A representative group from The United Methodist Church met to consider continuing education of the ordained pastor and to formulate recommendations for the church's strategy in ministerial continuing education. After a paper on continuing professional education, another described the minister as a professional—educated, expert, institutional, responsible, and dedicated. A plea was made for systematic career planning and careful research on career development. A partial report was given of a national survey made in 1968 to obtain a profile of leadership in continuing education for ministers, to count participants, and to gather data on evaluation. A review was made of major categories of programs, support for them, the denominational organizations intended to serve them, and several innovations. A final paper discussed cybernation as responsible for heightening the anxiety of loss of meaning of the human role. A panel discussion on the minister's needs led to formulations of objectives for the minister's continuing education and recommendations for United Methodist strategy development in continuing education.

(pt)
TOWARD A STRATEGY IN
CONTINUING EDUCATION:

PROCEEDINGS of
THE CONSULTATION on
CONTINUING EDUCATION for
MINISTERS of
The United Methodist Church

October 20-23, 1968
The Center For Continuing Education
The University of Chicago
TOWARD A STRATEGY
IN CONTINUING EDUCATION:

PROCEEDINGS OF THE CONSULTATION
ON CONTINUING EDUCATION FOR MINISTERS OF
THE UNITED METHODIST CHURCH

October 20-23, 1968

The Center for Continuing Education
The University of Chicago

Mark A. Rouch
Editor
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mark A. Rouch</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section I - MAJOR PAPERS AND PRESENTATIONS</td>
<td><strong>EMERGING DIRECTIONS IN CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Alan B. Knox</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>MINISTRY AS A PROFESSION</strong></td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>James D. Glasse</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>THE MINISTER'S CAREER DEVELOPMENT</strong></td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Edgar W. Mills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>CONTINUING EDUCATION FOR MINISTRY: PERSONNEL, PARTICIPATION, AND EVALUATION - Report of a Survey</strong></td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Connolly C. Gamble, Jr.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>A REVIEW OF CONTINUING EDUCATION FOR UNITED METHODIST MINISTERS</strong></td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mark A. Rouch</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>THE NATURE AND EFFECTS OF CYBERNATION</strong></td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Edward C. McIrvine</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>THE MINISTER'S NEEDS IN CONTINUING EDUCATION A PANEL DISCUSSION</strong></td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section II - FORMULATIONS</td>
<td><strong>OBJECTIVES FOR THE MINISTER'S CONTINUING EDUCATION</strong></td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>RECOMMENDATIONS FOR UNITED METHODIST STRATEGY DEVELOPMENT IN CONTINUING EDUCATION FOR MINISTERS</strong></td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>ROSTER</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

Mark A. Rouch

This Proceedings reports the Consultation on Continuing Education for Ministers in The United Methodist Church, held at The Center for Continuing Education, University of Chicago, in October 1968. For the first time, a representative group from throughout The United Methodist Church assembled to consider the continuing education of the ordained ministry.

The 1960's have been marked by a rapidly growing interest in and sense of need for the continuing education of the Church's professional leadership. Increasingly, The United Methodist Church, through its two antecedent denominations—The Evangelical United Brethren and Methodist Churches—has been involved in this development and at the Uniting General Conference of 1968 made definite assignments of responsibility for continuing education and adopted the following statement to be made a part in its new Discipline:

Par. 355. The minister shall be encouraged to continue his education throughout his career, including a carefully developed personal program of study augmented periodically by involvement in organized educational activities. In most cases the minister's continuing education program should allow for leaves of absence for study at least one week each year and at least one month during one year of each quadrennium. Such leaves shall not be considered as part of the minister's vacation and shall be planned in consultation with his charge or other agency to which he is appointed as well as his bishop, district superintendent, and Annual Conference continuing education committee.
Because of this growing concern as well as the fact of a new Church, it seemed to the Department of the Ministry that the time was right to hold a major consultation on the minister's continuing education. In January 1968, action was taken by the Department which resulted in the Chicago Consultation.

Those who assembled in Chicago represented a wide diversity of groups related to the minister's continuing education. It included bishops designated by the Council of Bishops; district superintendents; representatives from the seminaries, including several deans and presidents; annual conference officers whose jobs relate to continuing education; and staff members of general church agencies. The largest single group was pastors, who had been invited with the assumption that the Church could not plan adequately for the pastor's continuing education without his counsel.

The Consultation focused on the ordained pastor, but it was assumed that the denomination's strategy would include eventually many of its professional employees--lay and ordained. The scope of the Chicago Consultation was limited to the ordained pastor, partly to make the subject manageable for the diverse group assembled and partly because ordained pastors are the largest present group for whom continuing education needs to be available.

The Consultation was asked to formulate recommendations for main lines of The United Methodist Church's strategy in ministerial continuing education. This was its principal task, and the recommendations which it formulated are recorded in this volume.

While the recommendations concern the denomination's strategy, they themselves are actually its first major step. As a second step, the recommendations will be brought to the Department of the Ministry in January of

---

1Division of Higher Education, United Methodist Board of Education
1969, when they will be reviewed and steps taken to set the strategy in motion.

The Department of the Ministry in calling the Consultation decided that it should include a number of groups and agencies in the Church concerned with the minister's continuing education. The job before the Church in this area is great. Failure will exact a high cost; success will bring high rewards. Consequently, the Church must muster its full resources and bring them to bear upon the task ahead. While the recommendations from the Consultation will come directly back to the Department of the Ministry which called it, it is hoped that many throughout the Church will use them as they work in continuing education.

It is hoped, furthermore, that this Proceedings will contribute to the growing literature from various sources on the minister's continuing education, and that many outside The United Methodist Church can profit from it. Much of what it records is applicable to professional ministers generally.

In this connection, it should be said explicitly that those planning the Consultation and those participating in it have assumed that the United Methodist strategy should relate at every possible point to that of other denominations and that much of the strategy should be carried out ecumenically.

Finally, great appreciation should be expressed to all who made this event possible, of whom only a few can be mentioned: First, the participants whose names are listed in the Roster. The Consultation was not for them; it was of them and by them. Next, the guest consultants, each one of whom went at his work carefully and with concern; the other members of the Department of the Ministry staff who spent many behind-the-scenes hours to help guide the planning; and finally, the planning committee whose names should be
listed because the Church should know that these men spent long hours of hard work, without which the Consultation could not have been held, and because of which it was allowed to be productive: Quentin C. Lansman, Richard Murray, Everett W. Palmer, Joseph D. Quillian, Jr., George W. Richards, James S. Thomas and Newell J. Wert.
Section I

MAJOR PAPERS AND PRESENTATIONS

EMERGING DIRECTIONS IN CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION
   .......................................................... Alan B. Knox

MINISTRY AS A PROFESSION ................................. James D. Glasse

THE MINISTER'S CAREER DEVELOPMENT ..................... Edgar W. Mills

CONTINUING EDUCATION FOR MINISTRY:
   PERSONNEL, PARTICIPATION, AND EVALUATION

A REVIEW OF CONTINUING EDUCATION FOR
   UNITED METHODIST MINISTERS .......................... Mark A. Rouch

THE NATURE AND EFFECTS OF CYBERNATION ................. Edward C. McIrvine

THE MINISTER'S NEEDS IN CONTINUING EDUCATION - A PANEL DISCUSSION
EMERGING DIRECTIONS IN CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION

Alan B. Knox

BROAD FIELD OF ADULT AND CONTINUING EDUCATION IN THE UNITED STATES

Historic Trends

The contemporary emphasis on continuing professional education, which Professor House (8) refers to as the lengthened line of learning, is in sharp contrast to the emphasis on adult and continuing education a century ago. Today, almost one out of five American adults continues his education in an organized way on a part-time basis each year. However, the likelihood of their doing so is greater for adults with successively higher levels of formal education. A century ago, as Grattan (7) so effectively describes, the major thrust of adult education was to provide educational opportunities for educationally disadvantaged adults. The public schools gave special attention to recent immigrants with evening classes on Americanization, basic literacy and vocational skills. Cities such as Boston (1834), Louisville (1834), and New York (1847), pioneered with adult education classes, but by the turn of the century, evening classes had become common in the cities that were receiving a large influx of foreign born adults. Although some colleges provided public lecture series (beginning with Rutgers, 1816; Yale and Columbia in the 1830's; Harvard in 1840) the major period of establishment for higher adult education came in the 1880's when the first twelve university extension divisions were organized.

Prepared for the Consultation on Continuing Education for United Methodist Ministers, October 20-23, 1968.

Dr. Knox is chairman of the Department of Adult Education, Teachers College, Columbia University.
The American Society for the Extension of University Teaching flourished between 1890 and 1916. Organizations aside from the schools were being formed during the latter part of the 1800's, with adult education as one of their functions, (e.g., YMCA, 1851; YWCA, 1858; AAUW, 1882; General Federation of Women's Clubs, 1892; and the PTA in 1897). From the Civil War to World War II, an animating force in adult education was a missionary spirit to provide remedial and compensatory education to educationally disadvantaged adults. This remedial emphasis has continued until today as indicated by programs such as manpower development, adult basic education, and job corps.

However, in recent decades there has been a substantial shift in emphasis from remedial adult education programs for those who "missed out earlier," to developmental programs of continuing education that are widespread components of work, family, and community life for many adults. This trend reflects the impact of specialization, rapid social change, and the voluntary nature of adult education in which those with higher levels of formal education seem to be most highly stimulated to engage in further education on a part-time basis.

**Contemporary Scope**

Today, we are witnessing the emergence of an educative society in which education is a major and pervasive force in many aspects of life. One reason why more emphasis should be given to the continuing education of professionals is that education is becoming a dominant institution in our society. We seem to be phasing out of a period in which political and economic institutions have been dominant in our society and entering...
a period in which education is becoming a dominant social institution. There are many societal characteristics that are producing the increased prominence of educational institutions. Two of the most pervasive characteristics of our contemporary society are complexity and change. Complexity is apparent in the fragmentation of social relationships, in occupational specialization, and in the interrelatedness of urban problems. Social change, which de Tocqueville noted in 1835 as the central theme of our country, is occurring today on a more extensive scale and at an accelerating pace. Two of the results of our contemporary societal complexity and change are the rise of the knowledge worker and the decline of bureaucracy, both of which have implications for education. As Drucker (6) has indicated, an increasing proportion of our labor force can be classified as knowledge workers, (persons who require specialized education and training for their work, who must process information and participate in decision making).

In his article on "The Coming Death of Bureaucracy," Bennis (3) has asserted that "every age develops an organizational form appropriate to its genius"; and that the pyramidal bureaucratic structure (with a well defined chain of command, formal rules, a division of labor based on specialization, promotion based on technical competence, and impersonality in human relations) developed during the Victorian era in response to the industrial organizations' need for order and precision in the management of routine, and the workers' demands for impartial treatment. It is Bennis' contention that the emerging organizational structures that are replacing bureaucratic structures must solve some basic organizational
problems such as integration of individual needs and organizational goals, the distribution of organizational power, collaboration to resolve conflicts, adaptation to changing conditions, and revitalization or self-renewal in relation to emerging goals. Bennis has concluded that the post-bureaucratic organizational arrangements for work will be associated with five conditions. The first condition is an organizational environment characterized by collaboration rather than competition, with other large-scale complex and multi-national organizations that are oriented to deal with turbulence and uncertainty. The second condition is a population characterized by universal higher education and necessary continuing education throughout adulthood to deal with rapid change and obsolescence. The third condition is personal work values characterized by greater intellectual commitment to the job with concomitant participation in decision making and autonomy from traditional rules. The fourth condition is a relationship between organizational and personal goals, in which complex and changing organizational goals will require teams of diversified and highly trained specialists who will divide their loyalty between their professional values and organizational structures characterized by adaptive, rapidly changing, temporary task forces that are formed as organizational tasks emerge and are disbanded as problems are resolved. The fifth condition is personal work motivations that are characterized not by enduring work relationships but by satisfactions intrinsic in the task and by satisfactions associated with the recurring search for organizational arrangements that are most appropriate for each emerging task.
In the types of new organizational settings that Bennis predicts, education is a crucial ingredient. Research is both a source of change and a means to guide it. Preparatory education of children and youth provides the foundation for both stability based on a knowledge of the past and change based on a search for a better future. Continuing education of adults provides the necessary basis for continued growth and adaptation that is required if the individual is to cope with change and complexity. Both stages of education are reflected in Clark's analysis of efforts to educate the expert society. Also, Bennis' emphasis on changing organizational goals underscores the importance of Dewey's assertion that, "what a society is, it is, by and large, as a product of education, as far as its animating spirit and purpose is concerned." (5; p. 75)

There are other writers who have speculated about the emergence of the educational institution as a dominant social institutional form in our society. The analysis by Bell (2) of the relationship between the universities and society is exceedingly parallel to the preceding analysis by Bennis. Bell noted that "the university is a striking example of endurance among social institutions." What has survived is its social purpose, its independence, and its form of internal government. The American university has performed multiple functions including the production of research and scholarship, the facilitation of upward mobility, the preparation of persons for professional occupations, and the provision of community service in the form of extension education to individuals and consultation to organizations. Looking to the near future, however, Bell has asserted that "in the emerging post-industrial society the
university is taking on a vastly different role. It is becoming one of the active shapers of the society, taking over, perhaps, the role which the business firm played in the past hundred years." Bell summarizes this changing relationship between the American university and society with six assertions.

1. "The university is becoming one of the chief innovative forces in the society. Insofar as economic development is increasingly dependent on research and new knowledge, the role of the university has been enlarged, and it is becoming one of the determinants, rather than a passive reflector, of social change."

2. "The university is becoming the chief determinant of the stratification system of the society. Insofar as position in the society is increasingly determined by the kind and amount of education one obtains, the degree-granting power of the university (particularly the advanced degrees), the grading system, and the network of elite universities all become decisive to one's chances of moving up in the society."

3. "The job of mass higher education will become the predominant task of the colleges in the last third of the twentieth century. By 1975, as many as half of all youths aged eighteen to twenty-one will be seeking some kind of college education and higher degree. The definition of 'educated' will change radically, and the
what is 'an education' will have new answers."

4. "As society becomes more differentiated, both in knowledge and in tasks, the university takes over the function (once handled largely 'on the job') of training persons for specialization."

5. "Insofar as old skills will become obsolete and traditional subjects will erode, a new concept of 'continuing education' will come to the fore. The older notion that the possession of a college degree is a plateau of life is vanishing. Educated individuals will require continual training and, in fact, may have as many as two or three different 'careers' within a working lifetime. The formalization of continuing education will be one of the next great tasks of the university."

6. "The university has become, at least in American life, the major focus of the intellectual and, to some extent, the established cultural life of the country."

It is in this type of society in which educational institutions and educational process in non-educational institutions are so central, that adult education exists and functions. From the standpoint of the individual adult there are many activities related to learning and adaptation. Many are informal, but some are formalized to the extent to which they can be included in a definition of adult and continuing education. It is assumed that education results in learning, but that there are additional criteria that must be met if an activity is to be classified as
educational for the purpose of delimiting the domain of adult education. One criterion is that as the adult engages in the learning activity, a primary purpose of the learner should be to solve a problem or alter his competence through the modification of knowledge, skills, and attitudes. An adult who viewed a single program in an educational television (E.T.V.) literature course in which he was interested enough to enroll would therefore qualify, whereas another adult who happened to view the same program for entertainment purposes would not. A second criterion for an activity to be defined as education is that it be systematic and sustained. An adult who decided upon a topic on which he would like to increase his knowledge, who selected a relevant sequence of books and articles, and who periodically evaluated his progress would therefore qualify, whereas another adult who happened to read one of the articles would not. A third criterion related to the second is that someone perform the mentor role consisting of helping to establish objectives, select and organize relevant learning activities, and evaluate progress. The mentor role may be performed by a teacher in a group setting, a counselor-tutor in an individual setting, a writer in a mass media setting, or the learner may perform the role for himself.

To define education for adults in this somewhat restricted way should not imply that other ways in which adults learn are less important. Certainly, informal information seeking through print and electronic media or through interpersonal contact is essential for most adults to function effectively and to adapt gradually to changing circumstances. In addition, exposure to the arts and humanities provides experiences that enrich and enoble. However, activities defined as education in this more restricted
way provide a somewhat different reference point for generalizing about continuing professional education than does the wider range of informal information seeking activities and participation in cultural activities. It is in relation to this narrower definition of education that the contemporary scope of adult education will be described and the emergence of continuing professional education as a sub-field will be analyzed. In doing so, however, it is recognized that effective programs of continuing professional education should be related at several points with a wide range of informal personnel development activities that lie outside of this restricted definition.

There are six major characteristics of contemporary adult education that together characterize the field. They are extent of participation, characteristics of participants, topics studied, instructional settings, sponsors, and the part-time arrangements for both learners and teachers.

Johnstone and Rivera (9) in their national study conducted in 1962, estimated that approximately 25 million American adults, more than one person in five, engaged in adult education during the previous year. Almost 9 million of these engaged in independent study. On the basis of recent trends, it is likely that there will be about 30 million participants in adult education during the current year.

Adult education participants are broadly representative of American adults regarding region, race, urbanness, sex and marital status. Participants tend to be younger and have higher level jobs and income than the adult population. However, the characteristic that most differentiates
participants from non-participants is level of formal education. The association between level of education and participation during the previous year in adult education is very strong, ranging from nine per cent of those who completed eight years of schooling, to 15 per cent of those who completed some high school, to 24 per cent of high school graduates, to 36 per cent of those who completed some college, to 39 per cent of college graduates, to 47 per cent of those who completed more than four years of college. Clearly, education "begs" more education in our voluntary system of adult education.

The topics that adults elect to study tend to cluster around major adult life roles. About one-third of adult education is vocational and about one-fifth is recreationally oriented. In addition to education related to their roles as worker and as user of leisure, adults study topics related to their roles as family members, organization members and church members. Unfortunately, less than five per cent is related to citizen role. A small proportion, such as participation Great Books discussion groups, is liberal education that is oriented towards man as man in a holistic sense, instead of a fragmented concern for man at work or man at play.

The broad field of adult and continuing education contains a great variety of programs, in terms of educational objectives and types of teaching-learning transactions. The content reflected in the objectives covers the wide range of man's subject matter knowledge. The behavioral changes reflected in the objectives include modification of information,
understanding of relationships, critical judgment, creative imagination, skills, attitudes, and competence. Adult education participants seek to achieve educational objectives within four types of settings in which the teaching-learning transaction occurs, individual, group, organizational, and community. The individual setting includes correspondence study and E.T.V. courses. The temporary group setting includes the typical evening class in which adults without previous contact assemble for the class each week and at the end of the course go their separate ways. The organizational setting includes in-service training for work groups in which the prior and subsequent working relationships between the learners have a major influence on the program. The community setting emphasizes working relationships between different organizations and segments of a neighborhood or community.

Programs of adult education are sponsored by all types of institutions and organizations in our society. Some of the sponsors are educational institutions such as schools, higher education institutions, and Cooperative Extension Service. However, more than half of adult education is sponsored by a wide variety of other organizations such as employers, churches, professional and trade associations, community organizations (e.g., libraries, museums, YWCA's), voluntary associations (e.g., labor unions, League of Women Voters), and the mass media (e.g., E.T.V.). The largest segments of adult education are sponsored by higher education (21%), churches and synagogues (21%), community organizations (15%), employers (12%), and the schools (12%).
Part of the earlier definition of adult education was that the learners engaged in the student role part time, in addition to full time responsibilities in their roles as worker, family member, church member, organization member, and citizen. In addition, most of the teachers of adults do so part time with their major occupational time devoted to either teaching pre-adults or work in the occupational field about which they are teaching adults (e.g., the lawyer teaching a tax law course one evening a week). This "part timeness" of both learners and teachers has major implications for understanding the typical role performance of teachers, administrators, and learners. The teachers' relation to the adult education agency or program is an individual contractual one in contrast to the "faculty" of full time teachers at a school or college. Also, the teachers of pre-adults tend to transfer their typical practices to their teaching of adults, sometimes inappropriately. One result of these two characteristics is that the full-time program administrator makes a major contribution to the planning and conducting of the educational program, especially when two or more teachers are involved. One typical aspect of the administrators role is to convey to the teacher, pertinent information about the learners. The learners tend to approach the study of many topics differently than they would have as adolescents, in part because of their concurrent adult experience. Political science topics relate to their participation in a political campaign or a school bond issue, family sociology topics relate to their position between young children and aging parents, and accounting topics relate to their experiences in the bookkeeping department of their employers company.
Within the past two decades, the efforts to develop cohesive programs of continuing education for specific professional groups has become more widespread. Within the past two years, persons connected with single professional fields have tried to discover similarities and differences between their programs of continuing professional education and continuing education programs in other professional fields. At what points would it seem reasonable to expect similarities between programs of continuing education in separate professional fields? Certainly not in the specialized professional knowledge that is transmitted. It is this professional knowledge that differentiates one profession from another. Two probable points of similarity are suggested. One is the liberal education component in programs of continuing professional education, and the second is the program development process. By program development is meant the process by which potential participants for a program are identified, priorities are established regarding what should be accomplished, the educational program is planned, the planners find out how successful the program was, and the needed resources are organized.

The term continuing professional education includes the wide range of ways in which adults who are already engaged in one of the major professional fields that are typically entered through college preparation, continue to increase their knowledge and competence in a systematic and sustained way. Often continuing education is viewed as a way of raising the level of practice in the professional field. The term does not refer to preparatory education prior to entering into a profession, although it
is recognized that the quality of preparatory education has an impact on the extent to which a professional person engages in continuing education. The term does include, however, the great variety of ways in which continuing professional education programs are developed. Some examples of these ways include a televised course for clergymen, a self-study by teachers in a school system in preparation for a curriculum revision project, a committee of architects preparing the program for a professional conference, a group of faculty members and experts in a nursing school developing a symposium on new developments in the field, the membership of a local chapter of a social work association undertaking a program of education for itself, a chairman of a hospital department designing an extended program of systematic observation and consultation related to a new development in the field for a junior staff member, and an attorney undertaking a program of education for himself utilizing published materials and correspondence courses that he can study at home or in the office. These illustrations will suggest the wide range of activities from which the components of a specific program of continuing professional education may be selected. In addition to these types of systematic learning activities, professional persons come in contact with other sources of new ideas such as friendship groups, magazine articles, and salesmen of new goods and services such as the detail men from the drug companies who visit pharmacists and physicians about new drugs.
THE EMERGENCE OF CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION

It is not now clear how much similarity there is between continuing education programs in various professional fields. Any firm conclusions regarding the extent to which a cohesive sub-field of continuing professional education is emerging must await the preparation of detailed case descriptions and comparative studies. However, some of the similarities and differences are suggested by the following brief descriptions of typical or well known continuing education programs from each of several professional fields.

Although in-service teacher education in the schools has relied heavily on periodic courses at a local school of education, another major vehicle of continuing education for teachers has been the curriculum study group. In general, teachers within a school system who taught in related subject matter fields and grade levels met together regularly during a year or two. The focus of their activity was to improve a segment of the curriculum or instructional program. This involved a review of current practices, an examination of practices in other school systems, and the study of relevant professional literature. System supervisors and college faculty often served as resource persons. The result of the activity was not only the increased competence of the teachers, and a revised curriculum for the school system, but also a set of working relationships between the teachers who were engaged in the study group that could facilitate their efforts to put the new curricular plan into practice.

In some sections of the country, medical societies and medical schools have experimented with continuing medical education activities
that combined procedures for increasing the competence of physicians with the process of more effective diagnosis and prescription for remediation. As a general practitioner in a region that was some distance from a medical center confronted an illness that he could not adequately diagnose, he would send pertinent data to a medical center using a piece of equipment that he connected to the telephone in his office or in his patient's home. The data was quickly analyzed at the medical center and a specialist there responded with both information about diagnosis and remediation for that specific case, and information that assisted the doctor to become a more effective diagnostician in future similar cases. In this way, the need for greater understanding grew out of professional practice and the new knowledge was directly applicable to professional practice.

One seminary has used two approaches to encourage parish ministers around the country to engage in systematic and sustained study as a resource for his total ministerial service. One approach consisted of a directed study program which allowed the minister to study at home using up-to-date study guides related to ten to fifteen books which were mailed on consecutive loans from the library extension department to meet the borrowers needs. This program differed from correspondence study in that there were no reports, papers, tests, or academic credit involved. The second approach consisted of a twelve-day stay at the seminary for groups of experienced ministers with differing responsibilities. In addition to intensive library study on a previously selected topic, the ministers had extensive contact with other group members, and faculty and student
at the seminary, in both formal discussions and informal association. The ministers were encouraged to relate the topics studied to their role as a man and a minister when they return home.

To these two approaches of residential conferences and home study, a university medical school added a third dimension of a preceptor who met periodically with directors of small hospitals who were enrolled in a basic hospital administration course. The need for this course was indicated by the fact that there were 3,000 small hospitals in the United States with insufficient financial resources to obtain an administrator with a graduate degree in hospital administration. The purpose of the course was to provide some academic education to augment their practical experience. The course consisted of a two-week residential conference at the medical school, then an eleven-month period of correspondence lessons and individual guidance by a preceptor who worked nearby, and finally another two-week residential conference. Each preceptor was a highly competent administrator of a larger hospital in the geographic area who had completed course work on the topics of the correspondence course. Once a month each enrollee in the basic hospital administration course met at his preceptor's hospital to discuss questions arising out of his correspondence lessons, relating them to the enrollee's particular job. The correspondence lessons were based on reprints of articles from the professional literature. This multi method course pattern provided for participants in all parts of the country, a quality program developed at one institution, at relatively little cost, in a way that allowed the
participant to proceed within limits at his own rate, encouraged him to complete the course, and to relate the contents to his work.

An association of judges took a very different direction. The fact that influenced their choice of direction was that the preparatory education competencies and attitudes of the successful lawyer who suddenly becomes a judge differ markedly from those of a successful judge. It was therefore decided that the basic objective of each of the one-week residential institutes was to increase the newly-selected judges capacity for self-insight and their general abilities to understand, communicate, and productively work with others. Instead of lectures on law and court procedures, the participants received several presentations on psychology and sociology, and the remainder of their time was spent in "T-Group" sessions concerned with "sensitivity training" and "interpersonal competence." Their own group interaction became a living laboratory for observing and analyzing their own behavior in a group.

A final example was a one-semester, full-time program in the liberal arts for executives that was co-sponsored by a college and a large corporation. Groups of about twenty executives from throughout the country came to the college campus without their families for the semester, for a program consisting of lecture-discussion, extensive reading, and field trips. The total semester's study for each group was organized around a single unifying theme, such as the individual in his society, with sub-themes such as isolation, conformity, freedom and authority, responsibility, and belief and understanding. The units were multidisciplinary with readings,
college faculty, and special guests from the fields of philosophy, the arts, and the social sciences. One reason for the corporations commitment to such an extensive liberal education experience for middle management executives is the intensive specialized and technical education and work experience that brings men to middle management positions, in contrast with the demands for breadth, understanding of relationships, and the ability to make value judgments that will be important for those who move into top management positions.

There are several common themes that are apparent from these few illustrative program descriptions, which suggest the emergence of a sub-field of continuing professional education. Because all of the learners have high levels of formal education, they can be highly self-directed in their studies. Various types of organizations contribute to the programs of continuing education. An effort is made to assist the learner to concurrently relate work activities with the topics that are studied. The remaining sections of this essay constitute a further analysis of these and other common themes that span across the separate professional fields.

DIMENSIONS OF CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION

There are five dimensions of continuing professional education that appear to be common to the separate professional fields—common educational needs, primary educational resources, additional community resources, the program development process, and a liberal education component.
Common Educational Needs

There are three major types of needs for continuing professional education that appear to be common to various professional fields and these are related to changing professional knowledge, various career lines, and decision making. Not only is the total body of professional knowledge in each field expanding, but also those aspects that are most relevant to current concerns tend to shift substantially from decade to decade. This is most striking in technical fields such as engineering or medicine where research findings such as those related to transistors or antibiotics have a sweeping impact on many phases of professional practice. However, even in such tradition-oriented fields as law, rapid social change (that is reflected in supreme court decisions, tax laws, uniform commercial code, or court reform) affects markedly the day to day activities of the individual attorney. In most professional fields, especially in the helping professions, research findings from the social and behavioral sciences can stimulate higher levels of professional practice. As a result, it is possible for the person only a year or two out of professional school to have higher levels of professional competence than his counterpart who graduated twenty years earlier. The problem of professional obsolescence is even more severe than the more familiar, machine obsolescence.

In most professions there are a variety of specialties and settings in which the professional can work. The young lawyer may join a law firm and later go into practice by himself, or vice versa. He may remain in general practice or may specialize in tax law, or international law,
or commercial law, or criminal law. Professionals in education may pursue various patterns of emphasis on teaching, research and administration. The engineer may continue in technical work or may shift into administration of engineering services or even general administration. He may do so as an employee in a small or large company or as a consulting engineer in his own consulting firm. Some of the engineering specializations, and medical specializations, are so unique that communication between specialties is often difficult. In recent years, continuing education programs are major factors in facilitating the transition between one segment of a person's career line and another. The M.B.A. has become a typical example for specialists who are assuming general administrative responsibility.

Decision making seems to be one of the most consistent activities across professional groups and one that is of almost universal professional concern. Doctors diagnose illnesses, judges hand down decisions, engineers engage in scientific problem solving, teachers make curricular decisions, and so on. Most of the decisions that are made by professionals combine both a technical component based on professional knowledge and a value laden component related to the objectives of liberal education.

Primary Educational Resources

There are three primary educational resources that contribute to the continuing education of professional persons--higher education, employing organizations, and professional associations. Most graduate
professional schools in the United States have a unit concerned with continuing education or participate in the university-wide programs of the extension division. Employing organizations broadly defined, such as industrial corporation for engineers, hospitals for nurses, schools for teachers, denominations for clergymen, and government agencies for public administrators have education and training departments that assist with personnel development. In addition to direct training, these employer training departments assist with time off, reimbursement for costs, location of outside educational opportunities, and career counseling. Professional associations, as Houle (8) has stated so vividly, have as one of their primary functions the continuing education of their members. The approach varies greatly from state to state and field to field. One state bar association concentrates heavily on the publication of forms, work books, guides, and summaries; while another state association relies primarily on one or two day meetings, each with a series of speakers followed by discussion. But in each instance, some members of the association provide leadership regarding the continuing education of the membership.

In recent years, there have been increasing instances of universities, employers, and associations co-sponsoring programs of continuing education that are stronger because of the joint effort.
Additional Community Resources

Each professional person has available to him a rich variety of community resources that can contribute to his total continuing education efforts, in addition to those that are most specifically related to the technical aspects of his work. These resources include the adult education activities of the schools, units of the university aside from his professional school, community colleges, and liberal arts colleges. These institutions are particularly relevant to the professional person's efforts towards continuing liberal education.

Program Development Process

The fourth common dimension of various programs of continuing professional education is the process by which they are effectively developed. In seeking similarities and differences between several professional fields regarding continuing professional education, it seems evident that to the extent to which the primary professional competencies of the doctor, lawyer, judge, teacher, social worker, clergyman and executive differ, to that extent the substantive issues that are dealt with in continuing professional education programs in the several professional fields would be expected to differ. Although there are probably some major areas of knowledge and approach from the liberal education components that are similar to most professional fields, the specialized professional knowledge that would be presented and discussed in programs of continuing professional education would be expected to vary greatly from field to field. By contrast, it would appear that the process by which particularly effective and innovative
programs of continuing professional education are developed, is basically the same across all professional fields. It is further asserted that this process by which effective programs of continuing professional education are developed, is similar to the general process by which effective programs of adult and continuing education are developed, and to what in elementary and secondary education is referred to as curriculum development.

The adult education program development process has been formulated in many slightly different ways, but in general consists of clientele analysis, determination of objectives, selection and organization of learning experiences, evaluation, and institutional arrangements for support activities. This process would be expected to be distinctive for all of continuing professional education, compared with adult education generally, primarily in terms of (1) the centrality of a high level of knowledge and competence in maintaining and enhancing one's position in a professional field; (2) the complexity of professional knowledge; (3) the high level of verbal facility of college graduates; (4) the demand by participants in continuing professional education programs for excellence in the content, personnel and methods that are incorporated in the program; (5) competing demands on the time of persons in professional fields; and (6) the ability of participants and their association, company or institution to pay for the costs of highly effective educational programs.

The program development process would be expected to vary between different professional fields in five general ways: (1) The first is the specific subject matter content that is reflected in the program
objectives (e.g., specialized professional knowledge, such as recent law changes or court opinions for attorneys, biochemistry for physicians and the characteristics of new building materials for architects); (2) The second is the types of knowledge, skills and attitudes that are emphasized in the selected program objectives (e.g., knowledge of facts, understanding of relationships, extrapolation from existing knowledge, empathy, and diagnosis); (3) The third is the priorities that are assigned to certain objectives at a given point in time in relation to the historical development of a professional field and its associations (e.g., one association may be confronting the assimilation of many new members during a period of rapid growth; a second, the explosion of new knowledge that has been acquired by recent graduates but which contributes to the obsolescence of more experienced members of the profession); (4) The fourth is the methods of learning that are most appropriate for the selected high priority objectives (e.g., published materials and lectures may be effective ways of acquiring recently identified new factual knowledge, but if the objectives deal with substantial changes in skill or attitude or application of knowledge to new complex situations, then methods such as role playing, workshops, and simulation may be more effective); (5) The fifth is the methods of evaluation that are feasible in relation to the objectives, learning experiences, and circumstances of the participants (e.g., for participants in a program of continuing professional education who are members of the same company or organization in a given community, the benefits of the program may be evident during the succeeding months as they work together, whereas for a continuing professional education program, in which participants return to their home
communities throughout the country, more formalized procedures such as interviews or mail questionnaires may be needed).

**Liberal Education**

The fifth common dimension is the liberal education component of continuing professional education. In most professional fields a major characteristic of preparatory education is that it is built upon and is accompanied by an extensive background in liberal or general education. In its preparatory and in its continuing form, the objectives of liberal education typically include a holistic view of man as man instead of solely as money-maker, breadth instead of excessive specialization, facility in dealing with value judgments, and skill in learning and communication. It is assumed that educational activities with these objectives are central in both the development and the maintenance of professional competence. It is further assumed that liberal education for adults can be thought of in several ways, including an activity for a cross-section of adults from many walks of life in which the general objectives of liberal education are central in the program, and as an activity for adults in one professional field in which the liberal education component is designed to achieve some broader purposes of continuing professional education. In the latter instance, the emphasis is on liberal education as a component of continuing professional education in which the liberal education component complements the specialized professional components of the program. One question regarding liberal education is: To what extent has there been a liberal education component in various effective programs of continuing professional education? During the past fifteen years, there have been a variety of innovative
programs of liberal education for executives in which administrators from very different specialized backgrounds have studied together the same topic in a liberal education program. It would seem helpful to try to identify those elements of liberal education content and process that are most common to many professional fields, and those elements that appear to be uniquely related to just one or a few specialized fields of professional knowledge. It is also recognized that the liberal education component may shift from stage to stage of a professional person's career cycle. An early interest in techniques typically gives way to a greater interest in theory, then human relations, and finally historical and societal perspectives. In both the liberal and the professional education components, more attention needs to be given to life-long integrated education, in which preparatory and continuing education complement each other.

CURRENT ISSUES IN CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION

By way of conclusion, there are several major issues that confront persons who are engaged in some aspect of continuing professional education. The resolution of these issues in any professional field should be of great value to those in other professional fields.

1. The Self-Directed Learner

To what extent should the professional person be expected to be a self-directed learner? Certainly he should have acquired from his long years of formal education the attitudes and skills conducive to life-long learning. But if this is so, why are participation rates as low as they
are and why is there so much obsolescence in each professional field. Barton (1) has presented an excellent rationale for the ultimate goal of education as the learner becoming teacher unto himself. The volume by Solomon (11) reports the results of three research projects on the characteristics and practices of adults who are more self-directed in their learning pursuits than are most adults and Tough (12) describes self-teaching practices of adults. However, with the scope and complexity of professional knowledge and the rapidity of social change, all but the most hearty professionals will need some stimulation and assistance.

What role can various institutions and organizations interested in continuing professional education take that will result in an optimum balance between the learners autonomy and institutional resources?

2. Preparatory and Continuing Education

Part of the answer to the first question lies in the nature of preparatory education. In the past, there has been relatively little interaction between the preparatory education of school and college, and continuing education after a professional person enters his field. Some continuing education programs have been attempts to counteract inadequate preparatory education, while other continuing education programs have been shotgun approaches that have
built too little on the foundations of preparatory education. Whipple (13) has analyzed some of the characteristics of education that is especially for adults, such as the opportunity for direct application. These characteristics of continuing education programs should be strengthened and preserved. But, in addition, greater efforts should be made to establish more continuity between preparatory and continuing education, in which one of the goals of preparatory education is preparation for continuing education.

3. **Policy Role in Program Planning**

The planning of most well designed programs of continuing education in any professional field will entail the appraisal of needs, an identification of the interests of persons in the target population as a basis for encouraging them to decide to participate, the establishment of the educational objectives, the design of effective learning experiences, and program evaluation. The emphases and order may vary but if an effective program is to result, these types of planning decisions must be made either explicitly or implicitly. The central question is who should participate in making these decisions? What contribution should be made by representatives of the sponsors, teachers, learners, and successful practitioners? Which should be represented
on a planning committee and which viewpoints should be represented by some other means? In general, by what process should policy decisions be made when planning programs of continuing professional education?

4. Continuing Liberal Education for Professionals

There are several questions regarding liberal education. In what way is continuing liberal education defined? To what extent is a liberal education component essential in programs of continuing professional education? What types of liberal education components are most common across different professional fields? Is it preferable to select a liberal education component that is an extension or a contrast to the professional education objectives? What advantages are there in including participants from various professional or occupational fields in the same liberal education program, in contrast with one for persons from a single field?

These four issues in continuing professional education are illustrative of a wider range of issues that confront persons who want to develop effective programs. The challenge to such persons is to proceed in such a way that they learn from the relevant experiences of others, and themselves engage in the program evaluation and descriptions that will benefit the similar efforts of others. If this occurs, it is likely that dynamic programs of continuing professional education will occur to the benefit of all society.
REFERENCES


In the announcement of the consultation, you were assured that there would be no scholarly lectures. My talk is a fulfillment of that promise!

It was assumed in the planning of this consultation that some effort should be made to identify the objectives of the minister's continuing education, and it was suggested that it might be helpful to identify one concept of the ministry against which to work. I am delighted that my concept of the ministry as a profession has been chosen as a scapegoat, strawman, whipping boy, and point of departure. A fuller treatment of these and other matters you will find in my book Profession: Minister (Abingdon Press, 1968). Of course, I would like to believe that, after you have heard what I have to say, you will find that this is, indeed, the one concept which will solve all your problems. That was the purpose I had in writing the book: to settle once and for all the question of the identity of the Protestant parish clergy. If the letters I've gotten from ministers in response to their reading of the book is any indication, about half of them think I've done it and the other half think I don't even know the right questions yet!

I want to begin with the assertion that concepts of the ministry are not only not necessary, but are generally not helpful. We have gotten along very nicely so far without any single clear or concise concept of ministry to work with. We've been getting along in parish ministries, in missions around the world, in colleges and seminaries, continuing education

Prepared for the Consultation on Continuing Education for United Methodist Ministers, October 20-23, 1968.

Dr. Glasse is Associate Dean and Professor of Practical Theology, Vanderbilt Divinity School.
programs, and the like. We haven't waited until now for someone to give us an idea of what we are doing. Having said that concepts won't help, I will now give you what I consider to be a very helpful concept. (I say this for the same reason my speech professor in college used to say: "Gentlemen, never repeat for emphasis. Now remember that, never repeat for emphasis.") What I have to say is very simple and I will say it in several different ways.

The ministry is a profession. The ministry is a secular occupation. The ministry is part of the world's work. Unless and until we understand that (and learn to think about the ministry not only in ecclesiastical categories, but in occupational categories) we cannot begin to clean up some of the fog in which we have been working. Until a Protestant parish minister can go to a lawyer who is a member of his congregation, and consult with him about some technical legal aspects of a pastoral counseling situation, he has not yet understood the difference between being a minister ecclesiastically and being a minister professionally. For when he goes to talk with that lawyer to consult with him professionally (as a minister with a lawyer) he does not go to that man as one of his laymen (as a pastor with a parishioner). No, these are two professionals counseling with each other about a matter of professional responsibility. The fact that these two men are pastor and parishioner has ecclesiastical significance, but it makes no difference in occupational terms. Technically, the issue for the pastor is whether the man is a good lawyer, not whether he is a good layman. Now it is true that some ministers cannot do this. They have not learned to think professionally. Some laymen will not understand. They will think the pastor is just gossiping with them about another parishioner. This is only one illustration of a problem in professional practice that arises because we do not think of the ministry as a profession. But how do we learn to think this way?
First, consider the origins of the ministry, not in the Church - but in society. Ask the question: where do professions come from? (This is all in the book, so I'll just rough it out.)

Society produces professions, and Christian society has produced a number of them. In fact, historically, there was a time when, in order to be a teacher or a doctor or a lawyer, you had first of all to be a priest. The traditional professions in our society were originally clerical professions; occupations of the clergy. The others (law, medicine, teaching) have become autonomous. The ministry is the only one which continues to take ecclesiastical form. That is the reason why it is hard for us to separate the "ecclesiastical" from the "occupational" in thinking about the ministry. I would argue that the ministry is no less "secular" than the others, but that its setting in the church identifies the peculiar form of its secularity - its place in society. But what is its "place"?

Professions emerge in a particular society when a problem needs to be solved or a value needs to be secured. Professional origins, therefore, are both negative and positive. People are sick (negative). The society believes in Health (positive). Crime abounds. The society believes in Justice. Some problem persists and won't go away. It can't be dealt with on an ad hoc basis by part-time people. So someone is either designated to take care of it or someone who professes to be able to handle that sector of society's business is recognized - given a "license to practice." Around that particular area of concern and commitment there grows up a body of knowledge, an understanding which begins with folk wisdom and becomes refined and codified. A group of persons assume responsibility for knowledge about that area, and develop skills based upon it. A group of people emerge who share the concern, who perceive the problem and who support the people who
become professionals. So it is that society develops "sectors" of responsibility in its life, and assigns certain sectors to certain people for care. One of these in our society is the "religious sector." As long as people have needs and concerns which they identify as "religious" we will have religious information, religious professionals, religious institutions. Likewise, depending on the concerns of societies, we will have educational sectors, political sectors, economic sectors, artistic sectors, etc. Professionals emerge in these "sectors." A profession, therefore, always has an institutional base, and the profession has an institutional identity.

Professionals also emerge with an occupational identity. They are known by the work they do; not simply by their character or their commitment, but by the services they perform in society. Sick people require doctors. Criminals must have lawyers. The uneducated want teachers. But what do people want from ministers? As long as people thought they had a soul to be saved, they wanted soul-savers. Then some people thought there was a kingdom to be built, so they wanted kingdom-builders. How do Methodists today identify their religious needs? How does The United Methodist Church identify its purposes? Apart from real clarity on these points, we cannot get very far. You must do this for yourselves. As a guide to gathering your thoughts, let me lay out my definition of a professional. (You will find it in the book, page 40.)

The professional man is first of all educated: master of some body of the world's knowledge which is accessible in an accredited graduate professional school. Secondly, the professional is an expert: master of some cluster of skills which is related to this body of knowledge in theory and is directed toward the concerns and commitments of the profession. Thirdly, the professional man is institutional: related to society through some
historic institution to which he must have access in order to practice. Each professional is partly servant and partly master of this social institution: lawyer and the court, doctor and the hospital, teacher and the school, minister and the church. Fourthly, a professional is responsible: he assumes responsibility for a sector of society's work and commits himself to do this under high standards of ethics and competence: doctor and his Oath; lawyer and the Canon; teacher and the accreditation; minister and his Ordination.

Fifthly, the professional man is dedicated: the professional "professes." He professes not only to assume responsibility for some area of need but to seek to resolve the problems in that area in the direction of some value which the society seeks. So it is that the lawyer professes to believe that through the practice of his profession there will be an increase in society of that value which society calls Justice. The doctor who is a real professional, does not simply study medicine and then practice it responsibly, but professes to believe that through the practice of his profession there will be an increase in society of that value which society calls Health. So the minister, who is a professional, does not simply study theology and practice ministry in the church responsibly, but professes to believe that through the practice of his profession there will be an increase in the world of that value H. Richard Niebuhr called "the increase of the love of God and neighbor." This is what makes an occupation "professional"; it can be identified within this five-point perspective.

But at these same five points professions are distinguished from each other. There is no way to be a professional in the abstract; you have to practice a particular profession. Therefore, the ministry is, by definition, a profession. But it is not like any other profession in practice. The
minister studies theology and not law. He practices ministry and not medicine. He operates in the church and not in the hospital. He does this under his own standards of competence and excellence and he does this for his own purposes. The difference between the minister and other professionals is not that he is a dedicated man and other professionals are not dedicated. He just has a different dedication. That is to say, the professional defines himself by saying as precisely as possible what he professes: to know, to be able to do, through what institution, under what standards, and to what end. The minister must be able to say that much about what it means for him to be educated, expert, institutional, responsible, and dedicated.

One of the problems we have in the church is that the people who are responsible for making those decisions do not make them clearly and forcefully. Who is to say what Methodist ministers are supposed to know, what Baptist preachers are supposed to be able to do, in what kind of polity Presbyterians are supposed to function, what are the norms by which we evaluate ourselves, and what in the name of God we think we're up to? Unless and until those people in all of our denominations will make these decisions we continue to wander about in a fog, bumping into each other, recognizing each other only by the tone of our voice or by the way we are dressed, or by the sound of our foghorns. And it should not surprise us at all that people are confused about us. The ministry is pictured as a profession for confused men who learn to live in the fog, who never know what they should know, or do what they should do, but "mean well" and don't do too much damage. Society tolerates them because they are harmless. People support them out of a pious pity or a fading affection. Is this really true? Or is there the possibility of some clearer identifications?

I've just tried to give one, clear definition. If people just understood
this, it would all be so simple! But do we want clear ideas to inform our approach to continuing education? Some clear ministerial models appear to attract non-learners to a life of non-learning. Take the "fearless prophet" of the evangelical tradition: the man with unchangeable convictions who does not follow the crowd, who "takes his stand" and, come what may, stands there. He never listens, he never learns, he never moves; and we want him to be a change agent! All he can change is his stuffed shirt.

Then there's the "pious pipeline": the big believer, the one who really believes. He knows that what sets ministers off from laymen is that ministers believe a lot and laymen just believe a little. Ministers are professional believers! I submit that it is theologically unsound to assume that a clergyman in the Protestant tradition has to be anything more than an ordinary Christian. He really doesn't have to have any more "religion" than anybody else, but he has to have more "theology." Our symbol system is demonic if it tends to encourage anyone to think that he'll become more religious by becoming a clergyman. Some students think they will get religious by going to seminary. Maybe some of them do - but a lot of them don't. Some ministers seem to think that they stay religious by being a minister. You know, there may be some truth in that! I used to think that the ministry was God's gift to those among us who were the most faithful and the most dedicated. I've come to believe that maybe just the opposite is true: that the ministry is God's occupational concession to those weak and perverse among us who half suspect that if it wasn't our job to do so, we wouldn't read the Bible, we wouldn't be nice to people, and we wouldn't even go to church.

Another ministerial model is what I call the "ecclesiastical hippie": the man who goes around doing his "thing." One of the symptoms is a way of
talking about his career development. He may say: "I've been here three or four years and I think my work here is done. It's time for me to move on to some other (meaning, larger) field of service." This man, 15 years in the business, has moved three times. He hasn't had 15 years experience; he's had five years experience three different times. He never has to change anything but his location. He never learns, he never grows, he doesn't have to. The system is designed to maximize his idiosyncracies and make it possible for him to keep alive the illusion of his creativity simply by moving around. The "ecclesiastical hippie" does his "thing," and when his "thing" doesn't work any more, he goes somewhere else and does his "thing" and when they get bored he goes somewhere else and does his "thing." This is a poor model for continuing education, or anything else, really.

Then there's the "pastor who knows and loves his people." Bless his heart! This fellow runs around the parish getting to know everybody's name, who's cousin is married to whom, and all that kind of trivia. Then he leaves with no records for his successor so that the other guy will have to go through the same empty moves to collect the same information. He goes to another place and begins to fill his head with the same kind of junk again. He never really gets to know anybody, and seldom does anything for them except remember their birthday. He can usually convince himself he's "knowing and loving people," but he never learns anything.

We have, you see, plenty of images and models and concepts which are designed precisely to keep people from learning while legitimating their rigidity, their insensitivity, their stupidity, and their piousity. What is at stake in this consultation is the occupational identity of the clergyman, his integrity, his competence, his excellence, which is to say - his "professionalism." About this I have much more to say, but I will stop.
Some of this will come out as these two men react and as I have the chance to answer some of your questions. More is in the book. But even more is in your minds and hearts.
A paper on the minister's career development must be partly a plea for better career planning, which in turn calls for more and better research. Although the psychology of careers is well established as a significant field of research, relatively little has been done to apply its findings to clergy careers. In the chief bibliography of research on clergymen (Menges and Dittes, 1965; Menges, 1967) the term "career" doesn't even appear in the index. Such understanding as exists about the minister's career development comes largely from the judgment of experienced persons and the extrapolation of findings of cognate studies onto the minister's life and work. In this discussion I would like 1) to sketch out the major career stages and substages; 2) to discuss them in terms of the dynamics of career development; and finally 3) to suggest the relevance of these ideas for continuing professional education for ministry.

CAREER STAGES

The literature on career development is widely scattered and of uneven quality. Perhaps the best summary is by Donald E. Super, who points out that a career "involves taking into account a sequence of occupations, jobs, and positions... (and) the individual is viewed as moving along one of a number of possible pathways through the educational system and into and through the world of work." (pp. 6-7)

The best known and most useful elaboration of career stages is also by Super (1966). The adolescent enters upon the Exploratory stage in the years between 15 and 25, in which he "engages in the process of clarifying his self-concept, translating it into adult occupational terms, and testing both the concept and translation against the realities of preparation for work and work itself." (p. 66) As he makes the transition from school to work he develops a synthesis of his own characteristics and the opportunities which face him, a synthesis which

Prepared for the Consultation on Continuing Education for United Methodist Ministers, October 20-23, 1968.

Dr. Mills is director of the Ministry Studies Board, Department of Ministry, National Council of Churches.
is most consonant with his own developing self concept. The Exploratory stage concludes with trial in which the young person gradually gets more involved in experiences which help him test his synthesis and see what is likely to be a congenial role. For ministers, as Super says, the various kinds of trial behavior with minimal career commitment help him to test his concept of himself as a future minister. If he is pleased with the testing process he then begins to commit himself more fully to the ministry as a career.

Fuller commitment marks the beginning of the Establishment stage in which one gradually invests himself in the profession, perhaps by entering seminary. The task of the seminary is, in one sense, to change this young layman into a clergyman. He may, to be sure, change his mind later and try some other occupational niche, but now "the young careerist is playing for real stakes." (p. 67) If he decides to stay with the ministry, the young person stabilizes in the occupation, developing both skill in the performance of clergy roles and a unique style of ministry. Stabilization occurs either sometime during theological school or after beginning the first ministerial position. Sometimes people do not successfully stabilize but go through repeated trials. This is called floundering, and is not uncommon in the twenties.

Once in the occupational stream, the minister normally begins a sequence of moves which bring him to successively more favorable positions. This is the advancement sub-stage, in which the rewards of mobility may be greater salary, more independence, more responsibility or more satisfying work. Advancement is regarded by many clergy as a dirty word, but most of them do advance, by whatever criteria they regard as worthy, and it is quite clear that there are well defined procedures for obtaining advancement in the ministry.

The maintenance stage follows the period of advancement, and begins when the minister, perhaps in his late forties,
"has made his place, established his roles and styles, and ceases to break new ground...the man in his forties is often forced to take stock of himself and his situation, to consider how he can modify his role in order to play it well, what he can do better to equip himself to play required roles, where he can move in order to have good opportunity to play the roles he can expect to play well." (p. 72)

As Super points out, the period of maintenance is not in our day (if it ever was) a time when the minister can just do more of what he has been doing and rest on his laurels. He now must run to keep up, a problem too little recognized in the continuing education circles, where the emphasis tends to fall upon the young men establishing and advancing their careers.

The stage of decline varies greatly in the time of its beginning, coming sometimes in the fifties and sometimes in the eighties.

"The older man does fewer things and selects the things he does in terms of his changing endurance and capabilities...The ministry has the advantage of being a profession in which the individual has a good deal of control over his own behavior: within limits the minister can reduce and change activities as he feels the effects of aging." (pp. 72-73)

The period of career decline is a time in which simplification takes place and the roles are modified.

Super then points out the "cycles within cycles" phenomenon in which a man may change occupations and re-enter a period of trial and stabilization in mid-life. In some respects, exploration, establishment and maintenance occur within each position held for any length of time by a minister, and a new cycle is begun when he initiates a change.

THE DYNAMICS OF CLERGY CAREER DEVELOPMENT

Career development is ideally a process of self-directed change in which many interacting factors are synthesized by the minister into an intentional sequence of positions. But what creates the forward motion? What is it that drives career development and which the continuing educator engages in order to
make an impact? Where does the minister get his go? I will discuss seven such
dynamic factors, recognizing that there may be others of equal importance. The
significance of these factors varies with the career stage and the person.

1. Occupational Identity

The most powerful force making for continuity and development in a
minister's career is his own occupational identity. Super (1957) defines a
career decision as "the implementation of a self concept." A person early
develops an understanding of himself, and as he tests a variety of occupational
possibilities in the trial stage, he is at the same time exploring and maturing
that self concept. Gradually, he comes to conceive of himself as a working adult
in some field. The professional socialization process which occurs in seminary
and immediately after for the young minister is a process of forming and entering
fully into his occupational identity. He develops skill in role behaviors and a
unique professional style.

Please note that the concept of identity not only assumes a self concept
but also suggests commitment to it. It is a remarkable fact that, as Prescott
Lecky wrote in 1945, the drive for self-consistency is one of the most powerful
influences on behavior. (We have seen recent writings picking up this theme in
various ways by Leon Festinger, Gordon Allport, George Kelly and others.) Evidence
is mounting, for example, that most men who leave church employment for secular
work do not regard themselves as having "left the ministry" but rather as being
ministers in the world. A man's occupational identity provides a bridge from
ecclesiastical ministry to secular employment. This not only reduces the shock of
the change but integrates his entire career and enables him to be consistent with
himself. Tiedeman and O'Hara (1958, p. 2) believe that

"educational and vocational choices can be predicted
with greater fidelity if a person's perceptions of
himself and of himself in relation to work are taken
as the organizing theme directing career decisions
or their absence."
It seems to me, therefore, that in continuing education as part of the minister's program of self-directed change, a major ally of the educator is the minister's own drive for self-consistency, his commitment to his occupational identity.

Relatively little research has been done relating occupational identity (or self concept, or self image) to career development. One such study was done by Klausner (1964) of the "role adaptation of ministers and psychiatrists in a clinic." Although the total sample consisted of only twelve persons, Klausner's study is significant because he deals with why ministers choose to work in a psychiatric clinic. His thesis is in part that such a career shift is one way in which the clergyman maintains his occupational identity and at the same time resolves the profound role strain of being an expressively directed person in a highly instrumental society. Much more work needs to be done tracing the function of occupational identity in ministers' career decisions. It is clear, however, that the clergyman's desire to maintain a consistent identity is one of the major driving elements in his career development.

2. Professional Competence

A second major moving force in career development is the need for professional competence. Its sources are twofold: the desire, shared by most people, to feel that one excels in his field of work; and the conviction that his work is of utmost importance, commissioned by God. He wants to do his best for the Lord who has called him, and for the church, and for himself. Much continuing education attempts to increase the competence of clergymen in such central role tasks as preaching, counseling and theological interpretation. But we have very little empirically-based knowledge of the function of competence (or its absence) in the development of careers. We would like to think that competence is rewarded by advancement, in the church and elsewhere. Yet O'Donovan and Deegan (1963) showed that Catholic pastors believe merit plays little part in church promotions of others -- and my own informal samplings of Protestant grumbling suggests similar views.
The drive for excellence may be regarded as one form of the achievement motive, a much studied characteristic of American men. Young men who perceive competence as a major dimension of ministry thus enter the occupation with a tremendous built-in developmental force. Recruitment programs, seminaries and continuing education programs which deliberately encourage this drive towards excellence among clergymen are enhancing their career development. Yet to what degree does the young man in the exploration stage perceive the ministry as a career calling for high competence and thus affording him meaningful achievement experiences? My guess is that technical excellence in performance is honored mainly in the breach and that young people choose the ministry in spite of rather than because of their drive for competence. It has been observed (McCune and Mills, 1968) that ministers need too much to be liked, that they show major gains at social-emotional levels in continuing education, and that these are reinforced most effectively by present continuing education programs.

On the other hand, when a minister works in denominational or ecumenical committees and does become something of an expert in church camping, or budget and finance, or curriculum design, he thereby opens new possibilities for career movement. His mid-career competence, often gained through dedicated committee work, equips him for specialized ministries or even for secular employment which the ordinary pastor could not handle. If at the same time he makes contact with those who nominate persons for such positions, his career may expand in a gratifying way. This combination of competence and contacts, when it occurs, often is a major avenue of advancement in the minister's career. (Mills, 1966) It represents a form of specialization within general practice, making significant achievements possible even when the congregation one serves is generally uninterested in standards of excellence.

There is another dimension to the pursuit of excellence. Anyone over thirty today has discovered that you can't be good at the same thing all your life.
Competence changes as the years go by, and what was considered excellence in a youth will be viewed as inappropriate or even improper twenty years later. The new minister is expected to show unusual ability in dealing with teenagers and young adults, and to have at his command an armory of the latest theological weapons. He should be high in energy and enthusiasm, and a fresh approach to things is desirable, even if he steps on a few toes occasionally. The strengths which help stabilize him as a fullfledged young minister, however, will not suffice for his advancement. Within ten years he must have developed different skills in handling groups and in representing the church in the community with dignity, he must have polished his counseling abilities, and he can no longer be forgiven for shocking people by his fresh unorthodoxy. Then, as he moves from the establishment stage into the maintenance years, he will find that his acquired strengths are weighed against his known weaknesses, and that the areas in which he is strong will in large measure determine the type and degree of advancement he may achieve. His career development, therefore, is closely related to his demonstrated competence in specific areas, which may explain why in the ministry as elsewhere specialization is a very effective road to success and is deeply resented by those who have not acquired specialized skills.

3. Opportunity Structures

The discussion of competence and its consequences leads directly to a third dynamic operating in clergy careers, the pattern of opportunities available at any given time. Opportunity structures refer to more than the number and type of positions open. There are career patterns, in the ministry as in other occupations, which describe the way most clergymen move through their careers. One kind of pattern is based on job mobility. There is some reason to believe (Mills, 1966) that church executives, for example, have often combined in their careers rapid early mobility, as they moved up through one or two short pastorates, with later stability in one or more long and successful pastorates. Men who show only
sequences of short pastorates, and thus appear never to have stabilized, often leave the ministry altogether, while other men whose career patterns show nothing but long stable pastorates will probably serve in parishes all their lives.

Another way to see the opportunity structure is to construct a set of typical career tracks by examining the job histories of clergymen. When this is done, I believe it will show that early decisions create unequal probabilities of later moves, thus biasing the minister's career development toward some types of work and away from others. For example, one pastor told me why he does not move into the fulltime counseling work which interests him:

I don't see any way out...When I've looked into what I'd have to do to get into (that) field I just can't. Forty, six children, and I need every penny of income I have and all of this takeu money to accomplish. And laying aside responsibilities, and - I feel the preparation would come too late, the price is too high. It's not impossible, but the price is too high to change now. ...It's a frustrating thing too, because you see so many people just not being able to break out of their pattern....

This man is describing the high probability that he will stay in the pastorate by referring to the decisions he made at an earlier time - to enter the pastorate, to have a large family, not to go to graduate school, not to specialize, etc. For him the opportunity system is now highly structured and the track very narrow. He says, "I think I can make only one more move up in my ministry. This is the middle one right here. I make one more and then I begin going down the other side." This man's career development could be described in terms of the structure of opportunities in church occupations, and that structure in turn can be described partly by knowing the probabilities of movement along this or that career track. So far no one has done this job, and yet we are talking about one of the major dynamic elements in the development of clergy careers.

In general, occupational structures are more open for career movement than ever before in our history. Moment, Baruch and Brown (1967) point out that, in a time of rapid economic expansion and the creation of many new kinds of work,
there is "occupational elbow room" in which workers are able to move more freely within and between occupations. I believe this accounts for part of the increased movement out of ecclesiastical ministries. The clergyman has "occupational elbow room" to an unprecedented degree, partly because the health, education and welfare industries - the service professions - are growing so vigorously. This expansion of the opportunity structure challenges the continuing education movement to examine its old assumptions of predictability and continuity in clergy careers.

4. The Reward System

Most clergy consider it beneath their calling to labor for rewards. Yet nothing brings forth a man's effort better than the promise of appreciation generously given. The opening of new opportunities which lead to advancement is one kind of reward. The satisfaction of having people follow his leadership enthusiastically is another reward cherished by ministers. The completion of a project with visible results, the freedom which comes with the congregation's increased confidence in his leadership, and inclusion in the inner circles of denominational leadership are all prized rewards. Moreover, tangible rewards such as improved living conditions, salary increases and new staff assistance mean more to the minister than he usually admits.

Rewards are precious for two major reasons. First, there lies within each person some doubt about his own worth and that of his work (a condition to which clergy seem especially vulnerable). This tension between doubt and assurance about one's worth generates tremendous energies for work, energies which when directed toward an appropriate reward system become a major driving force in the development of careers. The kinds of rewards available exert enormous influence on the direction of that development. If there is any doubt in your mind about this fact, just imagine what would happen to the number of church vocations candidates if a one year sabbatical with full pay were offered to any minister recruiting fifteen young business and professional men for the ministry within a two year period.
The second reason rewards are so valuable to the minister is that they are indicators of what is really valued by Important People, the decision makers. One can talk indefinitely about joy and satisfaction and going to the foot of the table, but when the chief form of reward that a congregation gives is more salary rather than greater trust, a new car rather than new vigor, the minister learns very quickly what is valued and what he may expect to receive for his efforts. As his career develops, the minister often shapes his own values to fit the rewards which are available, sometimes relinquishing the ideals of the ministry he once held. Perhaps the most tragic situation is when lack of adequate rewards deadens initiative. Professor Stanton Wheeler (1966) points out that continuing education is unlikely to have long range effects unless the church can "selectively reward the behavior" resulting from the continuing education of its ministers. The reward system provided by the church for its clergy is a powerful shaper of the development of their careers.

5. Support Systems

The concept of a support system is an old one but it is little understood. The principle is very simple: when a minister feels shaky about his work or himself, there are certain resources available to support and strengthen him. In some respects, each of the factors I have discussed constitutes part of the minister's total support system: the increase of his competence, the opening of opportunities for advancement, and the availability of appropriate rewards are supportive. Moreover, he trusts God, and he leans upon that trust as upon a supportive staff. But I am thinking now of another very significant function which is familiar to every working man and yet is only beginning to be provided in any systematic way. The most powerful support system consists of people one can trust in times of unusual stress. For this system to function, a minister must be able to recognize and admit the stress points of his ministry, he must know whom he can trust, and such people must be alert to his possible need for support.
One of the reasons we do so poorly at providing an adequate support system is that we really do not understand major stress points in the minister's life. Many of his feelings and problems are characteristic of most ministers of the same age and circumstances. Just as there are developmental tasks associated with each career stage and sub-stage, there are characteristic problems which arise. One piece of research which should have high priority is the mapping of the minister's emotional path as his career develops along normal lines.

Several years ago the Peace Corps made such an effort, with very impressive results. (English, 1967) By systematic surveys, they discovered that 90% of the two-year volunteers indicated that they had psychological difficulties during their 21 months of service. These troubles were not randomly scattered but tended to cluster at four major stress points. First, there was the crisis of arrival, marked by intense anxiety, sometime during the first two months. To counteract it, a conference on their work was initiated for the volunteers in the third or fourth month, and the volunteer knew from the beginning of his service that it would take place. This reduced his isolation and was very supportive. Second, there was the crisis of engagement occurring between the fourth and eighth months, when volunteers became depressed about people's apathy and the lack of promising action possibilities. The most effective solution for this crisis was contact with other volunteers having similar problems. Third, the crisis of acceptance involved some depression and much anger in months 11 to 14, apparently arising out of small gains and the sudden awareness of the temporariness and loneliness of his work. Field supervisors scheduled conferences and discussions among the volunteers to increase their acceptance of what they could and could not accomplish. Finally, the crisis of re-entry developed just before separation and return, and it was met by systematic efforts to identify the volunteer's achievements and to begin planning for his life back home.

Notice how the use of this research involved reliance upon supervisors and
fellow workers in planned encounters which the volunteers knew in advance would
take place. Many of the stress points of clergymen appear to be similar to the
crises encountered by two-year Peace Corps volunteers. There is every reason to
suppose that discussion with fellow pastors, the existence of a few reliable laymen,
the availability of an experienced supervisor, ready access to career assessment
and counseling facilities, and continuing education opportunities geared to chang-
ing career needs would constitute a support system fully as effective as that
developed by the Peace Corps. All of these elements exist; our problem is that
we have not identified the predictable times of greatest need, we have not learned
to recognize them in ourselves and each other, and we have not legitimized the use
of a support system to manage the stress points of a normal ministry. One of the
most striking impressions from a series of interviews with men who have left the
church ministry for secular employment is the sense of isolation they felt instead
of support at critical times of need. It is the more tragic because in most cases
the isolation was unnecessary, occasioned largely by timidity and ignorance.

Today, as the nation becomes daily more conservative in temper, the deepen-
ing crisis of confidence between ministers and their congregations requires
drastic efforts to strengthen the support systems available to clergymen. (See
Hadden, in press)

The availability of support for critical times can keep a career from stag-
nating or floundering. It can also give a powerful forward movement to the
developmental process, for stress points are also opportunities for personal
growth. One pastor described the change that occurred during his second pastorate,
following a frustrating and humiliating first appointment. As he talked about his
growing interest in the field of Christian education in that second parish he
repeatedly referred to the encouragement of his synod executive, the excitement of
working with alert laymen, and the stabilizing influence of his wife's confidence
in his calling. This man not only came through the "crisis of engagement" in
good shape, but the supportive framework within which he worked encouraged the development of a specialized interest which has led him now into a denominational staff position in Christian education.

I am convinced that there are at least three functions which ministers need to find available in their human support systems: There is the head-patting function, consoling and encouraging in the midst of discouragement; there is the problem-solving function which helps him analyze the stress and develop strategies for dealing with it; and there is the feedback function which gives him straight, absolutely trustworthy data about himself and his work. (All three are found, by the way, in the Apostle Paul's letters to young Timothy.) The power of such a system in the process of career development will be clearest if you will imagine returning at the conclusion of this conference to a situation in which you know exactly on whom you can rely for sympathetic encouragement, for shrewd analysis and problem-solving, and for honest feedback about yourself. Thrice blessed is such a man!

6. Family

One of the most disappointing experiences in reviewing research on the ministry is to find study after study of the clergyman's roles and role conflict, with virtually no attention paid to his role as husband and father. Yet the interaction of family and work roles is probably greater for the ministry than for any other occupation. Wives are a crucial part of any minister's support system. One of the most prominent causal factors in leaving ministerial employment is marital crisis and separation. (Mills, 1966) Among pastors, the person whose praise is valued most highly, above that of denominational leaders, fellow pastors, lay leaders and seminary professors, is the minister's wife. Reports of reasons for moves whether within or out of the ministry frequently include the consideration of the needs of wife, children, or other close relatives.

The dynamics of career development parallel in crucial ways the dynamics of
family development from honeymoon through the maturity of grandchildren. For example, the coming of children forces a new parental maturity just at the point when a man moves from student to professional leader. Also, the goldfish bowl effect takes its toll of life in the parsonage just at the point when marital strains are likely to be severe as husband and wife adapt to new roles. The children's college expenses arise as the middle aged minister reevaluates his chances for advancement, and the empty nest confronts the wife as the husband is likely to be in positions of great responsibility. Little is known of the interaction of family and work roles in the ministry except that it is extremely important. Perhaps many of the career stress points referred to above, which are points of potential growth as well as times of distress, cannot be handled by dealing with the minister alone. Perhaps continuing professional education requires that wives grow intellectually and occupationally along with their husbands. No one has invested enough to find out yet.

A minor theme, but important for the development of many clergy careers, is the function of family contacts in the advancement and reward systems. We all know people who married the daughters of major church figures, or whose fathers entertained a succession of dignitaries on first name terms, or who were born into an elite of denominational leadership. One such man said of his decision to be a minister: "it started when I was born...because I come from a family of Levites. I am the fifth generation of ministers in my family." In this way also, family roots and contacts affect career development.

7. Inertial Factors

Many people continue moving in a more or less straight career line because nothing causes them to change course. There is a kind of inertia, in the sense of Newton's first law of motion, which is extremely powerful and not well understood. In a way it is the obverse of the drive toward competence. It is a residual factor, made up of obligations such as debts and promises, of fears which keep one from
risking, of discouragement born of old defeats, and the persistent absence of adequate opportunity, reward and support systems. Accumulated fatigue robs many ministers of the energy required to change course and try something new. In interviewing participants arriving at residential continuing education programs, we were struck by the tired and depressed manner of many of these men, and we were again struck by their increased vigor and enthusiasm at the conclusion of the programs (McCune and Mills, 1968).

I would hazard a guess that inertial factors represent a kind of lowest common denominator of career development, that without these we would not even have the continuity of work life which we call a career. Moreover, I think there is a kind of universal law of "spiritual entropy" (to borrow another term from physics) such that even our strongest commitments are constantly eroded toward a state of daily accommodation to pressures. Planned and purposeful lives continually tend toward ad hoc and uncommitted lives. In order to move a career successfully through exploration, trial, stabilization, and advancement, we must frequently renew our commitment to the ministry (our occupational identity). There is much in our work and our world which undermines one's drive for excellence: incompetence, blocked opportunities, inadequate rewards, theological upheaval, the failure of the support system, the cross pressures of work and family life, and the erosion of fatigue. These are not passing problems but structural tendencies, which need to be understood and prepared for.

In short, the minister's career development calls for joint planning, and research, in which he and the church take careful thought for what gives him his go, for what powers the best development of his own life and work, and thereby provides the church with its finest leadership.

THE PRICE OF CAREER PLANNING

It must be evident by now that this paper is an extended plea for two things: Systematic career planning and careful research on career development. Planning
depends upon research. Research is the price of planning. This is clear in every field where rational planning procedures have been attempted. Planning is a programmatic form of prediction, and one cannot predict unless he knows the relationships between many variables and has developed a conceptual framework which makes sense of those variables over time. To do this requires extended and detailed studies of ministers as they live out their careers. Research in learning theory has revolutionized educational method. Research in organizational behavior has created a whole new approach to corporation management. Research on Peace Corps volunteers drastically reduced illness, inadequacy and dropout. Ministers and churches will benefit as much or more from sustained and sophisticated research into what makes Reverend run, what drives his career.

Educators are people-changers, and continuing professional education ought to be facilitating the self-directed change which constitutes career planning at its best. You can't do that without research. Yet, as Connolly Gamble reports, "with a few notable exceptions the continuing education movement is lacking in research that seeks better means of setting goals and charting progress." It is said that, if thirty years ago the railroads had decided they were in the transportation business and not just the railroad business, they would not be in such a sorry plight today. It seems to me that if continuing educators consider themselves only in the business of running continuing education programs, they are already in trouble. For we are seeing a revolution in the processes by which the world's work is done, and the name of the revolution is planning. Systematic, orderly, rational, planning based on facts and calculated risks is gradually pushing out of every field the traditional, business as usual, routine-dominated leadership of the past. Research, both basic and applied, is an essential ingredient.

In 1965, Charles V. Willie estimated that approximately 5% of the budgets of non-profit corporations would be spent on research and evaluation, and I suspect
his estimate is already too low. Research is expensive in money and in time, and it also may be expensive in another way: That one must live with the findings even when they shatter favorite assumptions. For what plagues the educator today is not principally lack of method or even of strategy but ignorance of facts which would give him a basis for planned career development through education. Worse yet, he and the rest of the church with him appear unconcerned about their ignorance, still reshuffling programs and faculty.

If I seem harsh on this point, it is partly because I have visions of this consultation completing all its strategy developments and formulations of objectives and recommended priorities without ever having faced its own appalling ignorance (and mine also) of the developmental process within which continuing professional education is to be done. You're driving an impressive vehicle this week. You may turn the steering wheel, step on the accelerator and even clean the windshield, but until someone surveys the territory and maps out the minister's career process, you don't really know where you're headed.

The field of continuing education itself has a developing career, just trying to emerge from the trial stage. It may be near to floundering because it lacks clear identity and a genuine striving toward excellence. The planning you do this week may keep stagnation from settling in, and the purposes you develop may facilitate the field's development. But I hope you see clearly that an essential ingredient in the lines of strategy, a priority of first rank, has to be serious research which goes beyond program evaluation to provide a broad fact base for the development of clergy careers.
References


English, Joseph T., address to annual consultation on church manpower, National Council of Churches, Department of Ministry, January, 1967.


Willie, Charles V. "Evaluation Resources and Their Use" *Information Service* (National Council of Churches), XLV: 3 (Feb. 12, 1966), 1-5.
Continuing education for ministry is a moving stream with many currents flowing in the same general direction, at different speeds, of different depths and widths, and with different degrees of temperature. As a stream it cannot be arrested in its movement without some distortion of its true nature, and no description adequately conveys its living qualities.

A national survey was made in the summer of 1968 with the approval of the Society for the Advancement of Continuing Education for Ministry (SACEM), and the Commission on Continuing Education, Department of Ministry, National Council of Churches. It was made upon request and with funding by the Department of the Ministry, Board of Education, United Methodist Church.

Purpose. The aim of the survey was threefold: (1) to obtain a profile of the continuing education leadership in the United States; (2) to count participants in all programs offered; and (3) to assemble information on evaluation, its forms and its results.

Prepared for the Consultation on Continuing Education for United Methodist Ministers, October 20-23, 1968.

Dr. Gamble is Director of Continuing Education, Union Theological Seminary, Richmond, Virginia.
Responses. Many people had problems with the survey. Vacations and staff dislocations hampered efforts to respond. Heavy staff loads created time problems. Newness of personnel in some agencies meant that records were not readily available. Requested data were not always in the form sought in the survey. The scope and intent of the survey were not always understood. Some who received a questionnaire were not interested. Some no longer answer questionnaires. These and other factors affected the survey and its completeness. The inquiry was ended on 1 October 1968.

For purposes of convenience the respondents were grouped in eight categories. The names of responding agencies, as shown in Chart 5, will show the makeup of each group. The responses from various groups are shown in Chart 1 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Sent out</th>
<th>Received</th>
<th>Responsive</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Action Training Centers</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>54.54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Clinical Pastoral Education</td>
<td>233</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>42.91%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Councils of Churches</td>
<td>270</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>17.04%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Denominational Agencies</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>100.00%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Seminaries</td>
<td>148</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>60.13%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Universities &amp; Colleges</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>44.18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Miscellaneous Agencies</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>40.00%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Totals: 766 299 39.03%

The inquiry was sent to all agencies and officials who could be identified with addresses and that seemed to be connected with the continuing education movement. In view of the limiting factors already described, the total figures hereafter should be regarded as indicators from an extensive sampling, rather than a complete picture. The help of all those who answered is gratefully acknowledged.
I. Continuing Education Leadership

In seeking a profile of continuing educators, the survey asked about (1) role-concept; (2) number of persons devoting major time to continuing education for ministry; (3) proportion of time devoted to continuing education; (4) years of service in continuing education; (5) training and prior experience; (6) chief problems; and (7) their own continuing education.

1. Role-concepts held by continuing education personnel.

Respondents checked the following roles when asked what fit most closely their own conceptions of their work:

**Action Training Centers:** trainer for urban ministry 7; change innovator 5; educational administrator 5; teacher 3; field work counselor 2.

**Clinical Pastoral Education:** counselor to pastors 68; teacher 54; sensitivity trainer 43; chaplain supervisor 38; adult educator 24; performance evaluator 23.

**Councils of Churches:** ecumenical executive 12; counselor to pastors 9; change innovator 9; adult educator 7; denominational executive 7; educational administrator 6; trainer for urban ministry 4; teacher 4.

**Denominational Agencies:** denominational executive 8; educational administrator 8; change innovator 5; adult educator 4; counselor to pastors 4; teacher 4; sensitivity trainer 3.

**Seminaries:** educational administrator 47; teacher 35; adult educator 15; counselor to pastors 13; change innovator 6; field work counselor 6; career guidance counselor 5.

**Specialized Continuing Education Agencies:** counselor to pastors 8; adult educator 7; teacher 6; educational administrator 5; change innovator 3; sensitivity trainer 3; performance evaluator 2; trainer for urban ministry 2.
Universities and Colleges: adult educator 9; educational administrator 7; teacher 6; change innovator 3.

Miscellaneous Agencies: educational administrator 5; adult educator 4; change innovator 3; teacher 3; sensitivity trainer 3.

(2) Number of persons devoting major time to continuing education for ministry.

Those reported as spending 1/3 or more time to continuing education are tabulated in Chart 2.

Chart 2. Persons Devoting Major Time to Continuing Education for Ministry.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>None</th>
<th>One</th>
<th>Two</th>
<th>Three</th>
<th>Four</th>
<th>Five</th>
<th>Six</th>
<th>Seven</th>
<th>Eight</th>
<th>Nine</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ATC</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPE</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Couns</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denoms</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semins</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Univs</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misc.</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

II. Continuing Education Participation

Summary of Reports of Participation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Clergy</th>
<th>Laity</th>
<th>Resident</th>
<th>Non-Resident</th>
<th>Mail</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Action Training Centers</td>
<td>839</td>
<td>428</td>
<td>411</td>
<td>409</td>
<td>280</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clinical Pastoral Education Centers</td>
<td>4,166</td>
<td>3,598</td>
<td>460</td>
<td>367</td>
<td>2,246</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Councils of Churches</td>
<td>12,359</td>
<td>1,911</td>
<td>10,250</td>
<td>1,176</td>
<td>10,467</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denominational Agencies</td>
<td>1,978</td>
<td>1,612</td>
<td>386</td>
<td>1,317</td>
<td>661</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seminaries</td>
<td>12,148</td>
<td>8,947</td>
<td>2,924</td>
<td>3,903</td>
<td>6,520</td>
<td>2,258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialized Continuing Education Agencies</td>
<td>1,655</td>
<td>1,353</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>775</td>
<td>510</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universities and Colleges</td>
<td>1,640</td>
<td>1,103</td>
<td>487</td>
<td>418</td>
<td>1,270</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Miscellaneous Agencies</td>
<td>3,616</td>
<td>2,143</td>
<td>848</td>
<td>2,456</td>
<td>460</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Totals</td>
<td>38,401</td>
<td>21,095</td>
<td>15,858</td>
<td>10,821</td>
<td>22,414</td>
<td>2,356</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
III. Evaluation of Continuing Education

(1) Specific objectives.

Responses to the question of specific goals varied according to the type of agency. **ATC** respondents emphasized skill training—in analyzing urban problems; in strategizing re human problems in the city; in identifying and using resources of the metropolis to meet human needs; in working effectively with constituencies for environmental change; in clarifying professional roles and religious institutional roles in effecting urban change. **CPE** noted most often these objectives: self-understanding 22; clinical supervision of the use of academic training in ministering to persons under stress 22; sensitivity training 14; exposure to interdisciplinary team processes 14; improved pastoral care 8; personal and professional growth among clergy 5; etc.

**Seminary** goals in continuing education emphasized: opening avenues for personal enrichment 6; to examine current theological issues through dialogue between faculty and seminar 5; to release from professional duties and offer a change of pace 4; to offer an unstructured study opportunity for ministers to read 4; to develop the capacity and desire and definition of needs and goals for independent study 4; to make more skillful the clergy's use of their basic tools 3; to stimulate continued study and provide opportunities for directed study 3; to give intellectual stimulation, awareness, and growth 3; to relate theological, historical, and practical disciplines to the church and world situations where pastors work 3; etc.

**Specialized agencies** in continuing education stressed: to provide intercommunication among clergy 2; to renew, update, open windows 2; to bring about behavior changes or known behavior application as requested by or agreed to by participants leading to more effective ministry; to refresh and renew by a week away from work, in a supporting situation; to cast new light on the
preaching task; to help ministers (clergy and laity) to understand and use the principle of dialogue; to develop a sense of partnership between clergy and laity; to help ministers to understand and work in the structures of society; to provide an ecumenical setting where real differences between churches may be seen; to engender trust of persons; to awaken sensitivity to human need; to effect community and church change; to help pastors in personal growth and pastoral work with parishioners.

Universities and colleges stressed these goals: to inform and awaken lay and professional church leaders to change in society; to provide knowledge and skills to be more effective in the local situation; to assist the ecumenical movement by exposure and relationships among groups in the Christian tradition; to satisfy pressing current needs; to provide information on social and economic changes; to assist communities to develop human and natural resources.

Miscellaneous agencies noted these objectives: to help educators, especially clergy, to work better in strengthening marriage and family life; to equip ministers for new roles and provide essential skills to deal with organizational change, personal growth, and planning process; to present a factual and comprehensive analysis of the American economic system to clergy; etc.

(3) Means of evaluation

Asked what process of evaluation is used, respondents answered thus:

ATC said objective tests; feedback sessions; staff evaluation of curriculum; tests of attitude and skill before and after training; subjective evaluations; mailed questionnaire; written and oral questionnaires; curriculum planning with trainees; self-evaluation by students. CPE responded: student’s self-evaluation; supervisor’s evaluation; weekly group sessions; personal interview; student feedback; extern consultants; tests.

Seminaries said: participant questionnaire; evaluation by faculty.
by invited consultant sitting through conference 3, by staff 3, by director 3; student feedback 14; 3-part questionnaire--before arrival, stating objectives; after 2-week session; and 3-6 months later, re changes in objectives and accomplishments; professional team of evaluators on limited basis; research consultant formulates and evaluates report instrument; etc.

Specialized agencies said: student feedback at end 4; staff evaluation 3; questionnaire at end 4; follow-up after conference 2. Universities said: questionnaires from students 7; feedback from students 2; etc. Miscellaneous agencies said: feedback from students 2; questionnaires 2, one or two years after conference 1; consultants; attitudinal change scale developed for us; pre- and post-seminar testing; staff evaluation.

(5) Programs of most educational value

As asked which program has greatest educational potential and why, respondents said: ATC emphasized long-term--seedbed for planting, growth, and evaluation of results; depends on goals. CPE said: year's internship 14; 12-week program 10; all clinical programs 4; basic course in CPE 3; all CPE are equal except in length 3; each has its value. Councils said: all are important; those dealing with practical ecumenicity; trainer development seminar; conflict management programs. Denominations said: most are expendable; we want to become brokers, not programmers; young pastors' schools; guided reading program in afternoon of institute. Seminaries said: graduate courses 7; 12-day independent study on campus 4; have not yet evaluated at this depth 2; cross-discipline, in-depth dialogue; 10-days on campus; Pastoral Fellows Program; those in biblical and systematic theology, less concerned about techniques and manipulation; urban ministries; counseling; preaching and theology--because the pastor comes motivated to be more effective; full-year program--collegial method, combined discrete and on-the-job ingredients, oriented to behavioral
sciences; pastoral supervision program; only one offered.  

Specialized agencies said: supervisory chaplains conference--training trainers; 3-month resident fellow program; all the same; semester-long course.  
Universities said: regular degree program; total program of inter-related parts, not unrelated series. Miscellaneous agencies said: educational television series; summer school (3-week residence).

(7) Needed changes in American ministers  

Asked in what ways ministers most need to change and develop over the next five to ten years, respondents answered: ATC said: more related to community and social issues 2; develop specialized ministry; clear and limited job description; aware of metropolitanizing of America and implications for ministry; trained in community organizations, all styles; ability in group dynamics and personal growth re social change; courage in restructuring own convictions re meaning of Christian faith; new focus on white America, root of most problems; competent strategists, accomplishing defined tasks; able to anticipate rather than respond to crisis; broader acceptance of non-parochial ministries.  

CPE said: able to understand selves 9; involved in society's structures and problems 10; more aware of feelings of others 8; more flexible re religious traditions 6; ability to listen and be willing to get involved 4; maintain personal touch of love 5; relate theological understanding to psychology and human development learning 4; clear role concept integrated in self-awareness 4; adept at correlating theology and social sciences 5; develop theological perspective on life 5; renewed confidence in intrinsic value of Christian ministry 5; etc.

Denominational executives said: management and administrative skills 2;
more concern re social situation; develop interests beyond church--arts, politics, sociology, literature; nurture skills for ministry--communicating, counseling, teaching, administration; able to understand the world in which we live so as to find the church's particular mission; develop ways to keep in touch with the secular world and youth and build up a professional image of the man who speaks for God to and as a man; prepare for decline in membership and resources, so learn cooperation; change agent.

Seminaries said: improve ability to plan strategy and tactics for achieving change 4; become creative player-coach equipping laity in interaction with the world 5; clarify roles as ministers and accept distinctive role wholeheartedly 3; better knowledge of the faith, how to express it in contemporary forms, and apply to current conditions 3; see need for continuing education as a personal responsibility 3; aware of the changing world, but also of that which abides in the gospel 2; develop teams to divide responsibilities 2; develop higher standards of professional competence 2; improve ability to communicate 2; become more independent in continuing education; greater skill in organizing local church for mission instead of maintenance 2; more ecumenism; etc.

Specialized agencies said: increased ability to relate to others openly, trustingly, without being judgmental or threatening; able to minister through laymen instead of directly; learning what their role is and skills needed for it; building into professional practice continued learning; learning to handle conflict, change, and insecurity through managerial and communicative arts and sciences; to be ecumenical, dialogical, enablers of ministry instead of trying to be doers of it; flexibility, trust of laity and other clergy; professional confidence despite change and trauma; more professional competence, less academic, graduate-school stance; able to accept people where they are and lead them close to where they should be.
Universities and colleges said: aware of roles of clergy and laity in leading community change; stress educational role of minister and church as center for continuing education; understand impact of science and deal with changes from sound theological perspective; aware how values develop and are transmitted; able to relate Christianity to what is happening here and now; better theological grounding; knowledge and skill in behavioral sciences; more specialized ministry as professionals; more consciously task oriented in selecting and carrying out planned objectives; more aware of milieu.

Miscellaneous agencies said: able to earn salaries and provide services for fees; see selves as learners instead of proclaimers; able to know and serve the real needs of parishioners.

IV. Some Impressions from the Survey.

(1) The difficulty in defining continuing education.

In the letter accompanying the questionnaire a definition was suggested: "the planned learning which goes on after a person changes permanently from his primary role as 'student' to 'minister.'" The definition will not fit the data in the survey. The responses show that neither this definition nor any other has been accepted. For example, seminary students are recorded as "clergy" by some CPE centers and as "laity" by others in CPE. Many such centers also report on clergy who have reverted to the role of "student" for a term or a year as chaplain interns, but they are included as engaged in continuing education.

The nature of "planned learning" is also variously understood. A program may be a four-hour workshop on one occasion; three days in the Church Center at the United Nations; a series of 14 weekly seminars; or an engagement in study extended over seven years on and off campus. This survey has accepted program data on the basis of respondents' own definition of continuing education. Thus it reports programs that are clearly appropriate and also some marginal ones.
Communication among continuing educators would be greatly enhanced if a mutually acceptable, readily understood definition of "continuing education" were developed. Meanings will continue to fail to meet so long as terminology is ambiguously understood.

(2) The impossibility of making a definitive survey.

No accurate, adequate survey of continuing education can be made successfully. No way exists feasibly to identify all the forms of continuing education for ministry, or to count completely the participation, or to specify the locations. *Study Opportunities for Ministers* is the most comprehensive listing, but does not include occasional and invitational programs or marginal forms. So long as the definition is not standardized, a survey cannot be complete.

(3) The rapid developments in continuing education.

Despite the difficulties in making a survey, however, growth is clearly evident. In the eight years since a study was made, a notable increase in personnel and programs appears from the present survey. (1) In 1960 there were no urban training centers (or "action training centers" as they are now named). Now there are 19 centers or networks represented in the Action Training Coalition. (2) The number of accredited centers for clinical pastoral education has increased since 1960 from about 145 to 260 in September 1968; and the number of certified supervisors has risen in the same period from 182 to 377. (3) In 1960 there was no denominational executive devoting full time to continuing education for ministry. Now there are eight in four denominations who spend full time on this concern. (4) There were no programs for pastoral doctorates in 1960 comparable with the provisions now made in several theological schools. (5) Specialized continuing education agencies have multiplied from three in
1960 to fifteen in 1968. (6) In 1960 three seminary faculty or staff were devoting half-time or more to continuing education for ministry. In 1968 the number reported is 23. (7) In 1960 "continuing education" was the responsibility of a subcommittee of the Committee on Theological Education, Department of the Ministry, National Council of Churches. In 1967 the Department of Ministry formed the Commission on Continuing Education and is seeking a staff person to devote much of his time to this concern. (8) In 1967 was formed the Society for the Advancement of Continuing Education for Ministry (SACEM), with membership now approaching 150 personal and institutional members. (9) In 1968 the Academy of Parish Clergy was organized and members from pastoral ministry were enrolled with commitments to systematic study over a three-year period. Such developments over the last eight years give evidence of the quickening pace in the continuing education movement.

(4) The problem of goal-formulation and evaluation.

Many ministers express an urgent need for continuing education. Some programs, it appears, have been inaugurated as crash attempts to respond to the need. Apparent similarities among programs may indicate relatively uncritical adoption of several types as models. Such a judgment may not be accurate, however; the forms may have been adopted after careful study of alternatives and decision that they offer the greatest potential for the sponsoring agency's goals to be achieved.

The survey indicates widespread dissatisfaction with the means used in evaluating program effectiveness. Except for the CPE group, no other agencies seem well pleased with the methods employed to test their results against their goals. Only supervised clinical programs seem to provide clearly articulated change goals and careful measurement of progress toward
these objectives. Yet even in this group there is a difference between evaluation of the changes in persons and evaluation of the programs by which these changes were effected. No group is satisfied that its evaluation procedures are sufficient, it seems. With a few notable exceptions the continuing education movement is lacking in research that seeks better means of setting goals and charting progress toward these objectives.

(5) The status of continuing education for ministry.

Continuing education programs are in peril of being "too little, too late." The survey gives sparse evidence that any denomination through any of its agencies has made a massive commitment of its total resources to the continuing education of its ministry--clerical and lay. The rate of program development is increasing, but the problems of ministry are also growing in number and depth. A great many programs appear to be oriented to ministry as known in the past and present and with little attempt to reconstruct ministry for a changed and changing society. A new commitment to continuing education of ministry on radical terms is imperatively demanded.
A Historical Bibliography of Continuing Education for Ministry

1960

The Continuing Theological Education of the American Minister: Report of a Survey, by Connolly C. Gamble, Jr. (Richmond, Union Theological Seminary, 1960. 75 pp.)

1964


1965


Study Opportunities for Ministers, June 1965 to June 1966. (New York, Department of Ministry, National Council of Churches, 1965. 22 pp.)


1966

Study Opportunities for Ministers, March 1966 to March 1967. (New York, Department of Ministry, National Council of Churches, 1966. 48 pp.)

1967

Continuing Education and the Church's Ministry; a Bibliographical Survey, by Connolly C. Gamble, Jr. (Richmond, Union Theological Seminary, 1967. 120 pp.)

Study Opportunities for Ministers, March 1967 to March 1968. (New York, Department of Ministry, National Council of Churches, 1967. 48 pp.)

1968


Study Opportunities for Ministers, January 1968 to January 1969. (New York, Department of Ministry, National Council of Churches, 1968. 56 pp.)

Continuing Education for Ministry: Personnel, Participation, and Evaluation, by Connolly C. Gamble, Jr. (Richmond, Union Theological Seminary, 1968. 23 pp.)
A REVIEW OF CONTINUING EDUCATION
FOR
UNITED METHODIST MINISTERS
Mark A. Rouch

The primary focus of this review is the present. However, it may be helpful at the outset to sketch in some of the developments which have led to the present.

At the beginning of the 1964-1968 quadrennium, an Office of Continuing Education was established in the Department of Ministerial Education of the former Methodist Church, and at about the same time responsibility for in-service training assumed increasing importance in the Board of Ministerial Education and Relations in the former Evangelical United Brethren Church. These denominational developments were, partly at least, in response to the rapidly increasing interest among ministers in their continuing education and the mushrooming of programs designed to meet that need.

While it had been referred to most frequently as "in-service training," denominational responsibility for continuing education was new neither to the Methodists nor Evangelical United Brethren. For a number of years, the Evangelical United Brethren Church had conducted schools for ministers largely through the seminaries in relation to the regions which they served. By 1950, The Methodist Church had established across the denomination more than forty of what were most often called "Pastors' Refresher Schools," many of which had antecedents reaching back into the 1920's. It was, however, in the 1960's that both denominations recognized the emergence of this new movement and began actively to relate their efforts to it.

Prepared for the Consultation on Continuing Education for United Methodist Ministers, October 20-23, 1968.

As associate director of the Department of the Ministry of the United Methodist Board of Education, Dr. Rouch has responsibility for Continuing Education.
The Nature of This Review

Two functions are basic to the minister's continuing education: **program** and **support** and all organizational structures exist to serve these functions in one way or another. Accordingly, the first part of this review will concern these functions. It will then consider denominational organization intended to serve them and finally several recent potentially significant emergents in ministerial continuing education.

"Program" here denotes those organized educational or training activities usually with leadership of a mentor, teacher or trainer in which the minister may participate from time to time. By "support" is meant the help which the minister needs (such as money, time and guidance) to engage in his continuing education. In one sense support includes programs, but for purposes of this review the two will be considered separately.

**Programs**

This review does not attempt to include a reference to all programs of continuing education sponsored by The United Methodist Church for its ministers. Rather, it will cover the major categories with some specific statistics and examples related to each.

Two systems of United Methodist programing for ministerial continuing education stand out in the present situation: The short institute most often called the 'Pastors' School and programs conducted by the seminaries.

There are forty-two established Pastors' Schools throughout the United States with which the Department of the Ministry has contact. In most cases these are jointly sponsored by the Department and one or more annual conferences. Financial subsidies averaging approximately $600 annually are made to all but four of these programs and, except in three cases, program planning is done jointly with the Department of the Ministry.
Thirty-nine Pastors' Schools were held in 1968 with a total attendance of approximately 8,500 ministers. Probably two-thirds of these, or some 5,700, were full or nearly full-time registrants. In the fiscal year ending May 31, 1968, the subsidies to these schools and other direct expenditures by the Department of the Ministry for them was $25,178. During this same period, annual conference support was approximately $41,692. These total $66,870, and while this does not represent the total expenditure, it does indicate approximately the figure invested by the denomination through national and annual conference funds.

Several trends are apparent in the Pastors' Schools. For the most part their educational quality is improving. Instead of the traditional three lecturers and a preacher, many are focusing on a central subject, using fewer lectures and more planned discussion. Another trend is toward a shorter period. Several now are conducted intensively during 48 hours; few are longer than four days. Reported attendance ranges from approximately 50-500. After a peak of 10,000 in 1965, attendance has decreased slightly but not significantly. Finally, these programs are seen increasingly by their leaders as only one possible element in continuing education programming and are being interpreted as such.

In 1968 the former Methodist Central Jurisdiction School was discontinued and its constituency has been included in other schools. Where former Central Jurisdiction Conferences still exist, in most cases they have members on joint Boards of Managers of the schools in their areas.

All of the United Methodist seminaries have been involved significantly in either continuing education programming or preparation for it. For many years the seminaries have conducted lecture weeks or other special programs for alumni and others as well as summer schools and institutes. Within the
In the 1960's, however, programs have begun to be designed taking into account the emerging insights and demands of the continuing education movement.

In most cases, faculty continuing education committees have been established. Five schools now have directors of continuing education or equivalent offices with at least one other scheduled to make such an appointment in the summer of 1969.

The programs of the seminaries can be classified in several ways, one of which is residence and extension. Most of the schools have conducted both.

At present the most active extension education is at Claremont and Perkins, each of which has a distinctive character. In addition to other extension programs, Perkins has developed a guided reading program centered largely in its natural region, but beginning to extend to other parts of the United States, a program with which Garrett is now cooperating. Claremont has recently become a joint sponsoring agency in an Academy for Continuing Theological Studies which will be referred to later in the paper.

Two seminaries are now in their third year of extended residential programs in mid-academic year. In each case, the participants have been mostly those selected by cabinets and Boards of the Ministry from the schools' nearby conferences and in both the program has been directed primarily to renewal of the minister's ability as a professional man. After studies of their constituencies' needs and their own resources, at least four schools are initiating this year new residence programs varying from five days to three weeks. In most cases, these, as with most longer established residence programs, will be quite sharply focused on a particular aspect of the minister's work. In two cases, at least, there will be periods for unstructured residential continuing education study.

As residential programs have increased, the requirement of residential facilities has emerged also. Some schools are designating part of existing
facilities as continuing education residence centers or have constructed new buildings partly for that purpose. At Methodist Theological School in Ohio, the basic seminary schedule has been reorganized to provide for continuing education residence in mid-winter.

Increasingly, seminaries are relating their continuing education programs to those of other seminaries and universities in their vicinity. Just beginning, but the most complete of such involvement, is Boston University School of Theology's participation in Boston Theological Institute, whose Task Force on Continuing Education will be the primary agency for the school's continuing education program. Garrett's statement of "objectives and philosophy" undergirding its new program speaks of its "relationship to other theological schools, universities and church agencies in Chicago." Perkins is now working with four other schools in Texas in joint planning and publicity for continuing education opportunities in Texas. Others are involved in establishing similar relationships.

The total ministerial participants in United Methodist seminary programs reported in Dr. Connolly Gamble's survey is 1,351 from six schools, not inclusive for the most part of summer school and lecture week participants. No other attempt was made to secure numbers of participants.

In February 1967, representatives from Methodist and Evangelical United Brethren seminaries met for the first time to discuss their role in continuing education. Several significant points of consensus were established which have been taken into account as the schools have developed their programs. Perhaps the most important of these is "that the seminary is a community of learning which has a unique responsibility to provide the minister with counsel and resources necessary for the development of his continued program of learning." What has been said above indicates that the seminaries are accepting this responsibility and with increased sophistication have defined
their particular role in continuing education as well as their relation to other programming agencies and to the church.

Programs are also being initiated by Continuing Education Committees in Annual Conferences. In many instances, committees are working cooperatively with established program agencies. For example the Boards of the Ministry in Wisconsin are conducting this autumn the "Continuing Education Project for Wisconsin Clergy" cooperatively with three seminaries including Garrett and Evangelical. The Southwest Texas Conference has established a system of reading groups cooperatively with Perkins, using the Perkins reading guides. Reference has already been made to the Academy for Continuing Theological Studies in which the Southern California-Arizona Conference is working with the School of Theology at Claremont. This cooperative pattern between an established institution and an annual conference committee represents a significant trend away from the annual conference committee's seeing itself exclusively as a programing agency.

The other major category of programs is those conducted by general church agencies and their counterparts in annual conferences. Included here are such enterprises as social issues workshops related to the Board of Christian Social Concerns; laboratory schools related to the Board of Education, Division of the Local Church; Schools of Missions; etc. No attempt has been made to tabulate the number of ministers involved in these programs, but without question the figure is high.

A special case in this category is the network of training programs being projected and developed across the United States through MUST II, an interboard system under the administrative direction of the Board of Missions, Division of National Missions. Focused on training both clergy and laity for their mission in the world, MUST II is cooperating with other denominations in developing training facilities in metropolitan centers related to networks
of training facilities in the larger socio-economic regions related to these centers. The training style emphasized is action oriented and the system is being developed ecumenically. At present, an interboard team is beginning exploration of cooperative planning for two metropolitan centers.

Consideration of programs is not complete without reference to involvement of United Methodist ministers in other than denominational programs. The continuing education movement of the 1960's has been singularly ecumenical. Many significant nondenominational programs have developed, the constituency of which is interdenominational, including Roman Catholic priests and Jewish rabbis. United Methodist ministers have been among these in significant numbers. For example, last season The Institute for Advanced Pastoral Studies enrolled 248 in its ten-day programs; 32 were United Methodist. The Oak Ridge Associated Universities conference on the "Impact of Science on Society" in 1968 enrolled 88; 12 were United Methodist. Between 1962 and 1968 the Ecumenical Institute has enrolled approximately 2,700 ministers in its Chicago and regional center programs; approximately 40 percent, or some 1,100 have been United Methodist. While no statistics are available, there is little doubt that many of the 1,103 participants in university and college programs reported in the Gamble study and thousands more are United Methodist.

Support

Continuing education is a system which, like all education, has as its most important element the learning process of the individual. The goal of all continuing education efforts whether program or support is to enable the individual to take responsibility for and engage in his own learning program which should be unfolding, systematic and sustained.

If the individual is to accept this responsibility, including participation in continuing education programs from time to time, he must have support at least in terms of money, time, understanding and counsel or
The 1968 Discipline contains a new paragraph on the minister's continuing education which should provide undergirding for support. Among other things it says that in most cases the minister's program of learning will require study leaves of at least one week a year and at least one month during one year of each quadrennium.

Annual Conference Continuing Education Committees are increasingly assuming responsibility for support. Reports from these committees indicate that through them nearly 150 ministers received financial help in their continuing education programs last year. Nineteen committees reported that approximately $32,000 in scholarship funds were available in that period.

This is a bare beginning when one considers that there are some 30,000 United Methodist ministers, but it is a beginning and there are many indications that financial support will increase rapidly. It is anticipated that the Ministerial Education Fund will help provide continuing education scholarship resources for ministers through the monies kept by the conference for use of its Board of the Ministry in supporting ministerial education.

To a minor degree, Continuing Education Committees have offered guidance for men in their continuing education programs. In some cases, this is done through the evaluation of applications for scholarship grants. In some, definite suggestions are made through publicity concerning major directions which the minister's continuing education should take and suggesting programs which can best serve this purpose. For example, the Rock River Conference brochure suggests four major study areas: The minister and the mission of the church; The new day and the gospel; The personal and professional roles of the minister; and The minister and special competence. In 1967-1968, Boards of the Ministry, cooperatively with the Department of the Ministry, distributed more than 9,000 copies of Study Opportunities for
Ministers, the annually published primary source book for ministers seeking continuing education programs.

Several committees are working with their bishop and cabinet in plans for making available study leaves or sabbaticals. For example, a major program adopted by the Rocky Mountain Annual Conference in 1968 has this as one of its major objectives.

Guidance for the minister's continuing education is one of the most important support factors but has been given minimal attention such as those efforts referred to above. Probably the most actual guidance in a structured relationship has been given through the seminaries, and it should be noted that guidance is emerging as one of the roles of the seminary director of continuing education. A small amount of guidance is given through the national office as inquiries come to it, and the associate director is presently working with an interdenominational committee in a large metropolitan region in exploration of means of providing guidance.

Church Organizations for Continuing Education

Primary responsibility in the General Church for the minister's continuing education has been lodged with the Department of the Ministry. In accordance with that responsibility, this consultation has been called. However, the presence here of representatives from other general church agencies indicates that the job is too large, too diverse, and too critical for one agency alone and will require the best cooperative efforts of all of us. It is true, moreover, that the church's charge to various agencies includes responsibilities relating them to the minister's continuing education.

Since establishment of the Office of Continuing Education in the Department of the Ministry, several major functions have emerged. In addition to the continuation of the Department's role in relation to the Pastors' Schools,
a great amount of study, exploration and experimentation has been done to help determine the denomination's strategy in continuing education. In other words, much of the work of the last four years has led into this consultation. In these years, there has been considerable work with the seminaries, with other general boards and with annual conference continuing education agencies in exploring program and support possibilities.

In these years also, a significant involvement has developed with continuing education leaders of other denominations largely through what is now the Commission on Continuing Education in the Department of Ministry of the National Council of Churches, and more recently through the new Society for Advancement of Continuing Education for Ministry. Several recent developments have made it quite likely that significant cooperative projects in programming and support can now be gotten underway involving several major denominations.

In the annual conferences of the new church, the primary responsibility for ministerial continuing education is lodged with the Board of the Ministry. However, it is clearly stated that this responsibility should be carried out cooperatively with other conference agencies.

A substantial majority of conferences now have Continuing Education Committees. In some cases, these are elected by the conference and responsible to it. In most, however, they are committees of the Board of the Ministry, sometimes with representatives from other boards and in a few instances lay members. In other conferences, there are Pastors' School Boards, not designated as Continuing Education Committees. In several others, Boards of the Ministry have chairmen of continuing education but not committees. While complete information is not available, it is known in some cases that Boards of the Ministry and other agencies are relating their continuing education interests to the new Annual Conference Program Council.
One Jurisdiction, the North Central, has developed a continuing education program on a jurisdictional basis. Centered during the 1964-1968 quadrennium in a program of communications institutes, this program is being broadened in the 1968-1972 quadrennium to include "strengthening of in-service capabilities of the seminaries," communications institutes for lay pastors and two experimental institutes in administration, one including ministers' wives. The quadrennial budget is $75,000 for 1968-1972.

Potentially Significant New Emergents

Several recent developments, still virtually in infancy, are of such nature that they may be far more significant than their present size suggests.

The first has to do with a new attention to the minister's career and support services for it. A superintendent of ministries has recently been appointed for the Kansas Area with a job description which relates his work to all phases of the minister's career development including his continuing education. Other such superintendents of ministries may be appointed in the near future. However, the most important implication of this appointment is that it signifies a growing concern in The United Methodist Church for the minister's career and support services for it, a concern which is growing rapidly in other denominations. Two denominations have now established regional career centers and a system of such centers and other career services is now under consideration by the Department of the Ministry of the National Council of Churches. Should this movement grow significantly it will greatly affect continuing education support and programs for our own as well as other denominations.

A second emergent is the new Academy of Parish Clergy. With considerable support from the Lilly Endowment, the Academy is now in the process of formation. By-laws have been adopted and not later than January of 1969 it
will be open to membership. Indications are that it will grow rapidly and will include many United Methodists. A major objective of the Academy will be the furtherance of the minister's continuing education. To continue as a member the minister must engage in 50 hours of continuing education programs accredited by the Academy each year.

Earlier in this paper the Academy for Continuing Theological Studies, sponsored jointly by the Southern California-Arizona Conference Committee on Continuing Theological Education, The Disciples Seminary Foundation and The School of Theology at Claremont, was mentioned. This venture is of especial interest partly because it recognizes the importance of certification in continuing education, but perhaps even more so because it is representative of this new interest in the academy idea.

It is entirely possible that the voice of the parish minister through this new academy will soon become a considerable force in determining the nature and style of continuing education—as well it should. Within possibly five years or less, The United Methodist Church and other denominations may have to take seriously into account the voice of the Academy in planning for the continuing education of their ministers.

A third emergent is the "network" concept. Its most active development at present is among those involved in action-training programs, but other groups and agencies are likely to influence the process.

In most instances, continuing programs have grown up rapidly and like topsy. New interest is now emerging in attempting to bring order into the situation so that wasteful duplication can be eliminated and resources be used responsibly.

At their best, such networks would link on a regional basis training and education resources and denominational structures as well as guidance and support services for ministers in a system the most fundamental aim of
which would be enabling ministers to participate in those programs best suited to their needs.

Should such networks emerge, they will, in the nature of the case, be interdenominational in structure and ecumenical in spirit and no effective United Methodist strategy in continuing education could be unrelated to them.

Conclusion

This resume has sketched some of the major lines in the picture of continuing education for ministers in The United Methodist Church. It may or may not, however, have revealed the most important fact which is that no movement in the life of our church at the moment has within it a greater amount of spontaneous interest or sense of felt need. This, coupled with the rather high degree of flexibility in the situation, indicates that no time is more propitious than now for the emergence of a strategy for our denomination in the continuing education of its ministers. Our task here is to take the first major step to set that strategy in motion.

1"Pastors' School" is used here to refer to these programs, though some are called by other names: "Pastors' Assembly," "School of the Prophets," etc.

2One was suspended for 1968 because of a conflicting program; two moved their dates into the winter of 1969.

3The largest figure not included is most of the room and board costs which are usually cared for by the individual participant, sometimes with assistance of his church.

4Names of United Methodist seminaries are abbreviated to facilitate brevity.


6Paragraph 355.

7This is other than scholarship support for attendance of Pastors' Schools.
I have been asked tonight to address two important questions: What is meant by "cybernation"? What is its most important influence upon our culture?

Asking me to do something, and having me do it, are two quite distinct operations. My mother learned, early in the process of raising me, that I do not respond well to direction. When told to go west, I am likely to trudge east. When asked to explain, I am likely to obscure. When asked to comment on one subject, I am likely to comment on something quite different.

That is what will happen tonight, at least. "Cybernation", you must realize, is a coined word invented by D. N. Michael to designate the development of machines as surrogates for human thought-processes. To describe what is meant by "cybernation" in detail would certainly become quite dull and dry. I would have to explain to you the roots of the computer revolution. I would have to allude to automation. I would have to explain that automation implies the replacement by machine of the physical exertions of man. I would have to point out that cybernation, in an analogous fashion, implies the replacement by machine of the routine cognitive processes of man. And by that time, you would already have misconstrued the meaning of cybernation.

No, tonight I am not going to answer the questions: "What is cybernation? What is its influence upon our culture?" Instead I am going to pose and answer the much more transparent questions "What is a telephone?"

Prepared for the Consultation on Continuing Education for United Methodist Ministers, October 20-23, 1968.

Dr. McIrvine is the Computer Applications Project Manager, New Business Development Office of the Ford Motor Company.

*Copyright 1968 Edward C. McIrvine.
What is its influence upon our culture?" (If we reach agreement on that issue, then maybe we can move on to more erudite subjects.)

A telephone is a machine. It is put together from various passive components like plastic moldings and copper wire. All by itself it is of little use, but two telephones, with copper wire connecting them, become a communications system.

Very early in the history of the telephone, it was noticed that stringing wire between every pair of telephones would use up copper wire much too rapidly. The concept of a "central" exchange developed, with every telephone wired to one building downtown. Within that building a board was built which allowed an operator to "switch" connections so that any pair of phones could be connected. Thus began the switchboard. It has been observed that if the United States had continued to use manual switching to handle the Bell System's present load, more than 100 million telephone operators would now be required. This would exceed the present adult female population, so something had to be done.

That something was the development of automatic exchanges, and the addition of dials to telephones. For a long time, you will recall, one still dialed the operator in order to get long distance calls. But now that, too, is fading into the past. The other day, I had to place two calls: one to Katmandu, Nepal, and one to Windsor, Ontario (just across the river from Detroit). I called "directory assistance" and asked them how to get information on the two numbers I wanted. I was told that to get Windsor information I could use direct dialing. I should dial "1-519-555-1212". For Katmandu information I should dial "0". Now that is progress.

Let me get back to the question. What is a telephone? It is a machine, made of inanimate components, connected to other telephones in
order to make up a telephone system. The telephone system is used to communicate messages of all sorts from human beings to each other, and also to communicate data from machines to each other. In order to make that telephone system work, the population of civilized regions of the world has been trained how to dial eleven digits at a time without making an error, and to like it. In return for accepting this training, we have been given a system which rather well solves the communications problem of our society. The telephone solves it, that is, so long as we take the definition of that communications problem to be a purely technical one of the transfer of information. If we broaden our view to include the problem of human responsiveness to the information which has been transferred, then we are still in trouble.

What has been the primary influence of the telephone upon our culture? It has altered our entire concept of interpersonal communication. Who can imagine teen-age dating without the telephone? How could one run a modern business without the telephone system? Could a contemporary political election be run without telephone communication? Interpersonal communication has come to depend so heavily upon the use of the telephone that the form of communication has been altered, and the etiquette of communication adjusted, to fit the realities of the technique. Society has accepted these accommodations rather passively. We have accepted the technical possibility as a technical inevitability, and have shaped society to the instrument, rather than the instrument to society.

And that, in a nutshell, is the hazard of the society in which we live. In our admiration for the artifacts of technology, we tend to reshape the human experience to fit the machine reality, rather than to demand that the machinery serve human needs. This is true not only of telephone
machinery, but of other modern electronic devices: the computer, for example.

Come to think of it, perhaps the telephone is not so far from being a computer, after all. Or more exactly, the telephone system is a computer system. Let me elaborate both functionally and historically.

I have already indicated the early history of automatic dialing, now culminating in the Direct Distance Dialing system with its eleven digits. Since the user has been broken in gradually, he does not think of it in these terms, but he has been trained to program a computer. The computer is the property of the Bell System in his region, and is turned on by lifting the handset. The computer delivers to the user a "ready" signal known as a dial tone. The user then is required to program the switching apparatus in the exchange by sending electrical signals identifying the destination of his call. The computer interprets the coded destination, calls into play the appropriate switching apparatus, and automatically selects a segmented path of copper wire which will connect the user to the desired second party. Many times a day, most of us are required to code a program for the telephone company's computer. Probably several times a week we make errors in the programming. If the errors involve the exchange name, or the area code, they are normally trapped by the computer. (You have all received the recorded messages "Please dial one first when dialing long distance calls", and "I'm sorry, but the number you have reached is not in service".) However, the system is not fail-safe, and some errors can get through and inconvenience people. I recently discovered that the University of Michigan "Hail to the Victors" march can be played on a Touch Tone phone. Unfortunately, your telephone bill will respond with charges for direct-dialing northern Labrador.
So functionally, perhaps the telephone system is a computer system in its most familiar form. It certainly is an information system, the generic term which is preferred by many computer professionals. Now let us deal with the connection in another context. What about the historical connection between telephones and computers?

The first digital computers made use of telephone switching equipment: they were known as relay computers. The scientific description of information known as "theory of communication" was developed by a Bell Telephone Laboratory scientist, interested in better ways of switching telephone messages. The transistor, without which we would not have the modern electronics and computer industries, was an invention of three Bell Telephone Laboratory scientists. So perhaps in describing the telephone system I have inadvertently led into the subject which I was asked to address:

What is meant by "cybernation"?

By cybernation we mean a broad application of all sorts of information-handling equipment. We include information systems which are primarily concerned with the communication of messages. We include systems which are primarily concerned with computation and logical decision-making, otherwise known as data processing. We include systems which are primarily concerned with the control of physical devices in response to processed information. The key to the definition lies in the fact that in all cases, the machinery of the information system is being used to perform functions which are normally considered to be the prerogative of human reasoning. Cybernation is the execution, by machine, of well-defined tasks which require the transfer, processing, or consulting of a body of information.

Information systems can be subdivided into three broad categories: communication, computation, and control. Communication shall be defined
as the transmittal of meaningful information. By "meaning" we indicate a significance to the receiver which causes a change in the state of the receiver. The receiver may be a human, a control device, or an information storage facility (e.g., a library). The source of the information, likewise, may be a human, a sensor looking at the world, or an information storage facility.

Computation shall be defined as the amplification of intellectual activity through the mechanization of the repetitive parts of human thought. Computers are then quite general purpose mechanisms capable of carrying out complex stored programs, although incapable of innovation. Control is closely related to computation. The distinction is one of output. A control device is an information processor intended to affect the operation of some physical device, while the computer was intended merely to report the outcome of its processing to a person.

Just as a telephone is a machine made of inanimate components, so a computer is a machine made of inanimate components. Just as telephones are connected into a telephone system which does amazing feats of message switching and obviates 100 million telephone operators, so computing machinery is connected together into information systems which do amazing feats of computation, communication and control, resulting in the obviation of additional millions of jobs.

Why do these subjects loom large in the world of today? Because, quite prosaically, the equipment required to perform these functions has dropped in price to the point that thousands of new applications become economically justified. Computers are applied to ticket reservation systems, bank records, direct-mail advertising, text editing, factory inspection tasks, machine control, railroad yard switching, musical composition, typesetting,
engineering design, and a host of other areas. The resulting enormous growth in the use of computer-based information systems has not been accompanied by a complete understanding of the systems by the people who come in contact with them. We have what approximates a case of "cultural shock" as a result.

The outstanding influence of cybernation upon our culture is the manner in which it has elicited from man an anxiety about the meaning of his humanity. It is the anxiety that man will lose his identity in a fully cybernated culture.

I do not mean a loss of individual identity within humanity. The increasing interdependence of man in complex society does not threaten his individual existence. On the contrary, the development of a sophisticated technological civilization has freed man to realize the dimensions of his existence. By an anxiety over the loss of identity, I mean a loss of identity for humanity totally, through a loss of meaning of the human role. If Paul Tillich was correct in identifying the anxiety of meaninglessness as the over-riding anxiety of our age, and I believe he was correct, then cybernation is responsible for a severe heightening of this major anxiety.

Until the advent of cybernation as the logical extension of industrialization and automation, man's life had a widely accepted meaning: man's identity was that of the productive worker. Economic production requires the execution of certain techniques: man's role was as the practitioner of these techniques. Of course there were exceptions. The artist, the philosopher, the athlete, and others in small number have always been released from involvement in production. But the usual role of man was as a technical performer in the pursuit of productivity.

Now I do not mean to indicate that there did not exist a profound need
for the human performance of tasks in former times, or even that this need does not persist today to a significant fraction of its former degree. On the contrary, the need of society for the implementation of existing knowledge has been very great. Human participation in the implementation phase has been important. But the technological advances of the past century have carried us to the threshold of a society which does not need to emphasize technique. Yet we are left with a value system which continues to stress technical importance.

Our error has been in constructing so much social superstructure to encourage productive performance, that man has become identified by his productive function. Cybernation then threatens man's identity by offering non-human ways of executing technique. It points the way to an economy where the "productive" work is not dependent upon man, to a society where man's involvement in routine operations is not only unnecessary, but perhaps undesirable. Since we have been trained to admire technical performance, we then sense that the machine is somehow superior to man.

Unless we alter the concept that man is an implementer of technique, we allow cybernation to challenge man's role and to rob his identity. If we do not rise to the philosophical challenge of recent technological change, we are open to the anxiety of the loss of meaning of our existence. This is the outstanding influence of cybernation upon our culture.

Upon reflection, perhaps I have come close to fulfilling my mission. I have told you that cybernation consists of the use of machines, not significantly different from telephone dialing equipment, in order to perform functions of communication, computation, and control. I have pointed out that society is adjusting now to the presence of this new machinery, just as it has previously adjusted to everything from steam
engines to the telephone, by reshaping human society to fit the machinery, rather than the machinery to fit the desired society. Finally, I have indicated that the nature of computer machinery as a surrogate for human thought-processes has led to an anxiety about the meaning of humanity. On this somewhat pessimistic note, I should like to conclude, and open the floor for discussion.
A discussion of the minister's needs in continuing education was a pivotal point in the Consultation's program. With it, the consultants turned from reviewing important ideas and data concerning the minister's continuing education to the discussion and decision process which led finally to the formulation of strategy recommendations.

Discussion of the minister's needs was initiated by the panel presentation reported here. The panel included pastors and those closely related to their work—the district superintendent and the layman. This panel presentation and the discussion following marked also the point at which the Consultation began to give attention to those for whom continuing education is planned.

The presentations were recorded by tape and then transcribed and edited for use here. The editor hopes that in this process, the meanings intended by the panelists are retained. Panel members were: Howard J. Brown, moderator, Ralph B. Huston, Russell Kleis, C. Jasper Smith, James W. Wright—all of whom were full participants in the Consultation—and Joseph D. Boyd, who was present only for this session.

Howard J. Brown, moderator

This discussion is the center of a great deal of what our thinking is going to be in the days ahead of us, for now we begin to focus on the areas that will bear on the determination of our objectives and certainly will relate to the basic lines of our strategy. The program suggests that we think now about the minister's need in continuing education. Five members of a panel will make some observations about this. When each has made a brief presentation, we will ask that they get together on some discussion as members of
the panel and after that we will break into small groups where you will really have a chance to come to grips with the question.

James W. Wright

It seems a bit presumptuous that anyone of us should talk about his own needs in continuing education. I dare say, if we were going to have a sensitivity session here that what we think to be our own needs would certainly not be the needs that the rest of us think that we ought to have. I think if we as pastors could relate that fact to our people or to our students as teachers, their ideas of what we need and our ideas of what we need might be far different.

Certainly it should be said of anyone who has been in the ministry very long—25 years for myself—that he sees his needs far differently now than at the beginning. So, when we talk of needs, I think we have to be aware that our needs as pastors are changing frequently.

In view of this, there are three needs which I feel strongly at the present. I would put first on the list that I want to be and ought to be a better leader, director, priest if you will in the conduct of worship, and I'm not talking about spiritual life retreats or Wednesday night prayer meetings, but I'm talking about the things related to the return to and renewal of not only better liturgical forms but an understanding of what it means to be a community in worship. Most of the people that I meet who are interested in church renewal, no matter how far out of the ball park they seem to get at times, come back to the idea and to the presupposition that we need to be better worshippers than we are. And this is simply not mechanics. I may be wrong in this feeling, but I maintain that unless something happens on Sunday morning as the community gathers to worship, then nothing's going to happen during the week.

The second thing I would say in terms of my own needs is that I would
like to be a better motivator--I do not like this word but I hope you understand what I mean in terms of setting up and in helping to create the dialogical encounters that ought to come within the church vis-a-vis Keith Miller and Elton Trueblood, whatever we might feel about their approach. There is a great need in my church, I know, for a better understanding one of another that can come out of group dynamics.

The third need which I feel is to become a better director in setting up those situations in which we can involve our people in the great social issues of our times. I have never known--and I think you as pastors will agree that you have never known--a time when there were more people willing to become involved in the great issues of our times than now and we seem to give them so few handles and so little leadership. I'm not talking about the do-gooders--and I hate this word and wish we could get rid of it--but the seriously concerned people whom we need to lead and to direct.

The final thing that I would say perhaps should have been said first. I see this need being met more in terms of self-learning, through the journals that we read and the people with whom we talk. It has to do with the theological crisis that is all about us and, as has been said, changes every few months. However, I believe the great basics of our faith in terms of God and of Christ remain, and the changes that have come are more peripheral than anything else. But I need leadership in working my way through this changing situation.

C. Jasper Smith

If asked, as minister of a local parish, to list what he thinks his needs are in continuing education, the following would be included if he is concerned about competence in his work:

1) To be more informed relative to major trends in the theological spectrum; 2) needs an appreciative and communicative knowledge of current
social issues; 3) needs help and time in learning to deal with the tensions which exist between him and the people he serves, which result many times because of differences in theological stances relative to the church and her mission and involvements in the world.

In the day in which we live, specifically, I think we need to be exposed to and participate in sensitivity training sessions. The minister experiences this need, because he finds himself equipped more adequately for the sustaining of the institutional church than for serving effectively the people committed to his care. To do this latter, he needs to analyze and understand his behavior, his attitude in difficult situations to which he must relate. Sensitivity training sessions might enable him to work through conflict without destroying himself and without destroying the person with whom he finds himself in conflict.

And if you will permit me to add one thing more: in the South from whence I come, I think this is one of the points at which my white brothers find their greatest frustration. In the church they find themselves in conflict and in tension with their own membership and in many instances they find it almost impossible to deal with the conflict, and its certainly is conflict with which it is difficult to deal. So as a man serves the same people from week to week, the time might come when he will need special assistance in equipping him to live through and to constructively relate himself to conflict and tension.

I feel also the need for new skills in order to develop and administer new forms of ministry or mission in local churches and communities. Quite often I also feel the need for experiences, encounters and relationships which will help me rediscover who I am, as a person, and as a professional, and equally the need to learn new skills in communication in order to be relevant in missions or in ministries in today's world.
Joseph D. Boyd

My first observation would be this: I wish that every layman were here today to appreciate the openness with which you men gather to discuss this important issue. It seems to me that they would be shocked—pleasantly shocked I hope—to see some of the stereotypes of the past being reviewed again as to what is necessary in the age in which we live.

My first comment relates what I have just said to continuing education. I observe that a great number of pastors do not know how to accept change and the tension that accompanies it. I think they need to not only be able to accept and live with it but to help their congregations understand and live with it. I sense the real problem of integrity here—as I would sense it if I were in their shoes—in trying to separate being popular and being respected as persons who have been trained to understand what the historic faith was trying to say. It is the greatest challenge we face. Related to this, of course, is the need for the pastor to realize that change also requires growth experience for him.

The diagram which Dr. Glasse drew for us is very interesting. I think there is one big difference, however, between the profession of law, or dentistry, or medicine and the professional minister, which is that the others are listened to immediately in terms of authority, regardless of their manner of relating to persons. Tragically, there is no profession like the clergy in that what you are as an individual comes through first. If you wish to be a counselor, pastor, or any role you want to play, until you are accepted as a person the advice or the counsel or the store of wisdom you bring out of your training is not as readily accepted as it is in the other professions. Maybe this is wrong. I am only describing it as I have learned it, and I think that we have to overcome it if it is true.

I am excited and I hope that you are about the new structure for the
local church, and there is now a great need for continuing education in order that laymen and clergy can understand the why of this new structure and not just the what. It will be a difficult role for all of us—laymen and clergy—to play in learning how to proceed with the new emphasis of getting the mission of the church accomplished.

I hope that the role of the new pastor-parish relations committee will also be a vehicle for a valuable form of continuing education. In The United Methodist Church, if we allowed time to each district superintendent, he would be someone who could really aid in the minister's continuing education from his observation in helping him know what he needed in growth. Furthermore, there are laymen who are able to offer constructive helps whether it be in the area of the manner, the attitude, the content, or the administrative skill of the minister, and in turn I think churches expect more straightforward answers from pastors than they sometimes get as to how they analyze the congregation as they observed it. So I have hopes that continuing education will not be just formalized courses or retreats but will help establish some new relationships between pastors and congregations, and between pastors and district superintendents. These are some of my thoughts on what is needed.

**Russell Kleis**

Let me, in machine-gun fashion, enumerate several of the things that as a layman I seem to perceive that my pastor or pastors with whom I might imagine myself being associated might need.

First, I hope that my pastor would see himself as a learner among learners, seeing himself sometimes as giving and sometimes receiving and being able to receive graciously within the community of learners. It has been well said, I think, in the economic opportunity war one of the things we learned is if you would be helpful you must be helped. It must be possible for others to
be of help to you if you would be helpful to them. I'd like my pastor to know this, but I sometimes think that pastors have difficulty in realizing it.

Secondly, I would hope that my pastor might see the whole enterprise of the church in one important sense as being an enterprise in continuing education. If continuing education is an enterprise in which people are becoming, moving eternally forward, then I would argue that this itself is an enterprise in continuing education.

Third, I would hope that my pastor might feel compelled, because of his unique place in the community of learners, to identify those unique contributions which he and he best can contribute to the community of learners. And I hope that he would be equally compelled to be aware of those contributions that others might make as well as or better than he in the community of learners, and that he not feel compelled always to be a learned man.

Fourth, I would hope that he would understand that learning is change and that change breeds conflict. Change leads to tension and conflict is, of course, simply the product of tension. And that he would not be caught surprised when tension arises but that he would expect it, predict it, and prepare for it, and live with it constructively.

Fifth, I would hope that my pastor would know that not all learning is cognitive. Often learning has to do with what one can do and more often it has to do with some decisions about what one ought to do. I would hope that he would realize that when one is dealing with cognitive knowing, he proceeds in one way; but when he is dealing with what I've called its reverse—affective knowing—he functions in quite another way.

Sixth, I would hope that my pastor would know that in one important sense all experience is educational, that what one does in continuing education for himself and as a leader of others is to try to make sense out of it.
Seventh, I would hope that my pastor would know that his professional self and his personal self are separate aspects of a single self and not of two selves.

Finally, I would hope that he would realize that all continuing education or all education for himself as well as for others is unsettling and disruptive; it does not lead to tranquility; it does not lead to peace and quiet in and of itself. If the disruption is to be handled, it must be handled intelligently, boldly, deliberately, and I would hope that he would understand that this is a part of his full continuing education.

Ralph B. Huston

I'm intrigued with this topic to which we have been asked to address ourselves. The catalog just isn't big enough to put them all in today, but I would like to suggest a few of them that we might consider in our groups a little later. One of these is the tension between the job at hand and the training which the pastor has received for the long haul. The job he has been trained to do is not necessarily the one which he will be doing in the long haul, and so he needs to get training for the long haul while he's doing his present job.

Another one of the things that troubles our men is the fragmentation of their time and interests. You spoke of the men being old men. They are that. Let's don't forget. Many of our men suffer from the same fatigue that we suffer from here along about this time in the afternoon. They come in tired. When we get home now from this Consultation, there's going to be the mail that has accumulated while we were gone. It's going to keep us from getting on with some of the work that we thought we ought to do, and then our wives will tell us what happened in some of the parish while we were gone, and by the time we get caught up with that, other things will have happened. And
so our men become fragmented and too tired to pick up the task of their continuing education.

Another thing my men talk to me about is the need for their local church to recognize their minister's need for continuing education. Many churches are willing to suck a man dry and never give him the time and encouragement and the incentive to go off and get refurbished, and then they're quite ready to discard him as a squeezed-out orange peel (or perhaps a Florida orange) at the end of his three, or four, or five years.

Another thing that we ought to recognize as a need is the time and energy which our ministers spend attending the vast number of time-consuming, poor quality, irrelevant conferences that are oftentimes no more than a study in "gimmick-ry" and in the end time has been usurped that could have been used for education. A lot of them come back and say, "Well, we've been on another snipe hunt; we went, we opened our bags and a few dead leaves fell in, but we came back without any meat." The real tragedy of it is that the time that was utilized contributed to their fatigue and was time which then could not go to something that might have contributed to their education in a relevant manner.

The pastor both needs to get training and give training, and so his own continuing education must be of such substance and such dimension as to make for the re-establishment of his goals, to keep him up with the trends, and to cross-fertilize the forces that are creating the changes to which he must respond and react and which often are the directive force for his ministry.

Some ministers have voiced despair over ever changing the people who come to the quarterly conference. It often seems that the least fertile, those with sterile minds, church members are those who get in on the structure of the bureaucracy. And so the minister finds himself in situations of conflict. We have some of this about every four years. In the South right now,
some pastors who are Humphrey-oriented find a hard time relating to their congregation. But it says something also to the man about failure in his job in bringing the congregation along when he finds that they've just ridden off in another direction and never have looked back to wave goodbye to him. Where did he fail in his training? Where did he fail in his theology, his understanding of the Bible, his whole educational process? Where did he fail when he finds that his theological and biblical orientations are completely misunderstood, and misrepresented, among his congregation? How did he get out of step and what does this do to his sense of failure? One of the questions that I have asked the men who came before the Board of the Ministry to be interviewed for admission into the conference--and this may not be quite fair but I've sometimes asked it: Are they prepared to accept the fact that those kindly saints of the church who are the vehicle for calling into the ministry are going to be the very ones to nail his hide to the wall? Can he handle it?

Now, there've been a couple of things said today about district superintendents, and I'd just like to get defensive for a minute. First, let me say that the way the district superintendent views his role is perhaps very important in the relationship between him and his men. Actually, however, the relationship which exists is in some ways between the man and the institution. However, the role of the district superintendent--and thus that of the institution--is not to be regulatory to that pastor but to be supportive of him. The implication this morning that the establishment steps on the neck of the innovator may be true in some instances but by no means all. The role of the superintendent in at least one instance I know about is to help innovate new programs and new ministries for the church and to encourage the ministers to do their own innovating, and it is supportive in the sense that the district superintendent stands as the buffer between the innovating pastor and the
congregation who can't understand innovations. He also can help provide the resources, the money, the direction for men to get specialized training in this sort of creative ministry and can be very helpful to the minister in fulfilling an understanding of his role. These things can happen if the district superintendent sees his role as supporting and not regulating, innovating and not disciplining.

Finally, I would suggest two things please. One is that there ought to be some channel, for example, in preparation for consultations such as this for pastors to prepare position papers. A man may have only one or two good position papers in him in his whole life, but if somehow these could be extracted and published in some way, if only mimeographed, it would provide a stimulus for other ministers. So I would hope that maybe some position papers would be possible.

The second thing relates to the first. Developing such papers would do a lot for the pastor who prepares it. It would give him something that he would have to be knowledgeable enough to defend. If this can't be done in the whole of the church, I think a conference, or a district, or some smaller segment could encourage its men to do their own home work, their own thinking, their own writing, and to circulate it among those brethren with whom it can be discussed. These are some of the places where I think the needs of the minister lie.
Section II

FORMULATIONS

Objectives for the Minister's Continuing Education

Recommendations for United Methodist Strategy
Development in Continuing Education for Ministers
This section of the Proceedings contains two major statements produced by the Consultation: 1) Objectives for the minister's continuing education; 2) recommendations for principal lines of the denomination's strategy development. Having heard and discussed the papers contained in the first section of this Proceedings and having considered the needs of the minister in continuing education, the participants worked individually, in small groups and plenary sessions to develop these two statements. This process revealed pronounced differences of opinion. However, it also demonstrated that the participants were more concerned with arriving at valid formulations than with rigidly supporting their individual viewpoints. As a result, the statements reported here are based on substantial agreement.

The statement of objectives was developed with two uses in view. The first was to guide the Consultation as it worked on strategy recommendations, assuming that strategy and objectives for the minister's continuing education should be integrally related.

The second purpose was to provide a resource for those working in continuing education throughout the Church. For this latter use two limitations should be kept in view: 1) The statement is neither final nor definitive. It represents the best judgment of the participants, but this is a field in which continuing and careful research is needed. Furthermore, the needs of the ministry continuously change, which means that objectives must constantly be re-defined. 2) As was stated by Dr. Richard Tholin, the Consultation's process coordinator, this statement only maps out general directions and horizons within the context of a complex field. Those who are serious about developing programs and strategies in ministerial continuing education will need to fill in many of the details which this statement by necessity omits.
The recommendations should be interpreted as stating lines along which strategy for ministerial continuing education should be planned and carried out. They are not intended to suggest hard and fast goals. The situation in continuing education is fluid. An appropriate goal today might be inappropriate tomorrow and strategy must be planned accordingly. Nevertheless, the situation is sufficiently stable to allow for productive movement along well defined lines. It is for this purpose that these recommendations are made.

A number of the specific recommendations are grouped under others which are more inclusive. These latter express major concerns which emerged during the Consultation and indicate priorities for getting on with strategy development.

These recommendations are made directly to the Department of the Ministry of The United Methodist Church which had called the Consultation. However, they are available to all who find them useful. Indeed, both the Department of the Ministry and the Consultation participants urge that those working in this field take them seriously into account.
OBJECTIVES FOR THE MINISTER'S CONTINUING EDUCATION

The church is a servant community. It is the servant of Jesus Christ and, in his name, of the world. The ministry, then, of both clergy and laity is a form of servanthood and authentic objectives for the ordained minister's continuing education must take this fact fully into account.

At the same time, the clergyman is a member of a profession. As Dr. James Glasse and others during the Consultation pointed out, his work is defined, in part, by one segment of society's need and he has much in common with other professionals. The following statement indicates that many of the objectives for the minister's continuing education can be best stated in terms of his professional development and that some arise directly from it.

This does not mean that professionalism is an objective of continuing education. That, in fact, should be carefully guarded against. Neither, however, is the ordained ministry work for amateurs. In considering the following objectives, it will perhaps be productive to hold in tension that the ordained minister is both a professional and a servant of Jesus Christ.

General Objective

To provide the Church with the leadership of a healthy, competent, effectively performing professional ministry after ordination. This must include at least the following more specific objectives:

I. Professional knowledge, skills and perspectives necessary to carry out the minister's work.

*It should be noted that objectives I-V relate to the minister's own learning; VI-X relate to some aspect of the situation in which the learning takes place.
A. Development and strengthening of special skills according to his specific calling.
B. Correcting weaknesses where his specific job requires it.
C. Knowledge of and ability to use a method of evaluating his effectiveness, including accountability to institutional supervisors.

II. Perspectives upon the local congregation with which the professional shares ministry.
A. Theological understanding of the mission of the Church.
B. Use of the social sciences to illumine the dynamics of congregational life.
C. Experience in the effective introduction of change and the constructive use of conflict.

III. Self-examination and personal growth, insofar as these are necessary to professional effectiveness. (This assumes that who and what a minister is affect his professional effectiveness more than in other professions.)
A. Unifying a self-image in the midst of widely diverse roles and demands.
B. Inclusion of some continuing education opportunities for the professional's wife.
C. Inclusion of group and individual therapy resources.

IV. Data and theoretical perspectives to understand the changing world in which the minister works.
A. A method of theological reflection.
B. Knowledge of and experience in using psychological and social
processes to minister to persons, structures and issues.

V. Strengthening of the minister's identity and effectiveness as a man of Christian faith more able to communicate a living tradition to the world.

VI. Opportunities matching continuing education to the career development pattern of the professional minister.
   A. Specialized training at the proper stage.
   B. Supportive groups and reflection at natural crises points.
   C. Correlation of pre- and post-ordination training.
   D. Major research into career patterns.

VII. The stimulation and support of professional growth by denominational policies and leaders.
   A. Clear institutional policy encouraging continuing education.
   B. Use of specialized skills in assignments to boards and committees and charges.
   C. Appointments on the basis of professional growth needs as well as institutional needs.
   D. Continuing education for administrative leaders and teachers of ministers.
   E. Patterns that encourage congregational support of continuing education.

VIII. Consideration of professional associations of ministers as a source of support in crises, professional standards and identity formation. (Counseling in career patterns may be done best in this professional context, rather than in the administrative context.)
IX. Planning within an ecumenical context.

X. Inclusion of laymen in the education and training process.
   A. Skill training by other professionals.
   B. Sources of data on professional effectiveness in the con-
      gregation.
   C. Help in reflecting on shared experience in mission.
I. Help the minister become a self-directed learner throughout his career.
   --Create a climate in the Church supportive of the minister's continuing education.
   --Establish support policies and programs to provide necessary study leaves and financial assistance.
   --Establish educational counseling services to help the minister determine his immediate and long-range needs and find programs and other resources to meet them.
   --Engage in continuing study and research concerning the professional minister's learning needs for use of those developing programs and study resources.
   --Change further the content and method of basic seminary education to prepare the student for learning throughout his career.
   --Develop guided study resources for use individually and in small groups.
   --Encourage small study groups close to minister's place of work.
   --Encourage the minister's participation in organizations designed to recognize and help motivate his continued learning, such as the new Academy of Parish Clergy.

II. Use the minister's professional career development as a key principle for programing and provision of support services.
   --Provide programs related to critical career stages.
--Provide training programs to equip ministers for job changes and new job demands.

III. Coordinate program development.

--Facilitate and encourage seminary cooperation in program development to eliminate unnecessary duplication and make maximum use of each school's resources.

--Establish regional "networks" linking program agencies, as well as denominational and interdenominational church agencies concerned with the minister's professional development.

--Use a broad range of church and non-church program agencies.

IV. Develop strategy ecumenically, cooperating whenever possible with ministers and agencies of other denominations.

V. Relate continuing education for clergy to the needs and resources of the laity involving them where appropriate in programs and planning agencies.

VI. Strengthen annual conference agencies which have responsibility for the minister's continuing education.

--Define and strengthen the work of the Board of the Ministry, especially through its Committee on Continuing Education.

--Interpret the role of the bishop and cabinet in relation to the minister's continuing education and provide training for that role.

--Explore the possibility of annual conference, area or regional offices to help provide support services and coordinate programming.
VII. The Department of the Ministry should provide leadership to help initiate and carry out a general church strategy. The Department should:

--Provide communication services—gathering, interpreting, and dispersing information.

--Provide research services.

--Facilitate new program establishment through cooperative experimentation.

--Sponsor consultations and training programs for annual conference and seminary continuing education personnel.

--Counsel with continuing education personnel throughout the Church in development of programs and support practices.

--Provide leadership in establishing policies and practices for financing continuing education, especially in relation to the Fund for Ministerial Education.

--Serve as a primary liaison between the UMC and other denominations as well as secular adult education agencies in matters pertaining to ministerial continuing education.

--Help guide and coordinate the denomination's total continuing education strategy while encouraging initiative by indigenous groups.

--Establish a representative task force advisory to the Department to help refine and project further strategy development.