DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 071.711

AUTHOR Lehnus, Donald J.


INSTITUTION Illinois Univ., Urbana. Graduate School of Library Science.

PUB DATE Dec 72

NOTE 40p.; (17 References); Occasional Paper No. 105

DESCRIPTORS *Catalogs; Classification; Comparative Analysis; *Divided Catalogs; Indexes (Locators); *Information Retrieval; *Library Collections

IDENTIFIERS AACR; *Anglo-American Cataloging Rules

ABSTRACT The fact that so many notions and principles set forth by Panizzi are still in evidence today is proof of his great contribution to present-day cataloging. The comparisons made of the two sets of rules point out many contrasts and similarities. But even more significant is that, while reading the comparisons, one is constantly reminded of the importance of having good guidelines to follow in describing and recording the materials for a catalog. The catalog is, in reality, "the key to the library's collection," because it is the only efficient means of access to the materials. Any catalog compiled according to a code that does not permit or provide for appropriate entries under titles, or under names (or forms of names) of persons or corporate bodies under which some catalog user might reasonably look, is not fulfilling its role as "the key to the library's collection" as adequately as it should. Therefore, it can be said that the code of cataloging rules used in compiling the records which constitute a catalog strongly influences a library's effectiveness in assisting the user to determine the availability of desired materials and their location. (Author/NN)
INTRODUCTION

The major factors that differentiate a mere collection of books from a library are that the library is systematically organized for retrieval purposes, and its materials are described and recorded in a catalog. The catalog enables the library user to determine whether the library has certain materials and helps him to locate them in the library's collection. It is quite common for a library catalog to be referred to as the "key to the library collection" or as the "most important reference tool of any library." Three types of access--author, title and subject--are found in the catalog of a modern library, and desirably each type should be a separate catalog. Each of these has a particular function in helping the library user in his search for materials. The author catalog will be consulted when the name of an author or other contributor is known; the title catalog when the title is known, but no author or other contributor is available; and the subject catalog when the user desires material on a specific topic, but knows of no particular work.

Of the three catalogs, only the author and title catalogs are dealt with in this paper. The principle that sets these two catalogs apart is that the person who consults either of these has a specific work or book in mind. The subject catalog is for those users who need materials on a particular topic and do not have a list of specific publications on that topic.
The author and the title catalogs are built on the theory that each item recorded has either one or both of these properties. In reality this is not always the case, but they are compiled on this assumption; when both of these properties are absent, special provisions are made to compensate for their absence.

It is probably the cataloging that is at fault when the name looked for in the author catalog is not found, and the library does have material by that person (excluding the possibilities of missing or misfiled cards, spelling mistakes and other such errors on the part of either the user or the library). Adequate entries for authors and other persons connected with the recorded items, as well as all the necessary references from possible forms of the name that might be looked for, are basic necessities for making an author catalog as effective as possible. To make the title catalog as effective as possible, an entry should be made for each and every title, regardless of how generic the first word in the title might be.

The idea of authorship has been well established in cataloging literature and the importance of using an author (personal or corporate) as the main entry has been well established. The principle of "authorship" as it is known today can be traced back to Thomas Hyde, Librarian of the Bodleian Library at the University of Oxford in the late seventeenth century. Even though Sir Anthony Panizzi and Charles Coffin Jewett had used the same basic idea, it was never actually written down until Charles Ammi Cutter formally stated his definition for author in his Rules for a Printed Dictionary Catalogue:

Author, in the narrower sense, is the person who writes a book; in a wider sense it may be applied to him who is the cause of the book's existence by putting together the writings of several authors (usually called the editor, more properly to be called the collector). Bodies of men (societies, cities, legislative bodies, countries) are to be considered the authors of their memoirs, transactions, journals, debates, reports, &c.

Modern cataloging as we know it today has its origins in the middle of the nineteenth century when Antonio Genesio Mario Panizzi (later called Sir Anthony Panizzi) compiled the famous 91 rules to guide in the compilation of the printed catalogs of the British Museum. As Keeper of the Printed Books, he was in charge of the compilation of the printed catalogs, and wrote his famous 91 rules in 1839; they were published in the first (and only) volume of the printed catalog of 1841. These rules have served as the basis for all succeeding cataloging codes used in the United States and Great Britain. In chronological order these codes are:


Each successive code has brought certain refinements, clarifications, simplifications, and in general, many improvements. Many major changes have taken place, but at the same time there are several areas where little or no change has taken place, and some have even reverted to rules used earlier.

Catalogs are of utmost importance in assisting the user to determine which materials are available. The quality of the catalogs depends greatly on the guidelines which the cataloger follows in describing and recording the acquired materials. A good code of rules will guide the cataloger in making the necessary and appropriate records under names and titles under which the library patron will be most likely to look in his search for specific items. A standard cataloging code does much to assure consistency in the compilation of library catalogs. The purpose of the Anglo-American cataloging rules (AACR) was to produce a standard code that would advance international uniformity in catalog entries.

A period of 126 years elapsed between the appearance of Panizzi's 91 rules in 1841 and the publication of the Anglo-American cataloging rules in 1967. AACR contains many more rules and its scope is much broader than Panizzi's rules. But just how great have the changes been? And how do the basic guidelines set down by Panizzi for the compilation of a printed catalog for the British Museum differ from the new rules?

PANIZZI'S "91 RULES" COMPARED TO AACR

The following table groups the 91 rules into broad areas to give an idea of the general categories covered by the rules. Panizzi only numbered the rules and did not entitle them.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rule/s</th>
<th>Categories</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 - 8</td>
<td>Choice and form of personal name entries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Corporate entries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 - 17</td>
<td>Choice and form of personal name entries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18 - 31</td>
<td>Descriptive cataloging</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32 - 36</td>
<td>Anonymous works</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>Anonymous works and joint authorship</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38 - 40</td>
<td>Anonymous works</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41 - 43</td>
<td>Pseudonymous works</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE 1. Rules and Categories (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rule/s</th>
<th>Category</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>44 - 46</td>
<td>Collections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>Corporate entries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48 - 49</td>
<td>Collections</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>Translators and commentators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51 - 52</td>
<td>Translators and translations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>Commentators and commentaries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>54 - 69</td>
<td>References</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70 - 78</td>
<td>Organization and arrangement of multiple entries under the same author heading</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>79</td>
<td>Bible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80 - 83</td>
<td>Entries under broad form headings, and the necessary references</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84</td>
<td>Corporate entries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>85 - 91</td>
<td>Entries under broad form headings, and the necessary references</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The following comparisons have been made by citing each rule of Panizzi in numerical order and then contrasting it to the verbatim text of its modern equivalent from AACR. Following each comparison is a brief comment pointing out the difference or similarity. It must be kept in mind that Panizzi's rules covered not only guides to determine author and title entries, but also descriptive cataloging, and even some filing rules.

I. Titles to be written on slips, uniform in size.

The entries of works in the collection of George the Third presented by George the Fourth to the Nation to be distinguished by a crown.

COMMENT: The term "titles" as used here should be interpreted as meaning "entries." Throughout the rules it is necessary to distinguish between the title of a book, and title used as a synonym for what is currently known as a catalog entry. There is no AACR statement for standard sized cards, but the principle has been accepted and followed since the late nineteenth century. In 1878 the American Library Association set the standard size at 5 by 12.5cm., but now it is 7.5 by 12.5cm.

II. Titles to be arranged alphabetically, according to the English alphabet only (whatever be the order of the alphabet in which a foreign name might have to be entered in its original language) under the surname of the author, whenever it appears printed in the title, or in any other part of the book. If the name be supplied in MS. the work must nevertheless be considered anonymous or pseudonymous, as the case may be, and the MS. addition deemed merely a suggestion to which the librarian will attach such importance as he may think proper, on his own responsibility, in supplying the author's name between brackets, as hereafter directed.

In the alphabetical arrangement, initial prepositions, letters or articles to be taken in connection with the rest of the name.
1. Works of single authorship.
   A. Enter a work, a collection of works, or selections from works by one author under the person or corporate body that is the author, whether named in the work or not.

   COMMENT: This basic rule for authorship has remained unchanged throughout all modern cataloging codes.

   III. If more than one name occur in the title, by which it may appear that the work is the production of more than one person, the first to be taken as the leading name.

      B. Principal author not indicated.
         1. If no one is represented as principal author and if there are not more than three authors, enter under the one that is named first and make added entries under the others.

      COMMENT: The fundamental idea expressed by Panizzi is still adhered to, but AACR states that if there are four or more authors the entry is to be under title. AACR also allows for entry under anyone indicated as the principal author, whether or not he or she is named first.

IV. The works of sovereigns, or of princes of sovereign houses, to be entered under their Christian or first name, in their English form.

   49. Entry under given name or byname.
       A. General rules.
          1. Enter a person whose name does not include a surname and who is not primarily identified by a title of nobility under the part of the name by which he is primarily identified in reference sources, normally the first of the names that he uses.

   44. Language
       A. Names in the Roman alphabet. If a name is found in different language-forms, prefer the one that has become most firmly established in reference sources.

   3. Persons with names established in an English form.
      a. Prefer the English form of name for a person entered under given name or byname....

   COMMENT: Panizzi assumes that there is always an English form, and makes no provision for those cases where there is none. However, very few instances would arise where Panizzi's entries might vary from those cataloged under AACR.

V. Works of Jewish Rabbis, as well as works of Oriental writers in general, to be entered under their first name.

   COMMENT: In AACR there exists no special rule for Jewish Rabbis or Oriental writers, but rule 44-B deals with names not in the Roman alphabet and
discusses various choices as to what forms of names would be best for
the catalog entries.

VI. Works of friars, who, by the constitution of their
order, drop their surname, to be entered under the
Christian name; the name of the family, if ascertained,
to be added in brackets. The same to be done for per-
sons canonized as well as for those known under their
first name only, to which, for the sake of distinction,
they add that of their native place, or profession, or
rank. Patronymics, or denominations, derived from the
ancestors or names of other persons, to be used as sur-
names.

49. Entry under given name or byname.

C. Saints.
1. Add the word Saint after the name of a Christian saint
unless the person was an emperor, king or pope, in which
case he is identified only as such.

F. Other persons of religious vocation. Add either the
vernacular term of honor or address or the vernacular
title to the name of any other person of religious voca-
tion who is entered under given name or byname.

COMMENT: The end result is quite similar, but it is no longer suggested that
"the name of the family, if ascertained /is/ to be added in brackets."
A basic AACR principle is that whatever name a person chooses to be known
by is used as the entry in these cases, as is done for pseudonyms.

VII. The respondent or defender in a thesis to be
considered its author, except when it unequivocally ap-
pears to be the work of the Praeses.

12. Praeses or respondent. Enter a dissertation written for
defense in an academic disputation (according to the custom
prevailing in European universities prior to the 19th century)
under the praeses (the faculty moderator) unless the author-
ship of the respondent, defendant, etc. can be well authen-
ticated.

COMMENT: The same approach is taken now, i.e., to enter a thesis under its
author unless it is the work of a praeses.

VIII. When an author uses a Christian or first name
only (either real or assumed), such name to be taken as
a heading; and if more than one be used, the first to be
preferred for the principal entry. The surname or fa-
mily name, when known, to be added in brackets after the
first name.

40. Headings for persons--Basic rule. Enter a person under the
name by which he is commonly identified, whether it be his
real name, assumed name, nickname, title of nobility, or
other appellation.
COMMENT: The surname is not now added in brackets after the forename even if it is known. However, the form of the name chosen for the entry remains the same today as at the time of Panizzi.

IX. Any act, resolution, or other document purporting to be agreed upon, authorized, or issued by assemblies, boards, or corporate bodies, (with the exception of academies, universities, learned societies, and religious orders, respecting which special rules are to be followed,) to be entered in distinct alphabetical series, under the name of the country or place from which they derive their denomination, or, for want of such denomination, under the name of the place whence their acts are issued.

60. Headings for corporate bodies—Basic rule. Enter a corporate body directly under its name except when the rules that follow provide for entering it under a higher body of which it is a part, or under the name of the government of which it is an agency....

COMMENT: The notion of entering corporate bodies directly under their names, instead of under a geographical place name, is one of the greatest changes in the evolution of the cataloging codes. The British text of AACR eliminates entries under place, except for governments. Unfortunately the entry under place was not eliminated from the North American text. Panizzi did have the same idea for treating governments as corporate entries, cf. Panizzi's rule XLVII.

X. Names of persons that may have been altered by being used in various languages, to be entered under their vernacular form, if any instance occur of such persons having used it in any of their printed publications. With respect to places, the English form to be preferred.

44. Language.
A. Names in the Roman alphabet. If a name is found in different language-forms, prefer the one that has become most firmly established in reference sources. If no one form is firmly established in reference sources follow the instructions below.
1. Authors writing in Latin. Prefer the Latin form of name for authors who wrote in Latin and who flourished before, or principally before, 1400. For later writers prefer the vernacular form.
2. Authors writing in more than one language. If the name of an author is found in different language-forms because he has written in more than one language, prefer the form corresponding to the usage in the language of most of his major works.
3. Persons with names established in an English form.
a. Prefer the English form of name for a person entered under given name or byname....

72. Language.
A. Prefer the English form of a geographic name if there is one in general use.
COMMENT: As far as personal names are concerned, Panizzi did require consistency, but his preference was for the vernacular form instead of the English form. But this was a definite improvement over earlier practice of entering names in Latin. The preference for geographic names in English still persists today.

XI. Works of authors who change their name or add to it a second, after having begun to publish under the first, to be entered under the first name, noticing any alteration which may have subsequently taken place.

41. Choice among different names—General rule. Enter an author who is not commonly identified in his works by one particular name according to the following order of preference: (1) under the name by which he is generally identified in reference sources; (2) under the name by which he is most frequently identified in his works; (3) under the latest name he has used. If, however, a person changes his name, if he acquires or becomes identified by a title of nobility, or if the title by which he is identified is changed, enter him under the latest name or form of name or title unless there is reason to believe that an earlier one will persist as the one by which he will be later known.

COMMENT: The AACR preference is to use the name that the cataloguer feels will be most likely sought by the library user, while Panizzi consistently favored the name used first by the author.

XII. Foreign names, excepting French, preceded by a preposition, an article, or by both, to be entered under the letter immediately following. French names preceded by a preposition only, to follow the same rule; those preceded by an article, or by a preposition and an article, to be entered under the initial letter of the article. English surnames, of foreign origin, to be entered under their initial, even if originally belonging to a preposition. Foreign compound surnames to be entered under the initial of the first of them. In compound Dutch and English surnames the last name to be preferred, if no entry of a work by the same person occurs in the catalogue under the first name only.

46. Entry under surname.

B. Compound surnames.

1. Preferred or established form known. Enter a person with a compound surname under the element of his surname by which he prefers to be entered, or, if this is unknown, under the element by which he is listed in reference sources, preferably those in his own language.

E. Surnames with separately written prefixes.

1. Articles and prepositions. Enter a surname that includes a separately written prefix consisting of
an article, a preposition, or a combination of the two, under the element most commonly used as entry element in alphabetical listings in the person's language, as shown in the following list of languages and language groups.

English. Enter under the prefix.
French. If the prefix consists of an article or of a contraction of an article and a preposition, enter under the prefix. If it consists of a preposition followed by an article, enter under the part of the name following the preposition.

COMMENT: English and French surnames receive the same treatment in AACR, but variations would occur under some other foreign names, particularly Italian surnames where AACR generally enters them under the prefix.

XIII. German names, in which the letters ä, ö or ü occur, to be spelt with the diphthong ae, oe and ue respectively.

COMMENT: The purpose of this rule was more to standardize filing order than to copy the name as written, because sometimes the same name is found written in both forms, e.g., Miller and Mueller. In current American practice names are transcribed exactly as they are found. The Library of Congress filing rules indicate that the letters ä, ö, and ü are to be filed as though spelled ae, oe, and ue. The ALA filing rules leave the decision to the individual library.

XIV. Surnames of noblemen, though not expressed in the book, to be ascertained and written out as the heading of the entry. A person who has assumed titles not generally acknowledged, to have the words "calling himself" between brackets, to precede the assumed title.

46. Entry under surname.
G. Titles of nobility, honor, address, etc. added to the name.
1. Titles of nobility. Add the title of nobility in the vernacular to the name of a nobleman who is not entered under his title and make appropriate references.

47. Entry under title of nobility.
A. Enter under the proper name in the title of nobility (including a courtesy title) (1) an author who uses his title rather than his surname in his works and (2) any other person who is generally so listed in those reference sources that do not list noblemen either under title or all under surname. The entry word is followed by the personal names in direct order, except for forenames that are not used, and by the term of rank in the vernacular.

COMMENT: This follows a principle established by AACR wherein the choice between names is made by determining the author's preference, or by which name he is best known. Panizzi called for entry to be always under the surname of a nobleman.
XV. The same rule to be followed with respect to archbishops and bishops.

46. Entry under surname. Enter a person whose name contains a surname and who is not known to be primarily identified by some other name, under the surname followed by the other parts of his name in the form and fullness he commonly uses. If he uses in his works only his surname or his surname and a term of address, complete his name from reference sources.

49. Entry under given name or byname.
E. Bishops, cardinals, etc. Add the title, in English if possible, after the name of a bishop, archbishop, cardinal, metropolitan, or other such high ecclesiastical official who is entered under given name or byname.

COMMENT: Again AACR indicates that the form of the name chosen should be the one most commonly used to identify the author. To determine the most common form it is suggested that the cataloger consult reference sources or English-language translations of the author's works.

XVI. Christian names, included in parentheses, to follow the surname, and all to be written out in full, as far as they are known. In case of doubt on this or any other point, when the librarian is directed to supply any information in cataloguing, a note of interrogation to follow in such a position as to indicate clearly the point on which any doubt is entertained.

43. Fullness.
A. If the forms of name appearing in the works of an author vary in fullness, use the fullest form that has appeared in a prominent position (e.g., on a title page, half title, or cover), except that a rarely used initial of an unused or non-existent forename, or a forename used by the author only on his dissertation, is normally ignored.

COMMENT: Panizzi thought the fullest form should be used whenever it could be determined.

XVII. An author's rank in society, in cases in which he enjoyed any eminent honorary distinction, or office for life, not lower than that of knight, admiral, or general, to be stated in italics. Younger sons of dukes and marquesses, and all daughters of dukes, marquesses, and earls, when not enjoying a distinct title, to have the designation Lord or Lady prefixed to the Christian name. All other younger branches of the nobility to have the word Hon. prefixed. The words Right Hon., in the same situation, to distinguish privy councillors. Knights to be indicated merely by the appellation Sir prefixed to their first name. Titles of inferior rank, whether ecclesiastical, military, or civil, to be given only when necessary to make a distinction between authors having the same surname and Christian name.

Proper names commencing with Mr. or M' to be entered under Mac, with cross-references from the other forms.

Where a person is referred to in a title-page by a description insufficiently clear to render his or her identity obvious, the proper name of such person to be adopted as a heading, whether the work be historical or otherwise.
1. Works of single authorship.
   A. Enter a work, a collection of works, or selections from works by one author under the person or corporate body that is the author, whether named in the work or not.

46. Entry under surname.
   G. Titles of nobility, honor, address, etc. added to the name.

2. British titles of honor. Add before the forenames the terms of ho-or, Sir, Dame, Lord, or Lady /in italics/, used in conjunction with the names of British baronets and knights; dames of the Order of the British Empire and the Royal Victorian order; younger sons of dukes and marquesses; and the daughters of dukes, marquesses, and earls, respectively.

Add after the forenames the titles of tank, bart., or Lady, in the cases of a baronet and of the wife of a baronet or knight who is not entitled to the prefixed title of "Lady" by virtue of her father's rank, respectively.

53. Distinguishing terms.
   A. If distinguishing dates are not available and the name would otherwise be insufficiently identified or distinguished from other names used as headings in the catalog, add a term of address, the title of a position or office, the initials of an academic degree or denoting membership in an organization, etc., that appears with the name in author statements or in reference sources.

COMMENT: It is quite surprising that there is so much similarity between Panizzi and the AACR. The statement concerning the prefixes, M', Mc, and Mac, is a filing rules which is precisely followed today in library filing. Obviously the compilers of telephone directories have not read Panizzi's rules.

XVIII. The title of the book next to be written, and that expressed in as few words, and those only of the author, as may be necessary to exhibit to the reader all that the author meant to convey in the titular description of his work; the original orthography to be preserved. The number of the edition to be stated when appearing in the title.

In cataloguing sermons, the text always to be specified. The date at which preached to be inserted when it differs from that of publication.

133. The recording of the title.
   A. General rule. The title proper is transcribed exactly as to order, wording, spelling, accentuation, and other diacritical marks (if possible), but necessarily as to punctuation and capitalization.
B. Abridgment. Long titles are abridged if this can be done without loss of essential information. The first words of the title are always included.

A. An edition statement in a work is always included in its catalog entry, the impression or printing only in the case of items having particular bibliographical importance.

COMMENT: The current code dictates that the cataloger transcribe the title exactly as it appears on the title page, and may only abridge those titles which are inordinately long. An edition statement is always given in the catalog entry even if it does not appear on the title page. However, no edition statement is made if it is a first edition, unless it is bibliographically important or so stated on the title page.

203. Speeches, lectures, sermons, etc. The title (or term supplied when the title is not known) should include or be followed by the place and/or the occasion and the date of delivery.

XIX. Any striking imperfection in a book to be carefully noted; and any remarkable peculiarity, such as that of containing cancelled or duplicate leaves, &c. to be stated.

144. Notes—General rules.
B. Indispensable notes. Notes to provide the following types of information are generally indispensable:
(5) To explain that the work is incomplete or imperfect.

COMMENT: Other than to denote imperfections, it is only for rare books that AACR indicates that "any remarkable peculiarity" be stated on the catalog card.

XX. When the book is without a title-page, its contents to be concisely, but sufficiently, stated in the words of the head-title, preceded by the word begin. (beginning) in italics; if there be no head-title, in those of the colophon, preceded by the word end. (ending); and when the want of title is owing to an imperfection, the words taken from either head-title or colophon to be included between parentheses. If both head-title and colophon be wanting or insufficient, some idea of the work to be briefly given in English, between brackets, and the edition so accurately described as to be easily identified without fear of mistake.

132. Relationship of the title page to the description of a work.
B. Works without title pages. A work that is published without a title page, or without a title page applying to the whole work, is cataloged from some other part of the work if possible and that part specified as the source of the data. The part of the work supplying the
most complete information is used as the substitute, whether this be cover title, half title, caption title, colophon, running title, or other part.

133. The recording of the title.

F. Supplied titles. A title supplied according to the provisions of 132-B will be in the words of the work being cataloged if possible. If the title must be composed by the cataloger, the nature and scope of the contents of the work are described in English as briefly as intelligibility permits.

COMMENT: Panizzi did not provide for cataloging an imperfect copy by consulting either a perfect copy or a catalog entry of a perfect copy as does AACR. In general, however, Panizzi's rule is quite similar to the basic elements of rules 132 and 133 in AACR.

XXI. Whenever one or more separate works are mentioned in the title of any publication, as forming part of it, the same to be particularly noticed in cataloguing the principal publication; and, if not mentioned in the title-page, this information to be added to the title between brackets or parentheses, as the case may be.

149. Contents note.

A. Scope.

1. Either all of the contents or a part of them are specified in the catalog entry if it is necessary to bring out important parts of the work not mentioned in the title, or to give a fuller and more detailed description of the contents than the title supplies.

COMMENT: Panizzi had not developed the idea of a "contents note," but realized the importance of listing such information.

XXII. All works in Oriental characters or languages, except Hebrew, to be separately catalogued in a supplementary volume, according to special rules to be framed. The Bible and its parts, however, in whatever language or characters, to be entered in the general catalogue as hereafter directed.

150. "Title romanized" note. A note beginning "Title romanized" is included in the entry for each work the title of which is in non-Roman characters.

144. Notes--General rules.

B. Indispensable notes.

(8) To supply a romanized form of a title in non-Roman characters so that it can be interfiled with titles in the western European languages.

COMMENT: Even though many libraries do interfile cards of works in Oriental languages, it is not uncommon to find libraries with large collections
in Oriental languages which maintain separate catalogs for these collections.

XXIII. Works in more languages than one, accompanied by the original, to be entered in the original only, unless the title be accompanied by a translation or translations, in which case such translation also to be given. If no original text occurs, the first language used in the title to be preferred. In all cases the several languages used in the book to be indicated at the end of the title, in italics.

XXIV. Works with a title in a language different from that used in the body of the book to be entered according to the above rule, merely stating at the end of the title in italics in what language the work is written.

133. The recording of the title.
C. Titles in two or more languages.
1. If the title page is in two or more languages, the first title is recorded...If one of the succeeding titles is in English it also is transcribed. Succeeding titles in other languages may be included or omitted depending on such circumstances as the following. Omissions are not shown.
2. An additional title is included (a) if it is the original title, (b) if the work contains the text (complete, a substantial portion, or a summary) in the same language, or (c) is likely to be better known to the users of the catalog.

144. Notes--General rules.
C. Important but not indispensable notes.
(3) To show the nature and scope of the work and its literary form if the title is misleading; language of text, if the language of the title differs from that of the text, or if for any other reason the language of the text is not obvious.

COMMENT: The emphasis has shifted from the original language of the text to the first language used on the title page, but Panizzi did advocate transcribing the first language in the title if there occurred no original text. Both codes of rules indicate that the language of the text must be noted if it is not obvious from the title, and that it is necessary to note that the text is in other languages than those which might be indicated from the transcribed title.

XXV. The number of parts, volumes, fasciculi, or whatever may be the peculiar divisions of each author's work, to be next specified, in the words of the title.

XXVI. When nothing is said in the title respecting this point, if a work be divided into several portions, but the same pagination continue, or, when the pages are not numbered, if the same register continue, the work to be considered as divided into parts; if the progressive number of the pages or the register be interrupted, then each series of pages or letters of the register to be designated as a volume.

136. Statement of the number of volumes.
A. A statement of the number of volumes in a work is specified in its catalog entry, between the title and the
imprint, only if such a statement appearing on the work is at variance with the information shown in the collation of the work. The discrepancy is necessarily explained.

142. Collation.
   A. Extent of text in one volume.
         a. In describing the extent of a work that is complete in one volume, the terminology suggested by the work is followed as far as possible.
      2. Unpaged works. Works in one volume printed without pagination or foliation are described as 1 v. (unpaged) unless the total number of pages or leaves is easily ascertained.
   B. Extent of text in more than one volume.
      1. The number of bibliographical volumes or parts of a work in more than one volume is shown in the collation.
      2. If the work is paged continuously, the pagination is indicated, in parentheses, following the number of volumes, according to the rule for indicating the pagination of a work that is complete in one volume.

COMMENT: There is no basic difference, but the guides set down in AACR are much more explicit, and contain detailed examples.

138. Imprint.
   A. Order of elements. The imprint is recorded in the catalog entry in the conventional order of place, publisher, date.
   C. Printer's imprint as a substitute for publisher's imprint. If neither the place of publication nor the publisher is named in the work and the place of printing and the name of the printer are, the latter are used in the imprint.

139. Place of publication. Preliminary note. The place of publication is the place in which the offices of the publisher are located. It is commonly designated on the title pages of his publications, immediately preceding or following his name.

140. Publisher.
   A. General rule. The publisher statement appearing on a work is abridged as much as possible without loss of intelligibility or identification of the publisher.
141. Date.
   A. General rule. An imprint date on the title page is always recorded.

   F. Date uncertain. If there is no imprint date given in the book and the exact date cannot be ascertained, a date is supplied...

142. Collation.
   D. Size.
   1. The height of the work is given in centimeters, exact to within one centimeter, fractions of a centimeter being counted as a full centimeter.

   COMMENT: The content and order of the imprint, place, publisher and date have not changed at all, but now books are measured in centimeters and not according to the fold of the paper, i.e., folio, quarto, etc. However, in Chapter 8 of AACR, which covers the descriptive cataloging of incunabula, one finds the following rule:

183. Collation.
   C. Size is indicated both by the fold of the paper (i.e., fo, 4o, 8o, etc.) and by the height and width of the binding in centimeters, exact to the nearest millimeter.

   XXVIII. If an early printed book, and in Gothic or black letter, the circumstance to be mentioned at the end of the title, thus:—G. L. or B. L.

   COMMENT: No such rule exists in AACR.

   XXIX. If printed on vellum, satin, on large or fine paper, or if an editio princeps of a classical or very distinguished writer, who flourished before 1700, or if privately printed, or a fac-simile or reprint of an early edition; if only a small number of copies were struck off, or if there be any manuscript notes, these peculiarities to be stated.

   XXX. If the author of the manuscript notes be known, this information to be added between brackets. If the volume belonged to some very distinguished personage, the fact to be recorded in few words at the end of the entry, also between brackets.

144. Notes—General rules.
   C. Important but not indispensable notes.
   (2) ...to show peculiarities and irregularities; to describe format, limited editions (i.e. editions consisting of 500 copies or less) large paper copies, etc.

190. Facsimile editions.
   C. Notes. Any additional information that is needed is given in supplementary notes, arranged so that the information referring to the original work can be clearly distinguished from that referring to the facsimile edition.

   COMMENT: There is no basic difference, except for noting the existence of manuscript notes. The only provision in AACR for stating the existence of manuscript notes and other characteristics of a particular copy of a book is in the rules for incunabula where the following rule is found:
184. Notes.
E. Description of the copy in hand. The peculiarities of the copy in hand, including note of imperfections other than those given in the collation statement, are described in the last note or group of notes. The data include the following: rubrication, illumination, manuscript additions, binding (if contemporary or otherwise notable) and provenance.

XXXI. An editio princeps to be designated by the words *ED. PR.*, in italic capitals, at the end of the title. Manuscript notes to be indicated in italics at the end of the title, previous to the size of the volume, as follows:—*MS. works*. If the notes be remarkably few, or the reverse, the circumstance to be noticed by prefixing to the above the word *FEW* or *COPIOUS*. Works printed on *FOLIO* to be distinguished by these words, in small italic capitals, at the end of the title. The letters *L.P.* or *F.P.* in the same situation, to indicate copies on large or fine paper.

A. An edition statement in a work is always included in its catalog entry, the impression or printing only in the case of items having particular bibliographical importance.

COMMENT: Only incunabula and other rare books receive such detailed description in AACR, but the basic idea of noting the first editions and other peculiarities of a specific book is essentially the same.

XXXII. Works published under initials, to be entered under the last of them; and should the librarian be able to fill up the blanks left, or complete the words which such initials are intended to represent, this to be done in the body of the title, and all the supplied parts to be included between brackets.

The rules applicable to proper names to be extended to initials.

40. Headings for persons—Basic rule. If his name appears in his works in the form of initials only, however, the names for which the initials stand are used if known. If the names for which the initials stand are unknown, follow the provisions of 2 C.

2. Works of unknown or uncertain authorship, or by unnamed groups.
A. Enter under title a work that is of unknown or uncertain authorship, or that is by a group that lacks a name.

C. If the only clue to authorship is in the appearance on the title page of initials, some other alphabetical device, a characterizing word or phrase preceded by the indefinite article, or a phrase naming another work that the author wrote, make an added entry under this clue.
COMMENT: Panizzi preferred the main entry under initials, even if the name of the author was available. AACR has made every effort to have no main entries under initials, and only in rare instances are they allowed, e.g., corporate names or periodical titles that begin with single letters or initials for which no known meanings exist, or such a book title as A B C Manual of Photography used as a main entry.

XXXIII. When the author's name does not appear on the title or any other part of the work, the following rules to be observed. Anonymous publications relating to any act, or to the life of a person whose name occurs on the title of a work, to be catalogued under the name of such person. The same rule to be followed with respect to anonymous publications addressed (not merely dedicated) to any individual whose name occurs on the title.

1. Works of single authorship.
   A. Enter a work, a collection of works, or selections from works by one author under the person or corporate body that is the author, whether named in the work or not.
   B. If the publication attributes the authorship erroneously or fictitiously to someone who is not the author, enter it under the actual author and make an added entry under the attributed author if he is a real person.

2. Works of unknown or uncertain authorship, or by unnamed groups.
   A. Enter under title a work that is of unknown or uncertain authorship, or that is by a group that lacks a name.

COMMENT: The idea of taking the name of a person, albeit a biographee, from the title and using it as a main entry is quite contrary to anything done today. However, it must be recalled that there existed no subject catalog, therefore the idea was not without some merit. The rules for anonymous publications as they appeared were contrary to Panizzi's thinking. In a letter to Mr. Forshall dated Dec. 5, 1838, Panizzi wrote:

My opinion was that, for consistency's sake, the first word in the title (except an article or preposition) ought to be taken as the leading one under which to place anonymous publications.14

His idea was rejected by the Trustees of the British Museum and several rules were then devised for determining the entry word for all anonymous works.

XXXIV. When no such name of a person appears, then that of any assembly, corporate body, society, board, party, sect, or denomination appearing on the title to be preferred, subject to the arrangement of Rule IX.; and if no such name appear, then that of any country, province, city, town or place so appearing, to be adopted as the heading.

Articles to be inquired of within an ecclesiastical district to be entered under the name of such district.
17. Corporate author or personal author.
   A. Works of the corporate authorship.
      1. Enter under the corporate body, with an added entry under
         the personal author or the one named first, a work that is
         by its nature necessarily the expression of the corporate
         thought or activity of the body.

60. Headings for corporate bodies--Basic rule.
   Enter a corporate body directly under its name except when the
   rules that follow provide for entering it under a higher body
   of which it is a part, under the name of the government of
   which it is an agency, or under the name of the place in which
   it is located.

93. Patriarchates, dioceses, etc.
   B. Subordinate bodies.
      1. General rule. ... enter dioceses, provinces, and other su-
         bordinate units of religious bodies having jurisdiction
         within geographical districts as subheadings under the name
         of the body.

COMMENT: This rule is based on principles already established in the previous
rules, XXXIII and IX. From Rule XXXIII is taken the idea of using for
the main entry any corporate name appearing in the title; from Rule IX
comes the notion for entering the corporate name as a subheading under
a geographical place name, rather than directly under its own name.
Even more likely to prevent the item from being located in the cata-
log would be using the name of any country, province, city, town or
place that might appear in the title as the main entry. There is no
doubt about the improvements made by AACR rules for corporate bodies.

XXXV. If no name of any assembly or country, to be
preferred as above, appear on the title, the name of the
editor, (if there be any,) to be used as a heading; or, if
no editor's name appear, that of the translator, if there
be one. Reporters to be considered as editors.

4. Works produced under editorial direction.
   A. Enter a work produced under editorial direction under its
      editor providing: (1) he is named on the title page of the
      work, and (2) the publisher is not named in the title, and
      (3) the editor appears to be primarily responsible for the
      existence of the work.

COMMENT: It appears that the idea of "intellectual responsibility" used
to determine authorship is lacking, and the search for a distinctive
name on the title page is the overwhelming feature for choosing the
main entry.

XXXVI. Adjectives formed from the name of a per-
son, party, place or denomination, to be treated as the
names from which they are formed.
COMMENT: The use of the noun form of an adjective derived from a proper name that appeared in a title as the entry word in the catalog, would do much to keep such entries from ever being found. It is too bad that Panizzi's idea of using the first word in the title as the entry was not adopted.

XXXVII. If two names occur seeming to have an equal claim, the first to be chosen. Reports of civil actions to be catalogued under the name of that party to the suit which stands first upon the title-page. In criminal proceedings the name of the defendant to be adopted as a heading. Trials relating to any vessel to be entered under the name of such vessel.

   B. Principal author not indicated.
      1. If no one is represented as principal author and if there are not more than three authors, enter under the one that is named first and make added entries under the others.

26. Court decisions, cases, etc.
   C. Particular cases.
      1. Proceedings etc.
         b. Actions prosecuted by the state. Enter the proceedings and records of actions prosecuted by the state (criminal trials, impeachments, courts-martial, courts of inquiry, etc.) under the name of the person or body that is prosecuted, followed by the appropriate legal designation (e.g. defendant, liable).

   c. Indictments etc.
      Enter a formal indictment, accusation, complaint, or information under the name of the defendant or first-named defendant that is indicated or otherwise accused, followed by the appropriate designation (e.g. defendant).

COMMENT: The first statement in Rule XXXVII refers to names mentioned in the titles of anonymous works, not joint authors but the principle of using the first named on the title page is the same as that used today for shared authorship. Otherwise there is no basic difference between the codes here; even the idea of an entry under the name of a ship is used in AACR, cf. example on page 62 of the North American text.

XXXVIII. In the case of anonymous works, to which none of the foregoing rules can be applied, the first substantive in the title (or if there be no substantive, the first word) to be selected as the heading. A substantive, adjectively used, to be taken in conjunction with its following substantive as forming one word; and the same to be done with respect to adjectives incorporated with their following substantive. The entries which may occur under the same heading to succeed each other in strict alphabetical order.
2. Works of unknown or uncertain authorship, or by unnamed groups.
   A. Enter under title a work that is of unknown or uncertain authorship, or that is by a group that lacks a name.

**COMMENT:** The use of the first substantive as the key work (except when there appears a proper name in the title) for the title entry can result in very arbitrary decisions. The current practice of filing under the first word that is not an article results in much greater consistency.

XXXIX. Whenever the name of the author of an anonymous publication is known to, or conjectured by, the librarian, the same to be inserted at the end of the title, between brackets.

1. Works of single authorship.
   A. Enter a work, a collection of works, or selections from works by one author under the person or corporate body that is the author, whether named in the work or not.

2. Works of unknown or uncertain authorship, or by unnamed groups.
   B. If reference sources indicate that a certain person is the probable author of such a work, however, enter it under that person and make an added entry under the title.

**COMMENT:** The practice of not using the name of the author, even when known, was first brought out in Rule XXXII, where the entry was under initials even though the author's name was known. This gives more importance to the idea of using only title page information than to that of "intellectual responsibility."

XL. Works without the author's name, and purporting to comment or remark on a work of which the title is set forth in that of such publication, to be catalogued under the same heading as the work remarked or commented upon.

11. Commentator or author.
   A. Commentary emphasized. If the title page presents the publication as a commentary on the work, catalog it as such according to the applicable general rule (1-5) unless there is strong reason to catalog it as an edition of the work.

   B. Edition of the work emphasized. If the title page presents the publication as an edition of the work with accompanying commentary or annotations, catalog it as an edition of the work under the applicable general rule (1-5), making an added entry under the commentator, unless there is strong reason to catalog it as a commentary.

**COMMENT:** This rule to catalog an anonymous commentary under the main entry established for the work commented upon is not a bad idea if one takes into account the fact that no subject catalog was compiled. This puts the commentary in the catalog where it will be most useful.
42. Pseudonyms.
   A. If all the works of an author appear only under one pseudonym, enter him under the pseudonym.

**COMMENT:** The principle of entering pseudonymous works under the "nom emprunté" or pseudonym has been revived in AACR, but no longer is it necessary to add the real name after the "nom de plume." Panizzi made no provisions, as does AACR, for those authors who use several pen names. However, it is quite unfortunate that Panizzi's idea was not carried out consistently from 1841 to the appearance of AACR in 1967.

XLII. Assumed names, or names used to designate an office, profession, party, or qualification of the writer, to be treated as real names. Academical names to follow the same rule. The works of an author not assuming any name but describing himself by a circumlocution, to be considered anonymous.

51. Entry under phrase.
   A. If a person is always identified in his works or in reference sources by an appellation or pseudonym consisting of a word, phrase, or expression that is obviously not intended to be taken as a bona fide name, enter him under the appellation or pseudonym in direct order unless it has the structure of a name consisting of a forename, or forenames, and a surname. Enter such a name under the pseudo-surname and refer from the name in direct order.

**COMMENT:** Panizzi's rule seems to be very close to the practice prescribed by AACR. However, without examples to illustrate his rule it is not easy to interpret exactly what he meant by "names used to designate an office, profession, party, or qualification of the writer."

XLIII. Works falsely attributed in their title to a particular person, to be treated as pseudonymous.

1. Works of single authorship.
   B. If the publication attributes the authorship erroneously or fictitiously to someone who is not the author, enter it under the actual author and make an added entry under the attributed author if he is a real person.

**COMMENT:** AACR always prefers the entry under the author when known, Panizzi preferred the name as it appeared on the title page.
XLIV. Works of several writers, collectively published, to be entered according to the following rules, [and the separate pieces of the various authors included in the collection to be separately entered in the order in which they occur; excepting merely collections of letters, charters, short extracts from larger works, and similar compilations.]

That part of the foregoing rule which is framed between brackets has not been acted upon, in order to accelerate the printing of the catalogue.

149. Contents note.

A. Scope.
1. Either all of the contents or a part of them are specified in the catalog entry if it is necessary to bring out important parts of the work not mentioned in the title, or to give a fuller and more detailed description of the contents than the title supplies.

COMMENT: The note added to Panizzi's rule indicates that "to accelerate the printing" not all contents of the publications would be included in the catalog entries; and so goes it today when contents notes are often dispensed with to speed cataloging and to cut costs. Also, it should be noted that AACR leaves much to the discretion of the cataloger by including the very pragmatic clause, "if it is necessary..."

XLV. In any series of printed works, which embraces the collected productions of various writers upon particular subjects, such as Ugoilni Theosaurus Antiq. Sacra-

rum, Gronovii Theosaurus Antiq. Grammum, the work to be entered under the name of the editor.

XLVI. If the editor's name do not appear, the whole collection to be entered under the collective title, in the same manner as anonymous works.

In cataloguing collections without an editor's name, and having a collective title, the heading to be taken from such collective title without reference to that portion of the title which may follow.

5. Collections.
A. With collective title. If a collection of independent works by different authors, not written specifically for the same occasion or for the publication in hand, or of extracts from such works, has a collective title, enter it under the person who compiled it when he is named on the title page as compiler or editor, or is known to have been so named in another edition of the collection; otherwise enter it under its title.

B. Without collective title. If a collection of previously existing works by different authors, or of extracts from such works, lacks a collective title, enter it under the heading appropriate to the work listed first on the title page, or if there is no collective title page, under the heading appropriate to the first work in the collection.

COMMENT: There is no basic difference; in fact, Panizzi is surprisingly similar to the statements in AACR.
XLVII. General collections of laws, edicts, ordinances, or other public acts of a similar description, to be entered under the name of the state or nation in which or by whom they were sanctioned, signed, or promulgated. Collections extending only to one reign or period of supreme government by one person, as well as detached laws and documents separately enacted and issued, to be catalogued under the name of the person in whose name and by whose authority they are enacted or sanctioned; such names to be entered alphabetically under the principal entry of the state or nation, after the general collections. When more than one name occurs, the first to be preferred.

17. Corporate author or personal author.
   C. Works by chiefs of state, heads of government, etc.
      1. Official communications.
         a. Enter an official communication (e.g., a message to a legislative or governing body, a proclamation, an executive order that does not come within the provisions of 20 A) issued by a chief of state, a head of a government, or a head of an international intergovernmental body under the corporate heading for the office which he holds.

20. Laws etc.
   A. Laws governing one jurisdiction. Enter legislative enactments and the decrees, etc. of the chief executive issued in lieu of legislative enactments under a heading consisting of the name of the jurisdiction governed by the law followed by one of the subheadings indicated below.

80. Government officials.
   A. Chiefs of state etc.
      1. The heading for a sovereign, president, other chief of state, or governor, in his official capacity, consists of the title of his office in English, unless there is no proper equivalent for the vernacular term, followed by the inclusive years of his reign or incumbency and, in parentheses, by his name in brief form in the language used for the heading for the person—all as subheading under the name of the government.

COMMENT: These rules for government publications are basically the same as those prescribed by AACR.

XLVIII. Collections of laws, edicts, &c., of several countries or nations to be catalogued according to rules XLV. and XLVI.

XLIX. The same to be done with respect to laws on one or more particular subjects, either merely collected or digested in some particular order, or used as text to some particular comment or treatise.

20. Laws etc.
   B. Laws governing more than one jurisdiction.
   2. Enter compilations of laws governing more than three juris-
dictions under the personal or corporate compiler if named on the title page; otherwise under title. If all the laws are promulgated by a single jurisdiction, make a heading- and-title reference from that jurisdiction.

COMMENT: There is no basic difference. This is similar to Lubetzky's idea of general principles being applied to any kind of work, which was carried out quite extensively in AACR.

I. The names of translators or commentators to be stated in cataloguing and entering a work, if they occur in the title page; and when they do not occur, but are known to or conjectured by the librarian, to be supplied between brackets.

II. The works of translators to be entered under the name of the original author. The same rule to be observed with respect to the works of commentators, if the same be accompanied with the text complete.

11. Commentator or author.
   A. Commentary emphasized. If the title page presents the publication as a commentary of the work, catalog it as such according to the applicable general rule (1-5) unless there is strong reason to catalog it as an edition of the work.

   B. Edition of the work emphasized. If the title page presents the publication as an edition of the work with accompanying commentary or annotations, catalog it as an edition of the work under the applicable general rule (1-5), making an added entry under the commentator, unless there is strong reason to catalog it as a commentary.

15. Translator or author.
   A. Enter a translation of a work under the author of the original work. Make an added entry under the translator according to the provisions of 33 E.

COMMENT: Again, the similarity between Panizzi and AACR is quite remarkable.

II. Translations to be entered immediately after the original, generally with only the indication of the language into which the version has been made, in italics; but if any material alteration in the title have been introduced, so much of the title of the translation to be given as may be deemed requisite, or a short explanation in English added, between brackets.

COMMENT: Even though this is a filing rule established to keep a translation with the original work there is an equivalent idea in the AACR section on uniform titles with an identical purpose. That rule in AACR is:

105. Translations.
   A. If the publication is a translation, add the name of the language of the translation after the uniform title.

IIII. Commentaries unaccompanied by the text, to be entered under the commentator's name; if without a name, or with an assumed name, then according to the rules laid down for anonymous or pseudonymous works.
11. Commentator or author.
   A. Commentary emphasized. If the title page presents the
   publication as a commentary on the work, catalog it as
   such according to the applicable general rule (1-5) unless
   there is strong reason to catalog it as an edition of the work

COMMENT: There is absolutely no difference here between what Panizzi set
down and what is done if one follows AACR.

LIV. No work ever to be entered twice at full length.
Whenever requisite, cross-references to be introduced.

COMMENT: Unfortunately Panizzi does not state why it might sometimes be
"requisite." Perhaps he was referring to editions; if so, this would
differ from today's practice of cataloging discrete editions as new
entries.

LV. Cross-references to be divided into three classes,
from name to name, from name to work, and from work
to work. Those of the first class to contain merely the
name, title, or office of the person referred to as entered;
those of the second, so much of the title referred to be-
sides, as, together with the size and date, may give the
means of at once identifying, under its heading, the book
referred to; those of the third class to contain moreover
so much of the title referred from, as may be necessary
to ascertain the object of the reference.

120. References—Basic rule.
Whenever the name of a person or corporate body or the title of
work is, or may reasonably be, known under a form that is not the
one used as heading or uniform title, refer from that form to the
one that has been used.

COMMENT: The basic difference brought out here is that there are no "added
entries" in the book catalogs of the British Museum. In place of
"added entries" many cross references are made, which is customary in
book catalogs. Other than the use of cross references instead of
added entries, the underlying principles are the same.

LVII. Cross-references of the first class to be made in
the following instances:
   From the titles of noblemen, and from the sees of arch-
bishops or bishops, to the family name, or the first name
under which the works of such personages are to be
entered according to the foregoing rules.

LVII. From the family name of persons whose works
are to be entered under the Christian or first name, to
such Christian or first name; excepting in the case of
sovereigns, or princes belonging to sovereign houses.

LVIII. From any surnames either spells, or in any way
used, in a manner differing from the form adopted in the
principal entry, to such entry.

LIX. From any of the names or surnames used by an
author besides that under which the principal entry is
made, to the one so preferred.

LX. From the real to the assumed name of authors;
adding pseud. to the entry referred to in the cross-refer-
ence.
121. References--Names of persons.
   A. See references.
   1. Different names.
      a. Refer from a name used by the author or found in reference
         sources that is different from the one used in the heading.
         Typical instances are: Pseudonym; Real name; Secular name;
         Name in religion; Earlier name; Maiden name; Married name.
      2. Different forms of the name. Refer from a form of name
         used by the author or found in reference sources when it
         differs significantly from the form used in the heading.
         Typical instances are: Unused first forename; Different lan-
         guage-form; Different spelling.
      3. Different entry elements. Refer from different elements of
         the heading under which a person might reasonably be entered
         in a catalog. Typical entry elements from which references
         may be required are: Title of nobility different from surname;
         Surname different from title of nobility; Different element of
         a compound name; Part of surname following a prefix; First
         given name when not used as entry and there is no surname; Last
         element when it is not the entry element; Honorary titles and
         terms of address when sometimes used as names.

   COMMENT: Panizzi's rules LVI through LX show that he was quite aware of
   the necessity for including many references to guide the catalog
   user from a name or form of a name not used to the one chosen as the
   entry word. The fundamental purpose discussed here remains the same in
   Panizzi's rules and in those of AACR.

LXI. Cross-references of the second or third class, according to circumstances, to be made in the following instances:
   From the names of editors, or of biographers who
   have prefixed an author's life to his works, (provided
   such names appear in the book,) to the principal entry.

LXII. From the names of authors of anonymous or
   pseudonymous works supplied in the title, as well as from
   the names of authors who have shared with another in
   writing a work, or have continued it, and also from the
   names of translators, commentators, or annotators, either
   appearing on the title, or supplied as above directed, to
   the main entry.

9. Biographer/critic or author.
   B. If the one who is responsible for the biographical or criti-
      cal material is represented as editor, enter under the author
      of the work and make an added entry under the editor.

33. Added entries.
   D. Editors and compilers. Make an added entry under an openly
      named editor or compiler when the main entry is not under the
      name of a person...If the work is entered under the name of a
      person make an added entry for an editor if he has added sig-
      nificant material or if the work has been issued in many edi-
      tions with different editors.

   B. Principal author not indicated.
   1. If no one is represented as principal author and if there are
      not more than three authors, enter under the one that is
      named first and make added entries under the others.
11. Commentator or author.
   B. Edition of the work emphasized. If the title page presents
   the publication as an edition of the work with accompanying
   commentary or annotations, catalog it as an edition of the
   work under the applicable general rule (1-5), making an added
   entry under the commentator, unless there is strong reason
   to catalog it as a commentary.

15. Translator or author.
   A. Enter a translation of a work under the author of the original
   work. Make an added entry under the translator according to
   the provisions of 33 E.

COMMENT: Panizzi's "cross references of the second or third class" served
the same purpose as added entries and saved space in the catalogs. In
many book catalogs today cross references are also used instead of
added entries in order to keep down the size of the catalog and to econ-
omize on the cost of producing the book catalog.

LXIII. From the name of any person the subject of
any biography or narrative, to its author: stating briefly,
in italics, after the name referred from, the peculiar de-
signation of the biography in the work referred to; or,
if this cannot be done, using the nearest English word,
in brackets and italics, that may give an idea of the object
of the cross reference.

   In this description of cross-reference the first words
   of the title of the work referred to to be given, but not
   its date or size, so that the cross-reference may serve
equally for all editions.

COMMENT: There is no equivalent rule. This rule may be more properly
referred to as one for providing a subject approach for biographies.
The idea of a general reference card also appears in rule 126 of
AACR, which is:

126. References in lieu of added entries.
   A. Added entries common to many editions.
   1. When the same added entry is required for many editions of a
   work, it may be replaced by appropriate references when it
   appears that the advantage of greater simplicity and savings
   in time and catalog space offset whatever inconvenience may
   result for the user of the catalog.

LXIV. From any name which may be reasonably con-
ceived to have an equal claim to that selected for the
principal entry, to such entry.

33. Added entries.
   A. General rule. Make an added entry under any person or cor-
   porate body associated with the publication of it is believed
   that some catalog users might reasonably consider the person
   or body to be primarily responsible for it.
There are many rules in AACR which indicate specifically for whom added entries are to be made. The general rule for added entries in AACR is just a refinement of the one stated by Panizzi.

LXV. From any author, any whole work of whom or any considerable part of it may be the subject of a commentary, or notes, to the name of the commentator or annotator. No notice to be taken of the name of authors, fragments or inconsiderable parts of whose works are observed upon by the commentator or annotator.

11. Commentator or author.
   A. Commentary emphasized. If the title page presents the publication as a commentary on the work, catalog it as such according to the applicable general rule (1-5) unless there is strong reason to catalog it as an edition of the work.... Make an added entry under the author and title of the text.

COMMENT: This is an excellent example of the former use of a cross reference for what would be accomplished today by means of an added entry.

LXVI. From any author whose works, or considerable part of them contained in a collection, are considered so important as to be distinctly specified in the entry of the collection itself, to the principal entry; the volume, or part of the collection in which the article so referred to is found, to be specified.

LXVII. From the names of authors whose entire works or any considerable part of them are included among the collected works of a polygraphic writer, or translator, to the principal entry.

156. Analytical entries.
   Definition and scope. An analytical entry is an entry for a part of a work or series of works for which another, comprehensive entry is made.

COMMENT: The various sections of rule 156 give detailed instructions for making analytical entries, which is essentially what Panizzi had in mind in LXVI and LXVII.

LXVIII. From the name of a state or nation to which a collection of laws, entered under any other heading, belongs, to the main entry.
   From the name of the superior of any ecclesiastical district who promulgates articles for inquiry to the name of such district.
   From the name of any party to a civil action to the principal entry.

33. Added entries.
   A. General rule. Make an added entry under any person or corporate body associated with the publication if it is believed that some catalog users might reasonably consider the person or body to be primarily responsible for it.
H. Other related persons and bodies. Make an added entry under a person or body that has any other relationship to the publication that is important for its retrieval purposes and that would not otherwise be brought out.

COMMENT: These two parts of rule 33 cover the three instances explicitly spelled out by Panizzi.

LXIX. Entries to be made in the following order:
Cross-references to be placed at the beginning of the entry, from which they are made, in the alphabetical order of the entries referred to.

COMMENT: Even though this is a filing rule, and not covered by AACR, it is interesting to note that the same rule appears in the ALA filing rules.13 The ALA rule is:

35. Cross reference arrangement.
A. Filing position. A reference or explanatory note precedes all other entries under the same word or words.

LXX. Collections of all the works of an author in their original language only, to be entered immediately after the cross-references; the editions without date, and those of which the date cannot be ascertained even by approximation, to precede all those bearing date, or of which the date can be supplied either positively or by approximation. The latter to follow according to their date, whether apparent in any part of the book, or supplied. Editions by the editor, or such as are expressly stated to follow a specific text or edition, and editions with the same notes or commentary, to succeed each other immediately in their chronological order after the entry of that which is, or is considered to be, the earliest.

LXXI. The text of the collected works, accompanied by a translation, to follow those having the text only, and in the same order.

LXXII. The translations of such collected works into the Latin language only to precede, those in any other language in the above order; the Latin translations to be followed by those in English. Translations in any other language to follow according to the alphabetical order of the name of the language in English. If the volume contain two or more translations, without the text, the entry to be made according to the alphabetical order of the first of the languages employed. Translations into the same language, and their several editions, to be entered in conformity with the rules laid down for the entries of the originals.

LXXIII. Collections of two or more works of an author to be entered in the order and according to the rules laid down for the collections of all the works of a writer, after the translations of the whole works; such partial collections to precede, as are known or are supposed to contain the largest number of an author's works.

LXXIV. Selections, or collected fragments, from the works of an author, to follow the partial collections of his works, and to be entered according to the above rules.

LXXV. Separate works of an author to succeed each other alphabetically; the several editions and translations of each of them to be entered in the same manner as directed for the collected works of a writer.

LXXVI. Entire portions of a separate work to succeed the work from which they are taken, in the order above directed. If the whole work to which they belong do not occur, such portions to be entered after all the separate works, but according to the principles laid down for the latter.

LXXVII. Works not written by the person under whose name they are to be catalogued according to the foregoing rules, to be entered alphabetically as an appendix, and in chronological succession, when more than one article occurs in the same alphabetical series, after all the works of the person whose name is selected, if any occur in the catalogue. Volumes without date, or the date of which cannot be supplied, to be entered first.

LXXVIII. The same rule as to the alphabetical and chronological arrangement to apply to works entered under any other heading than the name of a person.
107. Collected editions etc.
A. Use the conventional collective title "Works" for editions of the complete works of an author, including those that purport to be complete or that are complete as of the time of publication.
B. Use the collective title "Selected works" for partial collections of the author's works in various literary forms or for partial collections of his works in a single form if he has written in only one form.
C. Use the collective title "Selections" for publications consisting of parts of various works, extracts, quotations, etc.
D. If there are also complete or purportedly complete editions of the author's works in a single literary form use an appropriate collective title, also do the same for collections of three or more works limited to that form.
E. When a publication entered under any collective title is a translation, indicate the language in the same way as for an individual work.
F. When two works of an author are published together, use the uniform title of the first work and make an author-title added entry using the uniform title of the second work.

COMMENT: Rule 107 is included in AACR as a guide for the cataloging of one author's voluminous works. The reason behind it is a logical arrangement in the catalog of the editions, collections, translations, etc., of any author's writings, which is essentially what Panizzi had in mind in Rules LXX- LXXVIII. The 1967 ALA filing rules consider the use of uniform titles and have detailed filing rules for the arrangement of the cards in the catalog. Panizzi realized the importance of a convenient and logical arrangement of the cards under a prolific author to facilitate the search for a particular work or book.

LXXIX. The Old and New Testament and their parts, to be catalogued under the general head "Bible," and arranged in the following order:
1st. The Old and New Testaments in the original Hebrew and Greek only, chronologically arranged.
2nd. The same, in polyglot editions, which include the original texts; beginning with those editions which contain most translations.
3rd. The same, translated into other languages, but without the original; those editions to precede which contain most languages; then translations into one language only, arranged as directed in rule LXXII.
4th. Editions, with comments, to follow those having the text only, in the same order and according to the same principles. Bibles accompanied by the same comment to follow each other immediately in chronological succession.
5th. The Old Testament only to be next entered, according to the same principles and rules.
6th. Detached parts of the Old Testament then to follow, in the same order in which they are arranged in the English authorised version of the Scriptures, and to be entered as directed for the whole Bible.
7th. The Apocrypha, as declared by the Church of England, to be next catalogued and entered according to the same rules.
8th. The New Testament to be next catalogued, and then its parts, according to the foregoing rules.
9th. General cross-references to be made from the several names of the inspired writers, as well as from the names of the several parts of Scripture, to the general head "Bible." Particular cross-references to be made from the names of editors, commentators, translators, &c., to the precise entry under which the part of Holy writ referred from in the cross-reference occurs.
10th. The names of parts of the Bible, as well as of inspired writers, to be expressed in the form adopted in the authorised English version of the Scriptures.
108. **Bible--General rule.**

Use the uniform title "Bible" for the Bible and any of its parts. Add to this heading the designation of a part, the language of the text, the name of the version, translator, or reviser, and the year of the edition, as specified by the following rules.

**COMMENT:** The successive rules (109-114) in AACR cover the same basic elements that were Panizzi's concerns. Sections 1-10 of rule LXXIX have set the pattern for all modern cataloging of the Bible as well as other sacred scriptures, cf. rules 115-118 in AACR. Julia Pettee in discussing Panizzi's rules in her article on authorship says: "A special rule (LXXIX) provides for the entry under BIBLE--the first rule formulated for the type of literature now known as anonymous classics." 15

Perhaps Panizzi was first to formulate such a rule for cataloging, but Andrew Maunsell had stated the same basic idea in the introduction to his catalog of printed books, published in 1595.

---

**LXXX. All acts, memoirs, transactions, journals, minutes, &c., of academies, institutes, associations, universities, or societies learned, scientific, or literary, by whatever name known or designated, as well as works by various hands, forming part of a series of volumes edited by any such society, to be catalogued under the general name "Academies" and alphabetically entered, according to the English name of the country and town at which the sittings of the society are held, in the following order. The primary division to be of the four parts of the world in alphabetical succession, Australia and Polynesia being considered as appendixes to Asia; the first subdivision to be of the various empires, kingdoms, or other independent governments into which any part of the world is divided, in alphabetical order; and a second subdivision of each state to follow, according to the various cities or towns, alphabetically disposed, belonging to each state, in which any society of this description meets. The acts, &c., of each society, when more than one meet at the same place, to be entered according to the name under which the society published its first work, in alphabetical order; and the acts, memoirs, &c. of each society to be entered chronologically. Continuations to follow the original entry.

60. **Headings for corporate bodies--Basic rule.**

Enter a corporate body directly under its name except when the rules that follow provide for entering it under a higher body of which it is a part, or under the name of the government of which it is an agency.

**COMMENT:** Panizzi recognized the problems of corporate bodies and therefore placed their publications under a single heading, "Academies," and thus avoided the problem of "corporate authorship." 16 Panizzi grouped corporate bodies according to geographical location under the broad heading "Academies." In the succeeding cataloging codes the grouping under such broad headings was dropped, but the arrangement
of corporate bodies under place became a standard practice. The later development of "societies and institutions" in the ALA catalog rules of 1908 and the ALA code of 1949 created just as many problems as they solved. Jewett was the first to extend the principle of authorship to corporate bodies. He advocated entering corporate bodies directly under their names, e.g., University of Oxford. This is the same principle proclaimed by Lubetzky a century later. The two editions of AACR, the North American text and the British text were published in 1967. The British text incorporated the idea of direct entry as advocated by Jewett and Lubetzky, but the North American text retained the old idea of entering certain corporate bodies under place instead of directly under their names as they read.

LXXXI. The same rule and arrangement to be followed for "Periodical Publications," which are to be cataloged under this general head, embracing reviews, magazines, newspapers, journals, gazettes, annuals, and all works of a similar nature, in whatever languages and under whatever denomination they may be published. The several entries under the last subdivision to be made in alphabetical order according to the first substantive occurring in the title.

LXXXII. All almanacs, calendars, ephemerides of whatever description they be, as well as their companions, appendices, &c., to be entered under the general head "Ephemerides." The several works under this head to be entered alphabetically according to the first substantive occurring in the title.

   A. Serials not issued by a corporate body and not of personal authorship. Enter a serial that is not issued by or under the authority of a corporate body and is not of personal authorship under its title.
   B. Serials issued by a corporate body.
      1. Enter a periodical, monographic series, or a serially published bibliography, index, directory, biographical dictionary, almanac, or yearbook, issued by or under the authority of a corporate body, under its title with an added entry under the corporate body. Exception: If the title (exclusive of the subtitle) includes the name or the abbreviation of the name of the corporate body, or consists solely of a generic term that requires the name of the body for adequate identification of the serial, enter it under the body.

COMMENT: Panizzi entered many types of publications under broad headings not unlike the approach used today in subject cataloging. Under AACR most serials are still arranged by title, but are entered directly under the first word which is not an article and are not grouped together under form headings, such as outlined by Panizzi and continued in the current British Museum rules.

LXXXIII. There shall be cross-references from the name of any author, editor, or contributor to any of the above works, appearing in any of the title-pages of any of the volumes, as well as from the peculiar name or designation of any of the societies, from the place at which they hold their meetings, from any place forming part of the peculiar name of a journal, almanac, calendar, &c., from the name under which such publications are generally known, to the main entries of such works.
33. Added entries.

D. Editors and compilers. Make an added entry under an openly named editor or compiler when the main entry is not under the name of a person. If the work is a serial, make the added entry only if the serial is likely to be known by the editor's name.

COMMENT: The only difference here is the use of references instead of added entries.

LXXXIV. Religious and military orders to be designated by the English name under which they are generally known, and entries to be made accordingly.

63. Conventional name.

A. When a body is frequently identified by a conventional form of name in the reference sources in its own language, prefer the conventional name to the official name and other forms of name used in its publications.

B. When the name of a body of ancient origin or one that is international in character has become firmly established in English language usage under an English form, enter it under this form, regardless of the forms that may appear on its publications. Instances of conventional names of this type are especially prevalent among religious bodies, fraternal and knightly orders, and diplomatic conferences.

COMMENT: The idea of entering religious and military orders under an English form of the name has persisted throughout all the major cataloging codes produced since the time of Panizzi. AACR states what should be done in case there is no form of the name in English; Panizzi failed to do this.

LXXXV. Anonymous catalogues, whether bearing the title catalogue or any other intended to convey the same meaning, to be entered under the head "Catalogues," subdivided as follows:—1st. Catalogues of public establishments (including those of societies, although not strictly speaking, public). 2d. Catalogues of private collections, drawn up, either for sale or otherwise. 3d. Catalogues of collections not for sale, the possessors of which are not known. 4th. General as well as special catalogues of objects, without any reference to their possessor. 5th. Dealers' catalogues. 6th. Sale catalogues not included in any of the preceding sections.

Catalogues without any date, and the date of which cannot be supplied, to be entered at the beginning of this subdivision in strict alphabetical order, as just directed. With respect to mere dealers' and sale catalogues compiled since the beginning of the present century, such only to be catalogued and entered as may be considered of peculiar interest.

LXXXVII. Cross-references of the second class to be made from the name of the compiler of a catalogue (when supplied by the librarian, and other than the collector or possessor of a collection, a dealer or an auctioneer) to the principal entry.

LXXXVIII. Anonymous Dictionaries of any description, including Lexicons and Vocabularies, to be catalogued under the general head "Dictionaries," and entered in strict alphabetical order according to the first substantive in the title, with cross-references from the author's name, when supplied.

LXXXIX. The same rule to be applied to Encyclopedias, the name of the editor of which does not appear on the title, and which shall be catalogued under the general head "Encyclopedias," with a cross-reference from the editor's name, when supplied in the principal entry, to such entry.
COMMENT: These rules follow the pattern set up by Panizzi in which certain classes publications are entered under broad subject (or form) headings. The ALA cataloging rules of 1908 and the ALA rules of 1949 also had many little rules for each class of publication, as did Panizzi; but in those codes there were no broad headings used. AACR has no provisions for these specific types of publications; instead they are treated in a more general manner, e.g., rule 4: Works produced under editorial direction. The principles behind AACR is the determination of who has the intellectual responsibility for the content of the publication. It should be noted that whenever a person was mentioned as compiler, editor, etc., a cross reference was made, thus illustrating Panizzi's awareness of the importance of names associated with publications.

XC. Missals, Breviaries, Offices, Hymn, Prayer Books. Liturgies, and works of the same description (not compiled by private individuals and in their individual capacity, in which case they are to be catalogued and entered according to the general rules laid down for other works,) to be entered under the general head "Liturgies," in one strict alphabetical series, according to the English denomination of the communion, sect, or religious order for whom they are specially intended; if drawn up for any particular church, congregation, or place of worship, then according to the English name peculiar to such church, congregation, or place of worship; if any work of this description occurs not coming under either of these two classes, then the first substantive in the title to be preferred as a heading. Entries under the same heading to be made in strict alphabetical order.

119. Liturgical works.
A. Form and language of title. Prefer a brief title in the language of the liturgy unless the name of the body under which the liturgical work is entered is given in English; in this case prefer a well established brief title in English when there is one.

[The name of the church is used as the heading with the subdivision: Liturgy and Ritual, e.g. "Church of England. Liturgy and ritual."

COMMENT: Again Panizzi used a broad heading for all liturgies, but he did subdivide them according to denomination. With the development of the concept of corporate authorship the Panizzi entry was just reversed, i.e., the denomination precedes the subdivision "Liturgy and Ritual," rather than the term "Liturgies" followed by the name of the denomination.
XCI. Cross-references of the second class to be made from the peculiar name or designation of any of the churches, communions, sects, religious orders, or places of worship, as well as from the name under which any of the works mentioned in the preceding article is generally known, to the main entry.

33. Added entries.
   A. General rule. Make an added entry under any person or corporate body associated with the publication if it is believed that some catalog users might reasonably consider the person or body to be primarily responsible for it.

COMMENT: Even though liturgical works were placed under the broad heading "Liturgies," the necessity of having access to the material under the name of the denomination was recognized by Panizzi, hence rule XCI.

CONCLUSIONS

It must be remembered that Panizzi wrote his rules for a book catalog and not a card catalog. The concept of added entries and subject headings does not emerge; instead of added entries there are "cross references," and in lieu of subject headings many categories of publications are grouped under broad form headings which are somewhat similar to current subject headings. The broad headings used were: Academies, Periodical Publications, Ephemerides, Catalogues, Dictionaries, Encyclopedias, and Liturgies. Undoubtedly they were convenient for the cataloger, and in many cases it would facilitate a library user's search for such publications as encyclopedias, periodicals, and liturgies; but one might never be able to locate materials placed under such headings as Academies, Catalogues, or Ephemerides. These groupings were devised to help solve the problem of the publications which often had no "author"; today many of these would be considered as publications of corporate authorship. It was not until later that the principles of authorship and intellectual responsibility were fully developed.

These rules were devised for catalogs which were to serve as a means to determine whether a particular work was in the British Museum, and not to determine if there was material on a given topic.

Title entries were used only for anonymous works and even then it might be difficult to locate a specific work or book, because one had to guess under which word it had been entered. In the event that one knew the title of a book which was not written anonymously, but did not know the author's name, the catalog would be of no value. Panizzi's attempt to make a rule for each entity that might be a main entry, e.g., religious and military orders, universities, etc., was continued and even more fully expanded in all the succeeding codes up to the time of the publication of AACR in 1967. It was a very serious problem, and finally Lubetzky in his critique of the AIA rules of 1949 and his Code of Cataloging Rules helped remedy the situation by advocating the concept of cataloging according to "basic principles," in place of a rule for each case that might arise.

Regardless of the aforementioned criticisms of Panizzi's 91 rules, he must be commended for the excellent results of these early efforts. He was not able to take advantage of the errors of forerunners and to improve upon what someone else had done previously.
Several persons had previously set down a few guidelines for compiling catalogs, but none had attempted to undertake such a major project as did Panizzi when he wrote his 91 rules. The basic principles he established are still evident today in AACR, and fully one-half of the ideas and principles laid down by Panizzi are incorporated into AACR.

In the foregoing comparisons, there are many instances where no change has been made at all, just a restating of the same idea. The greatest change that can be seen between these codes is that of the development of the concept of corporate authorship. The fact that so many notions and principles set forth by Panizzi are still in evidence today is proof of his great contribution to present day cataloging.

The comparisons made here of the two sets of rules point out many contrasts and similarities. But even more significant is that, while reading the comparisons, one is constantly reminded of the importance of having good guidelines to follow in describing and recording the materials for a catalog. The catalog is, in reality, "the key to the library's collection," because it is the only efficient means of access to the materials. Any catalog compiled according to a code that does not permit or provide for appropriate entries under titles, or under names (or forms of names) of persons or corporate bodies under which some catalog user might reasonably look, is not fulfilling its role as "the key to the library's collection" as adequately as it should. Therefore, it can be said that the code of cataloging rules used in compiling the records which constitute a catalog strongly influences a library's effectiveness in assisting the user to determine the availability of desired materials and their location.
REFERENCES

1. The terms 'work' and 'book' are used in this paper in the same manner as explained in Lubetzky, Seymour, and Hayes, R.M. "Bibliographic Dimensions in Information Control," American Documentation, 20:247-52, July 1969.


VITA

Donald J. Lehnus is currently a doctoral candidate in the School of Library Science at Case Western Reserve University, Cleveland. He received the M.L.S. degree from the University of California, Berkeley (1957) and graduated from the University of Kansas (1956) with a B.A. in Spanish literature.

Before entering the doctoral program in library and information science at Case Western Reserve University he was assistant professor in the School of Librarianship at Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo (1967-1970), and prior to that he was professor of cataloging at the Escuela Interamericana de Bibliotecología in Medellín, Colombia (1964-1966). He has also worked as cataloger and reference librarian in libraries in California and New York.

Papers in this series are issued irregularly and no more often than monthly. Standing orders can be established for $5.00 which will cover ten papers (102-111) to be sent as they are issued. Orders for any ten or more copies of back papers will be charged $5.00. Individual copies of back issues still in print are distributed free upon request. The Occasional Papers deal with any aspect of librarianship and consist of manuscripts which are too long or too detailed for publication in a library periodical or which are of specialized or temporary interest. Manuscripts for inclusion in this series are invited, and should be sent to: Occasional Papers, Publications Office--215 Armory Building, University of Illinois Graduate School of Library Science, Champaign, Illinois 61820.

PUBLICATIONS BOARD
Herbert Goldhor, Chairman and Editor
Barbara DiNovo, Assistant to the Editor

Walter C. Allen
George Bonn
Kathryn L. Henderson

Rolland E. Stevens
Cora Thomassen
Lucien W. White

* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *