

Educational Sciences: Theory & Practice - 12(2) • Spring • 725-730

2012 Educational Consultancy and Research Center

www.edam.com.tr/esto

A Qualitative Study on Change Management in Primary Schools Award Winning and Non-Award Winning Schools Case in Study of TQM

Esen ALTUNAY

Didem ARLI^a

Münevver YALÇINKAYA

Ege University

Ege University

Ege University

Abstract

The aim of this study was to determine the need of change in primary schools and to reveal out the principals' experiences during the change process by taking the total quality management practices into consideration and finally give suggestions according to the results of the study. In this study by employing qualitative research method, semi structured interview technique was preferred. The sample of the study was composed of the school principals whose schools both received and could not receive Total Quality Management Award during the 2009-2010 academic year in Bornova, Buca, Gaziemir, Karsıyaka provinces of İzmir. The findings of the study revealed out that teams were formed up, documents were prepared, but the teams in the schools that took awards worked more actively than the teams in schools that did not take any awards. The principals in the schools with awards mentioned that they were aware of the works of the teams and provided the required equipment for these teams.

Kev Words

Change, Total Quality Management, Change Management.

In order to survive, organizations should develop themselves concerning the speed of information, changes in the management approaches, the cooperation among the institutions and also they should make planned, successful and permanent changes and improvements (Burford, 2003; Escalente, 2005; Özkan, 2004; Özmen & Sönmez, 2007). There have been various organizational change definitions in literature (Darusselam, 2004; Escalente, 2005; Özdemir, 2000; Töremen, 2002). According to Owens (1987, p. 243) organizational change is a "planned, extraordinary, original effort that makes contribution to the organizations in reaching new aims and fulfilling the existing ones successfully. In the

a Didem ARLI, Ph.D., is currently a research assistant at the Department of Educational Sciences, Educational Administration, Supervision, Planning and Economics. Correspondence: Research Assistant Didem ARLI, Ege University, Faculty of Education, Department of Educational Sciences İzmir/Turkey. E-mail: didem.arli@eqe.edu.tr

process of change, there should be unity between the purposes of change and employees (Coventry, 1998; Çetin, 2002; Özkalp, 2001, p. 517; Özkan, 2004; Selçuk, 2004). Change management requires a dynamic cultural approach; it not only causes change in the culture, politics, structure and system of the organizations but also it determines the strategies to apply these changes (Düren, 2000; Helvacı, 2005; Taş, 2009).

Change management is conducted in five different levels which are, to determine the external and internal factors that compel change, to define change and aims, to prepare the available conditions for change and apply the programme, the assessment of change activities, and to get feedback (Kulu Şentürk, 2007; Kurşunoğlu, 2006). The most important tool to apply change in the organizations is total quality management. As total quality management is important for creating new organizational culture and providing personal development to employees, the primary schools should be restructured according

to total quality management principles (Acar, 1998, p. 5; Argun, 1998, p. 10; Aydın & Şentürk, 2007, p. 2; Özdemir, 1997; Töremen, 2002).

The schools are in need of managing the education and applying the change, so the culture of the schools (Helvacı, 2005; Taş, 2009) and total quality culture should be parallel. One of the studies to combine this culture is the total quality management awards. Total quality management awards are intended to cause the school employees gain quality knowledge, permanent development and recruitment in the whole process, increase effectively, compare the quality of education in national and international schools or institutions and as a result total quality management awards are intended to determine how much the quality management aims are applied (Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı [MEB], 2005). How the schools take total quality management awards are determined according to some rules. For taking total quality management awards, the schools related to their studies, apply to national education headship after they prepare some reports that are found in the regulations (MEB, 2005). It can be said that in the schools that have already taken total quality management awards, as soon as possible the standard quality increases and change starts. In the total quality management process of schools, school managers are very important. The secret of a successful change depends on good administration (Aktan, 1998, p. 69; Can, 2002, p. 94; Gökçe, 2005). A good administrator can determine the need for change, motivate the employees for change, assign the available people, generate a vision, cause employees work as a change agent (Özmen & Sönmez, 2007, p. 169).

Not conducting researches on change management in qualitative methods can be regarded as an important deficiency. In this aspect, it is important to conduct a research on how change is managed at schools and education system via qualitative research. It is thought that this research will be helpful to manage the change effectively at schools and solve the problems about change at schools.

The aim of this research is to determine the need of change at schools and emerge out the experiences of primary school administrators in the change process by taking the total quality management applications into account, and also determine the troubles in this process and give some suggestions. In the light of this aim, answers to the following questions are searched.

1) What are the perceptions of primary school administrators about the determination of change at schools?

- 2) What are the perceptions of primary school administrators about the preparation of change process at schools?
- 3) What are the perceptions of primary school administrators about the application of change at schools?
- 4) What are the perceptions of primary school administrators about the application of change at schools regarding total quality management?
- 5) What are the perceptions of primary school administrators about the assessment of applied change at schools?

Method

This descriptive study was conducted through qualitative research method. In this research, multiple holistic case study design was used. Case design is a kind of research design that gives opportunity to examine the facts in detail and to make comments by forming up various statements (Yaman, 2010).

Deviant case sampling which is one of the purposive methods was used in this research. The study group consisted of 4 total quality management award winning and 4 not having total quality management award school administrators working in the primary schools in Bornova, Buca, Gaziemir and Karşıyaka in 2009-2010 academic year.

As a data collection tool, semi structured interview form was used. In order to obtain comparative results, semi-structured interview form was developed for the administrators based on research questions and literature.

The internal validity of the research was tried to be acquired through expert inspection, participant confirmation, and long interview lengths. External validity of the research was obtained through detailed description of the data by the researchers. Internal reliability was obtained through consistency review whereas external reliability was obtained through confirmation review. Two researchers worked together to examine if the codes and themes were organized effectively. Afterwards, these codes and themes presented to two experts and necessary editing was carried out in the light of these experts' perceptions. Also, after the idea unity/ (idea unity+idea difference) x 100 formula was employed that was presented by Miles and Huberman (1994), the consistency rate between the two researchers was found .94.

Descriptive and content analysis were used in the research (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2003). In the analysis three activity levels were used which are decreasing the data, presenting the data, inference and verification (Türnüklü, 2000).

In the presentation of the data, intensity (different ideas), expressiveness (conformation of the themes), variousness and different samples criteria were used (Ünver, Bümen, & Basbay, 2010).

The main themes of the research were determined according to the research questions of the research and the levels of change management that are expressed by Kulu Şentürk (2007). The themes and sub themes after the data analysis are seen in Table 1.

Table 1

The Themes and Sub Themes After The Analysis

1. The perceptions about the determination of change

- 1.1. The perceptions about the factors that need to be changed in the education system.
- $1.2. \ \,$ The perceptions about the factors that need to be changed at schools
- 2. The perceptions about the preparation of change process
- 3. The perceptions about the application of change
- 3.1. The perceptions about the obstacles that emerge out in the change process
- 3.2. The perceptions about the solution of the obstacles that emerge out in the change process
- 3.3. The perceptions about the control of the applications
- 4. The perceptions about the application of the change at schools in the parallel of total quality management
- 5. The perceptions about the assessment of change process
- 5.1. The perceptions about the assessment of change results
- 5.2. The perceptions about the fields that successful change is applied

Results

The Perceptions of the Primary School Administrators about the Determination of Change

Perceptions about the Factors That Should Change in the Education System: The first question in the semi-structured interview form is "What are the factors that should change in the education system?". The primary school administrators mentioned the education program, the financial problems of the teachers and schools, the professional trainings, the structural problems of the schools, appointment system, placement tests, and in-service trainings as the factors that should change in the education system. All the primary school administrators whose school had taken the total quality management award emphasized the "placement tests" factor more than the others whereas all the primary school administrators whose school had not taken the total quality management award emphasized the "education program".

The Perceptions about the Factors That Should Change at Schools: The second question in the semi- structured interview form is "What are the factors that have to be changed in your school?". The primary school administrators mentioned the social, physical structure of the schools, success of the school, the parents' quality, financial sources, the quality of the teachers, class size, and bilateral training as the factors that should change at schools. All the primary school administrators whose school have taken the total quality management award emphasized the "quality of the teachers" as the factor that has to be changed at schools whereas all the primary school administrators whose school have not taken the total quality management award emphasized the "parents' quality".

The Perceptions about the Preparation of Change Process

The third question in the semi-structured interview form is "What are the preparations for applying change in your school?". The primary school administrators mentioned the organization of social activities, creating technology classes, training of the parents, increasing the financial sources and physical facilities, obtaining suitable equipment, convincing the employees, motivating the employees, and in-service training as the preparation of change process. All the primary school administrators whose school had taken the total quality management award emphasized the "in-service training" as the preparation to make change whereas all the primary school administrators whose school had not taken the total quality management award emphasized the "education of the parents".

The Perceptions of Change Process Application

The Obstacles That Emerge out in the Change Process: The fourth question in the semi-structured interview form is "What are the obstacles that you face in the change process in your school?". The primary school administrators mentioned the resistance of the employees to change, lack of financial sources, lack of physical area, not having total quality management culture, frequent circulation of teachers, and the general administration of Ministry of Education. All the primary school administrators whose school had taken the total quality management award emphasized the "resistance of teachers to change" as the most important obstacle in the change process.

The Solution of the Obstacles That Emerge out in the Change Process: The fifth question in the semi-structured interview form is "How do you solve the problems that emerge out in the change process?". The primary school administrators mentioned working more, providing new sources, in-service training about total quality management, new methods to support total quality management practices, participation to decisions, being chosen to commissions according to employees' fields of interests, organizing social activities, motivating employees to learn more about students, providing equipment, increasing study motivation, and convincing methods as the probable obstacles in the change process.

The Perception about the Control of Change Applications: The sixth question in the semi-structured interview form is "How do you control the change in your school?". The primary school administrators mentioned following a regular control program, delegation, control based on sharing and participation, and not controlling. Two primary school administrators whose school had taken the total quality management award emphasized "control based on sharing and participation" while two primary school administrators whose schools had not taken total quality management award emphasized "not controlling".

The Perceptions of Change Applications at Schools in accordance with Total Quality Management Applications

The seventh question in the semi-structured interview form is "What have you done in your school on behalf of total quality management process?". The primary school administrators mentioned the total quality management commissions, school development administration teams, technological equipment, cooperation of school and environment, delegation, planning, swot analysis, satisfaction surveys, and finding solutions. All the primary school administrators whose school had taken the total quality management award emphasized the "total quality management commissions and school development management teams and cooperation of school and environment" whereas all the primary school administrators whose school had not taken the total quality management award emphasized the "technological equipment and cooperation of school and environment".

The Perceptions of Primary School Administrators about the Assessment of Change Process

The Perceptions about Assessment of Change Results: The eighth question in the semi-structured interview form is "How did you evaluate the results of the change?" Some school principals mentioned the approach of student-centered education, parents' education of students, the success of the change, school development efforts (regulation of physical structure), academic achievement, and some school principals mentioned the change applications at schools being insufficient and their change goals.

The Fields where Successful Change is Applied: The ninth question in the semi-structured interview form is "In which fields did you think to do change in your school?" and "what is the most successful change you have did in your school?" The primary school principals mentioned the physical structure of schools, parents' awareness of students, students behaviors, school counseling, working environment, the image of the school, academic achievement, the social structure of the school, management approach, and communication. All the school administrators stated that the most successful change was done in the physical structure of their schools.

Discussion

Primary school administrators mentioned the subjects such as curriculum and student placement exam, characteristics of in-service training program need to be changed in the national education system and schools' social and physical structure and its success, the nature of students' parents, lack of financial resources, teacher qualifications that need to be changed in their schools. The research findings of Argon and Özçelik (2008, pp. 76), Ak (2006) and Cenker (2008) were parallel with the findings of this research. This finding indicated that school principals were aware of the need for change on various topics in the national education system and in their own schools.

Primary school administrators mentioned the subjects such as organization of social activities, creating technology classes, parent education program, increasing the financial resources and the physical facilities, ensuring tools and equipment, convincing and encouraging teachers to change and motivating them for attending some in-service trainings for doing preparations to change process. The results of this study was partly similar to Helvacı and

Kıcıroğlu's (2010, p. 15) research results. These findings can be said to be indicative that school principals employed to try to motivate teachers and to mobilize social and physical factors for preparing the process of change.

Primary school administrators mentioned the subjects such as teachers' resistance to change, lack of financial resources and physical areas, not understanding the total quality management culture, and Ministry of National Education' general management approach as obstacles to change. The findings of this research supported the findings of Töremen (2002, pp. 199-201) and Helvacı and Kıcıroğlu's (2010) research. According to these findings, it can be said that the education system is not open to change and apt to resume the traditional structure.

Primary school administrators mentioned the subjects such as working on fund raising, organizing in-service trainings about total quality management, motivating total quality management efforts, including the teachers to decision-making process, providing tools and equipment, and persuading teachers to change as for solution to the obstacles confronted during the change process. The research findings of Taş (2009, p. 15), Başaran (1992), Çınar (2005), Helvacı and Kıcıroğlu (2010, p. 17), Argon and Özçelik (2008) and Ak (2006) are similar to this finding of the research. The reason for this can be thought to be the centralized administration of schools, school administrators' not having a right to state their ideas clearly about the budget and source the Ministry of Education provides.

Primary school administrators stated that they used three different control types to control the process of change in their schools. These control types were strict control, participant-loose control, and free control. Argon and Özçelik (2008, p. 76), Taş (2009, p. 15), Cenker (2008) and Kurşunoğlu (2006, p. 45) also referred to different control types of primary school administrators. As a result, the manager's monitoring and controlling of change can be said to be effective in the process.

As for the total quality management application at schools, primary school administrators mentioned the subjects such as the total quality management commissions, school development administration teams, technological equipment, cooperation of school and environment, delegation, planning, swot analysis, satisfaction surveys, and finding solutions. Yıldırım (2007), Şentürk and Türkmen (2009) and Şahin's (2006, pp. 10-11) research findings indicated that scho-

ol development administration teams did not work effectively. As a result, although school development administration teams had potential to perform change, according to the literature it can be said that they do not work effectively.

When assessing the change, primary school administrators mentioned that they have made successful changes in some subjects such as social and physical structure of the school, school's image, parent profiles of students, academic achievement, and school council works. This finding of the research is similar to the results of Ak (2006), Argon and Özçelik (2008), Kurşunoğlu (2006) research. The results obtained in this study indicated that primary school administrators are aware that changes in the schools should be permanent.

The results obtained from this study show that in the determination of the need for change, in the preparation of change process, application, and in the assessment of the change process every school has own unique features. Administrators of total quality management award winning schools indicated that they determined the need for change in time, did the necessary activities in order to start change, and prepared the suitable conditions. According to the school administrators, " the change performed with total quality management" was the change performed in the school's physical infrastructure.

The results also indicated that both the schools having taken total quality management awards and not receiving total quality management awards already established the necessary teams for total quality management, prepared documents within the framework of total quality management, but only in the schools that had taken awards, these teams worked more actively.

Finally according to the findings of this research it can be suggested that for applying the change process effectively at schools, different kinds of activities such as in-service training programs, seminars, courses should be organized for not only the teachers but also for the administrators to lead them to gain the necessary skills and knowledge about change management. Such activities should be better qualified and timing of them should be better-organized and necessary incentive activities should be provided for teachers to participate in. All employees who work in schools, parents of students, and school council members should be more conscious about primary school administrators' efforts towards change and innovation activities.

References/Kaynakça

Acar, A. (1998). Değişim sürecinde başarıya ulaşmak. Executive Excellence, 14, 4-5.

Ak, M. (2006). İlköğretim okulu yöneticilerinin değişimi yönetme yeterlikleri (Uşak ili örneği). Yayımlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, Afyon Kocatepe Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, İlköğretim Anabilim Dalı, Sınıf Öğretmenliği Bilim Dalı, Afyonkarahisar.

Aktan, C. C. (1998). *Toplumsal dönüşüm ve Türkiye*. İstanbul: Milliyet Yayınları.

Argon, T. ve Özçelik, N. (2008). İlköğretim okulu yöneticilerinin değişimi yönetme yeterlikleri. Mehmet Akif Ersoy Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi. efd.mehmetakif.edu.tr/arsiv/aralik2008/aralik2008/70-89.pdf adresinden 05.05.2010 tarihinde edinilmiştir.

Argun, T. (1998). Kurumsal değişim. Executive Excellence, 14, 10-11.

Aydın, A. ve Şentürk, İ. (2007). Eğitimde toplam kalite yönetiminin uygulanması (ilköğretim okulları örneği). Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 17, 1-19.

Başaran, İ. E. (1992). Yönetimde insan ilişkileri: yönetsel davranış. Ankara: Gül Yayınevi

Burford, K. (2003). Managing change and transitions. http://www.nlta.nf.ca/HTML files/html_pages/publications/bulle-tins/Sept-Oct/human.html. adresinden 04.05.2010 tarihinde edinilmiştir.

Can, N. (2002). *De*ğişim sürecinde eğitim yönetimi. http://yayim.meb.gov.tr /yayimlar/155-156/can.htm adresinde 03.05.2010 tarihinde edinilmiştir.

Cenker, B. (2008). İlköğretim okullarında görev yapan öğretmenlerin, okulda değişim yönetiminin gerçekleştirilmesine bakış açılarının incelenmesi. Yayımlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, Yeditepe Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Eğitim Yönetimi ve Denetimi Anabilim Dalı, İstanbul.

Coventry, H. (1998). Organizational design and change. Retrieved 03 April, 2010 from http://www.canberra.edu.au/uc/lectures/mantech/manpol/sem982/unit3609/OrganisationalChange.html.

Çetin, K. (2002). Toplam kalite yönetimi felsefesi ve temel unsurları. Milli Eğitim Dergisi, http://yayim.meb.gov.tr/yayimlar/155-156/kcetin.htm. adresinden 02.08.2010 tarihinde edinilmistir.

Çınar, İ. (2005). İnsan kaynağını geliştirme bağlamında değişim yönetimi. *Ege Eğitim Dergisi*, 6 (1), 81-93.

Darusselam, E. (2004). Organizational change/transformation strategies. Retrieved 10 May, 2010 from http://www.voctech.org.bn/Virtuallib/programme/Regular/Hrm98/ChangeTransform.htm

Düren, Z. (2000). 2000'li yıllarda yönetim. İstanbul: Alfa Yayınları.

Escalente, E. (2005). Organizational change/transformation strategies. Retrieved 12 June, 2009 from http://www.voctechorgbnVirtuallib/programme/Regular/Hrm98/Change_Transform.htm.

Gökçe, F. (2005). İlköğretim okulu müdürlerinin değişme yöneticiliği yeterlikleri ve değişme sürecinde gösterdikleri davranışlar. Çağdaş Eğitim Dergisi, 321, 24-29.

Helvacı, M. A. (2005). Eğitim örgütlerinde değişim yönetimi. Ankara: Nobel Yayınevi.

Helvacı, M. A. ve Kıcıroğlu, B. (2010). İlköğretim okullarının değişime hazır bulunuşluk düzeyleri (Uşak ili örneği). İktisat ve Girişimcilik Üniversitesi, Türk Dünyası. Kırgız-Türk Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Akademik Bakış Dergisi, 21, 1-30.

Kulu Şentürk, S. (2007). İstanbul ili, ilköğretim okullarında görev yapan öğretmelerin değişime dirençleri ve direnç nedenleri. Yayımlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, Yıldız Teknik Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Eğitim Yönetimi, Teftişi, Planlaması ve Ekonomisi Bilim Dalı, İstanbul.

Kurşunoğlu, A. (2006). İlköğretim okulu öğretmenlerinin örgütsel değişmeye ilişkin tutumları (denizli ili örneği). Yayımlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi, Pamukkale Üniversitesi, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü, Eğitim Bilimleri Anabilim Dalı, Eğitim Yönetimi, Denetimi, Planlaması ve Ekonomisi Bilim Dalı, Denizli.

Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı (MEB). (2005). Eğitimde toplam kalite yönetimi uygulamaları ödül yönergesi. Tebliğler Dergisi. 2568. http://personel.meb.gov.tr/daireler/mevzuat/mevzuatlar/pdf adresinden 10.08.2010 tarihinde edinilmiştir.

Miles, M. B., & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative data analysis*. California, USA: Sage Publications.

Owens, R. G. (1987). Organizational behavior in education (2nd ed.). New Jersey: Prentice-Hall International Inc.

Özdemir, S. (2000). *Eğitimde örgütsel yenileşme*. Ankara: Pegem A Yayıncılık.

Özkalp, E. (2001). Örgütsel davranış. Eskişehir: T.C. Anadolu Üniversitesi, Eğitim, Sağlık ve Bilimsel Araştırma Çalışmaları Vakfı Yayınları. No: 149.

Özkan, Y. (2004). İşletmelerde değişime direnme ve çözüm yöntemlerinin incelenmesi. http://www.isguc.org/printout.php?id=176 adresinden 08.07.2010 tarihinde edinilmiştir.

Özmen, F. ve Sönmez Y. (2007). Değişim sürecinde eğitim örgütlerinde değişim ajanlarının rolleri. Firat Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 2 (17), 177-198.

Selçuk, A. (2004). Değişme ve yenileşme. http://atabim.sitemynet.com/hizmet2.htm adresinden 04.08.2008 tarihinde edinilmistir.

Şahin, İ. (2006). İlköğretim müfredat laboratuvar okullarında yönetim süreci. Ege Eğitim Dergisi, 6 (1), 81-93.

Şentürk, H. ve Türkmen Ö. (2009). İlköğretim okullarındaki yönetici ve öğretmenlerin toplam kalite yönetimi uygulamalarına ilişkin algıları. Dicle Üniversitesi Ziya Gökalp Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, 12, 128-142.

Taş, A. (2009). Ortaöğretim okulu müdürlerinin değişimi yönetme davranışlarına ilişkin öğretmen algılarının değerlendirilmesi. İnönü Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, 10 (2), 1-18.

Töremen, F. (2002). Eğitim örgütlerinde değişimin engel ve nedenleri. Fırat Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi, 12 (1), 185-202.

Türnüklü, A. (2000). Eğitim bilim araştırmalarında etkin olarak kullanılabilecek nitel araştırma tekniği: Görüşme. *Kuram ve Uygulamada Eğitim Yönetimi*, 24, 543-559.

Ünver, G., Bümen, N. T. ve Başbay, M. (2010). Ortaöğretim alan öğretmenliği tezsiz yüksek lisans derslerine öğretim elemanı bakışı: Ege Üniversitesi örneği. Eğitim ve Bilim Dergisi, 155 (35), 63-77.

Yaman, E. (2010). Psikoşiddete (mobbinge) maruz kalan öğretim elemanlarının örgüt kültürüne ve iklimine ilişkin algıları. Kuram ve Uygulamada Eğitim Bilimleri Dergisi, 10 (1), 449-578.

Yıldırım, N. (2007). Bir toplam kalite yönetimi uygulaması; Tokat ili Çamağzı ilköğretim okulu örneği. İnönü Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi, 8 (14), 1-16.

Yıldırım, A. ve Şimşek, H. (2003). Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri. Ankara: Seçkin Yayınları.