A method called "Objectives-Art," by which disadvantaged students in a community college can be taught to structure paragraphs, is described. Works of art are intended to be a stimulus to the student's sense of unity between form and content, and the objectives are aimed at transferring the student's perception of form and unity into a process which can improve the quality of his writing. The method consists of a prewriting sample of student paragraphs, a slide of a work of art as visual stimulus to perception, performance objectives for structuring paragraphs, other visual devices such as models of paragraphs, sequentially arranged instruction based on approximations of the final results, in-class practice of every objective, and frequent encouraging reinforcement of student responses. Objectives for the method require the student to include in his paragraph (1) the title of the artwork; (2) the name of the artist; (3) the name of the work of art; (4) quotation marks around the title of the work; (5) dominant impressions the student had of the work; (6) logical order to details; (7) a minimum of three details; (8) each detail must be related to the dominant impression; (9) repetition of key ideas; (10) mention of the artist; and (11) a clincher sentence to finish off the paragraph. (HOD)
Teaching the Paragraph in Developmental Composition Classes In the Community College with Behavioral Objectives and Art.

A Demonstration on: New Approaches to Remedial Writing in Two Year Colleges.

Prepared For

THE CONFERENCE ON COLLEGE COMPOSITION AND COMMUNICATION

Held In

New Orleans, Louisiana
April 5-7, 1973

By:

Madeleine F. Bennett
YMCA Community College
211 W. Wacker Drive
Chicago, Illinois
TEACHING THE PARAGRAPH IN DEVELOPMENTAL COLLEGE
COMPOSITION CLASSES WITH OBJECTIVES AND ART

Teaching developmental students in college to write mature paragraphs is a matter of having them use organization and structure. I regard a paragraph as a method of organizing and presenting ideas for the purpose of communication. If a student can gain a sense for crafting and developing paragraphs, he can also use it to develop an essay.

My method aims at equipping students with a general and operational model of a paragraph that can be used in most writing situations. But structure alone is not the desired outcome of instruction. I also expect students to gain a sense for the process of creativity undergone by the artist who crafts a piece of art. I want students to use a similar process when constructing sentences paragraphs, and essays.

The assumption of the Method which I call "Objectives-Art" is that students labeled "disadvantaged" can be taught to structure paragraphs because they have an innate sense of structure that is not influenced by variations in language or by a background of non-writing. Works of art are intended to be a stimulus to the student's sense of unity between form and content. My thesis is that a visual perception of the totality of the work of art is a very effective circuit to the student's understanding of the unity of form, and, that the student, given the objectives - art method of instruction, can successfully transfer his perception of form and unity into a writing process and improve the quality of his writing.

In this paper I shall demonstrate how student ability to structure their writing improved as did their ability to write clearly and in depth on one subject in a study conducted at the YMCA College, Chicago, Illinois. With the objectives-ART METHOD, an understanding of the artistic process is a key to the techniques of crafting and art form.

Then I shall describe the results mathematically, I will first describe students involved in the method and explain why non-traditional methods are necessary; next, justify the visual method; third demonstrate the method; and finally describe student progress mathematically. I find it essential to use a scientific approach to evaluate the success or failure of any method of instruction I attempt. An analysis of the effect of the method does not limit or stultify the method itself.

DESCRIPTION OF STUDENTS

The Objectives-Art method of teaching the paragraph has been tested on a class of Developmental students at the Y.M.C.A. Community College in Chicago, Illinois. The students at the college are international, black, white, Puerto Rican, Mexican-American. They generally have poor academic records and a sense of failure in school.
To add to the difficulty, much research on the so-called "disadvantaged" describes them in negative ways as: "retarded in speech", "disadvantaged in the use of language to a cumulative deficit." Much teaching based on such theory strives at "bringing up" the level of achievement of these students.

I find, however, that the Negative Model, is unfair, and prefer to base my methods on a more positive theory of learning. New non-traditional methods of teaching are needed for the urban community, college student when the old methods, namely lectures, note-taking, and essay exams have not been effective in the past.

Why Objectives and Art?

Lately, teachers have been developing performance objectives to clarify the goals of their teaching. Students then, in any given assignment, have an idea of what is expected of them. Sometimes, however, the objectives are stiff and authoritarian. I believe they should be used with more artifice and in this case, with works of art. Developmental students are in a threatening situation. They know they haven't written well for the college because they are in a developmental skill course. They also see the instructor as a judge and authority on writing. These factors combine to place the student in a situation of dependence. It is because of this dependence and his unfamiliarity with academic writing form that I believe in carefully specifying the nature of the writing structure I want from him. He too then has some idea of how to begin to proceed in writing.

I also believe the student has an innate sense of structure which can be used to get him to develop his writing skills for success in college. The aim of the method is conservative in equipping students to compete with others in college by giving them a working knowledge of the academic writing style most likely to succeed in college courses.

Theoretical Justification

I rely on an approach to perceiving that claims the senses are perceptual systems that can obtain information about objects in the world without the intervention of an intellectual process. Perception then is simply detection. Students detect.

In addition, Gestaltist also say the shape of the stimulus is aided by pre-destined patterns based on the nature of the receptors themselves. One could say that a distinction between perceiving and reasoning is superficial, that visual communication is universal and not limited by vocabulary. Thus works of art will be strong communicators.

Next I add the principle that art is organization and the artistic process is like the shaping of a universe out of chaos. In addition, much of art is crafting and organizing.

Therefore I derived the idea that works of art might best demonstrate the process of crafting and the unity achieved in a piece of art, and that this idea would be beneficial to the remedial student to arm him to become an artist of sorts as he wrote and to sensitize him to structure with materials other than a book or program.
Works of art are non-linguistic forms of communication. I can now say that art can aid the remedial process in five ways: 1) Provide students with a sense of process in writing; 2) encourage students to structure their own artifacts—paragraphs; 3) provide a PERSONA for the student where he can think of himself as an artist forming a piece of communication; 4) legitimize vision as a source of knowledge; 5) provide unusual classroom experience.

Basic Assumption on Student Ability to Perceive Form

It is essential to the credibility of this method that we find structure in student writing. The following pages are an example of a student essay written when the student first entered the course. The story shows an innate structure or form. It centered on one event and the lesson he learned from it. The story has specific details, chronological order, a specified time—it begins at the outset of the evening and ends at the conclusion of the event. Though there are flaws in grammar, I find a sense of form here. If the English teacher reader overlooks the need to have experiences related in grammatically perfect form, he can find an immediacy of the moment re-created in the student's sentences.
EXAMPLE OF STUDENT WRITING WHEN FIRST ENTERING
ENGLISH 96 at the YMCA COLLEGE
CHICAGO, ILLINOIS

My father and I went out for a chat. Something happened that night about a month ago.

We went to a lounge to have a drink together. Something told me before I went that something is going to happen. Not particular that night but that week. Because I said that I was going to know more lounges or parties.

So I broke my word to myself.

Anyway my father and I were drinking vodka and orange juice. Just wrapping about the good times, and bad. When all of a sudden, I looked around and seen a guy I use to work for. Remembering that this guy owns me forty dollars. So I politely got off my stool and without saying one word, to my father.

I walk over to him, he was sitting at a booth. With a girl and another couple.

I said hi! he said Hi. We shook hands and began to talk. In the conversation he let me know that he didn't like me to much. Anyway I mentioned the forty dollars. He politely said that he didn't own me anything. So I called him a lie. He knew and I knew he was lying.

I had been waiting on the forty dollars for about two months. So during the passing of words, the gut that was with him stood up.

At that moment, my father walk over and ask me what was the matter. I told him, he told me just to forget wait and going get a lawyer.

At that moment, this guy pushed me, and said (quote) (get out of my face anyway.) So I, you should have never hit me. So we started fighting, like beast in jungle. We fought for some time. I had him down (choking) him.

Then from know where came these powerful blows, four of them! I stop choking my victim and looked around, I wanted to see what was hitting me. It was the guy that was with my opponent. He had hand cuffs in his hands. I started bleeding like Niagara Falls. Then he said I am the police. I said why didn't you tell me that from the start. He said! and quote I don't have to show you or tell you got man thing. Then I looked around in total shock. The pig had jumped on my father for nothing. He blood streaming over his face. His eye was swollen so bad he didn't even look real.

The I thought if I attach this (coward) he'll shoot me and my father. So I put my hands up and walked backwards. Until somebody from behind hit me. With a bottle I looked around and it was the police girlfriend. I was terrified
with hate. If it hadn't been for my father I would probably be dead now. Because I would have attacked them all. So to make my conclusion brief.

By the police officer not making an arrest and not calling in, and by having other police officers pick him up, he under suspension until my court date. My lesson never try and make any body do something that they don't want to do. And stop drinking. Also stay out of lounges.

This paper and others show a sense for form and organization which can be utilized for teaching principles of paragraph and essay form.

**Procedure**

Students were first given numbers, so their progress could be observed throughout the study. Next I compiled a list of the performance objectives I would expect in the last paragraph after the Method was completed. Then I made up a "tally sheet" form to be used for each student at each step of the process. These forms merely record whether the student used the objective or did not. See Samples of definitions and tally sheets.

For each step of the process I totaled the number of each objective used by the class as well as each student at that period. Then I converted the number to a percentage of the students who used the objective. For instance, if fifteen students wrote for the step, but only two used the objective, the result would be:

\[
\frac{2}{15} = 13.3\% \text{ use of the objective for step X}
\]

I also computed the mean number of words in the paragraphs for each step to see if increased productivity came with the use of specified objectives. I would interpret increased use of words as evidence of increased confidence for writing, tapping the sources of ability in the student.

The Method consists of five steps beginning with a pre-writing sample, a showing of the slide, student commentary on it, student writing, giving students demonstrations of specific objectives, having them practice them, more viewing of a slide, more writing.

The method includes:

1. A pre-writing sample of student paragraphs
2. A slide of a work of art as visual stimulus to perception
3. Performance objectives for structuring paragraphs
4. Other visual devices such as models of paragraphs
5. Sequentially arranged instruction based on approximations of the final results
6. In-class practice of every objective

7. Frequent encouraging reinforcement of student responses by the instructor

**DEFINITIONS OF THE WRITING OBJECTIVES ON THE CHART TALLYING STUDENT USE OF THESE STRUCTURAL OR ORGANIZATIONAL TECHNIQUES OF WRITING.**

The following objectives are defined as they were used on the Tally Sheet after the students were shown the slide of Henry Moore's *The Family Group*.

1. **Title.** This objective was met when the student wrote a title for his work and placed it at the top of the page. Even if the title did not reflect the content of the paper, he was given credit for this objective when anything resembling a title appeared on the page.

2. **Name Artist.** This objective was met when the student named the artist who created the work he described in his paragraph. This name for the artist was to appear in the paragraph itself, not in the title of the article.

3. **Name Work.** The objective meant that the student named the work of art he was describing by its title. This naming was also to be placed in the body of the paragraph itself.

4. **Quotes Around Work.** This objective was met when the student used punctuation such as quotation marks or underline to designate the title of the work he was going to describe. In this case, I suggested that the class use quotation marks around the title, "The Family Group."

5. **Dominant Impression.** This objective intended to require the student to use a word, words or a phrase to name the key mood or theme that he saw embodied in the work of art he was describing. This impression was to be more than just a subjective response on the part of the student. It was to be a statement of the over-all theme or organizing principle implicit in the work of art structured in by the artist and illustrated in every detail of his work by the unity of perception that guided the artist in creating his work. If a student stated a theme or impression in the opening of his paragraph, he was credited with this objective.

6. **Logical Order to Details.** This objective was met when the student organized the presentation of his details in writing with a pattern. He might have used any appropriate pattern such as describing the sculpture from top to bottom, from left to right, from gross details to specific details. The purpose of this objective was to aid the student in presenting his writing in a manner conducive to creating a visual image in the mind of his reader. The construction of an image is aided when details are arranged with some symmetry and order as far as the reader is concerned.
7. Three Details Minimum. This objective meant that the student had to describe at least three specific details in the work of art to be credited with use of specific detail as evidence for the validity of his dominant impression. The figure three was arbitrarily selected, and represented a minimum standard of detail.

8. Each Detail Related to Dominant Impression. This objective was regarded as an essential feature of the student's imitation of the craft of the artist. The student was shown how each detail of the sculpture somehow suited the artist's theme. For instance, the formation of the arms of the male and female figures are in link fashion, and are linked to the body and legs of the child figure suggesting the unity and ties of the family. If the student's dominant impression of the sculpture was "family unity," he then had to show how the formation of the arms depicted that theme. This objective required a clear statement relating each specific detail described as it related to the theme stated by the student at the opening of his paragraph.

9. Repetition of Key Idea. This objective required that the student refer to the dominant impression within his paragraph more than just at the outset of the paragraph. This emphasis feature or repetition feature is designed to give the paragraph coherence. It was most likely met if the students used objectives 7, 8, and 9.

10. Mention Artist. This objective was met if the student referred to the creator of the sculpture in his paper more than his initial naming of him at the opening of the paper. Specifically this objective could mean that the student used words such as: "The artist . . .," "The sculptor . . .," "Henry Moore . . .," or "Moore . . .." The purpose of this objective was to give the student a tool for constantly showing the difference between himself as writer and the artist whose work he was discussing. In scanning his paper after writing it, the student had a specific item to check for. He might ask himself: "Do I mention the artist more than once?" The objective becomes a tool of the skill of composing, and then a real feature to re-read for.

11. Clincher Sentence. This sentence is the last sentence in the paper. Its intent is to finish off the paragraph. The clincher sentence re-emphasizes the dominant impression of the paragraph, and imparts a sense of unity and completeness to the paragraph. This objective was met when the student digressed from the listing and relating of details to the impression, and once again made a generalization including his dominant impression stated in the first sentence.
TALLY SHEET FOR OBJECTIVES USED IN PARAGRAPH WRITING BY REMEDIAL STUDENTS WHEN DESCRIBING A SLIDE OF A WORK OF ART IN CLASS AT THE YMCA COMMUNITY COLLEGE.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STUDENT NUMBER</th>
<th>ASSIGNMENT</th>
<th>DATE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>OBJECTIVE</td>
<td>USE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1. TITLE.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. NAME ARTIST.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. NAME WORK.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4. QUOTES AROUND WORK.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. IDENTIFY AS SCULPTURE.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. DOMINANT IMPRESSION.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7. LOGICAL ORDER TO DETAILS.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8. THREE DETAILS MINIMUM.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9. EACH DETAIL RELATED TO DOMINANT IMPRESSION.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10. REPETITION OF KEY IDEA.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11. MENTION ARTIST.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>12. CLINCHER SENTENCE.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DESCRIPTION OF STEPS IN THE METHOD

STEP ONE: A PRE-WRITING SAMPLE

The students were given one class period in which to write a paragraph describing themselves or someone in the room. They were told the paragraph should have a dominant impression, details, and a clincher sentence.

After they wrote, I tallied the appearance of objectives to be used in the study. Students did not know about the objectives.

STEP TWO: FIRST SHOWING OF SLIDE

The next class period, students were shown the slide of the sculpture, "The Family Group" projected on a screen for the class period. Students talked about what they saw. Some reactions were:

- laughter -
"I don't like it."
"It is beautiful."
"You need a lot of skill to work with stone."
"Sculpture is better than writing because you don't have to say everything. You leave it to a person to make up their own mind."
"I think he is saying something about togetherness."

They were then asked to write a description of what they saw at home. Example follows:

This paragraph was written after the students had seen the slide of Henry Moore's "The Family Group" for one hour. They were not given specific directions on structuring their writing.

In my opinion, the artist is trying to show togetherness among a man, his wife and child. He is also defining the woman by pointing out her physical features as in her breast. And he is showing the modesty where as the man sits completely nude and wife has on a skirt.

As for the time I think it is sometime between the seventeenth century and the eighth century. In saving this I am comparing their bodies with any two average American of today. An average woman of today is most likely to be smaller than the one on the screen and she would undoubtedly be wearing something to cover her breast. And as far as the man is concerned I'm just not satisfied with the size of his head in relationship to his body.
Students asked questions about details about the heads, shoulders, waistlines, why a skirt, why a hand on the shoulder. As I see it, these questions are inquiries into structure. Students wrote a description of the sculpture for one class period.

The writing in step two suggested the validity of the assertion that works of art would be a potent classroom stimulus. Students projected their feelings into the sculpture and became involved in it.

This step elicited strong emotions. The questions students asked demonstrated ability to perceive the theme of togetherness and unity built into the sculpture. Students also attached meaning to the details. Once they saw the small head, they inferred a de-emphasis on intellect.

**STEP THREE: WORK ON THE FIRST SENTENCE**

I drew on the chalk board a model for paragraphs.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DOMINANT IMPRESSION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Detail</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Detail</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Detail</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CLINCHER SENTENCE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The dominant impression of Henry Moore's sculpture &quot;The Family Group&quot; is togetherness.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Then I told the class there were five technical features in that sentence that should be used to start out a description. They are:

1. Name the artist
2. Name the thing you are describing such as the "The Family Group"
3. Use punctuation around the title such as quotation marks.
4. State your ideal of the overall impression or dominant impression of the art you see (such as togetherness)
5. Refer to that which is described specifically (such as a sculpture).
In class, students practiced on the first sentence. One example follows:

My impression of Henry Moore's sculpture "The Family Group" shows togetherness among a man, his wife and child. He makes it kind of clear as the man and his wife legs look as if they were glued together. There are clues which show the mother and her child's head almost looking in the future. The film shows a sense of responsibility as he holds the legs of the baby as support. I also believe they are hard working people because of their broad backs and shoulders. And I think he made this in the period of A.D. because he is wearing a skirt.

STEP FOUR: ORGANIZATION OF DETAILS INTO VISUAL ORDER

Though students had been increasing the use of objectives, there was up to this point no conscious effort to organize details from top to bottom or some order suitable to the sculpture. Student paragraphs were held together by the fact that they were writing about the sculpture. To show them that they should organize the presentation of details, I asked them to describe the sculpture to me and that I would draw what they described. They said "three people" so I represented three people. Someone said a bench, so I drew a bench. I purposely made it difficult to see what they were describing.

The result: a disarrayed figure as seen on the next page.

Students finally made the connection between the disarray on the board and the need to organize details in the paper.

I then stated it:

A reader of your paper might have difficulty in following your word description unless you give him a mind picture. To do so, plan ahead on how you are going to describe details. What are some plans we might use? Top to bottom, left to right?

Students then described the sculpture beginning with an overall description of three figures on a bench.

The results were the organized drawing following the disarrayed drawing.

Next, using a model of a paragraph again, I stressed to students that they too are artists, saying!
DISARRAYED FIGURES DRAWN ON BOARD TO ILLUSTRATE LACK OF ORGANIZATION IN DETAILS
DRAWING TO ILLUSTRATE CLEAR AND ORGANIZED PRESENTATION OF DETAILS
"When you recreate your own experience of the statue, you have to select words to say what you feel, just as Henry Moore had to think about how he would communicate his ideas about the family in stone. Henry Moore is a craftsman, putting ideas into sculpture, just as you are craftsmen putting words together into sentences and paragraphs to reach the mind of someone else. There is a pattern or shape to the paragraph which can be used over and over no matter what the ideas you are thinking."

They wrote again.

'Henry Moore' 'The Family Group' 

Henry Moore's Sculpture 'The Family Group' reflects 'togetherness.'

The formation of shapely bodies on the figures is due to hard work. The man's arm on the shoulder of the woman. And the way in which the legs are tells us they are united family. The mother holding the child's upper portion says she is to shape the child's personality and the pose the father supporting the child denotes he has his share. The face of the child is looking straight into the future. The child is having the needed care of parents as it appears. It is of course a "happy and united family" and this represents "togetherness" on the whole.

STEP FIVE: RELATING SPECIFIC DETAILS TO THE DOMINANT IMPRESSION

The last step was to get the details more specific and related them to the dominant impression to unify the paragraph. See the next page for the model I placed on the board.

Students were shown that each sentence with a detail in it should be carefully related to the dominant impression for the reader.

Accurate description of details was pre-requisite to the interpretation of the meaning of the sculpture.

Results of Step Five -

By now all papers were showing specific details. Students also demonstrated ability to distinguish the artist who created the work from the work itself and include both in their paragraphs. When they achieved this distance from the sculpture, they were united with the artist because they cooperated with the artist in participating in his artifaceted vision. It was this process that I wanted them to abstract from their experience with the art. The process of constructing and shaping beautiful things. An example of a student paper follows:
PARAGRAPH MODEL USED TO DEMONSTRATE STEP FIVE FOR
RELATING ALL DETAILS TO THE DOMINANT IMPRESSION
OF THE PARAGRAPH
Paragraph Explaining Henry Moore's Sculpture "The Family Group"

The dominant impression of Henry Moore's sculpture "The Family Group" is family unity. There are three figures in this sculpture: man, woman and child sitting on a bench. The man and woman are supporting or holding the child. This means that a family is one unit together. Together they shall face the obstacles of life. The man and child are nude and the woman is wearing a skirt. This means that the sculptor Henry Moore didn't want to know them too protected from life and the outside, and also the woman is wearing skirt means to distinguish her as a woman. Henry Moore has them sitting instead of standing. Could this mean that they're done with a hard day's work and they're relaxing or maybe absorbed in a discussion of family business. The figures' heads are smaller than their proportionate bodies excepting the child's. This means less intelligence and more physically endowed to life's work. The figures' faces are not distinct. This means that Moore did not want to characterize certain individuals but man and people in general. The man and woman have broad shoulders of which the man's are broader. This means that they are strong, healthy people and accustomed to hard physical labour. Their bodies are smooth in appearance. This again means that the artist didn't want to be specific as to which people these figures would characterize. Their backs appear rounded sort of hovering over the baby. This means that their bodies are slanted to family unity and sort of protecting the child. The baby is looking ahead as if to the future. This means that maybe our future is bright or perhaps it is for the children. The woman is supporting the upper half of the baby. This means that Moore is depicting the woman and the teacher and will help to mold the child into an adult. The man is supporting the bottom half of the baby. Perhaps this shows that the man is the moral support of the family. The woman's skirt has parallel folds. This means the flow of lines throughout the sculpture or parallel to the future. The man's knees are pointed towards the woman. This means the man is dependent on the woman to a certain degree and again shows family unity. The woman's knees are pointed towards the man. This means that she is dependent on him as he is with her. Both figures' knees are pointed toward the child. This means they have love for the child and are willing to support the child and help develop the child in growth. The last three indicates very strongly family unity. They have bare feet. This means that when they are finished with life or dying that dust they will go back. In conclusion, the sculpture by Henry Moore in my opinion is indicative of what humans are, why and what our purpose is. I think it shows family unity in every instance.
Finally, students in class were surprised at the length of their own paragraphs. During the class discussion of organization, one woman described her amazement with herself at having written long involved paragraphs. Another student who had been absent spoke to this classmates and said, "how come you all are so smart?" He was impressed with their attention to the sculpture and the thoughtfulness of their comments on it.

The last step accomplished all I hoped it would. Students experienced the ways they might craft an idea into a work of art that would communicate to others. I think in addition to the visible gains in structure, there were indefinable gains for students in terms of their describing a unity in the world. They found that there was a relationship between the communication built into the work of art and thoughts, feelings, experiences from their own lives. I hope they found that they can understand art, and through art organization or relationships, and through relationships unity, and through unity belonging.

**MATHEMATICAL DESCRIPTION OF WRITING**

I. Descriptive Paragraphs - after block paragraph was shown.

- Average Words: 88
- Dominant Impression: 79%
- Clincher Sentence: 59%

II. Paragraphs written after initial showing of slide of "The Family Group."

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OBJECTIVES</th>
<th>% USED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>USE OF DOMINANT IMPRESSION</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MENTION ARTIST</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAME WORK AS SCULPTURE</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USE QUOTATIONS AROUND TITLE</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THREE DETAILS MINIMUM</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LOGICAL ORDER TO DETAILS</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REFER TO ARTIST</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RELATE DETAILS TO DOMINANT IMPRESSION</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CLINCHER SENTENCE</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

MEAN LENGTH OF PARAGRAPHS: 101 words
### Mathematical Description of Writing

**After Partial Visual and Objectives Instruction**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective</th>
<th>Usage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Name Artist</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Identify Work as Sculpture</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Name Work of Art</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Dominant Impression</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Logical Order to Details</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Quotation Marks Around Title</td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Repetition of Key Idea</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Minimum Three Details</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Clincher Sentence</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Mention Artist</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Related Details to Dominant Impression</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Mean Words Per Paper:** 91  
**Number of Students:** 17  
**Mean Use of 7.6 Objectives Per Student**

### Final Results of Instruction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Objective</th>
<th>Use</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Name Artist</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Dominant Impression</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Logical Order to Details</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Minimum Three Details</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Identify Work as Sculpture</td>
<td>93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Relate Ideas to Dominant Impression</td>
<td>93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Repetition of Key Idea</td>
<td>93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Clincher Sentence</td>
<td>93%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Name the Work of Art</td>
<td>87%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Mention Artist</td>
<td>87%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Use of Quotation Marks Around Title</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Mean Words Per Paper:** 294  
**Number of Students:** 15  
**Mean Use of 11 Objectives Per Student**
DISCUSSION OF RESULTS

The final student paragraphs showed a high degree of organization and were also of considerable length for a paragraph. Compared to the first paragraph on the Moore sculpture, there was an average increase of eight objectives per student. Students in the last step nearly tripled the word output over the first. Again, I suggest that knowledge of structure enabled the students to develop their ideas and expand their articulation of what they had perceived when looking at the sculpture. Student responses to the sculpture were not necessarily more profound in the last writing. They had grasped the essentials of it when they first looked at it. The difference was in their ability to infer the meaning of the art and then to write about it more clearly after instruction in form. Also, we must attribute improvement to discussion of artistic process, to visual lessons in the crafting of paragraphs, and to stated structural objectives.

While the nature of the study precluded true experimental research design, it was possible to make considerable headway with descriptive research. The conclusions may have predictive as well as descriptive value. Above all, remedial students demonstrated remarkable ability to improve the structure and content of their college writing when given careful instructions.

SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS

1. Final paragraphs were more clear than previously written.
2. Students wrote longer paragraphs with each step of the process, probably as the result of instruction.
3. Knowledge of structure enabled students to describe and find meaning in each detail of the sculpture. The exercise in structure appeared to improve student skill in concentration and observation.
4. Students used the instruction in organizing details to organize their paragraphs.
5. Students succeeded in relating each detail to the dominant impression providing unity to their writing.
6. Students understood the art.
7. Students could abstract and infer
8. Students gained ability to craft a work of art and used it in their writing.
9. Students perceived art as a re-creation of an idea by an artist.
10. Students failed to demonstrate that they were disadvantaged.
Conclusions

One factor did emerge from the investigation: that students considered disadvantaged did not lack the ability to perceive structure both as an abstraction and as the component of artistic craft. They proved to be creative and perceptive.

The use of structure resulted in accurate representations of written paragraphs and in specific details. Students showed that they had command of the information they saw after being informed on structure. In conclusion, the visual method of instruction combined with objectives had a positive effect on the use of structure in the writing by students and consequently resulted in finer writing by students.