Document Resume

Author: Knowlton, Clark S.
Title: An Analysis of Certain Selected Causes of Poverty in
San Miguel County.
Pub Date: 25 Aug 74
Note: 18p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the
Rural Sociological Society (Montreal, Quebec, August
1974)

ERS Price: ME-$0.75 RC-$1.50 PLUS POSTAGE
Descriptors: Anglo Americans; Area Studies; Conflict; Cultural
Background; Demography; Federal Government;
Historical Reviews; Land Use; Local Issues;
Majority Attitudes; Poverty Research; Rural
Economics; Spanish Americans; State Government
Identifiers: *New Mexico; San Miguel County

Abstract: San Miguel County, one of the larger, older, and more
predominantly Spanish American counties in New Mexico, is located in
the north central section of the State. Marked by varied
topographical and climatic characteristics, the county was once one
of the more prosperous and densely populated areas of the State.
Today it suffers from high rates of malnutrition, unemployment,
welfare, disease and infant mortality, poverty, malfunctioning social
systems, and few sources of employment other than Federal, State, and
local governments. It is hypothesized that a major cause of today's
poverty among the Spanish Americans there is the imposition of alien
Anglo American legal, political, social, and economic systems shortly
after the American occupation of the Southwest, systems that the
rural village people have not yet completely understood or
assimilated. There is a history of conflict between Spanish and Anglo
land tenure systems, of a negative impact caused by imposition of
Anglo county systems, and of failure of government programs to
benefit the Spanish Americans. The document examines the geographic
environment, natural resources, genetic backgrounds, social and
economic systems, land grants, taxes, State and county government
systems, Federal programs, and the rural farm economy of the area.
(KH/BRDR)
AN ANALYSIS OF CERTAIN SELECTED CAUSES OF POVERTY IN SAN MIGUEL COUNTY

Clark S. Knowlton
American West Center
University of Utah

Presented at the Annual Meeting of the Rural Sociological Society
August 22-25, 1974
Montreal, Canada
Introduction... San Miguel County, one of the larger, older, and more predominantly American counties in New Mexico, is located in the north central section of the state. The county is marked by varied topographical and climatic characteristics. Once one of the more prosperous and densely populated counties of the state, San Miguel County today is scarred by high rates of malnutrition, unemployment, welfare, disease and infant mortality, poverty, malfunctioning social systems, and few sources of employment other than federal, state, and local governments.

Although many students of Spanish-American culture, history, social and economic systems, and social change have pointed out the existence of mass poverty and have described its characteristics, few have endeavored to analyze its basic causes. Many popular assumptions about the causes of poverty among the Spanish Americans found even among academic and government circles tend to assume that among the more important causes of that poverty are geographic, genetic, or Spanish-American cultural variables. These will be discussed first, and then will follow an analysis of the hypothesis of this paper—that a major cause of poverty among the Spanish Americans of San Miguel County is the imposition of alien Anglo-American legal, political, social and economic systems upon the Spanish Americans shortly after the American occupation of the Southwest, systems that the rural Spanish-American village people have not completely understood or assimilated to the present day. Aspects of these systems delineated for analyses in this paper are the conflicts between Spanish-American and Anglo-American land tenure systems, the negative impact of the imposition of Anglo-American county systems upon the local Spanish-Americans, and the failure of government programs to benefit the Spanish Americans. Time will not permit the inclusion of an analysis of the passing of economic dominance into the hands of Anglo-American merchants, the impact of cyclical economic trends upon the Spanish-American village people, and the reasons for the malfunctioning of the school system, among others.
The Geographic Environment... The eastern section of San Miguel County, one of the better summer grazing regions in the area, is marked by high rolling plains punctuated by buttes, mesas, arroyos, entrenched stream beds. A zone of transition, the middle segment of the county is characterized by broken high plains, sparsely wooded plateaus and mesas, and mountain foothills. The high peaks of the first frontal ranges of the Rocky Mountains separated by forested plateaus and canyons are the dominant geographical features of the western section of the County (Beck, 1962).

The climate of the county is continental in nature. Winters are moderately cold with temperatures hovering around the fifties. Because of the abundant winter sunshine, temperatures fall below zero less than five days in the average year. Summers tend to be cool and pleasant with temperatures reaching 90 degrees less than 15 days in the average year. Precipitation is highly localized and cyclic. Fluctuating dramatically from year to year, it ranges from about 15 inches a year in the drier eastern section to 32 inches a year in the mountain west. Much of the annual precipitation falls during the summer growing season, and the rainfall is sufficient to provide good grazing and even to mature some summer crops.

The average length of the growing season as measured by the frost-free period is closely associated with altitude and minimum temperatures. The average length of the frost-free period in the high mountain valleys in the western section of the County, where elevations may range well above 8,000 feet, ranges from 75 to 105 days. In each valley, marked variations exist from year to year. The frost-free period in the lower eastern segment of the County ranges from 180 to 195 days a year with again marked annual variations (Von Eschen, 1961).

County vegetation varies from the short grass eastern plains through open stands of pinon, juniper, and scrub oak in the central section to high mountain forests of Ponderosa Pine, Douglas Fir, Englemann Spruce, White Fir, and Quaking Aspen.
As poverty in San Miguel County has been blamed upon local climatic and topographical conditions, it should be pointed out that the inhabitants of many mountain sections of Asia with similar climatic and topographical conditions, such as Afghanistan, Pakistan, Iran, Bhutan, Nepal, and perhaps Kashmir in India, enjoy higher living standards than do the populations of many of the more densely inhabited lowlands. The mountain countries of Europe such as Switzerland, Norway and Austria, and the mountainous sections of Italy, Germany and the Pyrenees of France and Spain maintain thriving populations with high standards of living. On the other hand, the inhabitants of the mountainous sections of Peru and Bolivia today are marked by depressed living standards although in the past the living standards were probably higher under the Inca regime. Therefore, it would seem that the low living standards of San Miguel County are not primarily a factor of unfavorable climatic and geographical factors but rather the socioeconomic systems that exist in the County.

**Natural Resources**. Other planners and scholars in New Mexico have argued from time to time that the poverty of San Miguel County and its neighbors is primarily caused by the lack of an adequate natural resource base to sustain the existing Spanish-American population. Therefore, these people should be encouraged to migrate to urban or rural centers of a greater economic growth potential. As no comprehensive survey has yet been made of the natural resources of the region, such as timber, minerals, soil types, or grazing and recreational potential, it is rather difficult to say whether an adequate natural resource base exists in the region or not. Suffice it to say that in countries such as Switzerland and other mountain countries with similar natural resources, poverty is not as common as it is in San Miguel County.

It should be pointed out that northern New Mexico, including San Miguel County, rises like the prow of a giant ship high over the semi-arid plains of southeastern
Colorado, eastern New Mexico, western Oklahoma and Texas, and over the high plateaus, desert mountain ranges, and drainage basins of southern New Mexico. It is virtually the only mountainous, cool and heavily forested area in a region of many thousands of square miles. With proper development, it could very well become a recreational base for the entire region. Whether such development would be an economic blessing or curse for the local inhabitants would depend upon the type of recreational development that might take place. It is also the major source of culinary, irrigation, and commercial water supplies of large areas in New Mexico, Oklahoma, and Texas.

Because of existing systems of legal, economic, and land use that control access to the natural resources of San Miguel County, the Spanish Americans have lost ownership of and access to the natural resources of their county. This may well be a more important cause of poverty than an existence of an inadequate natural resource base.

The Genetic Factor... A rather popular explanation among Anglo Americans for the existence of poverty among the Spanish Americans in San Miguel County is that they are a product of a racial intermixture between genetically inferior human stocks, although the hypothesis that some human groups are genetically inferior to other human elements is no longer acceptable as valid by the majority of scholars and scientists and one hopes by the majority of the general populations. Nonetheless, it is still raised in Anglo-American circles in New Mexico.

The genetic background of the Spanish Americans is extremely complex. The Spanish brought with them into New Mexico genetic contributions from Iberians, Celts, Greeks, Phoenicians, Basques, the varied human elements that entered Spain during the period of the Roman Empire, Germans, Moors, Arabs, Berbers, and refugee Catholic groups such as the Irish. The Spanish were accompanied into New Mexico by Nahua Indian groups from the central valley of Mexico. Once in New Mexico,
the descendents of the Spanish and the Nahua intermixed with the local Indian groups, with French-Canadian, French Missourian, and French-Louisiana trappers and traders, with Anglo-American and European immigrant trappers, traders, merchants, soldiers, cowboys, and workers to such an extent that large numbers of Spanish Americans in New Mexico have French, Irish, German, and English surnames. Certainly the hybrid vigour generated by such a heterogeneous genetic ancestry cannot be used to explain the existence of poverty, as all of these groups contributing to the genetic stock of the Spanish Americans have made many significant contributions to Western and Indian civilizations.

Social and Economic Systems..... Many Anglo-American and even some Spanish-American leaders have argued that the cultural and social systems of the Spanish Americans are responsible for their poverty in San Miguel County. It may well be that some Spanish-American values are not conducive to the facile acculturation and assimilation of the Spanish Americans or to their adjustment to the demands of urban life and industrial employment. However, scholars again are almost in agreement that social systems or cultural systems cannot ipso facto be declared inferior to those of other ethnic groupings. It can be pointed out that the Spanish American, living in isolation from other European settlements for several hundred years, managed to develop a culture well adjusted to the natural environment in which the Spanish Americans lived. Furthermore, faced with many of the strongest fighting Indian tribes of the North American continent such as the Apaches, Comanches, and Kiowas, they managed to survive and to hold their own armed with but little more than the lance and bow-and-arrow of their Indian opponents.

Left to their own devices by the Spanish and Mexican governments, Spanish-American village settlements based on subsistence agriculture and pastoral activities, spread up and down the Rio Grande Valley, through the mountain valleys of
northern New Mexico and southern Colorado, down the streams flowing from the Sangre de Cristo Mountains, and out into the plains of southeastern Colorado, eastern New Mexico, and western Oklahoma and Texas until their eastward moving frontier was rolled back in a cloud of violence by the better armed more bellicose Texans.

Furthermore Spanish-American businessmen, political leaders, merchants, ranchers, farmers, and soldiers, whether in Spanish, Mexican, or American uniforms, have played important although seldom acknowledged roles in the economic, military, and political history not only of New Mexico but in the surrounding states as well. New Mexico was one state in which the Spanish Americans held their own against the intruding Anglo Americans far better than did other Spanish-speaking groups in other southwestern states. Thus, it is a dubious argument to propose that the Spanish-American political, economic, and social systems are responsible for their poverty-stricken conditions today.

**Impact of Certain Alien Anglo-American Systems Upon the Spanish Americans**......If topography, climate, natural resources, and local Spanish-American social and cultural systems are not primarily responsible for the existence of poverty in San Miguel County, then it might be logical to argue that existing poverty may have been caused by the impact of alien Anglo-American land tenure, legal, economic, political, and social systems. It is to this hypothesis that we address ourselves to. now.

At the time of the American conquest of New Mexico, the majority of the Spanish-American inhabitants of San Miguel County lived in isolated small farming villages. The local village economic systems were structured upon subsistence agriculture, livestock production, handicrafts, buffalo hunting on the plains by villages located near the plains, and trade with Mexico and nearby Indian tribes. Through marriage, kinship bonds, and the godfather system, the inhabitants of each village were formed into small, quite isolated little peasant communities, each based
upon its own community land grant. The village people did and still do today identify themselves very strongly with their native villages. Large numbers of people who migrate from the villages retain ownership of their house sites and small plots of irrigated land, refusing to sell them even though they seldom return to the village to live. It should be pointed out that in the eyes of the Spanish Americans, the village community included not only the village itself but also all of the land belonging to the original community land grant and utilized by the village population.

The land grant was the mechanism through which land passed from government into private ownership during the Spanish and Mexican periods in New Mexico. Although basically three types of land grants were made in New Mexico, the community or pueblo land grant, the sitio grant, and the proprietary or entrepreneurial grant. (Loomis and Leonard, 1961; Leonard, 1971; Knowlton, 1967), in San Miguel and other northern New Mexican counties, the community land grant was the most important type as it provided a land base for the multitudinous villages that dot the mountain areas and river valleys. Community land grants were in general granted to at least ten petitioning family heads. The petition, first sent to the governor of New Mexico, was referred to a local political official closest to the site who conducted an investigation to ascertain that the land was truly vacant and not essential to other Spanish-American or Indian villages. If these conditions existed, the official then met with the villagers, measured out to them their farming lands, helped select a village site, showed them their grant boundaries, and explained the conditions of the grant to them. Each family received a house site and a strip of irrigated land whose quantity depended upon the size of the family and often on the political importance of the family grouping. If the land were not settled, title to the grant reverted back to the government. Usually each family could sell its house lot and farming land within a specified number of years if it so desired. However, the larger part of the grant, the forested and grazing lands known as the ejido, was
held in communal ownership. Each village family had the right to utilize the natural resources of the ejido. According to custom, the ejido could not be alienated from the village.

Sitio and proprietary grants were made to establish livestock ranches or to thicken the zone of settlements. That is, the proprietors agreed to settle the land, attract a priest, etc. in return for the right to sell the land, conduct businesses, etc. 5

In view of the divergent concepts of land tenure and land use that existed between the Spanish Americans and Anglo Americans, it is not surprising that serious land conflicts developed that have left their impact upon present social and political forces in New Mexico. Among the Spanish Americans, land was not defined as a commodity to be bought and sold for private gain but rather as the very foundation of human life. Families struggled to maintain their landholdings intact from generation to generation. If a family lost its lands, the loss was perceived as tragic. It was also accepted that every family had a right to enough land to maintain itself. The very thought of anyone monopolizing land to the exclusion of others who needed land was and is abhorrent to the Spanish Americans (Knowlton, 1967).

To the Anglo Americans, land was a commodity to be bought and sold in the market like any other commodity for private gain. Land owners had the right to utilize their property for short run profits regardless of the damage that may be done to the land itself or to their neighbors. As Murphy pointed out:

"English settlers brought to the frontier ideas which precluded the sort of accommodation with nature and native peoples that marked Spanish settlements from Florida to California, or the sort of self-contained agrarian economy descriptive of most of the French settlements. To the English immigrants, all of North America was a vast preserve of resources waiting to be processed" (Murphy, 1967) p 7.

Coming into San Miguel County in search of economic opportunities, Anglo Americans found that the major sources of wealth--grazing, farm, mineral, and timber lands--
were either owned by Spanish Americans who were not eager to sell them and did not share Anglo-American values of private land ownership, or the accumulation of private wealth, or by hard-fighting Commanche, Kiowa, Apache, and Navajo tribes of Indians. To gain access to wealth-producing lands, Anglo Americans had to wrest them from the Spanish Americans and from the Indians. Utilizing fraud, violence, legal entrapment, and every device that the Anglo American political and legal system provided, the Anglo Americans from the 1870's to the 1930's managed to strip both groupings of the majority of their landholdings (Knowlton, 1967). The Spanish-American range lands went first, followed gradually by the small plots of farming lands. The massive land loss destroyed the economic base of the village economic systems. At first, the village people sought recourse in migrant labor, the men leaving the villages in the spring and returning in the fall while their wives and children cultivated the lands that they were able to retain. Then, as land loss accelerated, drought and depression darkened the scene in the 1930's, and the village population was forced to accept government assistance to survive, the realization spread among the Spanish Americans that immigration provided the only hope of survival. World War II, and the prosperous years following the war, brought about a mass migration of the village people to the urban centers of the West and Midwest. Today in San Miguel County, dozens of villages are occupied by old people and children while many others are totally abandoned. The Spanish Americans have been replaced by smaller numbers of incoming Anglo Americans and a subsistence village economy by livestock ranching, ranches owned by Anglo Americans.

Land loss was accelerated among the Spanish Americans by the imposition upon them of the complex, expensive, and cumbersome state and county systems financed through the imposition of a land tax. Under both Spanish and Mexican regimes, the government system was very simple and inexpensive. The local political leader
known as the alcalde, was a combination of political, military, economic and social leader as well as a judge. He was assisted in his decisions by the older, more respected men of the area. His expenses were minimal.

The economic and political impact of the Anglo-American government system was quite harsh. Heavy land taxes had to be imposed to support the county officials ranging from county commissioners, sheriff and deputies, county clerks and staff, assessors and staff, tax collectors and staff, local district judges and their staffs, county attorneys and their assistants. In a region whose economy was built upon subsistence agriculture and livestock ranching, in an area of uncertain precipitation, the land tax wrought serious damage to Spanish-American landholdings.6

Furthermore, as county and state governments provided almost the only source of non-agricultural employment in the region, the ability by county commissions to control this employment and to set land taxes gave them extraordinary power over the local county populations who have seldom understood the values and working mechanisms of the American political system. The result was the creation in San Miguel as well as other counties in northern New Mexico of corrupt, entrenched, county political rings composed both of Anglo Americans and Spanish Americans that enriched themselves at the expense of the local population.

The state government of New Mexico, expensive to maintain, was and is still, largely oblivious of the serious social and economic problems and needs of the rural Spanish-speaking population of San Miguel and other Spanish-speaking counties. Rank discrimination in the distribution of state funds and services in favor of Anglo-American counties has traditionally existed in New Mexico. The state systems of financing roads and schools has always worked to the disadvantage of the Spanish-American counties. The political neglect of the Spanish Americans, even though many of them have held important political positions in the state, has fostered an
extreme cynicism toward the political process in New Mexico. As one recent New
Mexican governor, Governor Cargo, commented: "The Spanish Americans view the gov-
ernment as being a natural antagonist who never helped them out" (Cargo, 1967).

The programs of federal agencies and departments in San Miguel County at
best have provided few benefits and at worse have wrought extreme harm to the
Spanish-American village population. The causes of failure of the majority of
federal programs rest in part upon the fact that these programs are pervaded with
such Anglo-American values as individualism with its emphasis upon the individual
rather than upon the community, commercial agriculture, private ownership, and
treatment of the symptoms of basic economic and social problems rather than their
basic causes.7

The programs of the Department of Agriculture are an excellent example. Most
of these programs are geared to the commercial farmer and require private matching
funds for participation. The Spanish Americans are often excluded quite simply
because they do not have the matching funds. Their systems of village subsistence
agriculture have been written off as viable agricultural systems by agricultural
economists entrenched in the Department of Agriculture bureaucracy. Many times,
the net result of these programs has been to increase the indebtedness of Spanish-
American farmers ultimately leading to land foreclosures rather than improving
his ability to remain in agriculture.

If these programs had been geared to utilize the village community rather
than the individual as the basic unit of planning, to foster research in the
development of strains of commercial crops adjusted to the climatic conditions
of San Miguel County, and to purchase land as it came on the market and sell it
to the local Spanish-American communities over a long term period at small inter-
est rates, and to develop cooperatives, perhaps they might have been far more ben-
efficial than they actually have been.
The irrigation districts fostered by the Bureau of Reclamation, and flood control districts supported by the U.S. Corps of Army Engineers have been responsible for driving thousands of Spanish Americans off the land into the slums of metropolitan areas. These irrigation and flood control districts are financed by placing fixed annual charges upon lands receiving presumed benefits. The small subsistence-farming Spanish American, unable to pay the charges, lost both his farming lands and his water rights through foreclosure proceedings initiated by the irrigation and flood control districts. In the case of Flood Control or Conservancy Districts, as they are known, the managing directors are not selected by the democratic process of election by the local people but are chosen by local district judges, usually Anglo Americans. Thus, the Spanish Americans were required to pay tax rates set by boards of commissioners chosen by local judges in whose election they had no control. The American Revolution began for less.

The U.S. Forest Service is another federal bureau that has negatively affected the rural Spanish-American villages in San Miguel and neighboring counties. A large part of the national forest lands once belonged to the village community land grants. From 1964 to about 1967, the Forest Service began to ban the grazing of work horses, largely owned by Spanish Americans, while permitting the grazing of riding horses owned largely by Anglo Americans. This was followed by the prohibition of grazing permits for milk cattle, again for the most part belonging to the Spanish Americans, while grazing permits for beef cattle and sheep were cut back drastically. As the livelihood of large numbers of poor Spanish-American village people depended upon combining the grazing of work horses, milk cows, and small numbers of beef cattle and sheep upon the natural forests with the cultivation of small irrigated and dry land farming plots, the forced cutbacks resulted in spreading malnutrition, deepening poverty, and immigration.
The local people complained in Spanish to the forest officials who answered back in English that the cutbacks were necessary to control erosion in the national forests; and yet, at the time, the local Spanish Americans were fully aware that the Forest Service was spending far more money to develop picnic and camping grounds, hiking trails, improvement of fishing waters and wildlife habitat for the benefit of the Anglo-American tourist than they were spending to improve grazing facilities. Bitterness and hostility toward the Forest Service was primarily responsible for the outbreaks of rural violence among the Spanish Americans in the late 1960's in northern New Mexico.

Perhaps the following quotation best illustrates the feelings of the Spanish-American people toward the Forest Service.

"The U.S. Forest Service has limited the grazing rights in Mora County to an unreasonable extent. Our U.S. Department of Agriculture is encouraging all farmers and ranchers to raise more livestock and to stay on the farms and ranches. On the other hand, one of its departments, the U.S. Forest Service, is telling them to get out fast." (Report of the Community of Chacon, A.R.A.-R.A.D. Provisional Plan, Mora County, 1961) p.3.

Or, as one embittered Spanish-American leader stated: "The Forest Rangers are storm troopers guarding the spoils of the Mexican-American War" (Atencio, 1967).

Outside of the now dismantled Office of Economic Opportunity programs, the government agency that has had the most favorable impact upon the Spanish Americans in San Miguel County is the Department of Defense. The military services provided the young Spanish-American male an escape from poverty. The allotments sent home assisted the families of draftees and volunteers, and the young men learned English, acquired a knowledge of Anglo-American values, and perhaps, if they were fortunate, picked up an occupation. Very few of these men, however, upon their release, remained in the rural villages of the county. Furthermore, the price paid in blood during World War II, the Korean War, and the Vietnam War was a heavy one.
The evidence discussed in the paper seems to indicate that the hypothesis upon which the paper is based, that the imposition of alien political, economic, legal, and social systems upon the Spanish Americans in San Miguel County as well as in other Spanish-American counties, played important roles in the development of massive poverty among the Spanish Americans. It is perhaps not out of line to point out that well-planned government programs based upon Spanish-American values and oriented toward returning ownership and access of the natural resources of the region to the Spanish Americans, and the formation of programs designed to develop these resources for the benefit of the local population rather than for the benefit of absentee owners, could do much to create a modest prosperity in the region.

If some effort is not made in this direction, then the ultimate Spanish-American response will be the continued migration of poorly educated, unskilled Spanish Americans to the slums of our metropolitan centers as well as the outbreak of chronic rural violence in San Miguel and its neighboring Spanish-American counties.
FOOTNOTES


3. The author served as president of the San Miguel County Area Redevelopment Committee from 1960 to 1962. He was also active in anti-poverty programs from 1960 to 1968 in New Mexico and West Texas. Many political, business, and even labor leaders in New Mexico were constantly offering geographical, genetic, or cultural explanations for the existence of poverty in San Miguel County as well as in other Spanish-American counties in northern New Mexico.


6. Ferguson, a New Mexican historian, in discussing the harsh impact of the land tax on Spanish-American landholdings says: "Often many owners of a grant are unable to pay taxes on their commonly held grazing lands assessed at perhaps a dollar-and-a-half an acre. The state takes over the land for delinquent taxes and resells the whole grant for thirty five to forty cents an acre. Having influence, the new owner then gets the assessed valuation reduced to fifty cents an acre." Harvey Ferguson, Rio Grande, New York: New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1933, p. 260.

Beck, Warren A.  

Von Eschen, G. F. Von  

Loomis, Charles P., and Olen E. Leonard  

Leonard, Olen E.  
1971 The Role of the Land Grant, Albuquerque: Calvin Horn Publisher, Inc.

Knowlton, Clark S.  

Murphy, Earl F.  

Atencio, Tomas C.  