The purpose of this bibliography is stated as follows: to help those interested in exploring further the views of Ivan Illich and Everett Reimer on schools by presenting information leading to materials which make significant reference to those views. It is divided into three parts: a) a reprint of an article which discusses the influence of Illich and Reimer and comments briefly on the books written about them and their ideas; b) a partial listing of the writings of Illich and Reimer, which are commented on in c) the books and articles listed in the main bibliography. The latter cites 570 different authors writing in 71 books and 351 journals, magazines, and newspapers issued in 30 countries. There are 83 references from the British Isles, 52 in French, 145 in German, and 27 in other languages. (JA)
BIBLIOGRAPHY OF COMMENTS
ON THE ILLICH-REIMER DESCHOOLING
THeses

by John Ohliger

Published by
ERIC Clearinghouse on Teacher Education
Number One Dupont Circle, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20036

Sponsored by: American Association of
Colleges for Teacher Education (fiscal
agent); Association of Teacher Educators,
national affiliate of the National Education
Association; Instruction and Professional
Development, NEA

April 1974

SP 007 833
The material in this publication was prepared pursuant to a contract with the National Institute of Education, U.S. Department of Health, Education and Welfare. Contractors undertaking such projects under government sponsorship are encouraged to express freely their judgment in professional and technical matters. Prior to publication, the manuscript was submitted to the University of Illinois at Chicago Circle, College of Education for critical review and determination of professional competence. This publication has met such standards. Points of view or opinions, however, do not necessarily represent the official view or opinions of either the University of Illinois at Chicago Circle, College of Education or the National Institute of Education.
"Your problem with Illich, Harold, is that you don't understand the goddam revolutionary mind."

Reprinted with permission of cartoonist Mike Elam and Phi Delta Kappan. The cartoon appeared in the September 1972 issue.
# CONTENTS

Foreword .................................................. v
Preface ..................................................... vi
Acknowledgements ........................................ vii
Abstract and ERIC Descriptors ........................ viii

## THE VISIBLE DISSENTERS ................................ 1

BRIEF BIBLIOGRAPHY OF WORKS BY EVERETT REIMER AND IVAN ILLICH ..... 7
  Works by Everett Reimer ................................ 8
  Works by Ivan Illich ..................................... 10
    Through Deschooling Society ........................................ 10
    Following Deschooling Society: School and Education as Paradigm ........ 11
    Following Deschooling Society: Other Institutions as Paradigms .......... 13

BIBLIOGRAPHY OF COMMENTS ON THE ILLICH-REIMER DESCHOOLING THESES .... 15
  Comment in English Language ............................... 17
  Comment in German Language ................................ 44
  Comment in French Language ............................... 51
  Comment in Other Languages ................................ 54

About ERIC ................................................. 57

ERIC Order Blank ......................................... 58
FOREWORD

Analyses of somewhat "far-out" publications are designed to stimulate the total education community to a reading of provocative books. Such reading can be informative in itself and can create a mind-set toward openness, experimentation, and relevancy. In publishing this bibliography, the clearinghouse does not advocate positions taken by authors whose works are cited. Our advocacy is for reading and thinking, for mind stretching to attain the best possible education for American children and youth.

It is appropriate to acknowledge the cooperation and encouragement of the former Clearinghouse on Adult Education, and its director, Stanley Grabowski, who provided some technical assistance.

This clearinghouse plans to publish later a document entitled Analysis of Radical Proposals for American Education. Plans for its content include analyses of several "radical proposals" and interpretations of what implementation would imply for educational personnel development.

You may do further research on this topic by checking issues of Research in Education (RIE) and Current Index to Journals in Education (CIJE). Both RIE and CIJE use the same descriptors (index terms). Documents in RIE are listed in blocks according to the clearinghouse code letters which processed them, beginning with the ERIC Clearinghouse on Career Education (CE) and ending with the ERIC Clearinghouse on the Disadvantaged (UD). The clearinghouse code letters, which are listed at the beginning of RIE, appear opposite the ED number at the beginning of each entry. "SP" (School Personnel) designates documents processed by the ERIC Clearinghouse on Teacher Education.

In addition to using the ERIC Thesaurus, RIE, CIJE, and various ERIC indexes, you will find it helpful to be placed on the mailing list of the ERIC clearinghouses which are likely to abstract and index as well as develop publications pertinent to your needs and interests.

For readers uncertain how to use ERIC capabilities effectively, we recommend the following materials which are available in microfiche and xerographic, or "hard," copy through the ERIC Document Reproduction Service: (a) How To Conduct a Search Through ERIC, ED 036 499, microfiche $.65; hardcopy $3.29; (b) Instructional Materials on Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC). Part Two. Information Sheets on ERIC, ED 043 580, microfiche $.65; hardcopy $3.29. Item "b" is available as a complimentary item, while the supply lasts, from this clearinghouse. The last page of this publication is an "ERIC Order Blank" which gives instructions for ordering materials and can be used for ordering.

--Joel L. Burdin
Director

April 1974
PREFACE

The purpose of this publication is to help those interested in exploring further the views of Ivan Illich and Everett Reimer on schools, by presenting information leading to materials which make significant reference to those views. It is offered in three parts: a) a reprint of an article drawing some conclusions from, and providing a key to many of the more important items in, an earlier draft of this bibliography; b) a partial listing of the writings of Illich and Reimer, upon which the comments in the main bibliography are based.

"The Visible Dissenters," completed in the fall of 1972, appeared in volume 3, number 4 (1972) of Educational Studies, the journal of the American Educational Studies Association. Since its acceptance for publication there have been several developments which should be noted when reading it: a) Illich's book tentatively entitled Retooling Society has been published as Tools for Conviviality; b) the bibliography in hand, noted in "The Visible Dissenters," now contains references to 691 books, articles, papers, book reviews, broadcast scripts, and tapes; c) there are now 83 references to the Illich-Reimer theses from the British Isles, as well as 52 in French, 145 in German, and 27 in other languages; d) all the materials listed as forthcoming have appeared except for Reimer's new work, which he is revising from a first draft, and Bereiter's book Must We Educate?, which is now scheduled for publication in January 1974. The bibliography for "The Visible Dissenters" has been incorporated into this publication.

The brief bibliography of Illich's and Reimer's efforts makes no pretense at completeness. Both men have been so generous and offhand with requests for reprint rights that it is impossible to trace them all. They have also written material on request for so many groups that it would take an immense effort to locate them. The translations of their books and articles continue to proliferate. Moreover, some of their writings on unrelated topics have been deliberately omitted to conserve space. What this section does attempt to accomplish is to make it possible for the reader to discover the direction of the explorations of Illich and Reimer on the subject of schooling and closely related issues. It has been maintained by some, for instance, that Illich has "lost interest" in education. Those maintaining that position should note that in his latest book in English (Tools for Conviviality) there are references to that theme on 51 of the 117 pages of text.

"Comments on the Illich-Reimer Deschooling Theses" now contains viewpoints by 570 different authors writing in 71 books and 351 journals, magazines, or newspapers appearing in 30 countries. But it is far from complete. The resources have just not been available to conduct a thorough search of possible sources, especially foreign ones. Incidentally, note should be made that lack of resources also precluded insertion of diacritical marks, accents, etc. for foreign languages.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Grateful thanks go first to Stanley Grabowski and Valentina Borremans. Grabowski, formerly director of the now-defunct ERIC Clearinghouse on Adult Education, has literally made this publication possible. His service to the field of adult education is far greater than is generally recognized. Borremans, a colleague and collaborator of Illich, has generously and regularly sent clippings of comments from publications as they arrived at the Center for Intercultural Documentation (CIDOC) in Cuernavaca, Mexico.

Others who have been particularly helpful in providing items, suggestions, and leads include Kitty Benedict, Associate Editor, Harper and Row; Marion Boyars, Calder and Boyars Publishers, London; Walter I. Bradbury, Editor, Doubleday and Company; Nils Christie, Professor, Institute of Criminology and Criminal Law, University of Oslo, Norway; Tom Crepeau, Professor, German Department, Ohio Dominican College; Linda Drake, Ohio State University Library; Hermann H. Frese, Professor, University of Leiden, Netherlands; David Gueulette, Columbus, Ohio; Ronald Gross, Great Neck, New York; Hartmut von Hentig, Professor, Bielefeld University, West Germany; Ian Lister, Lecturer in Education, University of York, England; Peter Lund, Lecturer in Education, The Polytechnic, Queensgate, England; Santha Rungachary, Director, Indian Council of Social Science Research, New Delhi; Jacques Vidal, Albi, France; and David C. Williams, Columbus, Ohio.

Standard sources that were consulted for items include the following (the date in parentheses indicates the latest issue or volume searched): Book Review Digest (September 1973); Book Review Index (August 1973); British Humanities Index (June 1973); Canadian Periodical Index (June 1973); Catholic Periodical Index (August 1973); Current Biography (September 1973); Current Index to Journals in Education (September 1973); Education Index (September 1973); Guide to Indian Periodical Literature (March 1973); Guide to Social Science and Religion in Periodical Literature (1972); Index to Book Reviews in the Humanities (1971); Index to Jewish Periodicals (June 1972); Index to Religious Periodical Literature (1972); Public Affairs Information Service Bulletin (25 August 1973); Public Affairs Information Service Foreign Language Index (1972); Philosopher's Index (Summer 1972); Readers' Guide to Periodical Literature (25 September 1973); Research in Education (August 1973--items with an "ED" number are abstracted in this journal); and Social Science and Humanities Index (September 1973).
ABSTRACT

The purpose of this bibliography is stated as follows: to help those interested in exploring further the views of Ivan Illich and Everett Reimer on schools by presenting information leading to materials which make significant reference to those views. It is divided into three parts: a) a reprint of an article which discusses the influence of Illich and Reimer and comments briefly on the books written about them and their ideas; b) a partial listing of the writings of Illich and Reimer, which are commented on in c) the books and articles listed in the main bibliography. The latter cites 570 different authors writing in 71 books and 351 journals, magazines, and newspapers issued in 30 countries. There are 83 references from the British Isles, 52 in French, 145 in German, and 27 in other languages. (JA)

ERIC DESCRIPTORS

To expand a bibliography using ERIC, descriptors or search terms are used. To use a descriptor: (1) Look up the descriptor in the SUBJECT INDEX of monthly, semi-annual, or annual issue of Research in Education (RIE). (2) Beneath the descriptors you will find title(s) of documents. Decide which title(s) you wish to pursue. (3) Note the "ED" number beside the title. (4) Look up the "ED" number in the "DOCUMENT RESUME SECTION" of the appropriate issue of RIE. With the number you will find a summary of the document and often the document's cost in microfiche and/or hardcopy. (5) Repeat the above procedure, if desired, for other issues of RIE and for other descriptors. (6) For information about how to order ERIC documents, turn to the back pages of RIE. (7) Indexes and annotations of journal articles can be found in Current Index to Journals in Education by following the same procedure. Periodical articles cannot be secured through ERIC.

TOPIC: Bibliography of Comments on the Illich-Reimer Deschooling Theses.

DESCRIPTORS TO USE IN CONTINUING SEARCH OF RIE AND CIJE:

- Bibliographies
- *Educational Change
- *Educational Innovation
- School Systems

*Asterisk(s) indicate major descriptors.
THE VISIBLE DISSENTERS

by

John Ohliger

The purpose of this paper is to facilitate the examination of some questions pertaining to the "visibility" or "invisibility" of recent radical educational critics, primarily two of the most recent and controversial ones. Lucas, in "The Invisible Dissenters" (1971) which appeared in this journal, reviewed the writings of Friedenberg, Goodman, Holt, Kohl, Kozol, Postman, et al. and concluded: "Although these so-called neo-progressivists or neo-romantic radicals have been attacking the schools loudly for the better part of a decade, so far there is little to suggest the educational power complex is listening or taking them seriously....The regular Establishment finds its latest detractors literally incomprehensible. They have been ignored, dismissed, and thereby rendered invisible....The new critics deserve a far better fate."

This essay contends that since the appearance of the work of two men, Ivan Illich and Everett Reimer, not mentioned in the Lucas article, educational radicals are no longer ignored or dismissed by "the educational power complex." The books of Illich, Deschooling Society (1971), and Reimer, School is Dead (1971), are similar, though not identical, in content. Illich and Reimer worked together on their schooling views for thirteen years starting in 1958.

The ideas of these men, and of most of those reviewed in the Lucas article, are now being intensely discussed, explored, and debated. Whether their proposals are being put into practice is, of course, a different issue. We are not dealing here with the question of long range influence or effectiveness. But the point is that the radical critics are now being "taken seriously," a necessary first step. Evidence for these conclusions will be drawn, in part, from items in Ohliger's Bibliography of Comments on the Illich-Reimer Deschooling Theses (1973) which contains references to over 500 books, articles, papers, and book reviews.

One viewpoint can be summed up in a statement by Rosen of the Institute of Public Administration in Postman et al., "Illich: Pro and Con" (1972): "More than a decade of work....gave Illich credentials that make it difficult not to take him seriously. Celebrity notwithstanding, his position needs to be dealt with rather than dismissed. This is not to say that Illich always hits the target; he does not. But he is on target or close to it enough to merit respect." The same can be said of Reimer, whose research and writing is supported by the Ford Foundation. The attention paid to the radical criticism of Illich and Reimer focuses also on others of similar mind. At least 60 books and ERIC documents by such critics have appeared since 1970 (when Illich and Reimer began publishing their views extensively), as Poli discovered when working on Alternative Schools: An Annotated Bibliography (1973).

Probably the first indication that the radical viewpoints were becoming visible appeared in an article by Fischer, president of Teachers College, titled "Who Needs Schools?" (1970), where he stated: "The issue whether schools
should be publicly or privately controlled, competitive or monopolistic, is overshadowed, however, by a prior and more basic question: Are they necessary? The radical question must be raised for it deserves a well-considered response."

Fischer wrote in a letter that Illich's article, "Why We Must Abolish Schooling" (1970), was "probably the clearest published statement [of the] extremist critics" he referred to in his article. Later, he expanded his analysis in "Public Education Reconsidered" (1972) in which he said, "Outrageous though the idea seems, deschooling deserves examination." The first book to appear in English, which started the attempt to tie in the Illich-Reimer theses with those of some of the "neo-romantics" mentioned in the Lucas essay, was a compilation of previously published articles by others edited by Gotz called No Schools (1971). Next, the eminently respectable National Society for the Study of Education commissioned Farewell to Schools? (1971) edited by Levine and Havighurst. The editors combined excerpts from the writings of Illich, Reimer, Bereiter, and Goodman with original responses to them by other educators.

Many of the standard educational journals have now published materials with substantial reference to the Illich-Reimer views. These include The American School Board Journal, The Journal of Higher Education, Change, The International Review of Education, Comparative Education Review, Educational Studies, Education U.S.A., and Teachers College Record. The Phi Delta Kappan has carried at least six such items, one of the most recent being a "Guest Editorial" by Snyder, a professor of educational foundations, titled "What is Ivan Illich Talking About?" (1972). Of the two pieces in The Harvard Educational Review, the latest is a lengthy article by Gintis called "Towards a Political Economy of Education: A Radical Critique of Ivan Illich's Deschooling Society" (1972). In the magazine School Management, Beckler wrote "Illich's Attack on Formal Schooling Echoes in Congress" (1971), in which he noted that Senator Mark O. Hatfield had inserted a Saturday Review article by Illich summarizing his views into the Congressional Record. Beckler concluded: "In almost any town, newspapers, TV panel shows and street corner conversations feature similar themes as the blows fall faster and heavier on the country's education system." A special 96 page issue of the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education journal Interchange was devoted to a presentation of Reimer's views of "Alternatives in Education" (1971), along with comments on them by professors of education and educational bureaucrats from the United States, Canada, and Ghana. A worthwhile feature of this special issue is that Reimer was provided an opportunity to reply at length to those commenting on his views.

Illich and Reimer have consistently maintained that schooling is a worldwide phenomenon which is basically the same in all countries. The attention their writings have received in other countries adds evidence to their contention. Reimer's book was published in England simultaneously with its American debut. Additional foreign publication has now been
arranged in French, German, Italian, Danish, Dutch, Spanish, and Kanada (an Indian language). Illich's book has already appeared, or is about to come out, in England, France, Germany, Italy, Japan, and Denmark. In the above mentioned Bibliography (Ohliger, 1973), there are 48 references to the Illich-Reimer theses from the British Isles, as well as 35 in French and 90 in German. The large number of items in German is partly accounted for by reviews of a book on their positions which was published in Germany before either of their books came out in the United States. This is Hentig's Cuernavaca oder: Alternativen zur Schule? (1971). Another book on the same topic has just come out in Germany: Luning's Schadet die Schule unsere Kinder (1972). Illich feels that one of the best books on the topic is one which has just gone into its third printing in Norway. Christje, a Norwegian sociologist, has written Hvis Skolen Ikke Fantea (If the Schools Did Not Exist, 1971). Illich and Reimer have made speeches, attended conferences, and met with educational leaders at their request, in many countries on all the continents. Illich has addressed national conventions of the American Association for Higher Education and the American Educational Research Association in this country and similar groups in other countries.

Though some observers believe the views of Reimer and Illich have drawn even greater attention in Europe than in the United States, Riesman in "The Academic Depression" (1972) notes that young officials from ministries of education in Germany, Sweden, and the Netherlands who came to the U.S. "looking to American mass education as a model [instead] find a blast of cynicism about what good education does, a growing interest in Ivan Illich's concept of 'deschooling', much as if a rich man should tell a poor man, 'Why do you want my ulcers?''

Despite the belief of Reimer and Illich that their tentative proposals for a series of networks to replace schools would only be meaningful in a society that does not yet exist, many people throughout this country are attempting to create "learning exchanges" or "free learning projects." Detzel, who is the subject of an article on his setting up of a successful exchange in the Chicago area (see Roper's "Three Ways to Get Something Done," 1972), reports that these networks have been established in at least 131 U.S. communities. The most obvious published example of attempts to facilitate the "free learning projects" is a book edited by Wurman called Yellow Pages of Learning Resources (1972). The title and approach are based on terms and suggestions from Reimer.

At least seven books on education published in 1971 or 1972 have made positive incidental references to statements by Reimer or Illich, perhaps because of their ability to pinpoint a concept in a sharp, quotable phrase or sentence. A good example is Inequality (1972) by Jencks et al. Those authors believe that Illich's perception that "many people view schools as secular churches...helps explain why schools are so often disagreeable: one cannot abolish original sin through self-indulgence. It also helps
explain why educators' claims for the schools are so often extravagant: a religion which promises anything less than salvation wins few converts."

There is even the possibility that "deschooling," the term Illich coined, is passing into the common language. Establishment speakers now seem to be taking the term as a point of departure without specific reference to Illich or Reimer. For instance, see Drucker's article "School Around the Bend" (1972) in which he begins, without reference to Illich, "People even talk of deschooling America, and foresee a future in which there will be no school at all. This is not going to happen." Also a San Francisco publisher has brought out three "Deschool Primers", one of which is Jones's Your City Has Been Kidnapped (1972).

Not all or even most of the attention paid to their theses by the educators-in-power has been positive. Reimer and especially Illich have been called many names, including: wild, mad, a fraud, a devil, manipulative, medieval thinker, impractical dreamer, vicious, dangerous, naive, and "proponent of last year's radical chic." A vitriolic attack came from Hook, the prominent Establishmentarian, in "Illich's Deschooled Utopia" (1972). Hook is disturbed that "Illich's views seem to have won the endorsement of some officials of educational institutes who purvey advice for liberal fees to the school systems of the nation." Hook himself dismisses Illich's approach as "absurd extremism" and characterizes him as one of those "contemporary reactionaries of the new Left."

The intensity of the reaction to the Illich-Reimer proposals has stimulated interest in their personal backgrounds. Gray devoted about one-third of her book Divine Disobedience (1970) to a biography of Illich. Ohliger and McCarthy in Lifelong Learning or Lifelong Schooling? (1971) give references to many other items with biographical data; and Ohliger's paper The Xenophile and the Disenchanted Bureaucrat (1972) contains some otherwise unpublished material on Reimer's life.

There are a number of books now in various stages of completion which will, to a significant extent, deal with, build on, or criticize the Illich-Reimer views. These include: Bereiter's Must We Educate? (1973) Educational Reconstruction:Promise and Challenge (1973) edited by Shimahara, an anthology of 18 authors' original papers with those by Brameld, Greene, and Shimahara including comments on deschooling; a Harper and Row book to be published in conjunction with the journal Social Policy, which will include the critiques of the Illich theses by Postman, Gross, Fairfield, Rosen, Jerome, Greene, and Pearl as originally published in "Illich: Pro and Con" (1972); and Pratte's The Public School Movement: A Critical Study (1973).

Since the publication of their two books in 1971, Illich and Reimer have both moved on to broader views, not only of the implications of their theses about schools (e.g., Illich's self-critical "The Alternative to Schooling" [1971] and his prophetic "After Deschooling, What?" [1971]), but
of the implications of their own value positions for all of social life. Illich is at work on a book dealing with his concept of "upper limits" tentatively titled Retooling Society (1973), some flavor of which can be gleaned from "Education: A Consumer Commodity and a Pseudo-Religion" (1971). Reimer is now writing a book presenting a proposal for what he calls "a realistic utopia" with a discussion of the means for getting there.

Why have Reimer and Illich succeeded where others may have failed in drawing broad attention to their radical views? It may be that most of the others wrote in anecdotal or segmental modes as opposed to theoretical ones. It may be that they are simply riding the crest of the wave of the "crisis in schooling." Lucas wrote in his essay: "It has become painfully obvious that today's more militant educational critics are unwilling to settle for institutional melioration; nothing less than the complete scrapping of the whole structural edifice--from kindergarten to graduate school--will suffice." But it appears that Illich and Reimer were the first to argue for "the complete scrapping of the whole structural edifice" within a broad socio-political theoretical framework and in very systematic, attention-getting, provocative, and prophetic ways. Their approach seems the most important reason why their theses have drawn great attention.

The work of Illich and Reimer has helped to get the concern of the educational Establishment focused on radical criticism, but in doing so the major goal of their approach may well be missed. These men along with their colleague and friend, Paulo Freire (author of Pedagogy of the Oppressed [1970]), who is not a deschooler), are calling for a humanistic revolution, which along with other sweeping changes would remove from power the present educational Establishment itself. Put in other terms, they are opting for new avenues of political and cultural action which should result in a completely different range of meanings for the very concept of learning.

Illich, Freire, and Reimer's own work, published and in progress; Holt's new book Freedom and Beyond (1972), much of which is devoted to a defense of deschooling; Spring's Education and the Rise of the Corporate State (1972) with a foreword by Illich; and Marin's recent article "The Free School Non-Movement" (1972) raise a host of basic questions. Such issues simply cannot be dealt with through a view that sees the educational power complex as yielding to a new well-worked-out set of alternatives within the present economic-political-social structure. They can only be dealt with through an overarching revolutionary viewpoint.
BRIEF BIBLIOGRAPHY OF WORKS BY EVERETT REIMER AND IVAN ILLICH

prepared with

David Gueuletto

Papers arising mainly from Reimer's work with the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico and the United States State Department Alliance for Progress. From the introduction: "Education, in the broad sense of human development, is a unifying theme of all the papers. In the later ones the role of the school, as the central educational institution of the society, comes to the fore."

---


"La Educacion Descarriada II." Gallo [San Juan], 1, no. 2 (October 1969): 17-22. Reprinted as CIDOC Documenta 69/198.


Lectures delivered to Yale University Divinity School, 16-18 February 1970. Basis for three articles in New York Review of Books (See below).


Interchange article and Reimer's response to other comments on it abstracted as EJ 040 587 and EJ 040 594. For these comments see Bereiter, Blege, Foster, Livingstone, Pitman, and St. John entries in bibliography of comments below.

"The Impact of Educational Accounts on Junior Colleges."
Junior College Research Review, 6, no. 1 (September 1971), 4 pp. ED 052 772.


to John Ohliger. 9 February 1972. 6pp.

Formed much of the basis for paper by Ohliger "The Xenophile and the Disenchanted Bureaucrat" (See bibliography of comments below).


WORKS BY IVAN ILLICH

Through Deschooling Society

Illich, Ivan. "Graduation Address to the Senior Class of the Agriculture and Mechanical Arts High School, Mayaguez, Puerto Rico." Horizons [Ponce, Puerto Rico], October 1959, pp. 58-64.


"The Futility of Schooling in Latin America." Saturday Review, 20 April 1968, pp. 57-59. Reprinted in Celebration of Awareness (See below); as "Impotencia de la Escuela en America Latina," Letras de Panama, February
Eight essays, most of which appear in similar form elsewhere, gathered for the Spring 1971 CIDOC seminar, "Alternatives in Education."


Following Deschooling Society: School and Education as Paradigm


The Breakdown of Schools. CIDOC Cuaderno no. 1016. Cuernavaca, Mex.: CIDOC, 1971. 148 pp. Reprints of this article with original title: New World Outlook, October 1971, pp. 32-37; Interchange [Canada], 2, no. 4 (1971): 1-10, EJ 057 344; Revista de Ciencias de la Educacion [Argentina], April 1972, pp. 3-16; Journal of Research and Development in Education, Spring 1972, EJ 060 044; Philippine Studies [Manila], 20, no. 3 (1972); and Journal of Social

This book mainly contains the original articles that were revised for publication as Deschooling Society. It also marks the first publication of "The Breakdown of Schools: A Problem or a Symptom?"


Following *Deschooling Society*: Other Institutions as Paradigms

Illich, Ivan, and Valentina Borremans. "La necesidad de un techo comun; el control social de la tecnologia." *CIDOC Documenta* I/V 71/4, September 1971, pp. 4/1-4/3.


BIBLIOGRAPHY OF COMMENTS ON THE ILLICH-REIMER DESCHOOLING THESES
KEY TO ABBREVIATIONS

(B) - From list of reviews sent by Marion Boyars of Calder and Boyars, London, Illich's British publishers.

(C) - Review of Hentig's Cuernavaca--oder: Alternativen zur Schule? as sent in a list prepared by Professor Hentig's associates.

(CA) - Review of, or extended comment on, Illich's Celebration of Awareness, with reference to schooling.

(CI) - Same as (C) but includes a review of Illich, according to the list prepared by Professor Hentig's associates.

(DS) - Review of, or extended comment on, Illich's Deschooling Society.

(FB) - Review of Holt's Freedom and Beyond with reference to deschooling.

(O) - Unspecified, general, or variously referenced comments on deschooling, related concepts, or activities.

(SID) - Review of, or extended comment on, Reimer's School Is Dead or earlier drafts of book.

(TC) - Review of, or reference to, Illich's Tools for Conviviality or early drafts of book, with comments on deschooling.
COMMENT IN ENGLISH LANGUAGE


Includes a three-page summary of a discussion following a talk by Illich.


Brief references.


Brief references on p. 356.


Includes question period after talk by Illich.


Brief references.


Brief references.


"Beyond 'Deschooling'." _Manas_, 30 June 1971, p. 4.


Blin, Michael L. _Young Children_, December 1971, pp. 120 & 122.


Parallel translation in English and German.

Carbonaro, August. August 1971.


Brief reference.


Burdin, Joel. Review of *Farewell to Schools,* *Phi Delta Kappan,* May 1972, pp. 593-94.

Chapter on *The Deschooling of Society.*


Calkins, Judson W. "Different Slant on Development." St. Louis Post Dispatch, 10 February 1970, pp. 1C & 7C.

Cantor, Elliot. "Ex-Priest Says Our School System is Lousy--Wants to Abolish It Entirely." National Chronicle Star [New York City], n.d.

Capaldi, G. Clergy Review, April 1973, p. 316.


Brief references.


Catansveldt Roodrunner, no. 30 (n.d.).


Excerpt from a center conference, which included Illich and Reimer, held 19-20 November 1970.


Brief references.


Brief references.


Cultural Information Service, August 1971, pp. 16-17.


Cultural Information Service, August 1971, pp. 16-17.


Review of five books by Catholics.


Cultural Information Service, August 1971, pp. 16-17.


Deedy, John. The Critic, September-October 1971, p. 84.


"Deschooling Society." Times of India [Delhi], 24 November 1972.


Dietrich, Jeff. Catholic Agitator, June-July 1971, p.5.


---


---

Brief reference in a story about Mortimer Smith.

---


---

Brief reference.

---


---


---


---


"The Four 'Networks'." Manas, 10 November 1971, p. 5.


On the second day, Freire responded to questions on his views of deschooling.

Frese, Hermann H. "Permanent Education--Dream or Nightmare." Education and Culture [Council of Europe], no. 19 (Summer 1972), pp. 9-13.


Part of a review of a book by a different author.


"Custom-made book of readings prepared for the courses taught by the editor."


Brief references.


Many references, including bibliographic.


Brief references.


_________. In *Saturday Review,* 16 October 1971, pp. 88-89. Reprinted in *After Deschooling, What?*, edited by Alan Gartner and others (See above).


--. In Life, 23 April 1971.

Brief reference.


Compares Illich and Brameld.


Haddon, P. "Ivan Illich, Or One Foot in the Future." Month [London], April 1973, pp. 143-46.


"Health is Not a Commodity." Manas, 26 April 1972, pp. 6-8.

Hentoff, Nat. In Saturday Review, 8 July 1972, pp. 64-65.

Hibernia, 19 November 1971.


"Learning and the Role of Schools." Current, April 1972, pp. 30-37.


Hunt, Peter. "Change--Superficial or Profound?" The Lethbridge Herald [Alberta], 30 June 1971, p. 5.


"Idolatry of Institutions." Manas, 8 September 1971, p. 4.


Jenkins, Paul, and others. "Does the Church-Related College Have a Right to Exist?" Colloquium, February 1971 and March 1971.


Brief reference.


"Road to School." Times Higher Education Supplement [London], 22 December 1972.


"Towards a Pedagogy of the Oppressed." Times Higher Education Supplement [London], 13 July 1973. Draft text, which contains much more material, may be available from York University, Department of Education Documentation Service.


Will include pieces (some new) by Hentig, Huberman, Lister, Ohliger, Storm, and Zimmer, plus a quotational bibliography.


Lonsday, Francis A. College and University Bulletin [AAHE], 1 February 1972, p. 2.


Several references and comments.


Brief comment.


"The School at the Service of the Status Quo." *Educacion Popular* [Bolivia], 2, no. 6 (1971).


Murray, James G. "Meet Mr. Inside and Mr. Outside of Education Reform." The Long Island Catholic, 1 July 1971.


The Observer, 11 July 1971.


Phenix, P.H. In Theological Studies, December 1971, pp. 706-10.


"Plan for 'Liberal Education'." Manas, 28 April 1971, p. 4.


Publisher's Weekly, 12 February 1973, p. 62.


37


"CIDOC Revisited." *ORBIT* 13 [Ontario Institute for Studies in Education], 3, no. 3 (June 1972). Also in *People's Crap Detector* (See above).


Scratch, Walter L. In Evening Outlook, 10 July 1971.


She Magazine, March 1972.


Brief references.


"Should Schools Be Abolished?" Time, 7 June 1971, pp. 33-35.


Brief reference.


Smith Trade News, 4 December 1971.


(CA-B) The Tablet, 14 August 1971.

(DS) "Taking the School Out of Learning." Instructor, August/September 1971.

(CA-B) The Teacher, 22 October 1971.

(O) "Teaching Without 'Schooling'." Manas, 3 February 1971, p. 5.


Brief reference.

(O) "We Become What We Hate." New York Times, 25 July 1971, p. 11.

(CA-B) Times [London], 1 July 1971.

(CA-B) Times [London], 21 August 1971.

(DS-B) Times [London], 21 October 1971.


(O) "Too Much Schooling?" Time, 19 June 1972, p. 44.


(DS-B) Tribune, 27 December 1971.


Weiss, H. In St. Anthony Messenger, February 1971, p. 54.


Whitney, George, David Gueulette, and John Ohliger. "Ivan Illich--Saint or Devil?" Program at First Unitarian Church, Columbus, Ohio, 30 April 1972. 10 pp.


COMMENT IN GERMAN LANGUAGE


(DS) Ader, A. "Wird die Schule zur Religion der Moderne?" Rheinischer Merkur [Cologne], 1 September 1972.


(C) ______. "Zorn and Freude." Rheinische Post [Dusseldorf], no. 48 (26 February 1972).

(C) Alternatief-Extra [Vilvoorde, Belgium], no. 1 (1972).

(C) Amtlicher Schulanzeiger für den Regierungsbezirk Niederbayern, no. 4 (1972), pp. 108-09.

(DS) Amtlichen Schulanzeiger für den Regierungsbezirk Niederbayern [Landshut], no. 6 (1972), p. 179.


(C) Aula, no. 6 (December 1971).

(C) Baacke, D. "Alternative zur Schule?" Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung, no. 293 (18 December 1971).

(C) ______. "Welche Alternativen hat die Schule?" Merkur, no. 3 (1972).


(C) Bayerische Schule [Munich], 17 December 1971.

(DS) Bayerische Schule [Munich], no. 9 (19 May 1972), p. 194.

(C) Becker, H. "Konnen wir die Schule abschaffen?" Publik [Frankfurt], 15 October 1971.

Berg, M. In Hamburger Lehrerzeitung, 22 April 1972.


Die Berufsbildende Schule, no. 3 (1972).

Die Berufsbildende Schule, nos. 7/8 (21 August 1972).


"Bildung ohne Schulen." Einezwanzgi, Stafa [Informationen fur die Zurcher Jugend], no. 16 (September 1972).

Binder, G. "Skeptische besorgt engagiert." Der Enztaler [Sudwest-Presse], n.d.


Deifler, Hans Herbert. "Entschulung--ein Reform--oder Revolutionsprogramm?" Herder-Korrespondenz [Freiburg], no. 4 (April 1972), pp. 201-03.

Deutsche Tagespost [Wurzburg], no. 6 (15 January 1972).

Deutschlandfunk [Cologne]. Radio script. 10 June 1972, 3 pp.


Education Permanente [Zurich], no. 3 (1972), p. 24.


Elemente [Oberlahr], no. 1 (1972).

Elemente [Koln], no. 3 (1972).


Entwichten und Zusammenarbeit, no. 4 (1972).

Erziehungswissenschaft und Beruf [Rinteln], 2nd qtr. no. 2 (1972), pp. 210-14.

Fach Religion [Salzkotten], no. 1 (1972).


Fahringer, Karl. "Non vitae sed scholae discimus." Neue Wege [Vienna], May 1972, p. 33.


Fragen der Freiheit [Mainz], no. 95 (May 1972).


Fuldaer Zeitung, 9 December 1971.


Gesamt Schule [Berlin], no. 1 (1972).

Gesamtschule [Braunschweig], no. 3 (1972), p. 38.


H. M. In Das Baugerust [Nuremberg], no. 3 (1972), p. 230.

Haffner, G. In Welt und Wort, 2 February 1972.


Hartmann, H. "Die Padagogik der Zukunft--Rettung oder Gefahrdunf." Die Tat [Zurich], 29 April 1972.

Heerwagen, F. In Wirtschaft und Wissenschaft [Essen], no. 5 (1971).


Hochschul-Zeitung [Zurich], no. 21 (31 May 1972).

Hoffmann, W. In Unsere Jugend, no. 5 (1972).

Jugend, Beruf, Gesellschaft [Bonn], 1 February 1972.

Juso Informationen [Regensburg], 11 May 1972.


Katholisches Sonntagsblatt [Stuttgart], no. 3 (23 July 1972).

Kuhn, H. In *Kultus und Unterricht* [Villingen], no. 2 (1972).


Kurzreiter, Josef. In *Osterreichische Padagogische Worte* [Vienna], nos. 5/6 (May/June 1972).

L. K. "Alternativan zur Schule?" *Orientierung* [Zurich], no. 3 (1972), p. 38.

Langeveld, M. J. In *Schweizer Schule* [Zug], no. 6 (1972).


Linke, K. "Entschulung der Gesellschaft." *Stimme* [Frankfurt], no. 24 (15 December 1971).


M. P. In *Studentenbrief des Hochschulringes in der Katholischen Erziehergemeinschaft* [Munich], no. 4 (1972).

Mark, K. "Cuernavaca." *Die Lupe* [Illingen], no. 3 (1972).


A collection of lectures broadcast over Suddeutscher Rundfunk Stuttgart.


*Luzerner Neueste Nachrichten*, no. 221 (22 September 1972).

M. P. In *Studentenbrief des Hochschulringes in der Katholischen Erziehergemeinschaft* [Munich], no. 4 (1972).

Mark, K. "Cuernavaca." *Die Lupe* [Illingen], no. 3 (1972).


Merker, F. *Neue Deutsche Schule* [Essen], no. 5 (1972).


Mittellungsblatt fur die Gewerkschaftliche Kultur und Bildungsarbeit [Dusseldorf], no. 4 (1972), pp. 39-41.

Muller, C. In Badener Tageblatt, 24 June 1972.

Murtfeld, R. In Wissenschaftlicher Literaturanzeiger, no. 6 (1971).

Das neue Buch [Mörz], no. 6 (October 1972), pp. 120-21.


Padagogik heute [Oberursel], no. 4 (1971).

Pauke [Offenbach], April 1972.


"Pladoyers fur die Abschaffung von Schulen (II)." Werkhefte, no. 12 (1971).

Pohlmann, E. "Kritische Fragen and die Schule." Radius [Stuttgart], no. 2 (1972).

"Priester, Prophet und Revolutionar." Die Stimme [Tel Aviv], November 1972, p. 7.

Raber, E. Neue Westfalische [Bielefeld], 27 November 1971.


Rendtel, F. In Bremer Lehrerzeitung, no. 12 (1971).

Rheinpfalzische Schulblatter [Speyer], no. 4 (5 April 1972).
Rhein-Zeitung [Koblenz], 29 March 1972.
Sauberzweig, Dieter. "Abschaffung der Schule?" Der Stadtetag, no. 6 (1972).
Die Scholle [Ansbach], no. 9 (1972).
Das Schulblatt [Aachen], no. 12 (1971).
Schwarz auf weiss [Dortmund], no. 2 (1972).
Singer, Manfred. In Blatter fur Lehrerfortbildung "Das Seminar" [Munich], November 1972.
Solle, C. In Buchanzeiger fur offentliche Buchereien, no. 286 (1971).
Solle, C. "Hartmut von Hentigs entschulte Schule." Buch und Bibliothek, no. 11 (December 1971).
Stern [Hamburg], 19 March 1972.
Straubert, D. "Lernen ohne Schule als befreites Lernen." Abendzeitung [Munich], n.d.
Ulshoefer, Helgard. In Der Evangelische Buchberater [Gottingen], no. 3 (1972).
Unabhangige Kronen Zeitung [Vienna], 6 August 1972, p. 38.
(DS) V. B. Schweizer Schule [Zug], no. 6 (15 March 1972).

(C) "Verzweiflung an Reformen." Die Drei [Stuttgart], no. 2 (1972).

(O) Verhundigung und Forschung [Munich], no. 2 (1971), p. 3.

(DS) W. N. In Belag aus "Das neue Buch" [Rom], 17 June 1972.

(DS-C) W. W. P. In Gegenwartskunde, March 1972, pp. 343-44.


COMMENT IN FRENCH LANGUAGE


(O) "Dossier de la Pedagogie 2: Mort de l'ecole?" Politique Hebdo, 16 March 1972, pp. 15-18.


(O) Bosquet, M. "L'Ecole pour quoi faire?" Le nouvel Observateur, 16-22 October 1972.


"Faut-il bruler l'ecole?" La Nouvelle Critique, January 1972.

Florenne, Yves. In Le Monde Diplomatique, January 1972, p. 11.

Formes Nouvelles [Luxemburg], no. 2 (1972).


Garrigou-Lagrange, M. "Une societe sans ecole. La statue de la deesse-ecole a des pieds d'argile..." Hebdo-TC, 2 December 1971.


Gloton, R. "Faut-il detruire l'Ecole?" Intereducation, June 1972.


"Ivan Illich et son stimulant message 'epimetheen'." Cooperation Canada [Agence canadienne de development international], July/August 1972, pp. 3-13. Text in French and English.


Piveteau, Didier J. "Reapprendre a dire non: L'ennemi des ecotes n'est pas Illich, c'est le systeme scolaire." Extrait de Orientations [Paris], no. 45 (1972), pp. 5-24.


"Pour une ecole sauvage?" Ecole de Mai, nos. 2/3 (Summer 1972).

Brief references.


(0) Temoignage Chretien, December 1971.


Contains 13 commentaries on Illich's "Dejouer les menées des 'développes'." Illich's article and the commentaries also appear in the German edition of IDOC International, 1 April 1970.


COMMENT IN OTHER LANGUAGES


"Illich says man should learn until he dies." Politika [Belgrade, weekly ed.], 15 October 1972.


Full-page review article.


Ons Equipe [Luxembourg], no. 4 (1971-72).

P. B. Orientamenti Pedagogici [Rome], no. 3 (1972), p. 797.


Script of program reviewing Yugoslavian publication of Deschooling-Society.
An interview with Illich.

"School in the 21st Century: to be or not to be." Literaturnaja Gazeta [Moscow], no. 8 (21 February 1973).
Several articles deal with the deschooling thesis and criticize it severely.


Four short articles.

Strometre [Argentina], 1972, p. 602.

Suarez, Luis. Siempre [Mexico City], 28 April 1971, pp. 32 & 34.
ABOUT ERIC

The Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC) forms a nationwide information system established by the U.S. Office of Education, designed to serve and advance American education. Its basic objective is to provide ideas and information on significant current documents (e.g., research reports, articles, theoretical papers, program descriptions, published and unpublished conference papers, newsletters, and curriculum guides or studies) and to publicize the availability of such documents. Central ERIC is the term given to the function of the U.S. Office of Education, which provides policy, coordination, training funds, and general services to the clearinghouses in the information system. Each clearinghouse focuses its activities on a separate subject-matter area; acquires, evaluates, abstracts, and indexes documents; processes many significant documents into the ERIC system; and publicizes available ideas and information to the education community through its own publications, those of Central ERIC, and other educational media.

TEACHER EDUCATION AND ERIC

The ERIC Clearinghouse on Teacher Education, established June 20, 1968, is sponsored by three professional groups--the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education (fiscal agent); the Association of Teacher Educators, a national affiliate of the National Education Association; and Instruction and Professional Development, National Education Association. It is located at One Dupont Circle, Washington, D.C. 20036.

SCOPE OF CLEARINGHOUSE ACTIVITIES

Users of this guide are encouraged to send to the ERIC Clearinghouse on Teacher Education documents related to its scope, a statement of which follows:

The Clearinghouse is responsible for research reports, curriculum descriptions, theoretical papers, addresses, and other materials relative to the preparation of school personnel (nursery, elementary, secondary, and supporting school personnel); the preparation and development of teacher educators; the profession of teaching; and the fields of health, physical education, and recreation. The scope includes the preparation and continuing development of all instructional personnel, their functions and roles. While the major interest of the Clearinghouse is professional preparation and practice in America, it also is interested in international aspects of the field.

The scope also guides the Clearinghouse's Advisory and Policy Council and staff in decision making relative to the commissioning of monographs, bibliographies, and directories. The scope is a flexible guide in the idea and information needs of those concerned with pre- and in-service preparation of school personnel and the profession of teaching.