

An Inquiry on the Third Mission of Universities: The Measurement of Universities' Contribution to the Social, Cultural and Economic Development of a City

Özge Altıntaşⁱ
Ankara University

Ömer Kutluⁱⁱ
Ankara University

Abstract

“Development” is a kind of growth that leads to the transformation of social and official organisms including innovation in cultural values, worldview, and consumption and behaviour patterns. Accordingly, development is a living organism as indicated by developments in many fields such as economics, science, art, sports, education, democracy, and freedom to improve prosperity. Since development begins with innovation in human resources and national development processes depends on regional and urban development, education, and educational institutes can be accepted as one of the initiatives and accelerative factors of development. Therefore, the role of city universities is important in the development of cities and countries. The purpose of this study is to determine the contribution of four major universities in Ankara to the social, cultural, and economic development of the city. The data were collected by a structured questionnaire, which was developed by the researchers to be used in interviewing with vice rectors of these four universities. Three of those vice rectors are from state universities, and one of them is from a private university. The qualitative data were analyzed by descriptive analysis. On the basis of results, it is concluded that universities in Ankara play their “third mission” by contributing to the development of their surroundings.

Keywords: City and the University, Social Development of a City, Cultural Development of a City, Economic Development of a City, Universities' Contribution to a City

DOI: 10.29329/ijpe.2021.366.19

ⁱ **Özge Altıntaş**, Lecturer Dr., Faculty of Educational Sciences, Ankara University, ORCID: 0000-0001-5779-855X

Correspondence: oaltintas@ankara.edu.tr

ⁱ **Ömer Kutlu**, Asst. Prof. Dr. Faculty of Educational Sciences, Ankara University, ORCID: 0000-0003-4364-5629

INTRODUCTION

All over the world, universities contribute to the development of scientific knowledge through scientific researches they conduct, and to the development level of their societies through their practices serving society. In the scope of universities' practices serving the society, it is important to train a workforce tailored according to society's needs; to share new scientific knowledge with industrial, agriculture, and service sectors; to conduct studies for protecting society's history and traditional culture, and to support state and private organizations through in-service training practices. So, it is important that universities should be in interaction with the city they are located in regarding their contributions to regional development. Arslan (2005) argues that regional development is one of the economic growths and development targets of all countries. The core principle to achieve this target is to use the country's existing resources and potentials in the most efficient way.

The third mission of universities' concept refers to an additional function of the universities in the context of the knowledge society. The university is not only responsible for qualifying the human capital (Education—the first mission) and for producing new knowledge (Research—the second mission). Universities must engage with societal needs and market demands by linking the university's activity with its own socio-economic context (Pinto, Cruz, & de Almeida, 2016). Çetin (2007) emphasizes that universities are among the essential dynamics of regional development and notes that the university is not only a research centre where undergraduate and post-graduate education is also provided but also a place where studies for the benefit of the local community are conducted. Universities are important to the people of the cities they are located in, in terms of acquiring information and education and availing of employment opportunities and social services. Since the 1960s, universities have been regarded to be an instrument for regional development in several European countries and they have increased their numbers in underdeveloped regions. Chatterton (2000) states that universities' contribution to the cities they are located in is a concept that can be tackled comprehensively. This concept covers a measurable contribution to the economy and employment, as well as a contribution to the social and cultural life in the city. Among these, while it is possible to measure contributions such as the number of students who graduated from art departments and the public's participation rate in the cultural events, it is difficult to measure contributions such as awakening creativity in people's minds and introducing a new point of views. A university's contributions to the region it is located in can be classified as economic and knowledge-based contributions for short-term and long-term processes. Besides, a university's contributions to the related city might vary according to the institutional history and culture of the university, student profiles of the faculties, the region the university is located in, and the university's being a state or foundation university. Thus Gültekin, Çelik, and Nas (2008) state that it is possible, to sum up, universities' contributions in the following items:

1. Ensuring improvement in economic variables such as regional income and employment,
2. Ensuring improvement in socio-cultural variables such as healthcare, communication, transport and an increase in the prosperity level,
3. Ensuring improvement in demographic and education variables such as an increase in the participation level in education and a decrease in immigration.

Universities can only function properly and gain society's support through their contributions to the society in economic and social terms with the approval and support of the society they are serving (Torun, Öztürk, & Gelibolu, 2009). In this context, in the present study universities' contributions to the related city are examined in terms of social, cultural, and economic aspects.

The 12th Clause of the Turkish Higher Education Law (1981) requires that:

“... universities are obliged to conduct researches that will lead to the scientific, cultural, social and economic development of the country; to reveal the results of the researches for the benefit of the society; to contribute to training professionals suitable for the development of agriculture and industry and the needs of the same; to conduct and implement studies and programs that will allow an increase in the production and modernization in industry, agriculture and healthcare services as well as other services...”

When we look at the previous studies of native and foreign origin in the literature on the universities' contributions to the city or region, we see that although there are studies that dwell on the economic contributions of Turkish universities to the related region, province, or district, the number of studies that dwell on the social and cultural contributions of universities are few. One of the first studies in this context in Turkey was conducted by Karadeniz Technical University. In this study, Beyazlı, Aydemir, and Aydemir (2005) examine the direct and indirect economic contributions of Karadeniz Technical University (1955), one of the first universities to be established out of Istanbul and Ankara provinces, to Trabzon and its neighbourhoods. In another study, the relations of Karadeniz Technical University with the business world in the city and the region are examined and the university's significant role in this regard is emphasized.

Another study investigating universities' role in urban development was conducted by Uludağ University. In the study “Uludağ University and Bursa”, universities' roles in the regional development and contributions to urban development are handled with a general approach (Özyaba, 1999). Gürkan and Karataş (2004) examined Muğla University's roles in the city's socio-economic development. The first study that examines the universities' contributions in Turkey on the book level was conducted by Sargın (2006). In this study, general approaches in urbanization movements in Turkey and universities' development processes are investigated. In the book, especially Süleyman Demirel University's effects on the population, urban functions, and economic structure of the related city are emphasized. Approaches in this subject are based on findings gathered from field researches.

In a project study on Anadolu University's interaction with the city it is located in (Eskişehir), Sürmeli, (2008) examined what the university did for the city and what it could and should do further. It has been stated that Anadolu University is the most contributing university in Turkey to the city it is located in. It makes contributions to society in the frame of university-industry collaboration and through practices serving society. In addition to the aforementioned functions, the University also offers many opportunities (such as facilities on the campus and in the city) and culture-art events to the region and the city.

When we look at the international literature in this regard, we see that a great number of studies have been conducted on the effects of universities on regional development. In these studies (Becker, 2003; Charles, 2003; Varga, 2003; Sutz, 2005; Wolfe, 2005; Nilsson, 2006; Badat, 2009; Bonander, et. al., 2016; Secundo, et. al., 2017; Agasisti, & Bertolotti, 2020; Olo, Correia, & Rego, 2020), it is noted that universities contribute to the cities they are located on a wide social and cultural spectrum and that universities' activities penetrate in all aspects of daily life. Besides, in their comprehensive systematic literature review (through examination of 134 peer-reviewed articles which were published between 2004 and May 2019) on the third mission of the universities labelled as a “contribution to society”, Compagnucci and Spigarelli (2020) state that the academy meets the transparency, efficiency and accountability demands for the socio-economic impact of their activities. In addition, they emphasized that the universities are now necessary to illustrate legitimacy to external stakeholders, including industry and society. They also state that the production and dissemination of the university and knowledge are currently at a crossroad.

Bologna Process started in 1999 and aimed to create the “European Higher Education Area” until 2010, maintaining the national system in the meantime, tried to establish links between systems of different nations. In their trends reports, the European University Association (EUA), one of the essential actors of the Process, summarizes the studies conducted in Europe on the development of

higher education in accordance with Bologna objectives. In the fifth report submitted in 2007 by Crosier, Purser, and Smidt, it is emphasized that outputs of the Bologna Process are not shared with the social partners sufficiently. At this point, it is proposed that one of the reasons for not interiorizing the Bologna Process is the universities' isolation from employer organizations and society. In the strategies for this new configuration in Europe, higher education institutions' interactions with society are highlighted. When this interaction is considered on a regional basis, it is understood that university-city relations should be examined.

In line with the above-mentioned requirement, the present study was conducted to determine the contributions of four universities in Ankara province, the capital of Turkey, to the development of the city in social, cultural, and economic aspects based on the views of vice rectors of these universities. Ankara is different from other cities in Turkey due to some singularities of it. Ankara's history dates back to the 7th century BC. The present settlement area of Ankara has been house by Hittites, Phrygians, Galatians, Seljuks, and Ottomans, who left significant historical works behind. Especially the Old Ankara is an important settlement area where historical structures rest. Ankara has been the capital of Turkey since the foundation of the Turkish Republic. Conducting Turkish Salvation War from Ankara, Mustafa Kemal Ataturk declared that city, which supported him on the worst days of the war, as the capital of the country on 13 October 1923. Besides, all state organizations and institutions that play a role in the governing process of Turkey are in Ankara. That Mustafa Kemal Ataturk, the founder of the Turkish Republic and the essential leader of the Turkish People, rests in Ankara in his tomb -Anıtkabir- makes the city more important.

Besides, among the universities which constituted the sample of the study, especially Ankara University, and Gazi University date back to almost over a century ago and these universities have been serving Ankara since their establishment. Another university that falls in the scope of the study is Hacettepe University. One section of the campus of this university located in the city falls in the remit of the extension of the Old Ankara city. The fourth university is Başkent University which was established in recent years as a private university. It makes valuable contributions to the city both through their investments in the city and the neighbourhood and through their broadcasts on their own equipped television channel. Therefore, we believe that data collected from these universities will reveal crucial and interesting results.

METHOD

Research Model and Participants

This is a qualitative research that has been carried out via a qualitative interview technique and conducted on the opinions of vice rectors of four major universities in Ankara as to the contribution of their universities to the city. Three of these authorities are from state universities (Ankara University, Gazi University, and Hacettepe University) and one of them is from a private university (Başkent University).

Data Collection

Within the framework of the research, data was collected through an interview which is defined as "a two-person conversation, initiated by the interviewer for the specific purpose of obtaining research-relevant information, and focused by him/her on content specified by research objectives of systematic description, prediction, or explanation" (Cannell & Kahn, 1968).

Ongena (2010) stated that the systematic character of interviews is generated through structured questionnaires practised in a standardized manner (e.g., read questions as written and probe non-directive, etc.). The standardized interview is described as a conversation with the purpose of collecting valid and reliable data and the main goal of standardization is defined to collect data that is comparable across respondents by keeping the stimuli (i.e., the questions) provided to them constantly.

She sequenced the means of standardization as; a) a questionnaire with a predetermined structure, question order, and question-wording and b) the instructions that interviewers must apply in interviewing. Due to the advantages of a structured questionnaire such as its role in leading the investigator to give all his or her attention to the informant's testimony and also in leading the interviewer to attend tasks at hand without preempting the "open-ended" nature of the qualitative interview (McCracken, 1988), one that aims to obtain deep views of the university authorized as to the contribution of their universities to Ankara has been devised by the researchers.

The devised questionnaire includes six questions under three aspects. These aspects are 1) *"the social contribution of the universities to the city"*, 2) *"the cultural contributions of the universities to the city"*, and 3) *"the economic contribution of the universities to the city"*.

The first aspect, *"the social contribution of the universities"*, includes questions to gather information about:

1a) what kind of work the university has performed to reduce the negative impacts of immigration such as;

- playing role in making policies,
- conducting researches contributive to the policies against immigration,
- playing role in planning rural and urban investments,
- taking precautions to obstruct the disruption in urban ministration,
- designing studies to prevent unplanned urbanization and assess infrastructure needs,
- designing educative activities oriented for parents and children,
- putting vocational programs into service (support and contribution to preventing unemployment),
- studying health and hygiene-related issues,
- endeavouring to reduce the disadvantages of immigration such as unfamiliarity with the city culture,
- intercultural conflict and discrepancy or taking precautions to prevent an increase in traffic problems and crime rates that are involved as a result of population growth due to immigration,

1b) what kind of work the university has performed regarding the development of basic living skills and lifelong learning activities of the public such as;

- contribution to the development of social policies,
- making individuals gain the habit of effective use of leisure time,
- instituting training programs on children education,
- disseminating vocational courses,
- instituting literacy courses,

- conducting studies oriented towards disabled,
- conducting studies to struggle against smoking, alcoholism, and drug addiction,
- developing strategies to overcome domestic abuse and social violence,

1c) what kind of work the university has performed regarding the improvement of the natural environment of Ankara such as;

- prevention of environmental (water, air, and soil) pollution,
- recycling of wastes,
- setting parks and gardens,
- planting trees and flowers,
- environment monitoring for avenues and streets,

raising public awareness of environmental issues.

In the second aspect “*the cultural contribution of the universities*” we try to find out;

2a) what kind of work the university has performed regarding the protection of historical texture and places in Ankara such as;

- conducting studies and releasing publications for the history of pre-republic and republic periods,
- raising public awareness via informative activities to introduce, protect and transfer historical heritage,
- dissemination of tourism,
- protection of extinct crafts,
- protection of the historical structures in danger of vanishing due to unplanned urbanization,
- support and contribution to the restoration,

2b) what kind of work the university has performed regarding the cultural and artistic development of Ankara such as;

- maintaining and disseminating museums,
- maintaining extinct vocations,
- disseminating social activities such as cinema, theatre, etc.,
- increasing interest in arts of sculpture, painting, music, etc.,
- disseminating sports habits and facilities,

- increasing public attendance to cultural and art activities,
raising public awareness of issues related to maintaining and transferring cultural properties.

Finally, “*the economic contribution of the universities*” aspect questions

3a) what kind of work the university has performed for the economic development of Ankara in agricultural, industrial, and service sectors such as;

- labour training,
- informing commerce sectors about new technologies,
- inviting sectors to scientific activities such as congress, symposium, panel, etc.,
- in-service training,
- consultancy services,
- designing joint projects with industrial and commercial plants in the city.

All the questions in the survey are open-ended. The vice rectors also declared whether they consider the performed work sufficient or not, whether they are supported or strike a snag in their effort, and what kind of works they have planned to do in the future.

The questionnaire was presented to an expert group, which included three experts, one of whom was a linguist and two experienced in educational measurement and evaluation courses. These experts have been consulted regarding the expediency, clarity and understandability of the questionnaire items. In line with the mentioned expert opinions, necessary corrections and changes have been made to get the questionnaire ready to be applied. The researchers implemented the eventual questionnaire in a single interview session between August and September. Based on the techniques of standardized interviewing summarized by Fowler and Mangione (1989), the process has been carried out with the phases of a) reading the questions, b) probing without hinting directives after inadequate answers, c) recording answers by using a tape recorder without judgment, and d) being interpersonally non-judgmental regarding the substance of answers.

There is no doubt that no matter what method or technique is used in the process of collecting data, several types of measurement error can occur. As defined by Ongena (2010); such errors might cause the respondent to answer questions inaccurately or imprecisely, or to answer a question with a different meaning than intended by the researcher. Sudman and Bradburn (1974) denoted that these errors may be related to the method of data collection, the measurement instrument, the manner of the interviewer or respondent characteristics. Many researchers (Schwartz & Schwartz, 1955; Cassell, 1977; Reeves-Sanday, 1979; Guba & Lincoln, 1992) agree within the scope of qualitative research that the investigator serves as a kind of “instrument” in the collection and analysis of data. To serve as a valid and reliable instrument, the interviewer must obey some rules to reach the qualitative research objectives. Correspondingly, in consideration of the necessity of drawing out the respondent in precisely the right manner to gain the entire success of the enterprise (Brenner, 1982), it was endeavoured not to violate the law of unobtrusive and nondirective manner in testimony during the interviewing process.

Data Analysis

In the study, the recorded responses given to the open-ended questions in the questionnaire have initially been decoded and then descriptively analyzed. Descriptive analysis is a technique in

which direct quotations from the responses are given to reflect the investigated content. The objective of descriptive analysis is to present the obtained findings to the reader in an organized and interpreted manner. To achieve this goal, the data is clearly and systematically described. Then, the descriptions are revealed, interpreted and finally, corresponding results are attained (Yıldırım & Şimşek, 2018). In this study, the content of the vice rectors' views is presented and interpreted by either summarizing their opinions on survey variables or giving direct quotations.

FINDINGS

The findings that have been acquired through qualitative analysis of the answers given by the university authorities to the questions included in the questionnaire are indicated below in terms of universities' contributions to Ankara Province in social, cultural and economic aspects respectively.

The Social Contribution of the Universities to the City. In this concept, there are three questions to gather information about what kind of work the universities have performed. The aim of the first question in this concept is to determine to what extent the universities have been effective in diminishing the negative effects of immigration to Ankara which has been under an intense flow of migration especially as of the 1950s. The primary studies to be conducted by universities to eliminate the negative effects of immigration are to make policies focusing on this problem, to help in implementing such policies or to conduct research that would facilitate the production of such policies. Concerning universities' roles in making policies and conducting researches contributive to the policies against immigration; it is determined that universities do not play a functional role in making policies in this regard, but they do contribute to the process via their studies on academic and social services grounds. For instance, focusing on the demographic transformation process of Turkey in the last 40 years, Hacettepe University, Institute of Population Studies have been conducted various studies on fertility and reproductive health; ageing; family planning; mother-child care; immigration and expatriated population and domestic violence against women.

Another potential study on the negative impacts of immigration is to commence vocational courses to prevent unemployment. When universities' contributions in this regard are investigated, it was found that vocational courses have been arranged as well as the ones aiming to improve one's existing profession, at the end of which the attendants received related certificates. It was also found that over one hundred thousand Ankara citizens availed themselves of that opportunity.

It is probably the studies on healthcare through which universities will contribute most to diminish the negative impacts of immigration. Concerning studying health and hygiene-related issues; it was determined that universities ensured the conduct of medical screening on family planning, dental health and physical and mental health etc. especially in slummy areas and contributed to raising public's awareness about healthcare through booklets and brochures. Some of the aforementioned studies and practices aiming to eliminate the negative impacts of immigration were performed on the basis of voluntary projects and some of them are being carried out with the support of and/or in collaboration with The Scientific and Technological Research Council of Turkey (TUBITAK); State Planning Organization (SPO); European Union and European Development Agency; Support Program for Public Institutions' Research and Development Projects (KAMAG); Ministry of Health, General Directorate of Mother and Child Care and Family Planning; and Prime Ministry, Undersecretariat of State Planning Organization.

In the concept of playing role in planning rural and urban investments, taking precautions to obstruct the disruption in urban administration, designing studies to prevent unplanned urbanization and assess infrastructure needs, designing parent-child-oriented informative activities, endeavouring to mitigate the disadvantages of immigration such as unfamiliarity with the city culture, intercultural conflicts and discrepancy or taking precautions to prevent an increase in traffic problems and crime rates that are involved as a result of population growth due to immigration; it is noted that universities do not consider their work sufficient and intended to conduct further studies focusing on these

subjects. None the less, research data also showed that universities agreed on the ground that immigration is an element that is promoted with political objectives and that studies and practices focusing on the solutions for this problem can only be promoted with the incentive of politicians again.

With the second question under the scope of universities' contribution to Ankara on a social basis, we tried to determine what studies the universities conducted in terms of the development of basic living skills and lifelong learning activities of the public. Data showed that "lifelong learning", which includes all learning activities that are continuing throughout a life span to increase one's knowledge and improve skills and abilities, is accepted as an essential element of a modern education system by universities and contributing to such activities is considered to be as crucial as providing associate degree, undergraduate and postgraduate education programs.

One aspect contributing to the acquisition of basic living skills and lifelong learning activities is to carry out vocational courses. In the concept of disseminating vocational courses; it was found that universities arranged vocational courses as well as the ones aiming to improve the existing profession at the end of which the attendants received relevant certificates. These courses were free of charge and universities encouraged the public to avail themselves of that opportunity. Moreover, it was determined that universities carried out activities contributive to lifelong learning via private television channels. These activities include applied studies such as graphics, painting and interior architecture for people who are fond of art, especially plastic arts as well as broadcasts on beauty, esthetics, health, fashion, arts, culture and education for women audience. Data also showed that another contribution of universities to the development of basic living skills and lifelong learning activities is in the concept of instituting training programs on children education and conducting disabled-oriented studies. It was determined that universities conducted researches focusing on these subjects through faculties of education and medical sciences and that these researches were backed up through scientific meetings such as conferences, seminars, workshops etc.

One of the most important contributions by universities to lifelong learning activities is to develop strategies to overcome domestic abuse and social violence. Research data revealed that lack of data on violence against women on a national level poses an obstruct for universities to develop policies, strategies and programs in this regard and that the very problem functions as a stimulus for universities to conduct various studies in this context. One of these studies is "Study on Domestic Violence against Women in Turkey" which concludes that informative programs should be developed and implemented to raise the public's awareness for the prevention of this violence. The importance of this study is summarized as such by a university authority:

"... "Study on Domestic Violence against Women in Turkey" is the most extensive study with the largest sample ever conducted in Turkey and worldwide in this context. ..."

Besides, social projects carried out by universities in collaboration with Ankara Prison Execution Organizations are among activities focusing on mitigating social violence. The aforementioned studies and activities aiming to develop basic living skills and lifelong learning activities are being carried out with the support of and in collaboration with Society-Supported Police Organization; Ankara Prison Execution Organizations; Prime Ministry, General Directorate of the Status of Women (KSGM); Turkish Statistical Institute (TurkStat), Province Governors; Directorates of Social Services and Children Protection Institution and Directorates of Healthcare.

In the concept of contribution to the development of social policies, leading individuals to gain an understanding of effective use of leisure time, instituting literacy courses, conducting studies to struggle against smoking, alcoholism and drug addiction; it is noted that universities do not consider their work sufficient and intend to conduct further studies focusing on these subjects.

The third and last question under the scope of universities' social contributions aims to determine what kind of studies have been conducted by universities in terms of the improvement of the natural environment in Ankara. Given that, in today's world, the level of development of a city is determined by the clean and livable environment it has, it can be concluded that one of the most important contributions of universities to the city in which they are located is their care for the environment and the measures they take to protect it as well as raising public's awareness in this regard.

In the concept of prevention of environmental (water, air and soil) pollution, and raising the public's awareness of environmental issues; University authorities state that the most remarkable contribution to Ankara has been realized through the "Green Generation" project which has a deep-rooted history and played a key role in the prevention of water pollution by controlling the major barrages (Emirdağ and Çubuk I), Ankara's potable water supply sources. Additionally, it is determined that studies are conducted in this context by departments of environmental engineering and biology. University authorities state that they continue to contribute to environment protection via private television channels and prepare joint television programs in collaboration with various environmental organizations. A university authority states the following about studies in this context:

"... In the scope of struggling against soil erosion, our university is preparing joint television programs in coordination with a reputable environment organization, The Turkish Foundation for Combating Soil Erosion, for Reforestation and the Protection of Natural Habitats (TEMA). These programs aim to prevent environmental pollution and to raise the public's awareness of environmental problems. ..."

Moreover, the universities have commenced using energy-saving solar panels to encourage and promote the use of natural energy resources is one of the big-leaps towards the improvement of the natural environment. Research data show that another contribution of universities to the improvement of the natural environment is in the concept of planting trees and flowers. University authorities state that, through the joint projects implemented in coordination with students and environmental organizations, they organize tree-planting fests every year. A university authority explains the situation as such:

"... Approximately eight million trees have been planted on our campus. If these activities are sustained, our campus will be one of Ankara's lungs in the next decade. ..."

The aforementioned activities for the improvement of the natural environment are carried out with the support of and in collaboration with TEMA and Ankara Development Agency. In the concept of recycling of wastes, setting parks and gardens, environmental checks for avenues and streets; it is noted that universities do not consider their work sufficient and intend to conduct further studies.

The Cultural Contribution of the Universities to the City. In this concept, there are two questions trying to find out what kind of work the universities have performed. With the first question, there came out studies and activities focusing on the protection of historical texture and places in the city. The common ground on which universities meet in this context is that universities should be the pioneering institutions in the protection of historical texture and places of the city.

One aspect of the activities for the protection of historical texture and places is the dissemination of tourism. Universities consider that domestic tourism should be primarily promoted and supported rather than international tourism. That the activities universities undertake for domestic tourism cannot go beyond small-scale activities appears to be a problem. Another aspect of cultural tourism is about activities promoting national and local languages. In this context, it is determined that the most important contribution to cultural tourism is achieved through universities' language teaching centres which are considered to be an element that introduces and promote the national and local culture and languages in Turkey and realize cultural shifts. One of the most notable of these centres is

Ankara University, Turkish Teaching Center (TÖMER). The interviewed authority states the following about TÖMER:

“... TÖMER prepared the ground for these long years ago and achieved great success. There are several reasons for that; first, it makes our culture known, second, it promotes our language and third, it prepares for cultural shifts. ...”

The protection of historical texture and places, as well as the handcrafts that are about to go extinct, is another contribution of universities to the city they are located in. Universities support the activities carried out by Ankara Province, Inventory Preparation Commission for Intangible Cultural Heritage and also carry out activities via books, exhibitions and television programs. The program “Anatolian Peninsula” that has been broadcasted on universities’ own private television channels is an example of these activities. In the program, they broadcasted documentaries on the heritage of 10-thousand-year-old civilizations such as artworks, life culture, traditions and customs, traditional handcrafts and local handicrafts, all about to go extinct. Museum projects to exhibit Ankara’s cultural texture in the frame of a collaboration between municipalities and universities can be counted among contributions in this regard.

Protection of historical structures that are in danger of becoming extinct due to unplanned urbanization and support for restoration works are among contributions to the protection of historical texture and places. For instance, universities assigned representatives to work in foundations such as Preservation Committee and these representatives carried out the restoration of several statues and structures (dated back to foundation years of the Turkish Republic) in the city. Another example of these activities is the restoration of “Traditional Ankara Houses” and putting these houses into service as houses of art, workshops and exhibition halls.

In two essential points, universities consider their contribution to Ankara in terms of protection of historical texture and places insufficient: One is to conduct studies and release publications on the history of pre-republic and republic periods; and the other is raising public’s awareness via informative activities in terms of introducing, protecting and transferring historical heritage. The reason for this insufficiency in this area is explained as such by a university authority:

“...Statesmen need to be good observers to ensure the protection of historical texture and places. It can only be possible by investigating not only the existing but also the pre-existing; absorbing society’s values and examining the road maps of countries that arrived at the same point earlier than you...”

University authorities also emphasize the insufficient financial sources to pose a major obstruction on the way of studies concerning the protection of historical texture and places in Ankara.

The second question under the scope of universities’ cultural contribution to Ankara aims to determine what kind of studies conducted for the development of culture and arts in the city. One of the potential studies to be conducted in this regard is the protection and dissemination of museums. Several activities show that universities support the development of the city in this context. Such activities include the opening of the Museum of Architect Kemaleddin, one of the first architects of the Republic Period, and also an example of Atatürk’s house in Istanbul was built on the university campus and turned to be a museum.

Universities try to contribute to the development of culture and arts in the city through activities such as increasing cinema and theatre occasions and attracting more attention to fine arts such as sculpture, painting, music, etc. It is determined that a great majority of these contributions are achieved by organizations established by university students. These activities include concerts by Turkish Folk Music and Turkish Classical Music choirs; dramas by theatrical companies and dance show by folk dance organizations. Universities do not consider their activities sufficient in terms of

cultural and artistic development of a city, promotion of practising sport exercises and opportunities for such; raising public's awareness for the protection and transfer of culture and art assets. Therefore, universities' plans focus on studies in this context.

The Economic Contribution of the Universities to the City. In this concept, what kind of work the universities have performed regarding the economic development of Ankara in terms of agricultural, industrial and service sectors is questioned. Data show that both universities and their subsidiaries (hospitals, schools, hotels, restaurants, etc.) contribute to the training of the city's workforce and employment through activities in the fields of healthcare, education, tourism and agriculture.

In the concept of labour training and in-service training; University authorities state that in the departments of economics and business administration, researches are conducted on the postgraduate level. In addition to the existing education provided by associate degree and undergraduate programs, arranging courses aiming to provide profession or improving the existing ones in collaboration with Ankara Municipality is among the contributions of universities in this context. It is stated that over 100 thousand Ankara citizens have availed themselves of this opportunity up to now and that these courses have made a major contribution to the development of a qualified workforce. Additionally, authorities state that in a large number of districts in Ankara, they have facilities for agriculture products, animal husbandry and dairy farming where qualified staff (such as research academicians) and administrative personnel find an opportunity of employment as well as workers. A university authority explains his university's contributions to training the workforce and providing employment as such:

"... There are already over eight thousand qualified staff working in the university. This is a significant contribution to the economy. Thanks to our university, this area, which was formerly a village, has become a district and the construction sector has boomed in the village. ..."

Similarly, a university's contribution to training qualified workforce and the establishment of new work areas is explained by another university authority with the following impressive statement:

"... Even building the university structure itself has been a work area for the construction sector. There have been opened restaurants, cafes and stationery shops in the area. Besides, lands in that territory gained value and a large number of houses and sites have been constructed. ..."

It is determined that universities contribute to the economy not only in agriculture, industry and service provision sectors but also in the tourism field through their activities. Universities also have touristic hotels where a remarkable workforce is trained and employed as well as service to Ankara citizens is provided. It is also determined that another contribution of universities to Ankara's economic development is in the concept of consultancy services and informing commercial plant about new technologies. Universities state that they provide consultancy services through departments such as Gazi University Technology and Permanent Education Centers, Faculty of Engineering, Architecture, Technical and Professional Education and Faculty of Economy and Administrative Sciences. Moreover, there are a great number of faculties who work with and provide consultancy services to industrial organizations.

In the concept of inviting sectors to scientific activities such as congress, symposium, panel etc.; University authorities state that they make their most important contribution by hosting panels and symposiums, even broadcasting the same on their television channels in order to convey such events to larger audiences.

In the concept of designing joint projects with industrial and commercial plant in the city; it is stated that universities implemented joint projects with industrial and commercial organizations in the city such as Ankara Chamber of Trade (ATO), Ankara Chamber of Industry (ASO), Middle East Industry and Trade Center (OSTIM), Ankara Chamber of Merchants and Craftsmen and that they will establish similar industrial and commercial partnerships in the future.

DISCUSSION, CONCLUSION, AND SUGGESTIONS

Conclusions based on the results of the study on universities' contributions to Ankara Province in terms of social, cultural and economic aspects are given below respectively.

Universities' Contributions on Social Basis. Results on the universities' contributions to Ankara on a social basis show that university authorities primarily emphasize the immigration phenomenon. It is determined that universities do not play a functional role in making policies for diminishing negative impacts of immigration, but they do contribute to the policymaking process via their studies on academic and social services ground. In order to prevent unemployment, one of the negative impacts of immigration, vocational courses have been arranged. So as to eliminate negative results of immigration, universities carried out studies on family planning and physical and mental health, etc. especially in slummy areas and contributed to raising the public's awareness about healthcare through booklets and brochures. They find their studies insufficient on planning urban and rural investments, preventing unplanned urbanization and assessing infrastructure needs, and designing child-parent-oriented informative activities. They also do not consider their studies sufficient on diminishing disadvantages of immigration such as urban culture, intercultural conflicts and incompliance; and taking measures against problems such as heavy traffic and increase in the crime rates, which are the results of an immigration-linked population increase.

As a second contribution to Ankara on a social basis, universities carry out studies on providing professions in the scope of development of basic living skills and lifelong learning. In addition to that, they conduct activities to contribute to lifelong learning via their broadcasts about painting, interior architecture, beauty, esthetics, healthcare, fashion, arts, culture and education. Another contribution of the universities in this regard is to start child education and childrearing programs and to conduct studies for disabled people. Universities also carry out activities contributive to lifelong learning by conducting studies to eliminate domestic and social violence. Moreover, it is determined that universities do not find their studies sufficient in terms of contributing to developing social policies, creating an understanding of effective use of leisure time for individuals; instituting literacy courses and struggle against smoking, drug addiction and alcoholism.

Similarly, Benneworth and Cunha (2015) have defined social innovation and studied the contributions of universities considering strategic modernization and privatization. In their research, they concluded that university engagement in urban knowledge exchange remains energetic and influenced by universities' own strategic choices and relationships. They also emphasized the key to viable and feasible college city-regions is guaranteeing colleges are able to produce clear benefits from these information exchange activities with their city-regional partners. Sharma (2015) states that universities are seen as key institutions in social change and development processes. Therefore, he emphasizes that the most important role assigned to them is the production of highly skilled manpower and research outputs to meet perceived goals.

The last but not least contribution of universities to the local community is the implementation of crucial nature projects such as Green Generation aiming to improve Ankara's natural environment. Moreover, it is determined that universities contributed to the prevention of environmental pollution and raising the public's awareness of environmental problems by preparing joint television programs with several environmental organizations. Besides, universities' activities to encourage and promote the use of natural energy resources and tree planting activities they conduct in collaboration with environmental organizations are remarkable practices in terms of improving the natural environment.

Universities do not consider their studies sufficient in terms of recycling wastes; setting parks and gardens; and, conducting environmental checks for streets and avenues.

Based on the results given above, basic recommendations can be presented in the following order:

1. Given that Ankara still lacks an urban plan, priority should be given to studies for preventing unplanned urbanization.
2. Turkey's young and child population is quite crowded. Especially families who immigrated to Ankara have more children than residents. Parents' role in helping children with gaining basic living skills is crucial. Therefore, it would be quite appropriate to conduct parent-child-oriented informative training activities.
3. That Ankara is located in a narrow area as a city naturally brings up traffic problems. So, in this context, studies for preventing traffic problem gain importance.
4. Ankara is a city that needs improving in terms of parks and gardens. The view of the city will be more likeable if universities focus on studies in this regard.

Universities' Contributions on Cultural Basis. Results of the universities' contributions to Ankara on a cultural basis show that universities have conducted studies and carried out activities for the protection of historical texture and places in the city. It is determined that universities ensure the promotion of cultural tourism, another aspect of these studies, via language teaching centres which are regarded to be an element that introduces local culture and language and realizes cultural shifts. The protection of historical texture and places, as well as the handicrafts that are about to go extinct, is another contribution of universities to the city they are located in. In collaboration with municipalities, universities are carrying out museum projects where Ankara's cultural texture is exhibited. In addition to that, exhibitions held and broadcasts on television channels by universities can be counted among the contributions in this context. Universities also contribute to the development of culture and arts in the city through activities such as increasing cinema and theatre occasions and attracting more attention to fine arts such as sculpture, painting, music, etc. It is determined that these contributions are mostly achieved by student organizations that include concerts by Turkish Folk Music and Classical Music choirs; dramas by theatrical companies and dance show by folk dance organizations. Moreover, protection of historical structures that are in danger of becoming extinct due to unplanned urbanization and support for restoration works are among contributions to the protection of historical texture and places.

Chatterton (2000) stated that insufficient attention has been paid to universities' cultural roles. In his field work in Bristol, United Kingdom, he has highlighted a number of cultural roles which universities undertake in the community. He has also shown the diverse set of cultural relationships which exist between universities and communities. In their research, Albulescu and Albulescu (2014) emphasized that the impact of universities upon the development of the communities to which they belong is significant. They also stated that the contribution of the university to local and regional development can also be understood in terms of forming and strengthening formal and informal connections in order to attain social, civic, and cultural objectives.

Results of the study show that in two essential points, universities consider their contribution to Ankara insufficient in terms of protection of historical texture and places: That is raising public's awareness to this aspect by releasing publications on the history of pre-Republic and Republic periods (informative activities with regard to introducing, protecting and transferring historical heritage). Universities do not consider their activities sufficient in terms of cultural and artistic development of a city, promotion of practicing sport exercises and opportunities for such; raising public's awareness for

the protection and transfer of culture and art assets. Based on the results given above, basic recommendations can be presented in the following order:

1. Ankara's history dates back to the 7th century BC. Especially the Old Ankara is an important area where historical structures rest. It would be crucial for universities to enrich this historical heritage by publications and conduct studies to raise awareness of the importance of social history and inform the public.
2. The Old Ankara is a region where professions "soon-to-go-extinct" try to survive. Studies on the protection of traditional culture and art assets and transferring the same to next generations will make great contributions to Ankara Province.

Universities' Contributions on Economic Basis. Results of universities' contributions to Ankara on an economic basis reveal that both universities and their subsidiaries (hospitals, schools, hotels, restaurants etc.) contribute to the training of the city's workforce and employment through activities in the fields of healthcare, education, tourism and agriculture. The vocational courses arranged by universities in collaboration with Ankara Municipality proved to be a major contribution of universities for a qualified workforce. Besides, it is determined that universities contribute to the economy not only in agriculture, industry and service provision sectors but also in the tourism field through their activities. It is also found out that another contribution of universities to Ankara's economic development is achieved by informing commercial organizations about innovation strategies such as new technologies and providing them with consultancy services. Similarly, Goddard and Vallance (2013) emphasize that the contribution of universities to innovation, in helping to create new knowledge-intensive economic activities and employment, is critical in regional economic development. EUA's study by Reichert (2019) titled "The Role of Universities in Regional Innovation Ecosystems", it is stated that the open innovation enhances the role of universities. Thanks to this approach, the partnership between companies and universities diversify and intensify.

Lastly, universities make their most important contribution to Ankara by hosting panels and symposiums, even broadcasting the same on their television channels in order to convey such events to larger audiences. Based on the results given above, basic recommendations can be presented in the following order:

1. Ankara is a nest for small-scale industrial organizations such as furniture manufacturers, wholesale merchants, etc. In this context, Ankara is the center of trade chambers and associations. Increasing productivity in the economy is only possible with a qualified workforce and sharing new technological and industrial advances with producers. It would be appropriate for universities to enrich their studies conducted in recent years in this field and improve their techno-park applications.
2. Ankara is a center for a number of reputable state and private universities. In this context, the city makes crucial contributions to advances in science both in Turkey and worldwide. Universities in Ankara have been hosting their scientific events such as congresses, symposiums, panel etc. in regions where sea tourism is developed. Restoration of the Old Ankara houses will enable the use of these houses for accommodation purposes. If universities host their scientific events in this region, that will provide significant economic input for Ankara, thus play a role in the development of the city.

Ankara has been the capital of Turkey since the foundation of the Turkish Republic. In this context, the Turkish Great National Assembly accommodates all state organizations and institutions in the city center. That Mustafa Kemal Atatürk, the founder of the Turkish Republic, rests in Ankara in his tomb makes the city more important. Therefore, it would be to the very benefit of Ankara if universities enrich their studies especially in the fields where they consider themselves insufficient.

Consequently, it is understood that universities in the scope of the present study have made significant contributions to Ankara Province. Notwithstanding these contributions, there are incomplete, overlooked, even ignored issues to dwell on. Universities' becoming aware of these outstanding issues will allow them to make even greater contributions in the future to Ankara on social, cultural and economic grounds.

REFERENCES

- Agasisti, T., & Bertolotti, A. (2020). Higher education and economic growth: A longitudinal study of European regions 2000-2017. *Socio-Economic Planning Sciences*, In Press, Corrected Proof. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.seps.2020.100940>
- Albulescu, I. & Albulescu, M. (2014). The university in the community: The university's contribution to local and regional development by providing educational services for adults. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 142, 5-11. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2014.07.578>
- Arslan, K. (2005). Bölgesel kalkınma farklılıklarının giderilmesinde etkin bir araç: Bölgesel planlama ve bölgesel kalkınma ajansları [Regional planning and regional development agencies as an effective tool in eliminating the differences in regional development levels]. *İstanbul Ticaret Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 4(7), 275-294. Retrieved from <http://acikerisim.ticaret.edu.tr/xmlui/bitstream/handle/11467/264/M00095.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y>
- Badat, S. (2009, September 13-19). *The role of higher education in society: Valuing higher education* [Paper presentation]. HERS-SA Academy, University of Cape Town Graduate School of Business, Cape Town, South Africa.
- Benneworth, P., & Cunha, J. (2015). Universities' contributions to social innovation: Reflections in theory & practice. *European Journal of Innovation Management*, 18(4), 508-527. Retrieved from <https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/EJIM-10-2013-0099/full/pdf?title=universities-contributions-to-social-innovation-reflections-in-theory-amp-practice>
- Becker, W. (2003). Evaluation of the role of universities in the innovation process. *Discussion Paper Series 241*, University of Augsburg Institute for Economics. Retrieved from <http://ideas.repec.org/p/aug/augsbe/0241.html#cites>
- Beyazlı, D. Ş., Aydemir, Ş., & Aydemir, S. (2005, Ekim 13-14). *Girişimci üniversite, Karadeniz Teknik Üniversitesi-iş dünyası, sorunlar-beklentiler-olası çözümler* [Paper presentation]. Doğu Karadeniz Bölgesi Kalkınma Sempozyumu, Trabzon, Türkiye.
- Bonander, C., Jakobsson N., Podestà, F., & Svensson, M. (2016). Universities as engines for regional growth? Using the synthetic control method to analyze the effects of research universities. *Regional Science and Urban Economics*, 60, 198-207. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.regsciurbeco.2016.07.008>
- Brenner, M. (1982). Response-effects of "role-restricted" characteristics of the interviewer. In W. Dijkstra & J. van der Zouwen (Eds.), *Response behaviour in the survey-interview* (pp.131-165) London: Academic Press.
- Cannell, C. F., & Kahn, R. L. (1968). Interviewing. In G. Lindzey & E. Aronson (Eds.), *The handbook of social psychology, 2: Research method* (pp.526-595). New York: Addison-Wesley.

- Cassell, J. (1977). The relationship of observer to observed in peer group research. *Human Organization*, 36(4), 412-416. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/44125795>
- Charles, D. (2003). Universities and territorial development: Reshaping the regional role of UK universities. *Local Economy*, 18(1), 7-20. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0269094032000073780>
- Chatterton, P. (2000). The cultural role of universities in the community: Revisiting the university-community debate. *Environment and Planning*, 32(1), 165-182. <https://doi.org/10.1068/a3243>
- Compagnucci, L., & Spigarelli, F. (2020). The third mission of the university: A systematic literature review on potentials and constraints. *Technological Forecasting & Social Change*, 161, 1-30. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2020.120284>
- Crosier, D., Purser, L., & Smidt, H. (2007). Trends V: Universities shaping the European higher education area. *European University Association (EUA) Report*. Belgium: European University Association (EUA) Publications. Retrieved from <https://www.eua.eu/downloads/publications/trends%20v%20universities%20shaping%20the%20european%20higher%20education%20area.pdf>
- Çetin, M. (2007). Bölgesel kalkınma ve girişimci üniversiteler [Regional development and entrepreneurial universities]. *Ege Akademik Bakış/Ege Academic Review*, 7(1), 217-238. Retrieved from <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/557011>
- Fowler, F. J., & Mangione, T. W. (1989). *Standardized survey interviewing: Minimizing interviewer-related error*. Newbury Park: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Goddard, J., & Vallance, P. (2013). *The university and the city*. New York: Routledge, Taylor & Francis Group.
- Guba, E., & Lincoln, Y. (1992). *Effective evaluation: Improving the usefulness of evaluation results through responsive and naturalistic approaches*. San Francisco: Jossey Bass.
- Gültekin, N., Çelik, A., & Nas, Z. (2008). Üniversitelerin kuruldukları kente katkıları [Advantages of universities for the cities]. *Elektronik Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi/ Electronic Journal of Social Sciences*, 7(24), 264-269. Retrieved from <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/download/article-file/70029>
- Gürkan, Ö. & Karataş, M. (2004). *Üniversitelerin sosyo-ekonomik gelişmedeki rolü ve önemi (Muğla Üniversitesi örneği)*. Muğla: Muğla Üniversitesi Yayınları.
- McCracken, G. D. (1988). *The long interview (Qualitative Research Methods Series 13)*. Newbury Park: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Nilsson, J. E. (Ed.) (2006). *The role of universities in regional innovation systems: A Nordic perspective*. Copenhagen: Copenhagen Business School Press.
- Olo, D. P., Correia, L., & Rego, M. D. (2020). The main challenges of higher education institutions in the 21st century: A focus on entrepreneurship. In D. A. Daniel, A. A. Teixeira, & M. T. Preto (Eds.), *Examining the role of entrepreneurial universities in regional development* (pp. 1-23). IGI Global.

- Ongena, Y. (2010). *Interviewer and respondent interaction in survey interviews: Empirical evidence from behavior coding studies and question wording experiments*. Saarbrücken: LAP Lambert Academic Publishing.
- Özyaba, M. (1999). *Kentsel gelişmede üniversitenin rolü (Uludağ Üniversitesi ve Bursa). 3. Geleneksel Mezunlar Buluşması (4-5 Aralık), UMED Uludağ Üniversitesi Mezunlar Derneği, Bursa*.
- Pinto, H., Cruz, A. R., & de Almeida, H. (2016). Academic entrepreneurship and knowledge transfer networks: translation process and boundary organizations. In L. Carvalho (Ed.), *Handbook of research on entrepreneurial success and its impact on regional development* (pp. 315-344). IGI Global.
- Reeves-Sanday, P. (1979). The ethnographic paradigm(s). *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 24(4), 527-538. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2392359>
- Reichert, S. (2019). *EUA study: The role of universities in regional innovation ecosystems. European University Association (EUA) Report*. Belgium: European University Association (EUA) Publications. Retrieved from https://eua.eu/downloads/publications/eua%20innovation%20ecosystem%20report%202019v1.1_final_digital.pdf
- Sargın, S. (2006). *Şehirleşme, üniversiteler-üniversitelerin şehirleşmeye etkileri: Isparta örneği. Isparta: Fakülte Kitabevi Yayınları*.
- Schwartz, M. S., & Schwartz, C. G. (1955). Problems in participant observation. *American Journal of Sociology*, 60(4), 343-353. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/2772027>
- Secundo, G., Perez, S. E., Martinaitis, Ž., & Leitner, K. H. (2017). *An intellectual capital framework to measure universities' third mission activities. Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 123, 229-239. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.techfore.2016.12.013>
- Sharma, R. S. (2015). *Role of universities in development of civil society and social transformation [Paper presentation]. Proceedings of International Academic Conferences, International Institute of Social and Economic Sciences*. Retrieved from <https://ideas.repec.org/p/sek/iacpro/2604181.html>
- Sudman, S., & Bradburn, N. M. (Eds.) (1974). *Response effects in surveys: A review and synthesis*. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company.
- Sutz, J. (2005). The role of universities in knowledge production. *Himalayan Journal of Sciences*, 3(5), 53-56. <https://doi.org/10.3126/hjs.v3i5.462>
- Sürmeli, F. (Ed.) (2008). *Anadolu Üniversitesinin Eskişehir'e etkileri ve şehrin üniversiteyi algılayışı*. Eskişehir: Anadolu Üniversitesi Yayınları.
- Torun, İ., Öztürk, S., & Gelibolu, L. (2009). Yöre halkının üniversiteye bakışı ve beklentileri: Kars Kafkas Üniversitesi örneği [The view of locale people to university and their expectations: The case of Kars Kafkas University]. *Manas Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 11(21), 169-189. Retrieved from <https://dergipark.org.tr/tr/pub/manassosyal/issue/49932/639862>
- Varga, A. (2003). Agglomeration and the role of universities in regional economic development. In Lengyel, I. (Ed.), *2003: Knowledge transfer, small and medium-sized enterprises, and regional development in Hungary* (pp. 15-31). Szeged: JATEPress.

- Wolfe, D. A. (2005). The role of universities in regional development and cluster formation. In Glen A. Jones, Patricia L. McCarney, & Michael L. Skolnik (Eds.), *Creating knowledge, strengthening nations: The changing role of higher education* (pp. 167-194). Canada: University of Toronto Press.
- Yıldırım, A., & Şimşek, H. (2018). *Sosyal bilimlerde nitel araştırma yöntemleri [Qualitative research methods in the social sciences]* (11th ed.). Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.
- Yükseköğretim Kanunu [Higher Education Law]. (1981). T.C. Resm Gazete [Turkish Republic Official Journal], (17506), November 4, 1981, 5347-5394. 4/11/1981 Retrieved from <https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/1.5.2547.pdf>