Social studies textbooks in Turkey in terms of citizenship and human rights: a critical discourse analysis

Davut Gürel [a] *, Görkem Avcı[b]

[a] *Bartın University, Faculty of Education, Department of Turkish and Social Sciences Education, Campus, Turkey*
[b] *Bartın University, Faculty of Education, Department of Primary School Education, Campus, Turkey*

Abstract

Educational institutions play a significant role in today's world, where the concepts of democracy and human rights gain more and more importance day by day. Every country aims to provide the qualifications that its citizens believe they should have via educational institutions. While doing this, it can reflect the current ideology of the period into curricula. In Turkey, as a democratic country, the most important course in which the content related to citizenship and human rights is conveyed at the primary level is the social studies course. In this study, it is aimed to examine the situations of including the concepts of human rights and citizenship in social studies textbooks used in Turkey with critical discourse analysis. For this purpose, text analyzes were conducted using Sketch Engine software. The textbooks were compared with the Turkish web pages in terms of the concepts related to citizenship and human rights, and the use of these concepts in the text was evaluated through a critical approach. The results revealed that the selected textbooks touched on some concepts related to human rights and citizenship very superficially; the treatment of some concepts was not compatible with social realities. It was concluded that it could not be sufficient enough to offer courses with such concepts as women's rights, feminism, gender equality, ethnicity, belief, political rights, and multiculturalism.

Keywords: Human rights, citizenship, representation of differences, critical discourse analysis, social studies textbooks

1. Introduction

Social and political concerns, such as recent economic troubles, racism, terrorism, political deadlocks, social imbalances or the disintegration of politics in many parts of the world, undermine the foundations of the culture of peace and human rights, thus endangering democratic stability. For this reason, human rights and citizenship issues have been among the priorities of countries in the last decade (Flowers, 2010). Human rights and citizenship are the basic building blocks of democratic systems and democracy.

* Corresponding author: Davut Gürel. ORCID ID.: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2309-9202
  E-mail address: gureldavut@gmail.com

It is not possible to ignore these two elements (human rights and citizenship), which are obligatory to be applied in societies on a universal scale (Özbek, 2017). Human rights, which have a very wide scope (Dan, 2015), are defined as the rights that a person has gained just because of being human. It is the set of rights that a person has regardless of where he/she lives, from which race, or from which country he/she is a citizen (Sen, 2004; Donnelly, 1995; Mcbeth, Nolan, & Rice, 2011; Kepenekçi, 2008; Flowers, 2010). Citizenship is a status given to those who are full members of a community (Lawson, 2001). They are obligations that define a person's status, rights and responsibilities as a member of a society (Althof & Berkowitz, 2006). Although human rights and citizenship are two closely related concepts, universality in the concept of human rights and the state in the concept of citizenship come to the fore. However, in the basic idea that both of them have, there are the basic rights of human beings and the duties and responsibilities he undertakes as a social being (Akdağ and Taşkaya, 2018). These two dynamic concepts are in a dialectical relationship from the past to the present in the universal dimension (Özbek, 2017).

1.1. Development of human rights, approaches and pursuits

Unlike other living things, humans, who lead their lives, have needed to establish certain systems, mainly because they have important functions such as making decisions, having goals and objectives, forming societies, and improving themselves thanks to their ability to think. In the light of these developments, human rights have emerged (Clapham, 2015). From past to present, many different approaches to human rights have emerged. Natural human rights, which is one of these approaches; defines them as moral rights that aim to protect the superior interests and characteristics of human personality such as autonomy, personality and freedom, and guarantee the future of human beings (Montero, 2014). From a political point of view; Human rights, which gained momentum and validity after World War II, took its place as a moral, ethical and political force in global politics and international law (Baxi, 1997).

In the context of the past, present and future, the idea of human rights theoretically encompasses an intercultural, irrefutable, fundamentally rational, internationally valid and applicable concept. In this direction, individuals, cultures and nations act jointly; It enables them to accept and be valued as an individual goal, not as a means towards a certain goal (Al-Darawesh, 2020). Since human rights are not given by any authority, nor can they be taken, they are a product of natural law (Flowers, 2010). It sets the standards for the provision and expansion of human rights, civil, political and socio-economic rights, which form the basis of all rights, and ensures that the rights system is secured by providing the moral foundations (Dan, 2015). Human rights, which contain many philosophical approaches, can differ in terms of thought and practice in societies.

In this context, Turkey is one of the countries that witnessed different processes and included various situations.

1.2. Human Rights and Problems in Turkey

The concept of Human Rights, a product of the twentieth century, has come to encompass understandings of the rights of individuals in all societies. As a matter of fact, in order for the expression of human rights to become widespread and valid, bad events had to be experienced in societies on a global scale (Flowers, 2010; Blanchard, 2021). These events on a global scale are experienced in Turkey, which is experiencing similar processes, and Turkey has been associated with human rights violations for a long time. Although Turkey is a party to the fundamental conventions on human rights, it has not been able to demonstrate stability in the protection of these rights (Çınar and Şirin, 2017). On the other hand, perceived and experienced threats to the democratic system in Turkey have hindered progress and developments in the field of human rights (Rumford, 2001). The evaluations stated in the European Commission reports support this determination. In reports; It is stated that Turkey is a party to many international mechanisms related to human rights and continues its efforts to implement these mechanisms, but there are problems in the implementation part. Although the protection of human rights is guaranteed by the Constitution, it has been emphasized that there are fundamental deficiencies in the current situation and serious regressions and deteriorations in human rights continue. On the other hand, it has been stated that many freedom-restricting sanctions have been imposed and human rights have been violated, and that concerns continue on this issue (T.R. Ministry of Foreign Affairs [MFA], 2015, 2016, 2018, 2019, 2020, 2021 Reports).

1.3. Human Rights and Citizenship Education in the Turkish Education System

Human rights, which have become a necessity for societies, are taking place more and more in education policies and curricula (Moon, 2013). Similarly, in recent years, debates on citizenship have taken its place among the urgent issues evaluated within the scope of politics and education policies (Sardoč, 2021). Depending on social change and developments, human rights are increasingly combined with citizenship and citizenship education (Kiwan, 2005). On the basis of both human rights and citizenship concepts are the birthrights of human beings and the social duties imposed on them due to their life. What these rights and duties are and what can be done when a violation is encountered is given through training (Akdağ and Taşkaya, 2018). It is a fact that citizenship and human rights are considered as a problem and in this direction, the education of these two concepts has been on the agenda recently.

Citizenship and human rights are the basic building blocks of democratic systems. They are mandatory elements that cannot be ignored or insensitive (Özbek, 2017).

Human rights and citizenship education, which has a synergetic complementarity between them (Rapoport, 2021), contributes to individuals' acquisition of knowledge, acquisition of core values and skills development. While citizenship education aims to educate individuals as responsible members of the society they live in, human rights education is based on equality, human dignity, active participation and empowerment. While human rights education covers citizenship as one of its main subjects, citizenship education is based on human rights values. Regardless of the differences between them, both approaches serve democracy (Flowers, 2010). In recent years, human rights education has been widely accepted as a requirement. Undoubtedly, the way to effectively acquire human rights education is through an effective citizenship education (Hung, 2012).

> *One of the most important development indicators of societies today is their sensitivity and attitudes towards citizenship and human rights issues. In general, the development and quality of citizenship and human rights education, compliance with national and international documents, the success levels of the students who take this course in reaching the goals of the course; The behaviors they display in terms of knowledge, belief, exercising their rights as a citizen and helping others to exercise their rights also reveal the characteristics of that society* (Özbek, 2017, p: 365).

Both nationally and internationally, human rights and citizenship education make significant contributions to citizenship education. Transferring these contributions to individuals is possible through teaching programs in formal education environments (Fernekes, 2016). In this context, in Turkey, which tries to achieve certain standards in human rights and citizenship issues (MFA, 2015, 2016, 2018, 2019, 2020, 2021 Reports); human rights and citizenship education, in the Turkish education system, Malûmat-ı Vataniye, Vatanî Information, Citizenship, Citizenship, Citizenship Education, Citizenship Knowledge, Citizenship Knowledge, Citizenship and Human Rights Education, Citizenship and Democracy Education, Human Rights, Citizenship and Democracy. (Erol, 2018; Ulubey, 2021). In addition, Human Rights and Citizenship education has taken place in the programs as an intermediate discipline and has spread to different fields (Ülger, 2013; Som & Karataş, 2015; Ersoy, Balbağ & Gündoğan-Bayır, 2017). As can be seen, there have been important changes in the historical process not only in the content but also in the way citizenship education is given. The transition to modern citizenship education in Turkey started with international initiatives in the 1990s, has undergone a significant transformation in the last 30 years, and the search for ideal citizenship education still continues (Şen, 2019).

Curricula in the education system and textbooks created according to the program reflect the value given by the country administration to the subject in the teaching of a

subject. In other words, the subjects in the curriculum and textbook content of a course can be seen as the projection of what the country's government wants its citizens to know about this subject. (Sezer and Sanli, 2017). In certain periods, updates were made in line with the developments in the Turkish National Education system on Human Rights and Citizenship, and Citizenship and Human Rights were presented to the students as a course in certain periods and distributed within the course in certain periods. These updated programs, according to the conditions of the day in the Republic of Turkey, content, purpose, scope, etc. It also differs in terms of its aspects (Akdağ and Taşkaya, 2018). Therefore, the changes made within the scope of Human Rights and Citizenship Education are changes with a paradoxical content that reflect the historical paradox of Turkish modernity. On the one hand, the programs promote a very specific, nationalistic, passive and authoritarian concept of citizenship, while on the other hand they include human rights content in detail. Thus, human rights and citizenship education oscillates between maintaining a separate Turkish identity and the will to be a part of the global world (Çayır and Gürkaynak, 2007).

1.4. Human Rights, Citizenship Education and Social Studies Curriculum

Citizenship and Human Rights Education is one of the indispensable priorities of modern society (Ramazan and Ezlam, 2017). During the pandemic, societies continue to struggle to protect human rights, especially for those marginalized based on race, gender, religion, sexual orientation and other identities. In this context, human rights education becomes a hope and exit door for individuals (Mitoma and Marcus, 2020). However, teaching and learning about human rights can be very difficult (Walsh, Hicks, & van Hover, 2017). The concepts of "education and social studies" come to the fore in citizenship and human rights education. Undoubtedly, the ultimate goals of both social studies and education are to raise good citizens (Ülger, 2012; Som & Karataş, 2015). One of the disciplines that forms the basis of the social studies course, which includes many disciplines and is a component of different subject-contents (Vlaardingerbroek, 2020), is citizenship education. (Garcia and Michaelis, 2001). The reason for this is the aim of the social studies course to prepare students for citizenship of a democratic country equipped with citizenship awareness, knowing and applying human rights. Thus, social studies have undertaken the important purpose of providing a social order in which people will live in harmony (Barth, 1991). Educational programs aim to raise individuals as global citizens while at the same time aiming to raise good citizens for societies. Schools, which societies have established in order to transfer cultural heritage and prepare individuals for life, have undertaken important duties at this point. The social studies course given in schools is also related to the acquisitions related to citizenship and it is expected to raise good citizens from the social studies course (Barth & Demirtaş, 1997).

Citizenship education includes having basic knowledge, skills and values so that individuals are knowledgeable about their own country, responsible and participatory towards their country. While the general purpose of the education system is to raise good citizens in a country, this task falls to the social studies course within the courses in the curriculum (Doğanay, 2002). There is a general consensus that raising individuals as good citizens is the main purpose of social studies teaching (Sim & Print, 2005). As a matter of fact, when defining the concept of social studies, it is often emphasized that social studies course aims to raise effective and productive citizens (Barth, Barr, & Shermis, 1977). In this context, in order to prepare students for active citizenship, qualified educational practices and pedagogy that provide knowledge, skills and values within the scope of social studies course must accompany students (Print & Smith, 2000). Although human rights and citizenship education were taught as courses under different names at different dates, citizenship and human rights issues were included in the content of some courses and were spread to the courses as intermediate disciplinary achievements (Akdağ and Taşkaya, 2018). In this direction, many achievements within the scope of human rights and citizenship education are included in the Social Studies course curriculum. Considering the aim of raising good citizens, this situation is important (Tonga & Kılıçoğlu, 2013).

Making the individual an active part of the society is one of the main aims of education. In order to fulfill this purpose, individuals should be given national and universal values within a certain plan at school. Social studies teaching has a very important place in terms of gaining these values. Social studies course aims to socialize the individual. In this respect, the concepts of human rights and citizenship come to the fore. Social studies course has important duties in the teaching of human rights and citizenship education. Teachers are expected to teach their students which citizenship and human rights they have as individuals, and to make them understand that they should really claim these rights. In addition, it can be said that students should be made aware that we have responsibilities in the context of citizenship and human rights (Akdağ & Taşkaya, 2018). "Social studies as citizenship transfer", one of the three approaches in Social Studies teaching, aims to raise effective and responsible citizens (Barr, Barth, & Shermis, 2013). With this tradition, it is aimed to provide students with knowledge, concepts and skills as well as national and universal values (Hanaylı, Öztürk, Baysan, & Akar-Vural, 2020). Social studies is taught as a combination of simplified social sciences and citizenship transfer. As a transfer of citizenship, social studies aims to socialize students by focusing on national consciousness, common culture and shared values, by equipping them with a specific set of values and knowledge at both cognitive and affective levels (Sim and Print, 2005). Similarly, Barr, Barth and Shermis (1977) defined social studies as the integration of knowledge and experience related to social relations in order to raise good citizens.

Countries aim to shape their future generations through the curricula in their education systems. Curriculum, which is one of the basic elements of education, and textbooks created within the framework of the program reflect the perspective of the political administration on the relevant subject in the teaching of a subject, phenomenon, event, content or situation. In other words, the content of the curriculum and textbook is the projection of what the administration wants its citizens to know. In this context, a phenomenon, subject, content, achievement etc. When looking for an answer to any problem related to teaching and learning, it is the best approach to examine the programs and textbooks. Textbooks contain content that a society wants to convey to its individuals in order to prepare its future and that has been officially accepted by the administration. In this respect, they play a key role in achieving the desired country goals in education systems. With these features, they serve to bring the political and social norms of the society to individuals (Sezer & Şanlı, 2017). Representing curricula (Meyer, 2020), the most basic resource for teachers and students in education processes (Yücel & Karamustafaoğlu, 2020) and one of the most effective ways to reach students (Karasu-Avcı & Faiz, 2018) It is important to examine it in order to adapt it according to the conditions and to reveal the deficiencies (Koyunlu Ünlü and Şen, 2018). Revealing the current status of the social studies course in the textbooks as a reflection of human rights and citizenship issues in the Turkish education system will make an important contribution to human rights and citizenship education in Turkey. On the other hand, in this research, it is also important to analyze human rights and citizenship issues, concepts and content in social studies textbooks by adopting a critical approach and using a different technique, computer-based analytical techniques (computer aided text analysis) (Meyer, 2020).

It can be said that critical discourse analysis has the potential to reveal important results in curricula, since citizenship education covers the socio-political participation of different identities in the society, that is, power relations, and the documents created by the state regarding citizenship education are also political texts that reflect the ideological power balances (Şen, 2019). Similarly, when textbooks are considered as the most basic and primary way of implementing curricula; Analysis of the content of social studies textbooks with the aim of raising good citizens can give an idea about the place and importance of human rights and citizenship education (Meyer, 2020). In this study, it is important that analytical transparency is emphasized in the analysis of data (Meyer, 2020) and that critical discourse analysis is adopted in the evaluation of textbooks. Critical discourse analysis (Rogers, et al., 2016) used in educational research at the international level and in all fields is a qualitative analytical approach used to critically define, interpret and explain the ways in which discourses construct, maintain and legitimize social inequalities (Mullet, 2018). Critical discourse analysis refers to a collection of socio-theoretical perspectives on discourses in society and is a language-based approach that deals with the critique of power relations and ideology in society.

The sources used for these criticisms are mostly oral or written texts that reflect socio-political parameters and power relations (O'Regan & Betzel, 2016). In this direction, the analysis of social studies textbooks was made by adopting the critical discourse analysis approach, and the findings were interpreted with reference to human rights and citizenship education. The obtained results can make positive contributions to social studies textbooks that appeal to the age, up-to-date, more effective and functional. In this context, the aim of this research is to examine the social studies textbooks taught in the 2021-2022 academic year in terms of human rights and citizenship concepts. For this purpose, answers to the following questions were sought:

- Which concepts in social studies textbooks can be examined within the scope of human rights and citizenship?
- What is the relationship between the concepts of human rights and citizenship in textbooks and Turkish internet pages (resources)?
- Under which themes can the concepts of human rights and citizenship be gathered and what does this mean for the social studies course?
- How can the representation of differences in social studies textbooks taught in Turkey be evaluated in terms of citizenship and human rights?

2. Method

After the curriculum studies carried out in 2017 by the Ministry of National Education in Turkey (from now on Ministry), primary school 4 and secondary school 5,6 and 7 between the years 2018-2019. 9 social studies textbooks to be taught in the classroom were approved by the Ministry and put into practice. These books, which were included in the sample of the study, were obtained from the Education Information Network (EBA) of the Ministry. Any of these books is one of the compulsory books to be chosen by educational institutions and teachers, but institutions or teachers can also use different resources or materials in addition to these books. Detailed information about the books used in the research is given in Table 1. Since there is an approved book that can be read by different publishing houses at any grade level, each book is given an identifying code (For example, the SS5.1 code refers to the Secondary School and Imam Hatip Secondary School Social Studies 5 Textbook, published by Ata Publishing and taught at the 5th grade level).

Table 1. Social Studies Textbooks Examined

Ref.	English title	Turkish title	Size	Pages	Author(s)	Publisher	Certification	Publication
SS4 [b]	Primary School Social Studies 4 Textbook	İlkokul Sosyal Bilgiler 4 Ders Kitabı	B5	208	Tüysüz, S.	Tuna Publications	2018	2019
SS5	Secondary School and Imam Hatip Secondary School Social Studies 4 Textbook	Ortaokul ve İmam Hatip Ortaokulu Sosyal Bilgiler 5 Ders kitabı	B5	208	Şahin, E.	Anadol Publications	2018	2019
SS5.1	Secondary School and Imam Hatip Secondary School Social Studies 5 Textbook	Ortaokul ve İmam Hatip Ortaokulu Sosyal Bilgiler 5 Ders kitabı	B5	192	Harut, S.B.	Ata Publications	2019	2021
SS5.2	Secondary School and Imam Hatip Secondary School Social Studies 5 Textbook	Ortaokul ve İmam Hatip Ortaokulu Sosyal Bilgiler 5 Ders kitabı	B5	201	Evirgen et al	MEB Publications	2019	2021
SS6	Secondary School and Imam Hatip Secondary School Social Studies 6 Textbook	Ortaokul ve İmam Hatip Ortaokulu Sosyal Bilgiler 6 Ders kitabı	B5	288	Şahin, E.	Anadol Publications	2019	2021
SS6.1	Secondary School and Imam Hatip Secondary School Social Studies 6 Textbook	Ortaokul ve İmam Hatip Ortaokulu Sosyal Bilgiler 6 Ders kitabı	B5	276	Yıldırım et al	MEB Publications	2019	2019
SS7	Secondary School and Imam Hatip Secondary School Social Studies 7th Grade Textbook	Ortaokul ve İmam Hatip Ortaokulu Sosyal Bilgiler 7. Sınıf Ders kitabı	B5	252	Azer, H.	Ekoyay Publications	2019	2019
SS7.1	Secondary School and Imam Hatip Secondary School Social Studies 7 Textbook	Ortaokul ve İmam Hatip Ortaokulu Sosyal Bilgiler 7 Ders kitabı	B5	256	Gültekin et al	MEB Publications	2018	2021
SS7.2	Secondary School and Imam Hatip Secondary School Social Studies 7	Ortaokul ve İmam Hatip Ortaokulu Sosyal Bilgiler 7	B5	240	Açıl et al	MEB Publications	2019	2019

a Indicates the date the book was approved by the Ministry of National Education (MoNE).

b This is the identifier code given to each book due to the existence of more than one approved book belonging to different publishers taught at the same level.

In the study, the main texts and titles of the textbooks were included in the scope of the study. The title part, the national anthem, the address to the youth, the picture of Atatürk (the founding father of the Republic of Turkey), the Turkish flag, and the dictionary, index, bibliography and maps given in the last section of the books are excluded from the scope. All content has been analyzed in terms of human rights and citizenship concepts using both qualitative and quantitative techniques. Computer-assisted text analysis was used to see the frequencies and distribution of the concepts selected for the purpose of the research (Pollach, 2012). It is thought that computer-aided analyzes can increase the reliability of the study in terms of the transparency of the analyzes and the reproducibility of the results (Meyer, 2020). For this purpose, Sketch Engine software (http://www.sketchengine.eu) was used for text analysis.

Before the software was used, a total of 956 words related to citizenship, which were considered important by the literature in social studies education, were determined by the researchers after the first stage of the study. These words were associated with 105 more comprehensive concepts, and these concepts were grouped under related themes in accordance with 5 different themes included in the Meyer (2020) study. Some of these concepts were used together with their synonyms (synonym) while scanning. Thus, it is aimed to make a comprehensive survey about that concept as much as possible. Sketch Engine software is a text analysis software that enables scanning large text collections in many languages for researchers from different fields. The software can scan all content in any language in the web environment and can also work on documents uploaded by the user. In this study, a corpus of 444,125 words (tokens), 327,914 words (words) and 25,417 sentences (sentences) was created by manually loading all of the social studies textbooks (9 books) into the system via the software. In order to determine how the words given under the themes are defined and used on the same software, the corpus created with Keyword-in-context (KWIC) was scanned. It was thought that the use of KWIC could help to see the relationship between context and concepts more easily (Meyer, 2020). In addition, Turkish web pages [trTenTen12] with a corpus size of 4,124,133,118 were scanned with the software and compared according to their inclusion of citizenship concepts in textbooks and web pages. Thus, it is aimed to make comparative inferences about the situation of the words related to citizenship on the web pages, which are a reflection of the Turkish social reality and the world of meaning, and the situation in the textbooks. However, it should not be forgotten that the qualitative dimension of the study and the attribution of different meanings to the concepts of human rights may cause differences in interpretation of the results obtained.

In the second phase of the study, critical discourse analysis technique, one of the qualitative research method techniques, was used in order to verify and in-depth analyze the quantitative data obtained in the study. This technique derives its source from Foucault's relationship between discourse and power. With this analysis, it focuses on the ideology that is influential in the texts examined and deconstructs them by presenting

various arguments. Discourse is not context-free and context is a social reality made sense by people/cultures. In addition, with this method, a link is established between discourse and action (Oğuz, 2008). Thus, inferences were made about the compatibility of the expressions in the texts of the books with the book in general or whether there is a practical equivalent. Thus, by deconstructing all the books, it was tried to examine whether there were things that were overlooked or reduced in importance, and how the features examined in the texts interacted and interpreted with the arguments put forward (Balkın, 2004). Thus, it is aimed to contribute to the thinking of what is not said in the texts and to further expand the reading field (Eroğlu, 2012). The study is not a study that interprets how teachers or students make sense of the texts, but only inferences about which topics are highlighted in the texts or tried to be kept in the background.

3. Results

3.1. Textbooks in Terms of Citizenship and Human Rights Concepts

Key concepts related to citizenship and human rights were gathered under 5 different themes in 8 textbooks examined within the scope of the research. Among these themes, 16 key concepts were included in the theme of current issues, 29 in the theme of youth-society, 27 in the theme of political issues, 18 in the theme of economy and 15 in the theme of global issues. The concepts related to citizenship and human rights included in the social studies textbooks examined within the scope of the study are given in Table 2 in detail. In the table, the frequency of these concepts in both textbooks and Turkish internet pages is compared. In addition, sections of the texts in which these concepts are used in the textbooks are presented and the discourses used are interpreted in the light of the findings.

Table 2. Key terms about categorizations

Theme	Concepts	Number of hits per million tokens*	
		Textbook corpus	İnternet corpus (trTenTen12)
Current problems	Climate change	544.89	44.39
	Global Environmental problems	141.85	8.08
	Development	18.01	5.36
	Armament race	2.25	2.2
	Terror	159.86	151.8
	Global epidemics	12.0	6.89
	Wars	405.29	240.52
	Poverty	22.52	20.58
	Natural disasters	1,206.87	135.07
	Children rights	869.12	320.76
	Women rights	231.92	6.45
	Fossil fuel	218.41	120.21

	Mass migration	682.24	63.94
	Disadvantaged groups	65.3	113.07
	Prejudice	40.53	3.04
	Tendency of violence	69.8	99.64
	Individual	941.18	712.53
	Society	1616.66	740.34
	Modernism	159.86	207.39
	Democratic society	339.99	3.22
	Ideas	511.12	199.75
	İslam	459.33	399.27
	Good citizen	148.61	49.64
	Westernism	216.16	148.13
	Human relations	898.4	513.15
	Philosophy	108.08	71.43
	Status	13.51	31.85
	Religion	702.5	864.23
	School	785.81	537.07
	Family	677.74	682.31
Youth-Society	Culture	1423.02	545.19
	Morality	11.26	27.71
	Etiquette	6.75	7.65
	Private life	6.75	1.62
	Social welfare	29.27	0.97
	Socialization	29.27	2.56
	Social roles	878.13	1230.17
	Community	31.52	29.16
	Television	544.89	258.99
	Rationalism	380.52	48.88
	Success	164.37	321.73
	Language	294.96	3665.55
	Atatürk	918.66	259.09
	Internet	1249.65	452.9
	Values	315.23	293.55
	Turkish Constitution	195.89	139.47
	Peaceful policy	193.64	145.25
	Basic human rights	29.27	2.54
	Democracy	1341.96	416.31
	Independence	166.62	141.04
	Social rights	27.02	3.77
	Governmental administration	1679.71	2104.04
	Separation of powers	13.51	1.6
Political issues	Judgment	351.25	434.56
	State agency	189.14	52.11
	Respect for diversity	236.42	49.93
	Non-governmental organizations	389.53	189.65
	Legislative	603.43	514.34
	Politics	58.54	392.98
	Secularism	67.55	45.57
	Equity	1146.07	661.24
	Flag	60.19	31.65
	Republic	222.91	155.29

	Homeland	3309.88	1955.96
	Anthem	85.56	16.91
	Citizenship	265.69	99.55
	Nationalism	285.96	234.63
	Public	1384.75	353.43
	State	819.59	475.1
	Revolution	40.53	63.56
	Martial law	13.51	10.53
	Censor	18.01	6.84
Economy	Tax	162.12	145.45
	Social security	20.26	59.1
	Economic activities	2384.46	449.69
	Profit	51.79	44.15
	Economic growth	42.78	49.81
	Bank	121.59	185.4
	Consumption	963.69	298.11
	Production	1119.05	382.91
	Generate income	60.79	55.83
	Industry	738.53	188.34
	Unemployment	29.27	41.08
	Professions	1141.57	646.01
	Capital	177.88	373.56
	Economic rights	13.51	63.19
	Consumer rights	162.12	29.8
	Foreign currency	63.05	409.44
	Trade	914.16	201.25
	Finance	13.51	47
Global issues	Developing countries	6.75	0.84
	Developing 8 countries	11.26	0.01
	International organizations	562.9	113.16
	International cooperation	110.33	240.02
	International relations	9.01	10.19
	Armament	2.25	73.07
	Countries in the world	1742.75	1553.4
	Sustainability	15.76	28.51
	Energy	108.47	199.43
	Use of technology	812.83	399.07
	Digitalization	60.79	3.37
	Customs tax	24.77	32.33
	Petrol	171.12	139.03
	Global competition	18.01	0.81
	Middle east	13.51	59

* "Values are the normalized frequency of a word per one million words in the focus corpus, plus a simple maths parameter (fpmfocus + n, n = 1) divided by the same word's normalized frequency per million plus the parameter in the reference corpus (fpmref + n, n = 1)." (Meyer, 2020, p.25)

Climate change (544.89), global environmental problems (141.85), natural disasters (1,206.87), children's rights (869.12) and mass migrations (682.24) are among the most frequently cited key concepts in the current issues theme. Key concepts such as development (18.01) arms race (2.25) global epidemics (27.02) poverty (22.52) prejudice (40.53) among the key concepts under this theme, which have a very important place for conscious and responsible citizenship, are very few in textbooks. appears to be included.

It is seen that the texts in the textbooks touch on these concepts superficially and there is not enough information about the reflections of the concept in practice. This situation can be interpreted as the theory and practice of the textbooks on the concepts of human rights and citizenship are not sufficiently compatible. The arms race, which occupies the agenda in today's world, is not mentioned in almost any of the textbooks. In only one textbook (SS7), the concept of armament is only mentioned as a concept in a text. Similarly, although the global epidemics that have been effective all over the world in recent years have been included in the textbooks, their causes or ways of protection from the epidemic have not been adequately addressed. The statements in a textbook on global epidemics are as follows:

> *The spokesperson of the World Health Organization stated that in order to prevent patients in countries with Ebola epidemics from carrying the virus to other regions, cooperation is being made with relevant organizations in these countries. Stating that the governments in these countries have created quarantine areas in places where the epidemic is common, the spokesperson noted that people are prevented from traveling to other parts of the country (SS7.2).*

In the text, a measure taken based on prohibitions is included, and it is not mentioned what kind of importance citizens will take as individuals. Similarly, HIV virus (31,072) or AIDS (40,292), which have been among the diseases that have been on the world agenda for many years, have not been included in any textbooks. However, it is seen that these concepts have a very important place in the internet corpus. The fact that these diseases are not included does not mean that this disease does not exist in Turkey. In 2021, a total of 2074 cases related to these diseases were detected in Turkey and 25 people died (General Directorate of Public Health [HSGM], 2021). Although the concept of poverty is included in the textbooks, what this concept means, how this problem can be solved, what is done to eradicate poverty in the world or in Turkey is not sufficiently mentioned, and it is generally discussed with different concepts. In particular, poverty was handled through the aid of foundations, associations or public institutions. This situation can be considered as an issue that affects the raising of citizens with low awareness of poverty and its solution in underdeveloped or developing countries such as Turkey, and the decrease in the visibility of the main problem because the concept of poverty is handled with concepts such as benevolence and social sensitivity. In addition, some textbooks do not include the concept of poverty at all (SS5, SS6). An expression given in the text of the books in which the concept is included is as follows:

> *The problem of hunger and poverty is a problem observed more intensely in rural areas. The most important reasons for the deepening of the*

> *hunger problem in the world and the increasing concerns on this issue*
> *are the increasing drought due to global climate change and the conflicts*
> *arising from regional conflicts* (SS7.1).

As can be seen, he mentions that poverty is a problem and its possible causes are climate change and regional conflicts. The most important cause of poverty, inequalities in income distribution, the reflections of poverty in Turkey or in the world, what politicians should do to solve poverty or what responsibilities people have in this regard were not mentioned. However, poverty (69,187/16.78%) has a very important place in Turkish pages scanned with Sketch Engine and have an internet corpus size of 4,124,133,118. It is very thought-provoking that a concept that is so important in the Turkish conceptual world is given very little place in the textbooks.

The concepts that stand out compared to other concepts in the youth-society theme are the individual (941.18), society (1616.66), human relations (898.4), culture (1423.02), social roles (878.13), Atatürk (918.66) and the internet (1249.65). Considering the aims of the social studies course (MEB, 2018), it can be considered natural that these concepts come to the fore in the textbooks. Digital citizenship, e-Government, virtual commerce, social media, etc., related to citizenship rights and responsibilities, due to the updating of the curriculum in 2018 and the developments in digital technology in the program. It was noted that new situations and new problems such as digital division, identity theft, privacy of personal information, cyber fraud, and cyber bullying were not emerging, and it was pointed out that in-class and extra-curricular activities related to the subject should be included in order to improve students' digital citizenship competencies. For all these reasons, it can be thought that the concept of internet has a very important place under the youth-society theme. It is seen that the internet is included in a course book as follows:

> *Choosing a place to stay is the first thing to do before traveling.*
> *In the past, this election was made by looking at newspaper*
> *advertisements, television advertisements or by familiar*
> *advice. Nowadays, this work is usually done in social media*
> *environments such as forums and blog posts on the internet.*
> *What are the prices and services of the hotels? Which hotel is*
> *the most preferred? Are the guests satisfied with the services?*
> *People can now find the answers to these questions online and*
> *make the right decision* (SS4).

As seen in the text, what the internet has changed in our lives and what conveniences it has brought us is given through an example. Under the youth-society theme, it is seen that the least included concepts in the textbooks are status (13.51), morality (11.26), etiquette (6.75) and private life (6.75). It can be said that these concepts are less frequently encountered concepts in the internet corpus compared to other concepts. From

this point of view, it can be concluded that there is a harmony between the books and the internet corpus.

In the theme of political issues, the concepts of democracy (1341.96), state administration (1679.71), equality (1146.07), homeland (3309.88) and people (1384.75) are the most frequently used concepts in textbooks. Considering that one of the aims of social studies is to raise democratic citizens, it is natural that concepts such as democracy, equality and public are among the most frequently used concepts. However, it is seen that the concepts of democracy (416.31), equality (661.24) and the people (353.43) are less common in the internet corpus compared to the textbooks. From this point of view, it can be said that there is a stronger emphasis on democracy and related concepts in textbooks. In the 2018 Social Studies Curriculum, the 15th purpose of social studies' special purpose is "to understand the historical processes of the concepts of human rights, national sovereignty, democracy, secularism and republic and to organize their lives according to democratic rules by understanding their effects on today's Turkey". The number of achievements given clearly reveals the role of social studies on the subject. In addition, the following statements are included in a textbook on democracy:

> *People living in countries with democracy determine their future by choosing the people who will govern them. In democracies, the source of sovereignty is the people. This situation is stated in Article 6 of the Constitution, titled "Sovereignty", as follows: "Sovereignty belongs to the nation unconditionally." The people exercise their sovereignty through elected representatives. The will of the nation, which consists of the coming together and fusion of the free thoughts and opinions of individuals, is an indispensable element for democracy. For this reason, national sovereignty is one of the most basic principles of democracy* (SS6).

As it is stated in the expression, not only the concept of democracy, but also the people, sovereignty, elections, etc., which are closely related to democracy. concepts are also included. When the textbooks were examined, it was seen that democracy or concepts related to it were included at every grade level. It can be stated that the concepts of state administration and homeland are similar in both textbooks and internet corpus. Under this theme, the concepts of basic human rights (29.27), social rights (27.02), separation of powers (13.51), martial law (13.51) and censorship (18.01) are the least used concepts in textbooks. The fact that these concepts are rare both in textbooks and in the internet corpus is quite thought-provoking. It is seen that the concept of secularism, which is included in this theme and is always one of the current issues in Turkey, takes place more in textbooks than in the internet corpus (45.57).

Economic activity (2384.46), production (1119.05), occupations (1141.57), consumption (963.69) and trade (914.16) are among the most frequently encountered concepts in the economics theme, which is another theme. These concepts take place more frequently in textbooks than in the internet corpus. The fact that the social studies course aims to provide the students with skills such as entrepreneurship and financial literacy can be thought to have a positive effect on the prominence of these concepts. Social security (20.26), unemployment (29.27), economic rights (13.51), finance (13.51) and economic growth (42.78) are the concepts that are closely related to the economy and are the least included in the textbooks. When the frequency of all of these concepts are included in the textbooks and the frequency of the internet corpus, it is seen that they occur more frequently in the internet corpus than in the textbooks. The concept of unemployment or rights related to social security, which occupy the agenda in developing countries, are rarely mentioned in the textbooks. This word is not included in the SS4 and SS5.1 books. The statement in a textbook on unemployment is as follows: "People earn their living by working in industrial plants. In this respect, industrial facilities play an important role in preventing unemployment. (SS5). It is thought that textbooks should give more place to unemployment.

It is seen that the most frequently encountered concepts in the textbooks, which are included in the last theme, global issues, are world countries (1742.75), international institutions-organizations (562.9), technology use (812.83). Similarly, the concepts of international cooperation (110.33) and oil (171.12) are among the concepts that are mentioned more frequently than other concepts. The Palestinian problem, the Yemeni crisis, the Iran and Arabia problem, which should be included in this category and have an important place in the world and Turkey's agenda, have been mentioned once in the books. Although the concept of sect, which is one of the most important concepts of the Middle East region, in which Turkey is located, is included in all 6th and 7th grade textbooks, sectarian problems or sectarian wars, which are also an important subject of this region, are not sufficiently included in any textbook. Sectarian conflicts are mentioned in only one textbook as follows:

> *Turkey's leadership in helping and solidarity among Muslims is also a result of this level of development. Turkey's term presidency demonstrates its leading role in the OIC. Many issues such as the civil war in Syria, the Yemen crisis, sectarian conflicts, the Iran-Saudi Arabia tension and the Palestinian issue are waiting for a solution* (SS6.1).

As can be seen, not only the sectarian conflict, but also the current issues of Palestine, Yemen, Syria, and Iran-Saudi Arabia tensions are also included. In this respect, the fact that textbooks deal with current problems or issues can be considered as a positive feature. However, it can be considered as a shortcoming that sectarian

problems or the problems between the mentioned countries are conceptually included, not mentioning why these problems are experienced or not offering solutions, and not including what kind of sensitivities Turkey has. Regarding the use of technology, which is another concept under this theme, it is seen that the following statements are included in the internet news text titled "The Balance Sheet of the Anatolian Rally in Antalya Was Heavy" in a textbook in order to raise awareness about the harms of misuse of technology:

> *During the Anatolian Rally held in Antalya, the fallow deer under protection were damaged. Of the 44 fallow deer left, the last of their generation, only in Antalya, 7 of them were pregnant and died due to the engine noise of rally cars. Other fallow deer, who were disturbed by the noise, were injured by hitting trees and rocks as they panicked and fled* (SS4).

Although the importance of being sensitive to the environment, the correct use of technology and the love of animals has been tried to be emphasized in this text, it is seen that this text may create a prejudice in students towards extreme sports other than what is intended. In addition, it is seen that the news text does not have a scientific content and it is given without ensuring the accuracy of the information contained. For this reason, it is considered very important to prepare textbooks with a more objective approach and multidimensional thinking. The distribution of citizenship-related words by themes is shown in Table 3.

Tabl*e* 3. Distribution of citizenship concepts in textbooks to themes

Theme	Total Words (Tokens)	
	f	*%*
Current problems	4705,88	11%
Youth-society	13568,24	31%
Political issues	13196,13	30%
Economy	8180,13	19%
Global issues	3670,51	8%
Total	43320,89	100%

As seen in Table 3, it is seen that the concepts related to citizenship included in social studies textbooks are the concepts that can be grouped under the theme of youth-society (31%). This theme is followed by political issues (30%). It can be said that the concepts that are the least included among the citizenship concepts are the concepts related to global issues. As seen in the table, the concepts included in the theme of global issues are 8% of the total concepts. This theme is followed by the theme of current problems with a rate of 11%. Based on these data, it can be said that the concepts related to the themes are not evenly distributed.

3.2. Women's Rights, Feminism, Gender in Society

It is very important that the words about women's rights find more place in textbooks than on the internet. This situation can be seen as a reflection of the sensitivity regarding women's rights in Turkish society. However, it can be said that there is a female identity construction with reference to social traditional gender roles. The following statements in a different context in a textbook are very important:

> *Anatolian women not only decorate their headscarves with lace, but also use them as a nonverbal communication element. With needle lace, she expresses her feelings such as love, pain, regret, anger, disappointment, happiness. For example, a woman who is angry with her husband covers a hot pepper lace. The new bride, who wants to convey a good message to her mother-in-law, presents a Yemeni embroidered meadow grass lace. For us to be as fresh as the meadows and as pleasant as the grass...* (SS7.1).

Considering the above quotation, the place of traditional handicrafts in Turkish cultural life has been tried to be emphasized. However, it can be said that some words chosen to have an emotional effect also refer to gender roles. The fact that a woman tells her husband about this because she is angry with her, also contains messages that she cannot or should not say her thoughts directly in front of her husband. It can be interpreted in a similar way that a bride cannot express her feelings and try to explain her with a Yemeni so that her relationship with her mother-in-law will be better. The use of "female", which is an addressing word, instead of the word "woman", which expresses gender in the text, also draws attention. Among all the textbooks, the word "lady" was used instead of the word woman only in the SS7.1 book.

The word women's rights appear in only two textbooks. In these books, women's rights are generally mentioned and not detailed. In a textbook (SS7.2, p.184) "In the first Turkish states, the wife of the ruler also attended the congresses. Evaluate this situation in terms of democracy and women's rights." The question was asked and the students were asked to answer it. However, explanatory statements about women's rights are not used in the book, and they are mentioned very superficially in a few places. This situation can be expressed as a negativity for the sake of raising future generations more sensitive in Turkey (Amnesty International [AI], 2003; European Commission [EC], 2021), which is constantly at the center of criticism in terms of women's rights. Similarly, the fact that there are statements about women's rights and equality between women and men in different parts of all textbooks can be interpreted as an indication that women are not sufficiently active in different areas of social life in Turkey. The practical examples of positive discrimination against women given in the textbooks on the subject (Ex. SS6, p. 230) prove this situation.

In the scans, it was seen that the concepts of feminism or feminist, which have the status of being included in Turkish web pages (22,084), are not included in any textbook. The same is true for LGBT (4.085) or other related concepts. Democracy, equality, etc. in all textbooks. The fact that these concepts are not included despite the constant emphasis of these concepts can be a subject of criticism for the construction of a democratic and egalitarian society. The following expressions are used in a textbook:

> *The stereotypes formed in the society can be against different genders and socioeconomic groups, as well as against different ethnic and religious groups. The stereotypes about gender discrimination are that girls don't play football, boys don't cook, etc. judgments are examples. However, our gender characteristics do not prevent us from doing these* (SS6.1).

These expressions, which include stereotypes about gender, can create an awareness of the concept of gender in students. In another part of the same book (SS6.1, p. 68), the Prophet Hz. Muhammad said, "O people! I advise you to observe the rights of women and to fear Allah in this regard. You have a right over women, and women have a right over you…" It is also emphasized in terms of religion that it is necessary to be sensitive about women's rights. Although all these reveal that there is a sensitivity towards women's rights, the state's obligations to protect women's rights, the absence of reference to international documents on the equality of women and men and the protection of women's rights can be considered as an important shortcoming. Turkey's withdrawal in 2021 from the Council of Europe Convention on the Prevention and Combating of Violence Against Women and Domestic Violence (Istanbul Convention), which was signed in 2011, can be interpreted as a contradiction between the discourse in textbooks and real-life practices for the protection of women's rights.

3.3. Belief, Ethnicity and Disadvantaged Groups

The lands of Turkey have historically hosted many civilizations. This land has been the living space of many people from different ethnic origins and religions due to its suitable climate and geographical features, its location serving as a bridge between Europe and Asia, and the intersection of migration routes. Today, Turkey, as an heir to the Ottoman Empire (Kongar, 1998), is a multicultural country where people from many ethnic origins and religions have lived. It is expected that these characteristics of Turkey will be reflected in the education programs as a requirement of democratic and multicultural education. Although social studies textbooks have a structure that reflects Turkey's rich cultural environment, it can be said that some political reservations are effective in the handling of the subject. Despite the fact that people from different religions and sects live, they are not included enough in the textbooks. Sunni, Shiite and Alevi sects, which are the sects of Islam, are not found in any textbook. While in a study

conducted in 2014 (Religious Affairs Administration, 2014) it was stated that 99% of the population of Turkey is Muslim, in a study conducted in 2021, 88 of the people living in Turkey are Sunni Muslims, 5 are Alevi Muslims and 2% are other Muslims. and 6% did not have any belief (KONDA, 2021). In the textbooks, the religion of Islam and Islam was mentioned in general, it was mentioned that there could be people from different sects, but what these sects were was not included. "Judaism" cannot be used as a word in all books, and the word "Jewish" is used in 2 places (3.86). The word "Christian" is used in 26 places (50.18), the word "Christianity", which expresses religious belief, is only used in 2 places (3.86). While the word "Muslim" is used in 68 places (131.25), the rate of words related to Islam and Islam (459.33) is quite high. The fact that the religion of Islam stands out compared to other religions in social studies textbooks despite the fact that the state of the Republic of Turkey is secular and does not have an official religion may be due to the fact that a very important part of its people (KONDA, 2021) are Muslims and the dominant ideology.

It is also seen that all textbooks do not give enough information about different ethnic origins living in Turkey due to the national education approach. The words Kurdish, Laz, Circassian, Tatar, Romani, which refer to people from different ethnic origins living in Turkey, are not included in any textbook. Although the word "race" is used 29 times (55.97) in all textbooks, the word "racism" is included only once. Similarly, although the word "ethnic" is included in the books, the word "ethnic discrimination" is rarely included. The statement in the textbook on the subject is as follows:

> *Laws enacted and established institutions and organizations in our country allow citizens to live in harmony. This situation is stated in paragraph 3 of Article 2 of the Law on the Human Rights and Equality Institution of Turkey: "Gender, race, color, language, religion, belief, sect, philosophical and political opinion, ethnic origin, wealth, birth, marital status, health status, Discrimination based on disability and age is prohibited* (SS6, p. 20).

As can be seen, constitutionally, people are not subject to any discrimination. Despite the fact that Turks make up a large part of the people of Turkey in the textbooks, the fact that there are also individuals from different ethnic origins (KONDA, 2006) is never mentioned in the textbooks, showing that ethnic differences are ignored, and this situation is in line with the multicultural and multi-ethnic structure of Turkey. It cannot be said that it is the product of an understanding. It should be noted that citizens whose identities are ignored or rejected will be unhappy citizens and may pose a danger to their state (Oran, 2021, p. 16).

Social studies course is one of the most important courses to raise awareness for disadvantaged groups in Turkey (Zayimoğlu Öztürk, 2016). This situation makes the representation of disadvantaged groups even more important in social studies education.

In this study, although the ratio of disadvantaged groups (65.53) is relatively low, it is seen that children (835.59), disabled people (55.97), immigrants or refugees (81.06) and the elderly (86.85) included in this group are included in the textbooks. In addition, the concepts of children's rights (869.12), prejudice (40.53), mass migrations (682.24), respect for differences (236.42) are among the concepts included in the books. For example, the following statements are included in a textbook on children's rights:

> *Children are part of the family. Therefore, the decisions taken within the family concern them as well. As stated in the Convention on the Rights of the Child, every child has the right to freely express his or her views on matters that affect him/her. It is important to create an environment where children can freely express their thoughts while making decisions within the family. Thus, a democratic understanding is displayed within the family. In this way, children use their right to participation and freedom of thought* (SS5).

As seen in the statement, it was stated that children also have various rights, they can express their thoughts freely and they can participate in the decisions taken in the family. It is seen that there are also awareness-raising statements for the disabled in the textbooks. The following statements on the subject are included in a textbook:

> *Struggling with the prejudices of some people, the physically disabled achieve such successes that they become a source of morale and inspiration for other disabled people. Thus, they play an important role in changing the perception of disability in the minds of people who exclude them. One of the best examples in this regard was experienced in the European Amputee Football Championship held in our country in 2017. In this championship, our National Amputee Football Team became the European champion by beating England 2-1 in the final match watched by 41 thousand people* (SS4).

The text includes an example of what disabled people can do and how people's perceptions of them can change. The fact that these and similar expressions are included in the textbooks can be considered as a positive feature. Although there are many expressions for the disabled in the books, it can be criticized that the representation of disability is presented using only two visuals in only two textbooks (SS6, p. 230; SS4, p. 29) through the visuals in the books. Considering that negative attitudes towards the disabled are generally formed during the primary education period (Diamond & Huang, 2005), the visual content can be enriched a little more in order to represent the disabled or other disadvantaged groups and raise awareness about them in the social studies course, which is one of the important lessons of this period.

Due to Turkey's geopolitical position and especially after the Syrian civil war, which started in 2011 and still continues, the concepts of migration and refugees have

also been concepts that occupy Turkey's agenda. The number of people under international protection in today's Turkey is about 4 million and 3.7 million of them are Syrian refugees (United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees [UNHCR], 2020). It is clearly seen that the current political power's attitude towards refugees is also reflected in the textbooks. It can be said that all textbooks act as sensitively as possible to avoid prejudices against these groups. An example statement in textbooks is as follows:

> *Syria has faced significant problems due to the civil war that started in 2011. Since this date, some of the Syrians living in the regions close to our border have taken refuge in our country. Turkey embraced its Syrian guests, ensuring their safety, and showing a great example of humanity by meeting their basic needs* (SS4).

It is particularly noteworthy that the word "guest" is used instead of the concept of "refugee" in the expression. Although Turkey's sensitivity towards refugees is important for many years, the concept of "refugee", which was not included in previous programs, has entered social studies programs since it has never been met with such a large number of refugees before. This feature of the program can be evaluated as a positive feature in terms of human rights. In addition, although this approach is thought to prevent anti-refugee thoughts and attitudes that may occur in the society over time, it can be said that Turkish people have a negative attitude towards living with and empathizing with Syrians in recent years (Çiftçi, 2018). This situation can be interpreted as there is no harmony between what is intended to be created by textbooks and social reality. The concept of refugee is examined under the concept of mass migration in Table 2 and although it is included in the textbooks as (682.24), it is included as (63.94) in the internet corpus. It can be said that the main reasons why the concept is more intensely included in the textbooks are the fact that the Sketch Engine scans the 2012 web pages and the content of the new textbooks prepared in line with the change in the social studies curriculum in 2018 is more up-to-date. It can be said that the content of the examined textbooks for disadvantaged groups in the context of human rights has been tried to be designed as carefully as possible, although there are some problems.

4. Concluding Thoughts

In this study, it has been revealed that the concepts related to citizenship and human rights in Turkey social studies textbooks are not evenly distributed in five different themes, and these concepts are given more space in the themes of youth-society and political issues compared to other themes. It can be said that the concepts that will increase students' awareness of global issues and contribute to their being individuals who are adequately equipped as global citizens are not included enough. From this point of view, it can be said that the traditional boundaries of raising citizens, which are shaped according to the needs of the nation state, cannot be exceeded. In today's modern

world, the success of a citizenship education based on universal human rights can only be possible by raising individuals who are knowledgeable in global issues and aware of the problems experienced in these areas. For this reason, it is thought that the content of the social studies course should be created by considering an effective balance between the local and the universal in the globalizing world.

It is difficult to say that some of the concepts related to citizenship and human rights included in the social studies textbooks in use in Turkey are equally included in the internet environments, which are a reflection of the conceptual world of Turkish society. It is seen that some of the concepts related to human rights and citizenship, which have an important place in the internet corpus, are not included in the textbook or are given very little space. In general, it is thought that concepts such as arms race, climate change, global warming, sexually transmitted diseases such as AIDS, capitalism or liberal economy should be given more space in the countries that are among the important concepts on the agenda both in Turkey and all over the world. For example, while the word capitalism has been mentioned once in only one of the books (SS7.2), the word liberalism has not found a place in any of the books. Similarly, while unemployment is one of the important words in the Turkish internet corpus, it is only mentioned 13 times in the books. In addition, this issue could not be discussed in terms of the causes of unemployment in general, what should be done to prevent unemployment or the responsibilities of the state in this regard. The word "strike", which is one of the fundamental rights, is not included in any textbook in Turkey, which is a country governed by democracy and whose democratic values are highly adopted by its people. The right to protest, which is a democratic way of seeking rights, was never mentioned, and this word was used only in two places in the textbooks in relation to history subjects. This shows that the use of democratic rights is not adequately represented in textbooks. In terms of basic human rights and their use, textbooks should not be seen as rights given to people, but as rights gained by people as a result of various struggles, and they should be constructed in this way.

Today's world continues to globalize rapidly in parallel with the developing technology. However, it can be said that this reality is not sufficiently included in the textbooks. It seems that the word globalization appears twice in only one textbook (SS7.2). Although the concept of "sustainability", which is an important concept for our world, is included, it can be considered as a negative situation that it is not mentioned what can be done in this regard and what responsibilities we have as individuals. The importance of tropical rainforests or Amazons, and the subject of glaciers in danger of extinction are also not adequately represented in the textbooks. It is thought that it should be equipped with sensitive content. In particular, the inclusion of controversial subjects in the textbooks will enable students to grow up as more democratic and free individuals (Hess, 2005). Thus, it will be more possible to raise active citizens with universal and national values and equipped with global competencies.

References

AI. (2003). *Türkiye Kadınlara yönelik gözaltında cinsel şiddete son!.* Retrieved from: https://www.amnesty.org.tr/raporlar

Akdağ, H. & Taşkaya, M. S. (2018). Vatandaşlık ve insan hakları eğitiminin sosyal bilgiler öğretimindeki yeri. R. Turan ve K. Ulusoy (Ed), *Sosyal bilgilerin temelleri* (pp.219-243). Ankara: PegemA Yayıncılık.

Al-Daraweesh,   F. (2020). Teaching human rights: toward a kingdom of ends. *Education Sciences*, *10*(4), 107. http://dx.doi.org/10.3390/educsci10040107

Althof, W. & Berkowitz, M. W. (2006). Moral education and character education: their relationship and roles in citizenship education. *Journal of Moral Education, 35*(4), 495–518. https://doi.org/10.1080/03057240601012204

Balkın, J. M. (2004). Yapısöküm. *Uludağ Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, *13*(1). 321-332.

Barr, R. D., Barth, J. L. & Shermis, S. S. (1977). *Defining The Social Studies*. Arlington, VA: National Council for the Social Studies.

Barr, R., Barth, J.L. ve Shermis, S.S. (2013). *Sosyal bilgilerin doğası.* (C. Dönmez, Çev.) Ankara: Pegem Akademi.

Barth, J. & Demirtaş, A. (1997). *İlköğretim Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretimi*. Ankara: YÖK/Dünya Bankası Yayınları.

Barth, J. L. (1991). *Elementary and Junior High/Middle School Social Studies Curriculum, Activities and Materials*. Maryland: Universty Press of America.

Baxi, U. (1997). Human rights education: The promise of the third millennium. G. Andreopoulus and R. Claude (Ed), *Human Rights Education for the Twenty First Century* (pp. 142–155). University of Pennsylvania Press: Philadelphia.

Blanchard, R. (2021). A History of NCSS Involvement in Human Rights. *Social Education, 85*(6), 358-360.

Çayır, K. & Gürkaynak, I. (2008). The state of citizenship education in Turkey: Past and present. *Journal of Social Science Education, 6(*2): 50–58.

Çiftçi, H. (2018). An analysis of the empathic behaviour and attitudes of turkish citizens towards syrian refugees and their perception of these refugees. *Itobiad: Journal of the Human & Social Science Researches*, *7*(3), 2232-2256.

Çınar, Ö. H. & Şirin, T. (2017). Turkey's human rights agenda, *Research and Policy on Turkey, 2*(2), 133-143. https://doi.org/10.1080/23760818.2017.1350354

Clapham, A. (2015). *Human Rights: A Very Short Introduction.* Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Dan, C. K. (2015). Human rights: A theoretical overview. *A peer reviewed multidisciplinary research journal, 1*(1), 24-31.

Diamond, K.E., & Huang, H. (2005). Prescholers' ideas about disabilities. *Infants & Young Children, 18,* 37-46.

Doğanay, A. (2002). Sosyal bilgiler ve sosyal bilgiler öğretimi. C. Öztürk ve D. Dilek (Ed). *Hayat Bilgisi ve Sosyal Bilgiler Öğretimi*. (pp. 15-46). Ankara: Pegem Yayıncılık.

Donnelly, J. (1995). *Teoride ve uygulamada evrensel insan hakları* (M. Erdoğan ve L. Korkut, Çev.). Ankara: Yetkin Yayınları.

EC. (2021). *2021 Türkiye Raporu.* Retrieved from: https://www.ab.gov.tr/siteimages/2021_trkiye_raporu_tr.pdf.

Eroğlu, O. (2012). "Yapısökücülük ve Necip Fazıl'ın 'Beklenen' Şiirine Bir Uygulama Denemesi", *Turkish Studies*, 7(1): 1095-1098.

Erol, H. (2018). Vatandaşlık ve insan hakları eğitimi dersinin ortaokul öğretim programından çıkarılmasına ilişkin bir değerlendirme. *Diyalektolog*, (17).

Ersoy, A. F., Balbağ, N. L. & Gündoğan-Bayır, Ö. (2017). İnsan Hakları, yurttaşlık ve demokrasi dersini öğretmenler ve öğrenciler nasıl algılıyor?. Sakarya *University Journal of Education, 7*(1), 223-241.

Fernekes, W. R. (2016). Global citizenship education and human rights education: Are they compatible with us civic education?. *Journal of International Social Studies, 6*(2), 34-57.

Flowers, N. (2010). Pusulacık, çocuklar için insan hakları eğitimi kılavuzu. (M. Çulhaoğlu, Çev.). https://insanhaklarimerkezi.bilgi.edu.tr/media/uploads/2020/12/09/Pusulacik_.pdf

Garcia, J. & Michaelis, J.U. (2001). S*ocial studies for children: A guide to basic instruction* (12th edition). Boston: Allyn and Bacon.

Hanaylı, G., Öztürk, A.A., Baysan, S. & Akar Vural, R. (2020). Sosyal bilgilerin doğası, anlamı ve nasıl öğretildiği üzerine bir durum çalışması: Öğretmen görüşleri. *Batı Anadolu Eğitim Bilimleri Dergisi, 11*(1), 210-238.

Hess, E. D. (2005). Controversies about Controversial Issues in Democratic Education. *PS: Politics and Society, 37(*2), 257-261.

HSGM. (2021). HIV-AIDS İstatistik. Retrieved from: https://hsgm.saglik.gov.tr/tr/bulasici-hastaliklar/hiv-aids/hiv-aids-liste/hiv-aids-istatislik.html.

Hung, R. (2012) Being human or being a citizen? Rethinking human rights and citizenship education in the light of Agamben and Merleau-Ponty. *Cambridge Journal of Education, 42*(1), 37-51. https://doi.org/10.1080/0305764X.2011.651202

Karasu Avcı, E. & Faiz, M. (2018). 4.ve 5. sınıf sosyal bilgiler ders kitapları "etkin vatandaşlık" öğrenme alanında yer alan becerilerin ve değerlerin incelenmesi. *Uluslararası Sosyal Bilgilerde Yeni Yaklaşımlar Dergisi, 2*(1), 1-21.

Kepenekçi, Y. K. (2008). *Eğitimciler için İnsan Hakları ve Vatandaşlık*. Ekinoks Yayınevi.

Kiwan, D. (2005). Human rights and citizenship: An unjustifiable conflation?. *Journal of philosophy of education, 39*(1), 37-50.

KONDA. (2006). *Toplumsal yapı araştırması 2006.* https://konda.com.tr/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/2006_09_KONDA_Toplumsal_Yapi.pdf

KONDA. (2021). *Türkiye 100 kişi olsaydı raporu.* Retrieved from: https://interaktif.konda.com.tr/turkiye-100-kisi-olsaydi. Retrieved from: https://interaktif.konda.com.tr/turkiye-100-kisi-olsaydi

Kongar, E. (1998). *21. Yüzyılda Türkiye: 2000'li Yıllarda, Türkiye'nin Toplumsal Yapısı [Turkey in the 21st Century: Turkey's Social Structure].* Remzi Kitabevi.

Koyunlu Ünlü, Z. & Şen, Ö. (2018). 5. sınıf fen bilimleri ders kitabındaki etkinliklerin bilimsel araştırma ve mühendislik tasarım sürecine göre incelenmesi. *Sakarya University Journal of Education, 8*(4), 185-197.

Lawson, H. (2001). Active citizenship in schools and the community. *The Curriculum Journal, 12* (2), 163-178. https://doi.org/10.1080/09585170122413

Mcbeth, A., Nolan J. & Rice S. (2011). T*he International Law of Human Rights.* Victoria, Australia: Oxford University Press.

MEB. (2018). *Sosyal Bilgiler Dersi Öğretim Programı (İlkokul ve Ortaokul 4, 5, 6 ve 7. Sınıflar).* Retrieved from: https://mufredat.meb.gov.tr/Dosyalar/201812103847686-SOSYAL%20B%C4%B0LG%C4%B0LER%20%C3%96%C4%9ERET%C4%B0M%20PROGRAMI%20.pdf

Meyer, T. G. (2020) Difference as privilege: identity, citizenship and the recontextualisation of human rights in Japan's social studies curriculum. *Critical Studies in Education, 61*(1), 17-36. 10.1080/17508487.2017.1352007.

MFA. (2021). Avrupa Komisyonu Tarafından Hazırlanan Türkiye Raporları (2015, 2016, 2018, 2019, 2020, 2021). Retrieved from: https://www.ab.gov.tr/ilerleme-raporlari_46224.html.

Mitoma, G. & Marcus, A. S. (2020). Human rights before and after covid-19: Getting human rights education out of quarantine. *Journal of International Social Studies, 10*(2), 127-140.

Montero, J.C. (2014) Human rights, international human rights, and sovereign political authority: a draft model for understanding contemporary human rights, *Ethics & Global Politics, 7* (4), 143-162. https://doi.org/10.3402/egp.v7.25522

Moon, R. J. (2013). Teaching world citizenship: The cross-national diffusion of human rights education in formal schooling. *KEDI Journal of Education Policy, 10*(1), 105–124.

Mullet, D. R. (2018). A general critical discourse analysis framework for educational research. *Journal of Advanced Academics, 29*(2), 116–142. doi:10.1177/1932202X18758260

O'Regan, J. P., & Betzel, A. (2016). Critical discourse analysis: a sample study of extremism. In Z. Hua (Ed.), Research methods in ıntercultural communication: A Practical guide (pp. 281-296). Hoboken: John Wiley & Sons.

Oğuz, M. C. (2008). Söylem analizi. *Sosyoloji Notları*, *5*, 52-57.

Oran, B. (2021). Foreword. H. Aydın & W. Langley (Eds.), In *Human Rights in Turkey: Assaults on Human Dignity* (pp.6-17). Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-57476-5

Özbek, R. (2017). Realization level of the citizenship and human rights education course objectives, *Inonu University Journal of the Faculty of Education, 18*(1), 359-371. https://doi.org/10.1080/09585170122413

Pollach, I. (2012). Taming textual data: The contribution of corpus linguistics to computer-aided text analysis. *Organizational Research Methods, 15*(2), 264–287. https://doi.org/10.1177/1094428111417451

Print, M. & Smith, A. (2000). Teaching civic education for a civil, democratic society in the Asian region. *Asia Pacific Education Review, 1*(1), 101-109.

Ramazan, O. & Ezlam, S. (2017). The evaluation of prospective teachers attitudes towards citizenship and citizenship education. *Educational Research and Reviews, 12(*16), 803-812.

Rapoport, A. (2021). Human rights and global citizenship in social studies standards in the United States. *Human Rights Education Review, 4*(1), 111–132. https://doi.org/10.7577/hrer.3997

Religious Affairs Administration [Diyanet İşleri Başkanlığı]. (2014). *Türkiye'de dini hayat araştırması.* Retreved form: http://www.ceidizleme.org/ekutuphaneresim/dosya/914_1.pdf

Rogers, R., Schaenen, I., Schott, C., O'Brien, K., Trigos-Carrillo, L., Starkey, K., & Chasteen, C. C. (2016). Critical discourse analysis in education: A review of the literature, 2004 to 2012. *Review of Educational Research, 86*(4), 1192–1226.

Rumford, C. (2001). Human Rights and democratization in Turkey in the context of eu candidature. *Journal of European Area Studies, 9*(1), 93-105. https://doi.org/10.1080/14608460120061975

Sardoč, M. (2021). Citizenship, Social change, and education. *Center for Educational Policy Studies Journal, 11*(2), 97-109.

Şen, A. (2004). Elements of a theory of human rights. *Philosophy & public affairs, 32*(4), 315-356.

Şen, A. (2019). Vatandaşlık eğitiminde değişiklik ve süreklilikler: 2018 sosyal bilgiler öğretim programı nasıl bir vatandaşlık eğitimi öngörüyor?. *Journal of Qualitative Research in Education, 7*(1), 1-28. doi:10.14689/issn.2148-2624.1.7c1s.1m

Sezer, A. & Şanlı, C. (2017). Coğrafya öğretim programında ve ders kitaplarında göç olgusu. *Marmara Coğrafya Dergisi, 36,* 16-25.

Sim, J. B. Y. & Print, M. (2005). Citizenship education and social studies in Singapore: A national agenda. *International Journal of Citizenship and Teacher Education, 1*(1), 58-73.

Som, İ. & Karataş, H. (2015). Türkiye'de vatandaşlık eğitimi üzerine bir inceleme. *Uşak Üniversitesi Eğitim Araştırmaları Dergisi, 1*(1), 33-50.

Tonga, D. & Kılıçoğlu, M. K. G. (2013). İlköğretim sosyal bilgiler dersinde yer alan kazanımların vatandaşlık ve insan hakları konuları açısından değerlendirilmesi. *Türkiye Sosyal Araştırmalar Dergisi, 171*(171), 289-308.

Ülger, M. (2012). *İlköğretim okullarında insan hakları ve vatandaşlık eğitimi uygulamalarının değerlendirilmesi.* [Yayınlanmamış doktora tezi]. Gazi Üniversitesi.

Ülger, M. (2013). İnsan hakları ve vatandaşlık eğitimi ara disiplin alanı uygulamasının sosyal bilgiler öğretmenlerinin görüşleri bağlamında değerlendirilmesi. *Turkish Journal of Education, 2*(3), 14-29.

Ulubey, Ö. (2021). Changes and transformations in the curricula of elementary education citizenship, democracy and human rights from 1926 to 2018. *Pegem Journal of Education and Instruction, 11*(1), 401–446. https://doi.org/10.14527/pegegog.2021.011

UNHCR. (2020). Türkiye istatistikleri. Retrieved from: https://www.unhcr.org/tr/unhcr-turkiye-istatistikleri

Vlaardingerbroek, B. (2020). School social studies as a vehicle for human rights education: Caveats. *Journal of International Social Studies, 10*(1), 203-209.

Walsh, B., Hicks, D., & van Hover, S. (2017). Difficult history means difficult questions: Using film to reveal the perspective of "the other" in difficult history topics. J. Stoddard, A. S. Marcus and D. Hicks (Ed), *Teaching Difficult History With Film* (pp. 39-56). New York: Routledge.

Yücel, M. & Karamustafaoğlu, S. (2020). Teachers' opinions about 5th and 6th grade natural sciences textbooks. *Amasya Education Journal, 9*(1), 93-120.

Zayimoğlu Öztürk, F. (2016). Expert opinions about position of social inclusion subject in social studies education. *The Journal of International Education Science*, (6), 191-205.

Copyrights