>
<th>Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Subj. Spec.</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>Brigham Young</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>Reference</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>Ohio State</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Lib Sci Fac</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>Brigham Young</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Systems</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>Toronto</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

"Sometimes Dirty Things are Seen on the Screen": A Mini-Evaluation of the COM Microcatalogue at the University of Toronto Library

Characteristics of Shortest Titles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pages</th>
<th>Ref</th>
<th>Job</th>
<th>Words</th>
<th>Institution</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Head of Public</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ala-Huntsville</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Acquisitions</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Clemson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>Colorado</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Decisions! Decisions!*

* The first article in the first issue.