The main concern of this paper is to determine the accuracy and representativeness of anthropology material from: Anthropology Curriculum Project (ACP); Education Development Center's Man A Course of Study (MACOS); Materials and Activities for Teachers and Children (MATCH); University of Minnesota's Project Social Studies; Anthropology Curriculum Study Project (ACSP); and High School Geography Project (HSGP). The materials analyzed in this study were submitted to a panel of professional anthropologists made up of five members of the Department of Anthropology at the University of Colorado, with different specialties—cultural, physical, archeology, and linguistics. A questionnaire was specially designed for the study and was divided into three parts—printed material, audiovisual material, and summary statements on specific and general items in the material. The project materials were all rated accurate and representative, though every project had some minor discrepancies or specific items to which the anthropologists took exception. (Author/JLB)
THE REVIEW OF AND REACTION TO
SELECTED ANTHROPOLOGY PROJECTS
BY PROFESSIONAL ANTHROPOLOGISTS

by

Thomas L. Dynneson
Coe College
Cedar Rapids, Iowa

and

Bob L. Taylor
University of Colorado
Boulder, Colorado

FILMED FROM BEST AVAILABLE COPY
INTRODUCTION

In the past, anthropology has not been part of the social studies curriculum. However, in recent years, curriculum writers have begun to consider the potential of anthropology for the public schools' social studies curriculum. During the 1960's, a "new social studies" movement, financed mainly by the federal government and some private non-profit organizations, made possible the establishment of centers where curriculum projects developed new materials for the public schools. Great quantities of new social studies materials have become available.

A number of these projects offered entire courses or units emphasizing anthropology. As a result of this work, public school personnel now have materials available for the teaching of anthropology. Teachers and curriculum supervisors are faced with the decision of whether or not to incorporate anthropology into their curricula.

Anthropology material was taken from the following projects:

Anthropology Curriculum Project, Education Development Center (Man: A Course of Study), Materials and Activities for Teachers and Children (A House of Ancient Greece), The University of Minnesota Project Social Studies (Hopi Indian Family), Anthropology Curriculum Study Project, High School Geography Project (The Geography of Culture Change). The main concern of this paper was to determine the accuracy and representativeness of these materials. This determination was made by professional anthropologists. Besides the determination of accuracy and representativeness, the general reaction of the anthropologists to the material was also considered important.

The design of the study involved the selection of mate-
rials which would be analyzed, and the development of a questionnaire that would aid in determining representativeness and accuracy. Directories and indexes were used, as well as the resources listed and described by Educational Resources Information Center Clearinghouse for Social Studies/Social Science Education (ERIC/ChESS). Most of the project materials selected for analysis were available from the curriculum library of the Social Science Education Consortium (SSEC).

The curriculum project materials analyzed in this study were submitted to a panel of anthropologists who were asked to rate the materials for accuracy and representativeness. Accuracy, with respect to the "correctness" of the material, was determined when the anthropologists looked for errors in the content of the material and rated the material according to their findings. Also, they were asked to rate the materials on the basis of their representativeness, considering the nature of the materials as they contained subject matter which was part of the content of anthropology.

The anthropology panel was made up of five faculty members from the Department of Anthropology at the University of Colorado. They included Dr. Alice Brucc, who represented the area of physical anthropology and whose specialities included evolution, population genetics, and variations in modern man; Dr. D. A. Breternitz, who represented the area of archaeology and has worked extensively among the Indians of the southwestern United States; Dr. Omer C. Stewart, who represented the area of cultural anthropology, and who specialized in American Indian ethnology, ethnography, ethnohistory, and Peyote religion; Dr. Alan Bell, who represented the area of linguistics and special-
ized in phonology, linguistic theory, and change and variation of language; and Dr. C. R. Hatfield, Jr., who represented the area of cultural anthropology and whose specialties included religion, Africa, and social change.

The procedure used in assigning or distributing project materials to panel members was to separate the materials, when possible, into the four areas of anthropology -- cultural, physical, archaeology, and linguistics. Once material was identified as belonging to an area of anthropology, it was assigned to the anthropologist who represented that area. However, in some cases all of the material from a unit or course was examined by a single anthropologist while in some other cases the project material was divided among several anthropologists. Each set of materials was examined and rated by a single anthropologist. No two anthropologists examined the same material although it was common to have more than one of them aid in the rating of a complete project.

The results of the examination of the materials were recorded on a questionnaire that was especially designed and produced for this study. In general, the questionnaire was meant to extract broad or general views on the materials. The questionnaire contained a rating system in which the anthropologist rated the types of materials contained within the projects according to the following categories: highly accurate, accurate, questionably accurate, not accurate; highly representative, representative, questionably representative, and not representative. The questionnaire was divided into three parts. The first part dealt with printed material, the second part dealt with audio-visual material, and the third part called for
summary statements on the specific and general items in the material.

EXAMINATION AND RATINGS OF SELECTED ANTHROPOLOGY CURRICULUM PROJECTS

The project materials were all rated accurate and representative. The main differences between projects were between project materials that were rated accurate and representative and those that were rated highly accurate and highly representative. There were a few cases where some parts of some projects were rated questionably accurate, but this only occurred in a few isolated cases. Therefore, the report concentrates on the general summary remarks made by the anthropologists as they pertain to entire projects. It should also be noted that every project in this report had some minor discrepancies or specific items to which the anthropologists took exception.

Anthropology Curriculum Project

The Anthropology Curriculum Project has produced a large variety of material for grades K through 7 with supplementary unit materials for the junior and senior high schools. The grade-level courses examined by the anthropologists in this study included the following sets of materials:

The Concept of Culture - 1968 experimental material
The Development of Man and His Culture: New World Prehistory - 1966 experimental material
The Development of Man and His Culture: Old World Prehistory - 1966 experimental material
Re e, Caste and Prejudice - November, 1970
Life Cycle - 1969 experimental material
Culture Change - 1969 experimental material

Language - 1968 experimental material

These materials included subject matter from all the areas of anthropology, and anthropologists with academic specialties which corresponded to the content areas were used in the examination of the materials.

The Concept of Culture. This course included materials used for both the first and fourth grades. The general materials were titled under the name The Concept of Culture and included the following publications:

Outline of Basic Concepts in Anthropology

Concept of Culture: An Introductory Unit

Concept of Culture - Teacher's Guide

The Arunta and Kazak Revised Bibliography

Teacher's Background Materials: The Arunta, The Kazak, The American Picture Books

Arunta - picture book

Kazak - picture book

Concept of Culture - pupil text (grade four)

Concept of Culture - pupil study guide (grade four)

In his summary comments on the project, the anthropologist noted that the project was weakened because of its attempt to cover two different types of objectives. The project material attempted to make a comparative study of three different cultural groups and at the same time instill within the student some of the basic theories and methodologies of the discipline of anthropology. The emphasis on vocabulary tends to make the course materials dull and difficult for students in the first or the fourth grades. Much of the vocabulary is overly complex. Com-
paring the Arunta and Kazak with American culture also tends to add to the difficulty or complexity of the course materials.¹

¹Comments and Ratings by Omer Stewart, March, 1972.

The Development of Man and His Culture: New World Prehistory. The materials available for grade two are listed under the general title The Development of Man and His Culture: New World Prehistory. The materials for this course included the following:

- The Development of Man and His Culture: New World Prehistory - Teacher's Background Material
- The Development of Man and His Culture: New World Prehistory - Teacher's Guide
- The Development of Man and His Culture: New World Prehistory - Pupil Text

In his summary comments, the anthropologist indicated that for a course in "new world prehistory" there was entirely too much emphasis on "old world prehistory." The general amount of material was too extensive for students in the early primary grades. The materials also stressed the history of archaeology to a greater extent than was necessary at the second grade level. The content dealing with "new world prehistory" was considered too broad, and the rater felt that the student could learn about "new world prehistory" without having to cope with the entire summary of the prehistory of the new world. It was also stated that an extraordinary amount of emphasis was given to some very technical terms or vocabulary which were considered unnecessary at such an early age. The vocabulary tended to make the material more complicated than was necessary. It was also stated that the course could have been simplified by excluding the material on the modern Hopi.
which was unnecessary in a prehistory course. Generally, it was noted that this course attempted too much for both the student and the teacher.²

²Ibid.

The Development of Man and His Culture: Old World Prehistory. The fifth grade material was available under the title The Development of Man and His Culture: Old World Prehistory.

The material examined from this course included:

- The Development of Man and His Culture: Old World Prehistory - Teacher's Guide
- The Development of Man and His Culture: Old World Prehistory - Pupil Study Guide
- The Development of Man and His Culture: Old World Prehistory - Pupil Text
- The Development of Man and His Culture: Old World Prehistory - Test Materials

In his summary comments, the anthropologist indicated that he believed that the material attempted too much for a supplemental program for the fifth grade. The course material was meant to present a study on "old world prehistory." However, the actual course materials included the following subjects: approximately twenty-eight pages were on the topic of "old world prehistory," approximately twenty pages were on the subject of archaeology, approximately seventeen pages were on the subject of geology, and approximately ten pages dealt with human paleontology. The student and teacher materials contained what were considered college level charts, vocabulary, bibliography, and outlines. The word lists were considered especially long and
dull. The anthropologist stated that too much was attempted by the materials. The methods and theories contained within the materials were far too complicated considering the grade level and the time allotted for the learning of all of the factual data.  

Race, Caste and Prejudice. The material for the supplemental course Race, Caste and Prejudice was examined and rated by a physical anthropologist. The materials consisted of a single paperbound publication entitled Race, Caste and Prejudice. These materials were not multi-media but consisted of a single publication used by both the student and teacher. In her summary comments regarding the material, the anthropologist stated that this material was especially difficult to rate because she was presently involved in writing on the same subject. Because of her involvement in and strong interest in this topic, she had definite ideas of how the subject should be handled. Her overall reaction to the material was stated in the following way:

On the whole, I would say that for second-hand physical anthropology it is pretty good. But I wonder (pp. 3-9) why they cite a biology text and a text in general anthropology by two authors neither of whom is a physical anthropologist. I also wonder why there is hardly a mention of the problem of how racial differentiation comes about in the first place.  

Life Cycle. The supplemental course Life Cycle was examined and rated by a physical anthropologist. The material examined was a mimeographed student booklet in paperback form entitled Life Cycle and a test form for the same material.
The only comment made by the anthropologist was in regard to a statement in the material which stated that there were few racial distinctions. The anthropologist disagreed with that statement and commented that she teaches a three semester hour course just on racial differences.  

Culture Change. The materials in this course were prepared for grade six and are entitled Culture Change. The materials were published in 1969, and the specific material examined and rated was the teacher's background material entitled Culture Change. The materials consisted of only one mimeographed paperback booklet. The booklet was examined by a cultural anthropologist. The booklet contained some sixty to seventy short essays which emphasized the change possible for the culture items with which they dealt. Also, the materials contained some case studies of tribal and modern groups. The material was considered adequate but open to the same types of criticism which were made by this rater on some of the other materials in this project.  

Language. The supplementary course entitled Language was available for the upper elementary and junior high schools. The materials examined from this course included:

- Language - Teacher's Background Material
- Language - Pupil Text
- Language - one LP record and record guide

The anthropologist who examined and rated these course materials
was a specialist in linguistics.

In his summary comments, the anthropologist noted that in general the orientation of these materials was far too narrow and too far removed from the daily experiences of the non-specialist in linguistics. The rater stated that there were several standard and watered down texts that were at least equal in quality to these printed materials but had the advantage of being more useful to the teacher as background material and as a guide. The anthropologist believed that the authors of these materials would, perhaps, have been better off by making more extensive use of writing systems, meanings and dialects, and social variations of language when introducing the discipline into the public schools. It was stated that the general quality of the publications was poor, and there were many typographical errors. A major problem with the materials involved the integration of the pupil's text with the teacher's background material. These booklets, he believed, were written by different authors because they contained different points of view. These two publications also contained differences in organization and emphasis. In general, the rater believed that the authors missed many opportunities to introduce linguistic concepts in a way that would make them more meaningful to both the student and teacher.

8 Comments and ratings by Alan Bell, February, 1972.

Education Development Center

Man: A Course of Study. The materials from Man: A Course of Study included a large number of booklets printed in 1968 which were designed for use in a one semester course. Although
the course was not divided into discrete units, the materials can be separated into four major topic areas. They include: the salmon, herring gull, baboon, and the Netsilik Eskimos. Films are an important part of this course, and approximately sixteen films are available in either 16mm or super 8mm. The course materials were examined by a single cultural anthropologist. The printed materials were divided into the four topic areas listed above, and they were examined and rated separately by the cultural anthropologist.

The printed materials on the salmon included the following booklets.

- Natural Selection
- Talks to Teachers
- Animal Adaptation
- Structure and Behavior
- Salmon - teacher materials
- Introductory Lessons and Salmon
- The Salmon - student material
- Going Upstream
- Life Cycle

In his summary comments, the anthropologist stated that the salmon material on adaptation was excellent. Most of the other material was very well done, although he noted that the introductory lessons were not of the same quality as the rest of the material. He stated that the introductory lessons were "not as well done."

9Comments and ratings by C. R. Hatfield, Jr., April, 1972.
The second set of materials included the printed booklets on the herring gull. The booklets examined and rated included:

**Herring Gulls**

**Information and Behavior**

**Herring Gull and Natural Selection**

**Innate and Learned Behavior**

In his summary comments, the anthropologist stated that these materials were well written and visually attractive. The one critical comment made by the rater concerned the rather sophisticated terminology used in some of the booklets. He gave the example of the word "regurgitation." In spite of this criticism, the materials were considered very well done.\(^\text{10}\)

\(^{10}\)Ibid.

The next topic area of the course concerned the materials on the baboon. These materials were examined by the same anthropologist and included the following booklets:

**How Baboons Grow Up**

**Baboon Troop Ranks**

**The Baboon Troop**

**Baboon Communication**

**What is a Baboon?**

**Baboon**

*Selections from Field Notes, 1959, March-August, Irven DeVore Anthropologist*

The anthropologist did not comment extensively on these booklets. He did note, however, that these materials were of excellent quality.\(^\text{11}\)

\(^{11}\)Ibid.
The fourth set of materials examined from this course centered around man in the form of the Netsilik Eskimos. The same cultural anthropologist rated these materials. The materials or booklets examined and rated included the following:

- The Arctic and Arctic Animals
- Antler and Fang
- On Firm Ice
- A Journey to the Arctic
- The Many Lives of Kiviok
- This World We Know
- Songs and Stories of Netsilik Eskimos
- Netsilik Eskimos at Inland Camp
- The Netsilik Eskimos
- Netsilik Eskimos on the Sea Ice
- Ethnographic Background

In his summary comments, the anthropologist noted the excellent quality of the material. He stated that the material was first rate in terms of quality and that the interest level of the materials was very high.\(^2\)

\(^{12}\text{Ibid.}\)

The films available for the course were examined by the same anthropologist who examined the printed materials from the course. Like the printed material, the films were divided into four topics: salmon, herring gull, baboon, and Netsilik Eskimos. The films which were examined according to these four areas, included the following:

"The Life Cycle of the Salmon"
"Fishing at the Stone Weir," Parts I and II
"Animals in Amboseli"
"The Baboon Troop"
"Younger Infants"
"Older Infants"
"Autumn River Camp," Parts I and II
"Winter Sea-Ice Camp," Parts I and II
"Life on the Tundra"
"Legend of the Raven"

The films examined in this study were all super 8mm and were made available through the Man: A Course of Study Center located at Temple Buell College, Denver, Colorado. The complete set of films available from the project was not examined because some films were damaged and the cartridges had to be sent away for repair. The remaining films from the project were examined and rated.

In his summary comments, the anthropologist noted that overall the films were superbly executed and very rich in ethno-graphic detail. The films could easily be used with success at all levels of education from grade school to the university. The only critical comment concerned the excessive concentration on the dominance role in the baboon films. It was stated that if this theme was that important, it should have been continued through the Eskimo films.13

13Ibid.

The same cultural anthropologist rated all of the material in this course which included the printed booklets and the films.
In his concluding remarks on this course, he stated that the materials in this course were rated the "highest" when compared to all of the material that he had examined.\textsuperscript{14}

Materials and Activities for Teachers and Children

\textit{A House of Ancient Greece}. "A House of Ancient Greece" is a four week unit that was produced by the Boston Children's Museum and published in 1963. This MATCH box was examined by an archaeologist. In his summary comments, the archaeologist noted that the materials provided by this MATCH box were of excellent quality, and he stated, "This material is very well done; the best project I have looked at."\textsuperscript{15}

\textsuperscript{14}Comments and ratings by D. A. Breternitz, March, 1972.

University of Minnesota Project Social Studies

\textit{Hopi Indian Family}. Project Social Studies, located at the University of Minnesota, has produced a series of units for use in a K-12 social studies program. Because of their publication timetable, only the "Hopi Indian Family" was available in 1971 to the anthropologist for examination. This unit was examined, and all of the materials within it were rated by one anthropologist—"in this case an archaeologist.

In his summary comments, the anthropologist noted that these materials were quite well done and that the kit materials would be useful for a variety of grade levels. He also stated, "If the teacher prepares himself with the resource guide and some supplemental readings, the kit would be very good at the first
Anthropology Curriculum Study Project

The one semester course that was produced under the auspices of the American Anthropological Association was published in 1971 under the title Patterns in Human History. This course is divided into four units which were packaged in multi-media boxes. The first unit, "Studying Societies," was examined by a cultural anthropologist. The second unit, "Origins of Humanness," was examined by a physical anthropologist. The third unit, "The Emergence of Complex Societies," and the fourth unit, "Modernization and Traditional Societies," were examined separately by different cultural anthropologists.

Studying Societies. The first unit, "Studying Societies," is the foundation unit of this course. In his summary comments, the anthropologist noted that in this unit some of the status-role information in the materials seemed overly complex and involved. He also stated that the materials could be improved by including more emphasis on the modernization of the bushmen and pygmies. The anthropologist concluded that the overall quality of the unit was excellent and imaginative.17

17 Comments and ratings by C. R. Hatfield, Jr., March, 1972.

Origins of Humanness. The second unit of the course is entitled "Origins of Humanness." This unit presents the student with a variety of topics including human biological and evolutionary history. The anthropologist who rated this unit
specialized in physical anthropology. In her summary comments, the anthropologist indicated that the overall quality of the unit was "good." However, there were a number of specific items that the rater took exception to.  

The Emergence of Complex Societies. The third unit of this course is entitled "The Emergence of Complex Societies," and it traces some of the institutions of man through various stages of development. This unit also contains a variety of multi-media materials which were examined by a cultural anthropologist. In his summary comments, the anthropologist noted that in general the quality of the materials was "very good." He especially liked the way in which the material traced the development of writing from 7000 B.C. through 1500 B.C. He predicted that the materials would be used very successfully by both teacher and student.

Modernization and Traditional Societies. The fourth and final unit of this course is entitled "Modernization and Traditional Societies." This unit builds upon the units presented earlier in the course and attempts to give the student some understanding of what effect modern technology has on the behavior of man. This unit was examined by a cultural anthropologist.

In his summary comments, the anthropologist noted that in general the materials were "very good." However, it was also felt that the teacher and student would have to be capable of removing
some of their own biases when working with the materials. Some of the materials (photos) required a rare sensitivity on the part of the teacher in order to aid the student in his interpretation of their meanings. The anthropologist also stated that some of the material relied too heavily on an archaeological interpretation of an ancient community. He also felt that some of the activities (mini-dramas) required a great deal of sensitivity, or they might amount to little more than fun or silliness.20

20Comments and ratings by C. R. Hatfield, Jr., March, 1972.

High School Geography Project

A one-year course called Geography in an Urban Age was produced by the High School Geography Project. This course contained six units prepared for the secondary level. The third unit of this course was considered anthropological because of its emphasis on culture. The materials examined were published in 1970.

The Geography of Culture Change. The third unit of the one-year geography course consists of a four-week unit entitled "The Geography of Culture Change." This unit might be used as part of a general anthropology course taught at the high school level. The material in this unit was examined and rated by a cultural anthropologist.

In his summary comments, the anthropologist noted that the overall aim of the project was good. However, he stated that some of the materials seemed too sophisticated for the high school level. He also indicated that a poor choice of terms was used in some of the materials, and the sequence that dealt with livestock
might not be relevant to urban students. The materials stressed "culture spread" with little regard to those who lead the movement. He also felt that the topic dealing with urbanism and conformity was confusing because of some unclear concepts regarding technical expansion and cultural differences. He stated that this was the least acceptable part of the unit. The anthropologist took issue with the idea of unification of world cultures. He recognized that some will argue that cultural uniformity is inevitable, however, he stressed that there are many other anthropologists who would argue that the concept of cultural uniformity was misleading.

21 Ibid.

SUGGESTIONS FOR IMPROVING PROJECT MATERIALS

The following are some suggestions that may aid authors and/or publishers when and if their materials are revised. These suggestions evolved from the examination of the project materials that were listed earlier in the paper.

Anthropology Curriculum Project

It is suggested that these materials may be made more attractive by:

1. Lessening the emphasis on vocabulary. Much of the vocabulary was considered technical and trite by the anthropologists.

2. Including more student directed (or led) activities. Individual, as well as group, activities would be helpful.

3. Making multi-media materials available for purchase
along with the printed material.

4. Editing the materials more carefully.

5. Adding color and pictures to the booklets.

6. Reducing the quantity of content. (The material attempts to cover too much — perhaps some of the content area should be broken into smaller and separate parts.)

7. Repeating concepts, but not using identical materials in the upper grades.

8. Integrating the teacher background materials with the pupil text. (This may be done by using the same author or using writing teams who are in constant contact when the material is written.)

9. Submitting the material to content specialists before it is marketed.

10. Basing the material on primary sources rather than on a general text. (Again, subject area specialists need to be consulted.)

11. Improving the durability of the material to extend the classroom use of the material.

Education Development Center - Man: A Course of Study

It is suggested that:

1. Some of the films need to be upgraded so that they are of the same quality as the Netsilik films.

2. The dominance theme should either be extended to the material on man or its emphasis should be lessened in the baboon films.

3. The cartridge films need to be improved because of maintenance and repair problems. (Can the cartridges be
improved? If not, the regular 16mm film should be used in place of the super 8mm cartridge.)

4. The project may also want to offer a hardbound set of materials since the durability of the softbound material may be unsatisfactory.

**Materials and Activities for Teachers and Children - "A House of Ancient Greece"**

It is suggested that:

1. The durability of kit items, especially cast items, needs to be improved.

2. The publishers provide printed materials of a less sophisticated level. (Braidwood, especially, needs more illustrations.)

3. The publishers recommend classroom tables as a practical necessity when using these materials.

**University of Minnesota Project Social Studies - Hopi Indian Family**

It is suggested that:

1. The publishers recommend classroom tables as a practical necessity when using these materials.

2. Packaging be improved. (The packaging system of the most recent unit - Ashanti Family of Ghana - is still not satisfactory. Kits should be easy to carry and store.)

3. The bibliography should distinguish between books for students and books that provide background material for teachers.

4. The materials should be examined by area specialists in order to avoid discrepancies caused by mixing cultural concepts or ceremonial activities.
Anthropology Curriculum Study Project - Patterns of Human History

It is suggested that:

1. The material should include more suggested activities along with the homework preparation, and teachers should be encouraged to modify the materials - perhaps into smaller units.

2. The unit "Origins of Humanness" should be examined for possible errors by a competent physical anthropologist.

3. Teachers should be cautioned that efficient classroom use of the materials will probably require tables.

4. The durability of the booklets may need to be improved. The publisher may want to offer the material in hardback as well as soft cover.

5. Adding photos and color would add greatly to material attractiveness.

6. The filmstrips may be too long and their use may be confusing or awkward. In some cases slides would be easier to use than filmstrips.

High School Geography Project - "The Geography of Culture Change"

It is suggested that:

1. Some aspects of the technical development of the filmstrips need to be reviewed.

2. When controversial assumptions or generalizations are included in the material the authors should attempt to base their arguments on solid data or inform the reader that the generalizations are of a controversial nature.

3. These booklets should also be offered in hardcover.

4. The materials may be made more attractive by adding color and pictures.