The objective of this study was to investigate the resources, needs, constraints, and tentative solutions that relate to staffing present and future school library systems in Ohio with trained personnel. Specifically, the study included: 1) a review and discussion of relevant school library personnel and staffing standards; 2) a summary of available information regarding tasks performed in the library; 3) the presentation and discussion of statistical data on school library manpower resources and needs; 4) a discussion of potential constraints involved in staffing school libraries; and 5) some proposed approaches on tentative solutions for meeting school needs for trained library personnel. Information and statistical data on various facets of school library manpower problems were presented and discussed. (Author)
LIBRARY MANPOWER

PREPARED FOR THE

OHIO DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

BY

BATTELLE MEMORIAL INSTITUTE
COLUMBUS LABORATORIES
CONDENSED TASK REPORT

on

STUDY OF OHIO PUBLIC SCHOOL LIBRARY MANPOWER

to

OHIO DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION

November, 1968

by

George Rosinger

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL NATIONAL INSTITUTE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY.

BATTLE MEMORIAL INSTITUTE
Columbus Laboratories
505 King Avenue
Columbus, Ohio 43201
FOREWORD

This report is the result of editing and reducing one of a series of Task Reports prepared by the staff of Battelle Memorial Institute, Columbus Laboratories, for the Ohio Department of Education under a contract research project entitled PLANNING TO MEET EDUCATIONAL NEEDS IN OHIO SCHOOLS. Funds for the project were made available under a Title III, ESEA grant from the U.S. Office of Education to the Ohio Department of Education.

This condensed version of a Battelle Task Report was prepared to present the essentials of Battelle’s findings as briefly as possible without loss of content or continuity in order to facilitate dissemination of the research findings to a wider audience.

Battelle has assessed educational needs in vocational education and technical training, school facilities, paraprofessionals and supportive assistants, data processing, educational technology, library services, and pupil transportation, each of these being the subject of a research Task.

Eight reports were prepared by Battelle as a result of these studies: seven Task Reports and one Summary Report. The Task Reports represent research studies aimed at the seven subjects mentioned above. The recommendations and conclusions stated in the Task Reports do not reflect full consideration of the educational system as a whole. The Summary Report considers the Task Reports collectively and seeks to relate the results of the Task studies to the educational system as a whole.

The reader is thereby offered two views, one of a specialized nature through a Task Report and one of an integrative nature through the Summary Report. The two views will have much in common, but will occasionally reflect differences arising out of the different context in which the studies were viewed. Accordingly, the reader may wish to study both the Summary Report and the related Task Report on a given subject.

This report is a Condensed Task Report. It carries the essential impact of the Task Report from which it was taken.

Dissemination of the material contained herein is the responsibility of the Ohio Department of Education. Requests for copies with designation of the report(s) desired, may be directed to Dr. Russell A. Working, Division of Research, Planning and Development, 71 East State Street, Room 205, Columbus, Ohio 43215.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIBRARY MANPOWER STANDARDS</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Library Association Standards</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The North-Central Association of Colleges and Secondary Schools Standards</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The State Board of Education Standards</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion and Implications of Standards</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIBRARY MANPOWER RESOURCES, NEEDS, AND CONSTRAINTS</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of Certificated Librarians</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School and Student-to-Librarian Ratios</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Librarian Degree Status</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Librarian Salaries</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Estimated Number of Library Assistants</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library Trainees in Ohio Colleges</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A Summation of the Library Manpower Situation</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TENTATIVE MANPOWER SOLUTIONS</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tentative Solutions for Staffing School Libraries With Trained Personnel</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study Findings</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tentative Manpower Solutions</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
STUDY OF OHIO PUBLIC SCHOOL
LIBRARY MANPOWER

INTRODUCTION

The general requirement for provision of library facilities and services in Ohio public schools has been documented in standards formulated and prescribed by the State Board of Education. The basic intent of the standards are to provide "efficient and effective instructional materials and equipment, including library facilities ..." (State Board of Education, 1966). While the State Standards for the junior and senior high schools require central libraries and librarians, the standards for elementary schools permit classroom libraries where facilities for a central library cannot be provided (Ohio Elementary School Standards, 1957, revised 1967; Junior High School Standards, 1968; High School Standards, 1957, revised 1968). It should be added, however, that the Elementary School Standards do indicate that a central library and librarian service (at least part-time) is desirable in the larger elementary schools.

An objective currently under consideration by the State Department of Education is that of establishing libraries staffed with trained personnel in all public schools throughout the State — including the elementary school. Further, the State Plan for Title II of the Elementary and Secondary Education Act of 1965 indicates:

The highest priority need of the State is that of developing elementary school libraries to comply with minimum standards prescribed by the State Board of Education, and to meet the needs of all elementary school children of the State.

On the assumption that such objectives or priorities are to be implemented, the need for more trained personnel in school libraries — particularly in the elementary schools — will increase substantially. In view of the apparent general shortage of trained library manpower, meeting school needs for these personnel will pose a practical problem. It is this problem area that is of central interest in this study. More specifically, the purpose of this study is the investigation of the needs, resources, constraints, and tentative solutions that relate to staffing present and future school library systems in Ohio with trained personnel.

The general approach pursued in conducting the study is outlined below:

- A review of the available literature on library manpower both at the State (Ohio) and national level
- A review of both State and national (American Library Association) standards relevant to school library manpower
- A review and summary of tasks generally performed in the library
- Interviews with experienced school library personnel
- A review and compilation of statistical data regarding school librarians, e.g., number, broken down by school level and enrollment, degree status, salary, etc.

- The use of a questionnaire to obtain data on the numbers of librarians and library technical aides presently being trained in Ohio universities and community (junior) colleges.

- A conference attended by cognizant professional librarians, at which the feasibility and merits of some possible approaches for staffing schools (particularly elementary) with trained personnel was discussed.

- The utilization and integration of the obtained information as the basis for arriving at possible approaches, or "tentative solutions" for staffing school libraries.

The sections of the report that follow discuss and present data on various facets of the school library manpower problem. Specifically, this study cites and discusses school library personnel standards, presents and discusses statistical data on school library manpower resources and needs, as well as some of the potential constraints involved in staffing school libraries, suggests some approaches or tentative solutions for meeting school needs for trained library personnel and, finally, summarizes the study and its general findings.

**Library Manpower Standards**

Library standards not only have considerable influence on school library development, they also have a direct bearing on library manpower. As such, this section of the report summarizes relevant standards and discusses their implications for the study. The standards are cited not as a basis for setting objectives or goals, but rather for providing a guide against which needs and recommendations can be reflected. Much of the material presented below is based on a recent report by R. L. Darling, entitled, "Survey of School Library Standards" (Darling, 1964).

Although library standards generally relate to all facets of library service, only those requirements that relate directly or indirectly to manpower will be discussed here. In general, these are requirements that relate to (1) the provision of libraries, (2) the number and type of personnel staffing the library, and (3) the education and training of library personnel. The three major organizations that prepare relevant library standards are (1) the American Library Association (which prepares standards at the national level), (2) The North-Central Association of Colleges and Secondary Schools**, and (3) the State Board of Education of Ohio. The highlights of the standards set by each of these three organizations are cited and briefly discussed below.

---

*Library tasks were discussed in the original Task Report.

**One of five accrediting associations that has prepared school library standards as a partial basis for school program evaluation.
American Library Association Standards

Of the three organizations indicated above, the American Library Association (ALA), through its Division, The American Association of School Librarians, has set the most stringent standards relating to the school library. In general, ALA standards and recommendations make no distinctions among school levels. The requirements are basically the same for both the elementary and secondary schools. A library for essentially all schools is recommended:

All schools having 200 or more students need well-organized school libraries with functional programs of service directed by qualified personnel. Other provisions must be made for those smaller schools that cannot afford a library, so that the thousands of students in these schools are not deprived of a wide range of printed and audio-visual materials and library services (American Library Association, 1960).

With regard to the size of the school library staff, the ALA has set the following standards:

- For the first 900 students or fraction thereof: One librarian for each 300 students or major fraction thereof if the head librarian has no administrative responsibility for audiovisual materials. If the head librarian has partial responsibility for audiovisual materials, the number of librarians should be increased by 25 percent, and in the case of full responsibility for audiovisual materials and the audiovisual program, by 50 percent.

- For each additional 400 students or major fraction thereof: One librarian, if the head librarian has no administrative responsibility for audiovisual materials. If the head librarian has partial responsibility, the number of librarians should be increased by 25 percent, and in the case of full responsibility for audiovisual materials and the audiovisual program, by 50 percent.

- One clerk for each 600 students or major fraction thereof if the head librarian has no administrative responsibility for audiovisual materials. If the head librarian has partial responsibility for audiovisual materials, the number of clerks should be increased by 25 percent, and in the case of full responsibility for audiovisual materials and the audiovisual program, by 50 percent (American Library Association, 1960).

The ALA recommendations regarding the education of school librarians are as follows:

- The basic program of general and professional education recommended for the school librarian is a 5-year program. The fifth year may be based on an undergraduate minor in school librarianship in a college or university with an approved program of this type.
Although the 5-year program is recognized as being desirable for most school librarians, some situations justify the appointment of a person who has completed 4 years of college work and some professional preparation in librarianship that may or may not be part of his college training. These situations are typically those that are covered in existing provisional or other certification measures ... (American Library Association, 1960).

ALA Standards are currently being revised to emphasize the importance of "unifying the administration of print and audio-visual library programs in schools". The revised document will be entitled Standards for Media Programs in Schools (Guthrie, 1968).

The North-Central Association of Colleges and Secondary Schools Standards

The school library standards set by the North-Central Association are utilized as partial basis for evaluating the school programs of individual schools. However, the participation of schools in the association is on a voluntary basis. Any school that applies for membership is admitted if it meets the Association's standards. Although the Association cooperates with the State Department of Education it is independent of State authority (Darling, 1964).

The library standards prepared by the Association are basically quantitative and are intended to be minimum requirements. Further, the standards are presently directed only at the high schools. The relevant standards are excerpted below.

- **Organization:** The library shall be organized as a resource center of instructional material for the entire educational program.

- **Adequate personnel:** Member high schools shall employ at least one professionally trained school librarian. Schools with an enrollment of less than 500 pupils shall employ a librarian who devotes at least one-half time exclusively to library services. Schools with an enrollment of 500 or more pupils shall employ a librarian who devotes full-time to library services. Schools enrolling 1500 or more pupils shall provide another full-time librarian, or the equivalent in part-time librarians.

- **Preparation:** The librarian shall meet the requirements for classroom teachers with reference to a degree and to general and professional preparation... The librarian also shall have a minimum of 15 semester hours of library science.

- **Note:** Adult clerks should be provided as needed to permit librarians to perform their professional functions. A ratio of one clerical assistant for each 750 pupils is recommended. (North Central Association of Colleges and Secondary Schools, 1968-69).

Although the above standards are in effect at the present time, revised standards are to become effective in September, 1969. The new standards reflect the trend toward
"media centers", i.e., the combination of library, audiovisual, and other instructional materials. Excerpts from the new standards are quoted below:

- A coordinated instructional media program shall be organized so as to make accessible in any location a wide range of media to teachers and students... The program shall be developed in such a way as to support instruction through appropriate facilities and professionally and technically prepared staff.

- Professional Media Personnel: Member schools shall employ the equivalent of at least one professionally trained individual. The professional staff shall provide such services as instructing students in the use of the media center, assisting teachers in locating and utilizing resources, and the production of graphic and other materials. In addition, the professional staff should develop a plan for the evaluation and selection of materials utilizing standards lists and the judgments of teaching staff. In order to provide these services, the equivalent of the following numbers of professional media persons (qualified as librarians or audio-visual specialists) are required according to the enrollment categories shown:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enrollment</th>
<th>Qualified Specialists Required</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fewer than 300</td>
<td>At least one half-time specialist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>300-1499</td>
<td>At least one full-time specialist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Over 1500</td>
<td>At least two full-time specialists</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Note: In meeting the above criterion, a school shall employ at least one qualified librarian on a half-time basis.)

- Librarians shall meet the classroom teacher requirements with reference to degree and professional preparation and also shall have a minimum of 18 semester hours of library science.

- Clerical Help: In order to permit media specialists to perform essential services to faculty and students, sufficient technical and clerical help shall be provided. (North Central Association of Colleges and Secondary Schools, 1968-69).

The State Board of Education Standards

The Ohio Board of Education publishes separate and varying standards for each school level. However, in all cases, the standards specify the minimum requirements. The standards relevant to the library include both quantitative and qualitative requirements, the basic contents of which are presented below:
High Schools

- Each school shall provide a library center.
- Each school shall provide an instructional materials center.
- Each school shall have a librarian who shall hold a baccalaureate degree, meet the following training requirements, and be assigned as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enrollment of School</th>
<th>Assignment</th>
<th>Training in Library Science</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>300 or less</td>
<td>1/2-time</td>
<td>12 semester hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>301-499</td>
<td>Full-time</td>
<td>16 semester hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500 and over</td>
<td>Full-time</td>
<td>24 semester hours or certificated as a librarian</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Junior High Schools

- There shall be a library center.
- Each junior high school shall have a librarian. The librarian shall hold a baccalaureate degree and be assigned as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Enrollment of School</th>
<th>Assignment</th>
<th>Training in Library Science</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>300 or less</td>
<td>1/2-time</td>
<td>8 semester hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>301-499</td>
<td>3/4-time</td>
<td>16 semester hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>500 and over</td>
<td>Full-time</td>
<td>Certificated or 24 semester hours</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Qualified clerical assistance shall be provided when the enrollment exceeds 800 pupils

(State Board of Education, Junior High School Standards, 1968).

Elementary Schools

- Each school shall have library facilities and services so organized as to contribute to the total educational program. In buildings where facilities cannot be provided for both a central library and classroom libraries, there shall be classroom libraries that will provide the resources generally provided through a central library service.

"Interpretive and explanatory material" regarding the latter standard is offered in the manual, and is as follows:
In the larger attendance centers, a central library is desirable. Librarian service, at least part-time, should be provided to manage the library and to assist pupils and teachers. Classroom libraries in these schools should be drawn from the central library.

Classroom libraries may serve in the absence of the central library, however, a record of all library books should be kept in a central catalogue, which is accessible to teachers and pupils (State Board of Education, Elementary School Standards, 1967).

State standards for the elementary schools are currently undergoing revision, and may result in changes to the library requirements cited above.*

Discussion and Implications of Standards

One factor that emerges from a comparative review of the standards set by the three organizations is that neither the State (Ohio) nor the North-Central Association standards meet those of the ALA. Considered on a national basis this finding is not unusual.

Another point of comparison is that neither the North-Central Association standards nor the State standards presently require libraries or librarians in the elementary school.

With regard to standards as they relate to school grade levels, Ohio's requirements for numbers of librarians and their qualifications make distinctions among the three school levels. However, according to the national Survey of School Library Standards, the current trend is the formulation of common library standards for the elementary and secondary schools. As Darling states:

That nearly half the States with standards pertaining to the number of school librarians serving elementary schools use the same recommendations for both elementary and secondary school levels provides further evidence of increased use of general standards for schools of all grade levels. (Darling, 1964)

As in the case for librarians, standards also vary for clerical assistants in the library. While ALA standards require paid library clerks, the North-Central Association standard with regard to clerical personnel is in the form of a recommendation. In the State standards, clerical assistance is specified for the junior high schools, but no mention of library clerks is made for the high schools.

One other important personnel category is that of the state library supervisor. The basic function of the supervisor, as suggested by the ALA, is that of "overall direction of a planned program of developing and improving school library services and resources". ** The ALA, which recommends "at least one state school library

*It is understood that the revised standards may be released during the early months of 1969.
**A detailed listing and discussion of the functions of the supervisor are included in the ALA Standards (American Library Association, 1960).
supervisor for every state", indicated that as of 1960 there were 26 states with such per-
sonnel. It is also suggested that the "office of school library supervision is most appro-
priately located in the state department of education" (American Library Association, 1960).

Neither the North-Central Association nor the State standards require a state li-
brary supervisor at the present time, and currently, Ohio does not employ such an
individual.

The standards presented and discussed above have rather direct implications for
Ohio school library manpower requirements — particularly in connection with the number
of librarians required. The standards also impose potential constraints on the types of
personnel — in terms of professional qualifications — that can be utilized in Ohio school
system libraries.

LIBRARY MANPOWER RESOURCES, NEEDS, AND CONSTRAINTS

This section of the report presents and discusses available statistical and descrip-
tive data on library manpower in the Ohio public schools. Included is information re-
garding (1) the number of certificated librarians in the Ohio public school system,
(2) the student-to-librarian ratio, (3) librarian degree status, (4) librarian salaries,
(5) the number of library assistants, and (6) the number of library science trainees. In
addition, this section discusses the need for school librarians in quantitative terms, and
some of the factors that impose constraints on meeting the needs.

The information reported below was gathered from a number of different sources: however, many of the data were obtained from the Division of Computer Services and Statistical Reports of the Ohio Department of Education. * The most recent information available from the Division was that for the 1967-68 school year.

Number of Certificated Librarians

For the 1967-68 school year there were 1290 librarians, of which a rough estimate
indicates 20 percent were part-time personnel. The largest number of librarians, 639
or 50 percent, served at the school district level. The secondary schools were served
by 385 or 30 percent of the librarians; and the elementary schools were served by 260 or
20 percent of the librarians. In general, the number of librarians increases with en-
rollment. For example, 55 percent of the elementary librarians and 90 percent of the
secondary librarians are in schools with enrollments of 500 or over. While there are
only a few (37 or 10 percent) secondary librarians for schools with less than 499 students,
there are relatively few high schools with enrollments of this size.

*The primary sources of information from the Division were (1) the File on Professional Personnel, and (2) the Salary Study. With regard to the former, Battelle prepared a computer program to extract and compile relevant information regarding school librarians (Position Code, "TK") from the file. It is understood that the File on Professional Personnel is based on a file of all certificated staff for the School Year 1967-68, as reported on Form SF-1 (Report of Certificated Employees).
School and Student-to-Librarian Ratios

Data were obtained regarding the total number of certificated librarians serving the school and district levels and the number of schools and approximate student enrollments as a function of school level. On the basis of these figures, the school-to-librarian and student-to-librarian ratios were calculated.

There is approximately one librarian for every 12 elementary schools and approximately one librarian for every 2.8 secondary schools. For the State as a whole (i.e., across school levels and districts), there is about one librarian for every 3.3 schools.

With regard to the student-to-librarian ratios, on average, one librarian serves about 5,767 elementary students, and one librarian serves about 2,239 secondary students. Considered on a state-wide basis, there is about one librarian (including part-time personnel) for every 1,839 students.

In order to obtain somewhat more precise information regarding the student-to-librarian ratios within Ohio, the ratios were determined on a county-by-county basis. Only one county (Brown) has a student-to-librarian ratio of one librarian to 1,000 students, or less. The two ratio classes that account for the largest number of counties are the 1601-1900 and the 1901-2200 classes. Stated differently, one-half, or 44 of the counties, have student-to-librarian ratios falling within the range of 1601-2200 students for each librarian. Of the remaining 44 counties, 18 (21 percent) have student-to-librarian ratios that are more favorable than the latter, and 26 (29 percent) counties have less favorable ratios.

As noted by Ennis in a recent study, Ohio "lags behind the rest of the nation in staffing its school libraries" (Ennis, 1967). This finding is borne out by the results of the present study. As indicated above, for the 1967-68 school year, Ohio had only about 1,290 librarians serving 4,227 public schools. In order to provide at least one librarian for each school - irrespective of enrollment and school grade level - nearly 3,000 additional librarians would be required. When the number of librarians was considered in terms of the student body served, on a Statewide basis a relatively poor ratio of one librarian per 1,839 students was found. This ratio compares unfavorably with that for the rest of the nation, which as of 1964-65 was on average approximately 1,009 students per librarian.

The fundamental question that arises at this point pertains to the number of librarians required to meet the present and projected needs of Ohio's public school students. As discussed under Manpower Standards, the three Standards that bear on student-to-librarian ratio vary. In very general terms, the existing requirement for full-time librarians is as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Standard</th>
<th>Ratio, librarian to students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>American Library Association</td>
<td>1:300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio (Junior and Senior High School)</td>
<td>1:500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North-Central Association</td>
<td>1:500 2:1500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
On the basis of these requirements it would seem that an overall ratio (across all schools) that would on average generally meet the State and North-Central Association minimum standards would be on the order of one full-time librarian for every 750 students. Clearly, this ratio does not represent "ideal" library service, and is far from the general requirement of one librarian per 300 students set by the American Library Association. However, as indicated above, on average, the 750:1 ratio meets current State and North-Central Association standards, and thereby appears to provide a reasonable basis to conservatively estimate current and future needs for librarians. Accordingly, the estimates indicated below utilize the 750:1 ratio.

Dividing the total Ohio student enrollment of 2,361,362 (for 1967-68) by 750, yields approximately 3,148 — which is roughly the total number of full-time librarians that would be required currently. Since about 1,161* full-time librarians are already employed in the school system, an additional 1,987 librarians (3,148 minus 1,161) would be needed to meet the ratio of one librarian for every 750 students. (It should be noted that this need could be met with an equivalent number of full-time plus part-time personnel.)

In summary, it would appear that, on average, about 3,173 full-time librarians (or the equivalent full-time plus part-time personnel) are presently required. The need will continue at about this level through 1975. To arrive at this total, an average of roughly 2,012 (3,173 minus 1,161) more librarians than reported for the 1967-68 school year will be required.

Librarian Degree Status

In order to obtain an indication of the educational levels attained by Ohio school librarians, information regarding degree status was collected. Of the 1,290 librarians, only 27 (2 percent) do not have a degree. Thus, almost all of the librarians, i.e., 1,263 (98 percent) have either a Bachelor's degree or above — with roughly equal percentages of personnel in each degree category.

Available data did not permit the determination of the numbers and percentages of librarians that received various levels of training in library science. For example, it is not known whether an individual holding a Master's degree has a degree in library science or an "education" degree with the necessary number of hours in library specialties. It will be recalled however, that for certification as a librarian, present minimum State standards require 8 to 24 semester hours of library science (the exact number of hours depending on school grade level and enrollment).

In general the educational attainment of Ohio school librarians compares favorably with that for the nation.

Librarian Salaries

To determine whether the salaries of librarians in Ohio are competitive with those earned nationally, the average salaries of school librarians were obtained. The study

---

*Although there are about 1,290 librarians in service (1967-68), it is estimated that about 20 percent, or 258, are part-time personnel. Thus, on the assumption that two part-time librarians equal one full-time librarian, the equivalent number of full-time personnel would be roughly 1,161.
considered average salaries of full-time librarians for the 1967-68 school year. The average salary for all librarians was $7,573, with the highest average salary being earned by secondary school librarians. In general, the salary scale for school librarians in Ohio is the same as that for teachers. (The average salary reported for classroom teachers for the 1967-68 school year was $7,387.)

While the foregoing data represent average salaries being earned by Ohio school librarians (as of 1967-68), information regarding starting salaries is equally important. On the basis of an extrapolation of data reported by Ennis, the average 1967 starting salary for Ohio public school librarians with no previous experience was roughly $6,475, with a corresponding national average of about $7,000 (Ennis, 1967). Thus, as of 1967, Ohio’s salaries for beginning school librarians lagged those at the national level by approximately $500. In another recent study it was forecasted that the average beginning 1968 salary will turn out to be around $7,500 to 7,600. The authors add the following comment:

...any library which is not now offering a beginning salary near this norm is probably not competitive. By the spring of 1969, assuming the average rate of gain observed during the past 17 years, beginning salary offerings will probably fall most typically at or near $7,700-7800. (Frarey and Rosenstein, 1968)

The apparent implication here is that retention of current library personnel and attraction of new personnel may be partially dependent on raising salaries to more competitive levels.

---

Estimated Number of Library Assistants

As indicated previously, many public schools in Ohio are without certificated librarians, or have an inadequate number of librarians (as defined by current standards) to meet their needs. However, it is also apparent that many schools are utilizing "library assistants" of various skill levels as an alternative measure. To assess the number of such personnel presently serving in this capacity, data extracted from a State-wide Battelle survey were utilized (Battelle-Columbus, 1968). The survey, which was conducted for ODE, was designed to obtain data on the "uses and training of supportive assistants". It should be emphasized that the survey was conducted on a sampling basis - specifically, on a sample of 83 selected school districts.* The figures cited below are calculated estimates (extrapolations) of the total number of assistants, based on the data obtained from these sampled school districts. It should be noted that for purposes of the Battelle survey, a supportive assistant (or aide, auxiliary, paraprofessional, etc.) was defined as "any noncertified person whose primary function is to perform tasks and services that otherwise would have to be performed by certified, professional school personnel. By this definition, a supportive assistant may be a paid or volunteer worker."

The study revealed an estimated number of library assistants by school level, as well as by full-time, part-time, and paid personnel. There are a total of 4,356

*The sampling plan is described in the Sixth Monthly Letter Report from Battelle to the ODE, October 10, 1968.
assistants — the majority of which (3,326 or about 76 percent) are serving in the elementary schools. Only a relatively small proportion of the assistants are full-time personnel. In addition, the paid assistants are in the minority (1,137 or about 26 percent). Further, 2,122 additional library assistants are currently required — the majority (1,316 or 62 percent) in the elementary schools.

The large majority of library assistants are working in the elementary schools. This condition is consistent with the fact that these schools have relatively few certificated librarians. Thus, it would appear that in many instances the library assistant is currently serving in the capacity of a librarian — particularly in the elementary schools. It is also significant that survey respondees indicated a need for a large number of additional library assistants — in effect reemphasizing the shortage of library manpower in Ohio schools.

**Library Trainees in Ohio Colleges**

In connection with the shortage of library personnel, it was of interest to estimate the number of librarians and library "technical aides" (e.g., those with associate degrees or certificates) that are being trained in Ohio. While recent studies of this type have been done (notably those of Ennis, 1967; Blasingame, 1968; Case, et al., 1968; and Frarey, et al., 1968), in general, data for only two schools, Kent State University and Case Western Reserve University, have been reported. This is probably due to the fact that these two universities are the only schools in Ohio that are accredited by the American Library Association to award degrees in library science. To obtain information on a more comprehensive basis, a questionnaire was sent to 16 Ohio universities and colleges that offered courses in library science.*

Although the results of the survey are somewhat limited, it does provide a representative indication of the library programs being offered in Ohio, and an estimate of the number of current library science students and graduates. The 16 schools and the number of hours they offer in library science are listed below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>University or College</th>
<th>Semester Hours Offered in Library Science(a)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ashland College</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bowling Green State University</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case Western Reserve University</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central State University</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Cincinnati</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuyahoga Community College</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hiram College</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kent State University</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lakeland Community College</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miami University</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College of Mount Saint Joseph</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio Dominican College</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Ohio State University</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio University</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Toledo</td>
<td>27(b)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wright State University</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(a) Quarter hours were converted to semester hours where necessary.  
(b) Graduate level.

*It was subsequently found that one of the schools surveyed, The Ohio State University, has not offered a library science program since the 1965-66 school year.
The responses to the major questions by the 10 schools that submitted completed questionnaires indicated that only 6 of the 10 schools offer degrees or certificates in library science. Of the 6, only 2 schools (Kent and Case Western Reserve) confer a graduate degree (Master of Library Science – MLS). Approximately 659 students are currently enrolled in library science programs; of this number, about 23 are enrolled in the Doctor's programs, 286 in the Master's, 145 in the Bachelor's, and 205 in certificate programs. Nearly one-half (305) of the 659 students are specializing in school librarianship.

As to data regarding numbers of library science graduates, for the 1967-68 school year, a total of about 150 students graduated, of which about 131 had graduate degrees, 7 had Bachelor's, and 12 had certificates. Of these graduates 55 (the majority with Master's degrees) had specialties in school librarianship. About 43 of the 1967-68 graduates accepted jobs in Ohio public school libraries.

For the 1968-69 school year, the 10 schools reported that they expected to graduate a total of approximately 171 students, the large majority (145) with Master's degrees. About 61 of the graduates will have specialties in school libraries.

While not all of the schools offer library science degrees or certificates, 10 schools offer library science courses totaling to at least 16 semester hours. By providing these courses, it makes it possible for "Education" students to take a sufficient number of hours to qualify them for positions as school librarians in Ohio. For the 1968-69 school year, roughly 53 Education graduates had taken at least 16 semester hours of library science. For 1968-69 it was reported that approximately 68 Education students are expected to graduate with at least 16 semester hours.

Although the above data are to some extent limited – including the fact that not every school offering library science programs is represented – it is apparent that the production of school librarians in Ohio is well below existing needs. And, as stated in a recent report by the Ohio Library Association, "...Ohio's library schools have not yet increased their production of fully trained school librarians to any appreciable degree" (Case, et al., 1968). Of the graduates that are produced, many leave the State, and of those remaining, only a proportion accept positions in Ohio's schools.

A Summation of the Library Manpower Situation

A number of major factors relevant to the school library manpower situation have emerged from the study – the basic factor being the general shortage of certificated librarians in Ohio's schools. In fact, as noted above, Ohio generally lags the nation in terms of student-to-librarian ratio. Relatedly, many schools are not being served by librarians, and there are apparently a significant number of schools that are not meeting minimum State standards with respect to adequate library staffing.

It appears that the "solution" to the manpower shortage at the present time is the use of the "nonprofessional", i.e., the library assistant, aide, or paraprofessional, who serves in the capacity of a certificated librarian. Of further interest is the fact that although there are a relatively large number of library assistants in use, the need for many additional library assistants was reported.

*The questionnaire returned by Kent State University reports only data regarding their graduate (MLS) students. It was indicated however, that while they had no data on "undergraduate certification minors", they enroll about 100-125 each term.
A survey of the number of librarians and library technical aides being trained in Ohio universities and colleges indicated that only a small fraction of the required number of library personnel are being produced.

While the educational attainment of certificated librarians presently serving in the schools compares favorably with librarians nationally, the starting salaries for Ohio's school librarians are somewhat lower than the national average.

To return to the fundamental problem, it was estimated that approximately 2,000 additional full-time librarians (or a proportional number of part-time personnel) would be required to meet the needs of Ohio's public schools. (As noted above, this requirement assumes a ratio of one librarian per 750 students — including those in the elementary schools.) Clearly a manpower need of this magnitude, when considered in terms of existing and potential constraints, poses a considerable practical problem. Thus, prior to any consideration of approaches for meeting library manpower needs, the constraints must be weighed. Included among the constraints that became apparent during the study are those briefly cited below:

- The number of institutions providing library science programs that meet minimum State preparation requirements is inadequate.
- The present rate of production of trained library personnel — on both professional and technical aide levels — is considerably below that required for meeting manpower needs.
- Existing regional and State standards specify minimum education and preparation requirements for certification of school librarians — thereby limiting entry.
- Enforcement of present State standards would preclude use of personnel that are suitably educated and trained, but that do not meet existing requirements.
- Present starting salaries for librarians are below the national average — potentially increasing attrition and decreasing the ability to recruit new personnel.
- Present funding may be inadequate to support the additional library manpower required.

While the above constraints are perhaps obvious, they are in fact basic considerations and, as such, bear on the tentative manpower solutions discussed in the next section of this report.

**TENTATIVE MANPOWER SOLUTIONS**

Specifying practical solutions for "real-world" problems is frequently the most difficult aspect of a research task. This difficulty became immediately apparent in this
It is also clear that while there seems to be general agreement regarding the manpower shortage, there is considerable controversy regarding the approaches to be taken for solving the manpower problem.

The tentative solutions offered below are the outgrowth of a review of the manpower literature, discussions held with experienced library personnel, and a conference held at Battelle to discuss possible approaches for increasing library manpower in the schools. With regard to the latter, the 12 conference attendees included 9 Ohio library personnel with a broad range of experience encompassing library administration, supervision, and training, as well as school librarianship.

The "tentative manpower solutions" proposed below are not necessarily the optimum or ideal approaches from the viewpoint of the library profession. However, on the basis of this study, the approaches proposed are considered to be both realistic and feasible interim measures for adequately meeting school library manpower needs over the next few years.

Tentative Solutions for Staffing School Libraries
With Trained Personnel

It is intended that, to the extent possible, the solutions or approaches briefly described below be pursued concurrently — such that the needs for library personnel can be met as rapidly as possible.

College Graduates

This approach would involve the recruiting of individuals with Bachelor's degrees (or above) to serve as librarians in the schools. These individuals would be hired on the basis of an agreement requiring them to complete the necessary number of hours in library science within a specified period of time.* Much of the required course work could probably be completed during summer sessions, minimizing the need to take time off for this purpose during the school year. Prior to starting their library jobs they would be given a short intensive course (of perhaps 2 weeks' duration) in basic library skills. Refunding tuition to personnel successfully completing their required course work could prove to be an incentive.

Several of the conference attendees suggested that adult volunteers presently serving in libraries provide a "fertile field" for obtaining recruits.

School Teachers

The approach suggested here is that of recruiting newly graduated teachers, and perhaps those currently teaching in the schools, to serve as librarians. As with the above personnel, they would participate in a short intensive course prior to reporting for library work and would be required to complete the necessary hours in library science by a specified time.

*The number of hours in library science and the time period for completion would be specified by ODE.
While this approach would "rob" the schools of some teachers, teaching manpower is apparently being produced in adequate numbers. In fact, it is understood that in some areas it is not uncommon for the supply of teachers to be greater than the demand.

Technical Aides

This approach involves the training and utilization of library technical aides (graduates of 2-year degree or certificate programs) in the school library until sufficient numbers of "professional" personnel are available. Although the aides would in effect serve in the capacity of librarians, it is intended that they would be under the part-time supervision of a professional traveling librarian - perhaps from a regional center. The primary advantage here is that the aides could be produced in roughly one-half the time necessary to graduate professional-level personnel (i.e., generally 2 years versus at least 4 years).

Regional Centers

The approach proposed here entails the establishment of regional library centers staffed with professional librarians and sufficient numbers of trained supportive assistants. The primary function of the librarians would be that of visiting schools on a regularly scheduled basis to provide such services as (1) supervising and guiding nonprofessional personnel in the school libraries, (2) guiding the setting up of libraries, and (3) training nonprofessional library personnel. The center could also provide a central ordering and processing function. While this approach is by no means new, it is currently receiving limited application. It is understood, however, that a library service of this general type is operating in the Columbus school system.

The feasibility of regional centers for providing services including data processing, transportation, audiovisual aides, and vocational education is currently under investigation at Battelle. If the regional-center approach proves feasible, the library service described could be one of the additional functions of these centers.

A center of the type proposed would of course be of greatest value in school regions with limited resources in terms of both money and professional manpower. For example, in rural areas having a low tax base, small schools, and difficulties in attracting professional personnel, a regional library center could prove to be one of the few feasible solutions.

Additional College Programs

This proposal is for the establishment of additional library science programs (professional and technical aide) in Ohio universities and colleges. Recent studies such as those conducted by the Ohio Library Association (Case, et al., 1968) and the Lake County Librarians' Association (Hennings, 1968) have indicated the need for additional programs.

An important aspect of the proposal is that of making library programs available over a wider geographical area. Presently, the majority of schools offering library
Science courses are in the northeastern sector of Ohio. It was pointed out at the conference that this situation makes it difficult and sometimes impossible for personnel not employed in the northeastern area to pursue course work on a part-time basis.

**Publicize Need**

While the matter of publicity is rather obvious, it is by no means clear that it is presently being utilized to any extent to convey the need for additional school librarians. Publicity should be directed to universities, community colleges, private libraries, and library associations, as well as to the general public.

**State School Library Supervisor**

The implementation of the solutions proposed above would require the efforts of a high-level individual having administrative skills and a knowledge of the library service function. To this end, it is proposed that a position of "State Library Supervisor" be established within the Ohio Department of Education. This individual would need an adequate supporting staff.

**SUMMARY AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

The objective of this study was to investigate the resources, needs, constraints, and tentative solutions that relate to staffing present and future school library systems in Ohio with trained personnel. Information and statistical data on various facets of the school library manpower problem were presented and discussed. Specifically, the study included (1) a review and discussion of relevant school library personnel and staffing standards, (2) a summary of available information regarding tasks performed in the library, (3) the presentation and discussion of statistical data on school library manpower resources and needs, (4) a discussion of potential constraints involved in staffing school libraries, and (5) some proposed approaches on tentative solutions for meeting school needs for trained library personnel.

**Study Findings**

The principal findings of the study are summarized below. It should be noted that the statistical data given generally reflect the 1967-68 school year:

1. The majority of states have adopted standards for elementary school libraries.

2. The minimum State standards regarding library staffing are not being met by many Ohio public schools.
(3) The professional librarian spends a significant amount of time pursuing work that could be satisfactorily performed by a library technical aide and/or clerk.

(4) There is a general shortage of certificated librarians in Ohio's schools, and Ohio generally lags the nation in terms of student-to-librarian ratio.

(5) There are approximately 1,290 certificated librarians (of which about 20 percent are part-time personnel) serving 4,227 Ohio schools.

(6) On the average, in Ohio, there is about one certificated librarian for every 3.3 schools, or one librarian per 1,839 students. (As of 1964-65 the national student-to-librarian ratio was about 1,009 students per librarian.)

(7) It is estimated that roughly 2,000 additional full-time librarians (or the part-time equivalent) would be required to meet the present needs of Ohio's public schools. This number would continue to be adequate through 1975. (The requirement for 2,000 assumes a ratio of one librarian per 750 students - including those in the elementary schools.)

(8) It appears that the present approach to the manpower shortage is that of utilizing the nonprofessional, i.e., the library assistant, aide, or paraprofessional.

(9) Estimates indicated that there are over 4,300 library assistants working in the schools, the majority of which (about 76 percent) are serving at the elementary school level.

(10) A survey of the number of librarians and library technical aides being trained in Ohio universities and colleges indicated that only a small fraction of the required number of personnel are being graduated.

(11) While the educational attainment of certificated librarians presently serving in the schools compares favorably with librarians nationally, the starting salaries for Ohio's school librarians are somewhat lower (by about $500 annually) than the national average.

Tentative Manpower Solutions

The tentative solutions proposed for staffing school libraries with trained personnel over the next few years are summarized below:

(1) The recruiting of individuals with Bachelor's degrees (or above) to serve as librarians in the schools. (These individuals would participate
in a short intensive course prior to reporting for library work and would be required to complete the necessary hours in library science by a specified time.)

(2) The recruiting of newly graduated teachers and perhaps those currently teaching in the schools to serve as librarians. (The comment in (1) above, regarding the short intensive course and the requirement for subsequent completion of the necessary hours in library science, applies here also.)

(3) The training and utilization of library technical aides (graduates of 2-year certificate programs) in the school library until sufficient numbers of "professional" personnel are available.

(4) The establishment of a regional library service (perhaps within a center providing other school services) provided by professional librarians and trained supportive assistants. (The librarians would visit schools on a scheduled basis to supervise and guide nonprofessionals, to provide direction in setting up libraries, and to train nonprofessional library personnel.)

(5) The establishment of additional library science degree and certification-oriented programs in Ohio colleges and universities, with a primary objective being that of making these programs available over a wider geographical area.

(6) Publicizing the need for additional personnel in the school libraries, with such publicity directed at academic and library institutions, as well as the general public.

(7) The establishment of a position of State Library Supervisor within the Ohio Department of Education. (One of the functions of the position would be that of implementing the foregoing solutions.)
AUXILIARY PERSONNEL
DATA PROCESSING
EDUCATIONAL TECHNOLOGY
SCHOOL FACILITIES
• LIBRARY MANPOWER
PUPIL TRANSPORTATION
VOCATIONAL AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION—PART I
SUMMARY REPORT—PHASE I