The purpose of Project SABOR (Sound Approaches to Bilingualism and Opportunities for Recognition) was to develop and promote native and second language skills in all curriculum areas for students in grades four to eight. Eight hundred students received instruction in English and native language arts and reading, mathematics, science, social studies, English as a Second Language, and Spanish as a Second Language. Additional program components included curriculum development, teacher training, and parent participation. Project SABOR was evaluated through consultant observations and pre- and post-test data in reading and mathematics from the Stanford Achievement Tests. Findings indicated that program participants made significant gains in academic areas. The consultant determined that Project SABOR was strong and viable. Tables of data are included. (MK)
FINAL EVALUATION REPORT - TITLE VII

1979 - 1980

FUNCTION NUMBER           PROJECT CODE
TITLE VII         5001           07601
BOARD OF EDUCATION OF THE CITY OF NEW YORK

COMMUNITY SCHOOL BOARD - DISTRICT 8

Dennis R. Coleman, President
Maria T. Color, Vice-President
Rosa Foley, Secretary
Anne L. Schuster, Treasurer
Louis M. Curcio
Alfred J. Mehmel
Hector Melendez
Joseph D. Praino
Gloria J. Vincent

Max Messer, Community Superintendent
Acknowledgments

This Project SABOR Report was prepared under the direction and supervision of Dorothy Silverman, director of evaluation. Richard E. Baecher, associate professor and director of bilingual education staff development at Fordham University prepared the narrative. Enrique Duran, School Neighborhood Worker on Project SABOR, contributed the section on the Parental Component.

Appreciation is extended to Raul Lahee, project director of SABOR; to Frank Quinones and Dorothy Weiner, resource teachers on the project; and to school principals and staff for their cooperation in the evaluation of the program.

The manuscript was typed by Carmen Olivares.
# CONTENTS

## Acknowledgments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I Achievement In Project SABOR 1979-1980</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II Project Goals And Objectives</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III Project Description</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sites</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School Staff</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District Office Staff</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV Evaluation</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedures</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Materials</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equipment</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Records</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Articulation</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Environment for Learning</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher Training</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classroom Practices</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parental Component</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District 8 First Annual Bilingual Conference</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V Conclusion</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strengths</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACHIEVEMENT IN PROJECT S430R
1979 - 1980

For a number of years District 8 has maintained a yearly district-wide testing program to ascertain the achievement progress of all its students in the areas of reading and mathematics. Such a procedure facilitates an analysis of all ability levels across the district and also enables learning gains to be reviewed for all funded programs. During the 1979-1980 school year, the Stanford Achievement, Form A, was administered in October and in May in keeping with the pretest posttest Model A design for evaluation. Students in Project S430R were included in this testing program.

Of the 801 student's registered in the program, 670 were tested in both the fall of 1979 and in the spring of 1980. This would indicate that 83.6 percent of the students participated in the program for the full year, i.e., the seven months between pretest and posttest. If those who were in the program but absent for one or both administrations of the test are considered, then the percentage is even higher. In view of the record of high mobility characteristic of the impoverished in the Southern Bronx, the stability of this student population and the apparently strong holding power of the program across all grades are remarkable. A more than satisfactory attendance rate is also reflected.

A correlated t test based upon the difference between the mean raw scores for the pretest and posttest was applied to the data. The statistical significance of the results was appraised in both reading and mathematics.
As can be seen in Table 1, all grades in the project made statistically significant gains in the reading components of the English language.

Similarly in mathematics, which is shown in Table 2, gains were highly significant for all grades. The fact that a somewhat smaller number of students (N=628) was tested in mathematics than in reading reflects a greater absentee rate on the second day of testing.

Table 1. Achievement in Reading - SABOR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Pretest Mean</th>
<th>Posttest Mean</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>t</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>57.29</td>
<td>70.93</td>
<td>13.64</td>
<td>12.46**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>48.76</td>
<td>61.12</td>
<td>12.36</td>
<td>13.53**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>46.88</td>
<td>54.95</td>
<td>8.01</td>
<td>8.85**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>31.72</td>
<td>41.83</td>
<td>10.11</td>
<td>7.07**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>39.80</td>
<td>43.77</td>
<td>3.97</td>
<td>3.28**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** p < .01

Table 2. Achievement in Mathematics - SABOR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Pretest Mean</th>
<th>Posttest Mean</th>
<th>Diff.</th>
<th>t</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>38.46</td>
<td>51.65</td>
<td>13.19</td>
<td>14.37**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>41.51</td>
<td>53.62</td>
<td>12.11</td>
<td>11.95**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>45.04</td>
<td>52.05</td>
<td>7.01</td>
<td>7.44**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>29.81</td>
<td>38.07</td>
<td>8.26</td>
<td>6.40**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>38.36</td>
<td>42.31</td>
<td>3.95</td>
<td>3.86**</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** p < .01
Analysis of the test data confirms the fact that the Title VII program in District 8 this past year functioned on a sound educational track in both the reading of English and in mathematics for its target population.
II

PROJECT GOALS AND OBJECTIVES

Within the context of District 8's on-going effort at bilingual programming, a major purpose of Project SABOR (Sound Approaches To Bilingualism and Opportunities For Recognition) was the development and promotion of native and second language skills in all curriculum areas throughout the student's preadolescent and early adolescent school years. Objectives which were primary to the proposal and which formed the basis of the program are as follows:

1. To establish and maintain a comprehensive bilingual-bicultural instructional program at the upper elementary and intermediate grades (4-8) with the greatest need; such programming would provide language arts and reading in English and in the student's native language, along with mathematics, science, social studies, English as second language (ESL), and Spanish as a second language (SSL).

2. To support and utilize bilingual learning and materials resource rooms for the distribution of curricular and professional materials and for teacher training.

3. To develop and sustain a program of teacher training in language arts, reading, mathematics, science, ESL and SSL for the teaching and paraprofessional staff through monthly workshops and school visits conducted by two bilingual resource specialists.

4. To enable parents of the target population to participate in a variety of activities, e.g., basic skills courses,
orientation conferences, guidance sessions, and monthly community meetings, thereby expanding their role in the bilingual program.

These objectives correspond to the content of the 1978 Bilingual Education Act which is an amendment to Title VII of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965. They were successfully implemented and integrated in Grades 4-8 to enable students of limited English proficiency to achieve competency in English and in their native language.
III

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

Sites

For the 1979-1980 academic school year, Project SABOR functioned in five elementary and two intermediate schools. The project was in compliance in terms of its proposed organization. Table 3 shows the distribution of schools, the proposed and actual number of classes (which are in close proximity) and the attendance area poverty percentage index for each site. The index shows that the low income level in the program is much more severe than the citywide low income cut-off for Title I of 44.25 per cent. All seven schools are located within a two mile radius of each other in the center of the Hispanic population in the Southeast Bronx. This section is known for its dilapidated and gutted buildings, its poor housing, and its abject poverty.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Schools</th>
<th>Number of Classes</th>
<th>Attendance Area Poverty Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P.S. 39</td>
<td>Proposed 3, Actual 3</td>
<td>88.22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.S. 60</td>
<td>Proposed 7, Actual 7</td>
<td>76.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.S. 62</td>
<td>Proposed 1</td>
<td>91.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.S. 75</td>
<td>Proposed 4, Actual 4</td>
<td>86.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.S. 130</td>
<td>Proposed 4</td>
<td>79.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.S. 52</td>
<td>Proposed 8, Actual 9</td>
<td>86.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.S. 74</td>
<td>Proposed 5, Actual 4</td>
<td>87.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3: Organization of Project SABOR by School and Classes
The 32 bilingual-bicultural classes were distributed across Grades 4-8. There was one combined Grade 6-7 class.

Table 4. Organization of Project SABOR by Grade

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade Level</th>
<th>No. of Individual Classes</th>
<th>No. of Combined Classes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>31</strong></td>
<td><strong>1</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in Table 4, the grade span of classes is also in accordance with the proposal. Important is the fact that the emphasis on student participation is in Grades 4 and 5. As earlier, more concentrated level of instruction would tend to increase the success rate and retention of learning.

School Staff

Classes were taught by 32 licensed bilingual teachers virtually all of whom have Master's Degrees. Most were of Hispanic background and had three or more years of teaching experience. Fifteen bilingual paraprofessionals were assigned to the project by the Bilingual Pupil Services Division of the New York Office of Bilingual Education and worked under the direct supervision of the teachers. The presence of paraprofessionals strengthened the program since their linguistic strengths and background identity with pupils tended to provide motivation and individualized learning. Table 5 shows the distribution of a highly trained and experienced staff for the project.
Table 5. Teaching Staff

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Teachers</th>
<th>Paraprofessionals</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P.S. 39</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.S. 60</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.S. 62</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.S. 75</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.S. 130</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.S. 52</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.S. 74</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Totals</strong></td>
<td><strong>32</strong></td>
<td><strong>15</strong></td>
<td><strong>47</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Students

The number of students assigned to the program was in compliance with the numbers projected in the proposal. At P.S. 62, and at P.S. 75, a decline in the student population affected the number of students in all classes, including the bilingual.

Table 6. Number of Students in SABOR

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Proposed No. Pupils</th>
<th>Actual No. Pupils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>P.S. 39</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.S. 60</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.S. 62</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.S. 75</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P.S. 130</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.S. 52</td>
<td>269</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.S. 74</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Totals</strong></td>
<td><strong>853</strong></td>
<td><strong>801</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 6 illustrates the distribution of students functioning in the program and the numbers anticipated in the program.

The average class size at the five elementary schools was 22 students. Learning in groups of this size is facilitated by the teacher's ability to provide small group and individualized instruction based upon close diagnostic analysis of each student's achievement performance. At the intermediate school level, the average class size was 28. Because of the size and organizational structure of intermediate schools, the numbers, of necessity, were somewhat larger than those in the elementary schools. It represented a number smaller, however, than the average class size of 30 in the regular classes of the New York City schools. This slight advantage, as well, enabled instruction to more closely match pupil needs more closely than would otherwise be the case.

**District Office Staff**

Supervisory and administrative activities were the responsibility of the Title VII staff located at the district office functioning in coordination with the school principals.

The project director of SABOR assisted in the implementation of the program objectives, facilitated the preparation of required materials pertaining to the project's functions and operation, and administered the district's policy related to bilingual programming. Complementing the activities of the project director were those of two bilingual resource content area specialists. One resource teacher concentrated on ESL reading and language arts; the other, on social studies and science. In addition to holding monthly workshops with bilingual instructional staff in the designated specializations, resource personnel assisted...
the director in the implementation of Project SABOR. This consisted of teacher training realized in the following way. They visited each site once a week, conferred with the principal regarding the work of the teacher to be visited that day, and then attended the bilingual teacher's class instruction. During these visits, the resource specialists observed the methods and materials employed by the teacher, discussed the lesson, and noted any request the teacher made for materials. These activities enhanced the project's viability for they provided continuous communication between the District Office and the sites.

Other district office staff included a bilingual school neighborhood worker. As specified in the proposal, he organized parental workshops, maintained close contact with various community groups, disseminated information about Project SABOR to parents and community members and prepared parents for the high school equivalency test. In this way, the parents of bilingual children were offered increased opportunities to learn about and participate in the district's bilingual program.

To accomplish its major goals of native and English language skills development for Hispanic students at the upper elementary and intermediate school levels, project staff was involved in significant curriculum activities. Wherever feasible, students were grouped for instructional purposes according to their language proficiency, i.e., English or Spanish; small group instruction was employed and Spanish and English, respectively, were used in the presentation of curriculum content. Spanish language skills were developed on a formal basis for a minimum of two periods each week. The traditional content areas such as reading, mathematics, and social studies were scheduled each day. These language and academic activities matched those stated in the proposal.
EVALUATION

Procedures

Formative, qualitative characteristics of the Title VII program were ascertained by the consultant through a series of visits to the schools. A district monitoring form was completed subsequent to each such visit. Among the factors reviewed were the roster, contact hours, materials, equipment, records, instructional methodology, staff development, articulation, and pupil progress. Information was obtained from conferences with principals, teachers, and district office staff, observation of instructional activities, and content analysis of commercial and teacher-made materials. Whenever possible, students were asked about the program.

All grades in the project and all subject areas, except science, were observed. This included reading/spelling, Lectura en Español, ESL, language arts, social studies, reading, and mathematics.

Materials

In conformity with the proposal, bilingual teachers made use of a wide variety of commercial texts and in some instances, supplemented these with teacher constructed materials. The evaluator inventoried several rooms to ascertain the range, quantity, appropriateness, and quality of the most frequently used materials. Table 7 gives the results of this inventory for a sample of eight classes.
Table 7. Materials Employed in Eight Project SABOR Classes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Excellent</th>
<th>Satisfactory</th>
<th>Poor</th>
<th>None</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Amount</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variety</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suitability</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

While the quantity of materials varied from room to room, it was never less than satisfactory; in two cases, the quantity was excellent based upon its uses in instruction. Moreover, all teachers commented favorably on the purchasing procedures of Project SABOR and on the time it took to obtain new materials.

The variety was satisfactory as can be seen by this listing of the most frequently used materials:

- Reading Basics Plus (Reading)
- McMillan Reading Program (Reading)
- Holt Basic Reading (Reading)
- The Young America (Social Studies)
- Exploring Civilizations: A Discovery Approach (Social Studies)
- Civilizations of the Past: Peoples and Cultures (Social Studies)
- Random House Math Program (Math)
- Matematica (Math)
- Laidlaw Series (Spanish reading)
- A Cada Paso (Spanish as a second language)
- Conozca Su Idioma (SSL)
All bilingual classrooms visited employed a satisfactory variety of materials.

In terms of suitability, i.e., reading level and attractive features, the materials were judged to be satisfactory. Content analysis indicated that the reading levels of the texts were well within the range of the students' reading levels and included adequate pictures and diagrams to explain concepts in different modes.

Equipment

Equipment such as tape-recorders, record players, and overhead projectors were available to all bilingual teachers through the audio-visual services at each school site. All the teachers interviewed spoke favorably of this service. Standard and imaginative procedures were incorporated in the classroom employment of machines.

The use of materials and equipment in Project SABOR was highly effective, reflecting the cooperation between district office and site staff, and the ability of bilingual teachers to meet the varied educational needs of the target population.

Records

Bilingual staff, in keeping with the proposal, engaged in the following
instructional functions:

- Grouping of students for skill development by ability level and language dominance.
- Diagnosis of student needs by means of the Stanford Achievement Test, Language Assessment Battery, informal assessment procedures, teacher judgment, and guidelines established by the Board of Education.
- Individualized instruction through the students' native language.

A recordkeeping system reflected the monitoring of student progress and instructional modification. These included teacher logs and lesson plans, diagnostic information based upon formal and informal testing, and student growth in learning.

A wide variety of lesson plans was evident. None was considered less than satisfactory. Two were excellent because of the inclusion of such details as objectives, approaches, materials (including dittos and work sheets). Pupil profile folders and attendance were well kept by the bilingual teacher indicating good training and supervision. Student notebooks were also inspected and reflected to a satisfactory degree the organization of instruction carried out in the classroom.

Articulation

Articulation between bilingual teachers and regular teachers was satisfactorily
carried out. While the bilingual classrooms were self-contained for the content areas, bilingual pupils received a variety of special services in reading and mathematics remediation. In addition, all bilingual pupils had opportunities to associate with other children in assembly programs, and in recreation and physical activities. On-site conferences with teachers and principals indicated high satisfaction with the different ways in which the bilingual and regular school program were coordinated. Many principals viewed the bilingual programs as a positive academic strength to enhance and enrich the education development of bilingual pupils; bilingual teachers, in turn, voiced a high degree of satisfaction with the support provided by the principals.

At the district office level, the project staff was in continuous communication with other district programs, e.g., testing, reading, mathematics. Furthermore, strong communication was maintained with on-site principals and bilingual teachers through telephone calls and weekly visits, thereby meeting this aspect of the proposal to a high degree.

Physical Environment for Learning

Each bilingual teacher had his/her own designated classroom; project pupils were taught reading, mathematics, social studies, Spanish as a second language, science, and English as a second language. Each content area was allotted 40-45 minutes.

Most rooms were satisfactory; a good portion was excellent. Rooms judged to be superior had an ample display on all wall space of student work such as compositions and drawings. Desks were arranged for different presentation modes, i.e., individual, small, and large group learning. Attractive posters and
plants were in abundance. All the rooms, then, were physically suitable and manifested a positive educational atmosphere.

**Teacher-Training**

The staff training program, an important objective of Project SABOR, was accomplished in a highly satisfactory manner.

Two bilingual resource specialists conducted on-site intensive training each week. Most of these sessions were on a one-to-one basis allowing for individual professional needs to be met. The acquisition and use of materials, ways to group students, different presentation modes for different concepts, and covering the required curriculum were substantially and successfully handled. Additionally, these same resource specialists met with the school principals regularly, thereby reflecting a cooperative team effort.

Monthly workshop conferences supplemented the weekly visits. Effective participation in these workshops, however, was considerably reduced because they were held after 3:00 p.m. in contrast to training sessions for other programs that were scheduled between 1:00 and 3:00 p.m. Funding for the project did not include class coverage for attendance at training conferences earlier in the day.

In general, bilingual teachers were extremely satisfied with the type and degree of teacher training provided through Project SABOR demonstrating that this objective was well achieved.
Classroom Practices

While the project objectives included functional bilingualism and content areas in English and Spanish, classroom practices directed at fulfilling these objectives varied. A sample of the activities observed in the seven schools visited, together with comments, follows.

Reading/Language Arts

The teacher asked questions to elicit student interest and then explained the different functions of letter writing: business and friendly letters were the focus. Letter format and organization, along with an example, were written on the board. Students copied the aim and letter format in their notebooks; then students were required to write a short letter to a friend inviting him to a birthday party. English or Spanish letters were allowed. After five minutes, the teacher asked four students to read their letters aloud; these were duly praised. A follow-up assignment was to be devoted to the contrast between the two types of letters.

Although five minutes was too short a time to complete the class assignment, the pace and content of the lesson were highly motivating. A combination of lecture with actual letter writing practice was excellent.

Spanish as a Second Language

The teacher asked three students to recite a Spanish poem from memory. After they were praised, the teacher moved to silent
reading with the class. She, then, asked literal questions about the content of the reading. This was followed by guided reading whereby the teacher and class read aloud. At the end of the lesson, workbook assignments were completed.

The teacher exercised excellent control over the class and modeled the use of Spanish to a high degree through interesting questions and reading aloud.

Mathematics

Three groups of students were instructed in division operations. A formula, along with three division problems, was placed on the board; while the teacher explained the formula to one group, the other groups copied and worked on problems in their notebooks. Then, the teacher moved from one group to the other and corrected student work.

Teacher rapport and movement around the room during the lesson were excellent. The lesson plan could have been enhanced through ditto materials, thereby avoiding all students looking at the backboard at the same time.

English as a Second Language

The class was divided into two groups. After students wrote their homework assignments in the notebooks, the teacher asked for the difference between a question mark and a period at the end of a sentence.
Practice on ten sentences from the textbook was completed. Next, the paraprofessional modeled an English sentence. This was followed by the formation of a question exercise which was done in student notebooks. The last part of lesson had small group instruction conducted by the teacher and the paraprofessional.

Variety, fast pacing, superb cooperation between teacher and paraprofessional, and direct use of materials and equipment characterized this lesson. While more attention could have been given to different intonation patterns in English and Spanish, the objectives of the lesson were accomplished in an excellent manner.

The most frequently observed classroom practices included the following:

- Dividing the class into at least two groups, one assigned work from the text and the other presented content by the teacher
- Eliciting answers to selected questions based upon lesson materials
- Correcting student errors
- Using visual aids to present difficult concepts, e.g., fractions, sets, cultural and linguistic contrasts
- Having students score their vocabulary test papers
- Having students read aloud in Spanish or English from a text or material on the blackboard
Most teachers employed small grouping patterns for instruction; a number relied solely on large group instruction. These patterns were employed successfully depending upon the nature of the daily lesson. More individualized instruction, viewed as the degree to which a particular student received unique assignments within a class, would have increased the variety of classroom practices to a considerable degree and would have strengthened the effectiveness of learning.

Students

In addition to these most frequent classroom practices, observations of student behaviors during actual lessons and the results of conversations with selected pupils after these lessons confirm the success of Project SABC activities. Despite the complexity associated with bilingual programming, student responses to instruction were attentive, enthusiastic, and eager. This attitudinal cluster was evident in large and small group instruction; moreover, teacher presentations, specific directions, and feedback expressed in English and Spanish, were appreciated by the bilingual students, as evidenced through their receptivity to classroom work. Neither discipline nor management problems were evident. A positive demeanor, then, among the majority of bilingual learners was prevalent, indicating a connection among the various aspects of classroom instruction, i.e., evidence of praise, acceptance of students' ideas, bilingual mode of teaching, and student achievement. Furthermore, in the instances in which students were asked about their learning in the class, responses were positive and informative. These conversations revealed the high degree of interest the students had in the program.
Parental Component

Since Title VII legislation requires parent participation in bilingual programs, the purpose of the Parental Component of Project SABOR in 1979-1980 was to foster parental and community involvement in the educational process, particularly in bilingual education programs.

Parents were encouraged to involve themselves in school-sponsored activities through Project SABOR and through the Parent Association. They were informed about the need for and the principles of bilingual education. In addition, they were provided with ways to supplement and follow up on tasks performed by their children at school.

During the school year 1979-1980, the staff of the Parental Component of Project SABOR which was administered in all its aspects by the project director, was composed of the following:

A Senior School Neighborhood Worker – District Office
A School Neighborhood Worker – P.S. 60
A Family Worker – P.S. 39 (three days a week);
   P.S. 62 (two days a week)
A Family Worker – P.S. 75
A Family Worker – P.S. 130
A Family Worker – I.S. 174

The role of the Senior School Neighborhood Worker was to train the Family Workers and to guide the activities of the Parental Component at each site.
He and the Family Workers were responsible for maintaining a parents' room at each school, providing workshops, organizing activities, and acting as a liaison between parents and school.

He also visited each school once or twice a week to coordinate activities and to conduct the adult education program.

The Bilingual Advisory Committee was an important part of the Parental Component of Project SABOR. It was composed of five parents from each participating school and of two members representing a community organization such as the United Bronx Parents. The formation of the Bilingual Advisory Committee came about in October of 1979 through elections and consultations with the Principal and the Parent Association of each school. The Bilingual Advisory Committee met monthly on a rotating basis at each school participating in the Project. It prepared by-laws, elected its Executive Board, and helped to organize some of the special events of the Parental Component.

Activities were of two kinds: those conducted on a regular schedule, and those designated as special events. In the parents' rooms, activities such as sewing, knitting, and other arts and crafts were on a daily basis. The arts and crafts, done by the parents, were regularly displayed in these rooms. The purpose of these activities was to welcome parents to the program, and to foster participation in the school.

A program of adult education for the parents was created. Basic courses in English as a second language were taught at three schools. In
addition, a pilot program of training for the High School Equivalency Examination in Spanish was started. A total of forty-two parents registered for this program. The Equivalency Program began in January, 1980. By June, thirteen parents were ready to take the test. Eight passed which represents a success rate of 61.5 per cent. The purpose of this program was not only to meet a real need among parents who wished to learn more, but also to give them a sense of accomplishment and respect. Indirectly, the children also benefited in the sense that parents were setting a good example for them.

Various conferences were offered parents. The goal was to have a major meeting every month. Workshops on Career Education were organized. Ms. Elva Sanabria from the Bronx Center for Career and Occupational Services presented two workshops, one on careers for parents, and the other on the selection of a secondary school. Mrs. Mae Kramer, a career counselor, presented a workshop on how parents can help their children choose a career. Leadership training for parents was presented by Ms. Alice Cardona from the United Parents Association. All schools in Project SABOR were invited to participate. The census and job opportunities were the topics presented by the Seneca Center of Hunts Point. Beyond this, each school organized conferences on health, housing, and nutrition.

A Family Worker, along with the other Family Workers, organized a Fashion Show in which parents and children participated. This event was well attended by parents from all the SABOR schools. Other events were held at different schools throughout the year on Valentine's Day, Puerto Rican Discovery Day, etc. The purpose of all these activities was to promote better relations among the various segments of the community.
Response to these events was heartening; the number of parents participating in the program increased during the year and an atmosphere for new ideas and more involvement was created.

District 8 First Annual Bilingual Conference

Title VII staff and parents organized the First Annual Bilingual Conference in the spring. Workshops, demonstration lessons and publishers' exhibits were made available to administrators, staff, and parents. Teachers shared in an intradistrict exchange of successful methodologies in bilingual education.

A high degree of self-confidence and skill was demonstrated by the bilingual teachers.

The goals and objectives of the conference were:

1. To promote unity and to foster understanding among diversified language groups
2. To develop a positive self-concept and cultural understanding
3. To improve performance in reading skills, mathematics, social studies, and science
4. To develop and strive for meaningful parental involvement in the education of their children
5. To provide instructional and support personnel
at all levels with bilingual/bicultural teaching methodology, strategies, and techniques

6. To provide an opportunity for conference participants to review commercial and teacher-made materials

The conference was well-attended and highly successful. Plans have already begun for the Second District 8 Annual Bilingual Conference.
CONCLUSION

In general, Project SABOR successfully met the goals and objectives as specified in its 1979-80 proposal.

Strengths

1. A strong and viable bilingual program was provided to Hispanic students of the South Bronx; they received instruction in language arts and reading in English and Spanish, respectively, along with mathematics, science, social studies, ESL, and SSL.

2. Bilingual staff was involved in teacher training activities through the effective services provided by two bilingual resource specialists. By means of weekly visits and monthly workshops, these specialists provided assistance on an individual and collective basis.

3. Project SABOR successfully maintained two bilingual learning and resource rooms.

4. A satisfactory supply of instructional materials was used in the project as evidenced through classroom observation and expressed teacher satisfaction.

5. Heavy emphasis upon English language skills acquisition was demonstrated. While categorical descriptions tend to simplify education realities one way that describes Project SABOR is that it was a "bilingual concurrent translation program with ESL and SSL supports." English and Spanish were employed alternately during the same lessor.
received English as a second language at least once a day, and Spanish as a second language for a minimum of two periods each week. English was the more frequently used language during instruction, reflecting current trends in bilingual education.

Recommendations

These recommendations are the outcome of school visits, interviews with principals and bilingual staff of Project SABOR, and observations of bilingual classroom practices.

1. Use the techniques of individualized instruction to a much greater degree so that bilingual students receive unique assignments that match their academic needs.

2. Increase the variety of materials for Spanish as a second language instruction; in addition to texts on the structure of the language, more literature and stories in Spanish would enhance this aspect of the project.

3. Create more opportunities for fluent bilingual students to increase their academic skills in both English and Spanish; these students can benefit from a stronger and more balanced emphasis on the use of both languages in instruction.

4. Enhance the effectiveness of teacher training efforts by scheduling workshops with bilingual teachers before 3:00 p.m. as is the practice in other district programs. A cluster approach whereby staff from three or four schools in the same vicinity meet might be feasible and reasonable. This practice would make the bilingual teachers...
28

a more cohesive group and increase their training skills.

5. Some topics for future training sessions might include:
   - practical techniques in individualizing instruction
   - the use of different questioning approaches
   - how instructional time is used
   - effective use of audio-visual aids
   - varying teaching styles among different bilingual learners

6. Increase opportunities in the bilingual classroom for the practice and mastery of those academic skills reflected in the tests, e.g., L.A.B., Stanford Achievement Tests, California Achievement Tests. Greater use of class tests, unit exams, and teacher quizzes, along with identification of the English language skills being evaluated through the District's norm-referenced testing instruments, are to be encouraged.

7. Establish a coherent set of procedures that avoids the confusion resulting from the different policies of the Aspira Consent Decree, Lau Remedies, and expressed goals of Title VII. For example, one school's bilingual classes were organized according to the student's dominance in English or Spanish. Therefore, one class was instructed mostly in English (the English dominant class) and another class at the same grade level was taught mostly in Spanish. However, the Aspira Decree asserts that social studies and science are to be presented in Spanish for Aspira eligible pupils. Since these students belonged to both classes, the program was reorganized to meet the criteria of the Aspira Consent Decree. The problems increase when other legal decisions impact upon the bilingual classroom.