A longitudinal study of two classes of medical students who entered Tel Aviv and Hadassah medical schools in 1969 follows students through their first year of graduate medical education. A summary of a final project report, this study reviews the continuing change in the students to distinguish the effects of qualities they bring to medical school from those they acquire at various stages of the educational socialization process. The major findings and applications in eight areas are discussed: (1) the development of three elements (people, status, and science) in the physician's role in the course of medical school; (2) the conflicting messages received by students from significant others, and the need for guidance; (3) the need for socialization of physicians as potential health team members; (4) a resistance to family medicine and community practice; (5) traditionalism and stereotyping of women physicians after (but not before) completion of studies; (6) the inefficiency of using role perception as a criterion for medical school admission; (7) the results of narrowing interests to science too early; and (8) advantages found in a break in the study program between secondary and medical schools. (MSE)
Israel Study of Socialization for Medicine
The Research Digest Series is published by the National Center for Health Services Research (NCHSR) to provide overviews of significant research supported by NCHSR. The series describes either ongoing or completed projects directed toward high priority health services problems. Issues are prepared by the principal investigators performing the research, in collaboration with NCHSR staff. Digests are intended for an interdisciplinary audience of health services planners, administrators, legislators, and others who make decisions on research applications.

Abstract

This is a longitudinal study of two classes of medical students who entered Tel Aviv and Hadassah medical schools in 1969. They were followed through their first year of graduate medical education. The study maps the continuing change in the students to separate out the effects of qualities the students bring with them to medical school versus those they acquire at different stages of the socialization process. Outcomes are specialty choice and preferred practice location.
Israel Study of Specialization for Medicine

by

Judith Shuval

October 1978

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION, AND WELFARE
Public Health Service
Office of the Assistant Secretary for Health
National Center for Health Services Research

DHEW Publication No. (PHS) 79-3231
Foreword

Rarely in professional education research has it been possible to study a cohort of students as intensively as Judith Shuval has done in this report on medical education in Israel. The National Center for Health Services Research supported the study from 1969 through 1974 under P.L.-480 and from 1974 to 1976 under Grant HS 01857. This enabled Professor Shuval to obtain data on these students from their applications to medical school, which, in the Israeli system, includes pre-medical education, through their first year of graduate medical education.

The significance of this research for the United States relates to the impact of the health services delivery system on the expectations of medical students. Virtually all physicians in Israel work in salaried care clinics of the Kupat Holim, the comprehensive health insurance system of Israel. Student expectations are fairly circumscribed, therefore, regarding monetary gains. Status is centered on hospital employment and only those who fail to achieve this status go into primary care clinics. The country with one of the highest physician to population ratios in the world still is characterized by a lack of physicians for primary care at the community level.

There are lessons to learn from such international studies as we embark on efforts to redistribute health manpower and to develop national health insurance plans.

Gerald Rosenthal, Ph.D.
National Center for Health Services Research
October 1978
### Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Settings and goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The two medical schools: summary of similarities and differences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Theory and design</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Role transformation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Design strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Major findings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Development of the physician's role: people, status and science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Multiple socializers—conflicting messages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Team practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Family medicine and community practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Women in medicine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Concerning selection of medical students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Early narrowing of interests</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Hiatus between secondary and medical schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>References</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This issue of the NCHSR Research Digest Series by Judith T. Shuval, Ph.D., summarizes her work at Hebrew University, Hadassah Medical School, Jerusalem, Israel. The research was performed for NCHSR under grant No. HS 01857.

The final report of the grant, 319 pages, is for sale to the public from the National Technical Information Service, Springfield, VA 22161 (703/557-4650), and may be ordered as PB 284 466 in either paper or microfiche.

NCHSR publications are available on request from NCHSR, Publications and Information Branch, room 7-44, 3700 East-West Highway, Hyattsville, MD 20782 (tel.: 301/436-8970). Current NCHSR publications are listed in the back of this publication.
Settings and goals

Why Israel?

Why another study of medical education? And why of all places in Israel?

The answers to these questions focus on qualities that Israel shares with other Western societies as well as on certain of its unique features with respect to medical education and the delivery of medical care. The common qualities are sufficient to provide a basis for generalization of certain findings to other cultural settings so that Israel serves as an additional case in the list of in-depth studies of professional socialization. Some of the unique features that characterize Israel today are likely to develop or are in the process of developing in the United States, in Western Europe and in other societies. This research can therefore provide an insightful "future look" at what medical education may eventually be like there. This study, while based in Israel, aims to serve both as a link in a chain and as an innovative contribution to the field of socialization for medicine.

The structure and timing of medical education in Israel parallel the systems in both Eastern and Western Europe which generally start immediately following secondary school and last six to seven years. The secondary school background from which Israeli students come to medical school bears strong structural similarities to the systems prevalent in much of Western Europe. The academic type of secondary school in which most medical students have previously studied is a selective, streamed system which admits candidates after inappropriate ones have been weeded out and prepares them for the nationally administered matriculation examinations. About 15 percent of the age cohort complete these examinations annually and of these only those with an average of 8 or over may apply to the medical schools considered here. It may thus be seen that severe selection has taken place early in the game, before the individual puts in his application for medical school.

An additional similarity to their European counterparts is seen in the fact that Israeli medical students have been heavily exposed to the sciences at an early age: 80 percent studied in the biology or mathematics stream in secondary school. This results in a relatively early narrowing and focusing of interest in the sciences with only limited exposure to the humanities or social sciences. This pattern reflects an earlier trend to specialization in Europe and Israel which contrasts with
the United States where decisions concerning career lines and specialization of interests take place at a somewhat later age. Before entering medical school, U.S. students are exposed to an undergraduate college program which usually includes at least some non-science subjects even if they have majored in the sciences.

On the other hand, the curricular content of medical education in Israel as well as its dominant value system are oriented to the United States which has strongly influenced the medical profession in Israel in recent years. There is substantial interchange of scientific knowledge and personnel among professionals; many students manage to travel and some do electives in the U.S. Needless to say, much American influence has also rubbed off on European medical practitioners particularly with respect to scientific contributions to the profession. Thus the principal professional model toward which socialization is leading approximates the American and Western European models fairly closely and the major mechanisms of training are similar to those prevalent in those countries. In fact, it is likely that the basic social and psychological processes underlying professional socialization are probably fairly universal and are not fundamentally culture bound. For these reasons many of the findings of this research are generalizable.

Virtually all physicians in Israel work in salaried posts. To the extent that private practice exists, it is marginal and supplementary to the dominant system of medical care delivery in which there are organized settings of ambulatory or hospital care in which groups of physicians, working on a salaried basis, deliver the service. The trend in the U.S. in recent years has been away from solo practice and increasingly toward the bureaucratization of medical practice in large scale "health factories" (American Medical Association, 1975; McKinlay, 1967). A similar trend is evident in much of Europe. Thus the present Israeli salaried system exemplifies, in a structural sense, the probable future direction of medical practice in these countries.

Israel needs primary care on the community level. In this aspect it is similar to many other countries where such care has been conspicuous by its absence, but where there is a real concern with delivery of medical care to large, often heterogeneous or deprived populations. Like other societies Israel is struggling against powerful odds to meet the problem of a system of medical education that highlights hospital practice as well as technology-based medicine as an ideal, while tending to down-grade less "sophisticated" community based practice. Students who internalize this clearly delivered message tend to focus their career hopes on elite hospital practices. There is only marginal exposure to family practice during the course of medical education and it is therefore not surprising that students enter a variety of specialties but relatively few have opted in the past for family practice. In Israel this issue is exacerbated by a variety of problems in the primary care clinics (Shuval, 1970); heavy patient load, poorer laboratory facilities and technical equipment, fewer collegial contacts, fewer scientific resources, and inevitably fewer "interesting" cases.
The existence in Israel of a comprehensive health insurance system (Kupat Holini) which provides full medical care to more than 80 percent of the population serves as a general background to medical education. Both students and teachers are aware that fee-for-service is essentially a marginal pattern and most segments of the population expect and are entitled to full medical care, including drugs and other expensive services, with minimal or no direct cost. Such a structure sets up systems of mutual expectations of deliverers and recipients of medical care that differ from those prevalent in systems in which there is no medical insurance or incomplete coverage. As comprehensive insurance schemes become more widespread in the United States and cover larger portions of the population in Europe, certain aspects of such schemes will come to approximate the Israeli system. The Israeli experience can thus prove useful in demonstrating how medical education functions in the context of this type of delivery system.

The setting and design of this study provide certain unique features of interest to medical educators and practitioners outside Israel. The longitudinal design focuses on classes that entered two medical schools in 1969; the research provides systematic data on the same populations which have been under constant study for a full six-year period. Such a design permits a detailed mapping of change patterns during socialization and their pin-pointing to specific stages in the process. This long time-perspective permits a study of the early roots of processes which in the U.S.-based research have been investigated after students complete their first degree, when they enter medical school (Bloom, 1971; Merton, 1957; Frederiks & Mundy, 1976). Since the formal educational process of medical education begins in Israel after secondary school with no intervening first degree program, and lasts six years, the research provides insight into a considerably longer process of socialization and can examine early patterns which may be relevant to subsequent professional practice. No such long-range design has been attempted in Europe to date.

Some of the processes under study will be examined on a cross-occupational basis, comparing socialization for medicine with socialization for other health occupations. Such a comparative analysis highlights features which medical socialization shares with socialization for other health occupations as well as its unique qualities.

In fact, this research is still incomplete. The real outcome variables of medical socialization may be seen during the practicing physician's developing career. Indeed it is our intention to pursue this research on into the careers of the students reported on in this volume. However, that is a long range effort and the present report on the first six years represents a necessary segment of the full process. Outcomes of medical education considered during this period of time may not be the same as those characterizing later stages in the physician's career, but they are of interest in themselves from a different, shorter-range perspective. Indeed, understanding the processes which occur during the period stretching from application to medical school until comple-
tion of formal training is a necessary condition for the subsequent analysis.

Goals

The principal objective of this research is to trace the development of certain outcomes of medical education through the course of professional socialization, starting when students are still laymen and unexposed to the socialization process all the way to the endpoint of formal socialization. The outcomes on which we will focus concern the central norms of the professional role and career preferences as expressed in terms of specialty choice as well as preferred locus of eventual practice. The study follows students through the end of year six that immediately precedes internship.

The purpose of a close, continuous mapping of change is to separate out the effects of qualities which students import into medical school from orientations acquired at different stages during the socialization process. Thus the analysis is geared to distinguish the relative contributory effects of (a) variables imported into the training situation, (b) variables activated during formal training, and (c) variables that become relevant only after formal training is completed. This analytic procedure indicates which antecedent variables are likely to be relevant to outcomes and when their effect is likely to take place.

The outcomes at this point may be viewed as early outcomes of medical education and they may well exhibit further change in a variety of directions during the course of practice. Nevertheless these early outcomes are themselves of interest. They are the result of a long and complex process that is a function of elements stemming from three different temporal and situational contexts: factors in the individual's life history in the period preceding formal socialization, events and experiences that took place inside the socializing institution during the six-year period as well as events and experiences that took place in the wider social system during the latter period and which impinged directly or indirectly on students undergoing socialization. Elements from each of these three contexts will be considered in the analysis and will be defined in terms of quantifiable variables or in terms of social and cultural themes characterizing the macro or micro social system under study.

Our interest will focus on the structural, social and cultural factors that operate in these three areas rather than on the idiosyncratic characteristics of each individual—although the latter undoubtedly also play a role in socialization. In this sense the study is sociological rather than psychological in its orientation.

The two medical schools: summary of similarities and differences

The curricula of the two medical schools are quite similar and the differences between them are more in the timing of certain subjects than in their content. However, there are a number of differentiating
features that are a result of historical and ideological differences between them.

The Hebrew University Medical School is an older school which has established its reputation for quality training and original research for over twenty years. Many of its graduates have attained considerable status in Israel and abroad and occupy leading medical posts in the country. The Tel Aviv Medical School began admitting first year students in 1966 and its graduates are only beginning to establish its reputation. Its staff is composed partly of graduates of the Hebrew University and its Medical School and of other qualified scientists, many of whom had well established careers and reputations at the time the school was opened.

On its founding, the Tel Aviv Medical School stated that one of its major goals would be to train physicians for community care. With this goal in mind it included a larger program of behavioral sciences in its pre-clinical curriculum at the time the study was initiated. The Jerusalem school has never made this claim overtly; its reputation and image tend to emphasize its research achievements.

A major structural difference between the schools appears in the clinical period of training and is associated with the nature and number of affiliated hospitals in which training takes place. In the Jerusalem Medical School the Hadassah Hospital is the one dominant training institution which serves the Medical School and the five affiliated hospitals are used for training in only a few departments. Despite the fact that students may be exposed to other hospital settings, they all feel strongly affiliated with the Hadassah Hospital, which provides the dominant clinical experience in terms of time spent in its departments. In the Tel Aviv Medical School clinical training is spread among departments in fifteen affiliated hospitals and, while students spend more time in some than in others, there is no one dominant hospital in which training is concentrated. Such a setting exposes students to a greater variety of socializers and clinical experiences so that their training is based on a more diffuse set of messages (Bentwich, 1965; Davis, 1949; Dostrovsky, 1949; Dostrovsky, 1959; Grushka, 1968; Gjebin, 1959; Ha'aretz, 1964; Prywes, 1956).

A unique feature of the Israeli system is the fact that the medical schools select their students from two separate pools of candidates: the army veterans and the army reservists. It will be recalled that most young people in Israel complete their army service before continuing their higher education. However the military authorities require the medical schools to accept a predetermined number of high school graduates immediately upon completion of their secondary school education with the intention that these "army reservists" will fulfill their obligatory national service as army physicians after completing medical school. Before obtaining permission to apply for medical school, potential candidates for the reserve undergo a pre-selection process by the army and only those with high scholastic achievement records in high school who also meet the army's stringent physical
fitness requirements obtain permission to apply for the medical school as army reservists. Army reservists are instructed to apply to both medical schools, but not all such candidates fulfilled this requirement. However, as will be seen in this chapter, the large common pool makes it problematic to compare pools of army reservist applicants to the two schools.

Since the medical schools know in advance how many such army reservists they will admit, they select these students separately from the pool of army reservist applicants to each school. The other candidates for medical school, largely men and women who have completed their national service, form a second pool from which the schools select. Each medical school utilizes the same admission criteria for the two sub-sets of applicants.

In view of this procedure it is evident that differences in the pool and eventually in the groups admitted may originate in differences between the army reservists and the army veterans who differ fundamentally in age and exposure to army experiences.

In sum, the differences between the reservists and the army veterans are not only a function of the age differential and the greater exposure of the latter to the maturing effects of army experience. In fact, the reservist applicants stem from a somewhat different segment of the society: this is seen in their higher socio-economic status, stronger religious orientation, "elite," science-based high school background and strong academic achievement in secondary school. They also tend to come from extended families in which there are physicians. On the other hand, the decision to apply for medical school is at least partly a function of the age difference between the groups: the younger reservists admit more parental influence while the more mature veterans state that they discussed their occupational decision and consulted with physician acquaintances in making up their minds, and were more influenced by friends who had already begun to study medicine. But insofar as their image of the profession is concerned and their career plans, there are few differences between the two groups.

A comparative portrait of the two classes is presented in the following table.
### The two classes: a comparative portrait (percentages)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Tel Aviv Medical School</th>
<th>Jerusalem Medical School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>General background</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Home community</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three major cities</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other urban communities</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New towns</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Villages &amp; Kibbutzim</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arab towns &amp; villages</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sex</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Females</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Age</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19 and under</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20–23</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24 and over</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Country of origin</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe**</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Near East or North Africa***</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Father’s education</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University graduate</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High School*</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Did not complete high school</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Socio-economic status</strong>*</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Self-defined religious observance</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extremely orthodox</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat traditional</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-observant</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Type of high school</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elite****</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Good</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Percentages do not always add up to 100 since all categories are not always presented.
** Includes those who immigrated from a European country or are the children of such immigrants.
*** Includes those who immigrated from a North African or Near Eastern country or are the children of such immigrants.
**** Based on father’s education and occupation.
***** “Elite” high schools include those exercising highest standards in selecting students for admission and having a reputation of high scholastic requirements.
### The two classes: a comparative portrait (percentages) continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>High School Background</th>
<th>Tel Aviv Medical School</th>
<th>Jerusalem Medical School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Curriculum stream</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Math-physics</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Biology</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humanities</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Professional commitment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age medicine first considered seriously</th>
<th>Tel Aviv Medical School</th>
<th>Jerusalem Medical School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Before 14</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14–17</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18+</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

“Never considered an occupation other than medicine” | 19 | 8 |

“Certain that medicine is the only occupation from which I will gain satisfaction” | 27 | 27 |

### Early contact with medicine and decision making

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Family contact</th>
<th>Tel Aviv Medical School</th>
<th>Jerusalem Medical School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Physicians in nuclear family</td>
<td>/ 14</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physicians in extended family</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No physicians in family</td>
<td>3 / 1</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Early contact with profession

“Knew more than 5 physicians personally” | 50 | 27 |

“Discussed the nature of the profession often with physician acquaintances” | 53 | 32 |

“Consulted with more than 3 physician acquaintances about application for medical school” | 18 | 12 |

*Percentages do not always add up to 100 since all categories are not always presented.*
The two classes: a comparative portrait (percentages) continued

"Early contact with medicine and decision making

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>Tel Aviv Medical School</th>
<th>Jerusalem Medical School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Influenced my decision to study medicine&quot; **</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physician acquaintances</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friends who are medical students</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parents</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family members in medicine</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Books, movies, plays, press</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family members not involved in medicine</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High school teachers</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family tradition</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friends who are not medical students</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Image of the medical profession

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>&quot;Modern-medicine demands even more idealism than in the past&quot;</th>
<th>22</th>
<th>24</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Normative role components of the competent physician ***

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component</th>
<th>Tel Aviv Medical School</th>
<th>Jerusalem Medical School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>People</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Science</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Status</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

"Certain that family medicine is needed in Israel" 74 74

Uncertainty of Medicine

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Uncertainty</th>
<th>Tel Aviv Medical School</th>
<th>Jerusalem Medical School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Two doctors can have different opinions&quot;</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Doctor frequently uses guesswork and intuition&quot;</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Doctor can't be certain of the effects of a specific drug on a patient&quot;</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Importance of patient's social background

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Importance</th>
<th>Tel Aviv Medical School</th>
<th>Jerusalem Medical School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&quot;Very important&quot;</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Percentages do not always add up to 100 since all categories are not always presented.
** Influenced my decision "a lot."
*** Measures based on mean scores of items with categories ranging from 1 (Component is very important) to 5 (Component is not important at all).
The two classes: a comparative portrait (percentages) continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Career Plans</th>
<th>Tel Aviv Medical School</th>
<th>Jerusalem Medical School</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Community clinic**</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private practice</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hospital</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research, teaching institution</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Percentages do not always add up to 100 since all categories are not always presented.

** In Israel a career in a community clinic almost always involves a salaried post working for one of the medical insurance funds such as Kupat Holim.
Role transformation

Professional socialization may be viewed as a special form of adult socialization. Brim has noted that adult socialization generally does not focus as much on basic values as does childhood socialization, except when it deals with the training of costly manpower (Brim, 1966). Medical personnel undoubtedly fall under this category and there is good reason to believe that professional values and norms are indeed internalized by medical students during the course of their socialization, especially during the clinical period.

We assume that professional socialization is not necessarily a smooth, single-directional process, but is characterized by intermittent conflict and reconciliation between socializers and socializees. In this sense it is similar to earlier periods of socialization. There is movement forward into the new role, but also regression into more familiar old roles (Gesell and Ilg, 1943). Olesen and Whitaker (1970) have pointed to the overemphasis on the "smoothness" of socialization: in fact the process is characterized by considerable conflict and ambiguity in terms of the messages delivered and picked up. In the long run, orderly socialization naturally requires that the balance of these two directional movements will favor the forward thrust. However, the two patterns may occur in temporal proximity and may even be instigated by the same socializing agent.

Students are active agents in the process, selecting and rejecting from the numerous stimuli to which they are exposed during formal socialization. Not only are there "models" to be emulated but there are "anti-models" whose style is to be avoided.

Formal Socialization: seven years of medical school: clearly defined boundaries.

Formal medical socialization in Israel can be divided into four sub-periods:

- $B_1$—pre-medical: one year
- $B_2$—pre-clinical: two and a half years
- $B_3$—clinical: two and a half years
- $B_4$—internship: one year

The pre-medical and pre-clinical sub-periods ($B_1$, $B_2$) are characterized by the following qualities:
little professional role playing by students.
- strong academic emphasis in traditional sense: grade models; scientists, few clinicians
- students tend to put off immediate gratification of professional interests and role playing
- style of teaching—similar to secondary school experience
- Characteristics of the clinical and internship periods (B₃, B₄) are as follows:
  - relatively unstructured learning situation
  - need to confront "real" clinical patients and play responsible professional role
  - confrontation with clinical reality which needs to be reconciled with expectations
  - many agents of socialization: clinical teachers, nurses, patients, other hospital personnel, other students
  - inconsistent messages from different socializing agents
  - mixture of authoritarian and "collegial" relations with teachers

Design strategy

These considerations dictate the basic design of the research and the variables included. The study is a longitudinal one focusing on two classes of medical students who entered the Hebrew University-Hadassah Medical School and the Tel Aviv University Medical School in 1969. These students were under continuous study for the full six-year period of their formal study as well as during their internship. Parallel research following a complementary design and including many of the same variables was carried on in the Schools of Dentistry and Pharmacy of the Hebrew University and at the Henrietta Szold School of Nursing. The present volume focuses on socialization for medicine.

The following types of data were collected on a continuous basis, since 1969, for the two populations.

1. Observation in situ of the cultural context of teaching and learning situations, both formal and informal, by teams of anthropologists and sociologists. Detailed protocols, structured around a set of predefined categories, were geared to add a qualitative dimension to the systematic questionnaire data.

2. Systematic attitudinal and factual data gathered by means of questionnaires completed by all candidates for admission before entry, T₀, and by students at the termination of each year of study: T₁, T₂, T₃, T₅*, T₆, (T₇)**. Selected variables were systematically repeated at intervals to permit measurement of change. In addition data were

- Due to a physicians' strike and The October War, T₄ was missed.
- Analysis from T₇ are not included in this report.
gathered on variables idiosyncratic to a specific year of study. Grades of students at the end of each year were recorded.

3. Interviews with samples of students to gain in-depth information on selected subjects which were not amenable to questionnaire techniques.

4. Interviews with teachers of all levels, both pre-clinical and clinical, who have contact with these students. The interviews were structured to parallel parts of the student questionnaires in order to permit comparisons of socializers' and socializees' attitudes and orientations.

The long range longitudinal design of the study makes possible the special approach of the analysis and provides for strategies that are unique to this form of research. Starting data collection at the time of application permits analysis which separates pre-socialization variables from variables which are introduced in the course of socialization. Repeated measurements of the same variable on the same population at different times permits a dynamic analysis of processes over time.

'Change during socialization examined from a variety of viewpoints will be considered in terms of its microprocesses as well as its overall patterns. The following strategies and techniques will be utilized separately and jointly in the course of the analysis:

A. Examination of aggregate change in the group by use of means and distribution of variables at different times.

B. Analysis of patterns of individual change, by use of correlations between times. In addition to use of zero-order correlations, we have utilized models of regression analysis in a multivariate approach when assumptions of linearity seemed justified. The time sequence of variables measured at various time intervals during socialization permits assumptions of causal ordering when this is warranted by the content of the variables. This strategy permits a consideration of several types of subprocesses during socialization:

(1) Primacy: extent to which attitudes or behavior patterns imported into medical school from the lay community persist to later stages and, most important, to the outcome stages.

(2) Continuity: extent of smoothness or discontinuity between various stages of the socialization process.

(3) Crystallization of outcomes: stage or stages at which the outcomes of medical education appear to be determined.

C. Analysis of transition processes between contiguous or distant times by means of turnover tables. Following the Lazarsfeld approach as well as the tradition of stochastic processes (Markov chain analysis and analysis in the Coleman tradition), we will examine subsegments of the change process and through such micro-processes obtain a picture of the overall patterning. Markov chains and Coleman's approach have been used only when it has seemed appropriate to assume that the process at a given stage is independent of earlier or later stages (Col-

D. Analysis based on data collected during systematic observation of the socialization process in situ. Trained observers watched students during formal and informal socialization as well as during leisure-time activities. Attention was focused on the values and norms of the student culture, on patterns of inter-student and student-teacher interaction, on group structure and processes within the class, on feelings expressed with respect to medical school and the future professional role, on attitudes toward other medical personnel and patients. This material is presented in a separate chapter concerning cultural themes in medical education and is also woven into the quantitatively-based chapters in order to anchor interpretations of the data in the reality of the culture context.
The following are some of the major findings and applications of the study.

Development of the physician's role: people, status and science components

Students perceive the physician's role to structure in terms of three dominant role components. We have termed these the People, Status and Science components of the physician's role. The People component concerns qualities which relate to the physician's interaction with others on both a collegial and client level. The Status component includes traits which focus on the practitioner's place in the organization of the profession with particular reference to its hierarchical structure. The Science component relates to knowledge, research and other cognitive areas. It has been shown that students show a remarkable similarity and consistency over time during socialization in the priority they attribute to the three components: the People component is viewed as most important, Status is viewed as lowest in priority, while Science falls between the two.

This order of priority has been found among students of three other health occupations (dentistry, pharmacy and nursing) with similar consistency during all stages of socialization. While there are differences in the absolute emphasis placed on these components by individuals preparing for different health occupations, the parallel ordering in priority suggests a strong common basic orientation among these groups which could be exploited with a view toward future collaboration and team work among them.

Among the medical students there is a consistent decrease during socialization in the absolute emphasis placed on the importance of the People and Science components, although these components retain their positions of relative priority, as noted above. The absolute emphasis on the importance of the Status component does not change during socialization and it therefore acquires a somewhat stronger relative position in the light of the attenuation in the other two components. We may therefore conclude that the organizational aspects of practice, although viewed as less important than the interaction and scientific components, are nevertheless acquiring a relatively greater importance as socialization proceeds.
Multiple socializers—conflicting messages

This research has highlighted the complexity of the socialization process by pointing to the large variety of socializers to whom students are exposed and to the heterogeneous, often conflicting messages they deliver. We have noted the various roles and statuses of socializing agents: senior and junior clinicians, residents, nurses, other medical students (both advanced and peers), patients, aides, technicians and others. It has generally been assumed that the senior physician, the star, sets the tone and serves as the dominant model for students undergoing socialization. This assumption has been challenged by the present research in view of the large number of significant others that play critical roles in socialization. There is also evidence that some physicians serve as anti-models for students.

What appears to be needed is some direction for students, especially during the clinical period of training, to guide them among these conflicting messages.

Team Practice

With the growing emphasis on a team approach to medical care, it has become increasingly important to consider relations among team members as well as means of preparing such members for practice involving task differentiation and cooperation. While dentists and physicians are not the most frequently found members of the same health team, there are nevertheless areas of common interest which require their cooperation in healthcare. Moreover, the joint socialization observed in this research of these two groups of practitioners during their first three years of professional training can shed light on how such ventures might succeed with other combinations of health occupations.

The findings suggest that basic professional goals and orientations tend to be quite similar in the two groups observed. Furthermore, primary relations and friendships cross-cutting the health occupations were frequent during the first three years when students were studying together and many persisted subsequently when the curricular programs separate. Nevertheless, such joint exposure does little to diffuse the basic stereotypes that prevail concerning the two professions which structure the status relations between them. Partly this is bolstered by differential admissions policy which, by its more severe selection of medical students, confirms the image that dental students on the whole are less successful academic achievers. The system of practice which is primarily private for dentists and salaried for physicians tends to confirm the cynical stereotype which suggests that dentists are more concerned with material rewards than are physicians.

This study, therefore, indicates that joint programs of socialization can make some contribution to better understanding and reinforcement of common orientations of eventual team members, but struc-
tural factors such as admissions policy and the nature of the system of delivery impinge on the socialization process and play a critical role in determining status relations among practitioners as well as their professional image of each other.

Another finding of the research concerns the relationship between socialization in authoritarian hospital structures and the role of the physician as an eventual member of a health team. We have seen from the Israeli findings that a socialization setting—in which students, interns, and house doctors—in that order—are subordinate to an authoritarian professor, tends to create an atmosphere in which subordinates wait anxiously for the moment when they can exert power and influence. Such a model of relationships may thus be transferred on an intergenerational basis from socializers to students. While the health team undoubtedly requires a leader, it would seem to be doubtful whether fruitful intermember relationships can be structured in this manner. Furthermore there is reason to believe that other members of the team—paramedicals and professionals—will in the future be characterized by higher levels of education and professional commitment so that a more equalitarian relationship among members of such a health team will be called for.

**Family medicine and community practice**

There is a growing awareness among students of the importance of family medicine in Israel but little translation of that awareness into personal career choice. Students appear to be increasingly sensitive to the need for practitioners in this field as socialization progresses but at the same time to be saying that “it’s important but it’s not for me...” In fact less than 10 percent express a preference for family medicine at the end of year six nor was the proportion ever much higher at earlier stages of training. Furthermore it appears that expression of interest in this career line, when it does occur, is an uncertain one with little commitment so that there is some reason to doubt whether it will in fact be carried out.

Not only family medicine but any community-based practice is shunned by students. The structure of the delivery system as well as the socialization process itself interact in causing this pattern. Students are exposed almost exclusively to hospital-based practice and even when some external exposure takes place they are led to the unambiguous conclusion that “real” medicine is practiced in the hospital. There is a certain denigration of the community-based clinics where, it is often openly stated by leading teachers, serious, high quality medicine cannot be practiced. In part, this image reflects the real structure of the Israeli delivery system which is plagued by excessively high utilization rates, a heterogeneous patient population, and numerous organizational problems (Shuval, 1970). Furthermore “interesting” medicine is almost by definition hospital medicine (Mumford, 1970).
Women in medicine

The proportion of women in Israeli medical schools is lower than in the Soviet Union or Eastern Europe but similar to many West European countries. In the population studied about 20 percent of the students are women which is similar to the proportion in many U.S. medical schools today but is larger than it was in 1969 when the present population started training. This research suggests that sex role differentiation can be largely broken down within the confines of the formal socialization process. The chances for such lack of differentiation would seem to be best if women and men admitted to medical school are approximately equal achievers and such equality is more or less maintained over time during formal socialization. Over achievement of a specific visible group tends to lead to labeling in terms of familiar stereotypic characteristics. The data show similarity of men and women on virtually all professional attitudes with little evidence for changes in this general pattern over time. All women students envisage a combination of career with family and children; few are anxious about this prospect or expect particular difficulties in making that combination.

Medical school effects an homogenizing process during socialization when differences between sub-groups existed before entry. Thus we have seen that initial differences between men and women, high and low socio-economic groups, or younger and older students which existed before exposure to medical school, disappeared fairly rapidly during the course of socialization.

However, once formal socialization is completed and career decisions are imminent, a good deal of traditionalism invades the system apparently in response to what are perceived as the constraints of the “real” world. This is expressed by women opting for the more traditional specializations. Women select pediatrics with increasing frequency as socialization proceeds, accepting this field as a traditional female stronghold among medical specialities which is congruent with the child-care aspects of the nonprofessional female role. Similarly virtually no women opt for surgery, even at the fantasy stage, when constraints of the real occupational world are minimal and imagination can soar.

Women also accept lower status community practice rather than more prestigious hospital careers. Such voluntary limiting of options may be less “voluntary” than meets the eye and is frequently a response to traditional patterns in which husbands’ careers are given higher priority while the wife’s choices are adapted to his.

We thus see that women are generally prepared to undertake professional practice on much the same terms as men. Indeed, their training strengthens expectations of full equality. Until the overall social system adapts itself to such universalism with respect to career choice, we can expect some frustration among women whose expectations are for freedom of choice.
Concerning selection of medical students

Selection of students for medical school in terms of scholastic achievement, intelligence and personality traits is fairly widespread. The dilemma in this area concerns the correlation of such variables with later outcomes of socialization. What is more, the timing definition and measurement of desired outcomes remain a thorny problem on which opinions differ considerably.

Evidence from this research indicates that attitudes of students concerning the importance of the role components of the practicing physician measured at the start of socialization are only weakly related to such attitudes at the end point of formal socialization. This pattern suggests that there is little to be gained in considering students' perception of the role components of the practicing physician as a criterion for admission. This is because so many shifts apparently occur in these attitudes over time that prediction is poor from the start to the end of socialization.

Additional research is needed to determine how general this pattern is. If it is shown to apply to other attitudes as well, these may also be thought of as inefficient means of selecting students for medical school.

Early narrowing of interests

The Israeli secondary school system, like its European counterpart, is structured to narrow students' academic interests as early as the tenth or eleventh grade of secondary school, by requiring a choice of programs specializing in sciences, humanities, languages or social sciences. In the United States where electives in secondary school and college are available and acceptable, future medical students also tend voluntarily to concentrate early in the sciences on the correct assumption that such specialization will improve their chances of gaining admission to medical school.

This early narrowing of interests serves to limit students' openness to curricular material that does not fit the "hard science" model. It might also serve indirectly to strengthen the commitment to science and research while weakening concern with person-oriented medical practice. This orientation also tends to reinforce the notion that hospital rather than community practice is a preferable career line.

Medical schools, in reconsidering their admission requirements, could make it known to potential applicants and to secondary school authorities that admission is not necessarily dependent on a science specialization and that students with wide academic interests including background in the humanities or social sciences stand an equal—or even better—chance of gaining admission to medical school.
Hiatus between secondary and medical schools

Evidence from the present study suggests that there are advantages in students taking a break in their study program before starting medical school. National service, along the Israeli example, is of course not the only style in which this can be accomplished. Nor does national service necessarily need to be under army auspices. What does seem important is that individuals take a breather from secondary school before they enter into a long, arduous and heavily committed field such as medicine. The data in this study lent confirmation to the notion that a 2 or 3 year break does a great deal to advance a young person’s image of himself, his aspirations and the seriousness with which he approaches his goal. There is widespread consensus on this among pre-clinical and clinical instructors as well as among students.
References


Coker, R. E., K. W. Back, I. G. Donnelly, and N. Miller, "Patterns of Influence: Medical School Faculty Members and the Values and Specialty Interests of Medical Students," *Journal of Medical Education*, 35:518, 1960


Gilbert, Leah, "Socialization of Pharmacy Students in Israel: Changing


Lingoes, James, The Guttman–Lingoes Nonmetric program Series, Ann Arbor, 1973


Mumford, Emily *From Students to Physicians*, Harvard University Press, Cambridge, 1970


Otis, G. D. and J. Weiss, "Explorations in Medical Career Choice," University of New Mexico, (mimeographed), 1972

Parsons, T., *The Social System*, Free Press, Glencoe, 1951


Shuval, Judith T. "Manpower Pools for Three Health Professions in Israel," *Social Science and Medicine* 7:893-910, 1975

Shuval, Judith T. "Socialization of Health Professionals in Israel: Early Sources of Congruence and Differentiation," *Journal of Medical Education*, 50:443-457, 1975

Shuval, Judith T. "From 'Boy' to 'Colleague': Processes of Role Transformation in Professional Socialization," *Social Science and Medicine*, 9:413-420, 1975


Related Studies


Current NCHSR publications

National Center for Health Services Research publications of interest to the health community are available on request to NCHSR, Publications and Information Branch, 3700 East-West Highway, Room 7-44, Hyattsville, MD 20782 (telephone: 301/436-8970). Mail requests will be facilitated by enclosure of a self-adhesive, self-addressed mailing label. These publications also are available for sale through the National Technical Information Service (NTIS), Springfield, VA 22161 (telephone: 703/57-4650). PB and HRP numbers in parentheses are NTIS order numbers. Publications which are out of stock in NCHSR are indicated as available only from NTIS. Prices may be obtained from the NTIS order desk on request.

Research Digests

The Research Digest Series provides overviews of significant research supported by NCHSR. The series describes either ongoing or completed projects directed toward high priority health services problems. Issues are prepared by the principal investigators performing the research, in collaboration with NCHSR staff. Digests are intended for an interdisciplinary audience of health services planners, administrators, legislators, and others who make decisions on research applications.

(HRA) 76-3144 Evaluation of a Medical Information System in a Community Hospital (PB 264353)
(HRA) 76-3145 Computer-Stored Ambulatory Record (COASTAR) (PB 268 342)
(HRA) 77-3160 Program Analysis of Physician Extender Algorithm Projects (PB 264 610, available NTIS only)
(HRA) 77-3161 Changes in the Costs of Treatment of Selected Illnesses, 1951-1964-1971 (HRP 0014598)
(HRA) 77-3162 Impact of State Certificate-of-Need Laws on Health Care Costs and Utilization (PB 264 352)
(HRA) 77-3164 An Evaluation of Physician Assistants in Diagnostic Radiology (PB 266 507, available NTIS only)
(HRA) 77-3166 Foreign Medical Graduates: A Comparative Study of State Licensure Policies (PB 265 233)
(HRA) 77-3171 Analysis of Physician Price and Output Decisions (PB 273 312)
(HRA) 77-3173 Nurse Practitioner and Physician Assistant Training and Deployment (PB 271 000, available NTIS only)
(HRA) 77-3177 Automation of the Problem-Oriented Medical Record (PB 266 881)
(NTIS) 78-3190 Uncertainties of Federal Child Health Policies: Impact in Two States
Research Summaries

The Research Summary Series provides rapid access to significant results of NCHSR-supported research projects. The series presents executive summaries prepared by the investigators at the completion of the project. Specific findings are highlighted in a more concise form than in the final report. The Research Summary Series is intended for health services administrators, planners, and other research users who require recent findings relevant to immediate programs in health services.

(HRA) 77-3162 Recent Studies in Health Services Research, Vol. I (July 1974 through December 1976) (PB 266 460)
(HRA) 78-3183 Recent Studies in Health Services Research, Vol. II (CY 1976)
(HRA) 77-3176 Quality of Medical Care Assessment Using Outcome Measures (PB 272 455)
(PHS) 78-3187 Criterion Measures of Nursing Care Quality
(PHS) 78-3193 Optimal Electrocardiography
(PHS) 78-3201 A National Profile of Catastrophic Illness

Policy Research

The Policy Research Series describes findings from the research programs that have major significance for policy issues of the moment. These papers are prepared by members of the staff of NCHSR or by independent investigators. The series is intended specifically to inform those in the public and private sectors who must consider, design, and implement policies affecting the delivery of health services.

(HRA) 77-3182 Controlling the Cost of Health Care (PB 266 885)

Research Report

The Research Report Series provides significant research reports in their entirety upon the completion of the project. Research Reports are developed by the principal investigators who conducted the research, and are directed to selected users of health services research as part of a continuing NCHSR effort to expedite the dissemination of new knowledge resulting from its project support.

(HRA) 76-3143 Computer-Based Patient Monitoring Systems (PB 266 508)
(HRA) 77-3152 How Lawyers Handle Medical Malpractice Cases (HRP 0014313)
(HRA) 77-3159 An Analysis of the Southern California Arbitration Project, January 1966 through June 1975 (HRP 0012466)
(HRA) 77-3165 Statutory Provisions for Binding Arbitration of Medical Malpractice Cases (PB 264 409, available NTIS only)
(HRA) 77-3184 1960 and 1970 Spanish Heritage Population of the Southwest by County (PB 280 656)
(HRA) 77-3188 Demonstration and Evaluation of a Total Hospital Information System (PB 271 079)
(HRA) 77-3189 Drug Coverage under National Health Insurance: The Policy Options (PB 272 074)
Research Management

The Research Management Series describes programmatic rather than technical aspects of the NCHSR research effort. Information is presented on the NCHSR goals, research objectives, and priorities; in addition, this series contains lists of grants and contracts, and administrative information on funding. Publications in this series are intended to bring basic information on NCHSR and its programs to research planners, administrators, and other who are involved with the allocation of research resources.

(HRA) 76-3136 The Program in Health Services Research (Revised 9/76)
(HRA) 77-3158 Summary of Grants and Contracts, Active June 30, 1976
(HRA) 77-3167 Emergency Medical Services Systems Research Projects (Active as of June 30, 1976) (PB 264 407, available NTIS only)
(HRA) 77-3179 Research on the Priority Issues of the National Center for Health Services Research, Grants and Contracts Active on June 30, 1976
(HRA) 77-3194 Emergency Medical Services Systems Research Projects, 1977 (PB 273 893)

Research Proceedings

The Research Proceedings Series extends the availability of new research announced at key conferences, symposia and seminars sponsored or supported by NCHSR. In addition to papers presented, publications in this series include discussions and responses whenever possible. The series is intended to help meet the information needs of health services providers and others who require direct access to concepts and ideas evolving from the exchange of research results.

(HRA) 76-3138 Women and Their Health: Research Implications for a New Era (PB 264-359, available NTIS only)
(HRA) 76-3150 Intermountain Medical Malpractice (PB 268 344, available NTIS only)
(HRA) 77-3154 Advances in Health Survey Research Methods (PB 262 230)
(HRA) 77-3181 NCHSR Research Conference Report on Consumer Self-Care in Health (PB 273 811)
(HRA) 77-3186 International Conference on Drug and Pharmaceutical Services Reimbursement (PB 271 386)
(PHS) 78-3195 Emergency Medical Services: Research Methodology

Program Solicitations

(HRA) 77-3196 Conference Grant Information
(PHS) 78-3224 Grants for Dissertation Research Support
(PHS) 78-3206 Grants for Cost Containment Research for Health Planning
This is a longitudinal study of two classes of medical students who entered Tel Aviv and Hadassah medical schools in 1969. They were followed through their first year of graduate medical education. The study maps the continuing change in the students to separate the effects of qualities the students bring with them to medical school from those they acquire at different stages of the socialization process. Outcomes are specialty choice and preferred practice location.