While most instructional supervisors recognize the importance of mutual trust and collaboration in building effective interpersonal relations with teachers (involving high cooperation, mutually agreed upon goals, and demonstrated positive outcomes), supervisors' attempts to achieve these ends often prove frustrating. This paper examines factors promoting trust, barriers to trust, benefits and methods of building trust, and staff development activities to promote schoolwide trust. To empower teachers to view themselves as managers in charge of school productivity, supervisors need to demonstrate trust in teachers, acknowledge the importance of teachers' role, and show their willingness to build collegial relations with teachers based on equality and mutual regard. Trust is related to several factors: the purpose of supervision and evaluation; confidentiality; handling of complaints; consistency, honesty, and sincerity; and collaboration and participation in the supervision process. Barriers to trust include teacher distrust and anxiety concerning evaluation, teachers' hesitancy to express problems and concerns, supervisors' managerial styles, and time constraints. A major benefit of trust-building is to assist teachers in self-evaluation and in addressing problems before they become major. Supervisors can also help teachers brainstorm solutions to problems. Successful organizations function by encouraging their members to collaborate on strategies for improving organizational effectiveness. Appended are 11 references and workshop materials, including suggested readings, geared to building trust in teacher supervision and evaluation. (MLH)
BUILDING TRUST IN SUPERVISION AND EVALUATION

A WORKSHOP FOR INSTRUCTIONAL SUPERVISORS

Lawrence Lyman, Ph.D.
Office of Professional Education Services

Michael Morehead, Ed.D.
Office of Professional Education Services

Harvey Foyle, Ph.D.
Division of Administration, Teacher Education,
and Industrial Technology

College of Education
Emporia State University
1200 Commercial Street
Emporia, Kansas 66801
(316) 343-1200, Ext. 5447

Presented at the 43rd Annual Conference
Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development
Boston, Massachusetts
March 12, 1988
BACKGROUND

INFORMATION
THE NEED FOR TRUST IN SUPERVISION

Effective instructional supervision challenges the supervisor to be able to build trust and encourage collaboration in the supervisory process. The level of trust between supervisor and teacher is a major factor in determining the quality of assistance the supervisor will be able to provide to the teacher. While most supervisors recognize the importance of mutual trust and collaboration in building the effective interpersonal relationships with teachers in which cooperation is high, mutual goals are generally agreed upon, and positive outcomes can be seen, attempts to foster such trust and encourage collaboration and collegiality have often been frustrating for supervisors. This paper will examine factors which promote trust, barriers to trust in the supervision process, potential benefits of building trust, ways to build trust between teachers and supervisors, and staff development activities that may promote trust on a school-wide basis.

FACTORS IN TRUST AND COLLABORATION

In order for school improvement efforts to be successful, teachers must to begin to view themselves as proactive managers in their classrooms who have the capacity to positively affect student opportunities to learn by their use of effective instructional behaviors. As managers using "modern" management techniques, teachers would assume more
responsibility for the productivity of the school. Working with other managers like principals in a collaborative manner, teachers will be more likely to see themselves as instrumental in improving the productivity of the school, in improving opportunities for students to learn, and in efforts to improve the system as a whole. In order to empower teachers to view themselves as managers, supervisors need to demonstrate trust in teachers, demonstrate belief in the importance of the teacher's role in the school, and demonstrate their willingness to collaborate with teachers and build collegial relationships based on equality and mutual regard. The supervisor can thus play a key role in helping teachers to view themselves as proactive managers of instruction and in improving the quality of instruction in the classroom.

Trust is a key factor in the success of the supervisor in helping teachers to change their behaviors. While it is difficult to identify specific supervisor behaviors that promote trust, several factors have been correlated with trust: the purpose of supervision and evaluation, confidentiality, how the supervisor deals with complaints, consistency, honesty and sincerity, and the development of collaboration and participation in the supervision process.

Lewis identifies three kinds of trust important in "excellent" organizations which can be applied to teacher-supervisor interactions. Teachers must believe that information shared in the supervisory process will not be
used to hurt them. When this trust is present, teachers feel free to share information and feelings related to their jobs with supervisors because they believe that their supervisor is honest, trustworthy, and sincere, and that by sharing ideas and information, problems can be solved.

Teachers must also believe that written and verbal agreements between supervisor and teacher can be relied upon. Teachers seek to verify their trust in their supervisor by observing his or her behavior for contradictions between written and verbal statements and actual performance. Higher levels of trust are developed when consistency is seen between what the supervisor writes and says and what he or she actually does.

Teachers must also believe that supervisors have a high degree of respect and integrity. Such trust may be diminished when teachers feel their supervisors are "checking up" on them rather than dealing with them openly and honestly.4

Effective leaders also demonstrate empathy for those they work with,5 promote staff feelings of ownership in the organization,6 and show sensitivity toward their employees.7 These factors tend to foster cooperation and encourage collaboration and collegiality.

Warren Bennis and Burt Nanus describe trust as "... the lubrication that makes it possible for organizations to work... .Trust implies accountability, predictability, reliability." P. F. Oliva summarizes the importance of
trust building and collegiality in the following quotation: "For supervision to be successful, teachers must want the services of the supervisor. They must feel that the supervisor is there to serve them and to help them become more effective teachers." 9

BARRIERS TO TRUST

Several barriers exist to establishing trust between supervisors and teachers. Because supervision eventually leads to evaluation, teachers often become tense and distrustful toward the process, especially when areas which need improvement are identified. The supervisory process is thus viewed as negative and judgmental. For example, teachers may view a negative supervisor judgement about a professional competency or skill as a negative judgement about them as a person. 10

Teachers' negative feelings about evaluation can begin in teacher education programs. The student teacher may properly feel that the final evaluation of their university supervisor will be an important factor in their ability to get the teaching job they want. Because the supervisor makes a limited number of evaluation visits to the classroom, student teachers believe that things need to go well when the supervisor does visit. Student teachers sometimes alter their teaching behavior, coach students to behave well, and even request that the cooperating teacher minimize problems the student teacher is having so that the
university supervisor gets the idea that things are going well and a satisfactory evaluation is completed.

As teachers move from student teaching into their own classrooms, the principal can be viewed by the new teacher as another supervisor who needs to see an ideal classroom when visiting and who should be kept in the dark about teaching problems and concerns. New teachers are often worried about keeping their jobs and perceive that they will not be rehired if the supervisor is aware they are having problems. Experienced teachers may build on new teacher fears of the supervisor by relating their own negative experiences with problems they have encountered.

Teachers appear to be well advised to keep problems and concerns to themselves in some schools. Some teachers are penalized for bringing their needs to the supervisor's attention by having these needs negatively reflect on their evaluation. Some supervisors allude to an open door policy verbally and in writing, but their behavior discourages teachers from coming to them when they find the supervisor is not really interested in helping. In such schools, trust between supervisor and teacher is at a low level and the effectiveness of the supervisor's efforts to improve instruction is appreciably diminished.

Supervisors who use traditional patterns of management which stress authority, compliance, and identification of teacher weaknesses also build less trust than supervisors who are able to stress collegiality, encourage productive
diversity, and emphasize teacher strengths. As supervisors are able to adapt their management philosophies and practices to facilitate collaboration and collegiality, they will be more likely to inspire teacher trust in their supervisors.

Time also conspires against supervisor effectiveness. Because of the many other tasks supervisors are called upon to perform, supervisors may not take the time to build the level of trust necessary for effective supervision to take place. To teachers, some supervisors appear to be rushed, unconcerned, insensitive, and just "going through the motions" of supervision, and trust is therefore lessened.

In order to build trust in the supervisory process, supervisors must reduce teacher anxiety about the supervision and evaluation process, encourage teachers to seek assistance without penalty, and take the time to build trust, encourage collaboration, and supervise effectively. Because of barriers which make such trust difficult to establish, patience also becomes a factor in establishing long-term patterns of trust, collaboration, and collegiality in school organizations. Achieving excellence in the schools may ultimately depend on leaders who are willing to take the time necessary to build organizational structures which enhance the professional growth of those who work in
them.

POTENTIAL BENEFITS OF BUILDING TRUST

One of the goals of instructional supervision is to assist the teacher in becoming effective in self-evaluation of their own instruction. Even the most conscientious supervisor who regularly visits teachers' classrooms has only an off-hand chance of observing at the specific time a certain instructional problem is being experienced by the teacher. Good teachers are experts at concealing problems from supervisors. Unfortunately, supervisors sometimes find out about such problems in other ways—from angry parents, worried superintendents, or concerned Board of Education members.

If trust can be successfully established between the supervisor and teacher, the teacher is more likely to voluntarily share problems and concerns with supervisors before the problems become major. By encouraging teachers to collaborate with the supervisor before a problem gets "out of hand", the supervisor not only helps the teacher, but enhances his or her own effectiveness as well.

As teachers turn to supervisors for help with classroom problems, a valuable opportunity is presented to the supervisor. Often the supervisor can lead the teacher to brainstorm solutions to their own problems. If the teacher is unable to think of appropriate solutions, the supervisor can also assist by offering practical ideas which may help
to solve the problem the teacher is having. The supervisor can later check with the teacher to see how the strategies they have developed are working. Teachers who receive this kind of assistance from their supervisor are more likely to perceive their supervisor as competent and caring, and trust is enhanced.

Successful organizations function by encouraging their members to collaborate on strategies for improving the effectiveness of the organization. In order to meet the challenges posed by "A Nation at Risk" and similar reports, supervisors and teachers will need to work together. By building trust through supervisory encounters, supervisors enhance their relationship with teachers and establish a foundation for further collaborative efforts.
REFERENCES


6. Peters and Austin, pages 299-300.


10. Acheson and Gall, page 192.

    Hickman and Silva, p. 245.
WORKSHOP MATERIALS
BUILDING TRUST IN SUPERVISION AND EVALUATION

ASCD WORKSHOP

Presented by:

Larry Lyman
Mike Morehead
Harvey Foyle

Emporia State University
Emporia, Kansas

Workshop Topics

1. Prerequisites for Effective Supervision and Evaluation
2. Positive Tone
3. Employee Involvement
4. Orientation
5. Communication Skills
6. Interpersonal Trust
7. Clarification
8. Brainstorming
9. Positive Confrontation
10. Conferencing
11. Effective Supervisory Behaviors
12. Staff Development Activities
13. Suggested Readings
EFFECTIVE SUPERVISION SKILLS

KNOWLEDGE OF VALID INSTRUCTIONAL PROCEDURES

yes?

ORIENTATION PLANNING

yes?

TEACHER TRUST

yes?

no?

no?

yes?

no?

DATA COLLECTION

yes?

COMMUNICATION SKILLS

yes?

CONFERENCING SKILLS

yes?

GOOD FAITH AND FAIR DEALING

yes?

PRODUCTIVE SUPERVISION AND EVALUATION
Positive Imaging Acclivity

One thing I've really enjoyed about the conference so far is

Something I'm looking forward to today is

My students are lucky to have me as an administrator because

One thing I do really well in my job is

Teachers are glad they work with me because

One thing I'm excited about this year is

A strength of my staff is

I've worked really hard this year to

I know I've really helped a teacher when

One of the best things about the place I work is

I know it's all worthwhile when
POSITIVE IMAGING ACTIVITY FOR TEACHERS

One reason my students are lucky to have me as a teacher.

Something I really like about teaching is

I know I've really helped a student when

Something I'm really proud of this year is

One thing I tried that really worked well was

A student makes my day when he/she

One of the best things about my students this year is

My principal is really helpful when

I know it's all worthwhile when

This has been a good week because

Something I'm really looking forward to is

One thing our school does really well is
Some Statements about Teachers

In your group, briefly discuss the following statements about teachers. Take a group vote to decide if the group agrees or disagrees with the statement as written.

Group Decision
(Agree/Disagree)

1. Trust relationships can be built between teachers and those who evaluate their performance.

2. Teachers experience professional growth when supervisors emphasize their strengths.

3. Teachers should have responsibility for staffing at their school.

4. Teachers should have responsibility for budgeting at their school.

5. Teachers should be in charge of recruiting new teachers and for induction and orientation of new teachers.

6. Teachers should have free access to the supply room.

7. Teachers should keep track of their own time—time sheets are not needed.

8. Evaluation in an environment where trust does not exist inhibits teacher growth and development.

9. Teachers will be more likely to treat students positively and to value the contributions of students when teachers are treated positively by supervisors who value the contributions of each teacher.

10. Teachers work best when they feel they are trusted.
BUILDING TRUST THROUGH EMPLOYEE INVOLVEMENT

In his recent book "Thriving On Chaos: Handbook for a Management Revolution", Tom Peters describes an employee involvement program at the General Motors Delco-Remy manufacturing plant in Fitzgerald, Georgia, that has achieved an "extraordinary" record for low employee absenteeism, high quality, and high productivity. The average workers in this plant:

- handle all quality control (experts are on tap only if needed in specific cases)
- do all maintenance and make minor repairs on machines
- keep track of their own time; there are no time cards (no clock)
- handle the "housekeeping" (no janitors)
- participate in a pay-for-knowledge program (for learning almost every job in the plant)
- are organized in teams which engage in regular problem solving activities
- are responsible for safety
- have full-time access to the lock-free tool room
- do budget preparation and review (capital and operating)
- help determine staffing levels
- advise management on equipment layout and generate requirements for new equipment
- are in charge of all recruiting and run the assessment center for new recruits
- decide on layoff patterns (whether to lay people off or have everybody work shorter hours, for example)
- rotate as leaders of work teams

EFFECTIVE ORIENTATION TO SUPERVISION AND EVALUATION

When teachers know what to expect, trust in supervision and evaluation is increased. Assessment must be predictable and surprises must be avoided. Use the self evaluation below to rate the effectiveness of your orientation procedures.

1 = Strongly agree 2 = Agree 3 = Not sure 4 = Disagree 5 = Strongly disagree

1. I provide orientation to supervision and evaluation each year for every member of my staff.

2. Orientation activities are completed before classroom observations begin.

3. I emphasize that the goal of supervision and evaluation is to improve the quality of instruction for all students.

4. I thoroughly and completely describe the procedures which will be followed in making classroom observations.

5. I thoroughly and completely describe the techniques I will use to collect data during classroom observations. (Note: A sample of data collected from an observation may be helpful.)

6. I thoroughly and completely describe the conferencing process that will be used after classroom observations. (Note: A videotape of a sample conference may be helpful.)

7. I provide comprehensive information to my teachers about the standards, policies, and procedures for teacher evaluation in my school district.

8. I give teachers opportunities to ask questions about goals, procedures, and policies for their supervision and evaluation.
9. A preconference is held with each teacher before the first observation of the year to make sure each teacher understands the process and to lower teacher anxiety.

10. New teachers are provided with more intensive orientation activities to familiarize them with supervision and evaluation procedures. (Note: Involving senior teachers in orienting new teachers may be helpful.)

11. I follow policies and procedures as outlined during orientation so supervision and evaluation become predictable and positive.
COMMUNICATION STRATEGIES

I. Things that influence communication:
A. Clothes
B. Eye contact
C. Posture
D. Silence
E. Facial features: smile, sincere, frown
F. Tone of voice: overtones, deception, loudness
G. Rate: How fast we talk
H. Accent, dialect
I. Vocabulary
J. Research/statistics

II. Barriers to Effective Communication
A. Use of jargon or slang
B. Red-flag words: SCAB, communist, teacher evaluation
C. Physical messages which disagree with verbal messages
D. Stereotyping the speaker
E. Various individuals will interpret message differently
F. Context: Where, when, and how
G. Speaker ignores feedback
H. Personal bias toward teacher
I. Words that have more than one meaning
J. Filtering: tell someone only what they like to hear or only what you think they need to know
III. Communication is enhanced:
   A. Active listening, limit your talking
   B. Spare time: we think faster than we or others think
   C. Specific statements
   D. Smile
   E. Minimize distractions, phone calls, drop ins
   F. Suspend judgment, listen to entire statement
   G. Restate the information shared
   H. Proper atmosphere: quiet office for difficult meetings
   I. Ask questions to clarify—probing questions
   J. Summarize all conferences at the end
   K. Attentive posture

IV. Written communication is enhanced:
   A. Clarity: avoid jargon, give complete information, keep sentences short
   B. Concise: say it once, avoid repetition
   C. Confidence: be assertive
   D. Correct: spelling, grammar, avoid slang
   E. Courtesy: communicate at their level
   F. Remember your audience

V. Indicators to be cognizant of:
   A. Pointing finger
   B. Sitting on the edge of the chair
   C. Talking louder, faster
   D. Use of extravagant terms: "Everyone's doing it."
   E. Focusing on an individual or situation and not
the message or issue

F. Attacking non-relevant issues
G. Blocker: resists change
H. Playboy: makes displays of not being involved
I. Special interest
J. Aggressor: deflates status of others
K. Dominator: asserts self through manipulation, flattery, interruptions

VI. Informal Network--Causes are:
A. Wishful thinking
B. Uncertainty/fear
C. Dislike, anger, distrust
D. Anxiety
E. Misinformation
F. Rumors are usually worse than reality

Summary

1. When verbal and non-verbal messages contradict, a mistrust develops: interestingly, people will choose the non-verbal message.

2. Comfort space

3. Higher status individuals usually initiate conversations

4. Be clear and specific in your expectations. Make specific your requested behavior.

5. Look at the person you are communicating with.

6. Standing, while your associate sits, sends a message of dominance.

7. Making another person wait to see you communicates your importance.
INTERPERSONAL TRUST BUILDING

The supervisor can build trust by developing a caring interpersonal relationship with teachers. As teachers see that the supervisor is concerned for their success as a person and as a professional, trust between supervisor and teacher is enhanced. Five ways for the supervisor to demonstrate positive concern are:

1. Showing consideration. The goal is for the teacher to feel that the supervisor likes and cares about the teacher. Examples:
   "I know you've been ill. Are you feeling better?"
   "How's your daughter doing in college?"
   "I heard you were elected president of your club. Congratulations."

2. Showing appreciation. The goal is for the teacher to feel that the supervisor recognizes and values the teacher's effort. Examples:
   "Thanks for all your hard work on the project."
   "I appreciate your support."
   "Thanks for helping to organize the fall dance. Everything went very smoothly this year."

3. Sharing positive remarks. The goal is for the teacher to know that the supervisor is hearing positive things about their performance from others. Examples:
   "The substitute yesterday said she'd come back for you anytime."
   "The university requested that you work with this particular student teacher."
   "John's mother was telling me how pleased she is with his progress in your class."

4. Showing respect. The goal is for the teacher to feel that the supervisor values their professional expertise. Examples:
   "Before I decide, I wanted to find out what you thought."
   "Do you have any suggestions for improving our meetings?"
   "I'd like you to make a short presentation at the next faculty meeting."

5. Giving positive feedback about instruction. The goal is for the teacher to know what they are doing well in their teaching. Example:
   "Your class test scores were very impressive."
   "You handled that student's incorrect answer expertly."
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAMES</th>
<th>Monday</th>
<th>Tuesday</th>
<th>Wednesday</th>
<th>Thursday</th>
<th>Friday</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CLARIFICATION: A SUPERVISORY TOOL FOR TRUST BUILDING

In their concern for accountability and student achievement, supervisors may be too quick to offer advice and solutions to instructional problems they perceive teachers are having. Clarification, the use of appropriate clarifying questions to gain understanding and facilitate teacher participation in the supervisory process, may help supervisors increase dialogue, improve understanding of teacher decision making, demonstrate support and interest, show commitment to accuracy, and promote teacher self-analysis.

The most important question which should be included as a part of most conferences is "Was this a typical day in your classroom?" Obviously, all teachers (even the most successful) teach lessons that do not go as well as the teacher and supervisor might have hoped. While the discussion of what went wrong during a less successful lesson may be useful to the supervisor and teacher, the supervisor must be careful to reassure the teacher that undue evaluative weight will not be placed on an atypical day.

When the supervisor receives an answer from a teacher that indicates the observation was not typical of what usually happens in the classroom, it is important to plan with the teacher to observe again soon on a day the teacher feels will be more representative of the normal experiences in the classroom. By making this extra observation, the supervisor helps to assure the teacher that the supervisor is truly interested in seeing the kind of teaching that usually goes on and builds trust by convincing the teacher that assessment processes are not designed to catch the teacher being ineffective. If further observations cause the supervisor to believe that the earlier observation was an accurate sample of what normally occurs in the class, this finding will need to be shared with the teacher and appropriate action taken.

Clarification questions may also be used to gain information about any part of the lesson which the supervisor did not understand or to inquire as to the rationale for decisions that were made during the lesson. For example, such inquiry may involve the teacher's diagnosis of student needs, questioning techniques, grouping of students, motivation and management of the students, organization and sequencing of material, or materials used in the lesson.
Clarification helps the supervisor to understand the teacher's decision making processes. Knowing the reasons for a particular teacher decision will sometimes change the feedback the supervisor will give the teacher about the lesson. Teachers often have sound, reasonable rationale for actions that may, at first glance, appear inappropriate.

The use of clarification questions helps turn a conference into a dialogue rather than a monologue delivered by the supervisor. As the teacher is encouraged to talk about what happened during the lesson and the reasons for decisions that have been made, the teacher becomes an active participant in the assessment process.

Clarification questions help the teacher analyze and discuss his or her instruction. The primary goal of clarification is to assist the teacher in becoming self-assessing, so that the teacher can successfully analyze their own instruction, make appropriate changes, and seek the supervisor's help as needed.

Facilitating teacher involvement in assessment and encouraging teacher self-evaluation should be priorities for supervisor. Skillful use of clarification questions can be a useful tool in building trust and promoting teacher growth through the supervisory process.
Practice Activity

Circle the questions below which are examples of effective clarification questions.

1. What objectives were being covered today?
2. What kind of group is this? (Example: active, listless; cooperative, disruptive; high achieving, low achieving)
3. Why are you teaching objectives that are not in the curriculum guide?
4. Was this a typical day in your classroom?
5. What happened before I came into the classroom?
6. Do you always have that much trouble keeping your students on task?
7. What are you going to do with this group during the next instructional period?
8. What aspects of the lesson pleased you?
9. Have you seen how the teacher next door passes out papers to avoid wasting student time?
10. What would you do differently if you were to teach this lesson again? Why?
11. How did you decide the students were ready for this lesson?
12. Don't you think you should have answered Jennifer's question soon instead of making her wait?
Brainstorming in the Formative Conference

Creativity is an ability to react to a problem in a new way, often in unprescribed ways. However, new approaches to problems are often inhibited by giving solutions or directions prematurely. Supervisors can fall into the trap of stifling creative problem solving by giving solutions to teachers' problems rather than allowing teachers to come up with solutions to their own problems.

Roles and Goals

The role of the principal in an instructional improvement conference includes brainstorming with teachers to increase their awareness of appropriate teaching behaviors and alternatives. The role of the teacher in an instructional improvement conference includes brainstorming in order to make teaching decisions consciously which are consistent with clinical theory in teaching.

Brainstorming provides an opportunity for the teacher and supervisor to discuss alternative ways in which a portion of the lesson might have been taught. Brainstorming may be used to help the teacher think of alternative strategies which might be effective in future lessons. In this way, brainstorming can be useful when the teacher has been successful during the instructional sequence which was observed. Brainstorming can also be helpful in focusing on ways to improve portions of a lesson that did not go as well as the teacher and supervisor wanted. The purpose of brainstorming in either case is to add to the number of instructional strategies a teacher can think about when deciding how to accomplish a desired objective. When planning to use brainstorming as the focus of an instructional conference, the supervisor needs to be prepared to offer several suggestions in the event the teacher is unable to formulate alternatives. (Lyman, 1987, p. 116)

The three goals of brainstorming are fluency, flexibility, and originality. In fluency, a large number of ideas are produced. Often the best ideas come late in the session or even days later after some thought. In flexibility, there is a shifting from topic to topic rather than sticking to a specific track. This tends to produce several ideas. Flexibility breaks old habits of thinking and looking at problems. In originality, the ideas are new or at least newly thought about by the teacher. These ideas can be expansions, shifts of emphasis, or new wrinkles on old ideas.
Principles

Brainstorming is one technique that fosters creativity in problem solving during a formative conference. Principles of brainstorming include the following:

1. Avoid the pressure of time and deadlines. Creative solutions to problems are not arrived at instantaneously. Thinking time is necessary. People problems are difficult to solve with instant solutions.

2. Avoid evaluation. Rather than expecting instant success, allow solutions that might lead to immediate failure but long-run success. Thus, an evaluation of a brainstorming idea should not occur. At this stage, attempting to improve a situation is more important than trying to evaluate the efforts of the teacher.

3. De-emphasize conformity. A variety of solutions may be successful depending on the specific situations. Different teachers may solve problems differently. Thus, one person's solution may act as a guide but not as a prescription for another person's problem.

4. Practice uncertainty. Rather than providing "canned" answers for every situation, allow some solutions that have uncertain outcomes. As a result of the conference, the teacher should attempt strategies that have not been used prior to the conference.

5. Allow participation. Teachers should have a part in determining how and what should be accomplished. If a supervisor gives an authoritative solution and the solution does not work, then the supervisor is wrong! If the solution works, then the supervisor is right until the next solution does not work! However, participation gives both the supervisor and the teacher ownership of the solution. This situation leads to creative problem solving and shared responsibility.

Most conferences encompass divergent situations, i.e. a wide range of problems with a wide variety of solutions. Brainstorming is one technique that generates many ideas while removing the natural roadblocks to creativity. The supervisor should follow the main rule of brainstorming: All ideas are of equal worth and the evaluation of those ideas should not occur until after all ideas are produced.
Question Types

The above principles and rule help establish a receptive atmosphere between the supervisor and teachers. During the brainstorming process the supervisor could ask three types of questions to gain teachers' responses. Two of the questions (convergent and evaluative) will not produce needed solutions.

An example of a question which a supervisor should not use during brainstorming is the convergent question, one with only one right answer. "What did you do that caused Johnny to yell and scream?" The teacher is on the defensive and must explain a particular action. This type of question stops discussion.

An example of another question which a supervisor should not use during brainstorming is the evaluative question, one which asks for a value judgment. "Should Johnny have yelled and screamed at this time?" Teachers are asked to evaluate not only Johnny's response but in reality are evaluating their own actions that brought on the response. In this case, the teacher cannot give a correct answer. If Johnny should have yelled, then the teacher was not in control of the classroom. If Johnny should not have yelled, then the teacher's previous actions were correct. Hence, only one response can be given, either a yes or a no.

During brainstorming a supervisor uses divergent questions. For example, a supervisor asks, "How might you handle Johnny's yelling in the future? In the context of your classroom, give me some ideas about ways to handle Johnny, then we can discuss those strategies."

In using divergent questions in a conference, the supervisor allows the teacher some thinking time. Do not repeat the question as a way of filling in silent gaps. Do not answer the question from your previous experience. Do not engage in idle "chit chat." Divergent questions should be used in the following ways:

1. To utilize information: Johnny yelled. The supervisor asks: "Why do you think Johnny yelled?"

2. To stimulate curiosity: Johnny yelled. The supervisor states: "Johnny seems to yell a lot. Have you noticed under what circumstances this has happened prior to today."

3. To solve problems: Johnny yelled. The supervisor asks: "What are some possible ways to deal with Johnny's behavior in the future?"
4. To suggest possible courses of action: Johnny yelled. The supervisor asks: "Can you come up with two or three ways to handle Johnny next time that he yells?"

5. To stimulate thought: Johnny yelled. The supervisor asks: "Think about the various times that Johnny has yelled and screamed. Are there any similarities between the various times that Johnny yells out?"

Aids to Brainstorming

Aids to brainstorming during a conference include the use of hitchhiking, categories and analogies. Adding to the teacher's responses is appropriate. This hitchhiking of ideas can produce more solutions. For example, the supervisor asks, "Are there any similarities between the various times that Johnny yells out?" The teacher responds, after some thought, "Yes, whenever it is totally quiet in the room, he gives out a yell." The supervisor responds, "Can you think of any reasons why Johnny would yell when the room is quiet?" The teacher and supervisor are now in a conversation which is searching out solutions to the problem.

The teacher's alternative ideas and solutions can be grouped in related categories by the supervisor. For example, "Your suggestions fall into two categories. First, long-range approaches to Johnny's problem. Second, doing something about Johnny's behavior tomorrow. Let's come up with some specific ways to handle Johnny for tomorrow. You can think about more long-range strategies and we can talk about them later."

Analogies can be useful. The supervisor asks, "When other students have acted like Johnny, what has been your approach?" After the teacher's response, the supervisor might state, "Do any of your solutions that have worked before with other students seem to apply to Johnny's situation?"

The best brainstorming conference will not be evaluative. This type of conference allows for a variety of ideas and produces many alternative solutions. The use of brainstorming can produce an atmosphere of mutual trust, respect, and help.
POSITIVE CONFRONTATION--A SUPERVISORY STRATEGY

Discussing unsatisfactory areas of performance with teachers is one of the more unpleasant responsibilities of principals and others responsible for instructional supervision.

The supervisor can overcome these barriers by positively confronting the teacher. Positive confrontation may seem like a contradiction in terms, but a skilled supervisor can use positive confrontation to provide necessary information to a teacher with as little damage to ego as possible.

Confrontation is positive when:

1. The supervisor has a clear objective for the conference with the teacher.

2. The supervisor describes the unsatisfactory performance concisely and specifically, giving appropriate examples.

3. The supervisor stresses the common goal of the teacher and principal to help all students learn.

4. The conference is limited to one major area that needs remediation.

5. Problems are dealt with before becoming major whenever possible.

6. Specific suggestions for improvement are made and a timeline is provided for improvement.

6. The supervisor states his/her willingness to work with the teacher to remediate the problem and ends the conference on a positive note.

7. The supervisor remains in control of the conference and refuses to be sidetracked by the teacher.

Teachers may try to resist the negative message by:

--refusing to acknowledge the problem exists
--minimizing the seriousness of the problem
--questioning the objectivity of the principal
--questioning the skill of the principal
--comparing themselves to others who "do it that way"
--becoming defensive
--becoming angry
--blaming other people or circumstances beyond their control
The supervisor can positively counter the resistance by responding appropriately:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Teacher Action</th>
<th>Supervisor Action</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teacher refuses to acknowledge problem</td>
<td>Supervisor restates problem and gives appropriate examples.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>exists.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher minimizes the seriousness of the</td>
<td>Supervisor restates concern and tells why the problem is serious. (injury may occur, student not achieving, violation of school/district policy, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>problem.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher questions the skill or objectivity</td>
<td>Supervisor does not respond to these concerns during this conference. If he/she feels the concerns are legitimate, the supervisor makes a note to discuss the questions in a future conference.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of the supervisor.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher compares him/herself to others who do it</td>
<td>Supervisor refocuses the teacher on his or her individual performance and refuses to respond to comparisons.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;the same way&quot;.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher becomes defensive or angry.</td>
<td>Supervisor avoids becoming angry or defensive, works to keep conference &quot;low key&quot;.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher blames other people or circumstances for the problem.</td>
<td>Supervisor affirms the teacher's responsibility for the problem and emphasizes that the teacher can correct the problem.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher &quot;gives up&quot;—expresses hopelessness</td>
<td>Supervisor affirms his/her faith in the teacher's ability to correct the problem.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is the supervisor's responsibility to:

-- follow through on commitments made
-- check for progress
-- keep the teacher informed about progress (if any)
PROVIDING FEEDBACK THROUGH EFFECTIVE CONFERENCES

1. BE CLEAR--Use data from the observation to formulate one or two major objectives for the conference. Too many objectives can make it difficult to understand the concepts that are being presented to the teacher.

2. BE TIMELY--Choose a time that is as convenient as possible for both supervisor and teacher--as soon as possible after the observation takes place.

3. MODEL--Model principles of effective teaching by lowering (and, if necessary, raising) the amount of teacher concern as appropriate, emphasizing positive tone, and structuring the conference to maximize teacher understanding.

4. ENCOURAGE PARTICIPATION--Have some questions prepared to encourage the teacher to talk during the conference.

5. LISTEN--Listen appropriately. The teacher needs to be encouraged to analyze his or her teaching.

6. OFFER HELP AS NEEDED--Make sure you can support any points made in the conference and that you can make appropriate suggestions for improvement as needed.

7. BE POSITIVE--Emphasize the positive whenever possible.

8. SUMMARIZE--Use closure to end the conference by restating the major points covered in the conference.
Teacher Feedback Form

To the teacher: I am working to improve my skills as an instructional supervisor and would like to get some feedback from you about our last conference. Please fill out the form below and include any comments you might care to make. You need not sign your name. Please return to me when you are finished. I appreciate your help.

Please rate our last postobservation conference in each area below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strongly agree = 1</th>
<th>Agree = 2</th>
<th>Not sure = 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Disagree = 4</td>
<td>Strongly disagree = 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1. Feedback given by my supervisor was accurate.  
2. The amount of feedback given by my supervisor during this conference was appropriate.  
3. The conference was held promptly after the observation.  
4. This conference was a positive experience for me.  
5. The time and place of the conference were satisfactory for me.  
6. The supervisor demonstrated good listening skills during his conference.  
7. I feel that the supervisor cares about my students.  
8. I feel that the supervisor cares about me.  
9. Suggestions made were helpful to me.  
10. This conference was helpful in helping me improve my teaching.  

Comments: For any area you marked "4" or "5", please make a brief suggestion on the back as to how I can improve. Feel free to make any other comments you wish.
In an effort to identify specific supervisor behaviors which enhanced and which diminished teacher trust in the supervisory process, a study of 150 teachers in seven school districts in the state of Kansas was conducted in 1986. The seven school districts ranged from a small, rural district to a large, urban district. The sample population consisted of 85 elementary teachers and 65 secondary teachers. A range of experience was present in the sample: 37 teachers in the sample had taught less than five years, 29 teachers had taught from five to eight years, 31 had taught nine to twelve years, and 53 teachers had twelve or more years of teaching experience.

In the study, teachers were asked to identify supervisory practices and behaviors that (1) contributed to teacher professional growth (trust building behaviors) and (2) supervisory practices and behaviors that caused worry and concern (trust reducing behaviors). Participants were asked to consider all of the supervisors they had worked with as teachers, including student teaching supervisors and cooperating teachers, team leaders, department heads, assistant principals, and principals—including any supervisors they were currently working with.

Teachers were able to identify a number of specific supervisor practices which either enhanced or reduced trust. These included:

--Orientation. Teachers indicated that providing teachers with information about procedures, schedules, and other expectations for the supervisory process helped them improve their teaching. Not knowing what to expect caused teachers worry and concern and reduced their trust in the supervisory process.

--Positive tone. Positive comments and feedback from supervisors helped teachers in the sample to improve their teaching. Negative comments and tone from the supervisor caused worry and concern and reduced their trust.

--Concern. Supervisors who showed genuine interest in teachers and students and made teachers feel valued and important helped them to improve, according to teachers in the sample. Supervisors who were unconcerned or disinterested in teachers and students caused worry and concern and reduced teacher trust in the process.

--Time. Teachers indicated that supervisors who conducted frequent, on-going observations of their instruction reduced their worry and helped them improve. Supervisors who only visited when an evaluation was due and who did not take a sufficient amount of time to complete the
supervisory process adequately were a source of teacher worry and concern.

--Feedback. Prompt and specific feedback promoted teacher growth, while lack of prompt or specific feedback diminished trust and caused concern. What was surprising was that some teachers in the study indicated that they were observed by supervisors, but that no feedback was provided after such observations.

--Listening skills. Supervisors who were good listeners contributed to teacher growth. Supervisors who demonstrated poor listening skills caused concern and worry and reduced teacher trust. One participant's comment was particularly interesting: "My principal couldn't wait for me to stop talking so he could start."

--Support for the Teacher. Teachers also valued support they perceived they received from their supervisors. This support was mentioned with parents, students, and board members. Teachers listed perceived lack of support as a cause of worry and concern.

Teachers also listed specific behaviors and traits of effective and ineffective supervisors:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Effective Supervisor Traits</th>
<th>Ineffective Supervisor Traits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Honest</td>
<td>Two-faced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Open-minded</td>
<td>Closed-minded</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Warm</td>
<td>Impersonal, cold</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consistent</td>
<td>Inconsistent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding</td>
<td>Condescending</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relaxed</td>
<td>Formal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fair</td>
<td>Plays favorites</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Willing to admit mistakes</td>
<td>Can't admit when they're wrong</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
EFFECTIVE SUPERVISORY BEHAVIORS: SELF-EVALUATION

1. I provide appropriate orientation to the assessment process for teachers.
2. I maintain a positive tone in supervisory contacts with teachers.
3. I demonstrate concern for all teachers and students in my school.
4. I take the time needed to effectively supervise.
5. I provide useful feedback to teachers about their teaching.
6. I demonstrate good listening skills.
7. I show support for my teachers.
8. I am honest in working with teachers.
9. I am warm and friendly in working with teachers.
10. I am consistent in working with teachers.
11. I am understanding in working with teachers.
12. I am fair in working with teachers.
13. I am openminded.
15. I am willing to admit mistakes.
STAFF RATING FORM

Most of the Time  Some of the Time  Not Enough of the Time

1. My principal provides orientation to supervision and evaluation procedures and goals.

2. My principal maintains a positive tone when supervising teachers.

3. My principal is concerned about me and about my students.

4. My principal takes the time needed to be an effective supervisor of instruction.

5. My principal provides useful feedback about my teaching.

6. My principal demonstrates good listening skills.

7. My principal supports his/her teachers.

8. My principal is honest.

9. My principal is warm and friendly.

10. My principal is consistent.

11. My principal is understanding.

12. My principal is fair.

13. My principal is informal when appropriate.

14. My principal is openminded.

15. My principal is willing to admit mistakes.
A program of staff development can be organized which can build teacher trust and encourage collaboration and collegiality to improve the supervision process in a particular school. Steps for such a program might include:

**STEP ONE**
At a faculty meeting, principal has staff members list supervisor behaviors and practices that (1) have contributed to their professional growth and have enhanced their trust in the supervisor, and (2) have caused them worry and concern and have reduced their trust in the supervisor. Participants are encouraged to think of all supervisors they have had, including those during student teaching. Responses are made anonymously.

**STEP TWO**
Secretary or teacher volunteers sort all responses and eliminate obvious duplicate responses. A master list of the remaining responses is compiled. (Note: If the sorters cannot decide if a response is a duplicate, it should be included on the master list.) The master list will include both positive and negative responses.

**STEP THREE**
At a faculty meeting (suggestion: at least a month later), staff ranks the ten (or fifteen) most important behavior or practices for their supervisor to utilize (or avoid). Their choices can be either positive statements or negative statements from the list.

**STEP FOUR**
Secretary or teacher volunteers sort the ranked responses and develop a list of the ten (fifteen) most frequently listed behaviors or practices. The statements are typed on a list with a Likert scale by each:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supervisor gives prompt feedback.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Effective</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**STEP FIVE**
At a faculty meeting (suggestion: at least a month later), staff members anonymously rank their current supervisor(s) on each of the important behaviors or practices on the list.
The supervisor develops a plan for improving his or her effectiveness in one or two of the areas identified in Step Six. The supervisor utilizes input from peer brainstorming and from Step Seven in formulating the plan. At least one suggestion from the staff brainstorming session is utilized in the plan.

The supervisor visibly works to improve his or her effectiveness by implementing the plan developed in Step Eight. The plan is shared with staff and areas identified by the staff in Step Seven are indicated.

At a faculty meeting, the supervisor shares a recent videotape of their teaching with the staff and invites group discussion about the effectiveness of the teaching episode.

Staff members may be ready to volunteer to share videotapes of their own teaching at future faculty meetings. Other collegial activities such as collaborating together to work on solutions to school problems, working out possible strategies to assist students, or evaluating various aspects of the school program may also be used as needed to continue to build teacher trust.

At the end of the school year, or after a reasonable period of time, Step Five is repeated to measure staff perceptions of
change. Further planning is done on the basis of the reassessment.

SUMMARY: TIPS FOR EFFECTIVE SUPERVISION AND EVALUATION

1. Don't fix it if it isn't broken. Effective teachers need support and encouragement, not criticism from their supervisor.

2. If it's worth doing, it's worth doing right. Take the time to become familiar with the criteria for effective instruction and to develop effective supervisory behaviors.

3. There is no one right way to teach anything. There are a variety of teaching styles and behaviors which can result in student success. Supervisors should avoid the temptation to "remake" teachers in their own image or to fit the requirements of a particular instructional model.

4. Remember what happens to bearers of bad news. There is a story of a messenger who brought news of a war loss to an ancient king. The king had the messenger beheaded. Unless supervision is done positively with professional growth in mind, the supervisor will become about as popular as the messenger in the story.

5. Learn to listen effectively. Teachers can sometimes solve their own problem and will certainly respect a supervisor who demonstrates a willingness to listen as well as to speak.

6. An empty garbage can rattles the loudest. The best supervisors have clear objectives for conferences with teachers so that valuable time is not wasted. Good supervisors are also able to provide specific feedback to teachers about effective and ineffective behaviors they observe in a clear, concise manner.

7. Be patient. Lasting change in teacher and supervisory behavior takes time.
SUGGESTED READINGS


Howard, Eugene, Howell, Bruce, and Brainard, Edward, HANDBOOK FOR CONDUCTING SCHOOL IMPROVEMENT PROJECTS, Bloomington, IN: Phi Delta Kappa, 1987.


Lewis, James Jr., ACHIEVING EXCELLENCE IN OUR SCHOOLS ... BY TAKING LESSONS FROM AMERICA'S BEST-RUN COMPANIES, Rockleigh, NJ: Allyn and Bacon, 1986.


Maidment, Robert, "How Do You Rate Me as a Listener?" in NASSP BULLETIN, May, 1987, pps. 87-91.

Meek, Ann, "Whatever Happened to Good Vibrations?" in EDUCATIONAL LEADERSHIP, April, 1986, pps. 80-81.


Peltier, Gary L., and Matranga, Myrna, "Improving the Morale of Faculty and Staff" in NFEAS JOURNAL, Volume 5, Number 2, 1988-89.


