ABSTRACT.

Proceedings from an April, 1977 conference focus on the current status and future directions of arts programming for the handicapped. M. Appell provides an overview of the field; while W. Kalenius, Jr. reviews data from 138 current research studies which indicate that handicapped children were able to learn the art forms, enjoyed the activities, increased feelings of self-worth and learned academic skills as a result of arts activities. S. Madeja discusses the role of aesthetic perception, the critical process, and knowledge about the arts in arts instruction for the handicapped. L. Molloy discusses architectural and program accessibility factors for public arts facilities. Methods of facilitating career development and leisure time enjoyment of the arts are discussed by J. Goldstein. Papers by J. Newbeig and J. Kukuk deal with the artist's role in working with handicapped people and the major components of comprehensive arts education programs for the handicapped. G. Barlow cites the negative attitudes of society toward the handicapped in general, and suggests the need to identify attitudes specific to the handicapped in the arts. Further research needs are projected by J. Morrison. A conference summary outlines conclusions (regarding the Federal role, research, and arts in education, public facilities and attitudes), implications, and projections. (CL)
The Arts and Handicapped People: Defining the National Direction

Proceedings from a Conference April 28, 29, 1977
Coordinated by
The Bureau of Education for the Handicapped Division of Innovation and Development and
The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped

"Permission to reproduce this material has been granted by
Wendy Perks"

The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped
An Educational Affiliate of the J. F. Kennedy Center for the Performing Arts
# Table of Contents

An Introductory Statement—Laureen Summers ............................................. 8

PART I—ESTABLISHING PERSPECTIVE .................................................. 8

Statement of Purpose .................................................................................. 9

Conference Design ....................................................................................... 10

Definitions .................................................................................................. 12

Harold Arberg, Ph.D.
Director, Arts & Humanities, Division, Office of Education

An Overview: Arts in Education for the Handicapped

Melville Appell
Division of Innovation & Development, Bureau of Education for the Handicapped

PART II—EXPLORING THE CURRENT STATUS ...................................... 16

"The State of the Research"

William G. Kalenius, Jr., Ph.D.
Administrator for Public Services and Research, Clover Park School District

"The Child and Aesthetic Development"

Stanley S. Madeja, Ph.D.
Executive Vice President, CEMREL, Inc.

"Public Facilities and Handicapped Patrons"

Larry Molloy
Project Director, Educational Facilities Laboratory

"Career Development and Leisure Time"

Judith E. Goldstein
Therapeutic Recreation Consultant, National Parks & Recreation

"The Role of the Artist in Working with Handicapped People"

Joan Newburg
NCAH Model Site Coordinator, San Fernando Valley Arts Council

"Arts Education for the Handicapped"

Jack Kukuk
Assistant Director, Alliance for Arts Education

"The Nature of Society's Attitude Toward the Handicapped and the Arts"

Gary C. Barlow, Ph.D.
Director, Art Education Department, Wright State University

"Speculations on Studying the Field of Arts and the Handicapped"

Jack Morrison, Ed.D.
Executive Director, American Theatre Association

PART III—PROJECTING FUTURE ARTS RESEARCH ................................ 64

Conclusions ................................................................................................. 65

Afterword—Garry McDaniels

Director, Division of Innovation and Development, Bureau of Education for the Handicapped
THE ARTS MAY BE THE HANDICAPPED-PERSON'S FIRST CHANCE FOR ACHIEVING A GOAL, HIS FIRST STEP TOWARD SUCCESS IN OTHER AREAS OF LEARNING. THE FIRST SIGN THAT HIS LIFE WILL HAVE MEANING AND SIGNIFICANCE.

from the testimony of Phyllis Wyeth, Secretary, Board of Directors National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped Senate Sub-Committee on the Handicapped Oversight Hearings, April, 1977
Acknowledgement

The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped expresses its deep appreciation to Dr. Garry McDaniels, Director of the Division of Innovation and Development, Bureau of Education for the Handicapped for his initiative in sponsoring the implementation of this developmental conference, "The Arts and the Handicapped: Defining the National Direction." Ms. Lani Lattin Duke, Director of Special Constituencies, National Endowment for the Arts assisted in providing meeting and luncheon facilities. Ms. Duke and Mr. Jack Kukuk, Assistant Director, Alliance for Arts Education, John F. Kennedy Center for the Performing Arts, and Dr. William Kalenius, Administrator, Public Services and Research, Clover Park Schools, Tacoma, Washington, devoted their time to aid in planning the overall conference design.

Dr. Louise Appell, NCAH, Associate Director assumed major responsibility for preparing and editing the final manuscript.

The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped hopes that this publication will stimulate increased national growth and development in the field of arts research and demonstration for all handicapped people.

The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped
I am a weaver with a slight case of cerebral palsy. I have been weaving for the past six years. As a handicapped person, it has been very exciting for me to overcome feelings of inadequacy and dependency as I strive to discover my potential as an artist. When I weave, I feel completely in charge of myself. I think of my accomplishments as statements of myself—my longing to create something real and beautiful.

Having a physical handicap is not the easiest thing in the world to cope with. Although there are laws and bills being passed to facilitate the integration of disabled individuals into the mainstream of society, many barriers still remain.

The path to my own growth and acceptance as a handicapped artist has often been scattered with fear and doubt. As I seek out able-bodied persons, there is often the initial fear of "she is different; I must be careful." The myth about disabled people states that such persons are not whole individuals; they are weak; mentally unsound; unable to take care of themselves. Each revision to this myth gives a little more credit to the handicapped person, but the belief still prevails that such an individual is a "cripple" and cannot function as well as his/her peers.

People like myself often buy this myth of inadequacy. We fit ourselves into the images provided for us. Without good support and productive expectations from able-bodied people, handicapped individuals sometimes revert to creating their own failures. This is what they are used to for themselves and what they feel is expected of them.

We all carry some fear around with us about the unknown. Able-bodied people fear becoming disabled and destroying their image of beauty and perfection. This makes it hard for such a person to confront a handicapped individual and recognize the beauty and sensitivity that lies beyond the handicap. It seems logical that emotional support is needed to help us to acknowledge and explore these kinds of fears. Once fear is accepted, it becomes easier to let go of it and move ahead to handle a frightening situation.

Society needs direct confrontation by handicapped individuals who have been pushed into the background for many years. People like myself need to feel expectation and appreciation from others—that we all have good...
potential and the ability to be cooperative and productive. Art is extremely important for disabled people because it may often be the only source of expression that they have. The old saying that a picture is worth a thousand words rings quite true. I have seen beautiful, creative products come from mentally retarded persons whose potentials have been considered to be quite limited and unskilled.

Weaving has gained me support and respect in a world which I am sometimes afraid to enter. Because I had trouble fitting into the images that most people grow up with, the need to find something different became necessary and vital. Art is an individual statement; it opens the door to an understanding which has not been there before. It is a way to reach beyond the fear that separates us from each other. It has the potential to bring us all together at last.
Part I
Establishing Perspective
The meaning and significance of life is intimately related to the ability of each of us, regardless of his status in the society, to manifest his uniqueness. Dr. Edwin Martin, the Deputy Commissioner of the Bureau of Education for the Handicapped, U.S. Office of Education, DHEW has reminded us that "as educators (we must) focus more carefully on the individual and his or her uniqueness . . . " In that phrase he has probably expressed the significance of this conference as effectively and efficiently as is possible.

Those who work with the handicapped believe that creative arts play a crucial role in providing for the individual's uniqueness. It is both natural and fitting that the Bureau of Education for the Handicapped, with its emphasis on individuality and The National Committee, with its focus on creativity, respond to Dr. Martin's far sighted observation, "The challenge of the next decade . . . will be to reawaken our hearts and our spirits to the individual nature of each handicapped or gifted."

With this general goal in mind the combined efforts of these two organizations were joined to sponsor this conference, "Arts and the Handicapped: Defining a National Direction." Topics chosen by a blue-ribbon committee were those that not only represented the greatest needs in the area of arts for the handicapped but were those that also appeared to be amenable to an applied research effort with a requital in the immediate future as a distinct possibility.

The eight position papers in this monograph, which indicate not only the expertise of the highly selected participants but also their devotion to the handicapped, (the papers were produced in less than a month's time)—will guide the Bureau of Education for the Handicapped in the future development of a creative arts program for the handicapped.

Our hope is that the wide dissemination of these Conference proceedings will serve to alert the professional community to the needs of the handicapped in the area of the Creative Arts and to ultimately provide for the handicapped, as President Carter personally recalled of his youthful exposure to the arts, "something beautiful and full of meaning."
Establishing the Goals

In recent months much national attention has been addressed to the crucial need for expanded opportunities in all the arts for all Americans. Before his inauguration, President Carter stated:

Arts in America are not simply a luxury, they are a vital part of the fabric of American life and deserve strong support from the federal government.*

If we can respond to the desire of the American people to participate in the arts, if we can educate our young people in an atmosphere in which the arts are an integral part of the everyday world, then we will have built a strong and secure base for the future of the arts in America.**

The wife of the Vice President of the United States, Mrs. Joan Mondale, has selected this as one of her major areas of concern and interest. Mr. David Rockefeller, Jr., Chairman of the Arts Education and Americans Panel, Dr. Ernest Boyer, the U.S. Commissioner of Education, the Honorable Joseph Califano, The Secretary of HEW, and Jean Kennedy Smith, founding Board member of The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped, have made public commitments to enhancing the quality of life for all people through the arts.

In the fall 1976, the Bureau of Education for the Handicapped assumed a leadership position in increasing opportunities in all arts for people with handicapping conditions by providing funding for "Arts in Education for Handicapped Children" to The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped. As part of this project NCAH conducted a preliminary review of the research literature which revealed that no concentrated effort to assess and evaluate past research and demonstration projects, to review current developments in the field, or to project future goals and directions had been conducted.

Therefore, The Bureau of Education for the Handicapped and The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped agreed to cooperatively sponsor a two-day developmental conference: "Arts and the Handicapped: Defining the National Direction." The primary aim of this conference was to explore and clarify specific issues and questions related to the future development of arts programs for handicapped people.

It is intended that the design of this conference will serve as a model for future national seminars and workshops, and that this monograph will generate heightened fiscal and programmatic commitment to the field of arts for the handicapped.

Coordinating the Effort

The Bureau of Education for the Handicapped agreed to coordinate with The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped to implement all phases of the conference and to develop the resulting state-of-the-art monograph. Dr. Garry McDaniels, Director of the Division of Innovation and Development, Bu-

---

* New York Times, June 26, 1976
** Press release, October 21, 1977
Developing The Format

A planning committee consisting of Mr. Jack Kukuk, Assistant Director Alliance for Arts Education; Ms. Lani Lattin Duke, Director of Special Constituencies, National Endowment for the Arts; Mr. Melville Appell, Division of Innovation and Development, Bureau of Education for the Handicapped, was appointed by Ms. Wendy Perks, Executive Director, The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped, to assist in conference design, formulation of key conference issues and questions, and identification of delegates and resource personnel. It was agreed that the two-day developmental seminar would involve the presentation of position papers by invited delegates and open discussion of the papers and related issues by the delegates and other national arts and education resource people.

Key questions addressed by the delegates included:

- What is the federal role in the development of arts for the handicapped?
- What is the state of research pertaining to arts for the handicapped?
- What is the relationship of the arts to the aesthetic development of a human being?
- What is the full utilization of public facilities in relationship to arts for the handicapped?
- What is the state of career development and utilization of leisure time in relation to arts for the handicapped?
- What is the role of the artist working with handicapped people?
- What is the nature of society's attitude toward the handicapped? How do the arts affect attitude?
- What contributions can all the disciplines make to the fields of arts and the handicapped?

Identifying The Delegates

The planning committee identified national leaders in arts and special education who would be able to develop significant and meaningful position papers on each of the key issues. NCAH selected and invited the delegate group and regularly communicated with them to provide additional resource materials and guidance.

Identifying The Resource People

A list of national leaders in arts and special education was also identified by the planning committee to serve as a resource team during the two-day conference. It was intended that these people would provide additional information and input during the two-day seminar. Although these people were not instructed to prepare position statements, they were requested to familiarize themselves with the topics for discussion and to make a commitment to join the entire two-day meeting.

Projecting The Outcome

This is the first national effort to assess, evaluate, and project research and demonstration needs in the area of arts for the handicapped. The Bureau of Education for the Handicapped and The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped intend that the impact of the conference and the resulting monograph will be significant and far reaching.
DR. HAROLD ARBERG, Director, Division Arts and Humanities, U.S. Office of Education, opened the conference by citing the established definitions of arts, arts education, and handicapped people as published in the federal regulations. Dr. Arberg noted that the basic premise of the regulations is that the arts need to have their own identity and role within the educational lives of all children. The arts serve an important purpose as a vehicle for teaching and learning basic educational skills and abilities, but serve an equal purpose in the total education of the whole person. Dr. Arberg noted that this two-fold approach to arts education is succinctly described in the regulations.

(20 U.S.C. 1807)

"Arts" includes, but is not limited to, music, dance, drama, folk art, creative writing, architecture and allied fields, visual arts (including painting, sculpture, photography, graphic arts, and craft arts), industrial design, costume and fashion design, motion pictures, television, radio, tape and sound recording, the arts related to the presentation, performance, execution, and exhibition of those arts, and the study and application of the arts to the human environment.

(20 U.S.C. 1807, 952 (b) (Pub. L. 89-290))

"Arts education program" means a program in which arts are an integral part of elementary and secondary school curricula. § 1603.3.

(20 U.S.C. 1807)

"Handicapped children" means children who need special education and related services because they are mentally retarded, hard of hearing, deaf, speech impaired, visually handicapped, seriously emotionally disturbed, crippled, or otherwise health impaired, or have specific learning disabilities.
In one area of educational activity, the arts, the handicapped are still not being brought into the mainstream, even though new approaches and materials have provided the educational system with a capability for integrating all children regardless of ethnic, social, sexual, physical or other ability variation. Furthermore, as Birch and Stevens (1955) have long ago concluded "... the regular grade teacher, with some assistance, can make a substantial contribution to the education of the mentally handicapped child, ..."

But while the educational system appears able to accommodate and the personnel force is potentially capable of providing the needed instructional service only about 12 percent of all handicapped children and youth out of eight million enrolled in our schools (Smith, 1976) are being afforded the opportunity to participate in a program of the arts. The reason is not as obscure as might seem at first glance.

The history of the handicapped in these United States is closely related to their "rehabilitation" which in itself is intimately concerned with the practicality of making wage earners rather than welfare recipients of the handicapped. This economic motive was most vigorously espoused by President Eisenhower as far back as 1954, although he was not the first or the last President to offer a helping hand wrapped in a dollar sign. He said:

"We are spending three times as much in public assistance to care for non-productive disabled people as it would cost to make them self sufficient and taxpaying members of their communities. Rehabilitated people as a group pay back in Federal income taxes many times the cost of their rehabilitation."

It has been only within the last few years, from the beginning of this decade and the beginning of the consumer advocate movement, that the emphasis on the tax dollar has given way to a greater concern for the dignity and rights of all citizens including the 35 million or so handicapped among us. In respect to the Arts that recent impetus has been given further boost by an alert congress. In Report #94-168, the Committee on Labor and Public Welfare, U.S. Congress (1975) emphatically stated:

"Handicapped individuals have a normal probability of being creative and talented."

"The use of the arts as a teaching tool for the handicapped has long been recognized as a viable, effective way not only for
mentally retarded. The art program elicited greater gains in intelligence and emotional behavior than the motor development program or the regular classroom instructional program.

An examination of the effects of music on the mathematics performance of mentally retarded children (Cotter and Spradlin, 1971) showed that appropriately programmed music will systematically improve the math performance of mentally retarded children in terms of speed and accuracy. Gallagher (1972) showed that significant improvement in creativity of emotionally disturbed children was noted after exposure to art lessons. Cameron (1970) discovered that basic learning abstractions could be developed through the use of music symbols even at the most elementary level. Neale (1964) found that training in art for trainable mentally retarded produced significant gains in behavior, speech, and language.

The broad effect of arts on the handicapped appears to be improved social response, gains in school achievement, self-confidence gained by personal achievement, and a better and more integrated existence. Yet, resistance to acceptance of the arts persists. The reasons go beyond the linkage of rehabilitation to earning power. Much of the reason is to be found within the educational system itself.

For one thing there is confusion as to how to teach the arts. At present, arts are taught by several kinds of teachers and other personnel in a variety of settings. There are many strategies available and probably the lack of research specific to the "goodness of fit" of any one compared to the other has resulted in a trial and error approach.

At present one can summarize these teaching approaches to arts education in elementary settings as follows:

1. The classroom teacher is the primary arts instructor supported by consultant services from specialists in the arts.
2. The regular teacher in a self-contained classroom is the arts instructor.
3. Instruction is delivered by arts specialists.

A second problem lies in the traditional resistance of the educational community to change. It has been said that education has
become so conservative that significant change would take a century to effect.

It becomes vitally important that if the handicapped are to be given equality of opportunity and perform in the least restrictive environment, as mandated by PL 94-142, options for maximum educational opportunity must be presented. Deborah May (1976) has correctly stated: "One of the conditions needed to achieve the full potential of every child is a sustained program of opportunities for art exploration with presence of necessary materials, equipment and circumstances."

With regard to the handicapped, specifically, one of the leaders in the field of art education, Kathryn Bloom (1976), has written:

"These programs (educational programs emphasizing the arts) are conceived as alternative approaches to learning for youngsters who may have problems in adjusting to more traditional classroom situations. The infusion of the arts into the general education of all children also encourages the identification of talented youngsters whose special abilities may otherwise go unnoticed or unrecognized."

In order to provide the alternative approaches to learning, the Bureau of Education for the Handicapped has funded project Arts in Education for Handicapped Children. This project will determine the effects of infusing arts in the special education curriculum as they relate to academic performance of the handicapped. The project will also examine the relationships between arts performance and type of handicapping condition and age. The fundamental hypothesis of this project is that students experiencing the arts centered curriculum will show significantly greater progress than those undergoing learning experiences in non-arts centered situations.

Interesting proposals with similar foci, i.e., materials development, teacher training, and alternative teaching strategies have been received by the Bureau in its discretionary program. Although funding possibilities are undetermined at this time, the variety of innovative efforts that might possibly lead to funding is indicative of widespread interest in a maturing field of many professionals from many disciplines.

A proposal has been received that has as its main purpose the development of a set of mediated teacher training packages and music/arts curriculum guidelines. The training program will provide inservice as well as pre-service teachers with skills necessary to develop an arts education program for handicapped children. An interesting feature of this proposal is the project director's efforts to provide the teaching personnel with guidelines that will help them to adapt existing curricular and instructional materials, to music and visual arts instruction for the handicapped. Another proposal of some merit has as its primary emphasis the teaching of indigenous crafts to handicapped children. Competencies in the cognitive and physical areas needed to perform each craft activity will be identified and analyzed. Teacher guides and related materials will be developed for purposes for implementation of teaching strategies.

A major approach to providing equal arts educational opportunity for the handicapped is provided in a proposal that has as its purpose the development, refinement, and validation of a Very Special Arts Festival (VSAF) model. This proposal would stimulate year round arts education programs sponsored by school systems and related educational services such as parks, libraries, museums, and other art and community resources. It would contribute to the cognitive, psycho-motor, and affective development of handicapped children.

In this paper I have alluded to the provision of arts opportunities as alternative teaching/learning strategies. I have also referred to their uses for economic gain in career settings I might also have acknowledged the role arts play in therapy. My own preference (and I hope it is also yours) is to want to use the arts simply to make life worthwhile, particularly for the handicapped the vast majority of whom are considered to be social outcasts or economic parasites whose usefulness is suspect. It is through the arts that they reach out and often reach their society.

The creative experiences are not to be decried even though this society seems to emphasize life's utilitarian purpose and puritanically rejects its enjoyment. President Steven Muller of Johns Hopkins University has condemned this pragmatic point of view. He referred to "a world in which extreme utilitarianism has driven pleasure out of work and
sensible purpose out of pleasure."

"The tendency today... is to focus on what is considered socially useful in the most immediate sense... What is missing is... the joy of learning, not for economic gain, but for relaxation."

Lest anyone forget, the handicapped have the same need for "excitement of the spirit as an antidote to enfeeblement of the mind" as do others. Whether it is mind expansion, cognitive development, or motor, perceptual, or vocational skills development, art is to be used for creative expression and personal growth. Educators and all personnel working with the handicapped should understand that the handicapped as well as others can and do express themselves and communicate through these media.

This is the importance of the arts for the handicapped. For them the arts do not only represent learning strategies or economic wherewithal. The arts afford them the opportunity to communicate directly on a personal basis with the society in which they live. Confined as they often are by a healthy, buoyant and intelligent society, to a life apart the arts can be of fundamental significance.

Through the arts those whose sensorium is often the hostage of disablement, whose extremities are visual evidence of their handicap condition, and whose minds are unable to conceptualize or symbolize the message are able to manifest themselves who and what they are through the magic of creation.

So let me now comment on why you are assembled. Conferencing provides a terminal source for researchable ideas. If the past is prologue, and it must be, if history is meaningful, then what we do and say in this conference should portend the future of arts in education for the handicapped. Am I being rational but impractical?

The evidence would seem to indicate the former. If you will recall as Hanlan Hoffa (1975) does in "The History of the Idea", the concept of a national research and development center in the arts was first proposed in 1965 at a conference which had been held at the Pennsylvania State University. The rationale behind this conference idea was that "... the current status of art education reveals confused perceptions of and inadequate solutions to curricular and instructional problems."

These problems are still current and more noticeable today simply because we are now more aware of the need to make artistic endeavor a part of our lives. However, we must acknowledge that the research in the field is still fragmented and given to fits and starts and is dependent on largesse from any one source with anyone's personal bias. Furthermore, no conceptual framework appears to exist for whatever is going on.

As Hoffa noted "In the absence of a center for advanced study in the field, which could provide both a data source and a center for scholarly activity in aesthetic education, this unfortunate situation seems likely to continue."

While I might be naive, I am not that pessimistic. Money has always made a convert out of me and with human intelligence and financial resource, what can be done has no limits.

Some areas of research that need early investigation are:

1. Program models for the major art forms including art, drama, dance and music for the handicapped
2. Teaching and learning through the arts. The process model by which teachers teach and students learn needs to be explicaded
3. The use of arts for purposes of self actualization and the maintenance of the individual in the community
4. A demographic study of artists who are handicapped who they are where they are, and their competence.
5. Arts infusion the process by which arts and artists are inserted into the regular curriculum
6. Models by which arts and arts facilities can be made available to the handicapped. Process models by which arts materials are adapted to the handicapped are included here.

Even as Kathryn Bloom (1970) ably acknowledges, leadership training needs to be instituted in our professional schools so that technical assistance can be made available to school districts for development and refinement of arts programs.

Attention to the above by you in this conference and the institution of an action oriented plan for arts in education for the handicapped will, as Lowenfeld (1960) so elegantly put it, "fan the spark of the human spirit..."
into whatever flame it conceivably can develop [for] every human being is endowed with a creative spirit.


2. Bloom, Kathryn. Research and development needs for comprehensive programs in the arts in education at the precollegiate level. The JDR 3rd Fund, 1975.


Part II
Exploring the Current Status
The State of the Research

Purpose of Paper

The purposes of this paper are (1) to provide a statement that responds to the question, "What is the (current) state of research pertaining to arts and handicapped (children)?"; and (2) to provide by that statement a frame of reference (or model) that serves as a point of departure from which to proceed.

Fulfilling these purposes should assist the Bureau for the Education of the Handicapped (BEH) and The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped (NCAH) in defining and designing their roles in future national directions for providing arts to handicapped children.

Procedure

The literature search was conducted through the Washington State Library System; the Council for Exceptional Children/ERIC Clearinghouse on Handicapped and Gifted Children; the Northern Colorado Educational Board of Cooperative Services Information Retrieval Center; the State of Washington Special Education Materials and Training (SEMAT) network; and The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped/Arts Resources Information Center (NCAH/ARIC). Computerized and hand searches of ERIC, The Education Index, Current Index of Journals of Education (CIJE), and Dissertation Abstracts were merged with independent reviews of the literature such as Doerflinger and Andrews (1978), Michel and May (1974), Hegco et al. (1975), Healey (1973), Washington State Library (1970), and Haimes (1971).

From the sources searched, 554 references appeared to have some bearing on the topic of "Arts" for "Handicapped" "Children". Of those 554, there were 138 studies of the "Arts" that reported some finding(s) as a result of a range of "research" from anecdotal reports to experiments with large N and adequate sampling techniques and design.

Of the 138 studies, there were 46 which could meet generally the definition of research as: structured inquiry that utilized acceptable
scientific problem solving methodology and created new knowledge that would be generally applicable (Hopkins, 1976).

In many of the 46 reports, the investigators suggested needs for larger samples, replications, and broader socio-economic bases to the samples.

In the 138 studies (which include the 46 mentioned above) there were similarities in concerns, considerable data for—albeit small N generally—and report after report of, behavioral, instructional, or attitudinal change, as a result of some "arts" activity.

All of the studies to be discussed, involved activities in dance, art, music and/or theater that caused, or were related to, therapy, instruction, infusion, shaping, affect, and/or evaluation, with children who had one or more handicapping condition(s).

**Studies by Handicapping Condition**

As specified by Congress in P.L. 94-142, Handicapping Conditions are: Deaf; Hard of Hearing; Mentally Retarded; Orthopedically Impaired. Other Health Impaired; Seriously Emotionally Disturbed; Specific Learning Disability; Speech Impaired; and Visually Handicapped. (U.S. Congress, 6th Session, 1975.)

As displayed in Table I, all but one Handicapping condition was covered by at least three percent of the studies. The one condition was "Deaf-Blind and Other Multi-Handicapped."

In proportion to the number of students with speech impairment, learning disability, and emotional disturbance, there was minimal research found. The mentally retarded area fared the best with 38% of the studies addressed to that classification. The lack of studies focusing on certain handicapping conditions such as Deaf-Blind and Learning Disability point out specific areas to which more research should be directed.

**Studies by Arts Form Categories**

The studies were sorted by the art form and/or combination of art forms (the arts). This sort is displayed in Table I by columns for dance, art, music, theater and the combination of two or more of the forms.

Arts, as defined in P.L. 89-209 pertaining to the National Endowment for the Arts, includes but is not limited to music, dance, drama, folk art, creative writing, architecture and allied fields, visual arts (including painting, sculpture, photography, graphic arts and craft arts), industrial design, costume and fashion design, motion pictures, television, radio, tape and sound recordings, the arts related to the presentations, performance, execution, and exhibition of those arts, and the study and application of the arts to the human environment.

Not by formal definition, but by their use in the studies, dance activity examples included, but were not limited to, balance, coordination, movement, and body image.

Art activity examples included, but were not limited to, visual perception, depth, color, lines, space, and orientation.

Music activity examples included, but were not limited to, auditory perception, auditory discrimination, rhythm, and tonality.

Theater activity examples included, but were not limited to, drama, coordination, self image, self-expression, and creative dramatics.

**Studies by Function Categories**

Studies were also sorted by the use or effect of the art form intervention or relationship. As displayed in Table II, these were row designations and were defined as follows:

- Therapy is that process by which a mental or physical anomaly is alleviated.
- Instruction pertains to learning skills in the particular art form being presented.
- Infusion is the process by which an art form is used to teach an academic or social skill.
- Shaping is used in the context of social behavior in behavior management.
- Affect designates feelings; in the studies of this paper, very often feelings about self.
- Evaluation is the term used to name diagnostic and assessment activities.

Those studies that reported two or more of the above were classified as combination.

**Studies by Form by Function**

In Table II, in each cell, each of the studies is designated by the number assigned to it in the numbered References section. The frequency of studies per cell is obtained by tallying the numbers. As displayed, music has provided the subjects for the most studies, seven times that of the least studied arts form, dance.
Table I
ESTIMATED NUMBER OF HANDICAPPED CHILDREN SERVED AND UNSERVED WITH PERCENT OF STUDIES REPORTED* BY TYPE OF HANDICAP

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1975-76 Served (Projected)</th>
<th>1975-76 Unserved</th>
<th>Total Hand. Child. Served &amp; Unserved</th>
<th>Percent Served</th>
<th>Percent Unserved</th>
<th>% of * Studies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL: Age 6-19</td>
<td>3,860,000</td>
<td>2,840,000</td>
<td>6,700,000</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>42</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL: Age 0-5</td>
<td>450,000</td>
<td>737,000</td>
<td>1,187,000</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>62</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL: Age 0-19</td>
<td>4,310,000</td>
<td>3,577,000</td>
<td>7,887,000</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>45</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPEECH IMPAIRED</td>
<td>2,020,000</td>
<td>273,000</td>
<td>2,293,000</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENTALLY RETARDED</td>
<td>1,350,000</td>
<td>157,000</td>
<td>1,507,000</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LEARNING DISABILITIES</td>
<td>250,000</td>
<td>1,706,000</td>
<td>1,966,000</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EMOTIONALLY DISTURBED</td>
<td>255,000</td>
<td>1,055,000</td>
<td>1,310,000</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRIPPLED &amp; OTHER</td>
<td>255,000</td>
<td>73,000</td>
<td>328,000</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HEALTH IMPAIRED</td>
<td>45,000</td>
<td>4,000</td>
<td>49,000</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEAF</td>
<td>66,000</td>
<td>262,000</td>
<td>328,000</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HARD OF HEARING</td>
<td>43,000</td>
<td>23,000</td>
<td>66,000</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VISUALLY HANDICAPPED</td>
<td>16,000</td>
<td>24,000</td>
<td>40,000</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>&lt;1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEAF-BLIND &amp; OTHER</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MULTI-HANDICAPPED</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COMBINATIONS OF HANDICAPS**</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Added for purposes of this paper.
** Studies directed at "handicapped children" with no independent variable for handicapping condition.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ART FORM</th>
<th>DANCE</th>
<th>ART</th>
<th>MUSIC</th>
<th>THEATER</th>
<th>ARTS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>THERAPY</td>
<td>45, 82, 195</td>
<td>5, 15, 16, 18, 62, 66, 84, 103</td>
<td>3, 9, 23, 24, 34, 86, 116, 132</td>
<td>53, 54</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INSTRUCTION</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>11, 37, 76, 80, 88, 111, 117, 137</td>
<td>25, 43, 48, 61, 83, 67, 100, 101, 128</td>
<td>126, 130, 32, 40, 42</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INFUSION</td>
<td>38, 39, 71, 79, 97, 113</td>
<td>20, 22, 49, 52, 78, 90, 108, 114, 122, 126, 129</td>
<td>8, 72, 73, 104, 118</td>
<td>10, 47, 48, 85</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHAPING</td>
<td>4, 19, 59, 60, 77, 96, 98, 119, 123, 124</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>55, 120, 121</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFFECT</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>1, 17, 36, 41, 63, 67, 81, 89, 91, 93, 94, 106, 134</td>
<td>115, 138</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EVALUATION</td>
<td>30, 31, 107</td>
<td>7, 35, 64, 92, 110, 112</td>
<td>13, 14, 21, 26, 28, 29, 33, 44, 50, 51, 57, 69, 131, 135, 136</td>
<td>12, 27, 74, 127</td>
<td>56, 58, 68, 75, 102, 109</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table II
138 STUDIES BY THEIR REFERENCE NUMBER BY ART FORM BY FUNCTION
Arts, as a combination of two or more of the forms, had very little research attention reported.

There were not the discrepancies among the functions of the arts forms as were observed among the handicapping conditions and among the arts forms.

Although shaping, affect, and evaluation were lower in number, analysis of the combination cells showed shaping, affect, and evaluation often combined with other functions and more frequently with each other. For instance, attitude about "self and/or others" was reported as a frequent function of many studies providing therapy or instruction.

Summary

Data from the 138 studies provided strong support that children who were handicapped were able to learn the art forms, enjoyed performing and/or exhibiting, increased their feelings of self-worth, were rehabilitated and learned academic skills as a result of arts activities.

However, there were not enough research studies available to generalize the results of the studies from which the summary statement is drawn.

Recommendations

1. New research is needed to replicate the studies reported in this paper if the findings are to be validated.
2. More research should be directed at specific handicapping conditions where sufficient data are now lacking.
3. More research should be directed at specific art forms (dance, art, drama, etc.) where sufficient data are now lacking.
4. Research should be conducted on the relative value of specific art forms for specific functional results (therapy, instruction, etc.).
5. A design should be developed to integrate additional areas of research (teacher training, curriculum development, administration and supervision) into the Arts for the Handicapped format.

The strength of this paper is in its generation of ideas and identification of needs. It points up the limitations under which research in arts for handicapped children have operated—poor definition of terms, weakness in research methodology, lack of communication between arts educators and special educators, and poor techniques for analyzing anecdotal and basic research studies.

It is clear that the bulk of the research has focused on visual arts and music and in the area of mental retardation with other art forms and other handicapping conditions receiving little in the way of research interest. An important message that comes out of the discussion of this paper is the realization of the need for an artist researcher. Universities must become involved in the promotion of doctoral research in arts for handicapped children and incorporate this area in their overall research planning.

It may be that there is a need to explore new research methodologies using innovative technology, methods and strategies in order to avoid violating the very basics of the arts in the forced use of scientific research procedures. The possibility exists that it is defeating to the aesthetic experience to impose artificial restrictions in the name of research methodology or that the aesthetic experience cannot be subjected to traditional research strategies and to do so makes for the collection of meaningless data leading to only general and erroneous conclusions. Nevertheless, the demands of budgets and programming require accountability and numbers. Some accommodations must be made for the several research needs.

Finally and most importantly is the summary statement from this paper that says "data provided strong support that children who were handicapped were able to learn the art forms, enjoyed performing and/or exhibiting, increased their feelings of self-worth, were rehabilitated and learned academic skills as a result of arts activities." Support of research is crucial to the future planning of programs to involve all handicapped children in all the arts.

References

Drerflinger, Christine and Andrew Nancy

Haimes, Norma. "Guide to the Literature
Art Therapy.” American Journal of Art Therapy. 11:1, October 1971, pgs. 25-42.


31. Evans, D. R. Changes in Social Behavior and Emotional Attitudes of High School Students Participating in Dramatic Art in High School of Cleveland Heights, Ohio. (Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, State University of Iowa, Iowa City, 1932.)


Godlvin, B. A. A Study of the Use of Dance as a Therapeutic Aid With Special Interest to the Mentally Ill. University of North Carolina, 1954.


Irwin, Eleanor China. The Effect of a Program of Creative Dramatics Upon Personality as Measured by the California Test of Personality, Sociograms, Teacher Ratings and Grades. (Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, University of Pittsburgh, 1963.)


Kramer, Edith. "The Practice of Art


80. Mills, Esther and Others. A Comparison of Especially Designed Art Activities with Traditional Art Activities as Used with Intellectually Handicapped Children and Youth. Arlington County Public Schools, Virginia: Maryland University, 1981.


84. Naumburg, Margaret. An Introduction to Art Therapy: Studies of the "Free" Art Expression of Behavior Problem Children and Adolescents as a Means of Diagnosis and Therapy. Teachers Col.


The Child and Aesthetic Development

Stanley Madeja

STANLEY S. MADEJA, PH.D., is the Executive Vice-President, CEMREL, Inc., St. Louis, Missouri. He was responsible for The Space Place—A Traveling Environment for Children and The Five Sense Store—An Aesthetic Design for Education, circulated by CEMREL, Inc. and the Smithsonian Institute Traveling Exhibit Service. Dr. Madeja is not only a professional artist but serves as an international consultant and lecturer to arts and education agencies and institutions. He has published numerous papers, articles, books, and films on arts and education.

All of us who work in the arts would be more comfortable if there were an ordering theory which defined levels of human development in one or more art forms. The neat categories or levels which describe how a person develops artistically would be very useful for the design of activities or programs in arts education. Unfortunately, what exists now in each of the arts is part of the iceberg. In music we have some schema which discern levels of pitch discrimination, in the visual arts a developmental scale of children's visual configurations, i.e. drawings, and in movement we have defined motor skills appropriate to a given age. There is a minimal amount of research which provides for the arts theory which could be thought of as encompassing all the facets of artistic development. This does not imply that the arts are lacking in their research or in their theory development, as we can make the statement that no theory of child development is really applicable to all categories of human development. Piaget, or Bruner, only deal with "parts" of the domain of human development and give clues or inferences to categories outside their domain of study.

The arts are concerned and should be concerned about how we develop artistically and aesthetically. Each of the art fields have taken the most obvious and observable phenomenon within them to study and categorize. In my own field the visual arts, the visual statement by the child, the painting or drawing has been the most researched area. Harris, Goodenough, Lark-Horwitz, Henry Schaeffer-Zimmer, Lowenfeld, Eisner have all developed in one form or another developmental levels or categories for children's art work. The levels of drawing categorized by Lowenfeld ¹ still predominate this literature (the scribbling, preschematic, schematic, realism, pseudo-naturalistic stages). Comparatively very little work has been done on children's responses to art. David Ecker, David Perkins, Ralph Smith and Brent Wilson have to some extent started to categorize the student's verbal response to

an art object or event, but any developmental schema for verbal response to the work is still forthcoming.

The need for better understanding of the total process of artistic development is surely one of the needs in the arts and would contribute to larger concern of human development. The questions are how might we go about gaining this understanding in the arts and what areas of study should be developed to broaden our knowledge base and make the linkages to the broader domain of human development? I would propose that three areas be studied which are generalizable to all the arts and contribute to aesthetic and artistic development, and further human development. Aesthetic perception, the critical process, and knowledge about the arts, these all contribute to the creative or artistic process and are essential to human development.

Aesthetic Perception

The way the artist perceives the object or event can be learned. The "artistic eye," "artistic vision," or the "aesthetic ear" are all catch phrases for being able to observe, or hear the arts object or event as the artist does. Perceiving the art object or event goes beyond merely looking or hearing an object or event, as perception implies some intellectual process. Arnheim made it quite clear that the perceptual process is a cognitive function of human intellect.

Arts appreciation is closely linked to the ability of the individual to perceive the object. Simply observing or looking at a work and recognizing it for what it is—a painting, a sculpture, a symphony—is the lowest level of appreciation. Further analysis and description of the objects, whether by recognition of the parts or by recognition of relationships between the parts or through knowledge about the object, become higher levels of perception and lead us to appreciation. I have defined four levels of perceptual learning that are based on the work of Arnheim. The levels are (1) observation, (2) description or relationships, (3) selectivity, (4) and generalization of form. These all contribute to the aesthetic development of the student and are applicable to all the arts. For the purpose of this paper I have chosen to elaborate on the visual arts.

Levels of Perceptual Learning for the Visual Arts

Observation: If acute visual, sensitivity is to be an outcome of art education, then one of the major skills that must be developed by the child is observation. The term "observation" is difficult to define since it alludes to many levels of understanding. Some people may observe phenomena but not be able to analyze their visual content; others may see parts of the whole but never the total object; while others may observe colors but not relate them to other visual elements, such as shape or texture.

I speculate that children can be taught to observe, just as they are taught to read, or listen. Art exercises in observation can be designed so that the child becomes conscious of various types of visual stimuli. The student can be trained through art, as in the science lab, to develop a capacity for receiving and judging a variety of visual phenomena.

Description of Visual Relationships: How children begin to handle relationships in existing visual phenomena may well determine their ability to select and generalize visually in and out of the context of his environment. It would seem logical that if children were able to recognize and describe either visually or orally relationships between such art elements as line, shape, color, and texture, their chances of later being able to generalize and discuss formal relationships would be enhanced.

This hypothesis is supported by Arnheim, who states that visual perception constantly involves the apprehension of relationships between the whole of the visual field and some item within it. Piaget concurs and thinks that the establishment of relationships is one of the principal cognitive mechanisms. In perception, such mental operations function within "rules of grouping by similarity" such as shape, color, movements, as described by Gestalt psychologists.

The implication of Arnheim's theories for instruction in art is that art activities should be created that have different structural ori-

---


2Arnheim, Visual Thinking, p. 6.
entations. The first step might be the description and recognition of visual relationships without an overall context. Using the element of shape, for instance, children might be given a varied group of blocks with geometric and nongeometric designs on them to sort along these two parameters in a series of problems. A second set of activities might use other structural elements, such as line or color, in relation to geometric or nongeometric shapes in environmental settings, as in a room or in a given group of paintings. In this way, these elements are brought into a visual context; they are no longer abstract concepts for the student. In Piaget's terms, this is "concrete" experience applied to the early stages of art appreciation. However, it is imperative that the transfer be made from these simple classification and sorting tasks that use the elements out of context to activities that engage the student in perceiving these elements in works of art.

Selectivity: The process of selection is similar to the method by which a photographer chooses parts out of the whole by using a camera's viewfinder. The problem of selectivity involves the cognitive function of recognition and the ordering and simplification of visual phenomena. Selectivity, thus, is a part of direct perception. Arnheim indicates that all cognitive activity presupposes selection and that the mind must focus on the subject to be considered and thereby lift it out of the continuum of the total given world. To establish the proper range—how much to include, how much to exclude—is the crucial aspect of problem solving. Perception is selective by its very nature.

Selection of visual phenomena from any given natural or artificial environment becomes the source of information for making aesthetic judgments. Children, given a visual stimulus, must sort out the irrelevant visual components and extract content that has meaning for them. When drawing, children are continually selecting from visual stimuli and making judgments about what to include and what not to include in their pictures. Selecting during the early years may be only a matter of making choices about the visual components, but later implies the organization of visual elements into compositions. This elementary exercise in developing and using criteria for selection is a necessary step toward conceptual thinking and is as relevant to the creation of art as it is to the appreciation of art.

Generalization of Form: "Generalization of form" implies the ability to synthesize visual principles. It implies that the student will have the ability to analyze visual phenomena and then be able to make a verbal statement. "Generalization of form" also concerns the ability to take apparently unrelated visual phenomena and bring them into a generalizable whole. The ability to talk about or explain the work of art in its totality and generalize about its content distinguishes this kind of perception from the others.

The simple recognition of the parts or elements of the work does not involve the larger context of the work. In generalizing the form of the work, the student should be concerned, for instance, with the relationship between the colors in the painting and the linear design used to hold the painting together or with how an artist has divided the canvas and created a geometric pattern that gives the illusion of positive and negative space. These are generalizations about the form of the work of art that characterize the total composition and the relationships that exist between the elements.

The implication of learning how to perceive as the artist does for art appreciation is that activities emphasized in each category can be used for heightening critical and appreciative skills in all the arts.

The development of perceptual skill inevitably becomes involved with the problem of analysis. When one speaks of "understanding," it is assumed that one refers to the cognitive aspect of appreciation. In this respect, we are asking the child to forgo his or her feelings for the moment and to bring some objective power of analysis to bear on his or her confrontation with the object. Where authorities differ is in their apprehension of the degree and kinds of activities that such an analytic process entails. Insofar as one cannot analyze without first looking and then being able to give some evidence of the process, we may assume that appreciative cognition begins in perception. Aesthetic experience also cannot be separated from a pre-existing body of knowledge, judgment, and classification in the experience of the participant.

Aesthetic perception is a process which is integral to the arts, it can be learned through
The arts, and is essential to human development. Arnheim contends all visual perception, the basis for visual concept formation, is essential to all cognition and recognition of form. In the educational process instruction must allow for the development of aesthetic perception. This is a "basic skill" necessary to enhance appreciation and understanding in every student.

The Critical Process

Another process which is generalizable across the arts applicable to all students, and integrally linked to the perception of the object is analysis of that object. Ralph Smith describes his method of critical activity as proceeding through four stages: description, analysis, interpretation, and evaluation. Feldman's classification is similar. He begins with description, proceeds to formal analysis, and, like Smith, follows this with an interpretive and judgmental stage. Each views description, interpretation, and judgment in basically the same light, yet interprets in his own way the analytic stage.

Broudy, in turn, describes four levels of critical activity, each dealing with different aspects of the work:

1. The vividness and intensity of the sensorial elements in the works of art; the affective quality of the sounds, gestures, and so on.
2. The formal qualities of the object, its design and composition.
3. The technical merits of the object, the skill with which the work is carried out.
4. The expressive significance of the object, its import or message or meaning as aesthetically expressed.

While Broudy does not include judgment as a fifth level, his writing in general seems to place great value upon it.

Critical procedure is also suggested by Barkan and Chapman in Guidelines for Art Instruction Through Television for Elementary Schools. In this publication, one of the few to deal with appreciation or aesthetic education for the elementary level, constant reference is made to description, interpretation, and explanation as levels of instruction, with judgment referred to as "tentative," that is, holding the percipient open to modification "in light of new experience and information."

One characteristic shared by all discussions of the critical process is the emphasis upon integrity of the art product and its effect upon the respondent. It is this belief in the value of viewing experience as it relates to the contemplation of the art work that constitutes the most significant meeting ground of the viewer and the aesthetic properties of the art object.

In order to do justice to appreciative "knowing" one cannot scatter one's attentions. The object must be isolated as a focus of attention so that all of the perceptual, emotional, and intellectual resources of the respondent may be organized for greatest effect. This brings us back to the other shared view of appreciation and aesthetic education: the need for a critical process that can provide a bridge between a raw affective "psychological report" and a judgment whose defense relies on the logical processes. Another analysis of such a process is made by Ecker. He divides the child's aesthetic judgment into two parts: a psychological report and value judgments. Ecker contends that when one looks at a work of art or an art event like a painting and responds to it by saying simply "I don't like it," or "I like it," this is only a psychological report, whereas value judgments are responses supported by arguments or evidence. On this
basis Ecker develops a four-step strategy for teaching aesthetic judgment. Initially, the student learns to distinguish between psychological reports and value judgments. Finally, the student's contact with various art forms is broadened in order to enhance his ability to justify the merit of an object or event, whether he likes it or not. I would not recommend classic criteria for what is beautiful and what is ugly and what is good art and what is bad art. What is implied here is that the nature of art appreciation lies in the process of perceiving rather than in learning various criteria on which to judge art. This is consistent with the changing nature of the art forms, as well as with what a school should be teaching relative to the visual arts. It is inconsistent to study art forms in any static format since the forms themselves are continually changing. Therefore, the implication for the arts in the school in the 1970's is that one can teach about the critical process, but the student ultimately will have to formulate his or her own criteria based on knowledge of the elements that make up the work, the techniques used by the artist, and the context in which the work was created.

From this brief attempt at a theoretical basis for appreciation, it is possible to reach some consensus on terminology used to describe critical analysis; however, there is less agreement on the process itself. In general, we may say that the engagement of viewers in the critical process becomes an analytic method by which they (1) perceive the work of art; (2) describe the work of art; (3) become conscious of the qualities of the work and analyze its substance; and (4) make a qualitative aesthetic judgment about the merit of the work only after having experienced the previous three steps. These steps become important to the teaching of arts appreciation as they are translated into activities for students. They form the process by which appreciation of art objects is heightened and taught and, enjoyed with greater intensity, and is applicable to all students.

Knowledge About the Arts

General knowledge about the art work itself can be a contributing factor to the appreciation process. This knowledge may be about such things as the historical context in which the art work was created, the style of the period in which the work was created and some of the characteristics of that style, and information about the artist: who he or she was, how he or she was trained, and by whom he or she was influenced. Knowledge of this type can contribute to general appreciation of the object.

Another knowledge base that can be useful for art appreciation is an understanding of arts elements. The viewer who has working definitions of such terms as balance, coherency, texture, color, form, line, and composition will be better able to appreciate the art form and will be more receptive to the totality of the work than one who does not.

The viewer who knows more about the art object should be better able to appreciate the overall aesthetic qualities of that object. Knowledge and appreciation are, however, not synonymous. Knowing about the arts does not necessarily assure appreciation. Knowing about art forms is only one part of the total process of art appreciation and creativity and should be viewed as a means rather than an end. Instead, knowledge about the art object should be regarded as a reinforcing factor in the total process of creating and appreciating the arts, and information should be introduced into arts activities when it is useful and appropriate to the situation. We can say that knowledge helps set the stage for a higher level of feeling. Knowledge consists not only of facts that can be committed to memory but also of the ability to identify the formal components of an arts object or event.

Summary

These three areas, aesthetic perception, the critical process, and knowledge about the arts all contribute to human development, cognitively and creatively. The arts in education are concerned about the creation of the object or event by the student as part of their education. The act of creating a work using perception, criticism and knowledge to solve the problem that is basic to all the arts. The basis for the instructional activity in school or the home is the experiencing and creating of the work of art. Making a dance, painting a picture, composing a musical composition, writing a poem are all creating in an art form and experiencing the process. This is essential to arts instruction but also essential to human development. The organism needs creative acts to
realize a sense of accomplishment and satisfaction.

In instruction in the arts for the handicapped, we should not ignore the basic constructs of education in the arts. Handicapped children need and deserve education in arts which teaches them to see, hear, move aesthetically, and gives them substantive knowledge about the arts in order to enhance their appreciation and understanding, and gives them the opportunity to create and experience the arts. All of these contribute to the "educated person" and we need not exclude the handicapped from this category. Adaptations are necessary to adjust to the various handicapped groups, but the case I am making is simple, you need not change the categories for artistic development because you are dealing with the handicapped. You only adjust the context or approach to fit their needs.

Discussion and Commentary

The central message of this paper is that aesthetic perception, critical judgment and knowledge about the arts can and should be taught. There are structured, reasoned and orderly ways to provide for the artistic development of children within the educational process.

Neglect of this important area in the education of children deprives them of valuable skills for judging their environment and improving the quality of their lives. It was noted that if people in general do not feel comfortable with the arts, it is because they have no confidence in their ability to relate in a logical way to it.

A need exists to cut through the fear and lack of personal experience that prevents participation and fosters negative and unhealthy attitudes toward the arts. Exposure to the arts during the educational process may be what is necessary. Most important may be influencing the teachers to recognize and cope with their own stereotypes about the arts in order to free them to teach aesthetic perception, critical judgment and knowledge about the arts.

It is essential to recognize that "we do not change the nature of the art when we deal with special populations." Rather we modify, we adapt, we adjust the approach to fit special needs.
Public Facilities, and Handicapped Patrons

Larry Molloy

LARRY MOLLOY is the director of the National Arts & the Handicapped Information Service, a consumer-demand information and referral center sponsored by the National Endowment for the Arts. An architect and writer, he has produced numerous publications and articles on educational facilities, planning joint school and community services, financial and architectural planning for college campuses, and designing for accessibility for the arts. Larry Molloy is a member of the Board of Directors of The National Committee.

Arts activities take place in a wide variety of facilities and locations: outdoors in parks, malls, and plazas; in cultural facilities such as museums, theaters, arenas, stadiums, and cinemas; in schools within gymnasiums, auditoriums, classrooms and studios; and in converted facilities such as railroad stations, firehouses, schools, barns, boats and trains. If handicapped people cannot get into or use the places where arts occur, then a relationship between arts and the handicapped is most unlikely.

Although many cultural facilities are not now architecturally accessible to handicapped patrons, an increasing number of them are built or renovated for easy access to people with mobility impairments, temporary injuries, arthritis, and people in wheelchairs. Much of this activity is due to federal, state and municipal laws that, since 1968, have required full accessibility in buildings built, renovated, or receiving public funds, a specification that includes almost all cultural facilities.

Laws, however, are not the most important factor in architectural accessibility to cultural facilities. Many exciting arts centers are accessible because administrators and officials made a personal commitment to provide equal access for all visitors. For example, the director of the Kimbell Art Museum in Fort Worth, Texas, steadfastly insisted that the building's design be free of barriers to the physically handicapped or the aged. In Spokane, Washington, handicapped citizens served on a jury to evaluate designs for the Washington State Pavilion, a performing arts center. In Chicago, consumer organizations representing handicapped people have successfully promoted widespread public acceptance of the need for accessibility. As a result, recent new and converted cultural facilities are making all the arts accessible—including studio facilities for handicapped students at the Art Institute of Chicago and a building-wide conversion for accessibility at the Field Museum of Natural History.

On a larger scale, Smithsonian Institution officials obtained federal funds to study the problems of museum accessibility—including interior design, communications, and exhibition display. Their findings were incorporated...
into the design of the National Air and Space Museum in Washington, D.C., that includes many amenities for the handicapped that are enthusiastically adopted by the public: participatory displays, multimedia communications and artifacts that encourage visitors to feel and explore—even a piece of the Moon to touch.

In short, cultural centers are moving inexorably toward equal architectural access to all people. All accessible cultural centers report improved attendance. Most also report that accessible facilities do not necessarily cost more than conventional design and construction. In fact, the director of city planning in Binghamton, New York, says that the extra costs for building an accessible second level plaza and bridge system linking government buildings with arts facilities and commercial spaces have paid off by stimulating development in the downtown area.

Architectural accessibility is encouraged by a wealth of publications, newsletters, materials and information. However, architectural accessibility is only the first step in accommodating handicapped patrons. Designers and administrators must also consider their needs for furniture, equipment, lighting, signage, and interior design. More important, new techniques in programs, services, communications, and education are required if retarded, deaf, blind, and learning disabled people are to have equal access to the arts. In these areas, there is very little specific information or research that is available to the art community.

Nevertheless, a few cultural centers are beginning to meet the challenge. The National Air & Space Museum, for example, embraces many new exhibition techniques that dramatize man and machines in flight. The Museum's flight technology gallery features puppet characters who explain scientific principles and thus heighten learning for mentally retarded and learning disabled youngsters. For deaf visitors, the Oakland Museum in California trains docents who provide sign language tours and interpret lectures. More than a dozen tactile sculpture galleries designed for blind visitors provide hands-on experience for all citizens. And the Metropolitan Museum of Art in New York gives special education classes for blind students who are allowed to feel the museum's artifacts while listening to taped lectures.

Youth museums are pioneering new participatory environments that heighten the arts experience and encourage learning. In an exhibit on dental health at the Jacksonville Children's Museum in Florida, for example, youngsters enter a giant open mouth and walk on teeth to check for cavities, or sit on the tongue to watch films about dental hygiene.

These and hundreds of other innovations are making arts facilities usable for handicapped visitors and students. More important, the innovations are creating better environments and arts experiences for the nonhandicapped public. Nevertheless, there are many unanswered questions about how arts facilities and their programs can be altered to serve handicapped patrons. For example, the National Arts and the Handicapped Information Service, a consumer-demand information and referral center sponsored by the National Endowment for the Arts, receives hundreds of questions about access to the arts every week. Rummaging through this week's batch of letters, here is a sample:

How can museum lighting be converted to maximize sight for people with low vision?

What is the best graphics system to help handicapped people orient themselves to the museum's collections?

What is the cheapest, acceptable method for providing access to the upper floors?

How can theaters be designed for deaf and blind patrons?

Please send me a list of accessible, professional arts schools with programs serving blind and deaf students.

How can an exhibition of photography be made accessible to blind and visually impaired visitors?

What is the best relationship between museum education departments and public school arts programs and how do I get it started?

Please send all available information about the construction of an accessible arts float for a parade celebrating our city's centennial.

Questions like these indicate that many public arts facilities have made a willing commitment toward developing new and better arts
programs for their handicapped citizens. With answers to their questions and support for their programs, cultural centers can take an active lead in making the arts a part of the lives of handicapped people.

For example, the Philadelphia Museum of Art offers a studio course in fine arts for blind adults. Advanced classes exhibit regularly throughout the city, and several students have become professional artists. In Washington, D.C., Arena Stage, an accessible theater and studio building, houses the Living Stage program, a professional performing arts company that brings public school students to the center for mainstreamed arts activities. The company also travels to public schools, and conducts workshops for parents and teachers. Also related to school students, the Hudson River Museum in Westchester, N.Y., circulates 20 different art education "discovery kits" containing objects to handle, photographic panels, suggestions for activities, and a teacher's manual. In Boston, the Community Music Center offers music therapy programs, administered by registered therapists, to citizens and students at the center and in public schools.

Clearly, cultural centers can offer a wealth of services, resources, and creative innovations. More important, the arts reflect and inspire the hopes and struggles of society. Struggling for their place in society, handicapped people can infuse the arts with a completely new range of human experiences, and through the arts inspire the public to accept them for their gifts rather than their needs.

Discussion and Commentary

Several very important points are made in this paper on the accessibility of arts facilities to handicapped persons. Most importantly, though, is the evidence of increasing sophistication in what constitutes accessibility. We are rapidly coming to recognize that accessibility means not just wheelchair ramps and wider doors and the removal of barriers but also provisions for the intake of information by the sensory impaired and the provision of specialized materials for persons with reading disability or mental retardation who visit museums and cultural centers. Interestingly, these specialized materials and provisions prove to be very popular with the general public as well.

Teachers need to be informed as to where the arts are available to their handicapped students and how to use them to the best advantage. It may be necessary to dispel the doubts and prejudices that teachers have about the arts in order to convince them of the value in these experiences.

The arts take place in a wide variety of settings across the nation. In general, the attitude of acceptance is as important as the accessibility if handicapped persons are to feel welcome and comfortable.
Career Development and Leisure Time

Judith E. Goldstein

JUDITH E. GOLDSTEIN has specialized in the development of a model training program to prepare therapeutic recreation personnel to work with handicapped populations. She has also devoted herself to directing leisure time and recreation projects for handicapped children and youth. Ms. Goldstein has published numerous articles in the fields of recreation, leisure, education and career education.

Yes, boys and girls shout and scream and make their various claims on us (not to mention themselves). But often they keep for themselves much that is lively, canny, speculative. The ferment of their minds may be conveyed in their artistic efforts—especially if those efforts are encouraged by respectful parents or teachers. (Cohen and Gainer, 1976, p. viii)

Robert Coles' statement is particularly significant when applied to children and youth whose expressive behavior is impaired or limited and whose literal and figurative "shouts and screams" are reduced to whispers, to impotent gestures. If normal children keep much of their inner life and aliveness to themselves, then handicapped children—beset by strictures, barriers, and vulnerabilities—must surely reveal to the world a mere glimmer of their feelings, thoughts, and sensibilities. If the "ferment" of the minds of fully functioning children and youth may be conveyed in their artistic efforts, then, without doubt, the uniqueness and richness of the handicapped children's inner world may become visible through involvement in the arts. If it is desirable to encourage young people to shape and reveal themselves in the "here-and-now" in relation to others, then it is imperative that "respectful" parents, teachers, and facilitators help handicapped young people learn the skills and have the opportunities to do so.

Dual Deprivation

Artistic efforts may occupy a primary or secondary place in both work and leisure (nonwork) time. However, for the handicapped person—young or old—entering the job market is, at best, a frustrating experience. He or she must face discrimination, reluctant (and often hostile) employers, restricted employment options, undesirable and unchal---

* Brevity has precluded both an in-depth review of the concepts and dimensions of leisure and richness of the arts and a thorough exploration of the parallels and interrelationships of the arts, leisure time, and career development. Readers are invited to pursue the perspectives within this paper at their leisure.
lenging tasks, unpreparedness for the intense competition. The reality is disheartening and deplorable: "... even through 97 percent of [the] handicapped have a potential for gainful employment ... only 30 percent find an outlet for their vocational needs." (Appell, 1976, p. 3) A statement made by the Deputy Commissioner of the Bureau of Education for the Handicapped in the 1975 report of the National Advisory Committee on the Handicapped presents a bleak picture:

Only 21 percent of the handicapped children leaving schools in the next four years will be fully employed or go on to college. Another 40 percent will be underemployed, and 26 percent will be unemployed. An additional 10 percent will require at least a partially sheltered setting and family, and 3 percent will probably be almost totally dependent.

As general unemployment in the United States increases and brings greater numbers of skilled and highly qualified workers into competition for jobs, the forecast for handicapped persons seeking work appears even more grim.

Ironically, handicapped individuals have free and easy entry into the nonwork world. They frequently have an overabundance of unobligated time. Forced to fill most (or a good portion) of the day with activity without skills or guidance ... forced to endure sameness and experiential deprivation in institutions ... forced into social isolation by peers and humanity en mass ... handicapped persons frequently face the slow erosion of their aliveness with each swing of the pendulum of the external and internal clocks. For, "Free time, in and of itself, is not tantamount to leisure: Free time is transformed into leisure according to the way in which it is viewed and used." (Goldstein and Verhoven, 1976, p. 3) As Appell notes:

For some, the disabled and the handicapped in particular, [leisure] is the bane of existence. Seldom are [they] taught how to use their free time wisely. The availability of time, which can hang heavy, is not the issue. The constructive use of that time, to improve the quality of life is what is at stake. Without the avocational skill component in their survival kit, the handicapped become prisoners of their free time. (1973, pp. 4-5)

Without doubt, the obstacles facing the handicapped individual in realizing satisfying use of free time are not inability or unwillingness; they are privation, ignorance, and isolation.

This dual deprivation may continue to exist for years to come for many handicapped persons. However, there are ways of approaching the problem from several perspectives through the arts. Arts involvement is personal, possible in some form for practically handicapped child, has intrinsic and extrinsic rewards, promotes lifelong learning and participation, and facilitates the acquisition of many basic life skills. Arts may be pursued as a vocation and as an avocation. And, in combination, they are enhanced in work as in leisure.

Career Development

What approaches are there to facilitate entry into and mobility within careers in the arts? Several are available: (1) provision of instruction in specific arts disciplines; (2) infusion of the arts in basic education; (3) provision of specialized arts education and enrichment experiences; (4) provision of a program of career education in the fine arts and humanities and/or leisure occupations, both designated career education areas; (5) provision of a leisure education program; and (6) encouragement of arts-related involvements during leisure time. All are valid and may be used singly or in combination. The last — using leisure time as a way of developing and reinforcing skills, attitudes, values, and knowledge appropriate for application to careers in the arts — is worthy of in-depth examination; of the six, it has probably received the least serious attention. (It is possible to view approach 6 as a component of approach 5.)

According to Compton (1976, p. 2-3):

Career development research indicates that activities which stimulate career awareness and career development should begin at an early developmental level. A child should learn at an early age that work is an entity, work is good, and that others about him/her are working for many purposes and performing many different tasks. Early exposure to the world of work can foster positive attitudinal development for later contacts with work.

In addition to work, the child should be taught the value of leisure. Work and leisure
are both important and must be put into perspective for the young child.

Career development is a process of growth and learning which is closely related to general human development. Research in career development indicates that it is a continuous and fluid process which can be divided into segments or life phases according to where major choice points occur. (p. 2-9)

Jordan (1976, p. 25) believes that additional elements are necessary in career education and development in addition to training in a specific vocation—instruction in personal skills to deal with change and independence and achieve maximum functioning and adaptability. Heilman (1977, pp. 75-76) suggests that instruction is careers-oriented when (1) the student is conscious of the implications that the learning activity has on one or more of his or her present or future life roles: occupational, family, citizen, and avocational and (2) when the learning activity includes a realistic application to one or more of the student’s present or future life roles.

As conceptualized by the U.S. Office of Education, career education is a four-stage process: (1) awareness; (2) exploration; (3) orientation; and (4) skill development. (Verhoven and Vinton, 1972, p. 2-3) Leisure education is also viewed as a multi-phase process with similar stages. (Hawkins & Associates, 1976) In fact, many of the goals and objectives of the two types of programs are similar, if not identical. Each seeks to maximize functional capacity; or, develop motivation, responsibility, independence, and competence. Both are means to enhance interpersonal relationships, to gain knowledge of self and others, to strengthen self-concept and self-acceptance. Therefore, the commonalities—in spite of the different focus—would allow attainment of some of the same goals in either work or leisure time frames, and the benefits and accomplishments in one sphere would further progress in the other.

The quotations on the following page illustrate complementary/supplementary nature of leisure education and career education.

- "Since the arts are integral to man, they must be central in the educational experiences of all children." (Perks, 1977, p. 7)
- "Art facilitates the 'inner journey' of the human potential—the goal of developing one's capacities and talents of understanding and accepting oneself, one of harmonizing and integrating one's motives." (Pressman, 1977, p. 13)
- "In addition to the inherent value of the arts, they also provide for expression, movement, observation, feeling, exploration and other important experiences central to human growth." (Brannan, 1977, p. 1)
- Perceptions and emotions are the "stuff from which the arts are made, and are basic to creative behavior." (Madeja, 1973, p. 2)
- "Art, however, is not a diversion from the business of learning. Studies of children's development indicate that art activities provide direction, clarification, and reinforcement of new concepts. They are sought with relish and diligence by curious youngsters." (Cohen and Gainer, 1976, p. 9)
- "There should be no failure possible in the arts. There should be only degrees of success if arts programs are approached properly. Each child in his own unique way expresses himself through the arts, sometimes eloquently, sometimes haltingly, sometimes in very limited ways; but each expression of himself through the arts is a success." (Kukuk, 1976, p. 7)
- "Handicapped persons, like other individuals, must have the opportunity to make the arts a vital and important part of their existence. Involvement in the arts assists handicapped citizens to develop creative outlets and can help individuals who need to overcome problems of social isolation and negative self-concept." (Cassiano, 1976, p. 56)
- "The traditional function of the arts is to press tools into the service of non-technological goals: to focus the imagination and feelings on things to be enjoyed for their own sake; to teach lessons about enduring human themes; to provide continuities through time. In the arts people can express or at least share great emotions and moving ideas; people can reveal all that is profound in human affairs from the mystical to the urbane." (Bundy, 1973b, pp. 3-4)
- "There are those who claim that basic skills, or life skills, are of primary importance to normalization. Few will deny that the basic skills are primary to the survival of the
handicapped individual in society, but we must question whether or not the only way to teach these and other skills is through the traditional and often self-defeating verbal/written approach... we must open the door to the joy of creative learning through the arts. With the arts we can help these students to attain the survival skills and build within them a foundation of arts skills needed for a fuller and more rewarding life." (Kukuk, 1976, pp. 1-2)

Career-Enhancing Aspects of Arts Involvement During Leisure

During leisure time wisely used an individual may consistently and continually reinforce skills which are used during work or which are supportive of achievement and performance of some aspect of work. There is also a chance to achieve a level of confidence and competence in a variety of skills necessary for initial employability. There is also a possibility of an avocational interest evolving into a vocational direction.

One of the topics addressed by Park (1976, p. 51), Goldstein and Verhoven (1976, p. 40), Hawkins & Associates (1976), and numerous others in various helping professions is risk-taking and its importance in the growth and development of all individuals, but especially handicapped persons. The arts offer a variety of media through which to take different types and levels of risk: to move through space without boundaries and structured patterns; to put the first brush stroke on an empty canvas; to hear one's voice on tape for the first time; to perform before an audience; to display feelings through a poem. And leisure time provides a relatively safe, non-pressured situation in which to deal with the feelings and problems associated with venturing into the unknown. To experience the letting go—physically, emotionally, and socially—which is an integral part of life-changing behavior in leisure as well as work.

Decision-making is an important element of leisure behavior and is crucial to successful performance of almost any job. The arts offer an infinite variety of decision-points: choice of colors, textures, forms, materials, designs, words, pictures, sounds; how to achieve balance, asymmetry, harmony, moods. By combining these options for personal choice and the need to make decisions about how to use free time, considerable progress can be made toward coping with decision-making where something significant is at stake in a job setting.

For handicapped children, the margin for self-determined action within and impact upon the environment is frequently decreased. The normal dependence of childhood is intensified and movement is even more curtailed. These boundaries are often most pronounced in the physical environment, especially when disabilities involve impaired vision and mobility limitations. Additionally, because the physical world is usually determined and arranged (and decorated) by adults, there is rarely an opportunity for children to alter their surroundings and personalize the spaces, surfaces, and configurations. Movement and the ability to make an impact upon the life-space and the people in it are two important elements in most job situations.

During the time a child spends in activities of his or her choice, he or she is able to experiment with motion and mobility and receive feedback from others (and internal cues) about the interaction of body and space and body-parts and arts tools and materials. The products enduring as a result of an encounter in the arts provide tangible proof of existence and impact. Decorating, shifting, rearranging, tearing down indicate personal power and capability.

The array of possibilities and desired outcomes on the following page are all applicable to career development and work circumstances. Therefore, there is good reason to study the connection between career development and the utilization of leisure time.

Facilitating Involvement in the Arts During Leisure Time

It is not sufficient for handicapped children and youth to acquire the skills, knowledge, attitudes, and values which enable them to participate in the arts and make satisfying decisions about use of their leisure time. They must have opportunities for participation, observation, and continuing education in the home or institution, schools, and immediate environs. The arts (and therefore involvement in the arts during leisure) may be seen as one bridge from the living-space to the more expansive and less restrictive environment of the neighborhood or community.
The Arts... Satisfying Use of Leisure Time
Equivalency of Possibilities and Desired Outcomes

**SELF**
personal growth, evolution of identity
pride, self-respect, self-acceptance
creativity, experimentation, risk-taking
independence, competence, mastery, power
success, assertiveness, power, achievement
motivation, purpose, discovery
dreams, spontaneity, aspirations
joy, pleasure, exhilaration
choice, values, preferences
basic skill development/arts skill development
flexibility, problem-solving
relaxation, rejuvenation
personalization, actualization, dignity
expression, communication (internal)
meaning, **raison d'être**

**OTHERS**
socialization, relationship
coping, communication
acceptance, belonging
social integration, normalization
caring, giving, sharing
contribution, impact

**PHYSICAL AND CULTURAL ENVIRONMENT**
impact, change
knowledge, understanding
aesthetic awareness
reality orientation
sense of continuity
contribution
testing
The arts are the only subjects taught in the schools which have immediately recognizable counterparts in the community—artists, performers, and arts organizations engaged in making and presenting the genuine, authentic product. . . . (Madeja, 1973, p. 4)

Because these opportunities exist within the community for observing and relating to career and human role models, handicapped children and youth have the chance to "do their thing" during leisure and to see what else they might like to do or in what other ways they might use their talents and meet their needs through work. From this perspective, it appears that involvement in the arts during leisure time has definite potential for stimulating and encouraging career development.

Factors associated with facilitating leisure time involvement in the arts include: transportation, attitudes, economically feasible options, architectural design and construction, understanding of the special physical and emotional needs of handicapped individuals, and a climate which allows the handicapped child to explore, experiment, risk, and achieve higher levels of creation and contribution. If these elements are present, the child will, in all likelihood, search out spaces, places, and people and get on with the sometimes leisurely, sometimes intense pursuit of artistic avocation and vocation.

In Sum

Many will agree with Appell (1976, p. 1): participation of handicapped persons in the arts offers the practical possibility of not only enjoyment but also economic reward. To be sure, handicapped persons have made significant contributions to the cultural heritage of the world and have achieved international fame and financial reward in the process. For every "star" there are hundreds of talented, creative handicapped children and youth who are demonstrating their capabilities to a smaller, yet no less appreciative audience. There are also thousands of creative and performing artists "in the wings," yet to become visible even to themselves.

Every person is capable of creative thinking and creative acting. The degree of thought and action is influenced by a multitude of factors. . . . Somewhere, however, in the fabric of this background pattern, there is probably someone or something whose impact set the wheels of creativity in motion. The extent or momentum of this motion or creative "thrust" is in direct proportion to the impression or impact made. (Godwin, 1974, p. 61)

If those who guide the development and education of handicapped children and youth have the foresight and insight to see leisure as an opportunity to leave the prescriptions and proscriptions of society and shape a personal mode of being and becoming . . . if they encourage involvement in the arts and leisure as both a means and an end . . . then perhaps each handicapped child will find the "someone or something" to inspire the determination necessary to take the risk with full knowledge of the rewards and strive for contribution and personhood through a career in the arts.

This paper presents a view of career development as a life-long process of growth and development leading to the goal of achieving the best of all possible lives for each striving individual. In this context, the importance of the arts as a way of developing attitudes, feelings and awareness is emphasized. Some essential work behaviors and skills important to successful performance as a worker can be learned through involvement in the arts. Feelings of self-worth and competency are often a by-product of participation in arts activities and these qualities are significant in reaching maximum human potential.

It may be that leisure-time involvement in the arts could lead to paid employment for handicapped persons. While the job market in the arts may not be dependable, it is also true that inasmuch as the arts do not fit the usual marketing pattern for employment, they offer some uniquely individualized avenues for personal satisfaction as well as improvement of the quality of life.

While describing the lives of many handicapped individuals as bleak, isolated and deprived, the author suggests that to encourage handicapped people to seek arts experiences, active efforts must be initiated through programming, accessibility, transportation, and communication strategies.
References


Bundy, Robert F. 1973a. "Futuring and the Humanities and Arts." Paper emanating from a planning conference with members of the Division of the Humanities and the Arts of the New York State Education Department.


The Role of The Artist in Working with Handicapped People

Joan Newberg

JOAN NEWBERG is currently the Executive Director of the San Fernando Valley Arts Council. She is the past president of the Alliance of California Arts Councils, which is a state-wide network of 150 California municipal arts commissions and community arts councils, and the former Chairwoman of the California Alliance for Arts Education. She also initiated the development of the first VERY SPECIAL ARTS FESTIVAL in California and serves as coordinator of a National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped model site project.

It is the artist who as a creative agent will establish the basis for meaningful aesthetic experiences and open up the world of the arts for the handicapped. He can become a catalyst for fundamental change in the education of physically, mentally and emotionally handicapped persons.

The approach of the artist in designing programs for the handicapped must be to go beyond the usual concept of music or art as therapy, and utilize the arts process as an alternative approach to learning. The artist can also provide alternative learning environments that will enhance perception, and assist in the development of the ability to communicate creatively.

The artist as a facilitator has an important role to extend the limited environment of the handicapped person. He has a special way of viewing the world and relating to the senses, experiences which are often lacking in the education of handicapped individuals. The artist brings new tools—to educate and to communicate. He is yet another positive experience that can balance the weight of the negative experiences often shared by the handicapped.

In his role as artist-educator-therapist, he must be flexible, sensitive and understanding. Artists who will be successful in arts programs for the handicapped must have a clear commitment to their own work and a sense of direction in which they are moving as artists. His own personal relationships with people will need to be strong to allow him to reject and buttress the many disappointments he may experience in the process.

A sensitive, skilled artist will not need to function as therapist, but must have the ability to refer handicapped persons to trained professional staff when necessary. The artist must be allowed to participate in the whole planning process—free to experiment and create new approaches to problem solving situations, and be capable of designing new tools and adaptive devices to allow handicapped persons to participate in creative experiences.

In service training of artists and staff development for special education personnel in developing strategies for arts programs must be a key component of all programs. The sharing process between the artist and special educators will enable the artist to understand diff-
different disabilities, allow the artist to design and individualize arts experiences, and be sen-
sitive to the realities of the unique setting and
the special needs of the diverse handicapped
population.

Only professional artists of proven ability
should be selected to participate in programs
as painters, filmmakers, dancers, musicians,
poets, writers, sculptors, puppeteers, craftsmen
and creative dramatists.

Although the artist in his role will not be
cconcerned primarily with training professional
artists; handicapped persons have as much
right to become professional artists, as their
accessibility to the arts is deemed a right and
not a privilege.

The artist must create quality arts experi-
ences that will relate to those participating in
such a way that they will be able to continue to
grow after the artist leaves. Artists must
also function in a manner conducive to their
own artistic development. The artist's experi-
ences with handicapped persons will allow for
the expansion of his own personal visions as
well as his ability to work with adaptive pro-
cesses. He will be able to integrate these new
techniques into his own way of creating. His
experiences with the handicapped will pro-
vide new insights into the meaning of the arts

The Visiting Artist Program, developed by
the Connecticut Commission on the Arts, dis-
covered that, "the sharing of an artist's vision
with others can produce a collective vision, a
creative act with its own unique dynamic. It
is an opportunity to establish a sense that
everyone may share in the ownership of the
creative process"

How can the artist reach the handicapped
individual through sensory experiences, and
cause a major breakthrough in communica-
tion?

Bella Lewitzky, dancer and educator, has a
belief in the deep significance of movement and
the kinesthetic sense. She has witnessed a
non hearing dance group move magnificently.
She states that this is the epitome and veri-
fication of what handicapped people can
achieve in the arts. Through kinetic motor and
sensory forms, we can prepare the ground
work for movement experiences. Dance, un-
like other art forms, can create energy, she
says. "Artists can manufacture energy and dis-
pense it with skill and artistry." The artist's
involvement creates a new improved level of
energy for the handicapped person. The role
of the artist is to communicate the value and
language of movement as a perceptual and
conceptual discipline, and to encourage the
handicapped individual to experience the kin-
esthetic senses. She believes it is the role of
the artist to free a person to assess his envi-
ronment through physical perceptions, and to
introduce him to his own individual potential
realized through the creativity of the art form.

It must be the role of the artist to collabo-
rate with special educators to utilize the arts
process and design programs as an integral
certainty of the basic education of handicapped
people. Concepts formulated by the Pennsyl-
vania Department of Education indicate that
in the educational environment, the artist's
modes of activity are translated into process.
Artists as communicators, can assist individu-
als in perceiving and responding to their so-
cial and physical environments.

We have just begun to recognize the basic
rights of handicapped persons toward a richer,
fuller and more humane life. The city of Los
Angeles has just initiated a costly program of
paving the streets so that handicapped persons
can navigate more effectively. We must also
offer a humanistic approach and recognize
their rights to get in touch with the world
around them and communicate more effectiv-
ely.

The artist and the arts will play a key role
in this process. However, the task ahead will
not be easy. We will need to research, evalu-
ate and document strategies for effective arts
programs and assess the role of the artist in
its implementation for as Machiavelli sum-
marized so succinctly in The Prince, "There is
nothing more difficult to take in hand, more
perilous to conduct, or more uncertain in its
success, than to take the lead in the introdus-
tion of a new order of things because the in-
novator has for enemies all those who have
done well under the old conditions, and Luke
warm defenders in those who may do well
under the new."

Several key points are made here. Foremost
among them is highlighting the need to move
away from a product orientation to a process
orientation, seeing the aesthetics of arts ex-
periences as viable goals in themselves. Ar

51
Artists can contribute their creativity in developing ways to teach the arts to handicapped children and through this involvement can grow personally and professionally.

While it is pointed out that artists not only need internal qualities of sensitivity and commitment, these will not suffice without training programs to prepare artists to work with handicapped individuals. Learning the special needs and constraints of various handicapping conditions is basic to designing strategies for offering creative experiences.

It must be recognized that we are only beginning to understand what the role of the artist should be in working with handicapped individuals. Artists can certainly serve as facilitators or catalysts in the development of innovative programming for handicapped people. There is a strong need to evaluate what is happening now as we introduce this relationship of artist to handicapped person, documenting strategies, assessing effectiveness and sharing the knowledge gained. There is also a crucial need for "new tools and adaptive devices" to facilitate arts programming for special populations.
JACK KUKUK is the Assistant Director of the National Alliance for Arts Education at the John F. Kennedy Center for the Performing Arts. His responsibilities include supervision and direction of showcase arts programs for children and youth at the Kennedy Center and special outreach activities throughout the nation. He is a founding member of the Board of Directors of The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped. Mr. Kukuk recently served on the cultural affairs panel for the White House Conference on Handicapped Individuals.

For several years an increasing number of Federal, State, local government and private organizations have been working toward the goal of providing ALL THE ARTS FOR EVERY CHILD. It was not until 1975 when The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped was established through the Alliance for Arts Education, that most of those concerned with attaining this goal fully realized that the phrase "every child" included all handicapped as well as non-handicapped students.

As strong arts and aesthetics education programs begin to emerge, even in the midst of the back to basics movement, we are faced with a fundamental concern, that is, how to deal with the special needs of the special child.

In the not too distant past, these children were treated as different and unacceptable. They were forced into isolation, either through overt action or by the erection of unconscious barriers to their normal function in society. Recently a national conscience has been awakened and it is recognized that all persons have essentially the same needs. With this realization, we have turned towards normalization and are making an effort to bring handicapped citizens into the mainstream of society. To do this, the best methods of approaching the normalization process must be assessed.

Few educators question the fact that basic skills, or life skills are of prime importance for survival of the handicapped in society. The question which must be asked, however, is whether or not the traditional and often self-defeating, verbal/written approach is the best method of teaching those skills. By placing emphasis on this approach, we compound the problems of the speech impaired, the hearing impaired, the retarded and many others with different learning styles. Through the arts we can help these students attain the survival skills and at the same time build within them...
a foundation of arts skills needed for a fuller and more rewarding life.

Students respond with a high level of enthusiasm to the arts which provide a variety of modes of reinforcement to the cognitive skills being presented. According to Piaget and other learning theorists, acquisition of cognitive skills relies on non-verbal activities: manipulation, sorting, constructing, interpreting shapes and symbols and making judgments based on different points of view.

Through the arts process and arts activities, aesthetic judgments are made which lead the child to an understanding of concepts rather than to a recitation of facts learned by rote.

Jerome Bruner has described the role of the arts in helping us to realize relationships and make connections as one of the most exciting aspects of learning.

Too often we forget that a major portion of all lifetime knowledge is learned before a child begins his or her formal schooling. This knowledge is gained through storytelling, drawing or looking at pictures, singing and listening to songs, and participating in games and dancing and other related activities. These activities make the child eager and excited about entering the formal education program but ... what happens as the child moves into the formal school situation? We tell them to sit down, to be quiet, and to stop acting. In effect, they are told to stop enjoying learning because it is serious business.

The inclusion of special programs for handicapped students in the private schools of the United States began as early as 1832, and in the public schools of the United States as early as 1869, according to Dr. Richard Graham, University of Georgia. These programs have steadily broadened in scope and number since that time. Now school districts, by law, must offer or make provisions for programs for the handicapped student that are equal to those offered the non-handicapped child.

A survey by The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped shows evidence of a wide disparity between the levels of services for the handicapped and for their non-handicapped peers. The elimination of this disparity and the inclusion of quality comprehensive arts education programs for all students is one of the major goals of this committee.

In order to clarify the meaning of comprehensive arts-education programs, it is necessary to define the three major components of such a program. First, Arts in Basic Education. This component represents an infusion of the arts into the basic curriculum. Through this infusion process, the arts become basic tools of learning, and the arts process, which involves PERCEIVING, RESPONDING, UNDERSTANDING, CREATING, EVALUATION, AND THE DEVELOPMENT OF MANIPULATIVE SKILLS, becomes a basic for general learning as well as the aesthetic and perceptual development of the child. This is illustrated in the following diagram.

A comprehensive arts program is described by the JDR III Fund in four parts: Arts in the Total Curriculum, Arts Instruction, School and Community Art Efforts, and Arts for Special Students.

PA Dept of Educ., "The Arts Process in Basic Education, Harrisburg, the Department 1974"
This type of program, which infuses the arts into the general learning process is especially important for educational programs serving the mentally handicapped because of the alternatives provided.

A second component of comprehensive arts education program is Education in the Arts, which involves instruction in specific arts disciplines such as dance/movement, music, painting, sculpture, film, drama, and the many traditional and newly emerging arts forms.

To persons who suffer either physical or mild to moderate mental handicapping conditions, education in the arts provides ready access to normalization. When handicapped persons are afforded participatory in-depth experiences in the arts, they come to be seen by society as contributors and as artists having dignity and worth and are accepted as such.

A third major component of a comprehensive arts education program is The Use of School and Community Resources. Through this component students are provided specialized artistic experiences. They include the use of a wide variety of community resources for enrichment purposes and are designed to supplement but not to supplant the regular school arts programs.

In 1967, Dr. Abraham Maslow spoke of a new concept of learning, of teaching and of education. He said:

"... that the function of education, the goal of education ... the human goal, the humanistic goal, the goal so far as human beings are concerned ... is ultimately the self-actualization of a person, the becoming fully human, the development of the fullest height that the human species can stand up, that the particular individual can attain. The arts are so close to our physiological and biological core, so close to this identity, this biological identity, that rather than think of these art courses as sort of whipped or luxury cream, they must become basic experiences in education. I mean that this kind of education can be a glimpse into the infinite, the ultimate values. This intrinsic education may very well have art education, music education, and dance education as its core."

Dr. Maslow cites five "levels in his hierarchy of human needs:

1. Physiological needs
2. Safety or security needs
3. Social needs
4. Ego needs
5. Self-fulfillment needs

Although Maslow did not make specific reference in his works to the needs of handicapped persons, his hierarchy of human needs was defined as "basic needs which all persons share." A constant need is the need for belonging in a social setting... a need for sharing and associating. In what better way can this be satisfied than by giving of oneself through the arts. The handicapped, like everyone else, have something to give, to share, and they need association with others in the arts and in normalized social settings where they are seen as contributors.

Each person in his own unique way expresses himself through the arts, sometimes eloquently, sometimes haltingly, sometimes in a very limited way. Each act in the arts process when successfully accomplished, can build self-esteem and self-confidence, and a basic need is being fulfilled.

Maslow expressed those "categorical areas which represent the flowering of mankind. There is a basic need, he says, for self-development and self-actualization. Each person, including those who may be handicapped, needs to realize the full range of their individual potentials as a human being.

Robert Valett, in his studies related to learning disabilities and learning activities, has identified six "basic learning" categories. They are: gross motor development skills, sensory-motor integration skills, language development skills, conceptual skills, and social skills.

The teachings of Maslow, Valett, Piaget, Lowenfield, Dewey and many others have been transferred into teacher guides, curriculum guides, statements of philosophy and bulletins by school districts throughout the country. An excellent example of a local school district statement on child growth is contained in a

"Little is known about the degree to which strengthening any one area will result in greater facility in learning. It has been observed, however, that experiencing success in any endeavor builds self-confidence which, in turn, has a positive effect on new learnings and often increases peer acceptance. When thinking about the child, then, one cannot separate any area of growth from the others; for in fact, any response which is made by a child calls upon all areas working together. The following diagram illustration demonstrates the interaction between the various areas of growth as the child strives to reach full potential.

To an arts educator this is an excellent description of an arts oriented program, but unfortunately in many cases the interpretation, development and implementation of these school curriculum guides and bulletins is accomplished by those who consider the arts as frills, without value to basic education. Arts educators must become more assertive to assure that they are involved in the planning and implementation of these educational programs. In addition they need to begin to develop, in cooperation with their professional associations and public agencies, the basic research and evaluation that is necessary to legitimize the arts in the eyes of administrators, parents and school boards. The United States Office of Education, the Bureau of Education of the Handicapped, The National Endowment for the Arts, The Office of Career Education, and state and local agencies responsible for general education or the education of the handicapped must assume a leadership role to assure that funding is provided for arts education programs. Areas of particular concern are:

1. Teacher training
   a. pre-service education
   b. post-service training
2. Curriculum development
3. Careers in the arts for the handicapped

4. Research and evaluation
   a. effect of arts education in special education
   b. split-brain learning theory

Funding is generally available for these programs in the agencies mentioned above. It is necessary, however, for those persons in decision making positions within these agencies to provide access to these funds for the arts by developing policy statements, or at least philosophical statements which encourage the inclusion of arts programs in the basic education programs for handicapped individuals.

Discussion and Commentary

Among the many valuable points made in this paper is the idea that comprehensive arts programming for handicapped students must include all of the elements of excellent comprehensive arts programming for all children as well as special modifications for the unique needs of particular handicapping conditions. Model programs have developed successful strategies for establishing program goals and objectives, implementing project activities, obtaining administrative and funding support; however, these models must be evaluated and shared within a national framework. It was noted that the arts can assist in breaking through communication barriers which exist between handicapped and nonhandicapped students.

Therefore, to continually develop new programs when exemplary programs exist, but are not widely replicated, constitutes a wasteful and flagrant misuse of finances and energies. The need is to evaluate and analyze current programs and to duplicate the successful components throughout the nation.

The conviction is expressed that the arts are basic to human development. Through the arts other skills can be learned and at the same time the quality of life can be enhanced.
The Nature of Society's Attitude Toward the Handicapped and the Arts

Gary C. Barlow

GARY C. BARLOW, Ph.D., is a Professor and Coordinator of Art Education and Art Therapy at Wright State University, Dayton, Ohio. He has had teaching experiences in all levels of education and frequently serves as an arts consultant to many other programs throughout the nation. As a NCAH model site coordinator at Wright State University, he is implementing a model university-based training program and developing the necessary training materials. Dr. Barlow is a member of the National Committee of NCAH.

Language and Labels

The posture of today's society with reference to the disabled and handicapped person is changing, and this change brings improvement, although it is slow. Words can be barometers of attitudes, and the descriptive words and phrases of a few years ago, such as "mentally disabled, addicts, retardates," have changed to words which communicate a more positive attitude about the exceptionality or disability and, more importantly, about the person. As pointed out by Manus (9) attitudes toward disabled persons can be inferred from our behavior, speech, and language.

Differentiation is now often made between the two words "disability" and "handicap." Lowenfeld identified differences between objective and subjective handicaps a few decades ago, and today similar references may be made to a disability as a decrease in the functioning of a part, or perhaps a system, of the human body, whereas a handicap can be defined as a disability that interferes with normal activities which could, of course, include subjective involvements with media, movement, and performance.

Unfortunately, words and phrases can lead quickly to labeling. The label is often the determinant of the attitude, and one therefore might unwisely focus on what the person cannot do rather than what the person can do. Hightower states that "the whole process of applying labels is a barrier to change. The basis for developing programs should be on the continuum of growth and development in order to make the system orchestrate to the needs of the individual." (5) In the analysis specifically related to mental retardation, Le-Land and Smith say that "society, with its fear of the unknown, has demanded labels" and they continue by saying that as social attitudes based on fear change, those labels which do not provide information can be discarded. (7)
Attitude: The Setting

Attitudes vary and are dependent upon at least three different and defined settings: the educational, the social, and the home. Labeling—and the changes and fluctuations of labeling—most often occur within the educational construct. To speak of "motor dysfunctions" or "genetic components" for example, outside of a defined educational context or process, might not communicate the desired meanings. Within the social setting, the general public deals less in educational labels, but more in appearance, or behaviors that, consequently, often determine attitudes. The behaviors, then, probably lead to some form of label or labeling process. Within the home, the behaviors are primary and the labeling is secondary.

Attitude: General

Leland and Smith state:

Society has an extreme intolerance for difference and seems unable to accept the unusual. In our democratic tradition, people who deviate are permitted to do so if they are not socially dangerous, but society is not always sure whether or not the inferior person is dangerous. (7)

Wright, in her writing titled "Some Psychosocial Aspects of Disability," identifies four myths pertaining to disabilities and stated that both laymen and experts tend to succumb to the power of these myths and either ignore facts that belie them or distort facts to fit them. She identifies these myths as:

1. The Myth of General Maladjustment. In essence, the belief that people with physical disabilities tend to be more maladjusted than the ordinary person.

2. The Myth of Tragedy. The belief that the life of a person with a disability has been made equivalent with disaster, when there has been such a coalescence between tragedy and disability that nothing else is perceived but a life filled with suffering, frustration, and rejection.

3. The Myth of Excessive Frustration. The belief that excessive frustration abounds in the lives of persons with disabilities.

4. The Myth of Sin. The belief that the perceived cause of the disability affirms that disability is a punishment for evil, usually on the part of the person himself or his family, but sometimes on the part of others, such as the doctor. (15)

Attitude: Specific

There seems to be no universally generalizable attitude about society toward the disabled or handicapped; however, references can be made to attitudes toward specific disabilities, handicaps, or conditions, and some general conclusions might be drawn from these.

In a study by Hartlage, Roland and Taraba, their findings indicate that:

employers may be more accepting of individuals whom they perceive as having physical or mental disabilities which are beyond the individual's control, (e.g., amputation, retardation) and less accepting toward individuals with handicaps involving social deviance (e.g., psychiatric disorder, juvenile delinquency) acceptance of the notion of a generalized employer attitude toward the disabled was not supported. (4)

Other recent research indicates that employers may think of disabled workers as belonging to a low status minority group, somewhat independent of the specific type or degree of the disability. (2, 3, 14)

In surveys taken of people with convulsive disorders the indications show that this population experiences widespread discrimination and alienation of rights, especially in getting and holding jobs once it is known that they have epilepsy. (11)

And in his analysis of seven major corporations' attitudes and responses toward hiring qualified blind employees in competitive jobs, Wacker states:

The outstanding barrier . . . is still phenomenally deficient information and the socially preconditioned attitudes of the sighted world about blind people. The outside world continues to view blind men and women as a pathetically fragile, idle group incapable of competitive employment. (13)

Wacker places some of the blame for attri-
It is one of my deepest innermost convictions that wherever there is a spark of human spirit—no matter how dim it may be—it is our sacred responsibility as humans, teachers, and educators to fan it into whatever flame it conceivably may develop. (8)

Too often, in educational, social, home, or employment settings the disabled or handicapped individual has been only an observer. The arts and arts experiences can offer the person a means of becoming involved in expressive, productive, and meaningful aesthetic and creative activities. The possibilities of changes of self-concept, alterations of social behaviors, and development of attitudes can occur and it seems important that arts experiences (such as painting, drawing, crafts, drama, theatre, music, movement, dance, and so on) be the natural vehicles for expression and communication.

The disabled and handicapped person should be helped to move from being an observer, to being an observer/participant and, ultimately, to the role of a participator.

Research and Implementation

There is a need to identify attitudes specific to the special person and the arts. A suggested approach might be in response to Yuker, Block, and Young who write:

Within research designs and methods, most of the measures designed for use with non-disabled persons have referred to specific disabilities and few instruments have been devised which could be used in investigations of attitudes toward the disabled in general. . . . the attitudes of disabled persons toward their own disabilities have been inadequately studied. Most of the measures developed for use with the disabled have been directed toward persons with a specific disability, usually the blind or deaf, and a few for use with the orthopedically handicapped. Only a few have been designed for use with persons with various non-specified disabilities. None of the instruments reviewed were designed for use with both the non-disabled and the disabled. (16)

In the Vocational Rehabilitation Index: 1974 (12) under the sections "Attitude, Attitudes, and Attitudinal" there are at least 184 entries on current topics of interest. These areas range widely in content, such as "Development and evaluation of an attitude to deafness scale" and "The Community Resources Institute—A Process for Attitude Change." The research, however, on the arts or creativity and the disabled is almost non-existent. It is imperative that research and documentation be undertaken in the arts for the disabled and the handicapped. The expanding vision, identified by The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped, is helping to make the public aware of the need for arts for the handicapped. Through the NCAI formats, and by appropriate and timely implementation, this awareness should increase. Social advocacy, which seeks changes in institutional
concepts, and personal advocacy, which broadens options and leads the individual closer to a normal life pattern (7) will help to dissolve neglect and apathy of the past.

In an interview with Dr. Henry B. Betts, past president of the American Congress of Rehabilitation Medicine, he stated that the attitude of the community toward the handicapped was extremely important. He said:

...we’ve tried very hard to have an impact on the community relative to their attitude toward the handicapped—to employ them, let them in the museums, let them in the concert halls, let them get through the streets, into the stores... It’s having a bathroom stall that’s accessible to the wheelchair, the drinking fountain that’s low, and a telephone that’s low, and a few seats where a wheelchair can go. (1)

Participation by the disabled and handicapped in the arts, and objective and professional reporting of this participation can help to change attitudes for the participant, and for the observer. Arts experiences offer alternate forms of communication, and opportunities to make personal, important statements. These experiences can carry with them feeling of release, of joy, of imaginative activity that possibly can exist on extremely high levels of response and reaction. These experiences can, and should, be shared by all people.

Discussion and Commentary

The overwhelming sense of negativism in attitudes toward handicapped persons comes through in this paper and the clear need for some careful research into the specifics of attitudes toward the arts and the handicapped is forcefully presented. The attitudes of teachers, administrators, parents, community leaders, etc. must be carefully examined in order to determine the potential positive effect that the arts could have on established fears, stereotypes and attitudinal barriers.

Calling attention to the myths that surround the disabled or handicapped person—myths of general maladjustment, of tragedy, of excessive frustration and of sin—it is pointed out that collecting, analyzing and disseminating the information needed to dispel these myths will be a necessary step in changing attitudes toward arts and the handicapped.

The objective and professional reporting of the positive experiences that handicapped persons can have through their participation in the arts could be another important device for improving society’s attitude toward art and the handicapped. Arts festivals, exhibits, productions and conferences on arts and the handicapped can serve the same purpose.

What does appear here to be most important is the need to deliberately plan for changing the inappropriate, stereotyped, negative attitudes that exist now on arts and handicapped people.

References

10. Rubin, Judith A. “Art is for All Human Beings, Especially the Handicapped.” Art Education, Journal of the National Art...


Speculations on Studying the Field of Arts and the Handicapped

Jack Morrison

JACK MORRISON, ED.D., is the Executive Director of the American Theatre Association and is responsible for keeping the ATA in contact with other arts organizations and offices of the government that deal with the arts. He was the Associate Director, Arts in Education Program of the JDR 3rd Fund, and a former Dean, College of Fine Arts at Ohio University. Jack Morrison is a member of the National Committee of NCAH.

Some time ago I saw a report on preparation of medical research personnel. In the report it was pointed out that one could gain the necessary background for medical research by completing seven Ph.D.s in seven different areas. The report then noted that someone in this program would be 50 years old before he started his apprenticeship in such a program. Clearly there has to be a better way. The search still goes on.

It seems to me that there is a similar problem in approaching research for the arts and the handicapped. There is so much we have to know in so many different fields that an individual could destroy himself trying to figure out where to start. Pursue the medical route? Or the basic sciences that are changing medicine? Or the series of selection processes to training personnel who can work in handicapped programs? Or reviewing the literature, report who is doing what? Mainly, it seems to me, there has to be a decision between so-called "pure scientific research" and "doing what comes naturally." There is also the matter of having specialists such as a highly skilled brain surgeon, for example, spending his time teaching a nice lady to put on band-aids in the first aid class at a local church.

Schools of medicine, I am told, have made a reasonable solution to that problem by inventing schools of public health attached to the school of medicine. In this way, everyone's time was used to a greater advantage at appropriate times. For example, lab work done in medical research could be related to community-health programs without the researcher leaving his lab or the field worker taking a mini-course in biochemistry. The critical point, of course, is getting information in a useful form from the lab to the field worker and knowledge of clinical conditions in the field to the lab.

What would all this mean to someone interested in arts for the handicapped? Would seven Ph.D.s help? Are we to make therapists out of artists, or solve the unemployment problem by converting the unemployed into project directors for the handicapped?

It seems to me that the conventional approach to any research—a review of the literature—is certainly high on the docket. But what do you do for a taxonomy? What will be in, what out? Teachers and interested people
learn there is a difference between music therapy, dance therapy, and working with the handicapped. But what precisely is the difference? Or is it an attitude? Who is taking on these problems?

And then there is the impression that the best worker with the retarded may be a high school dropout who has a knack for getting along with retarded folk., while a serious aspirant with an M.A. in special education just doesn't have it.

I think the most important idea affecting work in the arts for the handicapped is Susanne Langer's observation that the limits of man's expression are not the limits of words and numbers, that the non-discursive symbols, movement, gesture, color, sound, line, alone or together, are for the handicapped, as they are for the normal, only powerful, useful tools for communicating feelings and ideas. The non-discursive symbols provide ways of knowing as useful as words and numbers. In short, the challenge for those concerned with arts for the handicapped is to demonstrate how the use of the non-discursive symbol can be used to make the lives of the handicapped fuller, more complete, effective, and enjoyable.

The relationship of the artist, the arts therapist, the arts educator and the teacher in the educational setting, the school, may be similar to that of the scientist, the engineer, the science teacher, the teacher, and education. Of the medical doctor, the therapist, the school nurse, to teachers and education. Each is involved to a greater or lesser extent in the arts, science, or medicine. Each depends mightily on the other, and it's time we demystified the work of each and increased the respect one for the other. Then the development of new knowledge would get to the field faster and more effectively, and feedback from the field to the specialized researchers would be more useful.

What has been said for science and medicine and the arts could, of course, be said for all the disciplines in the social sciences, the humanities and in the professions as well as, in science and technology. How do we order up a procedure for using the wealth of knowledge existing and being continually created for the benefit of the handicapped? What sort of genius can be called from the ectoplasm to appear and take on such a task? Well, don't wait for him or her to show up—but if he or she does, offer a GS-18, places for his or her kids in Amy's school, plus a chauffeured Honda. In the meantime, a research group can be formed which could start tomorrow.

Two tasks are obvious to me. The first is to review the literature with a first-rate, up-to-date annotated bibliography. As I suggested earlier, some critical assumptions have to be made, but good scholars know how to look under "H" and find handicapped and go from there—really do a scholarly job with a critical essay introducing the bibliography. The exercise would be revealing and show plenty of "terra incognita" which would begin to shape up approaches to developing significant research in the field.

The second primary task is to set up a research team to "mess around," mess around in the scientist's sense: document what's going on right now, live with the kids, and a Portopack. Do a lot of observing. Report it the way Darwin did in The Voyage of the Beagle. Write, as closely as possible, the way Robert Coles writes—about people in insightful, penetrating, and attractive way. Get to know what handicapped kids and grownups do with the arts without any "careful" experimental design. This is the sort of thing that Getzels and Jackson did when they started to work on creativity some years ago. They played with the kids without preordain design so as not to design out what they very well might be looking for.

Identifying places and projects that are called exemplary at this stage of the game and documenting in simple, direct ways just what is happening is the way to start. Certain observations will begin to converge and critical modes of behavior will begin to emerge. These can then lead to increasingly rigorous techniques and productive research and demonstrations in a couple of years.

Since the annotated bibliography will be emerging at about the same time, the research group can begin to compare the findings in the literature and in the field in ways that will provide seminal thoughts by imaginative researchers. Remember, the really good researchers are people who, by definition, don't know what they are doing. They just have good hunches about what to do and ways of seeing if those good hunches pan out experi-
mentally or lead to information and experiments that do. The reality check at this point is what happens in the field, how the arts can be used to help the handicapped live a more abundant life. What is needed at this point is lots of uncommonly good common sense. Let the fine tuning and the exquisite design come later. We need some good descriptive studies of just what is happening to start with. What are the characteristics of the person who works well with the handicapped?

Such "messing around" will also reveal some good demonstration sites and some good footage on videotape and/or film which can be used for demonstration purposes. They would be natural by-products of the "messing around."

Critical at this point is the selection of the personnel to take on this assignment. They should be imbued with a kind of mature innocence, open to what's happening with a track record of an ability to report effectively. This takes a high order of a special kind of disciplined observation. It's a sine qua non.

What I've said is nothing new. It's a matter of recognizing the freshness of the field and trying not to apply conventional knowledge to a new area. In short, we can take advantage of our ignorance by using our ignorance systematically to begin to build a sound professional base with good research. Let the handicapped tell us how we can help them.

Are you ready to listen?

Discussion and Commentary

This is a paper which poses key concerns and issues regarding research in the field of arts for handicapped people. The author suggests a sequence of high priority tasks that need to be addressed before further research is designed.

The core of the challenge to those who work with arts for the handicapped is to demonstrate that the nondiscursive symbols: movement, gesture, sound, color, line, etc., are for the handicapped as they are for the nonhandicapped, powerful tools for communication.

Calling for a two-pronged attack on the problem through a review of the literature and research teams to do sophisticated, disciplined observation, it is reasoned that these techniques will lead to other, increasingly rigorous techniques for gathering data.

Care must be taken in the choice of investigators for this kind of assignment. Openness to new ideas, common sense and the ability to follow good instincts are of paramount importance. If we are careful and conscientious and receptive, then the handicapped will "tell us how we can help them."
Part III
Projecting Future Arts Research
Based upon the presentation of papers and discussion, conference participants developed a series of general conclusions regarding the current state of research and demonstration in arts programming for handicapped populations. The concluding remarks included the following issues:

The Federal Role

- There is a definition of arts, arts education, and handicapped people included in current federal regulations. New federal legislation (Public Law 94-142, "The Education of All Handicapped Children's Act and Section 504 of the 1973 Rehabilitation Act) does not make specific reference to the arts, although the broad scope of the language does not exclude the inclusion of arts activities.

- The federal government, the Bureau of Education for the Handicapped in particular, appears to be seeking a more active involvement in guiding the development of arts programs for handicapped people. Specifically, federal support for small developmental conferences, research and training projects, model demonstration programs, and technical assistance gradually have increased within the past two years.

- Federal support and interest is being complemented by increased activity at the state and local level. The U.S. Office of Education and the National Endowment for the Arts encourage the inclusion of special programs for handicapped people in their regular grant programs. The Bureau of Education for the Handicapped accepts the inclusion of arts activities in state plans and approves the expenditure of funds for these programs.

Research

- In some instances at the Federal, state, and local level educational and budget priorities have changed to insure the inclusion of arts programs for handicapped children.

- The limited amount of rigorous research indicates that handicapped children achieved in cognitive, affective, and aesthetic skills as a result of arts activities.

- Little cross referencing between disciplines has occurred which might result in a comprehensive review of the research literature.

- Research has focused upon the mentally retarded child, and on only two art forms: music and visual arts.

- Research is increasing our capacity to provide technical assistance for specific handicapping conditions. It is beginning to provide teachers with a broader assortment of instructional techniques, materials, and methods for dealing with complex-learning situations.

- We know through observation, experience, and limited research that handicapped children learn through the arts, and that schools are not taking full advantage of this poten-

- Final Regulations for Public Law 94-142, "The Education of All Handicapped Children Act," issued Fall, 1977, do include artistic and cultural activities under the definition of related services and special education.
tial that the arts have in learning. As these public facilities become more accessible and provide specialized programs for handicapped people, they offer better opportunities for the non-handicapped.

• Anecdotal and other research studies have been completed recording the positive effects of arts on handicapped individuals; however, there has been no systematic analysis of these materials.

Arts in Education

• No comprehensive efforts have been made to adapt arts education/aesthetic education curriculum materials for students with special handicapping conditions.

• Some "how to" manuals have been published to assist the regular classroom teacher in developing arts activities for handicapped children.

• Individual education plans (IEP's) as outlined in the regulations for The Education of All Handicapped Children Act (P.L. 94-142) provide an opportunity for the inclusion of arts in the regular education of the handicapped child.

• There is a need to clarify the scope, nature, and relationship of arts therapy to educational programs of the handicapped student.

Facilities

• Some cultural institutions, schools, parks, and recreation facilities are becoming more accessible and are beginning to implement special programs for handicapped patrons. As these public facilities become more accessible and provide specialized programs for handicapped people, they offer better opportunities for the non-handicapped.

• Generally, special populations are not regular participants in arts programs. The dissemination of information to handicapped people has begun to stimulate increased interest and involvement in a wide variety of arts activities.

• Coordination is occurring between agencies and organizations dealing specifically with handicapped people and those dealing with the arts. Generally, high quality arts programs are adaptable for the special needs of handicapped individuals.

Artists

• Artists who are sensitive to the needs of children with handicapping conditions have begun to make significant contributions to arts education programs. These artists pay equal attention to the creative processes in each of the art forms and to the completion of finished artistic products.

• The arts provide rewarding and fulfilling leisure time and career opportunities for handicapped people. Unfortunately, many handicapped artists find difficulty in entering the job market.

Attitudes

• To encourage the development of arts programs, several states have invited administrators to visit or participate in arts education programs. Handicapped artists touring a musical performance throughout Washington State created state-wide support for the implementation of arts programs for handicapped children. Positive personal experiences in the arts are consistently an effective device for developing positive attitudes about the arts.

• Arts activities can be a powerful vehicle for the integration of handicapped people into the mainstream of society.

• Many fears, stereotypes, and barriers continue to exist regarding society's attitude toward the arts and people with handicapping conditions.

Implications:

The preceding statements lead to a series of key questions developed by the conference participants, which provide direction for future research and demonstration projects in arts for the handicapped. These questions are intended to generate expanded exploration and analysis of this new and challenging field.

How can research questions and results be organized in a way that will effectively communicate the need for arts programs to administrators, parents, federal agencies?

How does each art form contribute to the growth and development of handicapped children and youth?

How can arts and special education people more effectively explore areas of mutual concern and interest?

How can the needs of special handicapped people be assessed in relationship to their needs for arts experiences?

How can the arts be effectively "sold" to
Those people who are not convinced about the crucial role the arts can serve in the lives of handicapped people?

How can research methods and techniques most appropriate for the arts investigation be identified? How can pupil growth in the arts be evaluated?

Does the amount of money spent per student make a difference in the students' performances in the arts or in basic skills in the arts? Does money affect inputs or outputs?

What are the crucial and necessary similarities and differences between arts programs for the handicapped and non-handicapped?

What is the role of cultural institutions in developing arts programs for handicapped people?

Are proper methods for teaching the arts to handicapped people being investigated?

Is there a need for a clearer definition of the arts? arts education? art therapy?

What are the facility needs, program needs, the communication needs, and furniture needs necessary for cultural facilities and other public institutions to effectively implement special programs?

How can a basic federal policy relating to arts programs for the handicapped be established and articulated to all arts and educational agencies and institutions?

How can arts programming be coordinated with the objectives and aims of all personnel involved with handicapped populations?

What new ways can be identified for delivering information to teachers in the classroom?

What are the most effective staff development techniques for both administrative and teaching staff in employing arts for the handicapped?

What kinds of opportunities do exist and might exist in the community for leisure involvement of handicapped people? And how might the handicapped people begin to learn the art skills in terms of an apprentice-type program to ease into the employment market?

What are the resources and major tasks necessary to adapt or to design curriculum in the arts for the handicapped?

If appropriate regard for arts in education is a result of experience, how can we provide legislators, school boards, etc., those experiences?

What resource guides and directives can be developed to facilitate the duplication and replication of successful program models?

How do we identify and change dysfunctional attitudes about the arts, and about handicapped people?

How can the physical, legal and professional relationships between cultural centers and educational institutions be expanded?

What are the procedures to promote increased joint programming and service delivery between educational institutions and cultural institutions?

What knowledge is needed about communications, equipment, exhibits, designs, display techniques, graphics, to assist the development of a better programming within public facilities?

How can the artists (handicapped and non-handicapped) serve as a facilitator for increased arts programming for handicapped people?

Projections:

Supportive Actions

Some enabling actions need to be taken to prepare the ground for the various studies and projects that have been identified out of these conference proceedings. It is paramount that federal, state and local agencies and institutions as well as private universities and foundations be supportive of the concept of arts for handicapped individuals. Some specific forms that such support must take are:

Visibility and accessibility of support services

Consolidation and sharing of program efforts

Inclusion of the arts in current federal legislature regulations

Making visible exemplary programs

University programs to train and encourage the artist researcher

Encourage effective program evaluation

Be receptive to new technologies

Support communication among the various disciplines in the arts and in the field of working with handicapped individuals

Identify artists with special capability for working with handicapped persons

Establish a task force on arts for the handicapped to act as an advisory group to the Bureau of Education for the Handicapped

Coordination to avoid duplication of efforts
Dissemination of information to various constituencies
Development of innovative techniques to heighten the natural awareness of the need for expanded arts opportunities for handicapped people

Research/Demonstration Programs

Some issues need exploration and projects need planning as long-term, ongoing demonstrations in order to derive useful information from them. These are complex questions that defy traditional empirical investigation and require different approaches. Some of the ideas for significant demonstration resulting from the conference proceedings are:

- Establishment of university programs at the graduate and undergraduate level to prepare personnel in arts for the handicapped
- Demonstration of various cooperative strategies for delivery of services to provide arts for the handicapped
- Demonstration of career training in arts for handicapped people
- Demonstration of the impact of artists in the classrooms with handicapped children
- Demonstration of the effect of in-service training specifically to prepare arts educators to work with handicapped children
- Demonstration of the effect of in-service training specifically to prepare special educators to offer arts instruction to handicapped children
- Demonstration of the impact of successful arts programs on a community's attitude toward the arts and toward handicapped individuals
- Demonstration of the effectiveness of the arts as a vehicle for the integration of handicapped children with their non-handicapped peers
- Demonstration of innovative and effective techniques for increasing the awareness of the need for expanded arts programs.

Research/Special Projects

There are a group of tasks that have been identified that are important short-term projects, completion of which will act as a catalyst for other, larger scaled projects. These are the projects that often can supply the missing piece in a puzzle. Some of these discussed in this conference setting are:

- A comprehensive annotated bibliography that represents a review of all the various literatures touching on arts and the handicapped
- Development of a useful set of operational definitions in each of the arts and all of the handicapping conditions
- An annual research conference on arts and the handicapped to stay current with problems and issues
- A listing of artists who are handicapped and can act as resource people and advocates for arts education for handicapped children
- Identification of instruments of evaluation that could be used in research studies in the area of arts and the handicapped
- A needs assessment study done to determine what arts educators need to know about handicapping conditions
- A needs assessment study to determine what special educators need to know in order to teach the arts
- A study of the competencies required to offer quality arts programs to handicapped children
- A catalog of acceptable practices for cultural institutions to accommodate handicapped patrons
- A handbook on research in arts for the handicapped
- A guidebook for agencies offering arts to the handicapped on where the funding is and how to apply for it
- Development of instructional materials for use in projects researching the effects of arts instruction on handicapped children

Research/Empirical and Historical Studies

Some problems that need resolution in the field of arts for the handicapped lend themselves to research studies, gathering and analyzing data, drawing conclusions and implications. These studies imply the use of parameters and controls and lend themselves to generalizability. Some suggested projects of this type are:

- Assessment of identified exemplary programs
- Assessment of students involved in arts programs for improvement in both the cognitive and affective domains
- Studies of attitudes of the handicapped toward the arts
Studies of the attitudes of teachers toward offering arts instruction to the handicapped

Studies to compare different methodologies for studying the effects of arts education for the handicapped

Studies of attitudes of artists who work with the handicapped toward their students

Case studies of individuals with handicaps who have made a career of the arts

Studies of the impact of arts instruction on basic skills development of the handicapped

Studies of the effect of different methodologies for offering arts instruction to the handicapped.
As the field of special education examines itself, preparing to make changes in response to new federal legislation, responding to a renewed awareness of the need to offer an enriched educational experience to all handicapped students, the potential of the arts as a powerful mechanism of learning must be investigated and documented.

These papers form a solid base for identifying research needs for directing attention to problems needing resolution, for assisting professional special educators in focusing their thinking, for setting priorities in funding and for stimulating ideas. They offer a comprehensive collection of research concepts. It is the hope of all those involved in this effort that the material will be a valuable impetus to increased arts programming for all handicapped children.

Profound gratitude is here expressed to all those who gave time and talent to this effort. Their commitment to the belief that the arts can help handicapped children to reach their full potential is evident in these writings.

The U.S. Commissioner of Education, Ernest L. Boyer has written and these papers affirm that:

"the time has come to weave the arts into the very fabric of our education. It's time for all of us to focus on the agenda for the future."

Boyer, Ernest L. "An address before the annual meeting of the International Council of Fine Arts Deans, Minneapolis, Minnesota, Oct. 5, 1977"
An NCAH-BEH Developmental Conference

AGENDA
April 28, 1977

9:00-9:30 Coffee
9:30-10:45 Welcome: Wendy Perks
9:45-10:00 Definitions: Dr. Harold Arberg
10:00-10:30 Dr. Garry McDaniels
   "Defining the Federal Role in the Development of Arts for the Handicapped"
10:30-11:00 Dr. William G. Kolenius, Jr.
   "What is the State of Research Pertaining to Arts and the Handicapped?"
11:00-11:30 Dr. Stanley Madeja
   "What is the Relationship of the Arts to the Aesthetic Development of a Human Being? To the Quality of One's Life?"
11:30-12:00 Larry Molloy
   "What is the Full Utilization of Public Facilities in Relationship to Arts and the Handicapped?"
12:00-1:00 Lunch
1:00-1:30 Judy Goldstein
   "What is the State of Career Development and the Utilization of Leisure Time in Relationship to Arts and the Handicapped?"
1:30-2:00 Joan Newburg
   "What is the Role of the Artist in Working with Handicapped People?"
2:00-2:30 Jack Kukuk
   "What is Arts Education for the Handicapped? What is the Relationship of Arts Education to the development of a Handicapped Person?"
3:00-3:30 Dr. Gary Barlow
   "What is the Nature of Society's Attitude Towards the Handicapped? How do the Arts Affect this Attitude?"
3:30-4:00 Dr. Jack Morrison
   "What Contributions Can all Disciplines Make to the Field of Arts and the Handicapped? What is the Role of the Researcher, Art Therapist, Curriculum Developer, Recreation Specialist, Parent, etc.?"
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>9:00- 9:30</td>
<td>Coffee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:30- 9:45</td>
<td>A Surprise!</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:45-10:30</td>
<td>Summary: What do we know?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30-11:15</td>
<td>Summary: What have we done?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:15-12:00</td>
<td>Summary: What are we doing?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:00-12:45</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:45-1:15</td>
<td>Summary: What do we need to do? Researchable Items?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:15- 2:00</td>
<td>Summary</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Arts and the Handicapped
Defining the National Direction

RESOURCE PEOPLE

Dr. Harold Arberg, Director
Arts and Humanities Division
Office of Education
Reporters Building, Room 421
400 Maryland Avenue S.W.
Washington, D.C. 20202

Floyd Jackson
Director of Special Education
State Department of Education
Old Capitol Building
Olympia, Washington 98502

Ms. Lani Lattin Duke, Director
Special Constituencies
National Endowment for the Arts
Columbia Plaza
Mail Stop 611
Washington, D.C. 20506

Jean Nazarro
Assistant Unit Head
Publications Department
Council for Exceptional Children
1929 Association Drive
Reston, Virginia 22091

Forbes Rogers
Executive Director
Alliance for Arts Education
J. F. Kennedy Center for the Performing Arts
Washington, D.C. 20566

Dr. Lewis Shupe
Associate Professor
Art Therapy and Speech Pathology
Wright State University
Dayton, Ohio 45431

Ms. Phyllis Wyeth
Arts Advocate
NCAH Board of Directors
Bloomingdale, Delaware 19807
A developmental conference coordinated by the Bureau of Education for the Handicapped, Division of Innovation & Development, and The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped.

PRESENTORS

Dr. Gary Barlow
Professor and Coordinator of Art Education and Art Therapy
Wright State University
Dayton, Ohio 45431

Judith Goldstein
Careers Project Director
National Parks and Recreation Association
U.S. Department of the Interior
Federal Division of State and Private Liaison
1100 K Street, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20240

Dr. William G. Kalenius, Jr.
Administrator for Pupil Services and Research
Clover Park School District
5214 Steilacoom Boulevard
Lakewood Center, Washington 98499

Jack Kukuk
Assistant Director
Alliance for Arts Education
J. F. Kennedy Center for the Performing Arts
Washington, D.C. 20566

Dr. Stanley Madeja
Vice President
CEMREL
3120 59th Street
St. Louis, Missouri 63139

Larry Molloy
Project Director
Educational Facilities Laboratories, Inc.
850 Third Avenue
New York, New York 10002

Dr. Jack Morrison
Executive Director
American Theatre Association
1029 Vermont Avenue, Suite 420
Washington, D.C. 20005

Joan Newburg
San Fernando Valley Arts Council
9055 Reseda
Northridge, California 91328
THE NATIONAL COMMITTEE, ARTS FOR THE HANDICAPPED

In June 1974, the Joseph P. Kennedy, Jr. Foundation provided the funding for a National Conference on Arts for the Mentally Retarded, which created a tremendous national interest in the concept of integrating the arts into the education of the mentally retarded child. As a result of several conferences and funding by the Kennedy Foundation and Alliance for Arts Education, a National Committee was organized to coordinate the development of a nationwide program of arts for all handicapped children. The National Committee, Arts for the Handicapped is composed of leaders from major national arts organizations, organizations representing handicapped citizens, general education organizations and private foundations. NCAH, an educational affiliate of the John F. Kennedy Center for the Performing Arts, operates as the national coordinating agency for the development and implementation of arts programs for handicapped children and youth.

BOARD OF DIRECTORS

Vivienne Anderson, Ph.D.
Associate Commissioner for Instructional Services
New York State Education Dept.

Harold Arberg, Ph.D.*
Director, Arts & Humanities Division
U.S. Office of Education

Mabel H. Brandon
Arts Advocate

Jack Kukuk*
Assistant Director
Alliance for Arts Education

Larry Molloy
Director
National Arts and Handicapped Information Service

Ruth Mondschein, Ph.D.
Director, Special Programs
Dept. of Health, Education & Welfare

Jack Morrison, Ed.D.
Executive Director
American Theatre Association

Anne Riordan
Chairperson, Programs for the Handicapped
National Dance Association

Forbes Rogers*
Executive Director
Alliance for Arts Education

Judith Rubin, Ph.D.
President
American Art Therapy Association

William Schipper, Ph.D.
Associate Director
National Association of State Directors of Special Education

Jean Kennedy Smith
National Chairperson
Very Special Arts Festivals

Harold Snider, Ph.D.
Coordinator of Programs for the Handicapped, National Air & Space Museum
Smithsonian Institution

A. Robert Towbin
Vice Chairman
New York State Council on the Arts

Phyllis Wyeth
Secretary, NCAH

* Ex Officio