PUBLIC EMPLOYEE TRAINING ON THE STATE LEVEL IN THE UNITED STATES. RESEARCH SERIES, NUMBER 8.
BY- HOAN, CHARLES E., JR.
RHODE ISLAND UNIV., KINGSTON, BUR. OF GOVT. RES.
REPORT NUMBER RES-SER-8
PUB DATE 64
EDRS PRICE MF-$0.25 HC-$1.72 41P.

DESCRIPTIONS- NATIONAL SURVEYS, GOVERNMENT EMPLOYEES, INSERVICE EDUCATION, STATE GOVERNMENT, TRAINERS, QUESTIONNAIRES, PROGRAM COORDINATION, SALARIES, PROFESSIONAL PERSONNEL, JOB ANALYSIS, STATE LAWS, STATE STANDARDS, MANAGEMENT DEVELOPMENT, SUPERVISORY TRAINING, CLERICAL WORKERS, PROGRAM EVALUATION, MANUALS, STATE AGENCIES.

TO SURVEY INSERVICE TRAINING FOR PUBLIC EMPLOYEES WITHIN STATE GOVERNMENTS, QUESTIONNAIRES WERE SENT TO ALL 50 STATES, PUERTO RICO, AND THE VIRGIN ISLANDS. OF THE 37 STATES AND POSSESSIONS RESPONDING, TWO REPORTED NO TRAINING ACTIVITIES, 16 HAD A CENTRAL TRAINING OFFICE TO DIRECT AND COORDINATE TRAINING PROGRAMS, AND 19 INDICATED THAT INSERVICE TRAINING WAS CONDUCTED ENTIRELY BY INDIVIDUAL DEPARTMENTS. THE NUMBER OF FULL-TIME PROFESSIONAL TRAINING PERSONNEL IN CENTRAL TRAINING AGENCIES RANGED FROM ZERO TO TEN. SALARIES FOR TRAINERS ON ALL LEVELS RANGED FROM $3600 TO $15,432 ANNUALLY. MANY STATES DEFENDED HEAVILY ON TRAINING FACILITIES AND STAFF OF OUTSIDE AGENCIES. FEW STATES HAD WRITTEN STATEMENTS OF TRAINING POLICY OR STANDARDS FOR ESTABLISHING OR EVALUATING TRAINING PROGRAMS. TOP AND MIDDLE MANAGERS WERE MOST OFTEN TRAINED, FOLLOWED BY SUPERVISORS AND CLERICAL STAFF. TRAINING FOR UNSKILLED AND SEMI-SKILLED EMPLOYEES RANKED NEAR THE BOTTOM IN MOST AGENCIES. TRAINING FUNCTIONS DID NOT HAVE THE STATURE OF OTHER STATE GOVERNMENT POSTS SUCH AS SALARY ADMINISTRATION OR EXAMINATION PREPARATION. (APPENDIXES ARE THE QUESTIONNAIRE AND TRAINING OFFICER JOB DESCRIPTIONS FROM SEVERAL STATES.) THIS DOCUMENT IS ALSO AVAILABLE FOR $0.50 FROM THE BUREAU OF GOVERNMENT RESEARCH, UNIVERSITY OF RHODE ISLAND, KINGSTON, R.I. (AJ)
Public Employee Training on the State Level in the United States

by Charles E. Moan, Jr.

RESEARCH SERIES
Number 8

BUREAU OF GOVERNMENT RESEARCH

IVERSITY OF RHODE ISLAND
Public Employee Training on the State Level in the United States

by Charles E. Moan, Jr.

Research Series Number 8

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH, EDUCATION & WELFARE
OFFICE OF EDUCATION

THIS DOCUMENT HAS BEEN REPRODUCED EXACTLY AS RECEIVED FROM THE PERSON OR ORGANIZATION ORIGINATING IT. POINTS OF VIEW OR OPINIONS STATED DO NOT NECESSARILY REPRESENT OFFICIAL OFFICE OF EDUCATION POSITION OR POLICY.

Bureau of Government Research
University of Rhode Island

Kingston, R. I. John O. Stitely, Director
FOREWORD

The Bureau is once again pleased to make available to scholars and administrators a piece of research resulting from its Master of Public Administration degree program. As this program continues to grow in stature and in numbers, the Bureau, with the cooperation of the Administration and Board of Trustees of the University of Rhode Island, will seek to enlarge the scope of its contributions to local, state and federal government.

Mr. Charles E. Moan for several years has been Director of Training for the Personnel Division of the State Department of Administration. As such, he has been largely responsible for the relatively elaborate in-service training program carried on in Rhode Island state government. His interest in improving this program led him to select, as the subject of his master's thesis, the experience of other state governments in providing in-service training programs for their employees. As he points out in the body of this study, well-known authors in the field of public personnel administration often have deplored the lack of knowledge of what states are doing by way of training their personnel after they are hired. This study seeks to provide that knowledge.

State personnel administrators and especially training directors are owed a debt of gratitude for their cooperation in providing much of this information. Their reward, it is hoped, will be obtained in the publication of this study and its distribution to them and other interested people and organizations. In this fashion, too, a spotlight will be thrown on what has been, up to this time, a much neglected, but very important, activity in state government—training.

W. Roy Hamilton
Assistant Director
WHY IN-SERVICE TRAINING?

More than half the states of the Union have some form of civil service or merit system of personnel administration. In other states, certain departments of government such as Health, Education, Welfare and Employment Security, in order to comply with federal statutes and thus obtain federal grants, maintain some form of a merit system of personnel selection usually administered by a “Joint Merit System Council.” Thus, the great bulk of state employees throughout the United States come to their jobs with demonstrated qualifications. Merit system governments require that the people they hire meet definite, pre-determined, job-related, and specifically advertised requirements; that they compete for the job with other people who also meet these requirements; and, that they be selected on the basis of relative fitness for the work to be done—presumably without reference to race or religion or politics.

The Need for Training. Why, then, does a state employee “need training?”
There are at least three sound, practical reasons. First, his job is often unique to government. Many government jobs have no direct counterparts elsewhere, and their skills usually are not acquired or taught outside of government. Examples include the tax examiner, the public health inspector, the forest ranger, the state trooper or highway patrolman. As a matter of practical necessity, state governments themselves have to give such specialized training to their workers after hiring them.

Second, fast-moving changes in his occupation may leave the employee behind if he has no way of keeping up to date. Even the best tools need an occasional resharpencing. As medical research finds new ways of treating tuberculosis or heart disease, for example, employees who are doctors in state hospitals must be brought up to date on the new methods—if patients are to get the best available care. As the national Congress and state legislatures change laws, state employees who apply these laws must be retrained—if the citizen is to get all the rights and benefits which the lawmakers intended him to get. Getting the best judgments out of executives—whose influence is paramount in every department and division—requires their keeping abreast of state, national or world developments and getting fresh perspectives on critical policy issues.

Third, changed missions or methods may convert the work into something entirely different from that which the person was hired to do. As electronic brains replace long manual computations, for example, state employees who have made those computations through the years must be retrained—unless government chooses between doing without the new method or turning the experienced employees out to seek employment in a vanishing labor market while it hires new replacements.
Actually, of course, government has no more real choice in such situations than does industry: it must train, because the other choices would defy the traditions of public policy and deny public service.

Besides these necessary reasons, there are other desirable reasons for training: to get faster service, more production, fewer injuries, better morale, more adequate staffing for the future—all of which add up to better government.

**Meeting the Challenge.** We have stated that a great need for the development of in-service training programs in all phases of responsible state government life has emerged as these state governments themselves have developed. We have attempted to set forth the "why" of in-service training and pose it as a challenge. It remains to determine just how the states are meeting this challenge.

**The Purpose of this Study.** It is interesting to note that, with reference to in-service training on the state level, Mosher and Kingsley wrote, more than twenty years ago, that, "No comprehensive study has been made as to the extent to which state governments interest themselves in the type of training under discussion at this point." And again as late as 1962, Planty and Kanawaty wrote, "Despite its importance, however, there have been relatively few surveys made of training activities within state governments."

**Methods of Presentation.** In the body of this report it is our intention to develop the results of our study on an item by item basis. This method will present the important data relating to in-service training programs as conducted by the central training agency. The reader, if he so desires, may refer quickly to any given question and thus acquaint himself with situations as they exist in the several reporting states with the least possible effort.

**The Basis of the Study.** To make this study, questionnaires were sent to fifty states plus the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico and the Territory of the Virgin Islands. A copy of the questionnaire is included as Appendix A to this report. In addition to completing the questionnaire, each jurisdiction was asked to supply information relating to statutes or rules establishing training programs, historical background, classification specifications for personnel training specialists, program standards and such other training material as may have been available.

**The Response.** Questionnaires were returned from thirty-five states and the insular possessions of Puerto Rico and the Virgin Islands. The information furnished varied from a single covering letter saying there was no activity in this area, to comprehensive reports supported by voluminous

---

data in the form of reports, training manuals and legal abstracts. There is, however, no assurance that all these jurisdictions reported fully or completely on the questions asked. Therefore, the reader should not conclude that this study is a complete report of training activities within the states. The material presented herein is simply that which the reporting agencies selected and forwarded to us. It is, no doubt, a very good indication of what is being done in this field and should serve to fill, in some measure, this gap of knowledge which exists in the vital field of public personnel administration.

Training in the Federal Government. As is indicated by the title of this work, Public Employee Training on the State Level in the United States, no attempt was made to study the training programs offered by the federal government, as their numbers are legion. For those interested in such training, we would direct their attention to the bulletin entitled, Interagency Training Programs, published semiannually by the Office of Career Development, United States Civil Service Commission, available from the Superintendent of Documents, U.S. Government Printing Office, Washington, D. C.

Definitions of Terms Used. In order to lend uniformity to the work and provide a common understanding of terms that may be found in this report, the reader is provided with certain definitions which, we believe, can be generally accepted in the technical field of public employee training.

Training: the process of helping others to acquire skills and knowledge, and developing necessary work attitudes and work habits.

Education: an aggregate of all the processes by which a person develops abilities, attitudes and other forms of behavior.

The Training Function: the organization and means by which the skills, abilities, and personal welfare of the employee are developed or enhanced on the job.

The Staff Training Function: the provision of professional and technical advice, assistance, and counsel to the supervisor and/or administrator.

The Line Training Function: the establishment and conduct of a training program for the agency.

On-the-job Training: an organized procedure used to develop the employee's abilities in performing his tasks, duties, and responsibilities at the work station.

In-service Training: an organized method used to increase the competency of the employee.
EXISTENCE OF TRAINING PROGRAMS

STATE-WIDE TRAINING PROGRAMS. The first problem of the survey was to determine just how many jurisdictions did, in fact, conduct state-wide training programs for their employees. (It should be noted at this time, that for the purposes of this report, both the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico and the Territory of the Virgin Islands will be treated as state jurisdictions.)

Of the thirty-seven states reporting, fifteen replied that they did conduct a state-wide training program, while twenty-two replied that they did not. Of this latter group, only two states reported that they conducted no training programs whatsoever.

Table I indicates the reporting states and the status of their training programs.

CENTRAL TRAINING AGENCIES. It should be noted that while the State of Vermont does conduct a state-wide training program for its employees on a limited scale and responsibility for the conduct of such training programs is vested by statute in the Division of Personnel, at the time of this survey sufficient funds had yet to be provided by the legislature to establish a unit within the Division specifically to conduct such training programs.

In states reporting the existence of a central training agency, this agency is, in all cases, a part of the central civil service department or division. Again, the supervisor, in all cases, reports and is responsible to the executive head of the central personnel office. Twelve of the training agencies are designated and established at the divisional level within a department or civil service commission, two are established as a section within a division, one is designated as a “unit,” and, in the aforementioned State of Vermont, no separate training staff exists. Table II shows the official designations of central training agencies together with the title of the person responsible for the supervision of the training function.

In all cases, training supervisors and their respective staff personnel are within the classified service of their respective state’s merit system and are subject to some form of qualifying examination prior to appointment within the system.

STAFFING FOR TRAINING. In the sixteen jurisdictions having established central training agencies, the total number of full-time staff personnel varied from zero in Vermont to nineteen in Puerto Rico. Insofar as strictly full-time technical personnel are concerned, the number varied from zero in Vermont to twelve in Puerto Rico. Six states reported one, four reported two, and one each reported three, five, nine, ten and twelve technical staff personnel.

Classification titles of technical staff personnel were variously reported as Training Assistant, Personnel Training Consultant, Training Officer, Personnel Technician of varying grades, Training Advisor, Employee Training Specialist, Personnel Officer, and Management Technician in various grades.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Agency Programs</th>
<th>Programs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Alaska</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arizona</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arkansas</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>California</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colorado</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connecticut</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Florida</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hawaii</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Idaho</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illinois</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indiana</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Iowa</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maine</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maryland</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michigan</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minnesota</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missouri</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montana</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nebraska</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nevada</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Hampshire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Jersey</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Mexico</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Carolina</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Dakota</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oregon</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pennsylvania</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhode Island</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vermont</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virginia</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wisconsin</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Puerto Rico</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Virgin Islands</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTALS</td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**2 states which reported no training programs.

Educational Requirements for Training Personnel. All reporting states indicate in their official job specifications for training positions of all grades that the appointee must hold a degree from a college of recognized standing, and, with few exceptions, almost all specify a preference for academic spe-
TABLE II

CENTRAL TRAINING AGENCY DESIGNATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Designation</th>
<th>Head of Training</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>California</td>
<td>Training Division</td>
<td>State Training Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colorado</td>
<td>Personnel Services Division</td>
<td>Per. Services Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connecticut</td>
<td>Training Division</td>
<td>Training Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hawaii</td>
<td>Training Division</td>
<td>Chief, Training &amp; E. R. Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illinois</td>
<td>Training Section</td>
<td>Training Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maryland</td>
<td>Training Division</td>
<td>Director of Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michigan</td>
<td>Training Division</td>
<td>Training Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Jersey</td>
<td>Tr. Sec. Admin. Serv. Division</td>
<td>Super. of Employ. Serv. Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York</td>
<td>Tr. Sec. Per. Services Div.</td>
<td>Director of Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio</td>
<td>Training Unit</td>
<td>Training Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oregon</td>
<td>Training Division</td>
<td>State Training Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pennsylvania</td>
<td>Bureau of Rec. &amp; Training</td>
<td>Director of Bureau</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhode Island</td>
<td>Training Section</td>
<td>Chief, Training Section</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vermont</td>
<td>Division of Personnel</td>
<td>Director of Personnel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wisconsin</td>
<td>Tr. &amp; Employee Dev. Div.</td>
<td>Training Supervisor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Puerto Rico</td>
<td>Training Division</td>
<td>Head, Training Division</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Specialization in the fields of business or public administration, personnel administration, psychology, or political science. The experience factor varied according to the grade level of the classification, ranging from one to five years in the fields of personnel administration, employee training or teaching. Only one state indicated a requirement of a graduate degree and that was found in the specification for the Director of Training. In Appendix B of this report may be found several examples of job specifications of selected reporting states marked exhibits "A", "B", "C", and "D", which define the duties of training technicians.

Compensation. Annual salaries for technical personnel (excluding heads of training agencies) engaged in the conduct of training programs on the central office level ranged from a minimum of $3,600 for the lowest technical classification to a maximum of $12,696 for the highest level technician. These ranges are based upon salaries reported by nine states having technical personnel on the staffs of their central training office.

Twelve states reported the annual salary ranges for the classification designated as head of the training function within the state. Here, the salaries ran from a minimum of $6,520 per annum to a maximum of $15,432. It is interesting to note, in connection with salaries paid to training supervisors, the results of a recent salary survey released by a national professional society on a confidential basis to its members. This survey showed that for 996 private companies, reporting on a nationwide basis, the lowest annual minimum salary was $7,600, while the highest maximum salary was $40,000. The average minimum salary was approximately $8,500, while the average maximum was approximately $11,500.

Table III indicates the annual salary ranges as reported by the states.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Minimum</th>
<th>Maximum**</th>
<th>Civil Service</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>California</td>
<td>$12,696</td>
<td>$15,432</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colorado</td>
<td>7,520</td>
<td>10,104</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connecticut</td>
<td>6,470</td>
<td>8,720</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hawaii</td>
<td>10,032</td>
<td>12,904</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illinois</td>
<td>8,400</td>
<td>10,320</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maryland</td>
<td>9,700</td>
<td>12,125</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michigan</td>
<td>11,060</td>
<td>14,783</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio</td>
<td>6,600</td>
<td>7,920</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oregon</td>
<td>6,900</td>
<td>8,580</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pennsylvania</td>
<td>7,772</td>
<td>10,432</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhode Island</td>
<td>6,474</td>
<td>8,242</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wisconsin</td>
<td>7,536</td>
<td>9,756</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Puerto Rico</td>
<td>7,800</td>
<td>9,600</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Reported as of July 1962

** Does not include additional salary benefits such as longevity or seniority as may exist.
THE LEGAL BASIS OF TRAINING

Existence of Statutory Provisions. In all reporting states except one, the laws provide for the establishment of training programs for their employees. The provisions governing the establishment and maintenance of such programs are usually found in the statutes which provide for the civil service or merit system of personnel administration. The State of Michigan has incorporated its Civil Service system within the framework of its constitution, Article XI, Section 5, a copy of which may be found in Appendix B, marked exhibit "E."1

Typical examples of statutes authorizing training are cited below. California’s law reads:

The board shall devise plans for and cooperate with appointing powers and other supervising officials in the conduct of employee training programs so that the quality of service rendered by persons in the state civil service may be continually improved.2

The statutes of Hawaii, the latest state to join the Union, provide for training, thus:

In-service Training. The director shall initiate and provide suitable in-service training programs so that the quality of service rendered by government employees may be continually improved. The director shall be responsible for the coordination of the in-service training activities of all departments of government, with related activities conducted by the University of Hawaii or the Department of Public Instruction.3

In defining the powers and duties of the Director, Department of Personnel, the statutes of the State of Illinois require him: “To foster and develop programs for the improvement of employee effectiveness, including training, safety . . . ”4

The State of Wisconsin, in its act creating the Bureau of Personnel within the Department of Administration, provides for training programs by declaring it a policy of the state to promote efficiency and economy in the operation of government, and to provide means for the development of its employees to the end that the quality of public service will be continually improved. It further gives direct authority to the personnel agency to coordinate state-sponsored training program.5

The Commonwealth of Puerto Rico provides for and directs the Director of Personnel to collaborate and cooperate with the heads of public

1Adopted April, 1963.
3State of Hawaii: General Statutes, Chapter 3-21 (r), RLH 1955.
4State of Illinois, Laws of 1955, subsection 6, Paragraph 9, Section 636109, Chapter 127, p. 2170.
5State of Wisconsin, General Statutes, Section 1, Chapter 16-21, p. 229.
agencies in establishing and maintaining programs of education and training for all public employees of the Commonwealth.¹

The State of Rhode Island, in its merit system act, simply provides that:

The personnel administrator shall co-operate with appointing authorities and other supervising officials in the conduct of employee training programs to the end that the quality of service rendered by persons of the classified service may be continually improved.²

Of the sixteen states having a central training agency, only one reported the existence of no statute or rule specifying authority for the establishment of a training program. This state was Maryland. The Director of Training said that:

The Division was activated as a result of a suggestion made by a subcommittee of the Maryland Legislature. Based on this recommendation, funds were included in the next budget and were approved by our Budget Bureau. I guess it is safe to say that we exist by budgetary allowance.³

As demonstrated by the foregoing citations from laws of various states, legislative bodies have recognized the need for establishing training programs to improve the quality of service rendered by public employees.

Implementation by Rules. In almost all states that were studied in the course of this survey, the enabling acts authorized the conduct of employee training in broad terms, leaving the implementation of the programs to be defined by administrative order or to be further set down within the personnel rules for the particular jurisdiction.

Prescribed procedures for the actual conduct of training programs were, in most cases, absent from the laws. For instance, the rules of the Pennsylvania Civil Service Commission simply state, “The director shall provide appointing authorities with such training resources and other assistance as may be required and available to aid employee training.”⁴

The Civil Service Rules of Hawaii repeats almost verbatim the words of the state statutes concerning the establishment of training programs, the only amplification being that all departments of government shall cooperate and assist the Director of Personnel in providing substantial in-service training programs and make available to him their staffs, facilities and equipment.⁵

¹Commonwealth of Puerto Rico, Public Act Number 136, Article 5, Chapter 21, dated April 28, 1949, p. 21-45.
²State of Rhode Island, General Laws of 1956, as amended, Title 36-4-44, p. 522.
⁵State of Hawaii, Civil Service Rules, Department of Civil Service, Rule 18, Sections 18.1 and 18.2.
The rules pertaining to training programs within the State of California are a bit more expansive in that they define the types of training to be given in broad terms, establish standards for assignment to specialized training, set forth time limits on training, authorize payments of salary, tuition and other necessary expenses within certain limits and require submission of training plans and reports to the central agency.1

Rhode Island, due to the unusual provisions of its Personnel Rules, which provide for “incentive salary increases” upon the completion of certain prescribed training courses, does lay out in more detail just what training programs are to be established and maintained.2 A complete copy of the rules governing in-service training in the State of Rhode Island are included in Appendix B, marked exhibit “F.”

The results of the survey show that the best insight into the legal responsibilities and the authority to conduct training programs is provided by job specifications for the positions which have been established within the several states to direct such programs. Typical examples are included in Appendix B and are marked exhibits “G,” “H,” “I,” and “J.”

---

1State of California, Administrative Rules, Title 2, Article 23, Sections 531-536, pp. 146-150.
Types of Training Offered. We have said that employees of state governments require training partly because there are many jobs within government that are unique. As the government structure in a state constitutes one of the largest, if not the largest single employer within the state, and because it runs programs of greater scope and significance to all its citizens than does any other employer, its training job is large and varied.

The range of training programs available to employees in state government runs from simple employee orientation, conducted in a matter of hours, to long-range, formal, graduate-level programs covering a span of two or more years per employee.

In their response to the questionnaire, almost every reporting state listed programs in management development, professional development, supervisory training, skilled and technical improvement and employee orientation. At least two states, Illinois and Rhode Island, reported offerings of graduate courses to state employees who hold the baccalaureate, thus enabling them to obtain academic credit towards a graduate degree in the field of public administration. In both instances, these courses are conducted in cooperation with the state’s university.

Illustrative Examples of Training within the States.

To elaborate upon typical types of training programs offered by the reporting states, capsule descriptions of what is being done by selected state central training agencies are presented below.

California: (a) Executive Management, for selected top managers who are sent to summer sessions at leading universities both in California and other states; (b) Schools of Management for the middle management group consisting of courses in Organizational Fiscal Management, Personnel, and Public Administration conducted by consultants from educational institutions, government and private industry; (c) management conferences and workshops conducted for all managerial levels by leaders in government, private industry, professional societies and educational institutions; (d) courses in areas such as Human Relations (2 weeks), Program Planning and Evaluation (5 days), Administrative Law (10 hours), Conference Leadership (5 days), Effective Speaking (30 hours), Data Processing for Managers (3 days), Public Relations (4 days), Humanities (24 hours), and Employee Orientation.

Colorado: (a) Training Demonstrations for Management (2 days); (b) Secretarial Workshops (1 day); (c) Grievance Procedures for supervisors and agency heads; (d) electric typewriter clinics conducted by factory trainers (3 hours); (e) Stenographic Training for clerical employees; and, (f) Employee Orientation.

Illinois: (a) Intermediate Shorthand for typists and stenographers who previously completed a course in Beginning Shorthand or its equivalent (24
hours); (b) Basic Accounting for beginning accountants, auditors and clerks (30 hours); (c) Political Science, series of courses offered in cooperation with the University of Illinois to enable state employees who are college graduates to earn master’s degrees in public administration without campus residence (32 hours); (d) Clerical Review, a course to assist employees in increasing their efficiency in clerical knowledge and skills (24 hours); (e) Shorthand Speed Building, a course to help stenographers increase their speed (20 hours); (f) Psychology for Supervisors, a series of workshops to acquaint supervisors with the basic psychological principles of motivation (21 hours); (g) Letter Writing for Stenographers, a course for stenographers and typists who transcribe letters or who compose their own letters (20 hours); (h) Typing Review to help typists increase speed and accuracy (20 hours); (i) Speed-Up Reading, a course to help administrators increase their reading rate in order that they may devote more of their office time to other duties (16 hours); (j) Advanced Dictation for secretaries and stenographers who need to build speed or accuracy (20 hours); (k) Dictating Techniques, a short course to help men and women who dictate letters, reports, etc., particularly those who use dictating machines (4 hours); (l) Arithmetic Review, a course to assist clerks and others whose duties involve simple mathematical computations (20 hours); (m) Workshop in Stenographic Practices (2½ hours); and, (n) Elementary Auditing for auditors and accountants (30 hours).

**Michigan:** (a) Personnel Management Workshops for executives and managers; (b) Organization Development for the executive staff of the state’s employment security agency (1 each month for 2 years); (c) Management Development for prison executives (a 3 year program); (d) Executive Development (84 hours); (e) Middle Management Development program (60 hours); (f) an annual state personnel officers school of instruction; (g) various types of orientation sessions for personnel clerks, foreign visitors, new employees, police administration students and visiting high school students; (h) Supervisory Training Programs for state agencies on an experimental basis; (i) workshops to train the trainer; and (j) special programs to meet particular training needs of various state departments.

**New Jersey:** (a) Management Development Program, a residential program for managers, six days with topics in decision making, organization, administrative planning, communications, human relations, motivation, work improvement, administrative controls, interdepartmental communication, and coordination; (b) Management Orientation Seminar for new managers, four sessions; (c) Conference Leadership, three hours, once a week for six weeks; (d) Principles of Supervision (27 hours); and, (e) Stenography Refresher courses for stenographers (4 hours).

**New York:** (a) Management Executive Development, for middle and top management which includes a variety of courses such as Methods and Procedure Institute (60 hours); Administrative Adjudication (14 hours); Research and Statistics Institute (22 hours); and a Professional Training
Program (64 hours); (b) Partial Tuition Program, to encourage public administration interns and trainees to extend academic training in colleges by providing full tuition up to 12 hours' credit; (c) Public Administration Training for interns and employee trainees; (d) Teacher Training, ranging from seven to fourteen hours; (e) Supervisory Training, including courses in Fundamentals of Supervision (30 hours), Practice of Supervision (30 hours), and Conference Techniques (18 hours); (f) trade training in seven subjects—Refrigeration, Maintenance, Electronics, Television, Stationary Engineering, Powerhouse Electricity and Laundry Operations—the length of courses varying from 40 to 160 hours; (g) Clerical Refresher courses (27 hours); and, (h) General Clerical courses (30 to 40 hours).

**Ohio:**
(a) Executive Development, supervision and management for executive and management personnel (34 hours); (b) Personnel Training for personnel technicians (20 hours); (c) Maintenance and Custodial Work Training Program for public building maintenance workers (30 hours); (d) Reading Improvement Course for supervisors and other state employees who have a great deal of reading in their daily assignments (30 hours); (e) Office Practice and Typing (36 hours); and, (f) Office Practice and Shorthand (36 hours).

**Oregon:**
(a) Executive Development Seminars, for new managers (22 hours); (b) Elements of Supervision, for supervisory personnel and prospective supervisors (30 hours); and, (c) clerical training courses for employees in various clerical levels as the need arises.

**Rhode Island:**
(a) Institutional Child Care Workers Training Program, a continuous program for workers engaged in the care and custody of children in both public and private institutions consisting of two courses of thirty hours each, and conducted by a regular member of the faculty of the Graduate School of Simmons College, Boston (part of this program has been financed through a grant of funds from the Rhode Island Foundation, a private charitable group); (b) Electronic Data Processing, a one-hundred hour course for workers and supervisors whose duties require knowledge of this system of record keeping and computer work; (c) Food Preparation and Service, a two-course (30 hours each) program for workers engaged in preparation and serving of food in hospitals and schools operated by the state; (d) Public Health Laboratory Techniques, a two-course (30 hours each) program covering material for technicians and laboratory assistants in state hospitals and public health laboratories; (e) Materials, a two-course (30 hours each) program covering asphalt and cement for inspectors and engineering aides; (f) Advanced Materials Laboratory Procedures, two laboratory courses (30 hours each) for professional engineers and engineering supervisors in the design and control of asphalt and concrete; (g) Practical Surveying, an advanced and basic course (30 hours each) in the practical aspects of highway surveying for engineering aides and other sub-professional workers; (h) Engineering Math, a basic course in mathematics (30 hours), for non-professional engineering personnel; (i) Engineering Physics, a basic course (30 hours) for non-professional personnel; (j) Public Building
Maintenance, a course including practical demonstrations for public building custodial and maintenance workers (30 hours); (k) Preventive Maintenance and Safety, a two-course (30 hours each) program for unskilled and semi-skilled workers in the care and operation of construction equipment conducted by engineering staffs of leading equipment manufacturers; (l) State Government, a basic course in Rhode Island government conducted for all levels of state workers (30 hours); (m) Political Science (Law), a survey course in basic legal procedures conducted by members of the Bar Association (24 hours); (n) Techniques of Instruction for supervisors and others who are required to train workers (30 hours); (o) Civil Defense Training, a twenty-two hour course in radiological detection and survival planning conducted for all state workers in cooperation with the State Department of Education and the State Council of Defense; (p) Local Planning Administration, a thirty-hour course for technical planning personnel of various state agencies; (q) Management Seminar, a course in various aspects of management for supervisors and middle management personnel (30 hours); (r) Drafting and Design, a two-course program (60 hours), for non-professional employees of the state highway departments; and, (s) The Foreign Officials Internship Program, a resident internship program ranging from three weeks to five months for administrative officials of foreign governments in cooperation with the United States Department of State and the Institute of Public Affairs of the University of Connecticut.

Puerto Rico: (a) fellowship and scholarship grants, financial assistance extended to government workers including tuition, room and board and travel to enable them to pursue advanced or specialized studies to improve their academic, professional or technical skills; (b) study leave with pay for employees to improve their academic, professional and technical preparation, but no financial assistance provided for tuition or travel in this program; (c) short term practical training, refresher courses on up-to-date techniques of work operations conducted by universities, vocational schools, private industrial establishments and government agencies; (d) tuition grants, employees receive tuition grants for up to six credit hours per semester for after-work-hours instruction; (e) In-Service Training courses, various training courses offered to employees during working hours; (f) observation trips and cultural tours, special travel programs arranged for employees with provisions for non-interest loans from the government retirement fund to finance such trips with the use of extended leave provisions of the personnel rules to provide the necessary time away from duties.

Number of Employees Participating in Programs. Of the sixteen states reporting the existence of a central training agency, only one state was unable to supply complete statistics as to the number of employees participating. California reported figures covering all training programs conducted within the state government, both by the central training agency and all other departments of government as reported to the State Training Officer.

Table IV is a summary of employee participation in training programs
TABLE IV
EMPLOYEE PARTICIPATION IN TRAINING
Conducted by Central Agency
(16 States)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Total Employees</th>
<th>Participating Employees</th>
<th>No. of Training Hours</th>
<th>Year Central Tr. Agency Began</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>California</td>
<td>84,369</td>
<td>162,376*</td>
<td>229,688</td>
<td>1952</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colorado</td>
<td>10,700†</td>
<td>692</td>
<td>11,438</td>
<td>1959</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Connecticut</td>
<td>25,414</td>
<td>1,191</td>
<td>1,400</td>
<td>1949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hawaii</td>
<td>15,000‡</td>
<td>2,351</td>
<td>46,179</td>
<td>1955</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illinois</td>
<td>64,466</td>
<td>1,053</td>
<td>553§</td>
<td>1943</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maryland</td>
<td>23,196</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>6,000</td>
<td>1958</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michigan</td>
<td>35,155</td>
<td>5,000</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>1944</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Jersey</td>
<td>29,215</td>
<td>275</td>
<td>2,789</td>
<td>1953</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>2,673</td>
<td>65,510</td>
<td>1949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ohio</td>
<td>47,516</td>
<td>251</td>
<td>14,642</td>
<td>1962</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oregon</td>
<td>19,000†</td>
<td>290</td>
<td>400</td>
<td>1954</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pennsylvania</td>
<td>75,000‡</td>
<td>1,184</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>1961</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rhode Island</td>
<td>9,552</td>
<td>1,247</td>
<td>35,540</td>
<td>1956</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vermont</td>
<td>5,000</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>1961</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wisconsin</td>
<td>26,000†</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>**</td>
<td>1957</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Puerto Rico</td>
<td>72,894</td>
<td>2,030</td>
<td>3,086</td>
<td>1945</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* No breakdown as to courses operated by departments
† Classified only
‡ Approximation
§ Figure supplied by agency—questionable
** Not reported by agency

Conducted by central training agencies as reported by sixteen states. These figures reflect the programs as of July, 1962.

Cost of Employee Training. As only nine states provided figures on the budgets of their central training agency, and in most cases there was no specific breakdown of staff salaries as against other expenses, it is rather difficult to draw any real conclusions as to the actual cost of training per employee participant or on a training-hour basis. Of the seven states reporting no specific budget appropriation for training, it is safe to assume that some money must have been expended, for with the exception of Vermont, all reported that there was at least one full-time employee in the central training agency. The problem is further complicated by the fact that in most central training agencies at least part of the operating expenses involved in maintaining training programs were normally charged to line items in the budget of the parent personnel department (e.g. printing, postage, office supplies, etc.). California reported its training budget as being $127,284, consisting of wages of $107,364 and operating expenses of $19,920. Rhode Island had one line item of $2200 for training, the balance, such as salaries and other operating expenses, being included in the overall budget for the Division of Personnel. Puerto Rico reported a budget of $250,000 for training with no breakdown as to its expenditure.
TRAINING STANDARDS AND INCENTIVES

Established Standards for Training Courses. Only six states indicated any established standards for the conduct of training. These states were Colorado, Connecticut, Illinois, Maryland, Rhode Island and Puerto Rico.

The most commonly mentioned standards were: (1) attendance requirement for courses; (2) examinations; and, (3) job-course relationships. In most cases, a combination of these factors served as standards for training. Information was scanty from all agencies concerned, which leads to the belief that this is one aspect of training which has not received much attention.

In Rhode Island, certain basic standards for training courses have been established in the Personnel Rules and have been further implemented by Administrative Orders in "Communication Number 183," of the Personnel Administrator, dated September 1961, which may be found in Appendix B marked as exhibit "K." Further, the Training Section has established course criteria such as: (1) the minimum number of hours that shall be devoted to a training course, the standard being thirty hours; (2) the attendance requirements for all employees, with excused absences limited to two per thirty-hour course; (3) written examinations or some form of student evaluation by the instructor at the end of each course; and, (4) the qualifications of the instructor must be certified by the training office prior to his assignment to a course.

Incentives for Training. Eleven states reported some form of incentive offered to their employees to participate in training. Three states offered credit for training towards promotional examinations, six states had established some form of tuition refund plan, one state offered paid tuitions, training during working hours and salary adjustments upon completion of a prescribed number of courses, and one state offered several incentive plans, including paid tuitions, paid leaves for academic training and interest-free loans for travel.

The most commonly employed incentive used by the states to promote interest in training appears to be the plan which offers refunds for tuition paid by employees to secure job-related training at institutions outside the government. The refund, which varies from fifty per cent in Vermont to one hundred per cent in Puerto Rico, usually is given upon the successful completion of the course.

Only Rhode Island offers an incentive for training which provides for salary increases upon completion of training. The Personnel Rules provides for a one-step salary increase upon the successful completion of four courses; these four courses must be in job-related areas.
Evaluations of Training Programs. Only one state, Colorado, indicated that a definite plan of pre-testing and post-testing, to determine the nature and extent of changes due to training programs, was being used. Seven states reported informal evaluations usually conducted with questionnaires and survey sheets which were completed by participants and their supervisors at the end of the training period. While this form of evaluation doubtless has some validity, particularly in the planning of future training courses, the reliability of such methods may be questionable. Eight states reported that there were no training evaluation programs whatsoever in existence. Most training supervisors seemed reluctant to elaborate on just what, if anything, was being done in this aspect of employee training on a formal basis.

While there appears to be a definite lag in the development of formal evaluation plans or methods in most states, ten out of sixteen training directors stated that their contacts with departmental officials indicated that training was producing results in economy of operations, more production and better employee morale.

Training Manuals. Eleven central training agencies prepared and published manuals for use in training classes. The form and style, as indicated by samples provided, ranged from simple mimeographed reproductions of certain training materials to professionally printed and bound texts covering entire training courses. The number of such manuals prepared and published by each training office varied as did the number of their training programs. The State of Michigan produces so many training publications that it requires three pages to list them in the Civil Service Commission catalog.¹ In Rhode Island, training manuals are prepared in the form of workbooks for many of the courses offered. This not only provides the student with an outline guide to the course and specific subject matter, but also provides space for inserting class notes during the term of instruction to the end that, if faithfully completed, it will provide the employee with permanent reference notes on the subject in which he has been trained. The Rhode Island training agency also publishes and distributes a handbook for the use of all employees, particularly directed at new employees during their period of orientation to state employment. The book covers a brief history of civil service in the state, the duties and obligations of state service and the benefits and services available to the employee.²

²Charles E. Moan, Jr., We're In The Service Now (Providence: The Training Section, Division of Personnel, 1962), 18 pp.
Training Facilities. Most training programs surveyed were conducted either by Training Specialists of the central training agency, staff specialists of operating agencies, professional instructors of colleges and universities or training and staff specialists of cooperating private industries. All central training agencies indicated that members of their staff participated, to some extent, in the actual conduct of training courses.

Training programs followed the usually accepted formats for the course work in most areas. Some training was conducted through the use of one- or two-day workshops, conferences or seminars.

Physical facilities utilized included work areas such as offices or garages, classrooms maintained by the central agency or the operating agency, and facilities operated by schools, colleges, and universities.
VI

TRAINING WITHIN STATE AGENCIES

At the outset of this report, we indicated that the survey would cover the important data relating to in-service training programs as conducted by central training agencies within the several states; however, a survey of state training programs should devote some space to those programs which are conducted by various departments of government within the states. As indicated on Table 1, page 7, of the thirty-seven states responding to the survey, twenty indicated the existence of training activities on the agency level although no central agency for training had been established. All states having central agency programs also reported that training was conducted by departments of their state government in connection with, or independent of, the central agency.

Data Supplied. Specific information relating to departmental programs was generally lacking, and such was found to be the case even where there was a central training agency.

Arizona, Arkansas, Idaho, Indiana, Iowa, Nebraska, North Carolina, North Dakota, Texas and Virginia all reported that training programs did exist on departmental levels. However, the central personnel office in these states was unable to give any further information about what was being done.

STATE REPORTS

Alaska. The only information furnished was to the effect that some departments have limited training, such as annual, one-week refresher courses for troopers and three- to four-day supervisory conferences.

Colorado. Agency training includes: professional training for cottage personnel in the Training School for Girls; training of attendants in hospitals; principles of accounting and the use of electronic equipment for auditors; communication training emphasizing letter writing, in the Health Department and the Civil Service Commission; office methods training in the Welfare Department; clerical training programs in the Department of Agriculture; and a nursing attendant training program in the State Hospital.

Florida. Some of the individual agencies have various types of training programs, ranging from simple employee orientation to a well-organized training program for civil engineers in the State Road Department.

Georgia. Information as to specific courses was lacking. However, there are classifications established within the state merit system for the following training positions on the departmental level: Director of Training (Agriculture); Training Assistant; Director of Training (Highway); Chief of Staff Development (Public Welfare); Training Program Assistant (Public Welfare).
Health) ; Director, Health and Training Service, and, Director of Training (Military).

Minnesota. Five large state departments provide in-service training for certain employees; namely, the Departments of Public Welfare, Highway, Corrections, Employment Security and Conservation. Each of these has a full-time training officer. In all other departments, training is conducted, if at all, by line supervisors. Although the State of Minnesota has no official centralized training agency, a Training Council, composed of the training officers of the above-mentioned departments, has been organized under the sponsorship of the Civil Service Department. The purpose of the Council is to provide a means whereby the smaller departments can participate in training activities and to share the training know-how and materials available within the state service. Training concentration appears to be in the area of supervisory development.

In the departments which have full-time training officers, the training officer reports to the top personnel man in that department.

In addition to the five training officers, the Council has a technician from the Civil Service Department, which also supplies the needed clerical service.

Employee training in Minnesota is authorized by a provision of the Civil Service Law which states, "The Director of Civil Service shall devise plans for and cooperate with, appointing authorities and other supervisory officers in the conduct of employee training programs ...".1

No statistical data was available as to the number of employees enrolled in training programs, the number of training hours completed or the cost of training programs.

Montana. The Merit System Council of Montana reported that training programs are conducted in the Departments of Fish and Game, Unemployment Compensation, Health, Welfare, Highways, and Mental Hygiene. Some tuition stipends are provided for the training of social workers, public health personnel and guidance counsellors. No other data on training was available.

Nevada. While Nevada does have a Department of Personnel, there had not been established a central training division within the framework of the department; however, some employee training programs are offered by the Division of Adult Education, Department of Education. This is a cooperative arrangement only, and does not constitute a central personnel training agency in the generally accepted sense. The report of Plany and Kanawaty, listing six training activities "sponsored by central office"2 in Nevada, is somewhat misleading. The function of divisions of adult education in most states is to provide and support such education and training for all the citizens of the state and, therefore, while state employees...

1State of Minnesota, Minnesota Statutes, Chapter 43, Section 43.32, 1959, p. 99.
may and often do participate in their programs, this function does not constitute the agency as a central training office for public employees.

Training specifically developed to meet the needs of state employees is conducted on the departmental level in Nevada. Such programs include: drafting and plan reading, drafting and plan designing, surveying, mathematics, basic engineering and map drafting—all thirty-hour courses for non-professional personnel of the Highway Department; police and fire training; and clerical and management training. No other specific data was reported.

New Mexico. The State Personnel Office of New Mexico, responding to this survey in August of 1962, informed us that the Personnel Act of 1961 provided for a personnel system to take effect on June 19, 1961; however, insufficient funds were provided to establish a training program. No additional data on agency level programs was supplied, other than that some did exist. However, Planty and Kanawaty indicate that in 1962 the State of New Mexico had a central training office employing two full-time trainers. They further indicate, in their table entitled “Reported Budgets and State Expenditures on Training,” that the State of New Mexico allocated $11,000 to training.1

Rhode Island. Agency-level training programs in this state cover a wide area of government operations. No attempt will be made to enumerate all training programs of courses; however, a cross-section of department activity will indicate their extent. Types of training found are: Management Development for Department of Employment Security; Forest Fire Patrolman and Conservation Law Enforcement in the Department of Agriculture and Conservation; Public Health Nursing and Rehabilitation in the Department of Health; Professional Development for clerical personnel of the State University; Professional Development, including tuition grants and leave with pay, for professional social service workers in the Department of Social Welfare; Correctional Officer Training in the Division of Corrective Services Department of Social Welfare; Aircraft Crash Rescue and Fire-Fighting in the Department of Public Works, Division of Aeronautics; Attendant, Nursing and Medical Training in the institutions comprising the Institute for Mental Health, Department of Social Welfare; Rehabilitation and Medical Information courses in the Department of Education; and, Electronic Data Processing in the Department of Administration.

While the above-mentioned courses are conducted by the individual departments, many meet the standards established by the central training agency for inclusion in the incentive program under the Personnel Rules and have been so certified. Many of these training programs have been established with the assistance and cooperation of the central training agency.

1Planty and Kanawaty, op. cit., pp. 4-6.
SUMMING UP

Based upon the materials received in the course of this survey, we are led to several conclusions relating to in-service training as presently conducted within the several states.

1. A small number of states, responding to our inquiries, reported no training activities. Of the thirty-seven states returning the survey questionnaire, only two fell within this category.
2. Sixteen jurisdictions reported that they had a central training office to direct or coordinate the various training programs, which were either sponsored by this agency or by the operating departments of the state government. The remaining nineteen states indicated that in-service training was conducted entirely by individual departments without central direction or supervision from the central training or personnel agency.
3. In those jurisdictions having established central training agencies, the total number of full-time staff varied from zero to nineteen. Insofar as strictly full-time professional training personnel are concerned, the staffs of the central office varied from zero to ten.
4. Education and experience requirements for professional trainers were, in all cases, found to be on a relatively high level.
5. Salaries for trainers on all levels ranged from a low of $3600 to a high of $15,432 per annum. These were compared with private industry salaries of $7000 to $40,000, per annum.
6. Reported budgetary appropriations for training, particularly on the central level, were low in comparison with the total number of employees in the public service.
7. Training expenditures were seldom recorded as specific line items within the agency accounting records.
8. Many states depended heavily upon the use of facilities and staffs of outside agencies.
9. While most states had a general provision within the framework of their statutes providing for employee training, few states had written statements of training policy, standards for establishment of programs, or methods of evaluating training programs.
10. The emphasis in training, from what was reported, appeared to favor strongly the areas of top and middle management development with supervisory training ranking second and clerical training third. Training for unskilled and semi-skilled employees seemed to rank near the bottom in most agencies.
11. Where there existed a central training agency or personnel agency for the state government, their records of training activities conducted by operating departments were found to be inadequate.
12. Training functions, in the personnel programs of state governments had not acquired the stature of other functions such as classification and salary administration, examination preparation or general personnel record-keeping and certification administration.
APPENDIX A

Training Section
R. I. Division of Personnel
304 Roger Williams Building
Providence, R. I.

In-service Training Survey Questionnaire
State Governments
July 1962

(Please complete with as much detail as possible.)

State of .................................................................
Department of ...................................................................
Address ..............................................................................

1. (a) Does this jurisdiction have a state-wide training program for its employees? Yes........ No...........
(b) If above is no do you have any type of in-service training program in the state? Yes........ No...........

2. (a) Do you have a central training agency to organize and supervise in-service training? Yes........ No...........
(b) What is the official designation of your training agency? .................................................................
(c) What is the title of the person in charge of the training function? ..............................................
(d) What is the job title of the person to whom the head of the training unit reports? ....................

3. (a) How many employees are attached to your training unit?
   Clerical .................................................................
   Technical .............................................................
(b) Excluding clerical personnel, please list the job titles and salary ranges of the technical classes in the training unit from the highest salary grade to the lowest.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Job Title</th>
<th>Annual Salary Range</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$ to $</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$ to $</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$ to $</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$ to $</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$ to $</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Please attach copies of class specifications if available.)
(c) Are these job titles within the merit or civil service systems of your state? Yes........ No...........

4. (a) Under what authority does your training agency operate (e.g., statute, Personnel Rules, etc.)? (Please attach copy of same if possible.)
(b) Please give total number of employees in the employ of your state...
   Classified .................. Unclassified ..................
(c) Total amount of annual hours of training given last fiscal year? ...........
(d) Number of employees participating in training during last fiscal year? ...........

5. What is the annual budget appropriation for training in your state? $...........

6. When did in-service training begin in your state?........................................
   (Please attach any historical or related data that may show development of your training program.)
7. What types of in-service training are utilized in your state? (Please list.)

8. Do you prepare and publish your own training manuals? ....................

9. Do members of your training staff actually conduct training classes?
   Yes ................ No ..............

10. Do you have established standards for training courses? ...................
    (Please attach copy if available.)

11. (a) Does your state give any type of incentive to its employees to participate in training? ..............
    (b) Please explain incentive if any.

12. Does your state have any plan for payment in whole or part of tuitions of employees enrolled in educational institutions on their own or state time? ..............

13. Do you have any program of training evaluation? ..........................

14. Do you have any concrete evidence that training programs for employees have produced results in economy of operations, more production, etc? ..................

15. Is there any other information not covered above that you can give us on your training program?
    (Please include all printed data you have at hand no matter how unimportant it may seem at the moment.)

16. Would you care to have a copy of the results of this survey? ..............

   Name of person completing questionnaire
   ____________________________________________

   Title
   ____________________________________________

N.B.

   Please return this questionnaire with all supporting data as soon as possible to:
   Charles E. Moan, Jr., Chief
   Training Section
   R. I. Division of Personnel
   Room 304 Roger Williams Bldg.
   Hayes Street
   Providence, R. I.

WE THANK YOU.
APPENDIX B

Illustrative Exhibits

EXHIBIT “A”

CALIFORNIA STATE PERSONNEL BOARD

Specification for the Class of Personnel Training Consultant

Definition:
Under the general direction of the State Training Officer, to advise and assist supervisors and administrators on staff development activities; to plan, organize, direct, and evaluate training programs to meet needs that are common to more than one agency; and to do other work as required.

Typical Tasks:
- Gives technical training assistance to operating officials and supervisors in formulating in-service training policies, in identifying in-service training needs, in planning the content of training programs, in selecting the most effective training methods, in developing handbooks, manuals, course outlines, and other training materials, and in evaluating the results of the training;
- Prepares or directs the preparation of handbooks, manuals, course outlines, and other training materials;
- Assists agencies in securing training assistance from outside subject-matter specialists and in securing available audio-visual training aids;
- Trains agency personnel in developing and leading specialized training courses;
- Trains agency personnel in the various in-service training principles, methods and techniques;
- Works with interagency committees and representatives of employee organizations in developing and carrying on training programs to meet needs that are common to more than one agency;
- Serves as liaison between schools and state agencies in developing and carrying on training to meet the needs of state employees;
- Keeps informed on current training trends, the literature of the field, new training methods, and available audio-visual materials; and
- Prepares reports and dictates correspondence.

Minimum Qualifications:

Experience: Three years of full-time experience in planning, organizing, and conducting employee or supervisory training courses in a variety of subjects or comparable full-time training experience in the armed forces. This experience must have included determining training needs, developing course content and training methods, giving group instruction using several training methods, and evaluating training results. (In appraising experience, more weight will be given to the recency and breadth of pertinent experience and the evidence of the candidate’s ability to accept and fulfill increasing responsibilities in employee training than to the length of his experience.)

Education: Equivalent to graduation from college. (Additional qualifying experience may be substituted for the required education on a basis of six months of experience being equal to one year of education.)

Personnel Training Consultant: Knowledge and Abilities:

- Wide knowledge of principles and methods of employee training, determining training needs, and evaluating training results; nature of the learning process; teaching principles and methods and skill in their application to the training of employees; principles of course development; literature in the field of employee training; principles and techniques of effective employee supervision.
- General knowledge of: audio-visual aids used in training activities; public administration and personnel management principles and practices.
- Skill in: designing programs to meet training needs; conference leading, speaking before groups, and training trainers.
- Skill and originality in: planning, organizing, and conducting training programs and evaluating training results.
- Ability to: direct the writing of, or to write, manuals, handbooks, and lesson plans, and develop visual aids and other instructional materials to meet specific training needs; analyze situations accurately and adopt an effective course of action; prepare reports and correspondence.
EXHIBIT "B"

MICHIGAN CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

45607 Training Officer IV

**General Description:** Employees in these classes plan and direct training programs for state employees on an agency-wide or state-wide basis, and perform related work.

**Examples of Work:** Serves as an assistant to the training director of the central personnel agency training division.

- Assists in planning and operating comprehensive continuing state-wide training programs, in consultation with agency executives, division heads and staff members; supervises delegated training division activities.
- Prepares and recommends survey instruments for determining agency training needs; analyzes and interprets the results, and develops training plans for meeting these needs.
- Evaluates all training programs, methods, materials, and leadership, and provides suggestions for improvement.
- Prepares and edits training manuals, training memoranda and other releases, and training outlines and materials.
- Provides training plans for and conducts or coordinates supervisory, middle management, and executive development training programs operated on an interagency basis.
- Prepares and conducts training-the-trainer workshops and demonstrations.
- Prepares articles and speeches on training activities for publication or oral presentation, represents the training director at public meetings and with educational and professional groups, and serves on training committees.
- Meets with faculty representatives of state educational institutions to assist in planning formal programs for state employees.

**Experience and Education Requirements:** Five years of experience as a training officer in a training program, two years of which shall have involved responsibility for the development of agency-wide training program; and possession of a bachelor’s degree from an accredited college.

**Other Requirements:** Physical condition adequate for performance of the work; intelligence quotient equal to the college average; tact, courtesy and similar qualities necessary in meeting and dealing effectively with others; appropriate speech and dress; knowledge of good English usage; knowledge of the principles and techniques of training; knowledge of adult education procedures; knowledge of the methods of planning, conducting, and evaluating training programs; knowledge of the problems and methods involved in the training of persons of varying degrees of intelligence, education and experience; knowledge of methods of conducting training courses and the texts and visual media available; knowledge of current trends, developments, and theories in in-service training; ability to recognize and determine areas where training is needed; ability to select appropriate training materials, methods and techniques; ability to criticize constructively handbooks, manuals and other training materials; ability to instruct and supervise assistants in the work; ability to determine work standards as to quality and quantity; ability to maintain favorable public relations; ability to write and speak effectively.
General Statement of Duties:
Supervises staff technicians and clerical employees, and participates in the performance of technical personnel work; or is responsible for an assigned major phase of technical work of the department; does related work as required.

Supervision Received:
Works under general supervision of supervisor of a major division in Civil Service Department who reviews works for compliance with laws, administrative and operating policies, and for effectiveness.

Supervision Exercised:
Exercises partial supervision as working supervisor over a small number of employees engaged in the technical and clerical procedures in the respective divisions.

Examples of Principal Duties:
1. Assists division head in planning, assigning and reviewing work of a technical and clerical staff in examination or classification processes.
2. Prepares examination questions and format and reviews for technical adequacy similar work performed by lower level examination technicians; contacts the public and other state departments by correspondence or personal review on general personnel questions; conducts research work involved in such problems as salary studies, studies of working conditions and other personnel questions.
3. Participates in the execution of parts of the functions involving processes or actions which may establish precedents or deviations from normal practice in developing examinations for technical and professional classes, selecting qualifying candidates, classifying technical and professional occupations, recommending salary grades and other similar activities.
4. Recommends to supervisor appropriate action regarding classification and evaluation of new and revised positions and classes; analyzes and decides problem cases in preferential certification; appointments, acceptance and refusal of candidates for admittance to examinations.
5. Develops procedures and processes, and recommends policy and procedure revisions to improve or simplify technical and clerical functions, and to serve as a basis for instruction.
6. Supervises a clerical staff engaged in maintaining various controls, lists, records and registers, or in preparing announcements and statistical data.
7. Confers regularly with agency executive and staff personnel in analyzing and resolving problems relative to examinations, certification, classification, pay, staffing, training and other personnel matters.
8. Answers inquiries of public through correspondence or in person to applicants interested in civil service positions; gives information on eligibility and acceptance.
9. Organizes and conducts wage and salary, fringe benefit and working condition surveys; analyzes data and recommends appropriate action to division head.

Recruiting Requirements:
Knowledge, skill and ability: Considerable knowledge of the principles of public personnel administration including a knowledge of methods and techniques of examination, position classification and transaction processes; considerable knowledge of governmental organization and types and content of a wide variety of positions common to public organization; considerable knowledge of the organization, functions and personnel of the state department concerned; working knowledge of principles of business or public administration; understanding and appreciation of the philosophy and problems of merit system administration and of departmental operating require-
ments; ability to present ideas effectively orally or in writing; ability to maintain harmonious relationships with department officials, employees and the general public; ability to plan and lay out work to be processed and to assign and coordinate work performed by clerical and technical employees.

Experience and Training: Four years of progressively responsible technical experience affording a knowledge and understanding of personnel administration, including at least three years of experience in responsible technical work in the preparation, conduct and evaluation of examinations, salary and wage administration, position classification, recruitment, certification, training or related work in a public personnel agency, and one year of experience equivalent to that of a Personnel Technician 1; and graduation from a four-year college or university, preferably with courses in public or business administration, or a satisfactory equivalent combination of experience and training.

EXHIBIT “D”

STATE OF RHODE ISLAND

Personnel Technician

Class Definition:

General statement of duties: In the Division of Personnel, to perform technical work in connection with position classification and pay plan studies, recruiting, testing, in-service training or other personnel activities of the State Merit System; and to do related work as required.

Supervision received: Works under the supervision of a superior from whom are received specific work assignments; work is reviewed in process and upon completion for conformance to accepted techniques, policies, law, rules and regulations.

Supervision exercised: May supervise and review work of the clerical assistants.

Illustrative Examples of Work Performed:

In the Division of Personnel, to perform technical work in connection with position classification and pay plan studies, recruiting, testing, in-service training or other personnel activities of the State Merit System.

As assigned, to make field investigations involving the interviewing of employees and their supervisors for the purpose of ascertaining the current duties and responsibilities of positions not presenting classification problems of a complex nature; to analyze such duties and responsibilities to determine their distinguishing characteristics through the critical examination and interpretation of the allocation factors present; to evaluate positions, in terms of such factors, in order to determine their relative place in the classification plan structure; to prepare written reports with recommendations for the allocation or reallocation of positions to existing or new classes of positions; to assist in the preparation of new or revised class specifications; to assist in pay plan studies.

As assigned, to perform technical personnel work, not of a complex nature, involving the selection and development of subject matter content of written examinations; to assist in the development of experience and education or other rating keys; to assist in the administration and scoring of examinations; as required, to review examination papers with examinees.

As assigned, to assist in providing technical assistance to operating officials and supervisors in identifying training needs, in planning content of training programs, in the use of training procedures and techniques, in developing training materials and in evaluating the results of training; to assist in the preparation of course announcements, training bulletins, outlines, handbooks, aids, manuals and other instructional
materials for use in programs; to perform necessary research for programs; to maintain records and controls in connection with training courses; to demonstrate teaching methods; to prepare reports of training activities.

As assigned, to assist in performing other technical personnel work, not of a complex nature, relating to the State Merit System.

To do related work as required.

**Required Qualifications for Appointment:**

**Knowledge, skills and capacities:** A familiarity with the principles, methods and practices of the functions of modern public personnel administration, including position classification, testing and in-service training; a familiarity with the organization of the state government; the ability to make field visits of a fact-finding nature; the ability to analyze and evaluate data and to make reports thereon; the ability to use clear and precise language in the preparation of written material; the ability to establish and maintain effective working relationships with state employees, officials and the public; and related capacities and abilities.

**Education:** Such as may have been gained through: graduation from a college of recognized standing or, any combination of education and experience that shall be substantially equivalent to the above education.

*Revised December 14, 1958*

**EXHIBIT “E”**

**CONSTITUTION OF THE STATE OF MICHIGAN**

**Article XI, Section 5**

The classified state civil service shall consist of all positions in the state service except those filled by popular election, heads of principal departments, members of boards and commissions, the principal executive officer of boards and commissions heading principal departments, employees of courts of record, employees of the legislature, employees of the state institutions of higher education, all persons in the armed forces of the state, eight exempt positions in the office of the governor, and within each principal department, when requested by the department head, two other exempt positions, one of which shall be policy-making. The civil service commission may exempt three additional positions of a policy-making nature within each principal department.

The civil service commission shall be non-salaried and shall consist of four persons, not more than two of whom shall be members of the same political party, appointed by the governor for terms of eight years, no two of which shall expire in the same year.

The administration of the commission’s powers shall be vested in a state personnel director who shall be a member of the classified service and who shall be responsible to and selected by the commission after open competitive examination.

The commission shall classify all positions in the classified service according to their respective duties and responsibilities, fix rates of compensation for all classes of positions, approve or disapprove disbursements (sic) for all personal services, determine by competitive examination and performance exclusively on the basis of merit, efficiency and fitness the qualifications of all candidates for positions in the classified service, make rules and regulations covering all personnel transactions, and regulate all conditions of employment in the classified service.

No person shall be appointed to or promoted in the classified service who has not been certified by the commission as qualified for such appointment or promotion. No appointments, promotions, demotions or removals in the classified service shall be made for religious, racial or partisan considerations.

Increases in rates of compensation authorized by the commission may be effective only at the start of a fiscal year and shall require prior notice to the governor, who shall transmit such increases to the legislature as part of his budget. The legislature
may, by a majority vote of the members elected to and serving in each house, waive
the notice and permit increases in rates of compensation to be effective at a time other
than the start of a fiscal year. Within 60 calendar days following such transmission,
the legislature may, by a two-thirds vote of the members elected to and serving in
each house, reject or reduce increases in rates of compensation authorized by the com-
misson. Any reduction ordered by the legislature shall apply uniformly to all classes
of employees affected by the increases and shall not adjust pay differentials already
established by the civil service commission. The legislature may not reduce rates of
compensation below those in effect at the time of the transmission of increases author-
ized by the commission.

The appointing authorities may create or abolish positions for reasons of admin-
istrative efficiency without the approval of the commission. Positions shall not be cre-
ated nor abolished except for reasons of administrative efficiency. Any employee consid-
ering himself aggrieved by the abolition of a position shall have a right of appeal to
the commission through established grievance procedures.

The civil service commission shall recommend to the governor and to the legis-
lature rates of compensation for all appointed positions within the executive depart-
ment not a part of the classified service.

To enable the commission to exercise its powers, the legislature shall appropriate
to the commission for the ensuing fiscal year a sum not less than one percent of the
aggregate payroll of the classified service for the preceding fiscal year, as certified
by the commission. Within six months after the conclusion of each fiscal year the
commission shall return to the state treasury all moneys unexpended for that fiscal
year.

The commission shall furnish reports of expenditures, at least annually, to the
governor and the legislature and shall be subject to annual audit as provided by law.

No payment for personal services shall be made or authorized until the provi-
sions of this constitution pertaining to civil service have been complied with in every
particular. Violation of any of the provisions hereof may be restrained or observance
compelled by injunctive or mandamus proceedings brought by any citizen of the state.

EXHIBIT "F"

STATE OF RHODE ISLAND

Personnel Rules

Rule IV — Section 4.08

4.08 Incentive In-Service Training Program

Purpose: To encourage the development of the individual state employee and
to improve the service of the state to its citizens.

Objectives: To familiarize employees of state government in the intricate func-
tions of all the facets of government. To make state employees more conscious of the
workings of state government... to insure a broader knowledge of each department
to better evaluate their own jobs by using the knowledge received in these courses in
relation to their own jobs. To improve employees' performance on the job by in-
service training in specialized and general basic areas of knowledges, skills and abili-
ties required in state employment.

4.081 Curricula to be established in accordance with the following principles:

4.0811 Training courses to be in the areas of knowledges, skills and abilities
required in the performance of the duties of the classification and the legal objectives
and responsibilities of the state agency to which the employee is assigned.

4.0812 All courses integral to this program must be approved in advance by the
Personnel Administrator.
4.082 Incentive awards to be implemented in accordance with the following regulations:

4.0821 A certificate to be awarded at the successful completion of each course.

4.0822 A one-step pay increment next above the current base step (or if the employee is at the maximum of the grade or has a longevity pay increase above the maximum of the grade, an increment equal in amount to the last step in the pay grade) to be effective upon the successful completion of a four-course curriculum, said increment to be retained, separate and apart from any salary or longevity increase that the employee may at that time or thereafter receive, restricted, however, to the limitations contained in Section 4.0823.

4.0823 Said increment shall be retained by the employee for a period of four years from the date granted. Each employee shall be eligible for only one such increment, under the Incentive In-Service Training Program, during the course of his employment with the State.

The provisions of the above paragraph shall apply to all employees receiving an increment on the date this rule is adopted.

EXHIBIT “G”

CALIFORNIA STATE PERSONNEL BOARD

Specification for the Class of State Training Officer

Definition:
Under the general direction, to plan, organize, and direct the activities of the Training Division of the State Personnel Board, to consult with, advise, and aid administrative and supervisory officials in more effective use of employee skills and abilities through the use of formal and informal programs of training and better management of personnel; and to do other work in the improvement of state personnel management practices as required.

Job Characteristics:
A major responsibility of the employee in this class is that of aiding administrators of state agencies in imparting to their administrative and supervisory staffs a recognition and understanding of modern concepts and principles of developing, managing, and working with employees. The objectives of his work are to assist administrators in attaining the most effective use of the employees of their respective agencies.

As a corollary responsibility, the incumbent assists state officials in analyzing employee training needs and evaluating methods of meeting the needs, but he does not assume direct responsibility for the administration of training programs, except interdepartmental programs.

Typical Tasks:
Supervises and works with the training staff of the Personnel Board in advising, encouraging, and assisting state agencies in the development of training programs and organizations; holds conferences with administrators and supervisors for the purpose of reviewing and analyzing management policies and practices for the supervision of employees; studies the effectiveness of management policies and practices and supervisory methods by analyzing employee discipline and grievance cases and other means; reviews the effectiveness of practices for keeping employees informed of agency policies and for achieving a uniform understanding of objectives, policies, and practices at all levels; assists administrative officials in acquiring and understanding of and skills in the use of management tools; assists in formulating employee development programs; studies and suggests improvements in the employee relations policies of agencies; works with interagency organizations such as the Governor’s State Advisory
Committee on Personnel Management and Training, the Deputy Directors' Conference and the Training Officers' Association.

Assists state agencies in determining the need for training programs and encourages their establishment; gives administrative advice; gives advice on the establishment of training units and the planning and organization of training programs; stimulates employee participation in training activities; assists in securing assistance from federal, state, local authorities and educational institutions in furnishing instructors and facilities for training; makes available up-to-date information on training methods and materials; suggests methods for evaluating the results of training; gives general supervision to the State Safety Coordinator in the development and conduct of safety programs.

Minimum Qualifications:

Two years of experience in the California state service in a training or personnel class comparable in level to Training Officer II or Personnel Officer II, which has included responsibility for organizing and directing a training program for a state agency.

OR

Experience: Four years of experience in a responsible managerial or administrative capacity, involving policy formulation and program development, with responsibility for active participation in any one of or a combination of the following activities:

1. The development and maximum utilization of employee skills and abilities in the accomplishment of the aims of the organization; or

2. The development of improved management techniques for facilitating the work of employees and increasing their understanding of the organization and their relationship to it; or

3. The development, coordination, or direction of a comprehensive personnel management program for the organization, or of a major phase of such a program, in a very large organization; or

4. The development, coordination, or direction of a comprehensive employee training program.

(In evaluation of this experience, emphasis will be placed on the degree of administrative responsibility carried, the size of the organization directed, and the nature and extent of the program of the type listed above.) and

Education: Equivalent to graduation from college. (Additional qualifying experience may be substituted for the required education on a year-for-year basis.)

Knowledge and Abilities:

Thorough knowledge of: objectives, principles, practices, and trends of modern organization and management; principles and techniques of effective personnel management and supervision and developing and maintaining sound and effective relationships with employees.

Broad knowledge of: types of occupations in industry, business, and public service.

General knowledge of: accepted principles, methods, and techniques of employee training and employee development.

Skill in: assembling facts and organizing data.

High order of ability to: analyze personnel management situations and make sound recommendations for improvement in personnel management policy and methods; win the interest, confidence, and cooperation of others in developing employees, in evaluating and improving personnel management policies and supervisory methods, and in organizing and installing training programs.

Ability to: speak and write clearly and effectively.

Special personal characteristics: demonstrated administrative ability, imagination, and tact.

34
EXHIBIT "H"

MICHIGAN CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

Personnel Training Administrator VI

General Description:
An employee in this class, under the general direction of the Deputy State Personnel Director, plans and coordinates training activities for personnel in the state public service; and performs related work.

Examples of Work:
- Plans, organizes and directs individual and group courses of instruction and other training activities in the various state departments and institutions.
- Stimulates recognition of need for training programs.
- Provides advice to operating officials, appointing authorities and departmental training officers concerning specific training needs and purposes.
- Ascertains that facilities are available for such programs as group instruction off the job, individual instruction on the job, institutes, conferences and circulating libraries.
- Personally conducts special classes for such groups as supervisors, employees and teacher-trainers.
- Develops and conducts training-the-trainer workshops.
- Coordinates training activities with other civil service functions.
- Consults with the Director and Deputy Director on policies for the training division.
- Prepares and devotes time to delivering speeches and writes articles for lay and professional presentation.
- Assigns, supervises and reviews the work of staff members within the training division.

Experience and Education Requirements:
- Five years of experience as a training officer in government or industry, three years of which shall have involved the planning and directing of training programs of major scope, and possession of a bachelor's degree from an accredited college.
- Note: Administrative or personnel experience may be substituted year for year for general experience as a training officer, provided that in any case the applicant has at least six months of experience as a training officer.

Other Requirements:
- Physical condition adequate for performance of the work of the class.
- In accord with the principles of the merit system for public employment.
- Tact, courtesy and similar qualities necessary in meeting and dealing effectively with others.
- Appropriate speech and dress.
- Willingness to travel about the state.
- Thorough knowledge of the methods of planning, conducting and evaluating training programs.
- Knowledge of the problems involved in educational promotion and leadership.
- Knowledge of adult education procedures as applied to the practical instruction of governmental employees.
- Knowledge of current trends, developments and theories in in-service training.
- Knowledge of material available for use in the training of government personnel.
- Knowledge of the development, construction and use of procedures manuals for in-service training.
Knowledge of literature in the field of public personnel training.
Ability to plan, develop and conduct training programs in a wide variety of fields.
Ability to recognize areas of training need.
Ability to coordinate education programs in the various state agencies.
Ability to evaluate training programs in terms of objectives and needs.
Ability to adapt methods of employee training to the public service.
Ability to prepare original material for training purposes.
Ability to write and speak effectively.
Ability to deal effectively with officials of operating departments and others.
Ability to organize and preside over staff conferences.

EXHIBIT "I"

STATE OF PENNSYLVANIA

Director, Bureau of Recruitment and Training

Definition:
This is highly responsible administrative and technical work directing the recruitment and employee training activities of the State Civil Service Commission. The employee in this class plans and directs a recruitment program and coordinates employee training and development activities on a state-wide basis. Work involves maintaining liaison relationships with operating agencies in providing recruiting and training services. Supervision is exercised over a technical and clerical staff. Work is performed independently under the general direction of an administrative superior and is subject to review for program effectiveness and conformance with established policies.

Examples of Work Performed:
Promotes and directs a comprehensive schedule of recruitment visits to high schools, colleges and professional groups and organizations.
Consults with representatives of operating agencies to determine recruitment needs.
Evaluates recruitment programs by reviewing reports and conducting cooperative studies of vacant positions and the extent of participation in examination programs; reviews, revises and adjusts recruitment techniques to meet changing conditions.
Assists and advises operating officials in analyzing training needs, planning and organizing training to be given, developing or locating training materials, and evaluating training programs.
Develops and organizes inter-agency training programs which can best be provided centrally for reasons of economy and convenience.
Formulates and maintains plans for the development, training and effective use of manpower resources, including periodic inventories of training needs and of progress being made in meeting these needs.
Stimulates recognition of need for training programs.
Recommends training policies and procedures to operating officials.
Performs related work as required.

Required Knowledge, Skills and Abilities:
Thorough knowledge of public personnel administration methods and techniques with special emphasis on recruitment and placement processes.
Thorough knowledge of the principles, practices and techniques of employee training.
Considerable knowledge of the principles and practices of public administration.
Considerable knowledge of governmental organization and of the types, content and qualifications required of occupations found in state government.
Considerable knowledge of the principles of teaching methods.
Knowledge of the principles and practices of supervision and office management.
Ability to plan, organize, conduct and evaluate state-wide recruiting and training programs.
Ability to exercise effective administrative and technical supervision over a subordinate staff.
Ability to secure employee and management interest and cooperation in developing and carrying on recruiting and training programs.
Ability to establish and assert effective relationships with state employees and officials, professional educators and the general public.

Minimum Experience and Training:
Five years of experience, including two years in a supervisory or administrative capacity, as follows: (1) three years of experience in employee training or six years of teaching experience above the elementary school level, and (2) two years of experience in a public or private personnel agency in the field of recruitment; and such training as may have been gained through graduation from a four-year college or university, supplemented by graduate work to the level of a master's degree in education, personnel management or public administration; or any equivalent combination of experience and training.

EXHIBIT "J"

STATE OF RHODE ISLAND

Principal Personnel Technician (Training)

General Statement of Duties:
To be responsible for the development and maintenance of in-service training programs within the various departments and agencies of the state government; and to assist and advise appointing authorities in their preparation and conduct of such programs; and to do related work as required.

Supervision Received:
Works under the direction of the Personnel Administrator with wide latitude for the use of independent judgment; work is reviewed for conformance to policies.

Supervision Exercised:
Plans, organizes, coordinates and directs the work of a staff of technicians and clerical assistants.

Illustrative Examples of Work Performed:
To be responsible for the development and maintenance of in-service training programs within the various departments and agencies of the state government; and to assist and advise appointing authorities in their preparation and conduct of such programs.

To be responsible for planning, organizing, coordinating and directing the work of a technical staff engaged in:
providing technical assistance to operating officials and supervisors in identifying training needs, in planning content of training programs, in the use of training procedures and techniques, in developing training material and in evaluating the results of training; preparing course announcements, training bulletins, outlines, handbooks, aids, manuals and other instructional materials for use in programs; performing necessary research for programs; obtaining visual aids such as films and slides; maintaining records and controls in connection with training courses; demonstrating teaching methods; collecting information on and making studies of training needs; preparing reports of training activities; and preparing bibliographies of all available teaching and instructional material.
In accordance with directions from the Personnel Administrator, to develop and conduct special training programs in connection with the recruitment program of the Division of Personnel.

To train officials and supervisors in the selection and use of effective training methods and techniques.

To meet with representatives of educational institutions in order to develop and foster the interest and cooperation of these institutions in providing courses to meet the needs of state government employees.

To recommend to the Personnel Administrator revisions of policies and procedures relating to the in-service training program or revisions of the Personnel Rules as they affect the in-service training program.

To prepare special reports on complex matters of the in-service training program, reports of progress, annual reports and other reports as required.

To do related work as required.

Required Qualifications for Appointment:

Knowledge, skills and capacities: A thorough knowledge of principles and practices of public personnel administration; a thorough knowledge and understanding of the objectives and accomplishments of in-service training, its role in public personnel administration and its relationship to other phases of public personnel administration; a thorough knowledge of the subject matter, methods, procedures, tools, aids, etc., employed in the in-service training field; the ability to conduct surveys of training needs, to analyze them and to develop programs to meet these needs; the ability to prepare or to direct the preparation of handbooks, manuals and lesson plans and to develop visual aids and other instructional material to meet training needs; the ability to plan, organize, coordinate and direct the work of technicians and clerical assistants engaged in the development and maintenance of an in-service training program; and related capacities and abilities.

Education and Experience:

Education: Such as may have been gained through: graduation from a college of recognized standing; and

Experience: Such as may have been gained through: employment in a supervisory position in a public agency or in private industry which has involved the application of in-service training principles, methods and techniques.

Or, any combination of education and experience that shall be substantially equivalent to the above education and experience.

June 30, 1957

EXHIBIT "K"

Communication No. 183

STATE OF RHODE ISLAND AND PROVIDENCE PLANTATIONS

DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATION

Division of Personnel

FROM: James R. Gray, Personnel Administrator
DEPT.: Administration—Personnel
TO: Appointing Authorities
SUBJECT: IN-SERVICE TRAINING PROGRAM

In order to implement the In-service Training Program currently being conducted by the Training Section of the Division of Personnel and to further encourage the active participation by the several state departments and agencies in the training of
their personnel, the following Training Policy will become effective 11 September 1961:

State employees may be granted course credit applicable to the Incentive In-Service Training Program as provided by Section 4.08 of the Personnel Rules provided that such courses taken by the employee bear a direct relationship to the duties of his position and the legal objective and responsibilities of the agency in which he is employed. Further, that such courses to be taken by the employee shall be given written approval in advance by the head of the operating division and the Director of the Department in which he is employed and by the Division of Personnel, Department of Administration. Expenses incidental to such courses shall be paid for by the individual employee himself.

In order to carry out the provisions of the above the following procedures shall be followed by all concerned.

A. Request for course approval: All requests for approval of courses to be taken by a state employee must be made by letter in advance of the starting date of said course to the Chief, Training Section, Division of Personnel, Room 122, State House and must contain the following information:
   1. Employee name and position title.
   2. Name and location of agency to which employee is attached.
   3. Course title and catalog number.
   4. Name of institution in which course is to be conducted.
   5. Number of hours course will run.
   6. Brief description of course content.
   7. Approval of Division head, and Department Director certifying that the course is directly related to the employee’s duties in the agency.

B. Approval for course: Employees will be notified by letter if approval is granted by the Division of Personnel. Final course credit will be granted only after the employee has successfully completed the course as evidenced by an official transcript from the institution where the course is taken. Submission of such evidence to the Division of Personnel shall be the responsibility of the employee concerned.

C. Courses for which credit will not be given: Credit under the provisions of the Personnel Rules will not be given to the employee for the following:
   1. Courses taken without prior approval as stated above.
   2. Courses taken prior to 11 September 1961, not already approved or sponsored by the Division of Personnel.
   3. Courses taken through correspondence schools.
   4. Courses not successfully completed with a passing grade.
   5. More than one course taken during the same period of time.
   6. Courses that are not directly related to the duties and responsibilities of the position of the employee and the needs of the agency in which he is employed.

It is the hope of the Division of Personnel that all departments and agencies of the state government will encourage to their utmost the training of personnel within their jurisdictions either by the development of approved training courses and programs within their agencies or if such is not feasible that they will encourage their employees to enroll in approved courses at institutions of higher learning.