The Role of Museum-Based Education in Creating 9/11 Curriculum

Elise Langan Bronx Community College, City University of New York

Cathlin Goulding Hunter College, City University of New York

Abstract:

This article is a qualitative investigation of teachers' pedagogical approaches to the terror attacks on September 11, 2001. The ten participants are regionally diverse in-service teachers who attended workshops conducted by the 9/11 Memorial Museum and Gilder Lehrman Institute of American History in New York during June and July, 2019. Teachers presented their 9/11 lessons at a March 5, 2020 conference in New York City to pre- and in-service teachers. Surveys, interviews, and lessons determined how teachers implemented professional development in their schools. The paper seeks to improve teacher training through the use of primary sources and place-based education to engender student inquiry. The creation of 9/11 digital lesson plans on the Library of Congress' Teaching with Primary Sources site provides teachers access to ensure that 9/11 receives greater emphasis in the social studies curriculum. Findings indicate that in-situ, place-based experiences increased 9/11 curriculum in classrooms.

Keywords: professional development, museum education, primary sources, place-based education, social studies curriculum.

Introduction

Professional development for teachers comes in many forms and is delivered by a wide array of vendors both in and outside school settings (Smith et al., 2020). Some in-service teachers receive professional development in the form of district-offered workshops. The content of these workshops varies and covers such topics as classroom management and lesson planning. The New York City Department of Education, for example, requires ongoing professional

development for in-service teachers; however, little is focused on local history and/or utilizing primary sources from cultural institutions. Due to their unique character, non-formal education venues can increase learning opportunities for participants who can tailor their experiences to fit their given criteria.

In this study, we draw attention to place-based professional development, which utilizes local spaces to provide authentic encounters with artifacts, narratives, and texts so participants can have visceral experiences, formulate questions, gain knowledge, and increase their skill sets (Gruenewald et al., 2007). Museums, in their offerings of site-specific learning, play a vital role in professional development by providing outreach that brings artifacts and experts to remote locations (Grenier, 2010). However, in spite of using museums as locales for teacher professional development, there remains a dearth of information about their effectiveness in achieving best practices for classrooms (Grenier, 2010). This study seeks to redress the dilemma through an examination of the role of professional development at New York City's 9/11 Memorial & Museum, its effect on teachers, and their curricular practice. We aim to demonstrate how historic sites can support the "development of the processes and competencies necessary to effectively engage in authentic inquiry either at the sites or via subsequent classroom integration" (Baron, 2013, p. 158).

On September 11, 2001, nineteen al Qaeda militants hijacked four airplanes and carried out terrorist attacks in the United States. Two of the planes hit the Twin Towers of the World Trade Center (WTC) in New York City. Towers 1 and 2 were built in 1973 and were, at that time, the tallest buildings in the world. The North Tower was 1,368 feet high and the South Tower was 1,362 feet. The WTC Twin Towers "symbolized globalization and America's economic power" (9/11 Memorial & Museum, FAQs). After two planes hit the Twin Towers, a third plane hit the Pentagon in Washington, D.C. A fourth plane—heading toward Washington D.C.—later crashed in rural Pennsylvania. Almost 3,000 people were killed which instigated various measures to combat terrorism in the United States and globally, including waging wars in Afghanistan and Iraq.

Rationale

Our work is motivated by the need to expand 9/11's representation in the social studies curriculum. Grades 4-12 students were not alive when the attacks occurred and younger teachers have no first-hand knowledge of the events. Currently, sixteen states do not mention the attacks in their standards (Stoddard, 2019). Most social studies teachers in the other states teach 9/11

as an annual event to mark its anniversary and show videos of the attacks on the World Trade Center, the Pentagon, and the plane crash in Pennsylvania. Stoddard (2019) found there was a generational divide in how teachers address 9/11: Older teachers want their students to experience September 11 as they did, while younger teachers want their students to understand how the attacks continue to impact their lives. In short, efforts to teach 9/11 and related themes have not paid sufficient attention to what curriculum scholar Ted Aoki (2004) calls the "lived curriculum," or teaching and learning as it is shaped by context, place and space, social relations, and interpersonal interactions in the classroom.

This study focuses on 9/11 curriculum-making and the relationship between cultural institutions and the teacher populations they serve. The project addresses two issues in teacher education and practice. First, there is a need to increase teachers' content knowledge about the events of 9/11, as many do not see its significance in relation to U.S. domestic and foreign policy. Our findings indicate that social studies teachers—and administrators—do not prioritize 9/11 in the curriculum. Teachers have difficulty finding engaging and thought-provoking 9/11 materials in spite of resources housed at the Library of Congress and the 9/11 Memorial & Museum. In addition to the difficulty of finding space in an already overcrowded curriculum, some teachers are reluctant to introduce the topic of the 9/11 terrorist attacks due to the controversy that might ensue (Beineke, 2010). The implementation of inquiry-based learning experiences using primary sources is an effective way of re-conceptualizing the 9/11 curriculum. Inquiry classrooms reposition students as active learners, engaged in exploration and problem-solving (Wu et al., 2015). In these classrooms, students interact with authentic, real-world material and sources, rather than traditional textbooks (Wu et al., 2015).

The purpose of this project is to determine how participation in the summer 9/11 professional learning experiences informed in-service teachers' classroom practice. This was achieved by reviewing submitted lesson plans which incorporated primary sources and 9/11 museum artifacts from the 10 certified teachers (out of 112) who participated in the summer professional development. These selected "teacher leaders" showcased their lesson plans to 21 pre- and inservice teachers on March 5, 2020, in New York City. (Attendance was smaller due to the Covid-19 outbreak.) The lesson plans are published on the Library of Congress Teaching with Primary Sources Teacher's Network. The publication has resulted in the dissemination of digital lesson plans to over 1,000 educators who have accessed them on the Library of Congress network.

Conceptual Framework

This study is guided by two strands of educational theory: one, place-based education and, two, inquiry models of learning. Both theoretical arenas are undergirded by assumptions about teaching and learning, namely that curriculum does not solely exist within the walls of the classroom. Curriculum occurs in public and private spaces like museums, cities and neighborhoods, and within the home. This study hypothesizes interactivity between the curriculum of public spaces and the curriculum that occurs within schools. To study this entanglement requires positioning the role of the teacher as an agentic maker of curriculum, rather than a transmitter of prescribed curricula (Walker & Soltis, 2004). The teacher, this study presumes, translates knowledge from the public sphere into the lifeworld of the classroom.

One goal of this study is to observe how the museum can be a site for curricular formations and curricular generativity. According to Gruenewald et al. (2007), "places are one of the chief—yet often overlooked—artifacts of human cultures (p. 232). Consequently, museums are well-suited to act as both meeting grounds and to provide resources for doing place-based pedagogy

Memorial museums merge aesthetic and sensorial experiences while also serving as sites for remembrance and instruction of historical violence to their audiences (Marcus et al., 2017; Williams, 2007). The construction of history—and the teaching of it—is a main goal of the memorial museum and is broached through material, psychic, and discursive tactics (Hein, 2002). Teachers in this study, we argue, translate pedagogies offered by the museum—such as its tactility of objects and images, witness testimony, and spatial movement—into the classroom. Museum curators and educators must be cognizant of their ability to influence visitors' knowledge and perspectives of targeted events. We argue that in-situ learning increases the understanding of historical content and practitioners can in turn translate museum-based experiences within their own classroom contexts. This kind of place-based professional learning serves as an effective springboard to construct a "plan and method of action" (Aquino et al., 2010, p. 28) for curriculum and teaching.

Research Questions

The research questions of this study are:

1. To what extent did the 9/11 Memorial & Museum professional development inform teachers' content knowledge and use of educational resources in their classroom?

2. In what ways did the 9/11 Memorial & Museum professional development experiences shift teachers' pedagogical practices in relation to the 9/11 curriculum?

Positionality

Our interest in creating content for teachers and students to increase the visibility of the September 11, 2001 attacks is deeply personal. Elise vividly recalls watching the attacks on the World Trade Center in New York City with thousands of others. On the morning of September 11, 2001—a clear, exquisite day—she exited the subway on Broadway and East 23rd Street and noticed crowds of people looking south to the North Tower. It was a little before 9:00 AM and the first plane had already hit. The consensus seemed to be that it was a commuter plane that had lost direction. A little after 9:00 AM, the second plane hit the South Tower. Elise recalls taxi radios announcing that the Pentagon in Washington had been attacked. Thousands of people were crowding the streets, and climbing the subway stairs. Radios blared that all bridges and tunnels were closed. Everyone walked in dazed confusion. Looking south, at 10:30, Elise could see that the South Tower was collapsing. There were throngs of onlookers who were crying, moaning, and shell-shocked. Incredulous, the crowd watched while the North Tower dissolved into clouds of gray ash.

Cath did not personally witness the attacks on 9/11. However, the extensions of state power after 9/11, particularly for Sikh and Muslim Americans in Cath's school community, recalled a painful family history. Issued in the aftermath of the 1941 Japanese attacks on Pearl Harbor, Executive Order 9066, demanded that all persons of Japanese descent be removed from a West Coast military zone. Her grandparents, American citizens of Japanese descent, quickly sold their house and liquefied their landscaping business. They were later taken to a prison camp in Arkansas— and later Arizona—where they were incarcerated for three and a half years. Cath's research on the memorialization of World War II-era Japanese American incarceration camps eventually led to the 9/11 Memorial and Museum. She spent two years at the Museum & Memorial as an Andrew W. Mellon Postdoctoral Research Fellow conducting qualitative interviews of teachers in the New York City metro region about their relationship to the museum.

Literature Review

Teacher Learning in Museums

Museum-Initiated Professional Development (MIPD) is programming designed by and provided by museums to provide professional development that meets the needs of in-service teachers.

Sessions can take place at a museum property or another location. Content is usually created by various collaborators who strive to uphold the museum's mission and educational objectives. MIPD sessions are usually held in the summer since the timing aligns with teachers' availability. In addition to promoting the museum's mission, studies indicate that participation in MIPD enables resources and experiences that teachers transfer to their classrooms (Grenier, 2010, p. 502). Partaking in on-site instruction allows for personal reflection on participants' practice and content. Taylor (2006) describes these types of learning experiences as "in situ," or learning in the original locations, which influences and enhances both the teaching and learning experiences in the museum setting (in Grenier, 2010, p. 502). Another benefit of MIPD is the creation of peer relationships and communities of practice. The gathering of educators of like minds, who share similar interests and priorities, improves reflection and implementation of practice. Also significant is the degree to which MIPD participants encourage their colleagues to attend. Pennington (2018) notes that participation in professional development allows teachers to practice and experiment with new techniques and discover methods that might be compatible with their current techniques. Collaboration has repeatedly been demonstrated to be a vital aspect of effective professional development (Pennington, 2018, p. 608).

Pedagogical Approaches of Museums

In order to be effective, professional development for teachers must be both constructive and accessible (Grenier, 2010). Museums can play an important role in professional development by providing outreach that brings artifacts, experts, and speakers to teachers by using permanent and temporary collections in addition to content that is designed to meet grade-level needs (Grenier, 2010). Teachers can also benefit from the knowledge and insights gained from attending professional development in non-formal educational settings (Jenlink & Kinnucan-Welsch, 1999). Grenier found this type of professional development to be valuable—especially when it includes materials and content that are transferable to the classroom, in terms of integrating newly discovered texts, historical figures, and theoretical lenses. In addition to providing content delivery, museum educators must be cognizant of intangibles such as teachers' motivations for attending and how they will implement their museum experiences.

In their analysis of the Birmingham Civil Rights Institute, Gregg and Leinhardt (2002) stress how artifacts display the magnitude of events in addition to providing tangible information that can only be gleaned while at the museum. According to Gregg and Leinhardt, museum artifacts provide unique perspectives that are transmitted due to their tangible nature and the curator's preferences. Upon viewing a museum's artifacts, visitors can consider why objects were selected

for display (pp. 556-557). Gregg and Leinhardt maintain that the physical act of moving through a museum's collection affects the visitor's emotional and visceral response to the displayed artifacts. Besides being places for objects and ideas for teachers, museums also serve as important learning arenas for students.

Marcus et al. (2012) believes that teachers' college-level training and their collaboration with museum staff can greatly influence their students' opportunities to learn. Although Marcus, Levine & Grenier (2012) view museum learning as "an understudied area in research on museum learning" (p. 74), they see museums' potential to promote learning about history. Baron (2013) concurs that not enough research has been done on the value of historic sites' role in improving teachers' historical thinking or in how to create effective professional development (p. 157). Baron asserts that the best data available about the role of historic sites in teacher professional development is derived from the Teaching American History (TAH) grant program. Their ingredients for professional development success were: intensive content-area studies, collaboration with colleagues, and implementation of content into the classroom. Museum educators, in particular, are knowledgeable, charismatic, and invaluable assets for PK-12 teachers' learning: They deconstruct displays by providing context and multiple interpretations (Gouws and Wasserman, 2018).

Museums and Difficult History

Some museum professional development is designed to help teachers cover difficult content, such as the Holocaust (Cohan and Sleeper, 2010) and the legacies of enslavement. Increasingly, school districts do not provide professional learning that covers the Holocaust and other difficult content. Consequently, teachers seek out information on their own through informal arenas (Pennington, 2018, p. 610). When considering the potential benefits of MIPD, such venues are no doubt conducive to helping teachers cover difficult topics. Although states—beginning with New Jersey in 1994—started requiring teaching the Holocaust in their schools, there was pushback from Holocaust education proponents who were concerned that teachers unfamiliar with the content would perhaps cover the topic in unfavorable or misleading ways (Fallace, 2008). The same controversy holds true for teaching about September 11, 2001. Stoddard and Hess (2016) found that although the events of 9/11 are well suited to teach students religious and social tolerance, this value was the least emphasized among over 1,000 surveyed U.S. History, Government/Civics, and World History teachers. Nonetheless, museums play a vital role in helping teachers construct accurate historical narratives and can also cultivate civic responsibility (Rose, 2016). We maintain that professional development provided by museum

docents, educators, and artifacts gives insights and informs pedagogical practices that cannot be achieved otherwise.

Methods

Participants

In order to draw qualitative comparisons between two separate professional development sessions at the 9/11 Memorial and Museum, we conducted pre- and post-surveys with 112 teachers on June 6, 2019 and July 7-13, 2019. Two separate cohorts of teachers were sampled. The first cohort was a group of Grade 3-12 teachers attending a one-day on-site 9/11 Memorial & Museum-sponsored workshop on June 6, 2019 (n=76); these teachers work in the New York City metropolitan region. The second cohort was composed of K-12 teachers who attended a week-long Gilder Lehrman Institute of American History-sponsored seminar on July 7-13, 2019 at the 9/11 Memorial & Museum (n=36). Unlike the June workshop, these teachers were from school districts and regions across the U.S.

The Thursday, June 6, 2019 event, was a one-day professional development session held at the 9/11 Memorial & Museum. It took place on a day in which students in the New York City public schools are not in attendance and teachers employed by the district attend a day of professional learning in the city, many of which are offered by cultural institutions and educational organizations. The day started with a keynote speaker, Mary Galligan, a retired FBI Special Agent who served as the supervisor of the FBI's 9/11 investigation. The bulk of the day was dedicated to breakout sessions. Participants were able to choose among the following sessions: Tackling Conspiracy Theories, (In)visible Identities: Addressing Islamophobia in a post 9/11 World; Enduring Questions of 9/11; Connecting to 9/11 Through Artifacts and Personal Narratives; Role of First Responders: 9/11 and Beyond; A Look Inside the Collection. Attendees were also given the option of taking a guided tour of the museum.

The Gilder Lehrman Summer Seminar took place July 7-13, 2019 at the 9/11 Memorial & Museum. The seminar, titled 9/11 and American Memory, was part of a menu of summer seminars for K-12 teachers offered by the Gilder Lehrman Institute of American History. Classroom teachers from across the country apply for stipends to participate; in all, a total of 36 teachers were part of this summer seminar. Nearly all of the teachers lodged at a university dormitory in downtown New York City. The seminar was led by history professor Edward T. Linenthal and included full days of presentations from the 9/11 Memorial & Museum staff and invited lecturers. Scholarly lectures touched on material culture, memorial museum design, post-

9/11 national security policy, and conspiracy theories. Education staff from the museum led teachers through using online collections available on the 9/11 Memorial & Museum's website. They addressed topics such as conspiracy theories and Islamophobia with students, drawing on resources from *The New Yorker* magazine covers to structural engineering reports.

Our study does not disaggregate findings between the two different professional learning types at the museum—the one-day versus week-long institutes. While of different lengths and intensities, members of both groups were shaped by a concentrated encounter with the 9/11 Museum, as evidenced in our subsequent qualitative interviews with teachers.

Ten certified middle and secondary teachers from the 112 teachers who attended the June and July 2019, 9/11 Memorial & Museum and the Gilder Lehrman professional development sessions applied for grant-funded stipends to continue with our study (see Table 1). Stipends, funded by the Library of Congress' Teaching with Primary Sources program, offered the teachers \$650.00 to write two original lesson plans—using the resources from the 9/11 Memorial & Museum and/or the Library of Congress—pilot one of the lessons in their classrooms, and lead a session in New York City. Ten teachers applied and all were accepted. Each of them signed an informed consent form. We followed IRB protocols to minimize risks and protect teachers' identities during the study. The teacher participants for this project worked with the project team to create and pilot their 9/11 lesson plans and then presented their work to 21 pre- and in-service teachers at an evening conference in New York City on March 5, 2020 (see Appendix C). The conference aimed to increase the use of primary sources as effective methods to teach about September 11, 2001. Conference invitees included pre-service teachers recruited from Teaching Methods courses taught by co-PIs at Bronx Community College, Lehman College, and Hunter College—all part of the City of New York (CUNY) system. We also invited New York City-certified social studies teachers. Since the Mayor of New York City had notified the public that day that the city would soon be closing down to limit Covid infection rates, 21 pre- and in-service teachers attended.

Table 1

Teacher Name (Pseudonym)	School Location	Subject Taught	Grade(s) Taught	Interviewed
Jill	Missouri	Social Studies	10-12	No
Stephanie	New York	History	6-8	Yes
Jen	Illinois	Social Studies	9-12	Yes
Leslie	Arkansas	Social Studies	9-12	Yes
Delores	New York	English as a Second Language	8	No
Jason	Illinois	History	11	Yes
Matt	Maryland	Social Studies	10-12	Yes
Michelle	Illinois	World History and Civics	9-10	Yes
Rachel	New York	History	6-12	Yes
Deborah	South Carolina	World History	7	No

Teacher Leaders Who Received Stipends

Data Collection

Surveys. Surveys were distributed on paper to 112 teachers before and after the June 6, 2019 and July 7-13, 2019 sessions at the 9/11 Memorial & Museum.

A pre-survey (see Appendix A) asked teachers information about their grade level, subject areas, and the number of years in the classroom. They were also asked about their motivations for attending the session and their prior experience teaching about 9/11. The post-session survey (see Appendix B) asked if teachers learned anything about 9/11 that they were unaware of previously and whether the sessions confirmed and changed any notions they had about 9/11.

Finally, the survey asked what teaching strategies and resources from the conference they might implement in the classroom.

Qualitative Interviews. After their presentations at the March 5, 2020 conference, we conducted structured interviews on Zoom with seven of the 10 teachers who created lesson plans and piloted them in their classrooms (see Table 1 for a list of teachers interviewed). Due to disruptions faced during the COVID-19 pandemic, the remaining three teachers were unable to participate. We interviewed the seven teachers about their experiences using the resources from the professional development session at the 9/11 Memorial & Museum. We asked them to reflect on the integration of the resources into their curriculum planning and to tell us about the piloting of the lessons, including the context and environment in which the lessons were taught. Finally, we asked about the impact of the 9/11 Museum's professional development on their classroom practice (see Appendix D for interview protocol).

Teacher-Authored Lessons. The 10 teacher leaders created lesson plans using online resources from the 9/11 Memorial & Museum and Library of Congress' websites and presented them at the March 2020 conference in New York City. We gave the teachers specific links to materials to guide their planning. We also provided teachers with a template to structure their lessons, align them with appropriate national and state standards, and prepare them for publication on the Teaching with Primary Sources Network (Teaching 9/11, 2020). After being reviewed and edited, these finalized lessons describe a sequence of guided activities around primary sources (artifacts, oral histories, speeches), timelines, and the 9/11 online memorial; they also created handouts for learners.

Data Analysis

Survey data, interview transcripts, and teacher-authored lesson plans were analyzed for common patterns and emerging themes regarding the degree to which the professional development experiences informed teachers' content knowledge about 9/11 and classroom practice. Qualitative data were triangulated among survey data, structured interviews, and teachers' lesson plans (Leech & Onwuegbuzie, 2007). These multiple sources of data provide a comprehensive picture of the impact of the intervention, participants' perspectives on the experience, and the ways in which these experiences intersect.

The co-authors used inductive coding to identify themes in the qualitative data (Calfee & Sperling, 2010; Caruth, 2013; Johnson & Onwuegbuzie, 2004). For the first round, the two co-authors read and re-read the three different data sources. Preliminary codes were listed during these initial

read-throughs (Saldaña, 2013). Then, as a second round, coding was conducted by highlighting salient portions of these documents and making notations in the margins. The co-authors coded each highlight with a coding category. Our determination of concepts was guided by reviewed research literature and emerged from statements made by teachers in the surveys and interviews. After this second round, we refined our analysis. Codes were bundled into the broader themes that constitute the study's findings. Both researchers wrote analytic memos (Saldaña, 2013) that reviewed the codes and reflected on emergent themes and patterns. In these memos, we observed the uniqueness of professional development within a museum setting, the animating effects of professional development, and how professional learning at the museum shaped the ultimate creation of a new curriculum.

Findings

On-site professional development experiences increased participants' awareness of and interactions with place-based pedagogy, the events of September 11, 2001, the Library of Congress and 9/11 Memorial & Museum primary sources, and the institutions which curate them. All names have been changed to protect their identity.

Positioning Teachers as Learners

Surveys with educators who participated in summer sessions at the 9/11 Memorial & Museum and later interviews with select teacher leaders evinced a relationship between place-based professional development and the subsequent development of new curriculum. Exposing teachers to places outside of their normal professional life, we proffer, enabled many to return to a learner-stance, absorbing lectures from museum curators and historians and seeing the site first-hand. Many of our teacher leaders expressed a sense of energy after returning to their respective regions of the country. After the summer professional development, Leslie, a history teacher in Arkansas, returned to her students feeling reinvigorated and "juiced" since she had more confidence in her teaching abilities. She was excited to see how her students were able to learn from the artifacts and primary sources on the online 9/11 Museum website. Both the summer experience and her students' reaction to the student-centered activities she created renewed her enthusiasm for the teaching profession.

Traveling to New York City from their nationwide home districts to the 9/11 Memorial & Museum incited a learner positionality. Jen teaches 10th-grade World History and twelfth-grade Western Civilization in Illinois. After returning, Jen taught about 9/11 to her 10th graders. She instructed her students to use the 9/11 Museum's primary sources to find someone who was profiled on

the Museum's website and to match them with various artifacts. They were also instructed to find the victim's obituary with the goal of constructing a person. The obituaries served as historical research "from the bottom up." Jen included her own photos and materials that she had gathered over the week at the 9/11 Museum as context for the activity along with facts about the attacks. Her students did two days of in-class research and were involved, enthused, and serious about what they were discovering. Jen described the opportunity for teachers to "become students again" as "invigorating" and the professional development (hosted by Gilder Lehrman) at the 9/11 Museum as "excellent."

Having an immersive experience in place, we found, prompted teacher leaders to address historical absences in the school-wide curriculum. Matt, who teaches social studies at a high school in Maryland, noted in an interview that most of the school's U.S. history classes concluded with the Civil Rights movement with only cursory nods to 9/11 in Advanced Placement level coursework. The professional learning at the 9/11 Museum propelled his creation of a new elective course called, "Understanding 9/11." Reflecting on this new addition to the social studies curriculum, Matt explained his former dissatisfaction with 9/11 being discussed only briefly in select classes at his school:

I had been sitting with that for a while, because like I said, I started to do that in my AP but just in very limited capacity. And I really wasn't satisfied with only having the AP students do something, and not everybody else. And it was just at the end. Everyone's like ready to be over with school. It's the last unit of the thing, at least. And so I thought maybe if we could have an elective that would be an entire semester to really delve into something was important.

Similar to Matt, Delores found that her learning experiences at the museum prompted substantive curricular changes. Delores teaches ninth-grade World History and tenth-grade Civics in New York. After the summer professional development sessions at the 9/11 Museum, Delores used several of the Museum's online resources. The summer professional development experience had a decided impact on Delores; she returned home convinced of the necessity of teaching about 9/11 even though her students had not been born when the attacks occurred. Speaking with her colleagues, Delores learned that the majority do not teach about 9/11, something she found deeply troubling.

The occasion of in-situ teaching in New York City and within the museum learning represented a significant break in the day-to-day contexts of teaching and learning. This ability to shift outside

of the normal pacing, sensations, and settings of schooling afforded the teachers a chance to reanimate their own learning. After returning from their New York experiences, a criticality ignited among the participant teachers. Two teachers, for instance, analyzed the existing curriculum at their school sites and unleashed a query as to why their school's curriculum did not include contemporary and consequential events like 9/11. One of these teachers ultimately discovered that her administrator felt teaching 9/11 would not prepare students for state social studies tests.

Translating Place

Participant teachers in this study found creative avenues for translating their place-based learning at the 9/11 Memorial & Museum into their specific regional contexts. In his interview, Jason, a U.S. history teacher at a charter school in Illinois, observed that the summer seminar invites teachers from across the U.S. and that the geographic intermingling ignited a widened perspective on 9/11 curriculum:

There's teachers all the way from like L.A., New York—having that kind of collaboration with other teachers from rural areas, metropolitan areas—it helped kind of understand 9/11 and how to teach it in an American context, I think, not just like in a Chicagoan or a New York perspective, but to look at how it's taught in American schools.

Jason's words emphasize the wide-scale application of 9/11 in American social studies classrooms. Teachers, regardless of their geographic region, were able to find ways to make the attacks on September 11th accessible to their students.

In some cases, teachers drew on the recollections of their visits to the Twin Towers and the post-9/11 site as the foundation for their curricular decisions. Leslie, for example, is the chair of her Arkansas high school's Social Studies Department and a former museum educator. Prior to the attacks, she had made several visits to the Twin Towers and realized both their global stature and importance. In her view, the Twin Towers were an international beacon of hope that drew people to New York City from all over the world. Due to her background and interest in architecture, Leslie decided to teach about the Twin Towers as they were (before the attacks) and in their current iteration as a memorial.

Consequently, understandings of the impermanence of place, as well as its contested nature, infused her lesson plans. These understandings, we found, emerged from a direct experience in the place of study during professional learning. In her civics course, Leslie used the 9/11

Museum's online oral histories and primary sources to prompt her students to consider who should be remembered and who should be forgotten subsequent to the attacks. In the context of a high school civics course, Leslie wanted 9/11 to serve as a springboard for why citizens need to be better informed about national history while considering the aftermath of what should occur after major architectural landmarks, like the Twin Towers, are destroyed. In her curriculum, she asked: Should buildings be replaced for the sake of the economy or should memorials be constructed? Eventually, she used the destruction of the Twin Towers as a comparative case study, asking students to consider a parallel example of when developers drove a highway through a local Black neighborhood that destroyed some buildings and homes while others were left intact. Even though the majority of her students had been born and raised in the area, the majority had no knowledge of the politics that were instrumental in completing the highway and destroying the adjacent neighborhood. Leslie's students reflected on the fact that "history is not equal" and that overall, teachers like to "sugarcoat things." Leslie believes that the neglect of the 9/11 curriculum by teachers is similar to the destruction of a local neighborhood; since both events were so traumatic, most of her colleagues have sidelined or eschewed them. The passage of time, in this case, allows history teachers to learn more about particular events since multiple perspectives can be applied.

With some exceptions, for our research participants, much of the work concerning translating place involved making connections between 9/11 and their particular localities—like New York City, Arkansas, or Illinois. Fewer participants used the events of 9/11 to expand global knowledge or to look at the consequences of the attacks beyond U.S. borders. However, Matt—a high school social studies teacher in Maryland—tackled *The Last Night* (9/11 Museum, *The Last Night*), a document handwritten in Arabic, copies of which were recovered among the hijackers' belongings in Boston, in Washington, D. C., and at the Flight 93 crash site in Western Pennsylvania. It gives a series of instructions to the hijackers as they prepare to carry out the attacks on 9/11. For Matt, the document became a cornerstone of a jigsaw discussion in which his students analyze the view of Islam presented and how the perpetrators used religion to justify the attacks. It is followed by a reading of an opinion piece by Leena Al Olaimy (2017), "Terrorists don't kill for their religion. It's something else entirely" to support students' understanding that terrorism's interpretation of Islam is not representative of the religion as a whole.

On a similar note, Michelle, a civics and history teacher in Illinois, wanted to support her Muslim students by writing lessons to counter Islamophobia. Her stance was informed by global migration and so she designed a lesson around a reading of *How Does It Feel to Be a Problem?*

(Bayoumi, 2009) about Rasha, a Syrian-Muslim immigrant who was detained for three months in 2002 in a New York City jail without due process of law. In reading about Rasha, Michelle writes in her lesson, "students put a name to the prejudice towards Muslims and people of Middle Eastern descent after 9/11." Overall, while we did see these two examples of a global, transnational focus in approaching 9/11, most teachers constrained their lessons to national and local places.

Museum Pedagogy in the Classroom

The last finding reflects the ability of the teacher leaders to apply pedagogies deployed by the museum into their everyday classroom contexts. Museum pedagogies (Hein & Alexander, 1998; Hein, 2002), taught during the summer professional development workshops at the 9/11 Memorial & Museum, include the use of visual and material sources, the vast array of oral history testimony about survivors on 9/11. Sessions provided concrete strategies and entry points into a variety of challenging content areas, including teaching 9/11 through primary sources, tackling conspiracy theories, and the rise of Islamophobia. Stephanie, who works at a middle school in New York, remarked that the sessions on conspiracy theory were especially helpful. "We could just use an event like 9/11 to understand why conspiracy theories come out of the tragic, seemingly random events," said Stephanie in an interview. Students "can take those skills to debunk those and other [conspiracy theories]."

The seminar offered teachers an opportunity to investigate the historical causes and context, the immediate impact, and the ongoing legacies of the attacks of September 11. Participants examined the collections of the 9/11 Memorial & Museum as well as the historic site and memorial. In addition, they considered the nature of commemoration. Finally, participants explored how to use oral history, media, and artifacts in the classroom.

In some cases, teachers used first-hand accounts of 9/11—a significant pedagogical tactic throughout the 9/11 Memorial & Museum—to jumpstart their student inquiry. In post-surveys, teachers remarked that the oral histories from those at Ground Zero and the Pentagon were among the most potent primary sources learned about in the summer Gilder Lehrman seminar. In one survey, a teacher commented on the "power of oral history to bring a personal and human touch to history." Michelle, a high school social studies teacher, made use of the personal stories of the featured speakers, e.g., victims' family members, first responders, professors, and 9/11 Museum educational staff, during the Gilder Lehrman Professional Development to reach her students. She found the 9/11 Museum's on-site displays to be very moving and used online

representations in her classroom. A seasoned practitioner of "historical thinking" (Wineburg, 2001), Michelle flipped the paradigm and had her students do investigative work in order to find information to construct the lives of victims from their exploratory work. She was delighted with her students' seriousness and thoroughness in creating their composites which proved to them that they can effectively utilize historical methods.

Throughout the post-surveys, we saw teachers draw from design strategies in the memorial museum, especially the concerted efforts to individuate among those who died—or nearly did—on 9/11. Participants were exposed to these individualizing portraits in the In Memoriam exhibit, in which photos and names of 9/11 victims appear on a series of walls. In this exhibit, there is ample opportunity to interact with touchscreens to read more about each victim. During the Gilder Lehrman seminar, teachers were able to hear 9/11 Memorial & Museum CEO Alice Greenwald and other senior staff talk about the underlying design principles of a memorial museum as bringing self-hoods and life histories to the victims.

One of the research participants, Delores, inserts a 9/11 curriculum into a 10th-grade civics class in New York City by developing a unit on International Relations. Delores played the oral history of Frank Razzano, a Washington D.C.-based lawyer, which she pulled from the museum's educational resources. With the help of the New York City Fire Department, Razzano was able to evacuate the World Trade Center. Delores also introduced her students to the "Falling Man," (Time Photo, 2016), an image by photographer Richard Drew, circulated by the press immediately after the attacks. The image shows a man plummeting headfirst to the ground, having leaped from the burning towers. Her lesson focused specifically on this image, studying the photographer, its controversial circulation in news outlets, and the public's reaction to it. Delores found that they needed (and wanted) much more context since they had not had previous exposure to the terror attacks. Delores's students also watched *The Man in the Red Bandana*' (Cortell et al., 2017) documentary on *ESPN*, a story of Welles Crowther, an equity trader and volunteer firefighter known to have saved at least eighteen lives. The remnants of these survivors, combined with first-hand oral histories, informed the teachers' pedagogy, and transported the 9/11 Museum's realism into Delores' classroom.

Other teachers drew on the epistemological structures in the 9/11 Museum, namely the Historical Exhibition driven by an intensively constructed timeline of September 11. In turn, teachers replicated this strategy by offering a media-rich timeline for students from the

Museum's online resources. Rachel, who teaches both middle grades and high school social studies, works in a New York City-based school where the principal has mandated that teachers not teach about 9/11 since it is only mentioned twice (in grades 8 and 11) in the New York State Standards. Nonetheless, Rachel was able to teach the events on September 11 as an extra credit assignment for her middle-grade students the first week of school—which coincides with the anniversary of the attacks. She presented the information to them as a Gallery Walk during her forty-five-minute lesson. She also created a lesson for her 10th-grade class as an extra credit assignment. Both sets of students made extensive use of the 9/11 Museum's website which she (and they) found to be an invaluable resource. Rachel gave her students prior knowledge before they were directed to find artifacts on the 9/11 Museum's site. Her students were motivated to find as much information as possible; however, Rachel noted that the reason the activity was successful was that she had scaffolded the assignment. She concluded that it would not have gone as well for students who have no background in the topic.

Utilizing the U.S. Congressional Record, housed on the Library of Congress website, Rachel's students examined U.S. Senators' speeches regarding the Patriot Act. Her students debated the pros and cons of the legislation and later participated in a Socratic seminar. Overall, she found the sources on the Library of Congress website to be too specific and instead relied on the 9/11 Museum's website so her students could build composites of victims and their families. Students were assigned a particular aspect of the attacks, such as Flight 11, the collapse of the North Tower, First Responders, and then pieced together online information and explained it to their classmates. Her students were extremely interested in the topic since they live in New York City and know people who were inside the buildings when the attacks occurred.

Rachel firmly believes that students need to learn about 9/11 so they can understand how profoundly it shaped the day-to-day lives of people in and outside U.S. borders. In an interview, Rachel commented, "I live in New York. I feel like it bothers me like crazy if the kids don't know." She explained that her students "don't even realize how different life was twenty years ago." She sees mastery of the content as being foundational in understanding U.S. foreign and domestic policy, as well as tracking the dangerous associations of "Muslim" with "terrorist." "Where does all the stigma against immigrants, and Muslims, and everything comes from?" Rachel said. "You just have to understand it in order to understand so much else."

In several instances, participants noted how affected they were by the act of physically traversing and experiencing the Museum's collection. Doing so elicited emotional responses and connections to the 9/11 Museum (Gregg and Leinhardt, 2002). Consistent with Grenier's (2009)

finding that effective museum education programs depend upon the competence of its educational team, the 9/11 Museum's education staff was repeatedly commended by our teachers for their efficacy and multi-layered approach. Several of the teachers were appreciative that they were able to talk with 9/11 experts on a casual basis during mealtimes to discuss best practices. They were also glad that their access to the educators continued on social media after the summer professional development sessions ended.

Discussion and Conclusion

By examining surveys, interview transcripts, and lesson plans, we considered how placed-based learning enhanced teachers' content knowledge and supported their use of educational resources in their classrooms. Our overall intention is to generate greater access and use of primary sources to both pre- and in-service teachers to learn and effectively teach about September 11, 2001. Consequently, there are lesson plans stored on the Teaching with Primary Sources Teachers Network. In addition to creating the 9/11 primary source curriculum for their own classroom and school-level use, the digital dissemination of lesson plans provides materials for teachers on a broad scale to ensure that the events of 9/11 receive their rightful place in the curriculum.

Our study revealed three insights: First, the in-situ museum professional development bolstered teacher knowledge and motivated their curriculum-making. In both surveys and semi-structured interviews, the teachers repeatedly mentioned how the experience of being at the site of the World Trade Center in New York City greatly increased their understanding of the attacks. As a result, the teachers were able to transform their personal experiences with place into their lesson plans and pedagogy when they returned home to their school districts. In fact, their experience at the 9/11 Museum acted as a catalyst for returning to New York in March 2020 to model their lesson plans to certified and pre-service teachers. Some summer participants brought along their family members and had detailed itineraries of how they would recreate the 9/11 Museum Professional Development experience for them. During the March 2020 conference, we noticed a deep sense of connection among the teachers since they had stayed in touch and continued to exchange impressions and materials from the previous summer. Our study demonstrates the power of assembling educators with similar interests, goals, and pedagogy in order to engender deeper reflection and implementation of best practices (Pennington, 2018).

Secondly, our study indicates that in order to improve history education, there needs to be far more emphasis on the singular role that museum education plays in achieving this end (Marcus,

Levine & Grenier, 2012). The 9/11 Memorial & Museum educators were committed and thoughtful throughout the professional development sessions. In addition to being well-versed in the content and sequence of events that preceded and followed the attacks, they demonstrated the power of artifacts to help teachers imagine the world before and after 9/11— no small feat. This impact was reiterated during the post-PD surveys and interviews with selected participants. Continuing to pay short shrift to the vital resources of museums impedes possibilities for teachers to utilize best practices, which, in turn, undermines emphasizing historical thinking in students (Wineburg, 2001).

Finally, our study demonstrates the need for greater emphasis to be placed on the 9/11 attacks in the middle and secondary curriculum. Repeatedly, our teachers told us about the resistance they encountered from their school principals and colleagues to include 9/11 in either U.S. or global history. Since the September 11, 2001 attacks are not highlighted in several state standards, some principals (and teachers) consider it "a waste of a period." Instead, the curriculum is focused on students mastering skills and memorization of facts so they can pass their state exams. Because 9/11 falls at the beginning of the school year, schools often hold a moment of silence and many administrators believe this commemoration is sufficient; it is not. The teaching of 9/11 calls for a far more expansive approach. One of our teachers revealed that she was able to insert 9/11 content during the yearly anniversary, but only because of her commitment. Another teacher drew connections between local events, such as the demolition of a Black neighborhood during highway construction, and the rebuilding of the World Trade Center site after 9/11. These examples demonstrate the teachers' ingenuity in addressing administrative challenges to their curriculum and translating place-based professional learning into specific contexts. Without exemplary in-situ museum professional development, the majority of middle and secondary teachers will continue to ignore or marginalize the most cataclysmic event of the twenty-first century.

Inspired by their summer professional development experience, our teachers returned to their districts and held 9/11 professional development for their colleagues and eventually many of their principals acquiesced to including it in the curriculum. No doubt it was beneficial that several of the participants are the Chairs and lead teachers in their school's social studies departments; however, haggling over what constitutes curricular priorities detracts from the larger curricular beneficence. In short, the pedagogical implications for in situ learning—and the use of authentic primary sources—should be replicated on a much larger scale. In order to bring greater attention to the positive experiences of place-based professional development, we

advocate its increase. Educational institutions must find ways to allocate resources to make administrators and practitioners aware of the many inherent gains of being in the room where it happens. Given that most of our participants taught 9/11 in the context of U.S. and local histories, we recommend that museum educators and other professional development practitioners use a comparative lens to help expand participants' perspectives beyond local parameters. Doing so will provide needed context and discussion about how discrete terrorist attacks are represented and adjudicated on the global stage.

References

- Al Olaimy, Leena (2017, July 27). Terrorists don't kill for their religion. It's something else entirely. *World Economic Forum*. https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2017/07/terroristextremists-dont-kill-for-islam-or-christianity
- Aoki, T. (2004). Curriculum in a new key: The collected works of Ted T. Aoki. Routledge.
- Aquino, A. E., Kelly, A. M., & Bayne, G. U. (2010). Sharing our teachers: The required graduate class at the American Museum of Natural History for Lehman College (CUNY). *New Educator, 6*(3–4), 225–246.
- Baron, C. (2013). Using inquiry-based instruction to encourage teachers' historical thinking at historic sites. *Teaching & Teacher Education, 35,* 157–169.
- Bayoumi, Moustafa. (2009). Chapter 1: Rasha. In *How does it feel to be a problem?: Being young and Arab in America.* Penguin.
- Beineke, J.A. (2011). Teaching history to adolescents: A quest for relevance. *Adolescent cultures, school, and society.* Peter Lang.
- Calfee, R., & Sperling, M. (2010). *On mixed methods: Approaches to language and literacy research.* Teachers College Press.
- Caruth, G. D. (2013). Demystifying mixed methods research design: A review of the literature. *Mevlana International Journal of Education, 3*(2), 112-122.
- Cohan, S., & M. Sleeper. (2010). Teaching genocide in the United States secondary education. *Genocide Prevention Now,* 2.
- Cortell, N., DeNucci, T., Kosoff, N., Tillinger, E.K., & Verdi, M. (Producers), & Weiss, M.(Director). (2017). *Man in red bandana*. <u>https://www.espn.com/video/clip/_/id/11505494</u>
- Fallace, T. D. (2008). The emergence of Holocaust education in American schools. Springer.
- Gouws, B., & Wassermann, J. (2018). The Durban Holocaust Centre educators and the origins of their historical and pedagogical knowledge. *Journal of Jewish Education*, 84(1), 32–55.
- Gregg, M., & Leinhardt, G. (2002). Learning from the Birmingham Civil Rights Institute: Documenting teacher development. *American Educational Research Journal, 39*(2), 553–587.

- Grenier, R.S. (2010). Now this is what I call learning. A case study of museum-initiated professional development for teachers. *Adult Education Quarterly, 60*(5) 499-516.
- Gruenewald, D., Koppelman, N. & Elam, A. (2007). Our place in history: Inspiring place-based social history in schools and communities. *Journal of Museum Education*, *32*(3), 231-240.
- Hein, G.E., & Alexander, M. (1998). *Museums: Places of learning.* American Association of Museums.
- Hein, G. E. (2002). *Learning in the museum*. Routledge.
- Hess, D., & Stoddard, J. (2011). 9/11 in the curriculum: A retrospective. *The Social Studies*, *102*(4), 175-179.
- Jenlink, P.M., & Kinnucan-Welsch, K. (1999). Learning ways of caring, learning ways of knowing through communities of professional development. *Journal for a Just and Caring Education, 5,* 367-385.
- Johnson, R. B., & Onwuegbuzie, A. J. (2004). Mixed methods research: A research paradigm whose time has come. *Educational Researcher*, *33*(7), 14-26.
- Leech, N. L., & Onwuegbuzie, A. J. (2007). An array of qualitative data analysis tools: A call for data analysis triangulation. *School Psychology Quarterly, 22*(4), 557.
- Marcus, A. S., Levine, T. H., & Grenier, R. S. (2012). How secondary history teachers use and think about museums: Current practices and untapped promise for promoting historical understanding. *Theory and Research in Social Education*, 40(1), 66–97.
- Marcus, A. S., Stoddard, J. D., & Woodward, W. W. (2017). *Teaching history with museums: Strategies for K-12 social studies.* Taylor & Francis.
- 9/11 Memorial & Museum. 9/11 FAQs. https://www.911memorial.org/911-faqs
- 9/11 Memorial & Museum. The last night. <u>https://www.91memorial.org/sites/default/inline-files/2001%20sept.10%20the%20Last%20Night%20Letter_0.pdf</u>
- Pennington, L.K. (2018). Hello from the other side: Museum educators' perspectives on teaching the Holocaust. *Teacher Development*, 22(5), 6-7-631.
- Rose, J. (2016). Interpreting difficult history at museums and historic sites. Rowman & Littlefield.
- Saldaña, J. (2013). The coding manual for qualitative researchers. Sage Publications.

- Smith, R., Ralston, N. C., Naegele, Z., & Waggoner, J. (2020). Team teaching and learning: A model of effective professional development for teachers. *Professional Educator*, 43(1), 80-90.
- Stoddard, J. (2019). Teaching 9/11 and the War on Terror national survey of secondary teachers. University of Wisconsin, Madison Survey Center. https://minds.wisconsin.edu/handle/1793/79305
- Stoddard, J., & Hess, D. (2016). 9/11 and the war on terror in American secondary curriculum fifteen years later. *Reassessing the social studies curriculum: Promoting critical civic engagement in a politically polarized, post-9/11 world*, 15-28.
- Teaching 9/11. (2020). The Library of Congress, Teaching with Primary Sources Teacher Network. https://tpsteachersnetwork.org/teaching-911.
- Time Photo. (2016, September 8). The story behind the haunting 9/11 photo of a man falling from the Twin Towers. *Time*. <u>https://time.com/4453467/911-september-11-falling-man-photo</u>
- Taylor, F.W. (2006). Making meaning of local non-formal education: Practitioner's perspective. *Adult Education Quarterly, 56,* 291-307.
- Walker, D. F., & Soltis, J. F. (2004). *Curriculum and aims*. Teachers College Press.
- Williams, P. (2007). *Memorial museums: The global rush to commemorate atrocities*. Berg Publisher.
- Wu, J., Tseng, J. C. R., & Hwang, G. (2015). Development of an inquiry-based learning support system based on an intelligent knowledge exploration approach. *Educational Technology & Society*, 18(3), 282-300.

Appendix A

9/11 Memorial & Museum Educator PD: PRE-PD SURVEY

- 1. What grade(s) or population(s) do you teach (check all that apply)?
 - **□** 3-5
 - **G**-8
 - 9-12
 - Special Education
 - Higher Education
 - Other: ______
- 2. What subject area do you teach?
 - Social Studies
 - **English Language Arts**
 - □ English Language Learners
 - Language
 - STEM
 - Arts
- 3. How many years have you taught?
- 4. What are your motivations for participating in this professional development session?
- 5. Do you currently teach about 9/11 in your classroom?
 - 🛛 Yes
 - 🛛 No
- 6. If Yes, please provide some details about how you teach about 9/11:
- 7. Are you aware of the 9/11 Memorial & Museum resources for classroom teachers?
 - Yes
 - 🗋 No
- 8. If yes, what materials do you use and how?

Appendix B

9/11 Memorial & Museum Educator PD: June 6, 2019 | POST-PD SURVEY

- 1. What, if anything, did you learn about 9/11 that you were unaware of previously?
- 2. Did the workshop sessions confirm or change any previous notions about 9/11? Please explain.
- 3. If applicable, what specific teaching strategies did you learn about during these sessions?
- 4. How will you use the materials, resources, and information from this session? Please be specific.

Additional Comment

Team	Teacher Leaders	Presentation Information
A	Jill Social Studies Teacher, Missouri, Grades 10-12 Stephanie History Teacher, New York, Grades 6-8	Political Consequences of 9/11 Our presentations will focus on America's political response to 9/11, including an analysis of the debate around the Patriot Act as well as comparing presidential speeches following direct attacks on the United States. This lesson asks students to consider when, if ever, is it acceptable to take away human rights in the name of safety.
В	Jen Social Studies Teacher, Illinois, Grades 9-12 Leslie Social Studies Teacher and Department Chair, Arkansas, Grades 9-12	Oral History: The Unforgotten Voices of 9/11 The presentation will focus on how to incorporate the human side of the victims of 9/11. The presenters will discuss how to use oral histories and the rich archives at the 9/11 memorial museum, while incorporating artifacts of victims and primary source documents surrounding the death of Osama Bin Laden.
C	Delores English as a Second Language Teacher, New York, Grade 8 Jason U.S. History Teacher, Illinois, Grade 11	Enduring Images Of 9/11: How Public Opinion Can Shape Media Coverage. The Falling Man is a photograph taken by Associated Press photographer Richard Drew of a man falling from the north tower of the World Trade Center during the September 11, 2001 attacks in New York City. The photo was printed in many newspapers the next day and then, due to public outcry, disappeared from public view. In this lesson, students face this uncomfortable image and analyze whether the public should determine what truth is covered by the media. Enduring Images of 9/11: The Impact of Artifacts for Remembrance Presentation focuses on the use of the National September Memorial and Museum's online catalog to help students attain an emotional understanding of the events that day; presentation focuses along the story of Welles Crowther, a volunteer firefighter who worked in the WTC that is responsible for saving multiple lives, recognized as "the man in the red bandanna"
D	Matt Social Studies Teacher and Department Chair, Maryland, Grades 10-12 Michelle World History and Sophomore Civics Teacher, Illinois, Grades 9-10	Islam and Islamophophia During 9/11 and Its Aftermath This presentation will examine the perpetrators and how their beliefs were used to carry out the 9/11 attacks and why some terrorists are drawn to radical Islamism to justify their attacks. Additionally, we will look at individual stories of how people of Middle Eastern descent and people of the Islamic faith were treated living in the US in a post 9/11 world. This will focus on the ideas of stereotypes and prejudice that came with 9/11 as well as how it affects the daily lives of many Americans.
E	Rachel Global History Teacher, New York, Grades 6-12 Deborah World History Teacher, South Carolina, Grade 7	Introducing the Timeline In this presentation, the group will model activities that can be done in the Middle School classroom for lessons focusing on the timeline of 9-11 while engaging with primary sources. They will create a one page interactive timeline and will collect facts and data through a gallery walk of student work.

Appendix C

Appendix D

Interview Questions:

- 1. What grade(s) are you teaching or working with during the 2019-2020 school year?
- 2. Did you use any of the materials from the 9/11 Museum's professional development sessions? If so, which materials did you use? Please be specific.
- 3. How did you use the materials? And how did you fit them into your curriculum?
- 4. What, if any, Library of Congress materials did you use? Please be specific.
- 5. Describe the context and classroom environment where you used the materials?
- 6. What did you notice about students' responses to the activities?
- Is there anything else you would like to say about the impact of the 9/11 Museum professional development or the resources on your classroom practice?

Acknowledgements

This research was funded by The Teaching with Primary Sources (TPS) Eastern Region program at Waynesburg University. The mission of the Library of Congress Teaching with Primary Sources program is to build awareness of the Library's educational initiatives; provide content that promotes the effective educational use of the Library's resources; and offer access to and promote sustained use of the Library's educational resources. The program was in coordination with the Gotham Center for New York History's (CUNY) K-12 Education Program. We would like to thank Ms. Julie Maurer, the Gotham Center's Education Director, for her considerable efforts on behalf of the project.

About the Authors:

Elise Langan holds a B.S. from Northwestern University, an M.S. from the University of Southern California and a Ph.D. in Social Studies Education from New York University. She is an Associate Professor at Bronx Community College, City University of New York, in the Department of Education. Dr. Langan is a Consortium Member with the Library of Congress Teaching with Primary Sources Eastern Region and has received three grants (2020, 2021, 2022) from the Library of Congress to train teachers on effective ways to teach about the September 11, 2001 attacks. She is a visiting scholar in New York University's Department of History. Dr. Langan has published in *Teacher Education and Practice, The Journal of Educational Thought, International Journal of Educational Research, Journal of Contemporary Research in Education,* and *Excelsior: Leadership in Teaching and Learning.*

Cathlin Goulding, Ed.D., is an adjunct assistant professor in the Adolescent Social Studies program at Hunter College, City University of New York. She co-directs YURI Education Project, a design studio that creates educational resources for clients like The New York City Department of Education, The WNET Group, the Smithsonian's National Portrait Gallery and Asian Pacific American Center, Sesame Workshop, and the Center for Asian American Media. She started in the education field as a high school English Language Arts teacher. She has an M.A. in Education from the University of California at Berkeley and an Ed.D. in Curriculum & Teaching from Teachers College, Columbia University. Her research and writings focus on place-based learning, public pedagogy, and the teaching of historical violence. <u>cg313@hunter.cuny.edu</u>