DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 105 527   CS 50i 036

AUTHOR   Berg, Charles M.
TITLE   The Human Voice and the Silent Cinema.
PUB DATE   Apr 75
NOTE   23p.; Paper presented at the Society for Cinema
              Studies Conference (New York City, April 1975)

EDRS PRICE   MF-$0.76 HC-$1.58 PLUS POSTAGE
DESCRIPTORS   *Audiovisual Communication; Communication (Thought
              Transfer); *Films; *Film Study; Higher Education;
              *History; *Sound Films; Visual Literacy

ABSTRACT
              This paper traces the history of motion pictures from
Thomas Edison's vision in 1887 of an instrument that recorded body
movements to the development cf synchronized sound-motion films in
the late 1920s. The first synchronized sound film was made and
demonstrated by W. K. L. Dickson, an assistant to Edison, in 1889.
The popular acceptance of silent films and their contents is traced .
through the development of film narrative and the use of music in the
early 1900s. The silent era is labeled as a consequence of
technological and economic chance and this chance is made to account
for the accelerated development of the medium's visual communicative
capacities. The thirty year time lapse between the development of
film and the use of live human voices can therefore be regarded as
the critical stimuli which pushed the motion picture into becoming an
essentially visual medium in which the audial channel is subordinate
to and supportive of the visual channel. The time lapse also aided
the motion picture to become a medium of artistic potential and
significance. (RB)

THE HUMAN VOICE AND THE SILENT CINEMA

Charles M. Berg

The dream of arresting an unbroken arc from the
visual and aural components of time's continuum helped
lead to the invention of cinema. Edison, for example,
wrote:

> In the year 1887, the idea
> occurred to me that it was
> possible to devise an instrument
> which should do for the eye
> what the phonograph does for
> the ear, and that by a combination
> of the two all motion and
> sound could be recorded and
> reproduced simultaneously.[1]

One of Edison's visions was the recording of performances
at the Metropolitan Opera House for later generations.[2]
At about the same time in France, the photographer
Nadar wrote: "My dream is to see the photograph
register the bodily movements and facial expressions of
a speaker while the phonograph is recording his speech."[3]
Such dreams were translated into numerous inventive
efforts during the next four decades.

The first attempt to actualize this vision was made
by Edison's assistant, W. K. L. Dickson. Dickson
claimed that in 1889 a synchronized sound film was
demonstrated in which Dickson appeared and said "Good
morning, Mr. Edison, glad to see you back. Hope you

like the kinetophone. To show the synchronization
I will lift my hand and count up to ten."[4]
The marriage of the phonograph and moving picture was
not commercially exploited, however, until 1895, when
the kineto-phonograph (a refinement of the silent peep-
show or kinetoscope) enabled a single viewer to see
and hear a short performance by a singer or an organ-
grinder's monkey responding to a strain from Norma.[5]
In 1895 and 1896, the development and exploitation of
projected moving pictures relegated the kineto-phonograph
and its silent companion, the kinetoscope, to obsolescence.

During the next three decades the urge to render
synchronized sights and sounds resulted in frequent
attempts to link the projected motion picture and
phonograph. The French entrepreneur, Leon Gaumont, made
several efforts to achieve satisfactory synchronization.
Carl Laemmle, an American film pioneer, tried in 1907
to exhibit a German development called Synchroscope.
In Germany, Oskar Messter worked on the same problem.
And in 1913, Edison made a serious attempt to provide
synchronized sound.[6] These early experiments failed,
however, because of poor sound quality, inadequate
amplification and imperfect synchronization.[7]

In the early 1920's, Lee DeForest made successful
sound-on-film experiments but the film industry, riding a

crest of expanding popularity, was not interested.
By 1926, the Bell Telephone Laboratories perfected a
sound-on-disc system. Warner Brothers facing bankruptcy
grasped the device in hopes that the novelty of
synchronized sound would provide the basis for a comeback.
After a year of cautious exploitation, the Warners'
Vitaphone caught the public's imagination with Al Jolson
in The Jazz Singer (1927). With the public's acceptance
and enthusiasm the rush was on. The industry scrambled
to make the conversion to sound. In the process, the
Warners' phonographic method was replaced by the sound-
on-film system which became the new technological mode
for film comm. nication. The technical and economic
conditions necessary for the accurate interlocking and
amplification of images and sounds had at last arrived.

It is evident from the speculations and inventive
efforts of men such as Edison, Nadar, Gaumont and Messter,
that synchronized sound was from the start a vital part
of the concept of cinema. Therefore the appearance of
mute moving images in the 1890's was only a partial
fulfillment of the drive to mechanically reproduce both
sight and sound. That a successful sound system did not
emerge until the late 1920's can therefore be regarded as
accidental. The silent era can consequently be considered

the product of technological and economic chance.[8]

The Need for Sound

Films of the silent era were not, however, exhibited in total silence for several important reasons. There was the need to mask disagreeable sounds emanating from the projector, patrons, ventilation fans and traffic outside the theater. A related need arose from the discovery that silent projection (i.e., the absence of any sound intended as part of the performance) was not easily tolerated by the public. Unaccompanied film images were negatively described as "noiseless fleeting shadows,"[9] "cold and bare,"[10] "ghostly shadows,"[11] "lifeless and colourless,"[12] "unearthly,"[13] and "flat."[14] There was also the need to provide dramatic and narrative support for the silent streams of images. In order to satisfy these needs, several "solutions" were tried.

Aside from the efforts to employ the phonograph, exhibitors had recourse to instrumental music, sound effects, narrators, live actors mouthing dialogue from behind the screen and singers. It is the purpose of this paper to explore those attempts at providing aural accompaniments involving the live human voice.

Narrators

To satisfy the felt need for some kind of sound

accompaniment, film exhibitors conducted various trials with narrators. These efforts were extensions of two 19th-century entertainments, the ballad singer and the lantern slide lecturer.

The ballad singer was a traditional part of rural Continental festivals. Travelling from fair to fair the balladeer recited stories of adventure while pointing out in a series of paintings or sketches the main incidents of the tale. According to film music authority Kurt London, the ballad singer declaimed in a singsong manner and was an influence on early European film narrators.

> The first 'films' were show..
> in a kind of show-booth or
> similar obscure premises. They
> were turned at great speed and
> each lasted only a few minutes.
> In the beginning, they had as yet
> no explanatory subtitles, and
> would, without a commentary, have
> remained in many cases unintelligible
> to their simple-minded audience.
> As a result the narrator was
> reinstated, to keep the spectators
> in a good humour and to act as
> 'compere' to the films, in the
> tradition of his predecessor, the
> ballad singer.[15]

Related to the ballad singer was the lecturer who accompanied a show of lantern slides. Alexander Black, a prominent slide lecturer who toured the American lyceum circuit, typified this approach in dramatic

productions he prophetically called "picture plays."
Working from an original script, Black would present
a two hour story from the lecture platform while
projecting about three hundred photographs.[16] The
influence of this entertainment mode is illustrated in
the case of Cecil Hepworth, a pioneer of the British
film industry.

Hepworth, like Black, had toured with travelling
lantern slide shows. When he acquired several films
from Robert Paul, the early British filmmaker, Hepworth
took the natural step of combining these with his slides
and lecturing. His production of "The Storm" exemplified
this multi-media concept. While running the slide and
film projectors, Hepworth delivered a running commentary
designed to intensify the emotional impact as did the
piano accompaniment provided by his sister.

> The sequence opened with a calm
> and peaceful picture of sea
> and sky. . . . That changed to
> another seascape, though the
> clouds looked a little more
> interesting, and the music
> quickened a bit. At each change
> the inevitability of a coming
> gale became more insistent and the
> music more threatening; until the
> storm broke with an exciting film
> of dashing waves bursting into the
> entrance of a cave, with wild music.[17]

When motion pictures scored their initial American
successes in vaudeville houses in the late 1890's,

narrators were sometimes brought in to "explain" more
complicated films. Such was the situation with
Richard G. Hollaman's New York rooftop counterfeit
production of The Passion Play at Oberammergau (1898).
Hollaman hired a lecturer to guide the audience
through the several scenes (the motion picture had not
yet developed into a narrative medium) and to point out
that the film had been made in Germany.[18]

Narrators were also employed to comment on scenic
views of such exotic foreign and domestic locales as
Japan, Switzerland, Pike's Peak and Niagara Falls. One
especially interesting enterprise was Hale's Tours and
Scenes of the World. These small movie theaters in the
form of railroad passenger cars enjoyed great popularity
throughout the United States for several years starting
in 1905. In the New York show operated by Adolph Zukor,
a lecturer expanded on the scenes which had been photo-
graphed from moving trains around the world.[19]

More refined and reflecting the tradition of the
lyceum and Chautauqua was the illustrated lecture. In
Chicago, Henry Lee's "Cyclo-Homo" (1908) was described
by the New York Dramatic Mirror.

> Mr. Lee's bill is largely
> educational, including moving
> picture scenes from all parts
> of the world, supplemented by
> travelogue lectures, sound effects
> and other features to add to the
> interest.[20]

In New York, Madison C. Peters presented a series of
"illustrated lectures" utilizing moving pictures and
colored slides on such topics as "Japan and the
Japanese," "Italy and the Italians" and "Ireland and
the Irish."[21]

With the evolution of the commercial film into a
story-telling form, the need for providing narrative
continuity grew. In the pages of the Moving Picture
World (established in 1907), the cause of the film
narrator was championed by the articulate W. Stephen
Bush. Bush cited several reasons to support his
argument.

In his first position paper of 1909, Bush pointed
out that audial and visual stimulation were necessary to
prevent tedium.

> . . . the burden of absorption
> becomes too heavy and tiresome
> for the one sense alone [i.e.,
> the visual channel]; the eye
> demands to be satisfied as well
> as the ear, and the ear becomes
> eager to share its burden with
> the eye.[22]

In addition to the obvious function of elaborating on
plot and character, Bush believed that a good lecturer
helped silence the "buzz and idle comment" by becoming
the audience's "spokesman." And through the power of
inspired speech the spokesman functioned to bond the

spectators together in a dramatic experience of transcendent emotional intensity.[23] To corroborate this view Bush quoted from the Parisian art critic, Cellatier.

> If this sort of entertainment
> [i.e., the moving picture] is
> ever to stop being a toy and is
> to become a permanent institution
> in the amusement world it needs
> the assistance in some shape or
> other of the human voice.[24]

In later articles Bush argued that competent narration and increased profits were directly correlated on the assumption that patrons preferred their film entertainment with spoken accompaniment.[25]

In his series of articles on film narration which spanned the period of 1909-1912, Bush articulated a number of guidelines. He first urged lecturers to select only those subjects which could be enhanced by narration. Most suitable were pictures based on novels, plays, poems and historical events. To be avoided were comedy and magic films.[26] Bush also expressed concern for the proper integration of the lecture with music and sound effects. In regard to explanatory titles, Bush advised that only music should be heard so that the title's meaning could be absorbed. In general though, the narration was to be featured with music and effects

playing subsidiary roles.[27] For the potential lecturer
Bush specified the requirements of "a good voice, a
fair education and a determination to give the best
there is in you at all times." Also stressed were "a
thorough and patient study of the picture" and adequate
rehearsal. His final word of caution was an appeal to
the lecturer's sense of discretion.

> Do not, however, attempt to
> lecture on a film unless you
> feel in your heart and soul
> that there is need for it
> [i.e., commentary] and that
> you are competent to fill that
> need.

Bush concluded that the film with live human voice
should be a special feature and not just part of the
theater's everyday routine.[28]

    With the hope of providing encouragement and
guidance for film narrators, Bush authored a lecture for
the Edison production Foul Play (1911). He prefaced
the lecture by noting that wi le continuous commentary
was not required there were still many sections which
could be made clearer by explanatory remarks. The
"Introduction" and comments for Reel I exemplify Bush's
approach.

> Introductory.
> "In presenting to you, ladies
> and gentlemen, this evening's
> entertainment, a few words of
> explanation may not be out of place.

'Foul Play' is the title of a
well-known novel by Charles Reade,
with whose works some of you no
doubt are acquainted. It is a
thrilling and romantic story and
will be unfolded before your eyes
in three reels. You will see it as
you would a drama in three acts,
only the action will be swifter and
the intermissions shorter. The first
reel will show you two young men,
one honorable and unsuspecting, the
other crafty and criminal. To pay
his gambling debts the bad fellow
forges the name of his father on a
check and gives it to the other
man, who endorses and cashes the
check and is arrested as a forger
and sent to prison in a colony for
five years."
      (After these remarks have the
operator start the first reel and
explain the first picture as follows:)

          Scene I.
      "Arthur Wardlaw, son of a rich
merchant and friend and pupil of
Robert Penfold, while a student at
Oxford, suffers heavy losses at the
gambling table. He gets deeply into
debt."
      "With the aid of Penfold young
Wardlaw graduates from the University
and is made a partner in his father's
business."
      (The next scenes up to the title
"General Rolleston and his daughter
Helen, guests at Arthur's dinner" may
be covered by the following remarks:)
      "Penfold, wishing to open a school,
asks Wardlaw for a loan. The latter
conceives the plan of forging his
father's name on a check, made payable
to young Penfold. He sends the forged
check to Penfold and tells him to take
out seven hundred pounds and give the
rest (thirteen hundred pounds) to him.
Suspecting no wrong, Penfold cashes the
check and tells his father about his
good luck."

(When the scene with the title
"General Rolleston and his daughter
Helen, guests at Arthur's dinner" is
flashed on the screen, continue lecture
as follows:)
    "General Rolleston, a retired
soldier, and his daughter, to whom
young Wardlaw is engaged to be married,
and old Wardlaw. A messenger insists
on seeing old Mr. Wardlaw to find out
whether his signature on the two thousand-
pound check is genuine. Old Wardlaw
denounces the check as a forgery."
    (The concluding scenes of this
reel may be covered by the following
remarks:)
    "Detectives call at the house of
Penfold and arrest him as a forger.
He turns for help to Wardlaw. The
latter is made sick by fear and does not
appear at the trial to clear his friend.
In consequence, Penfold is found guilty
and sentenced."

END OF REEL I.[29]

Bush's encouragement and guidance had limited

impact and lecturers never achieved the level of acceptance

for which he hoped. One problem involved the shortage

of "qualified" narrators. Other problems included the

lack of films suitable for lecture, poorly prepared

lectures, a residual prejudice against lecturers going

back to the pre-motion picture stereoptican presentations

and lecturers' difficulty in projecting over the din

created by the patrons, projector, ventilation fans and

noises from outside the theater.[30] After reaching a peak

popularity in 1912[31] the lecturer was doomed as a passing

fad due to forces emerging from the evolution of the art

and business of the motion picture during the period
1910-1915.

Filmmakers like Griffith were developing visual
narrative devices such as parallel editing, fades and
close-ups which combined to reduce the necessity of the
of the spoken or printed word. Films were also
increasing in length so that by 1915 the feature-length
era had been entered. Longer and more complex films
meant longer and more complex narrations, a challenge
successfully met by only a few narrators. And along with
feature pictures came a construction boom which created
the institution of the picture palace. Successful voice
projection which had been difficult in smaller theaters
was impossible in the huge cathedrals of the motion
picture. With only a few and brief exceptions, the film
narrator had by 1915 become an extinct species.

Voices Behind the Screen

Another attempt at using the human voice involved
the employment of actors who were stationed behind the
screen to speak dialogue. This innovation surfaced in
1908 under such trade names as "Humanovo," "Actologue"
and "Dram-o-tone." Of the larger companies, Adolph Zukor's
Humanovo was the most successful.

By July, 1908, Humanovo had twenty-two road
troupes, each consisting of three actors.   Each company
stayed at a theater for one week and then moved to the
next location in the manner of touring vaudeville acts.
The troupes travelled in "wheels" so that a contracted
theater had a change of pictures and company each week.
Will H. Stevens, the general manager of Humanovo,
described his method of operation.

> First, I select a suitable
> picture, then I write a play
> for it, putting appropriate
> speeches in the mouths of the
> characters.   I write off the
> parts, just as is done in
> regular plays, and rehearse
> the people carefully, intro-
> ducing all possible effects
> and requiring the actors to
> move about the stage exactly
> as is represented in the films,
> so as to have the voices properly
> located to carry out the illusion.[32]

Humanovo continued to prosper so that by November, 1908,
a western branch headquarters in Los Angeles had been
opened.[33]

In spite of the initial successes of well organized
companies like Humanovo, problems developed.   W. Stephen
Bush spoke of the actors' inability to produce a "pefect
illusion."[34]   Part of what Bush had in mind were absurd
image-voice juxtapositions such as a heroine articulating
her cry of help in the deep growling bass of the villain.[35]

A related problem was the introduction of "cheap
efforts at wit into pathetic scenes" which transformed
a dramatic picture into a burlesque.[36] Even advocates
of "talking pictures" expressed implied reservations
as evidenced by their calls for better elocutionists.[37]
And then there were problems of synchronization. The
cry of "fire" after the filmed flames had been doused
obviously struck a bizarre note. Equally ludicrous
were the frequent attempts to match dialogue to the
movement of the screen actors' lips.[38]

Some of the excesses mentioned above can be traced
to economics. Since small theaters could not afford to
hire travelling companies they attempted a cheaper
substitute by using one person to take all roles. This
economic short-cut resulted in poorly prepared scripts
or improvisations, repetitions of the same dialogue for
different pictures, strange aural-visual combinations and
the use of "actors" with little dramatic inspiration.[39]

The novelty of live actors soon expired and the
matter ceased to be of concern to the trade press after
1911. Sealing the fate of rear-screen thespians were the
trends toward longer pictures and larger theaters.
Longer and more sophisticated pictures meant additional
expense as more actors, more rehearsals and better scripts

had to be provided. Larger theaters increased the
difficulty of projecting the human voice through the
screen and audiences could just not understand the
actors' dialogue. Consequently, live actors, like
narrators, were victims due in part to the artistic
and economic growth of the motion picture.

Singers

A third method of employing the human voice was
through the use of singers. This practice was especially
effective in films that were essentially illustrations
of popular and patriotic songs. Silver Threads Among
the Gold (Edison, 1911), The Star Spangled Banner
(Edison, 1911), The Battle Hymn of the Republic (Vitagraph,
1911), Ben Bolt (Solax, 1913), Home, Sweet Home (Griffith-
Reliance, 1914) and After the Ball (Photo-Drama, 1914)
provided excellent opportunities for the accompanying
human voice in song.

With the coming of the feature film, however, singers
were primarily employed as extra attractions to be used
in the stage entertainments preceding the feature film.[40]
The only exceptions were the special show-case presentations
in the huge metropolitan picture palaces. Thomas Ince's
Civilization (1916) was, for example, first exhibited at
New York's Criterion Theatre with a special score by

Victor Schertzinger utilizing a chorus of sixty voices.[41]
In general, however, singing accompaniments were rare
and special events.

Conclusion

Because of the failure of inventors to deliver
"the myth of total cinema" in one neat package, motion
picture showmen were forced to experiment with alternatives
to synchronized recorded sound due to audiences' felt
need for aural stimulation. And because lecturers,
actors behind the screen and singers proved ineffective,
instrumental music supplemented with occasional sound
effects became almost by default the silent film's
constant accompaniment.[42]

The most significant consequence of the fortuitous
thirty year span we call "the silent era" is that film-
makers were forced to invent visual means for expressing
emotions, articulating ideas and telling stories.[43]
This accident of technological evolution accounts to a
very large extent for the accelerated development of the
medium's visual communicative capacities. The delay in
"the coming of sound" also short-circuited the Edison-
Nadar dream of using the sound motion picture as a mere
recording device for operas and speeches as filmmakers

demonstrated film's ability to express visions from
the interiors of men's hearts and minds.[44] The
failures of recorded and live human voices can
therefore be regarded as critical stimuli which
pushed the motion picture into becoming (1) an
essentially visual medium in which the audial channel
is subordinate to and supportive of the visual channel
and (2) a medium of artistic potential and significance.

Notes

[1]Thomas A. Edison in a foreward to W. K. L. Dickson and Antonia Dickson's History of the Kinetograph, Kinetoscope and Kineto-phonograph (1895; rpt. New York: Arno Press, 1970), p. 4.

[2]Ibid.

[3]Cited by Andre Bazin in "The Myth of Total Cinema," What Is Cinema?, trans. by Hugh Gray (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1967), p. 20.

[4]Dickson's own account, History of the Kinetograph, Kinetoscope and Kineto-phonograph, p. 19, which has been passed on by several film historians, is questioned in the careful researches of Gordon Hendricks in The Edison Motion Picture Myth (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1961), pp. 88-91. In American Film Criticism (New York: Liveright, 1972), p. 211, Stanley Kauffmann (ed.) quotes from the May 20, 1893, issue of Scientific American, which describes an Edison machine designed to project sound-synchronized motion pictures.

[5]Dickson's description of the kineto-phonograph in History of the Kinetograph, Kinetoscope and Kineto-phonograph, p. 18, is supported by Gordon Hendricks in The Kinetoscope (New York: The Beginnings of American Film, 1966), pp. 118-25.

[6]Edward W. Kellogg, "History of Sound Motion Pictures," in A Technological History of Motion Pictures and Television, ed. by Raymond Fielding (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1967), pp. 174-5.

[7]For a complete account of the development of sound motion pictures, see Kellogg's three-part "History of Sound Motion Pictures" in Fielding's A Technological History of Motion Pictures and Television, pp. 174-220.

[8]This argument is derived from Bazin, What Is
Cinema?,p. 21, who maintains that "the myth of total
cinema," i.e., the dream of a perfect mechanical
reproduction of reality, preceded the actual invention
of cinema itself. Bazin regards the silent film as a
stage in the realization of the "myth" and states that
"the primacy of the image is both historically and
technically accidental."

[9]Harvey Brougham, "The Play's Not All," Overland
Monthly, November, 1920, p. 82.

[10]Stuart Fletcher, "Two Arts that Meet as One,"
Sackbut, June, 1929, p. 374.

[11]Wilfred H. Mellers, "Film Music," in Grove's
Dictionary of Music and Musicians, ed. by Eric Blom,
Vol. 3 (5th ed.; New York: St. Martin's Press, 1954),
p. 103.

[12]Dorothy M. Richardson, "Continuous Performance:
Musical Accompaniment," Close Up, August, 1927, p. 60.

[13]Louis Levy, Music for the Movies (London:
Sampson Low, Marston, 1948), p. 7.

[14]Ernest Lindgren, The Art of the Film (New York:
Macmillan, 1963), p. 137.

[15]Kurt London, Film Music, trans. by Eric S.
Bensinger (London: Faber and Faber, 1936), pp. 25-6.

[16]Kenneth Macgowan, Behind the Screen (New York:
Delacorte Press, 1965), p. 88.

[17]Cecil M. Hepworth, Came the Dawn (London:
Phoenix House, 1951), pp. 31-2.

[18]See Macgowan, Behind the Screen, p. 89, and
Bosley Crowther, The Lion's Share (New York: E. P.
Dutton, 1957), p. 17.

[19]Raymond Fielding, "Hale's Tours: Ultrarealism
in the Pre-1910 Motion Picture," Cinema Journal,
X (Fall, 1970), 41.

[20]"Henry Lee's 'Cyclo-Homo,'" New York Dramatic Mirror, July 4, 1908, p. 7.

[21]"Illustrated Lectures at the Belasco," New York Dramatic Mirror, November 14, 1908, p. 9.

[22]W. Stephen Bush, "The Human Voice as a Factor in the Moving Picture Show," Moving Picture World, January 23, 1909, p. 86.

[23]Ibid.

[24]Cited by Bush, Ibid., from "a recent issue of the Temps."

[25]W. Stephen Bush, "The Picture and the Voice," Moving Picture World, November 2, 1912, p. 429.

[26]Bush, "The Human Voice as a Factor in the Moving Picture Show," p. 86.

[27]W. Stephen Bush, "Music and Sound Effects for Dante's 'Inferno,'" Moving Picture World, January 27, 1912, p. 283.

[28]W. Stephen Bush, "The Added Attraction: Article II," Moving Picture World, November 25, 1911, p. 617.

[29]W. Stephen Bush, "Lecture on the Three Reel Production 'Foul Play,'" Moving Picture World, October 7, 1911, p. 28.

[30]W. Stephen Bush, "The Added Attraction: Article I," Moving Picture World, November 18, 1911, p. 533.

[31]Bush, "The Picture and the Voice," p. 429.

[32]"Twenty-two Humanovo Companies." New York Dramatic Mirror, July 18, 1908, p. 7.

[33]"Humanovo Companies Still Advancing," New York Dramatic Mirror, November 14, 1908, p. 8.

[34]Bush, "The Human Voice as a Factor in the Moving Picture Show," p. 86.

[35]See G. W. Beynon, _Musical Presentation of Motion Pictures_ (New York: G. Schirmer, 1921), pp. 8-9.

[36]"Moving Picture Notes," _New York Dramatic Mirror_, July 4, 1908, p. 7.

[37]See, for example, Hugh F. Hoffman, "The Moving Picture Play; as Distinctive from the One Reel Drama," _Moving Picture World_, February 25, 1911, p. 418, and Elizabeth Blank, "The Baroness Blank Talks about Talking Pictures," _Moving Picture World_, January 28, 1911, p. 186.

[38]Beynon, _Musical Presentation of Motion Pictures_, p. 9.

[39]_Ibid._

[40]See Ben M. Hall's _The Best Remaining Seats_ (New York: Bramhall House, 1961) for numerous examples of stage attractions featuring singers.

[41]"The Composer of 'Marcheta' Talks about the Talking Pictures," _Music Trade News_, September, 1929, p. 16.

[42]For discussion of the role of music during the silent film era, see Charles Merrell Berg, _An Investigation of the Motives for and Realization of Music to Accompany the American Silent Film, 1896-1927_ (New York: Arno Press, 1975).

[43]Inserted explanatory titles were obviously of importance in assisting the film in its narrative efforts. But titles had the negative effect of interrupting the film's visual and dramatic continuity. For discussion of inserted titles see Macgowan, _Behind the Screen_, p. 117, and Lewis Jacobs, _The Rise of the American Film_ (1939; rpt. New York: Teachers College Press, Columbia University, 1968), pp. 220-1.

[44]The discovery of film's artistic, dramatic and rhetorical potentials did not in any way negate the value of film's recording capacity as envisioned by Edison and Nadar.