

Textbooks as Value-laden: A Critical Discourse Analysis of Moral Values Representation in Primary School EFL Textbooks

Ihsan Tanama Sitio^{1*}, T. Silvana Sinar², Rahmadsyah Rangkuti³

¹ Universitas Sumatera Utara, Indonesia. e-mail: ihsantsitio@gmail.com

² Universitas Sumatera Utara, Indonesia. e-mail: tengkusilvana@usu.ac.id

³ Universitas Sumatera Utara, Indonesia. e-mail: rangkuti@usu.ac.id

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT
<p>Keywords: Critical Discourse Analysis, EFL Textbooks, Moral Values, Primary School, Visual Grammar Theory</p> <p>DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.21093/ijeltal.v8i2.1515</p> <p>How to cite: Sitio, I.T., Sinar, T.S., & Rangkuti, R. (2023). Textbooks as Value-laden: A Critical Discourse Analysis of Moral Values Representation in Primary School EFL Textbooks. <i>Indonesian Journal of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics</i>, 8(2), 95-115</p>	<p><i>The inculcation of moral values in English textbooks, particularly in primary schools, has been a global concern in recent decades due to English's growing importance as a global lingua franca and the impact it carries. Hence, the present study aimed to: (1) elucidate the realisation of moral values discursively represented in three primary school English textbooks entitled English Chest 1, 2 and 3, and (2) determine the extent of the textbooks' contents in teaching the moral values. Fairclough's (1995, 2013) framework of Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) integrated with Kress & Van Leeuwen's (2006) Visual Grammar Theory (VGT) was applied to elucidate the depiction of moral values in the textbooks. Additionally, Isaacs' (2001) framework of Developmental Moral Values and Smetana's (2006) Social Domain Theory were also adopted to look at how the contents of the textbooks teach moral values. The results show that (1) modesty (8,99%), curiosity (8,44%), perseverance (7,08%), and friendship (6,53%) are the most frequently occurring values in the three EFL textbooks. (2) The discursive realisation has revealed that certain fundamental moral values such as audacity, sociability, industriousness, respect for others, and responsibility are taught through the depictions of verbal-visual images in both school and familial contexts. Importantly, the three EFL textbooks have fairly adhered to the Indonesian moral (character) education goals and stipulation. They also provide implications on both primary school students and English teachers' pedagogical, linguistic, and moral development so as to raise EFL textbook designers' awareness to develop more morally-laden content.</i></p>

1. Introduction

Textbooks are designed as a central resource for both teachers and students in the teaching and learning process (Hadar & Ruby, 2019). They occupy the most important position in the teaching and learning process since they are not only a source for obtaining specified goals and knowledge in terms of the students' needs (Cunningsworth, 1995) but also communicate information, values, and behaviors (Gebregeorgis, 2017; Setyono & Widodo, 2019). Importantly, textbooks serve a vital role in shaping morally prevalent societal values and beliefs (Ide et al., 2018; Pratiwi et al., 2023). They are undisputedly considered a vehicle for certain social values and norms which likewise foster moral attitudes and behaviors (Canh, 2017; Smith & Sheyholislami, 2022). Therefore, they are the most significant carrier of moral values (Feng, 2017; Tan et al., 2018).

The issues of moral values inculcation in pedagogical discourses, such as English textbooks (Canh, 2017; Feng, 2017; Jang, 2021; Johansson et al., 2011; Sulistiyo et al., 2020b; Widodo, 2018), have been investigated worldwide over the previous decades, such as in the USA (Althof & Berkowitz, 2006), UK (Arthur, 2005), Australia (Johansson et al., 2011), Africa (Gebregeorgis, 2017), even in the Asian contexts such as China (Feng, 2017; Gao, Zhang & Tang, 2021; Maosen, Taylor & Shaogang, 2004), Japan (Bamkin, 2018), North and South Korea (Jang, 2021; Lee & Misco, 2014), Iran (Tahririan & Sadri, 2013), Nepal (Saroj, 2020), Turkey (Alabaş, 2019), Vietnam (Canh, 2017), and Malaysia (Sidhu, Kaur & Fook, 2018; Tan, Naidu & Jamil, 2018). The core idea is that value conflicts that arise in everyday relationships throughout the globe urge pedagogical discourses for moral development. It is crucial to be able to comprehend the complexities of social circumstances and the diverse values embedded within them (Johansson et al., 2011).

A similar concern has also been gained an important place in the Indonesian context. Even though English is no longer a compulsory subject in the current 2013 National Curriculum, however, several primary schools in Indonesia include English as a locally tailored subject (Lestariyana & Widodo, 2018; Sulistiyo et al., 2020a). It was figured out that there were still few studies that were carried out to investigate and discuss the inculcation of moral values into English textbooks in such a multicultural context as Indonesia (Lestariyana & Widodo, 2018; Qoyyimah, 2016; Puspitasari et al., 2021; Sulistiyo et al., 2020a, 2020b; Widodo, 2018; Widodo et al., 2018). Most of the studies (Lestariyana & Widodo, 2018; Pratiwi et al., 2023; Puspitasari et al., 2021; Qoyyimah, 2016; Setyono & Widodo, 2019; Sulistiyo et al., 2020a, 2020b; Widodo, 2018) have analysed and investigated the inculcation of moral values in Indonesian-produced English-as-a-Foreign-Language (EFL) textbooks. However, to our knowledge so far, there has been no study that attempts to investigate the inculcation of moral values in non-Indonesian-produced EFL textbooks, yet used widely in primary school classrooms in Indonesia.

Hence, the present study aims to fill the empirical void by attempting to elucidate the representation of moral values in one of the non-Indonesian-produced EFL textbooks yet used widely in primary school classrooms in Indonesia through Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA henceforth). CDA elaborates the most effectively how a discourse expresses and produces social realities contextually bound to a certain ideological (values) system through the emergence of covert and overt signals (Johnson & McLean, 2020; Setyono & Widodo, 2019; Widodo, 2018). Since textbooks do not only communicate information and scientific

knowledge across several disciplines, but also represent ideological, social, cultural, and even political assumptions (Fairclough, 1995, 2013). Therefore, CDA is best to be applied in order to reveal such representations in school textbooks (Giaschi, 2000; Setyono & Widodo, 2019; Widodo, 2018). Thus, the present study addresses the following research questions:

1. How are moral values represented in EFL textbooks for primary school?
2. To what extent do the contents of the EFL textbooks promote and teach moral values?

2. Literature Review

2.1. Moral (Character) Education in Indonesia

Moral education has been reconfigured in numerous countries in recent years (Veugelers, 2010). It has been highlighted globally as the primary educational goal, even the most important one (Noddings, 2010), since it has the capacity to mold an individual's identity and sense of right and wrong (Halstead, 2010; Lickona, 1999). In Indonesia, the term 'moral education' is interrelatedly referred to as 'character education'. The underlying philosophy of this character education is comprehensive, encompassing both character and intellectual development (Kurniasih & Utari, 2016). Furthermore, this character education is meant to serve as a bridge to fulfilling the nation's values (Susilo et al., 2022) and placed as the foundation for achieving the vision of national development which is the establishment of a society defined by noble character, morality, ethics, culture, and civility based on the *Pancasila* ideology and the preamble to the Republic of Indonesia's 1945 Constitution (Puspitasari et al., 2021; Rokhman et al., 2014).

Therefore, the 2010 Character Education Action Plan stipulates 18 character values that should be integrated into all school subjects in Indonesia (Indonesian Ministry of National Education & Culture, 2011; Kurniasih & Utari, 2016; Qoyyimah, 2016; Rokhman et al., 2014; Widodo, 2018). They are (1) religiosity, (2) honesty, (3) tolerance, (4) self-discipline, (5) hardwork, (6) creativity, (7) independence, (8) democracy, (9) curiosity, (10) patriotism, (11) nationalism, (12) respect for others, (13) friendliness, (14) peace-loving, (15) love to read, (16) environmental sensitivity, (17) social awareness, and (18) responsibility. The purpose of the values is to form continuous individual self-improvement and train self-ability in order to lead to a better life. Throughout the integration and implementation of the values above, teachers, not only as a subject educator but also as a facilitator, are obliged to assist students in achieving the learning objectives.

2.2. Textbooks as Value-laden

Educational institutions rely on educational media to fulfill the educational goals. English textbooks, as one of the educational media, play a pivotal role to the accomplishment of language education's socially transformational goal (Canh, 2017; Elmiana, 2019). Therefore, as students' primary source of contact with the world (Johnston, 2003), the contents of English textbooks must be developed in such a way that it promotes students' experiences whilst also encouraging communication, information, and moral awareness to enhance comprehension (Feng, 2017; Heinle, 2000).

By carefully analysing the contents of the textbooks, students can learn about universal moral values and human ideals embedded in them. Practically, English textbooks will also assist teachers in teaching morality through their contents by bringing moral issues to students' attention and making them the focus of education. That is why textbooks can be regarded as

value-laden because the materials often either explicitly or implicitly present and convey morally significant messages (Johnston, 2003). Thus, it has always been the destiny of textbooks to be a bridge between students and universal moral values (Sidhu, Kaur & Fook, 2018; Widodo, 2018).

2.3. CDA on Textbooks

Textbooks, without a doubt, reflect certain hidden ideologies and agendas tied to curriculum designers and education policymakers (Canh, 2017; Curdt-Christiansen, 2015; Widodo, 2018). Through textbooks, curriculum designers and education policymakers strive to attain and instill specific values, norms, and beliefs prevalent in society through covert messages upon both teachers and students. Simultaneously, Canh (2017) asserts that textbooks are the primary ideological carriers of society's dominant values, norms, beliefs, cultures, and attitudes (p. 115).

Given the fact that certain moral values and cultural norms are covertly integrated with textbooks (English textbooks in particular), both teachers and students are often unaware of and occasionally fail to see them. Therefore, in order to reveal such implicit values and norms, Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) is best to be employed since it deciphers and elucidates the intricate relationship between discourse and social underlying ideologies (Fairclough, 2013). CDA is a multi-functional approach to researching discourse that draws from a critical theory of language that looks at language as a social practice (Fithriani, 2022b; Johnson & McLean, 2020; Widodo, 2018). In more practical terms, CDA aims to explore the social function of language, describe the linguistic processes in social terms, and reveal ideological investments in a discourse by analyzing it at three levels: text (description of verbal, visual, or even both verbal-visual signs of a text), discursive practice (interpretation of a text's production, distribution, and consumption), and social practice (explanation of a text's position in society) (Fairclough, 1995).

3. Research Methodology

3.1. Research Design

The present study employed Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) as an analytical approach to elucidate the discursive realisation of moral values represented in the textbooks. CDA was best to be applied in this study because textbooks are viewed as pedagogical discourses containing a plethora of discursive meanings conveyed through verbal and nonverbal languages (Fairclough, 2013; Sulistiyo et al., 2020b; Widodo, 2018). Moreover, Kress & Van Leeuwen's (2006) Visual Grammar Theory (VGT) was also adopted as an analytical tool to provide an essential analytical resource for empirical visual critical analysis since the present study focused on critical image analysis. In relation to CDA, VGT aims to construct linguistically-inspired tools that would allow us to better define how these nonlinguistic forms were utilised to transmit ideas, attitudes, and identities (Forrest, 2017; Kress & Van Leeuwen, 2006). Accordingly, Johnson & McLean (2020) and Wang (2014) figure out that a merger principles of CDA and VGT analytical methods can be fairly adaptable, iterative, and adaptive based on the circumstances of a specific project. Hence, examining textbooks through the lens of the integrated synthesis of CDA and VGT frameworks may reveal hidden social, political, and cultural agendas that represent hidden ideologies (Janks, 1997; Wang, 2014; Widodo et al., 2018).

3.2. Research Context

Indonesian context was purposefully chosen as the focus of analysis in this study because moral values remains a prevalent issue in this country. Indonesia's slogan, "*Bhinneka Tunggal Ika* (Unity in Diversity)", reflects the country's diverse cultures and ethnic groups with the majority of its people coexisting peacefully (Setiadi, 2006). It is academically interesting to probe whether such values and virtues are reflected in written materials, particularly school textbooks in Indonesia (the ones which are non-Indonesian produce in particular) and whether they are appropriate to Indonesian contexts.

3.3. Research Data Corpus

The data in the present study were all verbal-visual artefacts taken from a series of English-as-a-Foreign-Language (EFL) textbooks entitled *English Chest 1, 2, and 3* which were the data sources. Authored by Liana Robinson and published by Compass Publishing, the material in the textbooks has been aligned with the Indonesian national curriculum and syllabus yet still meets two international standards, namely: the Common European Framework of Reference for Languages (CEFR) and Cambridge English Language Assessment. Essentially, the textbooks were selected as the data sources because of the following justifications:

1. They were written and produced by non-Indonesian author and publisher yet used in most primary school EFL classrooms in Indonesia. Therefore, the inculcation of moral values into the textbooks needs to be critically evaluated to determine whether they meet the standard of a reliable textbook and are appropriate to the Indonesian context.
2. They comprise rich verbal-visual artefacts representing moral values which are considered important for Indonesian primary school students. Verbal-visual images in school textbooks stimulate students' curiosity and encourage more creative and critical language learning (Elmiana, 2019; Tahririan & Sadri, 2013). Additionally, Boling et al. (2004) assert that instructional verbal-visual artefacts (images) are frequently positioned in meaningful contexts that provide clues that may aid students' understanding of the images and the learning context.
3. Grade 1, 2, and 3 of the textbooks were intentionally chosen to be analysed because in the age range of 3-9 years, the process of child growth and development accelerates significantly whereas such years are called 'the golden age range' (Santrock, 2020). In the context of Indonesian primary schooling system, the first year starts from the age of 6 (first grade), to be continued to the age of 7 (second grade), and then to the age of 8 (third grade) (Alatas et al., 2013), therefore, those ages include in the above-mentioned golden age range of years (3-9). During this period, as added by Santrock (2020), children have the potential to learn many things and think as logically as they can when applied to concrete examples and they begin to integrate moral and other notions, resulting in more complex and flexible moral evaluation.

3.4. Data Analysis Procedures

In order to answer each of the research questions, analytical procedures were necessarily and carefully carried out in order to analyse the data. To answer the first research question, a general frequency count (percentage) was conducted to determine whether the verbal-visual artefacts represent certain moral values by counting and tabulating the data in Excel worksheets. Adopting Isaacs' (2001) framework of developmental moral values, we first determined the moral values contained in the verbal-visual artefacts.

After the general frequency count was done, a Critical Discourse Analysis following Fairclough’s (1995, 2013) framework of description (verbal-visual analysis), interpretation (discursive analysis), and explanation (socio-cultural analysis) was conducted in order to answer the second research question. Along with the analysis, Kress & Van Leeuwen’s (2006) framework of representational, interactive, and compositional metafunctions was simultaneously occupied to visually elucidate and describe the depiction of the verbal-visual artefacts. Additionally, Smetana’s (2006) Social Domain Theory was adopted to look at how the contents of the selected textbooks teach and convey moral values. In this respect, it is necessary to underline that “the examination and interpretation of an image are subjective” (Giaschi, 2000, p. 37). Therefore, it must be acknowledged that the interpretations in this study, under the different eyes of writer, may have been varied and different since it is a characteristic inherent to qualitative research.

3.5. Trustworthiness

For the purpose of the reliability and credibility of this study, inter-rater agreement and peer-debriefing were used in order to test the interpretative and factual accuracy as well as provide evidence of both credibility and confirmability. Two fellow researchers with expertise in both CDA and moral values in educational materials were invited to serve as the raters and debriefers to assess whether or not one or more key points were missing, overemphasised, or repeated in the analysis. In this regard, we scheduled several meetings with the raters/debriefers. Here, the raters/debriefers acted as a sort of critical detective to review and evaluate the aspects that need more detailed evaluation of the analysis.

4. Findings

4.1. Moral Values in the EFL Textbooks

A moral value-based coding of the three selected EFL textbooks was carefully carried out to answer the first research question. Following Isaacs’ (2001) framework of Developmental Moral Values, the results varied from one textbook to the others, as displayed in the following Table 1.

Table 1: The Frequency (displayed in percentage) of the Moral Values

Moral Values	English Chest 1		English Chest 2		English Chest 3		Total Freq.	Total %
	Freq.	%	Freq.	%	Freq.	%		
Obedience	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%
Sincerity	7	5,34%	5	4,46%	8	6,45%	20	5,44%
Orderliness	5	3,81%	3	2,67%	7	5,64%	15	4,08%
Fortitude	3	2,29%	2	1,78%	0	0%	5	1,36%
Perseverance	12	9,16%	5	4,46%	9	7,25%	26	7,08%
Industriousness	8	6,10%	6	5,35%	3	2,41%	17	4,63%
Patience	0	0%	1	0,89%	0	0%	1	0,27%
Responsibility	0	0%	1	0,89%	2	1,61%	3	0,81%
Justice	0	0%	1	0,89%	0	0%	1	0,27%
Generosity	2	1,52%	2	1,78%	2	1,61%	6	1,63%
Modesty	11	8,39%	10	8,92%	12	9,67%	33	8,99%
Moderation	1	0,76%	4	3,57%	1	0,80%	6	1,63%
Simplicity	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%
Sociability	10	7,63%	7	6,25%	6	4,83%	23	6,26%

Friendship	12	9,16%	7	6,25%	5	4,03%	24	6,53%
Respect for others	1	0,76%	1	0,89%	4	3,22%	6	1,63%
Patriotism	0	0%	0	0%	4	3,22%	4	1,08%
Prudence	0	0%	1	0,89%	1	0,80%	2	0,54%
Flexibility	2	1,52%	2	1,78%	6	4,83%	10	2,72%
Understanding	6	4,58%	5	4,46%	6	4,83%	17	4,63%
Loyalty	2	1,52%	0	0%	0	0%	2	0,54%
Audacity	5	3,81%	4	3,57%	2	1,61%	11	2,99%
Humility	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%
Optimism	1	0,76%	1	0,89%	1	0,80%	3	0,81%
Religiosity	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%
Honesty	5	3,81%	6	5,35%	1	0,80%	12	3,26%
Tolerance	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%	0	0%
Curiosity	8	6,10%	12	10,71%	11	8,87%	31	8,44%
Self-discipline	3	2,29%	2	1,78%	5	4,03%	10	2,72%
Hard work	4	3,05%	3	2,67%	6	4,83%	13	3,54%
Creativity	3	2,29%	3	2,67%	4	3,22%	10	2,72%
Friendliness	9	6,87%	7	6,25%	5	4,03%	21	5,72%
Independence	8	6,10%	6	5,35%	4	3,22%	18	4,90%
Democracy	3	2,29%	5	4,46%	5	4,03%	13	3,54%
Nationalism	0	0%	0	0%	2	1,61%	2	0,54%
Love to read	0	0%	0	0%	1	0,80%	1	0,27%
Environmental sensitivity	0	0%	0	0%	1	0,80%	1	0,27%
Total	131	100%	112	100%	124	100%	367	100%

The discrepancies in the proportion of moral values represented in the three EFL textbooks suggest that each textbook puts a greater focus on a specific set of values that must be inculcated in primary school students at the relevant age. As displayed in Table 1, *English Chest 1* emphasises on the perseverance (9,16%), friendship (9,16%), and modesty (8,39%) values. As for *English Chest 2*, the textbook emphasises on the curiosity (10,71%) and modesty (8,92%) values. Whereas for *English Chest 3*, the textbook emphasises on the modesty (9,67%) and curiosity (8,87%) values.

4.2. Discursive Representation of the Moral Values in the EFL Textbooks

Moral development is a socio-affective process involving an intricate interaction between individuals and their social surroundings (Smetana, 2006). The depiction of moral values in school textbooks has always been deemed pivotal because it is a means to convey ethical and moral behaviours to students, especially at the primary schooling level. More, Puspitasari et al. (2021) assert that primary school children are constantly engaged with educational textbooks, so the contents of their textbooks should be well-enlightened to them by the teachers (p.5). Due to space limitation, only 5 most fundamental and relevant discourses were chosen for in-depth analysis.

To begin with, a visual description of the verbal-visual images was carried out as part of Fairclough's (1995, 2013) Critical Discourse Analysis. Following Kress & Van Leeuwen's (2006) Visual Grammar Theory, we thoroughly analysed the verbal-visual images based on the representational, interactive, and compositional functions of the selected images, as displayed in the following Table 2.

Table 2: The Description of the Verbal-Visual Images

Figure	Unit & Page	Source	Description	Moral Values
1	Unit 1 (Lesson 2) Page 22	English Chest 1	Seven participants (five boys and two girls) are in a classroom setting. Interactively, a boy (on the left side) seems standing up in front of the other pupils (on the right side), displaying a drawing of his family and describing it pleasantly. The gaze among participants performs an 'offer' (demands no attention from the viewer to be involved) to the standing boy and otherwise showing that they are paying attention (showing respect) whilst their peer is speaking.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Audacity • Respect for others • Creativity
2	Unit 3 (Lesson 2) Page 71	English Chest 1	Two participants (a boy and a girl) are in a long shot of three frames. The salience of a boy who seems falling down on a pile of boxes grabs viewer's attention. The symbols are dominated by the pile of boxes which can be assumed that both participants are in a store or other indoor settings. Interactively, the gaze between participants performs an 'offer' (demands no attention from the viewer to be involved) showing that the girl is having fortitude to help the boy.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sociability • Fortitude
3	Unit 1 (Lesson 4) Page 32	English Chest 3	Three participants (a girl is on the left side, a boy is in the middle, and a father is on the right side of the frame) are in a kitchen (setting) as evidenced from the symbols (a sink on the left side, a dining table and dishes on the bottom-right side of the frame). The high colour saturation of the participants' bodies and surrounding makes the image present a real circumstance. Interactively, the gaze among participants performs an 'offer' (demands no attention from the viewer to be involved) which seem delightful doing the actions they are doing (the girl is washing the dishes, the boy and the father are enjoying their breakfast).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Industriousness • Responsibility • Sincerity
4	Unit 3 (Lesson 4) Page 83	English Chest 2	Three participants (two girls and a mother) are in a long shot of three frames. The symbols of the top-centre frame (flowers, butterflies, a cat) indicate that they are in an outdoor setting, whereas the symbols of the bottom-right frame (a dining table with hamburgers, salad, and corn) indicate that they are already inside the house. Interactively, the gaze among participants performs an 'offer' (demands no attention from the viewer to be involved) in which the mother seems asking her daughters to have lunch (seen from the dialogue).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Modesty • Generosity • Responsibility • Sincerity
5	Unit 3 (Lesson 4) Page 84	English Chest 3	Four participants (a boy, a mother, a father, and a girl) are in a dining room (setting) as evidenced by the symbols (a dining table, meals, and drinks). The close proximity among participants shows warmth and sincerity. Interactively, the gaze among participants performs an 'offer' (demands no attention from the viewer to be involved). The facial expressions of the participants are smiling indicating happiness among them.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Understanding • Sincerity • Modesty • Generosity

Furthermore, both discursive interpretation and explanation of the verbal-visual images within larger social and cultural contexts were then carried out as part of Fairclough's (1995, 2013) Critical Discourse Analysis. During these stages, the images were thoroughly elucidated based on how viewers unconsciously assimilate hidden ideologies and agendas that are intentionally encoded in the images.

1. Encouraging audacity at school and showing respect for others

Audacity is a part of virtue that helps children to engage on great undertakings and makes them convinced that they can achieve something worthwhile in any situation (Isaacs, 2001). This value also helps children to recognise their potentialities and beyond, which any parent desires their children to possess. Visually, in Figure 1, a boy is standing up in front of his classmates showing a drawing of his own family. As seen from the monologue, the boy is explaining each person in the drawing to his classmates delightfully as he is smiling (seen from the gaze). Linguistically, the declarative sentences "she is my sister" and "he is my dad" show that the boy is having a confidence when explaining what he has drawn. The possessive adjective "my" supports the evidence that the boy recognises the exact member of his own family. Semiotically, this portrayal denotes a value of audacity in school context. As seen in Figure 1, a school is seen as an avenue for teaching the value of being audacious to primary school children particularly the first graders, since the image is located on the textbook for first grade (English Chest 1). This is also in line with Smetana (2006) and Puspitasari et al. (2021), who state that school is a place where students develop their moral awareness and judgements.

In the context of Indonesian society, some first-year primary school children may lack of confidence in meeting their new classmates and peers on the first day of school. Therefore, most of the primary-school-children parents involve themselves in taking their children to school (Yulianti, Denessen & Droop, 2019). Through this portrayal, teachers can teach and encourage their students (particularly the first graders) that they should be audacious anywhere and in any situation starting from the school (classroom in particular). Ideologically, through this portrayal, the author of the textbook implicitly emphasises and echoes that first-year primary school students should learn to be audacious in their school. The standing boy who is audaciously mentioning the picture of his family becomes the locus of attention for primary students to behave audaciously.



Figure 1. Source: English Chest 1, p. 22

Moreover, the value of respect for others is implicitly portrayed in the image as well. Respect for others is the state of refraining from disrespecting others according to their rights, status, or circumstances (Isaacs, 2001). It is also an important value in Indonesian society. Visually, in Figure 1, the other students who are sitting on their seats (on the right side) seem to be pleasantly paying attention to their classmate (the standing boy on the left) while he is showing and describing his drawing, waiting for their turn to do the same. None of them seem to be talking to each other or be distracted by other activities. They could just talk to each other since the situation indicates that they are in a first-day of school (they are introducing their own selves), but they keep listening and paying attention to the boy. This denotes that they are showing respect for their peer who is talking in front of the classroom even when their teacher is not there to instruct them. Such a portrayal is important to be taught and enlightened to students by the teacher since the value of respect for others reflects the second principle of Pancasila, "Just and Civilised Humanity". It has also been a custom in Indonesia to have respect for others if someone wants other people to have respect for themselves. One of the examples has been shown in the image above; you should pay careful attention to others when they are talking because they will do the same to you. Such a portrayal is necessarily important since the intertwining of emotions of respect and concept of social relationships results in children's moral adjustments in this age (Smetana, 2006).

2. Developing sociability and fortitude in social context

Sociability or social awareness is also a very important value in Indonesian society. It is the state of managing to communicate and deal with other people through genuine interest (Isaacs, 2001). It is also the virtue that makes Indonesia well-known worldwide (Setiadi, 2006). As seen in Figure 2, a boy seems to be accidentally falling down on a pile of boxes. A girl, who is in the same area as the boy, then rushes to help him immediately. Depicted in three different frames, the verbal-visual artefact shows primary school children how to have social awareness amongst peers and friends. Linguistically, the interrogative sentence "are you OK?" amplifies the portrayal of care and awareness that the girl possesses of other people (in this case the boy) in a social environment. This portrayal shows the value of sociability and constantly relates to the context of Indonesian society. Socio-culturally, it has been the habit of Indonesian people to always show their social awareness by helping others who are in need of help, even when they are not asked. Social awareness or sociability is also included into one of the 18 core character values by Indonesian Ministry of National Education and Culture. Indonesian government thinks that students are essentially expected to have and show social awareness because it helps them build positive relationships and make responsible decisions (Puntaswari & Mukminan, 2020; Qoyyimah, 2016).

The discourse of having social awareness in the textbook encourages textbook readers and primary school students to embrace socio-cultural ideology by having an awareness of social surroundings and willingness to help others who are in need. This agrees with what Diana et al. (2022), Jang (2021), and Tan, Naidu & Jamil (2018) state that having sociability or social awareness promotes good individuality and citizenship. This value is essential because when children can be socially aware means that they understand how to react to different social scenarios, and they can adapt their interactions to achieve the best results in any situation (Smetana, 2006). Ideologically, the textbook author wants to put a focus on having social awareness and higher emotional intelligence for it is essentially important for primary school students to possess.



Figure 2. Source: English Chest 1, p. 71

More, Figure 2 portrays the value of fortitude as well. Fortitude is a moral value that encourages a person to endure hardship and attempt to behave positively in order to overcome obstacles and strives in a tough circumstance (Isaacs, 2001). Visually, in Figure 2, the girl is attempting to get the boy up on his feet. Linguistically, the expression "I'll help you" shows a firm intention to help her peer, no matter how hectic and hard the circumstance or how heavy the boy is to her. Importantly, the interaction between the girl and the boy in the image can be viewed as the locus of attention, underscoring shared gender emancipation to signify that a female (a girl) is also capable of helping a male (a boy). Ideologically, through this portrayal, the author of the textbooks intends to convey and teach primary school students that even though you are a female (a girl), you have to be strong and tough and can still help others who are in need, whether they are females or even males, and whether they are larger or smaller in size. That is, this verbal-visual artefact portrays the value of fortitude in social context.

In the context of Indonesian society, having fortitude is necessarily required for any child to possess. Most of the parents want their children to be ready to face challenges, learn to help others, and overcome simple problems (Dunn, 2013). Both Isaacs (2001) and Smetana (2006) also suggest that the virtue of fortitude should be established by children (or at least be taught to them) at an early age. Therefore, through this portrayal, teachers can teach and enlighten the primary school students to have fortitude anywhere and in any situation starting from helping their peers because it is the responsibility of all people to help others. Thus, children may learn that people must help each other.

3. Nurturing industriousness and being responsible in familial context

Industriousness can be defined as the capacity to diligently carry out a series of activities and stay with it until it is done. It is a personality trait that defines a person's diligence, determination, and persistence (Isaacs, 2001). Visually, Figure 3 portrays a common familial

circumstance where a girl (on the left side) seems to be washing the dishes delightfully (seen from the gaze) and both of her father and little brother (on the right side) are enjoying the meals. Such a portrayal represents the value of industriousness in home sphere. The author of the textbooks may want to convey that children should be industrious starting from a family (at home). This is also in line with what Puspitasari et al. (2021) state that a family serves as an avenue for instilling moral virtues and reasoning in children (p.6).

Socio-culturally, in most Indonesian families, the girls are taught to be able to take care of the domestic chores (Fithriani, 2022a) when they reach the age of 6-7. Interactively, the smile on the face of the girl indicates that the textbook author does not want to portray a forced action but rather to demonstrate that the activities of doing the chores should be done willingly and with pleasure. Therefore, the teachers can teach their students that they, not only females but also males, should be industrious at home. Through this portrayal, teachers can also reinforce how a child is supposed to behave in a family (Puspitasari et al., 2021; Smetana, 2006).



Figure 3. Source: English Chest 3, p. 32

Figure 3 portrays the value of responsibility as well. As seen in the image, the girl is kindly washing the dishes without being forced by her parents or anyone in the image. The act of washing the dishes may be the girl's habit at home regardless of her parent's command or request. This indicates that she takes responsibility to do the chores in order to help her parents at home, since, as seen, she is the eldest child in the family. The statement "[I'm] washing the dishes" uttered by the girl which will be filled by the students as a task, denotes a positive 'affect' (Martin & White, 2005) towards the activity. The deployment of this positive attitudinal discourse can be an effective way of instilling the value of being responsible in primary school students. Teaching children to be responsible at an early age will also stimulate them to be aware of their obligation and duty as a child as well as develop their descriptive understanding of the nature of reality (Isaacs, 2001; Smetana, 2006). This is also in line with what Puspitasari et al. (2021) state that a family and home sphere serve as an avenue for instilling moral virtues and reasoning in children (p.6). Children will develop a moral sense to shape their moral behaviour and attitudes towards others starting from their families (Smetana, 2006). Therefore, through this portrayal, English teachers can explain

their students that being responsible should be started from their own homes simply by helping their parents to do the domestic chores.

4. Teaching modest and generous behaviours at home

Modesty is a virtue or state of being courteous and respectful to others and attempting to behave accordingly (Isaacs, 2001). It is a very important value in Indonesian society because it reflects the second principle of Pancasila, "Just and Civilised Humanity". This moral value should be possessed by any child in the world because being modest means behaving morally and ethically appropriate with others, especially with their parents and elderly people. Visually, in Figure 4, a mother seems to inquire her daughters whether they would like to have lunch or not. The word "sure!" replied by one of the daughters shows that they positively want to have lunch. However, both of the daughters do not look at their mother when they answer their mother's question. In the context of Indonesian society, this action is ethically inappropriate. Socio-culturally, the youngsters should directly look at the face when they talk to elderly people, especially their parents (Setiadi, 2006; Sulistiyo et al., 2020b). As younger people, it is a responsibility for students to align themselves to the accepted moral values. Therefore, teachers, as the moral agent, are the one to educate and enlighten them to always show social respect to the elderly people.

In this respect, Figure 4 portrays another value of modesty towards parents that should be taught to student as well. When the mother inquires her daughters again whether they want to have pizza or hamburgers as meals, one of the daughters replies: "hamburgers, please!" and she looks at her mother too. The word 'please' denotes a polite request performed by the daughter to her mother. This portrayal shows that the daughter is courteously requesting her mother that she wants to have hamburgers as the meal for lunch. Through this portrayal, the textbooks author would possibly like to reinforce that showing politeness to parents is morally an obligation for children in any social contexts.



Figure 4. Source: English Chest 3, p. 83

Furthermore, the value of generosity is depicted in Figure 4 as well. Being generous means deliberately and willingly doing something for the benefit of others (Isaacs, 2001). The value of generosity also reflects the image of Indonesian people (Setiadi, 2006). As seen in the bottom-right frame, the mother and her daughters seem to be enjoying the lunch. One of her daughter asks her sister: "Would you like some corn?", while she is kindly offering a bowl of corn to her sister. Semantically, such an expression indicates a generous offer performed by the girl to her sister (Kreidler, 1998). The portrayal above implicitly teaches students to be generous towards their siblings. As seen in the sibling-to-sibling interaction, the textbook author may intend to build a strategy to develop children's moral awareness and understanding through such distinct lexical choices as "Would you like some corn?" followed by the reply "Yes, please. I love corn!" performing a harmonious sibling relationship. This accords with what Smetana (2006) states that sibling-to-sibling interaction and relationships play an important role in the significance of children's moral development (p.343). In this respect, children may have learned that being generous should be nurtured at an early age and it starts from their own siblings.

5. Accentuating a sense of understanding and sincerity in the family

Understanding is basically a state of having a desire to do kindness and be thoughtful toward others (Isaacs, 2001). It is occasionally neglected by many people but it is fundamentally important for children to possess this particular virtue in their daily lives because it is a factor that motivates prosocial behaviours toward others (Smetana, 2006). As seen in Figure 5, a nuclear family seems to be enjoying a breakfast where a boy is kindly offering a plate of pancakes to his mother. The pancakes may be baked by the boy and he serves it to his mother where she sits still enjoying her cup of tea. This implies a value of understanding toward parents as the boy lets his mother sitting on the chair while he serves the meal. The expression "Would [you like some] pancakes?" uttered by the boy which will be filled by the students as a task shows a positive 'affect' (Martin & White, 2005) toward the activity. The image reinforces that any child should show a sense of understanding to his parents.

Not only does the boy kindly serve some meals to his mother, but the father (on the right side) also seems to be offering a glass of pineapple juice to her daughter. A smile on the father's face (seen from the gaze) denotes a kind desire to do such a thing. This portrayal implicitly depicts the value of understanding as well. Traditionally, it is often the domestic responsibility of a female (a mother in particular) to prepare the daily meals at home (Fithriani, 2022a; Giaschi, 2000; Setiadi, 2006). However, semiotically, the image represents the phenomenon of gender evolution in a familial context where a father and a son prepare meals for the family demonstrating an egalitarian ideology in which both men and women should have equal roles in every social context, specifically at home (Puspitasari et al., 2021). Depicted horizontally in a mid-shot frame, this verbal-visual artefact represents a sense of togetherness in a nuclear family as well in which students may learn that children should engage themselves in helping their parents at home. This is also in line with what Smetana (2006) and Dunn (2013) state that a family serves as an avenue for instilling moral values in children. Further, the textbooks author may likely suggest that serving meals together is a bonding activity that must be frequently practiced by family members.



Figure 5. Source: English Chest 3, p. 84

Moreover, the value of sincerity is depicted in Figure 5 as well. Visually, both the boy and the father kindly prepare the meals and offer them to the mother and the daughter. They let the mother sit still enjoying the meals while they *tirelessly serve them to her*. This indicates the value of sincerity in a family. Sincerity is the state of being truthful and honest toward others and free of deceit and hypocrisy (Isaacs, 2001). As seen in the image, the boy and the father act sincerely that they want to prepare the meals for the family by themselves. They may have understood that the mother has tirelessly done such things (cooking and preparing meals for the family) day by day so they kindly let her free of the responsibilities for a day or two. This also shows the pedagogy of father-led parenting in which a father serves as a role model while preparing and serving meals (Puspitasari et al., 2021). In this respect, students may learn to have sincerity and care for each member of the family. Through this portrayal, the author of the textbooks may assume that every children has to show care and attention as well as act sincerely to their parents. In support of this, teachers can also encourage and educate their students to be sincere and show care toward their parents at home because being sincerely care for parent is a noble obligation for any child worldwide.

5. Discussion

Despite the textbooks are non-Indonesian produced, the discursive analysis indicates that a certain number of moral values are embedded in the verbal-visual contents of the textbooks that still relate to the contexts of Indonesian society. The four most dominant values—modesty, curiosity, perseverance, and friendship—consecutively occurred within the three textbooks are slightly different from what Imelwaty et al. (2022), Pratiwi et al. (2023), Puspitasari et al. (2021), Sulistiyo et al. (2020b), Tan, Naidu & Jamil (2018), and Widodo (2018) found, since each and every textbook from different authors and publishers ideologically present and promote different and particular moral values. Such discrepancies in the proportion of moral values mostly represented in those textbooks indicate that they put a greater focus on a certain set of values that the textbook authors and designers want students to inculcate based on the relevant age. It was figured out that there are several values that do not occur within the textbooks analysed in the present study, yet they are found in the textbooks analysed in the previous studies and vice versa. For instance, the value of religiosity is mostly occurring in Puspitasari et al. (2021), Sulistiyo et al. (2020b), Widodo (2018),

Qoyyimah (2016) studies since the textbooks they analysed are Indonesian-produced. Socio-historically, Indonesia is one of the world's most religious countries in which each and every Indonesian is required to embrace one of the six official religions (Haryanto, 2019). However, such a value is not found within the textbooks being analysed in the present study.

Regarding the characters presented in the textbooks, they seem to have blond and ginger hair. There are only a few characters who come up with black or coloured hair. Likewise, the complexion of the characters is mostly white referring to the Caucasian race due to the fact that the textbooks are Western-produced. This differs from what Puspitasari et al. (2021), Sulistiyo et al. (2020b), Setyono & Widodo (2019), and Widodo (2018) found out that the characters in the textbooks they analysed are depicted quite similarly as in the context of Indonesian society (wearing veils and white-grey uniforms denoting an Indonesian senior high school context). That is because the textbooks they analysed are Indonesian-produced particularly published by the Ministry of Education and Culture (Puspitasari et al., 2021; Setyono & Widodo, 2019; Widodo, 2018).

6. Conclusion

The present study has provided understanding on moral values representation in non-Indonesian-produced EFL textbooks for primary school students. Despite the images portrayed are mostly Western-related especially on the depiction of the characters (the hair is mostly yellowish and ginger) and the main course of the daily meals (hamburgers, salads, saussages), the author of the textbooks presented a numerous morally-laden contents within the textbooks which still relate to the context of Indonesian society. She emphasises more on encouraging audacious and industrious behaviours in both school and family contexts, teaching modesty and responsibility at home, so as to demonstrate to have social awareness in social contexts. Essentially, the majority of the images in the textbooks are real or non-fictional depictions of social events and activities. Non-fiction or authentic piece of information are intended to support students in learning language (English in particular) in real-life situations (Halstead, 2010; Sulistiyo et al., 2020b).

The findings of the present study suggest that integrating moral lessons into English lessons may be an effective way to instil moral values in the children's minds. Importantly, this Critical Discourse study has provided a better understanding of how non-Indonesian EFL textbook authors integrate moral values into teaching materials both verbally and visually. In this respect, it must be noted that learning language should go beyond more than just learning the skills like grammar, vocabulary, and translation; it must also engage students to develop their moral awareness and judgement. In regard to primary education, EFL teachers, without a doubt, must clearly enlighten the morally-laden materials to the students so that their moral awareness can be cultivated well. Further, it is necessarily obliged for textbook designers and publishers to construct and develop more morally-laden contents. Another implication is that EFL teachers should provide tasks to help students develop their moral awareness and identity.

The findings of the present study also imply and highlight the need to relate the classroom context to the wider social context with a focus on morally social transformation through language education (Canh, 2017; Imelwaty et al., 2022). Hence, further studies on moral values in language textbooks (English in particular) are necessarily required to be done to

provide more insightful understanding upon the dynamic construction of students' moral identities and awareness and the development of their 'intercultural citizenship'. Methodologically, to extend the study, other aspects and approaches to CDA (e.g. gender inequality, inter- and multiculturalism, multimodality, critical morality, critical feminist analysis) should be the research agenda for extending studies on textbook analysis probing into ideological, sociocultural and historical agendas.

References

- Alabaş, R. (2019). Moral values in school textbooks during the second constitution and early republican periods: The case of the lectures on morality. *International Online Journal of Educational Sciences*, 11(3). <https://doi.org/10.15345/iojes.2019.03.006>
- Alatas, H., Brinkman, S., Chu Chang, M., Hadiyati, T., Hartono, D., Hasan, A., Hysun, M., Jung, H., Kinnell, A., Pradhan, M., & Roesli, R. (2013). Early childhood education and development services in Indonesia. In *Education in Indonesia* (pp. 82-108). Institute of Southeast Asian Studies. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1355/9789814459877-010>
- Althof, W., & Berkowitz, M. W. (2006). Moral education and character education: Their relationship and roles in citizenship education. *Journal of Moral Education*, 35(4), 495-518. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057240601012204>
- Arthur, J. (2005). The re-emergence of character education in British education policy. *British Journal of Educational Studies*, 53(3), 239-254. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8527.2005.00293.x>
- Bamkin, S. (2018). Reforms to strengthen moral education in Japan: A preliminary analysis of implementation in schools. *Contemporary Japan*, 30(1), 78-96. <https://doi.org/10.1080/18692729.2018.1422914>
- Boling, E., Eccarius, M., Smith, K., & Frick, T. (2004). Instructional illustrations: Intended meanings and learner interpretations. *Journal of Visual Literacy*, 24(2), 185-204. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23796529.2004.11674612>
- Canh, L. V. (2017). A critical analysis of moral values in Vietnam-produced EFL textbooks for upper secondary schools. In *Situating Moral and Cultural Values in ELT Materials* (pp. 111-129). Springer, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-63677-1_7
- Cunningsworth, A. (1995). *Choosing Your Course Book*. Heinemann English Language Teaching.
- Curdt-Christiansen, X. L. (2015). Ideological tensions and contradictions in lower primary English teaching materials in Singapore. In *Language, ideology and education* (pp. 129-144). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315814223>
- Diana, M. W., Wilupi, A. Y. T., Setiawan, D., & Nurhajati, D. (2022). Enhancing social awareness through Total Physical Response (TPR) in teaching English at elementary school. *English Education: Journal of English Teaching and Research*, 7(1), 1-9. <https://doi.org/10.29407/jetar.v7i1.17460>
- Dunn, J. (2013). Moral development in early childhood and social interaction in the family. In *Handbook of Moral Development* (pp. 135-159). Psychology Press.
- Elmiana, D. S. (2019). Pedagogical representation of visual images in EFL textbooks: A multimodal perspective. *Pedagogy, Culture & Society*, 27(4), 613-628. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14681366.2019.1569550>
- Fairclough, N. (1995). *Critical Discourse Analysis: The Critical Study of Language*. Longman.
- Fairclough, N. (2013). *Critical Discourse Analysis: The Critical Study of Language*. Routledge.
- Indonesian Journal of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics*, 8(2), 2023

- Feng, W. D. (2017). Infusing moral education into English language teaching: An ontogenetic analysis of social values in EFL textbooks in Hong Kong. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 40(4), 458-473. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01596306.2017.1356806>
- Fithriani, R. (2022a). Gender stereotypes in educational texts: A comparative study of Indonesian and international primary English textbooks. *Discourse and Interaction*, 15(2), 53-76. <https://doi.org/10.5817/DI2022-2-53>
- Fithriani, R. (2022b). Gender portrayals in Indonesian and International English language textbooks for primary students: A critical image analysis. *MEXTESOL*, 46(4), 1-13. https://www.mextesol.net/journal/index.php?page=journal&id_article=46388
- Forrest, S. (2017). How does it make me feel?: Using visual grammar to interact with picturebooks. *Literacy Learning: The Middle Years*, 25(1), 41-52. <https://search.informit.org/doi/10.3316/informit.596868412539517>
- Gao, D., Zhang, L., & Tang, Y. (2021). Learning-centered moral education in textbooks and teaching practices. In *Explorations of Chinese Moral Education Curriculum and Textbooks* (pp. 67-103). Springer Singapore. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-16-1937-3_3
- Gebregeorgis, M. Y. (2017). Peace values in language textbooks: The case of English for Ethiopia student textbook. *Journal of Peace Education*, 14(1), 54-68. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17400201.2016.1228526>
- Giaschi, P. (2000). Gender positioning in education: A critical image analysis of ESL texts. *TESL Canada Journal*, 32-46. <https://doi.org/10.18806/tesl.v18i1.898>
- Hadar, L. L., & Ruby, T. L. (2019). Cognitive opportunities in textbooks: The cases of grade four and eight textbooks in Israel. *Mathematical Thinking and Learning*, 21(1), 54-77. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10986065.2019.1564968>
- Halstead, J. M. (2010). In Clauss-Ehlers, C. S. (Eds.) *Encyclopedia of cross-cultural school psychology*. Springer Science & Business Media.
- Haryanto, S. (2019). The sociological context of religion in Indonesia. *Research in the Social Scientific Study of Religion*, 30, 67-102. https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004416987_006
- Heinle, T. (2000). *Designing Language Courses: A Guide for Teachers*. Kathleen Graves.
- Ide, T., Kirchheimer, J., & Bentrovato, D. (2018). School textbooks, peace and conflict: An introduction. *Global Change, Peace & Security*, 30(3), 287-294. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14781158.2018.1505717>
- Imelwaty, S., Gunawan, F., Kuraedah, S., Mardiana, W., Wardhana, D. E. C., & Boulahnane, S. (2022). Moral values in Indonesian primary school thematic textbooks: The marrying of language appraisal and moral foundation theories. *Education*, 3-13, 1-13. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03004279.2022.2120771>
- Indonesian Ministry of National Education and Culture. (2011). *Character Education Guidelines*. Puskurbuk.
- Isaacs, D. (2001). *Character Building: A Guide for Parents and Teachers*. Four Courts Press.
- Jang, S. B. (2021). Discursive construction of social selfhood: An analysis of North Korean elementary moral education textbooks. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 1-13. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01596306.2021.1896991>
- Janks, H. (1997). Critical discourse analysis as a research tool. *Discourse: Studies in the Cultural Politics of Education*, 18(3), 329-342. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0159630970180302>
- Johansson, E., Brownlee, J., Cobb-Moore, C., Boulton-Lewis, G., Walker, S., & Ailwood, J. (2011). Practices for teaching moral values in the early years: A call for a pedagogy of

- participation. *Education, Citizenship and Social Justice*, 6 (2), 109-124
<https://doi.org/10.1177%2F1746197910397914>
- Johnson, M. N. P., & McLean, E. (2020). Discourse analysis. *International Encyclopedia of Human Geography (Second Edition)*, 377-383. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-08-102295-5.10814-5>
- Johnston, B. (2003). *Values in English Language Teaching*. Taylor & Francis.
- Kreidler, C. W. (1998). *Introducing English Semantics*. USA: Psychology Press.
- Kress, G., & Van Leeuwen, T. (2006). *Reading Images: The Grammar of Visual Design*. 2nd. Ed. Routledge.
- Kurniasih, H., & Utari, V. Y. (2016). Character education policy and its implications for learning in Indonesia's education system. *Research on Improving Systems of Education*, 1-7.
- Lee, L., & Misco, T. (2014). All for one or one for all: An analysis of the concepts of patriotism and others in multicultural Korea through elementary moral education textbooks. *The Asia-Pacific Education Researcher*, 23(3), 727-734 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40299-013-0146-1>
- Lestariyana, R. P. D., & Widodo, H. P. (2018). Engaging young learners of English with digital stories: Learning to mean. *The Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 8(2), 489-495. <https://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v8i2.13314>
- Lickona, T. (1999). Character education: Seven crucial issues. *Action in Teacher Education*, 20(4), 77-84. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01626620.1999.10462937>
- Maosen, L., Taylor, M. J., & Shaogang, Y. (2004). Moral education in Chinese societies: Changes and challenges. *Journal of Moral Education*, 33(4), 405-428. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0305724042000327975>
- Martin, J. R., & White, P. R. (2005). *The Language of Evaluation*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Noddings, N. (2010). Moral education in an age of globalization. *Educational Philosophy and Theory*, 42(4), 390-396. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-5812.2008.00487.x>
- Pratiwi, Y., Andajani, K., Suyitno, I., Ismail, A., & Prastio, B. (2023). Representing and implementing moral values in foreign students in Indonesia textbooks for learners other than Indonesians. *International Journal of language Education*, 7(1), 58-76. <https://doi.org/10.26858/ijole.v1i1.36256>
- Puntaswari, N. C., & Mukminan. (2020). Promoting good citizenship in the social studies course at the secondary school in Indonesia. In *2nd International Conference on Social Science and Character Educations (ICoSSCE 2019)* (pp. 229-233). Atlantis Press. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.200130.047>
- Puspitasari, D., Widodo, H. P., Widyaningrum, L., Allamnakhrah, A., & Lestariyana, R. P. D. (2021). How do primary school English textbooks teach moral values?: a critical discourse analysis. *Studies in Educational Evaluation*, 70, 101044. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.stueduc.2021.101044>
- Qoyyimah, U. (2016). Inculcating character education through EFL teaching in Indonesian state schools. *Pedagogies: An International Journal*, 11(2), 109-126. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01494929.2016.1157561>
- Rokhman, F., Syaifudin, A., & Yuliati. (2014). Character education for golden generation 2045 (National character building for Indonesian golden years). *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 141, 1161-1165. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.05.197>

- Santrock, J. W. (2020). *Child Development: An Introduction*. (15th Edition). New York: Mc Graw-Hill
- Setiadi, B. N. (2006). Indonesia: Traditional family in a changing society. In *Families across cultures: A 30 Nation Psychological Study* (p. 370).
- Setyono, B., & Widodo, H. P. (2019). The representation of multicultural values in the Indonesian Ministry of Education and Culture-endorsed EFL textbook: a critical discourse analysis. *Intercultural Education*, 30(4), 383-397. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14675986.2019.1548102>
- Sidhu, G. K., Kaur, S., & Fook, C. Y. (2018). Analysing the integration of moral and cultural values through ELT reading materials in Malaysian ESL classrooms. In *Situating Moral and Cultural Values in ELT Materials* (pp. 69-85). Springer, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-63677-1_5
- Smetana, J. G. (2006). Social-cognitive domain theory: Consistencies and variations in children's moral and social judgments. In *Handbook of Moral Development* (pp. 137-172). Psychology Press.
- Smith, C., & Sheyholislami, J. (2022). Current trends in critical discourse studies of textbooks: A look at selected literature. *Canadian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 25(1), 47-63. <https://doi.org/10.37213/cjal.2022.31515>
- Sulistiyo, U., Haryanto, E., Widodo, H. P., & Elyas, T. (2020a). The portrait of primary school English in Indonesia: Policy recommendations. *Education 3-13*, 48(8), 945-959. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03004279.2019.1680721>
- Sulistiyo, U., Supiani, Kailani, A., & Lestariyana, R. P. D. (2020b). Infusing moral content into primary school English textbooks: A critical discourse analysis. *Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 10(1), 251-260. <https://doi.org/10.17509/ijal.v10i1.25067>
- Susilo, M. J., Dewantoro, M. H., & Yuningsih, Y. (2022). Character education trend in Indonesia. *Journal of Education and Learning (EduLearn)*, 16(2), 180-188. <https://doi.org/10.11591/edulearn.v16i2.20411>
- Tahririan, M. H., & Sadri, E. (2013). Analysis of images in Iranian high school EFL course books. *Iranian Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 16(2), 137-160. <http://ijal.khu.ac.ir/article-1-1791-en.html>
- Tan, B. P., Naidu, N. B. M., & Jamil, Z. (2018). Moral values and good citizens in a multi-ethnic society: A content analysis of moral education textbooks in Malaysia. *The Journal of Social Studies Research*, 42(2), 119-134. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jssr.2017.05.004>
- Veugelers, W. (2010). Moral values in teacher education. *International Encyclopedia of Education*, 7, 650-655. <https://hdl.handle.net/11245/1.333780>
- Yulianti, K., Denessen, E., & Droop, W. (2019). Indonesian parents' involvement in their children's education: A study in elementary schools in urban and rural Java, Indonesia. *School Community Journal*, 29(1), 253-278. <http://www.schoolcommunitynetwork.org/SCJ.aspx>
- Wang, J. (2014). Criticising images: Critical discourse analysis of visual semiosis in picture news. *Critical Arts*, 28(2), 264-286. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02560046.2014.906344>
- Widodo, H. P. (2018). A critical micro-semiotic analysis of values depicted in the Indonesian Ministry of National Education-endorsed secondary school English textbook. In *Situating Moral and Cultural Values in ELT Materials* (pp. 131-152). Springer, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-63677-1_8

Widodo, H. P., Perfecto, M. R., Canh, L. V., & Buripakdi, A. (2018). Incorporating cultural and moral values into ELT materials in the context of Southeast Asia (SEA). In *Situating Moral and Cultural Values in ELT Materials* (pp. 1-14). Springer, Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-63677-1_1