Ethiopia's Education Sector Review and a subsequent symposium set up a framework and guidelines for incorporating, integrating and financing a nonformal component in a comprehensive educational system for Ethiopia. Most of the governmentally sponsored educational activities now classified as NFE are conducted by organizations other than the Ministry of Education. The extensive experience of missionary and other private organizations and the more recent experience of the agricultural development programs need to be analyzed for the guidance of the expanded NFE program. Examination of programs designed to promote development in rural areas has demonstrated the learning abilities and adaptability of illiterate persons and the usefulness of rural leaders. Linkages between formal and nonformal education are currently very limited and must be greatly strengthened to meet NFE objectives. The approaches and programs for literacy training must be thoroughly evaluated before additional resources are allocated to it. Operational research should be built into NFE planning and activities to provide data for decision-makers. The Sector Review was successful partly because it was comprehensive and realistic. (KM)
I
Introduction

The following observations, learnings and reflections on present and projected non-formal education activities in Ethiopia are based on participation by the authors in the comprehensive Sector Review of Education in Ethiopia which was actively undertaken between November 1971 and July 1972. Specific participation of the authors in the Sector Review involved: (1) the study, during a six-week period in March-April 1972, of approximately thirty-five governmental, parastatal and private organizations which conduct varying types of educational programs outside of the formal school system; (2) the preparation, at the request of the Director of the Sector Review, of several reports and memoranda on our research and observations; (3) serving as consultants to the Sector Review and attendance at the plenary and commission sections of the concluding conference of the Sector Review held in July 1972.

Since the observations, learnings and reflections are derived from the intensive involvement in the subject as described above, the authors are very cognizant of the complexity of the problems dealt with in the Sector Review and, with particular reference to the non-formal aspects of the comprehensive review of education in Ethiopia, are accordingly aware of the possibility of some error in the findings and interpretations. Nevertheless we hope that our efforts to compress our major observations and conclusions into a relatively few pages will serve a useful purpose to scholars and administrators interested in the unique effort of the Imperial Ethiopian Government, realistically and comprehensively, to deal with the non-formal education component of their total learning system.
The Sector Review

The Ministry of Education and Fine Arts on its part was contemplating a review of the entire education sector. In May, 1971 an agreement was signed between the Government and the International Development Association (IDA), an affiliate of the International Bank for Reconstruction and Development (IBRD). Under the agreement IDA provided financial assistance to carry out a comprehensive analysis of educational needs. In October 1971, the Education Sector Review was launched under the direction of Dr. Abebe Ambatchew, with the following responsibilities:

1. To analyse the education and training system of Ethiopia, and its capability for promoting economic, social and cultural development;
2. to suggest, wherever necessary, ways to improve and expand the education and training system in order that it might achieve aims relevant both to the society and the overall development of the country;
3. to suggest ways in which education could best be utilized to promote national integration;
4. to identify priority studies and investments in education and training.

Non-Formal Education in the Context of the Sector Review

The Sector Review was undertaken by fourteen task forces and five small working groups concerned with all aspects of education. The task forces and working groups were manned largely by Ethiopians with the help of relatively few ex-patriate personnel. Only one of the task forces, as initially set up, was specifically and exclusively concerned with "out-of-school education". This term, however, began to be used interchangeably with "non-formal education" shortly after the Sector Review got underway. Many, if not most of the task forces, began to deal with aspects of non-formal education in their deliberations. Accordingly, the thrust of the total review of education in fact
focused in many respects on non-formal education as will be shown in the ensuing comments.

The initial activity of the task forces - which began in the fall of 1971, focused largely on the assembly of data and evaluative material in the context of the frame of reference of the Sector Review. A stock-taking symposium was held in January, 1972 to consider the interim reports prepared by the task forces and working committees. The discussions at the January symposium were open-ended in scope and wide ranging in terms of the recommendations which were projected for more intensive study and consideration in later stages of the Review. Furthermore, the deliberations were unusually candid in tone and constructively imaginative in content. For example, the "rapporteur" of one of the Commissions, which considered the interim task force reports on Vocational-Technical Education, Teacher Education, Manpower and Education for Development, reported in his summary as follows:

"If I were to choose a single, striking idea which comes through all of the foregoing, it would be this: in a large body of knowledgeable people, not notable for its radicalism, indeed we have present usually the entirety of the so-called establishment figures in Ethiopian education - there has been a constant refrain to the discussions, and that is: If we take seriously the goal of equalizing educational opportunity in the foreseeable future, the resource constraints of the country are such that we can not possibly provide this equality of opportunity by extending the conventional schooling system in existence at present. We must instead restructure the system in the direction of non-formal, out-of-school education which is relevant to the social and economic needs of a largely rural/agricultural society. This has, on some few occasions, been accomplished in other countries, but never on any scale outside the context of violent upheaval. We are talking, therefore, of
a peaceful revolution, but, to borrow a phrase - no less a revolution for being peaceful”.

A partial list of 118 suggestions and recommendations on strategies, policies, possible projects and programs advanced implicitly or explicitly by members of the task forces and other participants was assembled by a member of the Director’s staff for further analysis and consideration in preparation for the July, 1972 conference which concluded the Review. A partial grouping of the several suggestions and recommendations with particular reference to non-formal education follows:

- Relative priorities between formal education and non-formal education be in favor of non-formal education.
- The following non-formal education schemes be considered:
  - Mass media including radio, TV, newspapers, pamphlets, books or mobile film teams and village libraries.
  - Adult literacy.
  - Agricultural extension.
  - Rural development centers or integrated development centers for young and old, health, hygiene, family planning, child care, agriculture, etc.
- Institutions other than the Ministry of Education should be used as delivery systems for education such as the church, the military, university students, and other organizations.
- A program for "minimum formation" be instituted.
- An interministerial task force be established to study rural development programs, to prepare a plan for rural development and to administer such a plan.
Cooperation between the Ministry of Education and development agencies be fostered at both the ministerial and field levels.

- Expenditures of government ministries for education be identified as well as expenditures by the Ministry of Education.

- A school structure other than the 6 + 2 + 4 + 4 be considered.

- Various levels of education should become terminal programs.

- On-going non-formal education projects in Ethiopia should be used as models for future programs.

- Consideration be given to the creation of a mechanism for coordinating the variety of non-formal education programs.

- The curriculum should become less academic and formal and be more oriented to agriculture and other development needs.

- Formal and non-formal programs be integrated.

- Public works *cum* education projects should be devised.

- New or expanding industries should be required by law to provide certain types of training programs for their employees.

- A new concept of the teacher be evolved in which the teacher would be a community development worker whose responsibilities would include teaching in adult literacy, health and agricultural extension, and other community development programs.

- Education and development activities should be considered together as a "package".

- Consideration should be given to utilizing local craftsmen as teachers.

In more general terms, the symposium resolved that:

1. The present educational system is not meeting the needs or aspirations of the vast majority of the people, nor the needs of the development programs of the nation.
2. Improvement in quality or expansion of the present system was not generally seen as a satisfactory course of action. It was generally accepted that drastic restructuring was called for.

3. "Non-formal" education should be looked to for solutions of some of the educational and development problems that the formal system has not been able to solve.

The January symposium was followed by a series of lectures sponsored by the Directorate of the Sector Review. At the first lecture on February 18, 1972 approximately a month after the symposium, a paper was presented by H.E. Ato Million Neqniq, Minister of State of the Ministry of Education. His lecture was highly supportive of the thinking expressed in the January symposium as indicated by the following excerpts from the lecture:

"The recent symposium conducted by the Education Sector Review brought into sharper focus two fundamental educational questions which critics of the present system have been raising with increasing insistence. Namely: is it relevant to the social and economic needs of a largely rural/agricultural society and does it provide reasonable equality of educational opportunity to all groups of society? Unfortunately, as the implications may seem, the short answer to both these questions appears to be no. We must recognize that up to now education has a) provided for a very restrictive group, b) prepared people for a narrow range of occupations, overwhelmingly white collar jobs, c) been very expensive, and d) not always been relevant . . ."

He went on to indicate that:

"With all these ideas on the table, a number of broad questions are emerging. Can the government resources - capital, recurrent and human - be organized more effectively and efficiently to prevent overlapping of activities and to produce the most affective results? How can we move
from the coordination of activities toward a fuller integration of government programs . . ." 

He ended his lecture with the statement that: 

"This leads inevitably to a restructuring of the present system with a much greater emphasis on non-formal education, with a simultaneous effort to make this restructured system more relevant to Ethiopia as it is, and will be in the foreseeable future".

Following these remarks, and after the draft papers prepared by the several task forces were reviewed by the international symposium held in January, the Director of the Sector Review issued, on March 7, 1972, a memorandum to all task force members which instructed them to take a number of "themes" into consideration, in the further analytical and creative work which they would be undertaking in preparation for the concluding conference to be held in July, 1972. More specifically, the Director requested the task forces to: 

(1) study critically the merit and implications of the themes; (2) make specific recommendations within the framework and formulate strategies/projects/proposals; 

(3) formulate alternative frameworks, projects or proposals where task forces find the suggested themes unacceptable.

The themes, with appropriate background and provocative material included in the Director's memorandum, covered the following major requirements:

- The need for an educational system "to ensure that education reaches the mass of the population, on whose shoulders development depends and flourishes."

- Objectives of education to: (a) contribute effectively in bringing about economic betterment of the individual and society; (b) help in the promotion of national integration; (c) bring about attitudinal changes essential to attune the society to development needs and orientations; (d) cultivate values that are cognizant of religious and cultural diversity, and to
enable the individual to participate in a world growing closer.

The need for restructuring the present educational system around a program of "minimum formation" to meet the needs and wants of a largely rural and agricultural society.

- Interpretation of formal and non-formal education to make "available to a much wider clientele, diverse types of educational programmes".
- Prominence to be given to agricultural education in consideration of the fact that 90% of the population is engaged in agriculture.
- Design of educational programs into units which will be valuable in themselves without primary consideration of their relation to higher units.
- Spread of educational opportunity to a wider "variety of localities, tribes, towns and socio-economic groups".
- Extension of Amharic as the "medium of instruction to the junior and secondary schools and possibly to the University".
- Restructure the educational system taking into account "the brutal fact that the financial resources available are relatively known and do not allow much latitude". The Director also indicated that consideration be given to the better coordination and integration of the educational programs of the different government agencies - Education, Agriculture, Interior, etc.
- Better use of the existing institutions - particularly the churches, mosques and other institutions as delivery systems.
- Decentralization of the educational system - financially and administratively to the different provinces of the Empire.

The reality framework articulated by the Minister of State (based on the thinking of the Sector Review and the Symposium) and the guidelines laid down by the Director of the Sector Review were very widely accepted in spirit and in
There were no serious arguments raised about the desirability or feasibility of incorporating, integrating, and financing a non-formal component in a comprehensive educational system for Ethiopia. Furthermore, there were no serious "hangups" over definitions of formal or non-formal education or of their relationship to the attainment of educational/development goals. The authors of this paper, too, found it comfortable and convenient to accept this framework. Accordingly, our observations which follow are focused on major generalizations which we derived from our experience as participants in the Sector Review. Subsequent chapters will deal more analytically with specific major topics which were developed or alluded to in the Sector Review, including the recommendations made at the conclusion of the Review in July, 1972 to the Government of Ethiopia.

II

Major Generalizations

A. The importance, role, and scope of non-formal education (NFE) has now been established through the Sector Reviews, as an integral part of the total educational program recommended for Ethiopia and appears to be solidly built into the thinking of educational and developmental leaders.

- References to NFE in the "Summary Report of the Education Sector Review - Education: Challenge to the Nation" are numerous and positive. (By actual count the term NFE appears on 18 pages of the 54 page Summary Report).

- Although there are numerous unresolved problems which will require much ingenuity and creative thinking for their solution, there appears to be no serious objection to the concept, the objectives to be realized through its use or philosophical or other "hangups" about the concept or its implementation.

- The Sector Review recommends substantial allotments of funds spent for education to the NFE component.
The recommended revision of the structure for elementary education to include "minimum" and "basic formation" and the references to "community practicums", "village development centers" which will involve the participation of children, youths and adults reflect the newly adopted terminology, content and framework within which NFE activities can be conducted.

The role of education generally and NFE particularly in economic development, nation building and national integration is widely - if not universally - accepted.

The term "non-formal education", although not used in the Third Five Year Plan will - we predict - be extensively referred to in the Fourth Five Year Plan.

The authors' survey of NFE activities indicated that most of the governmentally sponsored educational activities now classified as NFE are conducted by ministries (Agriculture, Health, etc.) or parastatal organizations (Ethiopian Airlines, Ethiopian Power and Light, etc.) other than the Ministry of Education. The NFE activities of the Ministry of Education are largely confined to literacy training and evening schools following the elementary school curriculum.

The experiences of these organizations, although varied in terms of objectives, methods of operation, costs, and other important variables, could supply important elements of guidance for the projected expansion of NFE activities in the Empire.

Although there is some evidence of effective inter-ministerial coordinating machinery focused on the integration of governmental programs at the field level, additional attention will need to be given to this problem if the best use of limited resources is to be achieved. The inter-ministerial collaboration involved in the creation of the proposed Awraja development program has doubtless provided useful experience in dealing with the new problems of planning, organization, funding and staffing which are implicit in the implementation of the recommendations of the Sector Review for NFE.
New demands will be placed on the Ministry of Education to provide leadership—collaboratively with other governmental organizations—in creating effective supplementary training programs for teachers and field officers of other ministries who will be expected to provide instructional services to "community practicums", village development centers and other projected NFE activities.

C. The extensive experience of missionary and other private organizations (which have been permitted wide freedom to experiment with various approaches to NFE), and the more recent experience of the agricultural development programs, which rely on voluntary participation as the critical component of the educational strategy and method, needs to be analyzed and documented for guidance of the expanded NFE program—particularly in rural areas.

The experience of these organizations—although uneven in quality and results, is particularly relevant in providing guidance with reference to:

1) methods of motivating adults and youths to engage in educational/developmental activities;
2) use of volunteer teachers and local leaders;
3) involvement of development officers as "teachers" in educational activities, and
4) the production and use of teaching materials. Their experiences are particularly relevant for the projected "community practicums" and village development center.

The leaders of these organizations could usefully serve in advisory capacities to the Ministry of Education or Inter-Ministerial Committees created to establish policy and operational guidelines for the expanded program of NFE activities.

D. Our examination of the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO), Chilalo Agricultural Development Unit (CADU), Wolamo Agricultural Development Unit (WADU), various programs for women, the Ethiopia Nutrition Institute, and other programs...
significant generalizations, as follows:

- That illiterate persons can learn and adopt innovative practices, if the ideas and skills to be learned are closely related to the problems, welfare or survival, and if they achieve better production or some other concrete benefit as a result of adopting the improved practices. Inasmuch as most NFE programs in Ethiopia for some time to come will need to be fostered in a context of illiteracy, the successful experiences of agricultural programs, women's programs, etc., conducted chiefly with illiterates, is of critical importance in supporting the projected programs.

- That some of the theories regarding restrictions imposed on acceptance of innovations by rural people in terms of individual "traditionalism" or "modernism" needs to be questioned. The constraints to rural development formulated by Galjart* in terms of "ignorance, inability and unwillingness" appear to be more relevant to the rural development planner.

- Rural leaders - literate and illiterate - help bridge the gap between their neighbors and "change agents" by serving as demonstrators, model farmers, credit committee members and in other ways. The successful use of rural leaders demonstrated in the agricultural programs can be applied to other programs projected for the village development centers which involve rural public works, health and other programs.

- The relative simplicity of the recently established mini-agricultural and other development programs can be promoted within the limits noted above. As the programs reach second and succeeding higher levels of complexity (adoption of new and improved crops, irrigation, marketing, cooperatives,

etc.), it is predicted that illiteracy will become an increasingly burdensome handicap. These new and higher demands on the individuals and groups participating in these programs may be expected to serve as additional motivations for these persons to become literate. Furthermore, as development proceeds, presently unemployed or underemployed literates may be absorbed in marketing, servicing and other operations or combinations of both.

The newer developments, chiefly focused on agriculture and the rural sector, furnish the leading edge of motivation and necessitate the development of effective non-formal educational methods to continue and expand the momentum which is evident in Ethiopia.

E. The investigation by the authors of NFE programs serving the modern sector indicates that the need for trained technicians and other levels of manpower at the present or currently projected level of expansion, and particularly for staffing parastatal organizations (Ethiopian Airlines, Ethiopian Power and Light, etc.) appears to be met by the vestibule and in-service training programs of these organizations and by the United Nations Development Program (UNDP) supported training programs for private industry.

The trainees for most of these programs are school leavers 'tapped off' from the formal school system at varying levels below the 12th grade. Unlike the NFE programs projected for the rural masses, most of the programs in the modern sector require literacy, numeracy and some general academic training.

The programs are generally quite expensive for the limited number of graduates.

The curricula, instructional materials and methods are geared to universal technology and not subject to local variations as are anticipated in the projected programs for the rural masses.
Expatriate personnel are used extensively - but in diminishing numbers - in these programs. More external financial assistance from more varied sources are also used in support of these programs.

Many of these training programs, although classified as NFE, are formally structured, taught and evaluated. Accordingly the techniques used in training for jobs in the modern sector are not generally applicable to projected mass programs in either the rural or urban sectors. Nevertheless, certain features of these programs - such as clarity of objectives, curricula, and instructional methods - should be examined particularly for some projected programs such as public works, machine maintenance shops, and related activities.

Greatly expanded educational/developmental programs proposed for the rural masses, however, will require the training of very large numbers of para-engineering, para-medical, para-agricultural and "para-teachers" (for literacy and development programs), and other technicians to guide and administer the rural public works, community health centers, "mini-midi- and maxi-" agricultural programs, all of which are projected within the framework of non-formal education. Special types of training institutes will need to be established by the technical ministries for this purpose with much greater emphasis on technical content than the Community Development Training Center has incorporated in its curriculum. Emphasis will need to be placed on the teaching functions of these technicians to participate in community practicums, village development centers, and similar organizations. In all likelihood, the curricula will have to be built around a few elementary skills, which are to be taught to the rural people with relatively frequent upgrading of the skills of the teachers as villagers adopt more innovations. Also, considerable emphasis will
need to be given to effective methods of teaching/persuasion of illiterate rural people for participation in these projected programs. Furthermore, this greatly expanded program can only go forward with the production of massive amounts of "teacher-proof" materials, which initially may consume much of the increased budget allocated for NFE.

F. It appears to the authors that the linkages between formal and NFE are currently very limited but will need to be greatly strengthened to meet the objectives enunciated by the Sector Review.

- The formal school system now produces personnel who are tapped off at varying levels for other training programs and for high level technical and professional personnel including teachers, doctors, engineers and other high level personnel.

- The projected emphasis on NFE and programs for the rural and urban masses, however, will require:
  - Comprehensive planning and a different allocation of resources for a total education program.
  - Better methods of integrating and administering the programs of the several ministries and other organizations involved in NFE activities. The ad hoc inter-ministerial committee which developed the Awraja program may serve as a pattern for other aspects of the expanded NFE program.
  - Consideration of ways in which educational materials and mass media can be used somewhat interchangeably for all programs.
  - Clarification of the role of central ministries - Education, Agriculture, Health, etc. - in the production of policies, educational materials, guidelines, etc., for decentralized administration by awraja and woreda employees.
  - The planning and administration of more varied pre-service and
in-service training programs for the needed technicians for agriculture, public works and other development programs, and less structured training programs for community leaders.

- The creation of new and the better use of the results of CADU, WADU, and other present and projected experimental/demonstration areas.

G. The varied approaches to and programs of literacy training need a thorough evaluation before additional resources are allocated to this critically important sector.

- The relative effectiveness of the varied methods or materials which are being used under the varied conditions that exist in Ethiopia is not now sufficiently analyzed.

- The relationships between the various literacy programs and other development efforts need to be tested.

H. Operational research needs to be built into the planning and coordinating machinery and the individual NFE activities for the expanded program in order to provide data for the decision makers responsible for policies and operations.

Key topics for such needed research are:

- Cost effectiveness of the various programs - particularly those where two or more organizations are involved in the same or similar programs, e.g., literacy.

- Documentation, interpretation, analysis and dissemination of the findings of various experimental/demonstration programs (CADU, WADU, etc.), and private organizations for use in the expanded programs on such topics as (1) methods of motivation; (2) use of local leaders; (3) training methods and materials used in the introduction of new methodologies; (4) evaluation techniques; (5) costs.
New (presently untapped) and increased use of present sources of financial support for expanded NFE programs particularly in development areas where the Government of Ethiopia and outside organizations are investing substantial resources to enhance development programs.

Assemble, analyze and codify for ready reference, the relevant documents on the experience of the developing countries with reference to NFE programs in rural and urban areas on topics such as agricultural extension and development, trades training, public works, leadership training, literacy, local government, community development centers and related subjects. Upon completion, or near completion, of such an inventory a task force made up of key officials responsible for policy and operational aspects of the expanded program should visit the countries with the most successful programs in this field.

1. **The Sector Review approach and method of analyzing and projecting a more comprehensive and integrated educational policy and program — including the NFE component, was impressively successful, in part because:**

- The review was conducted in a context of realism and candor with a minimum of defensiveness of the present educational system.
- The main burden of the leadership and work of the review was assumed by Ethiopians with a minimum of expatriate involvement.
- The review was sufficiently comprehensive in scope to take account of the most important and relevant factors having a bearing on an expanded program designed to reach the masses.
- The relatively high quality of the task force reports which arrayed data and judgment having a bearing on the critical problems relevant to the review.
- The active involvement of the Minister of Education, the principal personnel of the Ministry, the University and other relevant personnel. Because of the scope of the review and the intermix of educational and development...
considerations, the review could be slightly faulted on the basis that not enough persons with practical experience in development/educational projects participated in the Sector Review.

J. The country-wide approach to the study of non-formal education tested by the authors proved to be highly valuable to them - and hopefully to their colleagues in the Michigan State University and other research groups - for a variety of reasons. The fact that the research was undertaken in the context of the Sector Review, however, added immeasurably to the experience, which would be difficult to duplicate. Nevertheless, the opportunity to review a representative sample of major NFE activities in a single country provided insights of a different order than research on specific subjects, such as agricultural extension, vocational training, economics of NFE or any other single subject. Additional country studies which would provide a basis for comparisons plus depth studies of other aspects of NFE such as categories, alternative strategies, etc., should round out the total research effort on this complex subject. More specifically, the Ethiopian country study provided information and insight on:

- The similarities (common denominators) and dissimilarities of different approaches to and types of NFE under governmental, parastatal and private auspices.
- The role and potential contribution of NFE in a comprehensive program of education designed to serve a variety of purposes.
- Some of the characteristics of successful NFE activities.
- The potential uses of the varied approaches currently underway to guide and strengthen massive expansions of NFE.
- The present and potential interrelationship of formal and NFE to serve various clientele and to identify cross-over points between the two "systems" under a comprehensive national educational policy.
The problems of planning, organizing, coordinating, staffing and funding an integrated national educational program.

The interrelationships between the uses of education to aid in the achievement of development goals and education for personal growth. (The two uses or ends of education are, in the view of the authors, inter-supportive).

The need for much more operational research and evaluation on such problems as motivation, preparation of teachers to participate in development programs involving youths and adults (practicums, community development centers, and other such organizations), and for development officers (agriculture, health, and others) to function as teachers in the same programs.

There are myriads of unsolved problems in the implementation of the spirit and specific recommendations of the Sector Review with reference to the incorporation of the NFE component in a comprehensive national program of education. Although the recommendations are still under consideration by the Imperial Government of Ethiopia, the country has made a bold start from which it will probably never retreat. The full implementation of the recommendations can only be accomplished in the context of a decade or two, but a first major breakthrough has been accomplished.

R. O. Niehoff
and
Bernard Wilder

---

ERIC Clearinghouse
MAY 23 1973
on Adult Education