This annotated bibliography contains 120 citations of journal articles, most of them published in 1970 and 1971, which deal with various aspects of educational accountability. (MBM)
ACCOUNTABILITY IN EDUCATION
A BIBLIOGRAPHY

by

Ellis E. Tucker
Department of Library Science
The University of Mississippi
ACCOUNTABILITY IN EDUCATION

A BIBLIOGRAPHY


This is a report of a recent leadership conference for the improvement of teaching. In order to attain accountability in schools, the educational program must be changed from traditional methods of teaching to specifically defined objectives, learning techniques, and judgment of the results.


Accountability as promoted by Lessinger and Davies and as pioneered in Texarkana is discussed. The contract of the San Diego City School District with the Educational Development Laboratories of New York and the accountability plans of the Open Court Publishing Company and Initial Teaching Alphabet Publications, Inc., are referred to.


In excerpts from an address by Acting U. S. Commissioner of Education, Terrel H. Bell, before annual convention of Michigan Association of School Boards, emphasis is placed on program reform, performance, accountability, and increased productivity through wider use of new instructional technology.


There exists ten dropout prevention programs being operated in public schools by private firms which are being subjected to careful, regular scrutiny by outside auditors. The objective is to ascertain whether specific educational objectives are being met at specified costs.


To be held accountable for classroom performance, teachers must have a voice in governing the profession.

In an editorial announcing a campaign to establish professional practice boards, by state statute, to give teachers more control over teacher education, licensure, in-service education, and the ethical conduct of their peers, it is asserted that only after the success of the campaign can teachers be held accountable.


The President of NEA comments that accountability stresses measurable skills and neglects aspects that are as important such as creativity, ability to reason, etc., that teachers themselves have been short-changed in the training they received, and that teachers should be included in determining educational standards and policies.


The Office of Economic Opportunity will fund programs with accountability concept in mind. The article reviews basic tenets of accountability with reference to the Texarkana program.


The Merit Pay Plan is that augmented by Dr. Kenneth Clark in his proposed reading program for the Washington, D. C., schools. The entire curriculum of the primary and junior secondary schools will be devoted to teaching reading. The teachers union opposes the plan because they would be evaluated according to the gains made by their students; they would be paid and ranked according to those gains.


Developing accountability measures for the public schools is possible if various characteristics and dependent variables are taken into consideration for each classroom, school, and district. There are difficulties in developing accountability measures, but those can be worked out and accounted for so that teachers, principals, and district administrators can be measured for their accountability.


This is a brief summary of the President's comments on the failure of public education in the U. S. in terms of funds expended on special programs, equal educational opportunity, etc. A brief summary of the President's proposals for improved accounting of funds and educational programs are also included.
Accountability and performance contracting are criticized as unlikely answers to the educational dilemma. Who is accountable and for what they are accountable is very vague and in need of specification. Dehumanization, an education monopoly, teacher mistrust, among other factors, are likely to result from performance contracting.

This is a brief listing of the concepts of accountability (as advocated by Lessinger). AFT requests that teachers investigate, study, and evaluate the accountability concept and what it means to their school districts.

Mr. Blair defines the state departments of education as being a rational agency to gain in the 1970's more control over public education through its existing power structure and thus require and determine accountability in public education.

The guidelines for administering bonus pay to teachers in schools with Title I programs have been released by USOE. The bonus pay will be given "only to teachers who have been selected to serve" at schools with the greatest number of disadvantaged children. The new guidelines also contain an accountability factor.

The Texarkana contract with the Dorsett Education Systems is briefly and succinctly explained. The authors suggest that a far-reaching implication of the Texarkana experiment is that performance accountability can be applied in the regular classroom, as well as outside it.

Briner feels that basically the administrators are to be held accountable; therefore, administrators must utilize the combined talents of the public, educators, governmental agencies and others to help in writing objectives, planning programs, defining performance criteria, etc. Administrators' primary responsibility is educational accountability.

"Can Parents Demand Accountability?" Instructor, LXXX (August/September, 1970), 47. A panel of elementary principals give their varying opinions on the criteria for judging the competency of the classroom teacher and the prerogative of parents to insist on accountability in education.

Carline, Donald E. "'Why Do You Teach' or 'How Accountable Are You?'" Journal of Reading, LIV (March, 1971), 385-386. For each educator to determine why he teaches would clarify reasoning and responsibility and be a response to accountability.

Cass, James. "Accountable to Whom? For What?" Saturday Review, LIV (March 20, 1971), 41. This article reviews the usual concepts of accountability and focuses on recent action of the New York City Board of Education in Commissioning Educational Testing Service of Princeton, N. J., to devise an "accountability design" that will define the performance objectives of both students and staff members, considering variables that will affect student performance.


Chavez, Simon J. "Performance Accountability in Teacher Education." Audiovisual Instruction, XVI (March, 1971), 56-57. To obtain accountability in teacher education, Mr. Chavez suggest a workable partnership between the school and the university for more effective teacher education. He outlines the factors involved and suggests data for measuring the success of various teaching methods and personality factors.

Cook, Constance. "Accountability in Higher Education/Sharing the Duty to Account." Compact, IV (October, 1970), 24-25. A high degree of accountability is expected of our system of higher education by the public and perhaps a mutual striving for responsibility and accountability on the part of both the legislatures and the institutions of higher education will bring about the desired results. Emphasis is placed on the responsibility of both educators and legislators to share the duty to account.

Those involved in education are accountable for developing autonomy in each person involved: student, teacher, principal, superintendent, school board, descending from the school board to the superintendent to the principal to the teacher to the student. Teaching and recognition procedures for developing autonomy should be studied and charted.


Cunningham pinpoints the problems facing administrators, board members, teachers, the public, and legislators as accountability becomes a reality. Fear of appraisal-judgment, lack of information on which to make accountability judgments, self-satisfaction or disinclination for change, ingrained bureaucracy, professionalism vs. community action, and the responsibilities at the state level are considered as they have or will affect accountability in education.


More and more public schools are at rock bottom and reaching out to private industry for help. Performance contracts offer the newest potential for helping schools make learning more effective.


The move toward accountability of Florida's State Department of Education is implemented by the Florida Research and Development Program. Four themes prevail in the nine sections of the Educational Research and Development Program: (a) accountability, (b) systematic planning, (c) individualized instruction, and (d) strengthening competencies and skills of teachers.


Davies asserts that the real test of educators' training is its effect on school pupils' performance. He discusses programs to improve education of children in urban and rural low income areas, to bring new kinds of people into schools.


Accountability will entail a great deal of change for all involved with education--teachers, aides, teacher-training institutions, administrators, school board members, etc.; changing people is the basic need for the accountability concept to succeed although it will involve a re-evaluation of goals and concepts of public education and a change in programs and training. The Education Professions Development Act, and the kind of programs the Act supports, is a major and important indication that accountability can and will work.

Dorsett Educational Systems, Inc., in given a chance to prove that their program to raise student achievement to national norms is effective.


Mr. Darland contends that accountability is a conceivable--and reachable--goal for public education; however, before teachers can be held accountable for the results of their profession, the profession must be granted some form of self-governance that includes teacher-training, teacher-accreditation, in-service training, etc.


"If accountability is to be realistic, the criteria by which the schools will be assessed should be based on a systems approach. That is, school systems must systematically analyze the variability of their input, systematically develop operations to produce output in terms of clearly understood objectives, and assess output for feedback to adjust the system." This, however, must be an individual district accounting, not statewide or countywide, etc.


Accountability is a reachable goal, a believable concept in education. Objectives must be written and methods of reaching competence devised, but each student is capable of a level of competence. Before they can be held accountable, those in education may have to be trained in new methods of teaching because they are used to performing in a teacher-subject oriented setting, but Deterling comments that "the things that we are doing now aren't easy either, so we might as well do it right."


The important concept of accountability is discussed in a critique denouncing it in its present state as "a marketing device for vendors, a selling device for school administrators, and a slogan for politicians.


Dorsett Educational Systems, Inc., was awarded a contract to conduct an educational experiment in Texarkana schools. The article briefly states the basic provisions of the contract.

The article contends there is definitely a need for reform in educational planning and budgeting. "Out of this reform at all levels should come the ability to organize and function in such a fashion as to permit accountability as the usual way of doing business. The accountability movement is an excellent thing for education, but we should beware of the pitfall of becoming the only public institution operating on this basis."


Uniform, reliable diagnostic and evaluative measures that can be compared statewide or nationwide are necessary in the Title I reading programs. Current testing procedures do not measure all phases of reading ability for they were not constructed to be used as they are in corrective and developmental reading programs. The terms that are used to describe gain or loss in reading skills are in need of clarification, for there are many thus far uncontrolled variables.


A structure for dealing with accountability, measuring the performance of a system, and a proposal for development of a system, i.e., Office of Accountability Information, are the topics of Durstine's paper.

Dyer, Henry S. "Toward Objective Criteria of Professional Accountability in the Schools of New York City." Phi Delta Kappan, LII (December, 1970), 206-211.

A school effectiveness index (SEI) can be developed over a period of years (two or three for a short-range program) to serve as a reliable measure of a school's accountability. Input, educational process, surrounding conditions, and output are the four groups of variables that must be taken into consideration in order to develop criteria for accountability. The SEI could be used to compare the effectiveness of schools and by the comparison provide a basis for improvement.


In the future performance contracts may be negotiated in many phases of education, such as job-training for prison inmates and the drop-out program in Texarkana. National priorities will not change, probably, the percentage of the budget that will go to various departments or programs; therefore, performance contracting may be the way for the citizen to be assured he is getting what he is paying for.

The age of performance contracting-accountability is upon us, and the Texarkana experiment in performance contracting with private industry for rapid improvement in pupil achievement has started a nationwide trend.


Elam places in juxtaposition the "Texarkana situation" and historical accounts of teacher performance and accountability. He cites examples in Canada, 1876-1882, and in Georgia, 1819.


After discussion of varied aspects of accountability, performance contracting, and governance, the article focuses on the internal performance contracting taking place in the Mesa, Arizona, Public Schools. The Mesa plan seems to make governance and accountability interdependent.


In May, 1969, the U. S. Office of Education awarded a $270,000 grant to Texarkana schools for a five-year dropout prevention program. Schools hope to eradicate potential dropout's deficiencies in reading and mathematics and improve quality of regular instructional program.

Filagamo, Martin J. "Texarkana Battles Dropout Dilemma." Elementary English, XLVII (February, 1970), 305-308.

Dorsett Educational Systems, Inc. awarded a contract to utilize multi-media approach in Texarkana schools on potential dropouts due to educational deficiencies are to demonstrate that one approach does exist to introduce quality control and accountability into public education.

"Florida Accountability Plan Focuses on the Principal." Nation's Schools, LXXVI (November, 1970), 54-55.

The Lake County School District has formulated a plan whereby principals are encouraged to submit plans for improvements in their schools (within specified areas). The written plan includes the specific need and what and how the principal intends to do. Accountability pay is in addition to the regular salary. The written proposal of one principal is included.
Accountability in public schools is being demanded and cities throughout the United States are turning to guaranteed performance contracts to raise student achievement to the national norm.


Garvue suggests that all sectors of the economy should be held accountable—not just public education. Realizing that accountability is imperative, many changes will have to occur in existing institutions and power structures in order for the ultimate in accountability to be attained.


The author feels that "Right to Read Program" has placed librarians in the middle of the "accountability" issue. If we do not deny with dollars our commitment to equal educational opportunity for the poor, compensatory programs will justify themselves.


The performance contract is discussed as a means of achieving accountability. A detailed-outlined plan for planning a program and receiving bids for a contract are presented. Grayboff very clearly states who is responsible for what in negotiating a performance contract.


Accountability, the demand for public schools to prove that students can meet reasonable standards of achievement at various levels, brings about two approaches—PPBS or resource allocation and National Assessment which focuses on sampling what children, youth, and young adults have learned.


Junior colleges can become effective higher education institutions by writing goals and objectives, by implementing methods and evaluative procedures to achieve the goals and objectives, and by periodically re-evaluating the effectiveness of the programs offered; the effectiveness is measured by the success of its students. The excellent institution is not the one where 60 per cent of the students fail, but the institution where 90 percent of the students succeed in performing skills based on their studies.

The school district's newsletter is the means by which to convey to the public how the district is striving to be accountable.


Two viewpoints on accountability are given, the viewpoint of private industry and the viewpoint of teachers. The private industry account deals primarily with performance contracting and cites examples from the Texarkana schools and the Gary, Indiana, schools. The teachers viewpoint is more concerned with accountability and how the responsibility for accountability will be delegated and evaluated. An example is given of the Portland School System.

"How Schoolmen View Accountability." National's Schools, LXXXV (June, 1970), 33.

The results of a nationwide poll shows accountability overwhelmingly approved by schoolmen, but gives a much dimmer view of performance contracts with private firms.


The public is demanding that institutions of learning be held accountable for money spent. Methods of doing so are statewide evaluation programs (unsatisfactory because they do not differentiate goals, do not promote variety, and cause teaching to the test) and committees composed of faculty representatives who evaluate methods used and course objectives and suggest alternatives when ones used are not satisfactory.


The six-step problem solving model of Corrigan and Kaufman for application to education is related to current tools for implementing and evaluating procedures in education. Conceivably, accountability would be implemented by the integration of currently utilized tools and the "system approach" to education model.


Change needs control and the "control" is evident in the progression of a program of "management by objectives." Kennedy outlines the steps in planning for management by objectives: goal setting, determining needs, setting objectives, developing a program structure, policies, procedures, and development of program plans. The plan is applicable to both the public and private institution.

At its best, performance contracting should utilize the talents and abilities of the public, school board, administration, teachers, and industry, working together, becoming accountable for giving youth the best education possible.


Kruger gives the aspects of promoting educational accountability by use of educational program auditing. The auditing measures the project's actual performance against the educational objectives it has set for itself.

"Large Majority Favors Teacher Accountability." Nation's Schools, LXXXVI (December, 1970), 33.

In an opinion poll, 72% of administrators polled were in favor of making teachers formally accountable for classroom performance of their students. Many concurred that procedures for evaluating teacher performance were the major drawback of an accountability plan.


New educational movement is in progress—the age of accountability. The article attempts to describe some of the more important potential impacts of review and reform in the educational system.


Schools are insistently being asked to account for results of their programs. Lessinger draws up an overall educational redevelopment plan to respond to the new challenge.


Lessinger explains the new process of accountability and how its application to public education can be a "concrete, practical activity" that educators can use to confront some of the most critical educational dilemmas, including re-establishment of confidence in our educational system.


With the idea of schools being accountable for their educational output, the Texarkana plan revolves around a performance contract with Dorsett Educational Systems, Inc., in which a special teaching group will be reimbursed according to how well the students in its program do on a set of standardized tests.

Lessinger details the responsibilities and tasks of the legal education agency (LEA) and the management support group (MSG) as they produce a request for proposal (RFP) on which bids are received from private enterprise. The independent education accomplishment audit (IEAA) assists in controlling the quality of the program. Important advantages of performance contracts are the turnkey and innovative features.


Lessinger, Leon M. "Focus on the Learner: Central Concern of Accountability in Education." Audiovisual Instruction, XV (June/July, 1970), 42-44.

Lessinger evaluates accountability in education from many stand-points. He suggests developmental capital and educational engineering as possible routes for improving output in education. Expected changes, the result of the call for accountability, will make education more relevant for the student as the school becomes learner oriented rather than teacher oriented.

Lessinger, Leon M. "How Educational Audits Measure Performance." Nation's Schools, LXXXV (June, 1970), 33-34.

Leading advocate of accountability discusses the Independent Accomplishment Audit with emphasis on learning and student performance as a result of financial outlays. Local school personnel and students designed to serve in problem-solving mode of thinking with focus upon student attitudes, skills, and knowledge in specific areas. Outlined is a model audit system.


Accountability will inevitably produce some outstanding changes in education. Emphasis will be on the learning rather than on the teaching. Six concomitants of accountability of education are discussed.


The author believes to have an antidote to the Peter Principle. The counter-principle to Peter is the Principle of Public Stewardship through Accountability. It states that "independent, continuous and publicly reported outside review of promised results of a bureaucracy promotes competence and responsiveness in that bureaucracy."

The authors offer a performance-criteria approach to writing educational proposals which would promise greater economy in the allocation of education resources.


Whether it is the compared relationship of "input" and "educational output" or the "voucher system," accountability is here to stay.


Accountability can be achieved through a series of charters of accountability--the school system, the school district, division, or department, each writes their charter of accountability--measurement of the success of the charters, and teacher-supervisor accountability interviews. Management by objectives is given a large role.


Mr. Lovett attempts to determine three indeterminables of the teacher accountability controversy: "Who Is Accountable?"; "To Whom Is He Accountable?"; and "For What Is He Responsible?" Mr. Lovett recognizes there are many influencing factors in the accountability chain--a chain that extends responsibility to the parents, society, teacher training institutions, supervisors, and administrators as well as the classroom teacher.


Those working in public education are indeed accountable. "Accountability must include all components: teacher education, state departments, local schools and private enterprises which are involved in the education program." Each component may have to review or re-evaluate its contribution as goals are determined and means of reaching the goals are implemented.


Because of improved facilities, changes, innovations, etc., public education has reached the age of accountability. The school as a whole is being held accountable, and who becomes accountable depends on the governance issue. Ideally the community, school board, administrators, and teachers will work together to govern and account for public education.


Accountability of higher education would contribute to the general welfare of the whole population, not just the young. Contribution should be through improved performance in environmental quality, social justice, and world peace.


The article gives the major elements of a plan submitted to the Michigan Legislature for educational reform. Accountability is stressed in sense of accomplishment, what students learn, and how to measure it.


Although accountability is a new term, accountability, despite new emphasis, is not new to teachers and schools. Norris delineates the reasons for the accountability movement; he states the requirements to be met if the accountability movement is to be successful and productive.


Dorsett Educational Systems, Inc., is under performance contract with Texarkana schools to take over the job of teaching curriculum to a large number of disadvantaged students. The basic agreements of the contract and opinions of those involved are reviewed.


Motzkus weaves a humorous satire criticizing aspects of educational accountability by relating these same aspects to accountability in religion.


Nordh writes an editorial commenting on the public's insistence on accountability and the role of the community college in answering that insistence.

A plan of action to implement accountability can be formulated and carried out by the school district that realizes the need for success in the public school. Nottingham gives a model plan that determines the goals, the behavior indicative of having attained the goals, needs assessment, problem identification, solution strategies, resources available, selection of a solution strategy, implementation and evaluation. The individual district's plan can be formulated and carried out by the existing personnel, and evaluated by the people participating.


Growing pressures of the two aspects of accountability question have the funds been spent for the purpose intended and what effective use has been made of them.


As an alternative to performance contracting as a means of achieving accountability, teacher incentive agreements are being promoted in some school districts, e.g., Portland, Oregon; Dallas, Texas; and Washington, D.C. Teachers have not been over eager in responding to teacher incentive contracts, and controversy has resulted in some cases.


Primarily a report on the Texarkana situation, there is reference to a new contract made by the Philadelphia schools with Behavioral Research Laboratories for a reading program in grades 1-8.


Due to a large percentage of dropouts and student achievement below the national norm, Texarkana schools have involved private industry to aid them in teaching.


Elementary and secondary education techniques use measures of input as prime criteria for performance, but the article stresses the importance of "holding the school accountable for results in terms of student learning rather than solely in the use of input resources."

Rather than serving only as a regulatory agency, state education departments should exercise their judgment, competency, and leadership in educational matters and actively seek to improve education state wide by offering their services and recommendations to local school districts.


Public schools are faced with educating all the children of all the public. Many teachers are aware of the differences of their students, but since they are protected by state law plus a master contract, they are not held accountable. To fulfill their roles, citizens are beginning to realize that teachers must be held accountable.


National Assessment, designed not to demonstrate relationships between what is taught and what is learned, but to describe what people know, is discussed, and accountability is stressed as the seed that must germinate and grow or National Assessment will be meaningless.


Accountability as measured for the humanists, the teacher and the student, consists of action conducive to the betterment of humanity by the teacher in the classroom and society and by the student's behavior in society. To determine what is humane, research should be conducted and criteria determined, for the author contends that "the "cult of gut response," has now gone too far."


Rajpal writes of a study designed to examine the relationship between selected measures of educational quality and expenditure in public secondary schools of Iowa with the influence of school district size held constant.


Accountability is looked at from a humanistic point of view. People are asking education to reassure them about the future—to provide them with some of the answers—to give them a measure of security. "...behavioral objectives are not what accountability is all about. Nor is it even programmed learning, accounting systems, cost effectiveness, and interminable testing, for these are simply irritating manifestations of much larger pressures on the public school. Two of these pressures are (1) change and its accelerating rate of occurrence, and (2) the onrushing future."

The Keokuk (Iowa) Secondary Schools wrote a performance contract patterned after the Texarkana program for a summer reading improvement program. The Keokuk program had no elaborate machines and was devised within the school and administered by local faculty. Reynolds uses the success of the program as an incentive to schools to organize and administer their own performance contract--accountability programs rather than negotiating with private business, which tends to mechanize learning.


Teachers should look at performance contracting as an opportunity to evaluate new methods and procedures that would make public education and teachers more accountable.


Robinson, in an editorial, gives a brief overview of accountability, its criticisms, and its strengths.


The community college has "adopted a philosophy of educational opportunity for all--all abilities, all social and economic classes, all interests and all ages." The community college can and must fulfill this philosophy and become accountable to the community that supports the programs. Programs should be designed and teachers hired with the policy in the foreground that the institution will be accountable.


Performance contracting, the idea of requiring measurable increases in learning achievement before payment, is discussed as a method to raise poor students up to or above national grade level norms.


Schure presents a model for attaining accountability in occupationally related schools through the extensive and intensive use of a computerized system. The model system he proposes is programmed to account for and report on all variables that should be considered to prepare individualized programs for students. Diagrams are given.

Due to prodding by USOE officials, Congressmen, cost-conscious citizens, and administrators are beginning to focus on what comes out of their schools, not what goes in. The performance contracting concept is applied to accountability.


Accountability is the honoring of promises made to educators to children and their parents. Some examples of the routes to the goal of accountability are (1) performance contracts, (2) teacher support contracts, (3) teacher union contracts, and (4) internal accountability.


Shanberg delineates the concepts, planning, and work involved in an experiment at Hillsborough Junior College in Florida for the community college to become accountable for the learning successes of students.


The article questions how publishers can guarantee performance to those using their books, for the book may succeed and fail simultaneously. The publisher can guarantee the editorship and expertise that went into the book.


Accountability for results is a new basic principle for education, and private industry is beginning to bid for a place in public education. Texarkana schools together with Dorsett Educational Systems are working to raise the level of achievement in poor students.


The classroom teacher is willing to accept accountability as it is defined by leading educators. This special article specifies for what, to whom, and under what conditions the teacher accepts accountability. Teachers specify what they would like local, state, and national associations to do about accountability.


Vocational-technical instruction is an area of education where the factors to be accountable for are easily determined and measured. The Air Force training system has long been accountable for its trainees; it might well be used as a civilian model. Much civilian research duplicates areas already explored by the military. Military-civilian cooperation would aid in achieving accountability for vocational-technical instruction in public education.

In CBE (competency-based education) teacher training programs, sponsored by USOE's National Center for Educational Research and Development, students work through a series of instructional modules at their own pace. Teachers would be certified because they had acquired effective teaching methods.


Performance contracts seem to be the new vehicle for institutional change. Several of the major cities of the U. S. are making use of private industry to raise student achievement to the standard norms.


Criterion-referenced tests should be developed and published to test for specific skills that are emphasized in performance contracts and accountability plans.


Schoolmen are having to re-evaluate the innovative programs that in the past were promoted as panaceas. Now schoolmen must determine the "troubled" areas and promote specific programs as the public is demanding accountability. Underwood gives the method that the Fargo, North Dakota, schools use for writing objectives and determining priorities.


Wagoner, a member of the Seattle School Board, gives a board member's viewpoint on accountability. He suggests it is the school board's obligation to argue for accountability and objective performance criteria in collective bargaining sessions with teacher organizations. He calls to account many big city schools where conditions are deteriorating. "If accountability in the classroom is not recognized, it will be the children who pay the piper."


A look is taken at the various aspects or characteristics for a zero-failure school system. Methods of determining failures are discussed and suggestions for correction given. The responsibility is given to the teacher, the student, and the curriculum.

This is an editorial discussing professionals being held accountable for standards they do not govern; they have responsibility for effective teaching but lack authority to improve quality in their own ranks. When there is a board composed of teachers for establishing standards for licensing, certification, practices, and conduct, then teachers can be held accountable to the public for their profession.


Wildavsky gives four alternatives for an accountability plan in the elementary school. He recommends the principal as the center of accountability. Accountability would give a measure of security to teachers and principals for they would know specifically for what goal or toward what objective they were working and they would know on what basis their competency would be judged.